

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

PB/1a/11.00

The House met at eleven of the clock,  
MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

-----

**Q. No. 81**

**SHRI K.E. ISMAIL:** As stated in the answer, the flood and heavy rain had caused widespread damage in Karnataka and Andhra Pradesh. Such natural calamities are regular features of our country. Though we cannot prevent rain and flood, but if we take precautionary measures, we can mitigate the damages.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please ask the question. Don't make a statement; ask the question.

**SHRI K.E. ISMAIL:** Sir, I am putting the question. The main reason of the flash flood in Andhra Pradesh was the releasing of surplus water from Almati and Narayanpur Dams. Recently, Moolathara Dam in Palghat district of Kerala collapsed partially due to sudden release of water from Aliyar Dam. The concerned authorities did not give prior intimation about the volume of water to be released.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** You are making a statement. Please ask your supplementary.

**SHRI K.E. ISMAIL:** Sir, my question is, in such a situation, whether the Union Government will create some mechanism to coordinate the actions of State Governments for releasing the surplus water from dams and issuing early warning to the people.

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 81 (Contd.)

**SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, the question pertains to the Ministry of Water Resources and it has no relevance with this question.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Second supplementary, please.

**SHRI K.E. ISMAIL:** Sir, the Kerala State had suffered heavy loss of human lives, crops and houses due to heavy rain and flood in the month of June this year. The estimated loss is Rs. 700 crores. A Central team had visited the affected areas and it was convinced that the State has suffered heavy losses. I would like to know whether the Government had given any extra financial help to the State for the relief and rehabilitation of the victims.

**SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN:** Sir, the northern parts of Kerala had floods from 15<sup>th</sup> to 20<sup>th</sup> of July, 2009 and eight districts have been affected. I will give you details of the lives lost and the other losses suffered by the State due to it. On the night of 15<sup>th</sup> July, 2009, we had sent two companies of MGRF to the State of Kerala from Arconam.

Sir, regarding the amount released by the State, I would like to inform you that an Inter-Ministerial group met and approved Rs. 61.36 crores and Rs. 1.86 crores from the Accelerated Rural Water Supply Project for the State of Kerala this year.

**SHRI V. HUNUMANTHA RAO:** Sir, my question to the hon. Minister is this. Due to heavy rains, a lot of people, the small vendors, the shopkeepers, etc., lost everything. So, I think, the banks should come forward to give some loans to these affected people. Then only, they

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**Q. No. 81 (Contd.)**

can build up their career and business because they have lost everything. So, the nationalised banks should be requested to give some loans so that these people can rebuild their career. I would like to know whether the Government is ready to help these people through the bankers.

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:** Sir, whenever there is a calamity of this nature, the invariable practice is for the State-level Bankers' Committee to meet. The Chief Minister usually chairs such a meeting and I know a number of cases where at that meeting, banks have come forward to reschedule loans and to give fresh loans. (Contd. By 1b/SKC)

1b/11.05/skc-akg

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (Contd.):** Whether such a meeting has taken place in each State, I am not in a position to say immediately, but I know that a meeting took place in the State of Karnataka. Perhaps such meetings have also taken place in other States. I shall find that out and give that information to the hon. Member.

**SHRI M.V. MYSURA REDDY:** Sir, there has been this severe calamity in Andhra Pradesh and Karnataka. The Inter-Ministerial Group visited these two States. Through you, Sir, I would like to ask whether the inter-ministerial Central team has submitted any report, and if yes, whether the Inter-Ministerial Group has examined the Inter-Ministerial Central Team's recommendations. What are the Inter-Ministerial Group's recommendations to the High Level Committee about expenditure to deal with the calamity and what is the extent of assistance provided?

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 81 (Contd.)

**SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN:** Sir, the Inter-Ministerial Group has already submitted the report and the State Government has submitted a memorandum amounting to Rs. 11609.20 crores comprising Rs. 3755.83 crores from the National Calamity Relief Fund and Rs. 8533.40 crores towards permanent restoration. The memorandum of the State Government for additional assistance out of the NCF is under process. Requests of the State Government for assistance in items outside the CRF and NCF norms have been forwarded to the Ministry and the Department of Agricultural Cooperation and other departments for consideration.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Shri Rama Jois. (Interruptions) No, one question please.

**SHRI M. RAMA JOIS:** Sir, the hon. Minister may please state how many houses have been washed away and how much time will be taken to rebuild them.

**SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN:** Sir, according to the report given by the State Government, 6.55 lakh houses have been lost in the State of Karnataka.

(Ends)

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question 82 Hon. Member absent.

**SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU:** Sir,...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Three supplementaries only. (Interruptions)

**SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU:** Sir, I belong to Andhra Pradesh.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I know that, but the three supplementaries-rule is sacrosanct. (Interruptions) This is not a debate.

**SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD:** Sir, this is a serious issue. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** There are very large number...(Interruptions)... Please, do not interrupt.

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** Sir, we belong to the affected areas. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** If you want a debate, please give Notice for the debate.

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** Sir, we belong to the affected areas. (Interruptions) There should be a half an hour discussion. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question 83

**श्री मोहम्मद अली खान :** सर, मैं आन्ध्र प्रदेश से हूँ ... (व्यवधान) ...

**جناب محمد علی خان :** سر، میں آندھرا پردیش سے ہوں۔(مداخلت)۔

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** He gave an answer.

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTUALLA:** He did not give a full answer. (Interruptions)

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** Sir, we want a half an hour discussion. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Then complaint about the...Interruptions)

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** Sir, we want a half an hour discussion. We all belong to the affected States. (Interruptions)

**श्री मोहम्मद अली खान :** चेयरमैन साहब, हम इस पर Half an Hour Discussion चाहते हैं ... (व्यवधान) ...

**جناب محمد علی خان :** چیئرمین صاحب، ہم اس پر Half an Hour Discussion چاہتے ہیں۔۔(مداخلت)۔۔

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** This is not the manner in which this matter is to be raised. I am sorry...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** Sir, we want a half an hour discussion. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** There is a procedure for giving notice for discussions. Please, follow it. What is the difficulty? Question 83.

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009



Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 83

**SHRI MOHAMMED ADEEB:** Sir, my first supplementary is this: The Human Rights Commission consists of three members. The minorities and backward class people suffer more from human rights violations. Will the Government of India think of having a member from the minority communities, backward classes and dalits in the Commission, as they are the people who suffer more from human rights violations?

**SHRI AJAY MAKEN:** Sir, we have separate commissions for various other groups, like we have the National Commission on Minorities also. So, I think, the minorities issues are adequately taken care of even there. Besides, the Human Rights Commission also takes care of the minority issues.

(Followed by hk at 1c)

HK-SCH/1c/11.10

**SHRI MOHAMMED ADEEB:** Sir, my second supplementary is that in Maharashtra more than 20 people are still in jail for the last seven years although no charges have been framed against them. POTA has already been repealed but they have not got the bail by the Government of Maharashtra. Is this not a case of human rights violation? I want to know from the hon. Minister as to why they have been in jail for seven years when there is no charge-sheet framed against them? POTA has already been repealed but Maharashtra Government has not allowed them to get the bail. The Supreme Court has held that if there is no substantial evidence in POTA cases, they are liable to get the bail. This

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 83 (Contd.)

is a total human rights violation. Why have they been in jail for seven years? I want to know this from the hon. Minister.

**SHRI AJAY MAKEN:** Sir, on the basis of any complaint or letter received from the hon. Member, we are going to take it up with the Government of Maharashtra. Otherwise, in most of the States we have the State level human rights commissions and we are asking the States to set up human rights courts also. Around ten States have already set up specially designated human rights courts, and we wish that all the States set up such courts so that such cases can be taken up in those designated courts.

**SHRI MOHAMMED ADEEB:** Sir, I have written, at least, twenty letters to the Ministry of Home Affairs.

**SHRI AJAY MAKEN:** We will take it up afresh.

**श्री साविर अली:** सर, जैसा कि अभी अदीब साहब ने कहा, मैं सिर्फ उसमें कुछ आंकड़े देना चाहता हूँ। वर्ष 2006-07 में Human Rights के 9,603 violations हुए थे, जिनमें खास करके सिर्फ मुसलमानों के साथ 8,390 हुए थे। 2007-08 में 10,568 हुए थे, जिनमें से 9,248 मुसलमानों के साथ हुए। 2008-09 में 12,794 हुए थे, जिनमें से 11,178 मुसलमानों के साथ हुए। यह उत्तर इसी सदन में दिया गया था और ये आंकड़े इसी सदन के हैं। इस तरह जो Human Rights के violations होते हैं, यह काम खास करके सरकारी पदाधिकारियों के जरिए किया जाता है और खास तौर पर अक़ल्लीयतों के साथ यह होता है। इस पर सरकार ने क्या कदम उठाए हैं? ये आंकड़े सरकार के द्वारा ही दिए गए हैं। सर, आपके जरिए मंत्री महोदय से मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि 2006 से लेकर अब तक सरकार ने इस पर क्या कदम उठाए हैं ताकि ऐसे मामले रिपीट न हों?

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 83 (Contd.)

**श्री अजय माकन:** सभापति महोदय, इस तरीके की जितनी भी कंप्लेंट्स आती हैं, National Human Rights Commission और State Human Rights Commission समय-समय पर स्टेट गवर्नमेंट्स को उन पर डायरेक्शन देते रहते हैं। Human Rights Commission न केवल minorities के केसिज़ पर, बल्कि अन्य बहुत सारी चीज़ों के मामले में समय-समय पर स्टेट गवर्नमेंट्स को डायरेक्शन देता रहता है - जैसे custodial death, insurgency, rape and torture, reform of the police, prison reforms, mental hospitals, shelter for women, minorities etc. स्टेट गवर्नमेंट्स इन डायरेक्शन्स का पालन करती रहती हैं।

अगर माननीय सदस्य को कोई स्पैसिफिक केस हमारी जानकारी में लाना है अथवा हमारे माध्यम से स्टेट गवर्नमेंट की जानकारी में लाना है, तो वे हमें बताएं, हम उसको जरूर टेकअप करेंगे।

**SHRI PRAVEEN RASHTRAPAL:** Sir, we all are aware that the worst victims of the human rights violation is the weaker section of the society, in particular the SC/ST, the Muslims and women too. I want to know from the hon. Minister: Are you aware of the honour killing in the neighbouring States of Haryana, Rajasthan and many other States all over the country? A young boy and a girl married to each other which is legally permissible; they went to the court and even the parents were in agreement, but a certain community panchayat in the name of *gotra* or *sagotra* and all this thing has not only violated the laws of the land but killed the couple in the presence of Police. The Central Government is constitutionally responsible to protect the rights of women and the rights of the poor, and we claim that there is no discrimination on the basis of caste, class or creed in our country. But is there a single case where



Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 83 (Contd.)

the Central Government has intervened and asked the State Governments of Rajasthan or Haryana as to what the State Government machinery was doing when *goondas* and goons were killing the couple?

(Followed by 1d/KSK)

KSK/PSV/11.15/1D

**SHRI AJAY MAKEN:** Sir, while responding to a question on honour killing in the last session, my senior colleague had, in very strong words, deplored such so-called honour killings, and it is very unfortunate that in our country, in certain States, we have such kind of killings. We are aware of this matter. We are taking it up with the State Governments, and in whatever manner, we can do it, within the constitutional limits, we are going to take care so that such things are not repeated in future.

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** You should bring a law to curb these crimes. That is the issue.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** No interruptions please.

**SHRI AJAY MAKEN:** Sir, honour killing is just like any other murder...(Interruptions).

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** It is not just like any other murder. It is totally wrong. How can he say that honour killing is like any other murder? It is a crime connected with honour which has different dimensions.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** The very fact that the term 'honour killing' has been used, means it is somewhat different from normal murder.

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 83 (Contd.)

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Thank you, Sir. I hope your wisdom will percolate to the Government.

**SHRI AJAY MAKEN:** By way of using different terminology, there is no distinction between the two because the punishment, the capital punishment, for both are the same. We are not giving any relaxation, as many other countries do, for so-called honour killing. There are many countries in the world which give some kind of relaxation if it is proved that it is an honour killing. There is no relaxation in our country. It is as good or as bad as a normal murder, as far as the law is concerned. So, the punishment is capital punishment.

**सरदार तरलोचन सिंह:** सर, National Human Rights Commission बहुत बड़ा organization है, लेकिन सरकार ने कई महीने से इसका चेयरमैन भी अप्वायंट नहीं किया। यह बताता है कि हमारी सरकार की तरफ से इस National Human Rights Commission के बारे में क्या रवैया है।

Secondly, Sir, through you, I want to know कि National Human Rights Commission ने कितने केसेज़ आज तक डील किए और कितने लोगों को रिलीफ मिली? Is there only deliberation and no action? Do they have any power to take action? Through you, I want to draw the attention of the hon. Home Minister to one Khala case where 1200 people were burnt. Without any name, a case is pending with the Human Rights Commission कि अमृतसर में 1200 लोग एक दिन में जलाये गये, उनका कोई whereabouts या उसमें कोई रिलीफ आज तक नहीं आया। The Human Rights Commission is sitting on it.

**श्री अजय माकन:** सभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य ने दो प्रश्न पूछे हैं।

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 83 (Contd.)

**श्री सभापति:** आप एक का ही जवाब दे दीजिए।

**श्री अजय माकन:** सर, पहला प्रश्न उन्होंने NHRC के कम्पोजीशन के बारे में पूछा है। यह मामला sub-judice भी है, लेकिन मैं बताना चाहूँगा कि National Human Rights Commission के Chairperson retired Chief Justice of the Supreme Court हो सकते हैं, जिनकी उम्र 70 साल से कम हो। इन दोनों parameters में केवल 2 व्यक्ति आते हैं और दोनों के दोनों व्यक्तियों ने कहा है कि वे inclined नहीं हैं और वे उपलब्ध नहीं हैं।

**डा.(श्रीमती) नजमा ए. हेपतुल्ला:** सर, अभी माननीय मंत्री जी ने जवाब देते हुए कहा कि अगर custodial death होती है, तो वे भी Human Rights के अन्तर्गत आती हैं। अभी recently जम्मू एवं कश्मीर में शर्मा नाम का एक आदमी custodial death में torture के बाद मारा गया। उसके नाखून निकाल लिए गए, उसके साथ और भी दुर्व्यवहार किया गया। उसके बारे में कुछ मंत्री जी बताएँगे या आपको चिट्ठी लिख कर भेजें?

**श्री अजय माकन:** मैडम, आप इसके बारे में हमें चिट्ठी भी लिखेंगी, तब भी हम इसको दिखवाएँगे। आपने इसका मेशन किया है, तो हम इसको वैसे भी दिखवाएँगे, लेकिन मैं आपको बताना चाहूँगा कि जम्मू एवं कश्मीर में custodial death के जो केसेज़ हुए हैं, उनके आँकड़े इस प्रकार हैं- 2006-2007 में कोई नहीं, 2007-2008 में तीन और 2008-2009 में कोई नहीं। इस प्रकार पिछले तीन सालों में ऐसे केसेज़ केवल 3 हुए हैं।

**श्री सभापति:** क्वैश्चन नं0 84.

(समाप्त)

(1ई/जी0एस0पी0 पर आगे)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

GSP-DS/11.20/1E

**Q. No. 84**

**SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, the national highway projects are very ambitious projects of both the NDA and the UPA. If we go by the statistics, it shows that in the past approximately nine years, there had been a tardy development of the national highways. Sir, when the NDA came to power, they insisted on National Highways, Expressways and the Golden Quadrilateral etc.

In the recent past, in 2001, two projects, one in Uttar Pradesh and the other one in Jharkhand, were taken up, and, which have almost got stalled. It involves Rs. 19,000 crores. I do not know whether these projects have been started or not. I want to know when these projects will be completed. I think, these projects have been taken up under the World Bank scheme. Apart from this, two projects in Karnataka, namely, Chitradurga and...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please put the question.

**SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD:** Sir, I am putting the question. Sir, because there is a lot of delay in the implementation of these projects, I just want to know from the hon. Minister as to how long will it take to complete these projects, especially, one project in Uttar Pradesh and the other one in Jharkhand, and, also the two projects in Karnataka, namely, Chitradurga and Shiradi Ghat. Sir, for the past ten years, about sixty kilometres of the stretch has not been completed. I want to know from the hon. Minister as to when he will be completing these projects.



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**Q. No. 84 (Contd.)**

**SHRI KAMAL NATH:** Sir, the question really is about dispute resolution and about the cases which are pending in dispute. Sir, there has been delay, undoubtedly, and, the reasons for this delay have largely been due to land acquisition. Land acquisition has been an enormous challenge, and, for the last few months, the State Governments are sensitized about the importance of land acquisition. We are setting up 150 special land acquisition units to ensure that the land is acquired in time; the unencumbered land or removal of utility like electricity polls etc.

The hon. Members mentioned about the NDA Government's progress, I would like to inform the hon. Member that just this year alone, we will build more roads than what were built in the entire five years regime of the NDA Government.

**SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD:** Sir, this is my second supplementary. Sir, the dynamic Minister has announced that he will be completing about 7,000 km. of roads annually, which means 20-kilometre per day. With so much of litigation going on through out the country, I have my own doubts as to how the Minister would complete these projects. Sir, the (b) part of my question is: whether to empower the National Highway Authority of India financially, apart from providing sovereign guarantee against National Highway Authority of India's instruments like bonds, the Government would also consider empowering the National Highway Authority to levy cess on commercial vehicles plying on national highways stretches and carrying heavy minerals thereby causing a

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 84 (Contd.)

premature damage to the roads which necessitates frequent repairs and resurfacing.

**SHRI R.P.N. SINGH:** Sir, the hon. Member has brought to the notice of the House the delays which we have because of the arbitration, which is taking place in the National Highways Authority of India. I would like to bring to the notice of the House that all the arbitration cases are mostly on the model which was being followed by the NHAI earlier when it was started. When the National Highway Authority was started, it was the EPC programme. The 20-kilometre road per day, which the Ministry plans to make are mostly going to be on the BOT-Toll model, where there is little problem of arbitration, and, in fact, we have had no kind of arbitration in the BOT-Toll model. As far as the problems coming in the BOT-annuity, or, BOT-Toll problems are concerned, my senior colleague has already answered the question of land utility, we have put up a lot of things to get the land acquired.

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि :** धन्यवाद, सभापति महोदय। हिन्दी में एक शब्द है "मार्गदर्शन"। अगर हम किसी भी विशिष्ट व्यक्ति से सभा में मिलते हैं तो कहते हैं कि कृपा करके मार्गदर्शन कीजिए, लेकिन आज देश में मार्ग की हालत क्या है? देश भर में राजमार्ग तो दूर सामान्य मार्ग की हालत भी अत्यंत दुर्दशाग्रस्त है। सर, मैं उड़ीसा से आता हूँ।

(1एफ/वीएनके पर क्रमशः)

-DS/VNK-YSR/1F/11.25

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि :** उड़ीसा के मुख्य मंत्री बात-बात पर कहते हैं कि श्री कमल नाथ जी मेरे मित्र हैं, जो राजमार्ग मंत्री हैं, वे मेरे मित्र हैं। सर, राज्य में जितने मार्ग हैं।

**श्री सभापति :** आप सवाल पूछ लीजिए।

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 84 (Contd.)

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि** : सर, मेरा सवाल यह है कि राज्य में जितने राजमार्ग हैं, जैसे राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग सं. 200 है, राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग सं. 23 है, राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग सं. 43 है और राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग सं. 05 है, जोकि कोलकाता से चेन्नई तक के लिए है तथा राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग सं. 06 भी है, जो कोलकाता से मुम्बई तक के लिए है, उनमें से किसी भी राजमार्ग की हालत ढंग की नहीं है। उनकी स्थिति ऐसी है कि उन पर एक इंच भी आगे बढ़ने की हालत नहीं है।

**श्री सभापति** : आपका प्रश्न क्या है?

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि** : सर, मेरा प्रश्न यह है कि उड़ीसा राज्य के राजमार्गों की मरम्मत के लिए कम से कम कितना पैसा दिया जाता है और जो पैसा मरम्मत के लिए दिया जाता है, राज्य सरकार उसका व्यय ठीक ढंग से कर पाती है या नहीं कर पाती है? कृपा करके मंत्री महोदय एक बार राज्य में विराजें और वहां के लोगों की दुर्दशा को दयापूर्वक देखें।

**श्री कमल नाथ** : सर, इनके दो प्रश्न हैं।

**श्री सभापति** : आप एक प्रश्न का जवाब दीजिए।

**श्री कमल नाथ** : इनका पहला प्रश्न यह है कि मुख्य मंत्री मेरे मित्र हैं, इसका भी मैं जवाब दे देता हूँ। जैसे विभिन्न प्रांतों के मुख्य मंत्री मेरे मित्र हैं, वैसे ही उड़ीसा के मुख्य मंत्री भी मेरे मित्र हैं। मुझे उम्मीद है कि माननीय सदस्य इससे संतुष्ट होंगे।

जहां तक राजमार्ग के maintenance की बात है, इस संबंध में मुख्यमंत्री जी मुझसे मिले थे और समय-समय पर अन्य MPs भी मुझसे बात की है। उड़ीसा के राजमार्ग के maintenance के लिए और सेन्ट्रल रोड फंड के लिए जो आवश्यक और पर्याप्त राशि है, उसको हम देने का प्रयास कर रहे हैं। माननीय सदस्य को यह जानकर खुशी होगी कि उड़ीसा को जो पिछले साल मिला था, इस साल और अगले साल उससे ज्यादा मिलेगा।

**DR. K. MALAISAMY**: Sir, in the wake of several lapses, as pointed out in the question by the hon. Member, I am inclined to ask whether the World Bank, which is giving the credit, has made any adverse

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**Q. No. 84 (Contd.)**

observation against the country which is availing the credit. If so, what are the adverse observations against us?

**SHRI KAMAL NATH:** Sir, there are World Bank projects which are going on. And we are looking at another World Bank loan also. There are certain issues, which the World Bank raised, with regard to implementation. Some of them have been resolved and some of them are in the process of being resolved.

I am happy to inform the hon. Member that in the recent discussions with the World Bank, they agreed to consider what they have not considered earlier, in addition to the project, which we have given them, and it will cost three billion dollars, roughly 2.96 billion dollars, to convert one lane National Highways into two-lane National Highways. In our country, the length of one lane National Highways is 17,000 km. Now to convert them into two lanes, we have prepared a World Bank audit. The World Bank is going to consider this. It will give three billion dollars over a period of five years. The World Bank has also agreed to look at viability gap funding and annuity which they were not doing earlier. This would provide us a major resource for the programme in the next four or five years. There have been some concerns with the World Bank, and rightly so, and we have been correcting what they have brought to our notice. Certain things require corrections and certain things don't require correction. While that is going on, currently, we are also pursuing further funding and further borrowing from the World Bank.

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 84 (Contd.)

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** Sir, the hon. Minister has just told that there are many disputes basically in EPC areas, and in the BOT toll projects, which are being subsequently undertaken, there are no problems. I think that in the BOT toll projects also, there are problems and delays.

(Contd. By RSS/1G)

RSS/MP/1G/11.30

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (CONTD.):** Whether the hon. Minister is aware that BOT toll projects may not be having much of the problem for the Government, but it has problems of other dimensions. Where there are BOT projects, contractors are being extended concessional period for 15, 30 years and the contractors are realising their costs by 5, 6 years by collection of tolls. So, there is an overall problem for the country's economy and the department. I would like to know whether they are considering that. And also whether they are aware that even in BOT projects, the major reason of the delay is changing the scope of work by the NHAI after awarding the contract and this resulted in the contractor who got the contract on the basis of a negative grant procuring more than Rs. 150 crores from the Government as in the case of the Gurgaon Highway project. I would like to know whether any accountability was fixed for this gross negligence and gross mismanagement. Thank you.

**SHRI KAMAL NATH:** Sir, with regard to the BOT projects, the first question of toll must be understood that toll really pays. Projections are

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 84 (Contd.)

made, a feasibility study is made based on traffic, and sometimes, the traffic which we are seeing, and we are ensuring that we are as accurate as possible and the traffic and the toll pays for the capital cost of the road. In feasibility studies which are prepared, these have been not of a very good content, I must admit. We are taking corrective steps in this respect. Sometimes, certain bypasses or certain service lanes or certain other facilities in the road which are not part of the design or the engineering, are required to be undertaken, which is outside the scope of the project which the hon. Member has referred to, and rightly so. These have to be taken up on an ad hoc basis because in respect of these projects, there is a public outcry, there is a need for it, and when these get taken up separately outside the BOT, obviously, that does not form a part of the total project cost. So, for the future projects, we are ensuring that by more public consultations and more public interaction, we are able to give correct designing, correct engineering and provide facilities so that this add on which takes place, is not there.

**श्री रामदास अग्रवाल :** सर, एक छोटी सी request है, मैं interpret नहीं कर रहा हूँ। सभापति महोदय, मेरी प्रार्थना है, मैं इस विषय पर discussion इसलिए चाहता हूँ कि ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति :** आप उसका नोटिस दीजिए।

**श्री रामदास अग्रवाल :** मैं दे रहा हूँ। सर, इसमें एक लाख करोड़ रुपए से ज्यादा खर्चा होता है और इन परियोजनाओं में कई व्यवधान हैं, इसलिए अगर उस पर discussion होगा तो कमल नाथ जी को भी सहायता मिलेगी और कई व्यवधान दूर होंगे। Fair enough. (Ends)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009



Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

प्रश्न संख्या 85

**श्री अमर सिंह :** सर, बहुत दुख के साथ कहना पड़ता है कि लालफीताशाही ऐसे मामलों में भी हावी है। मेरे पास जो उत्तर आया है, वह बहुत अमानवीय है। उस उत्तर में यह कहा जा रहा है कि यह तो मान रहे हैं कि पूरी की पूरी खेती बाढ़ में डूब गई है, लाखों हैक्टेयर डूब गया है, यह भी मान रहे हैं कि 90 लोग आंध्र प्रदेश में और 229 लोग कर्णाटक में मौत के शिकार हो गए हैं लेकिन मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि उत्तर में लिखा जा रहा है कि assessment of damage is being assessed. The process is on. हमारे प्रशासन का यह आचरण ठीक नहीं है। अगर किसी रोगी के रोग का निदान तत्काल न हो, उसे अगर दवाई की जरूरत है, शल्य-चिकित्सा की जरूरत है और डॉक्टर अगर assessment ही करता रहे, तब तो वह मर ही जाएगा। Justice delayed is justice denied. तो आपको जो भी देना है, जो भी करना है, क्या कोई instant mechanism आपके पास है या आप इसी तरह का औपचारिक उत्तर देते रहेंगे that assessment is being made.

**श्री सभापति :** आप सवाल पूछ लीजिए।

**श्री अमर सिंह :** तो मेरा प्रश्न यह है कि how long will you take in making the assessment because considerable time has passed when the flood has taken place, people have died and their crops have been ruined?

**SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN:** Sir, the Central Team has submitted its report yesterday. The Inter-Ministerial group, headed by the Home Secretary, is to meet shortly. About Karnataka, the Central Team has submitted its report. (contd. by 1h)

MKS-SC/11.35/1H

**SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN (CONTD.):** The Inter-Ministerial Group is about to meet tomorrow.

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 85 (Contd.)

**श्री अमर सिंह :** सर, आंध्र प्रदेश में हमारे साथी सांसद डा० दसारी नारायण राव जी ने प्रयास किया कि कुछ फंड इकट्ठा हो। कुछ एनजीओज़ ने भी इस संबंध में प्रयास किया। मेरी जानकारी है कि कर्नाटक की सरकार ने एक दिन पदयात्रा करके अपने उपक्रम से पांच सौ करोड़ रुपए से ज्यादा धनराशि एकत्रित की। महोदय, एनजीओज़, आंध्र प्रदेश के फिल्मकार और कर्नाटक की सरकार पदयात्रा से पांच सौ करोड़ रुपए इकट्ठे कर लेती है, लेकिन अभी तक सिर्फ 156 करोड़ रुपए केन्द्र से गए हैं। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि दक्षिण भारत में जो लोग मरे हैं, जो किसान मरे हैं, क्या वह दक्षिण भारत भारत का हिस्सा नहीं है? वहां पर मरे हुए लोगों का असेसमेंट हो रहा है। अभी माननीय मंत्री जी ने कहा कि it will be shortly done. How shortly you are going to do and as compared to what is being done in Andhra Pradesh, .....(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please ask the question.

**श्री अमर सिंह :** सर, मैं सवाल ही पूछ रहा हूँ लेकिन आंध्र प्रदेश के बारे में थोड़ा बताना तो पड़ेगा कि वहां पर क्या हालत है। वहां पर निजी संस्थाओं ने इतना प्रयास किया है, कर्नाटक की सरकार ने पदयात्रा करके तीन घंटे में पांच सौ करोड़ रुपए एकत्र किए हैं। आप तो खजाने के मालिक हैं, आप तो वित्त मंत्री जी के पीछे बैठे हैं। आप एक कलम चलवाइए और वहां पर रुपया भिजवाइए तथा जो लोग दुखी हैं, संतप्त हैं, उनको रिलीफ दिलवाइए।

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:** Sir, there is no shortage of money; there is no shortage of funds as far as the disaster relief is concerned. In fact, Sir, CRF and NCCF are mechanisms, and there are rules under which money is being released under the CRF. We have released the second instalment. The Prime Minister has announced a thousand crore, each for Karnataka and Andhra Pradesh; Rs.500 crores are being released. I have visited both States; I have spoken to both Chief Ministers. I received delegations. They have got enough balances. We have told

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**Q. No. 85 (Contd.)**

them, "You spend the money, and, then, once the assessment is made and whatever relief is to be granted from the NCCF will be granted." Money is not a constraint. They can spend the money and whenever the assessment is made, money will be reimbursed to them. We have already released the advance money. Today, NGOs are doing work; the State Government is doing work; the Central Government has done all that it has to do, in the immediate days, for relief and rehabilitation. Let me make it very clear that money is not a constraint in providing relief and rehabilitation to the affected people. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI AMAR SINGH:** Sir, how soon the assessment will be made?

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** No, no; no more questions. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI AMAR SINGH:** Money is not a constraint. Thank you, Sir. ... (Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** You can ask only two questions. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI AMAR SINGH:** Is there any mechanism about making a quick assessment? ... (Interruptions)... People are suffering there, Sir.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** This has been answered. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI AMAR SINGH:** That is one question. Thank you, Mr. Chidambaram.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** We can't have a discussion on this. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI AMAR SINGH:** What is the mechanism for making a quick assessment?

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 85 (Contd.)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** You have asked a question and it has been answered. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि :** सर ये लोग पैसा नहीं देते हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री सभापति :** आप बैठ जाइए प्लीज़। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री अमर सिंह :** असेसमेंट का मकैनिज्म क्या है? ..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Amar Singhji, please sit down.

**SHRI AMAR SINGH:** What is the mechanism? He has not answered, Sir. ...(Interruptions)... Money is not a constraint. Thank you, Mr. Chidambaram. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री सभापति :** अमर सिंह जी, प्लीज़। ..(व्यवधान)..

**SHRI AMAR SINGH:** What is this, Sir? ...(Interruptions)... What is the mechanism for making a quick assessment? ...(Interruptions)... What is this, Sir? ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Shri Jesudasu Seelam. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI AMAR SINGH:** What is the time frame? ...(Interruptions)... People are dying there. ...(Interruptions)... We want a time frame, a definite time frame. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** What is this, Sir? ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि :** सर, दो साल पहले उड़ीसा में बाढ़ आयी थी। ..(व्यवधान).. प्रधान मंत्री महोदय ने कहा था कि एक हजार करोड़ रुपए देंगे लेकिन केवल 25 करोड़ रुपए वहां पर दिए गए। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री सभापति :** पाणि जी, इंटरप्ट मत कीजिए। आप बैठ जाइए प्लीज़।

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि :** कहां एक हजार करोड़ रुपए और कहां 25 करोड़ रुपए। ..(व्यवधान).. वहां पर एक हजार करोड़ रुपए देने के लिए कहा गया था। स्वयं प्रधान मंत्री

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 85 (Contd.)

जी ने वहां जाकर यह ऐलान किया था कि एक हजार करोड़ रुपए दिए जाएंगे लेकिन..(व्यवधान)..यह बिल्कुल गलत कह रहे हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** No, no; this is not proper. ...(Interruptions)... पाणि जी, आप बैठ जाइए प्लीज़। Please don't interfere. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI AMAR SINGH:** What is the mechanism? And what is the time frame? ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** If you don't want that questions should be answered.....(Interruptions)... Please listen to me. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री शिवानन्द तिवारी :** दिल्ली की सरकार ने एक पैसा नहीं दिया है। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री के.बी.शणप्पा :** महोदय, मैं फ्लड अफेक्टिड एरिया से आता हूं। ..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Look, I have drawn the attention of the hon Members that this House runs on accepted procedures. If everybody wishes to speak at the same time, nobody will be heard. So please resume your places and go by the procedure. Shri Trivedi. ...(Interruptions)... Sorry, I have asked Mr. Seelam first. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Trivedi, you can ask after he finishes. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Seelam first.

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** Sir, it is really unfortunate that unprecedented damage has happened. Ten lakh people are reported to have been rendered homeless. Sir, the Government of Andhra Pradesh has come with a project to construct houses at a unit cost of Rs.70,000/-.

(Contd. by NBR/1J)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

-MKS/NBR-MCM/1J/11.40.

Q. No. 85 (Contd.)

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM (CONTD.):** It has asked for special assistance from the Central Government. I want to know the status of this.

Secondly, Sir,...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** One question has to be asked. But, you are asking two supplementaries.

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** Sir, it is about rehabilitation to the same people. The SHGs among the homeless have asked for postponement of their instalments by, at least, two months. We have met the bankers. They are refusing. The hon. Minister is saying that there is no shortage of funds. We are not saying that there is shortage of funds; there is shortage of will. The bankers are requested to postpone the instalments. They are really suffering. So, I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether there are any clear instructions to waive off the loans of the weaker sections -- the backward classes and petty traders whom Mr. Hanumantha Rao was referring to -- among the 10 lakh people. Is there any specific direction to complete the construction of 70,000 houses for 10 lakh homeless people in Andhra Pradesh and Karnataka?

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** One question will be answered.

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** So, I go for homeless.

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:** Sir, both the Chief Ministers have come forward with a large proposal for reconstruction. We have had the previous experience in the Tsunami and the Super-Cyclone in Orissa.



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**Q. No. 85 (Contd.)**

So, we have said that after relief and rehabilitation, which is the immediate task, reconstruction must be taken up. They have asked for extra houses under Indira Awas Yojna. They have asked for special assistance for reconstruction. We have said that once the reconstruction plan is given to the Government, it will be examined by the Planning Commission and funds, to the extent possible, will be provided by the Government. Sir, reconstruction is slightly a long term process. Immediate need is relief and rehabilitation. Reconstruction of houses is also on the agenda and likely address the issue. After Tsunami and after Super-Cyclone, the issue of reconstruction of houses in Andhra and Karnataka will also be addressed humanely, compassionately and with great sympathy.

**SHRI TRIVEDI:** Sir, we are talking about floods in Maharashtra, Andhra Pradesh and Karnataka. In these States, there are floods in one year and the second year there will be drought. I am talking about Mumbai. Sir, every year because of heavy rains, floods and water logging in Mumbai life is completely paralysed. Trains go out of gear for a number of days. Working hours are totally lost. And, this commercial capital is virtually comes to a halt for a number of days. So, my question is: what concrete steps that the Government is visualising to mitigate the hardships of the people in Mumbai which they are facing every year.

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:** Sir, although this question directly does not pertain to Mumbai, hon. Members are aware that after that unprecedented rains in Mumbai a few years ago, a plan has been drawn

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**Q. No. 85 (Contd.)**

up for Mumbai, including widening and deepening of river Mithi which runs through Mumbai. Money has been provided. The hon. Prime Minister announced a special grant to Mumbai. Funds have been provided under JNNURM to Mumbai. It is for the Government of Maharashtra to address the issue. Wherever they need help of the Central Government, let me assure you, the Central Government stands ready to help India's premier city and the commercial capital ... (Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Shri Das. I will allow you if you have a supplementary on this particular question... (Interruptions)... Only on this question.

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Sir, Mr. Madhu is from Andhra Pradesh. He should be given a chance to ask his question... (Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** No. Just a minute... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS:** Sir, my question is... (Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Just a minute... (Interruptions)... If you are putting a supplementary on this question, you go ahead... (Interruptions)... But, don't deviate.

**SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS:** Okay. Thank you, Sir... (Interruptions)... Sir, whenever the question of flood comes... (Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I am sorry... (Interruptions)... Mr. Sarkar, we cannot take questions like this... (Interruptions)... I am sorry. There should not be any agitation in this House... (Interruptions)... I am sorry... (Interruptions)... No. There will be no agitation in the House.

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 85 (Contd.)

**SHRI SITARAM YECHURY:** Sir, question pertains to Andhra Pradesh and Karnataka...(Interruptions)...You have allowed supplementary on Mumbai. You are allowing supplementaries on other States ...(Interruptions)...Hon. Member from Andhra Pradesh should also be given an opportunity to put his supplementary...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Yechuryji, please read the question...(Interruptions)...It pertains to Maharashtra also.

(FOLLOWED BY YSR "1K")

-NBR/YSR-GS/11.45/1K

**SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS:** Sir, my question is this. The Government is providing relief and rehabilitation plan for the flood affected people. In our region, every year the Government..(Interruptions)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I said you have to stick to this question. (Interruptions)

**SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS:** Sir, it is related to this question. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** This is not related to it. (Interruptions)

**SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS:** This question is about relief and rehabilitation, Sir. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I am sorry it is not. (Interruptions) I am afraid it is not. (Interruptions) If you will agitate I shall go to the next question. Please don't force me to do that. (Interruptions)

**SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS:** Then let there be a half-an-hour discussion on this matter. (Interruptions)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 85 (Contd.)

**श्री के.बी. शणप्पा :** सर, हम लोग कर्णाटक से आते हैं, हम भी सवाल पूछना चाहते हैं। ...  
(व्यवधान)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Das, please resume your place. (Interruptions) आप अपनी जगह पर बैठ जाइए। ... (व्यवधान)... आप कुछ कह रहे थे। आप फरमाइये। ...  
(व्यवधान)...

**श्री मनोहर जोशी :** सर, मैं महाराष्ट्र के बारे में कहना चाहता हूँ। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति :** जी, कहिए। ... (व्यवधान)...

**SHRI MANOHAR JOSHI:** Sir, in Maharashtra, Konkan region is affected by this. In Konkan, the Chief Minister of Maharashtra announced that the money would reach the people in two days. Forget two days, now almost twenty days have passed and money has not been sent to the people. I have personally visited the places and found that lot of damage is caused and the money has not reached the people even today. I would like to know from the Government whether the money will reach the people immediately. I can mention the name of places where I went. I am referring to Mahad, one of the places I visited, and the place next to that. Whether the Government can assure the poor people that the money will reach them within 24 hours.

**SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN:** Sir, no information regarding the damage caused has been received from the State of Maharashtra. But we will take up the matter positively with the Government of Maharashtra.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question No.86. (Interruptions)

**SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU:** Sir, we come from that area.

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 85 (Contd.)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I am aware of that. (Interruptions) But only three questions can be taken up as supplementary. (Interruptions)

**श्री के.बी. शणप्पा :** सर, हम कर्णाटक के बारे में सवाल पूछना चाहते हैं। ... (व्यवधान)...

**SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD:** Sir, one Member should be allowed from any political party. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** If you change the rules, I am with you. (Interruptions) Please don't do that. (Interruptions) If you want questions to be asked on the basis of regions and States, I would submit that you change the rules, I will implement them. (Interruptions) Question No.86, please. देखिए, सिर्फ टाइम जाया हो रहा है, कोई फायदा नहीं हो रहा है। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री बी.के. हरिप्रसाद :** हजारों करोड़ रुपया वहां के लिए मिलता है। ... (व्यवधान)... आपके मुख्य मंत्री खुद रो रहे थे। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि :** वह हमारे मुख्य मंत्री नहीं हैं, वह कर्णाटक के मुख्य मंत्री हैं। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति :** पाणि जी, ... (व्यवधान)... पाणि जी, आप बैठ जाइए। ... (व्यवधान)... Please. (Interruptions) One minute, gentlemen. I am afraid if this kind of interruption goes on, I will be forced to name Members. Please don't take me to this point. Question No.86.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

प्रश्न संख्या : 86

**श्री धर्म पाल सभ्रवाल** : सभापति महोदय, माननीय मंत्री जी ने जो उत्तर दिया है, उसमें यह लिखा है कि यह स्कीम 2001 में बनी थी और अब हम इसको लागू कर रहे हैं। मैं सदन को यह याद दिलाना चाहता हूँ कि स्पैक्ट्रम की जो स्कीम थी, वह भी 2003 में बनी थी। आज वह स्कीम समाचार पत्रों की हैडलाइन में छपी है और देश में चर्चा का विषय बन गई है। आ जो स्कीम लागू की जा रही है, इसमें ऐसे लोगों को यह ठेका दिया जा रहा है, जो विदेशों में काम करते रहे हों..।

**श्री सभापति** : आप सवाल पूछिए।

**श्री धर्म पाल सभ्रवाल** : ऐसे लोगों को ठेका दिया जा रहा है, जो विदेशों में काम करते रहे हों, लेकिन अभी तक अमेरिका, यू0के0, जर्मनी आदि देशों में ऐसी प्लेट का प्रचलन नहीं हुआ है और यह प्लेट 300 रुपये से लेकर 1800 रुपये में जनता को दी जाएगी।

(1एल पर आगे)

-GS/LP-VKK/11.50/1L

**श्री सभापति** : आप भाषण न दें, सवाल पूछिए।

**श्री धर्म पाल सभ्रवाल** : जहां तक इन्होंने स्पेसिफिकेशन दी है कि प्लेट की कितनी मोटाई होनी चाहिए, कैसी प्लेट होनी चाहिए, उसके बारे में इन्हें उसका मूल्य भी निश्चित करके देना चाहिए। सर, मैं आपके ध्यान में लाना चाहता हूँ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति** : आप सवाल पूछिए।

**श्री धर्म पाल सभ्रवाल** : मैं सवाल पूछ रहा हूँ। मैं आपके ध्यान में यह लाना चाहता हूँ कि अभी हाल ही में एक कंपनी ने असत्य कागजात बनाकर राजस्थान से प्लेटों का ऑर्डर लेने की कोशिश की...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति** : आप सवाल पूछिए।

**श्री धर्म पाल सभ्रवाल** : मैं माननीय महोदय से यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि जो कंपनी राजस्थान में असत्य दस्तावेज के आधार पर ऑर्डर लेना चाहती थी, क्या उसकी जांच गृह मंत्री से करवाएंगे और केंद्र द्वारा उनकी कीमत निर्धारित करेंगे ताकि एक जैसी कीमतें देश में चलें?



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**Q. No. 86 (Contd.)**

**श्री सभापति :** आप यह आखिरी जुमला पहले पढ़ सकते थे ताकि इतना टाइम बच जाता।

**SHRI R.P.N. SINGH:** Sir, the Bill for high security registration plates was introduced in 2001. It is primarily the concern of the States which are going to introduce the plates in the States. The Central Government is just going to assist the State Governments. The State Governments are going to take out the tenders. We have issued the basic guidelines from the Ministry under which the State Governments have to implement this policy. We have taken all measures and tried to initiate dialogue with the States to implement the introduction of plates in the States because it is a State subject. The hon. Member has made a mention about the State of Rajashtan. We are not inviting any tenders. The tenders are going to be invited by the State Governments and we are only facilitating the process.

**श्री धर्म पाल सभ्रवाल :** सभापति जी, राज्य सरकारों के लिए दिशा-निर्देश हैं कि ऐसी कंपनियों को ऑर्डर दिया जाए जो विदेशों में काम करती रही हैं। वे कंपनियां झूठे कागजात लेकर यहां से खरीद रही हैं। हिंदुस्तान में बहुत सी ऐसी कंपनियां हैं जो ये प्लेट बना सकती हैं। हमने ऐसी स्पेसिफिकेशन के साथ यह बात कैसे निश्चित की है कि उन्हीं लोगों की मोनोपोली बने? क्या आप इस पर विचार करेंगे?

**SHRI R.P.N. SINGH:** Sir, I would like to bring to the notice of the House that the Government of India has not given any specifications that only the people who have worked in other countries can do this work. We have very basic points. We have an eight-point programme which is in the notice inviting tender which does not specify that the contractor should have worked in any country because it is not a Central issue. We are not inviting tenders. Some States have come up with the idea that only those contractors can work who have participated in other countries. Sir, it is not an issue relating to the Central Government.

(ENDS)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009



Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009





Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009



Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

प्रश्न संख्या 87

**श्री शिवानन्द तिवारी :** सभापति महोदय, सरकार ने अपने उत्तर में बताया है कि ICRIER संगठन से इन लोगों ने संगठित क्षेत्र में जो खुदरा व्यापार है, उसके बारे में अध्ययन करवाया है और उस अध्ययन की रिपोर्ट इसमें जारी की है। यह पूरी की पूरी स्टडी ऑर्गेनाइज्ड सेक्टर के लोगों, संगठित क्षेत्र जो रीटेल में है, उनके पक्ष में है। यह फ्लड गेट खोलने के लिए लगता है कि जैसे जान-बूझकर यह स्टडी करवाई गई है ताकि और लोगों को भी इस मामले में लाइसेंस दिया जा सके, जबकि इस देश में स्वतंत्र एजेंसियों ने भी, संगठित क्षेत्र के खुदरा व्यापार का असंगठित क्षेत्र पर क्या असर पड़ा है, इसका अध्ययन किया है। उस अध्ययन से यह बात सामने आई है कि इसका रोजगार के मामले में और अन्य मामलों में भी इस देश में दुष्प्रभाव पड़ा है। हम जानते हैं कि असंगठित क्षेत्र में करीब 3.5 करोड़ से 4 करोड़ लोग एम्प्लोएड हैं, हम सरकार से जानना चाहते हैं कि यह जो बिल्कुल biased report है, इसको खारिज करके क्या दूसरी स्वतंत्र एजेंसी से इसका अध्ययन करवाएंगे?

(asc/1m पर आगे)

ASC-RSS/11.55/1M

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा :** सभापति महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय सदस्य को बताना चाहता हूँ कि जो ICRIER की रिपोर्ट है, इस देश के अंदर संगठित और असंगठित क्षेत्र में जो व्यापार है, उससे क्या प्रभाव पड़ा है, इसके लिए कराई गई थी। सरकार रिपोर्ट को स्वीकार नहीं कर रही थी, लेकिन जनता के सामने रिपोर्ट का ब्यौरा दिया गया है। जैसा कि मैंने प्रश्न के उत्तर में बताया है कि हमारे देश के अंदर जो डोमेस्टिक इन्वेस्टर्स हैं, उनको रिटेल सैक्टर में जाने पर कोई पाबंदी नहीं है। आर्गनाइज्ड और अन-आर्गनाइज्ड रिटेल को अगर देखा जाए, तो 96 प्रतिशत रिटेल असंगठित क्षेत्र में हैं और केवल चार प्रतिशत संगठित क्षेत्र में देश के अंदर हैं। आने वाले वर्षों में इसमें हर वर्ष 13 प्रतिशत की बढ़ोत्तरी होगी और 11 प्रतिशत असंगठित क्षेत्र में बढ़ोत्तरी होगी। यह सही है कि इसमें साढ़े तीन करोड़ से ज्यादा लोगों को रोजगार मिला है और जिस तरह से रिटेल का कारोबार देश में बढ़ रहा है, लोगों

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 87 (Contd.)

की आमदनी को देखते हुए, जहां पहले 37 करोड़ लोग 90 हजार औसत आमदनी सालाना रखते थे, अब 62 करोड़ लोग सन् 2011-2012 तक इतनी आमदनी रखेंगे, इसीलिए बढ़ोत्तरी होगी। इससे रोजगार भी बढ़ रहा है।

सभापति महोदय, मैं एक बात और कहना चाहता हूं कि संगठित क्षेत्र में आर्गनाइज्ड रिटेल से किसान को जो लाभ हो रहा है, मैं उसको भी सदन के सामने रखना चाहूंगा। किसान को उसकी उपज की ज्यादा कीमत मिलती है, उसको ज्यादा मुनाफा मिलता है बनिस्बत इसके कि वह मंडी में बेचे। फिर 96 प्रतिशत वहां का खुदरा व्यापार असंगठित क्षेत्र में है। असंगठित क्षेत्र में आज भी और आने वाले वर्षों में भी बढ़ोत्तरी होगी, कमी नहीं होगी।

**श्री शिवानन्द तिवारी :** सभापति महोदय, जिस रिपोर्ट की नीयत के बारे में मैंने संदेह व्यक्त किया है, उसी रिपोर्ट का हवाला देकर संगठित क्षेत्र में खुदरा व्यापार का समर्थन मंत्री जी ने किया है। मंत्री जी ने किसानों के बारे में कहा है कि किसानों को ज्यादा मुनाफा मिल रहा है। नेशनल सेम्पल सर्वे आर्गनाइजेशन ने जो सर्वे किया है, उसमें 40 परसेंट किसानों ने यह कहा है कि अगर हमें कोई दूसरा धंधा मिलेगा तो हम किसान का धंधा छोड़ देंगे। मैंने मंत्री जी से यह सवाल पूछा था कि यह रिपोर्ट संगठित क्षेत्र के पक्ष में है। क्या ऐसी भी स्वतंत्र एजेंसियां हैं, जिन्होंने इसके दुष्प्रभाव के बारे में चिंता व्यक्त की है कि रोजगार पर क्या प्रभाव पड़ा है और दूसरे क्षेत्रों पर क्या प्रभाव पड़ा है। मैंने स्पेसिफिक ढंग से पूछा है कि क्या इस विषय पर, मंत्री जी, सरकार दूसरा अध्ययन करवाना चाहती है?

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा :** सभापति महोदय, मैंने पहले भी माननीय सदस्य को बताया है कि असंगठित क्षेत्र में कोई प्रतिकूल प्रभाव नहीं पड़ा है और न ही रोजगार पर पड़ा है। रोजगार भी बढ़ा है और व्यापार भी बढ़ा है। ..(व्यवधान)..मैं रिपोर्ट के माध्यम से कह रहा हूं। मैं आपकी जानकारी के लिए दोबारा दोहरा रहा हूं कि आज भी 96 प्रतिशत खुदरा व्यापार असंगठित क्षेत्र के अंदर है, केवल चार प्रतिशत संगठित क्षेत्र में है। जो आपका डोमेस्टिक इन्वेस्टर है, उस पर इस देश के कानून में कोई पाबंदी नहीं है और न ही ऐसी कोई नीति है। ..(व्यवधान)..जो प्रश्न माननीय सदस्य पूछ रहे हैं, मैं उसी का उत्तर दूंगा। ...(व्यवधान)..

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Q. No. 87 (Contd.)

**श्री शिवानन्द तिवारी :** जो सवाल पूछा गया है, उसका जवाब नहीं दिया गया है और इसी बात को दोहराया जा रहा है। ये इससे पहले भी यह बात कह चुके हैं।

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा :** देखिए, जब जवाब एक ही है, तो मैं दो जवाब कैसे दे दूँ? दूसरे, आप नीयत की बात कर रहे हैं, तो मैं आपकी संतुष्टि के लिए अपनी सरकार की बदनीयती स्वीकार करुं और आपकी बात को मान लूँ।...(व्यवधान)..मैं ऐसा उत्तर नहीं दे सकता।...(व्यवधान)..

**श्री शिवानन्द तिवारी :** मैंने यह नहीं कहा है। ..(व्यवधान).. मैंने कहा है कि क्या आप दूसरा अध्ययन करवाएंगे? ..(व्यवधान).. आप दूसरी स्टडी करवाएंगे, मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ?...(व्यवधान).. क्या सरकार दूसरी स्टडी करवाने के लिए तैयार है?

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा :** जब आप नीयत की बात करते हैं, मैं उसकी ....(व्यवधान)..

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Sir, I want to know whether there is any change in policies as far as FDI into the retail sector is concerned because in the newspaper reports relating to the Prime Minister's visit to the US, we have seen that you are changing your policy on this. Please give a categorical statement in the House.

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** Sir, I am responding to the question which is there before the House. I am not responding to what Mrs. Karat has said about a newspaper report emanating from the United States of America. Secondly, we have a very clear policy as I have mentioned that in the extant policy, no FDI is allowed in the retail sector and we have no intent to review FDI in the retail sector except what is permitted, a single brand retail, and that too in specific products in the IN chain.

(Ends)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question Hour is over.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

MKS-AKG/12.00/1N

**(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.)**

**PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE**

1. **SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA:** Sir, I lay on the Table

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry (Department of Commerce) Notification G.S.R. 760 (E), dated the 16<sup>th</sup> March, 2009, publishing the Rubber (Amendment) Rules, 2009, under sub-section (3) of Section 25 of the Rubber Act, 1947.

II. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry (Department of Commerce) Notification G.S.R. 443 (E), dated the 23<sup>rd</sup> June, 2009, publishing the Tea Board (Recruitment and Conditions of Service of Directors of Tea Promotion appointed by Government) Amendment Rules, 2007, under sub-section (3) of Section 49 of the Tea Act, 1953.

III. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry under sub-section (2) of Section 49 of the Special Economic Zone Act, 2005, together with Statement of Objects and Reasons and Statement of Explanatory Notes:

Draft Notification F.No.C.3/9/2008-SEZ, dated Nil, December, 2009, proposing to exempt the setting up offsite Automated Teller Machines and branches by banks in Special Economic Zones, not concerned as offshore Banking Units; from the provision of clause (v) of section 2 of the Special Economic Zones Act, 2005.

Draft Notification F.No.D6/12/2009-SEZ, dated Nil, December, 2009, proposing to exempt Special Economic Zones from the requirement of obtaining distribution licence.

IV. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry (Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion), under sub-section (2H) of Section 29B of the Industries (Development and Regulation) Act, 1951:

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

4. S.O. 2155 (E), dated the 24<sup>th</sup> August, 2009, publishing the Newsprint Control (Amendment) Order, 2009.
5. S.O. 2156 (E), dated the 24<sup>th</sup> August, 2009, publishing the Newsprint Control (Amendment) Order, 2009.

V. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) of Section 619A of the Companies Act, 1956:ꣳ

- (a) Fourth Annual Report and Accounts of the Jammu and Kashmir Development Finance Corporation Limited (JKDFC), Jammu, for the year 2008-09, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.

2. **SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN:** Sir, I lay on the Table, under Section 77 of the Disaster Management Act, 2005, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Home Affairs Notification G.S.R. 682 (E), dated the 16<sup>th</sup> September, 2009, publishing the National Disaster Management Authority (Group A Posts) Recruitment Rules, 2009.

3. **SHRI HARISH RAWAT:** Sir, I lay on the Table

- I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the National Policy on HIV/AIDS and the World of Work.
- II. A Statement (in English and Hindi) on Action taken or proposed to be taken on the ILO Convention No. 127 and Recommendation No. 128 concerning Maximum Weight adopted at the 51<sup>st</sup> Session of the International Labour Conference held in Geneva in 1967.

4. **SHRI R.P.N SINGH:** Sir, I lay on the Table

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways, under Section 10 of the National Highways Act, 1956:

- S.O. 2114 (E), dated the 13<sup>th</sup> August, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from Km. 60.680 to Km.100.000 (Nagpur-Dhule Section) on National Highway No. 6 in Wardha District in the State of Maharashtra.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

- S.O. 2243 (E), dated the 3<sup>rd</sup> September, 2009, publishing corrigendum to Notification No S.O. 2473 (E), dated the 17<sup>th</sup> October, 2008.
- S.O. 2534 (E), dated the 6<sup>th</sup> October, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from Km.115.500 to Km.126.000 (Kalamboli-Mumbra Section) on National Highway No. 4 in Raigad District in the State of Maharashtra.
- S.O. 2535 (E), dated the 6<sup>th</sup> October, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from Km. 126.000 to Km.131.500 (Kalamboli-Mumbra Section) on National Highway No. 4 in Thane District in the State of Maharashtra.
- S.O. 2537 (E), dated the 6<sup>th</sup> October, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from Km. 265.000 to Km.287.500 (Pimpalgaon-Dhule Section) on National Highway No. 3 in Dhule District in the State of Maharashtra.
- S.O. 1345 (E), dated the 26<sup>th</sup> May, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, from Km. 278.620 (New chainage 747.081) to Km.279.620 (New chainage 748.081) on National Highway No. 2 in Sant Ravidas Nagar Bhadohi District in the State of Uttar Pradesh.
- S.O. 1582 (E), dated the 30<sup>th</sup> June, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from Km. 8.250 to Km.137.000 (Lucknow-Faizabad Section) on National Highway No.28 in Faizabad District in the State of Uttar Pradesh.
- (8) S.O. 1628 (E), dated the 4<sup>th</sup> July, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from Km. 239.700 to Km. 241.100 (Kozhikode-Kollegal Section) on National Highway No. 212 in Mysore District in the State of Karnataka.
- (9) S.O. 1629 (E), dated the 4<sup>th</sup> July, 2009, regarding acquisition of land with or without structure, from Km 322.180 to Km 322.250 (Old Madras Road Section) on National Highway No. 4 in Bangalore Urban District in the State of Karnataka.
- (10) S.O. 1732 (E), dated the 14<sup>th</sup> July, 2009, regarding acquisition of land with or without structure, from Km 244.000 to Km. 245.000 (Ankola-Gooty Section) on National Highway No.63 in Koppal

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

District in the State of Karnataka.

- (11) S.O. 1733 (E), dated the 14<sup>th</sup> July, 2009, regarding acquisition of land with or without structure, from Km. 201.000 to Km.202.000 (Bangalore-Mangalore Section) on National Highway No. 48 in Hassan District in the State of Karnataka.
- (12) S.O. 2277 (E), dated the 7<sup>th</sup> September, 2009, regarding appointment of competent authority for acquisition of land for construction of Bypass to Hubli City connecting National Highway No.218, National Highway No. 63 and National Highway No. 4 in the State of Karnataka.

(Ends)

**MESSAGE FROM LOK SABHA****THE RUBBER (AMENDMENT) BILL, 2009**

**SECRETARY-GENERAL:** Sir, I have to report to the House the following message received from the Lok Sabha, signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha:-

"In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the Rubber (Amendment) Bill, 2009, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 24<sup>th</sup> November, 2009."

Sir, I lay a copy of the Bill on the Table.

(Ends)

**REPORT OF DEPARTMENT RELATED PARLIAMENTARY  
STANDING COMMITTEE ON HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT**

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN (TAMIL NADU):** Sir, I present the Two Hundred Eighteenth Report (in English and Hindi) of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Human

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

Resource Development on The National Commission for Minority Educational Institutions (Amendment) Bill, 2009. (Ends)

**REPORT OF COMMITTEE ON WELFARE OF  
SCHEDULED CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES**

**SHRI PRAVEEN RASHTRAPAL (GUJARAT):** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the First Report of the Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes on Reservation for and Employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Oil and Natural Gas Corporation Limited (ONGC).

(Ends)

**REPORT OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON FOOD, CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC  
DISTRIBUTION**

**SHRI MATILAL SARKAR (TRIPURA):** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the First Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Food, Consumer Affairs and Public Distribution (2009-10) on Action Taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations of the Committee contained in their Twenty-seventh Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) pertaining to the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Consumer Affairs).

(Ends)

**REPORTS OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY  
STANDING COMMITTEE ON HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE**



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**SHRI AMAR SINGH (UTTAR PRADESH):** Sir, I present a copy each of the following Action Taken Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare:

(i) Thirty-fifth Report on Action Taken Note (ATN) furnished by the Department of Health and Family Welfare on the recommendations/observations contained in Committees Twenty-seventh Report on Demands-for-Grants (2008-09) of the Department;

(ii) Thirty-sixth Report on Action Taken Note (ATN) furnished by the Department of AYUSH on the recommendations/observations contained in Committees Twenty-eighth Report on Demands-for- Grants (2008-09) of the Department; and

(iii) Thirty-seventh Report on Action Taken Note (ATN) furnished by the Department of Health Research on the recommendations/observations contained in Committees Twenty-ninth Report on Demands-for- Grants (2008-09) of the Department.

(Ends)

**MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE COMMITTEE ON  
OFFICIAL LANGUAGE**

**गृह मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री अजय माकन) :** महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित प्रस्ताव उपस्थित करता हूँ :-

"राजभाषा अधिनियम, 1963 (1963 का 19) की धारा 4 की उप-धारा (2) के अनुसरण में, यह सभा 18 सितंबर, 2009 से समिति की सदस्यता से श्री मतिलाल सरकार के त्यागपत्र के कारण रिक्त हुए स्थान पर सभा के सदस्यों में से एक सदस्य को आनुपातिक प्रतिनिधित्व प्रणाली के अनुसार एकल संक्रमणीय मत द्वारा राजभाषा समिति का सदस्य होने के लिए निर्वाचित करने की कार्यवाही करे।"

**The question was put and the motion was adopted.**

(समाप्त)

**MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE CENTRAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
FOR THE NATIONAL CADET CORPS**

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI A.K. ANTONY):** Sir, I move the following Motion:

"That in pursuance of clause (i) of sub-section (1) read with sub-section (1A) of Section 12 of the National Cadet Corps Act, 1948 (XXXI of 1948), this House do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Chairman may direct, one Member from among the Members of the House, to be a member of the Central Advisory Committee for the National Cadet Corps".

**The question was put and the motion was adopted.**

(Ends)

(Followed by TMV/10)

-MKS-TMV-SCH/10/12.05

**CALLING ATTENTION TO THE STATUS OF PREPARATION  
FOR COMMONWEALTH GAMES, 2010.**

**श्री कलराज मिश्र (उत्तर प्रदेश):** माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, मैं 'राष्ट्रमंडल खेल, 2010 की तैयारी की स्थिति' के बारे में खेल मंत्री जी का ध्यान आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ।

**THE MINISTER OF YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS (DR. M. S. GILL):**

Sir, the Commonwealth Games is a mega multidisciplinary sporting event in which around 8,000 sportspersons from 71 nations and territories of the Commonwealth will take part in 17 sports disciplines. The Games will be held in Delhi from 3<sup>rd</sup> to 14<sup>th</sup> October, 2010.

The 19<sup>th</sup> Commonwealth Games were allotted to Delhi on 13<sup>th</sup> November, 2003. The Host City Contract, which is the governing document for the games and lays down the responsibilities, roles and obligations, was signed in November, 2003. The signatories were the Government of India, the Government of Delhi, the Commonwealth Games Federation and the Indian Olympic Association.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

The Organising Committee of the Commonwealth Games was registered as a society with the Registrar of Societies, Government of Delhi on 10<sup>th</sup> February, 2005. The OC thereafter became a signatory to the Games.

In the overall schemes for the preparation for the Commonwealth Games, the sports infrastructure is to be developed by Government agencies and funded by the Government. The responsibility for the conduct and delivery of the Games is of the Organising Committee. For this purpose, the OC is funded upfront by the Government as a loan, to be recouped on the basis of revenue neutrality. The development, upgradation and improvement of the city infrastructure are to be done by the Government of Delhi, with the support of the Government of India.

Out of the seventeen sports disciplines of the Games, nine will be held in the stadia of the Sports Authority of India, four in the stadia of Delhi Development Authority and one each at the venues of the Government of Delhi, New Delhi Municipal Council, Delhi University and All India Tennis Association. A table, stadium-wise, showing the expected dates of completion is provided in the Annexure which is submitted to you, Sir, and will be circulated in due course. The estimated cost of the Competition and Training venues is around Rs.4,100 crores. Financial sanctions for all the stadia have been accorded and the work is progressing at a rapid pace. The work on three stadia, namely, Dr. S.P.M. Swimming Complex, Dr. Karni Singh Shooting Range and the Cycling Velodrome had a delayed start due to

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

some design issues. All possible measures are being taken, including increase in number of supervisory staff and labour, increase in working hours, deployment of additional machinery and close monitoring of procurement of special and critical items. The Group of Ministers constituted for the Games reviews the progress every week. The stadia will be completed in time for the Commonwealth Games to be held in October, 2010.

I may mention that most of the stadia were started in 2008 and some in 2007. The Games were signed in 2003.

The OC is responsible for the conduct and delivery of the Games, which includes all logistical and stay arrangements for about 8,000 sportspersons, as well as, all arrangements for the technical officials and media persons. The OC is also responsible for the technical conduct of the sports, sponsorship, ticketing, merchandizing, ceremonies, etc.

(Contd. by 1P/VK)

VK/1P/12.10

**DR. M.S. GILL (CONTD):** The Government has sanctioned a budget of Rs. 1,620 crores for the Organising Committee. In September, 2009, the President, Commonwealth Games Federation, (CGF), expressed some concerns related to the capacity of the OC, to deliver operationally. On the occasion of the launch of the Queen's Baton in London in October, 2009 these matters were discussed between the President, CGF and the Chairman, OC in the presence of the Minister of Youth Affairs and Sports, and they were resolved amicably to the satisfaction of both CGF and OC. A joint statement affirming this was issued thereafter. In order

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

to strengthen the internal management and financial administration of the OC, at the request of the Chairman, OC, a retired Secretary to the Government of India was posted in the OC as Chief Executive Officer in October, 2009. Three other senior serving officers, including a Finance Expert -- they already have one -- were also made available to the OC. All the officers have joined and are functioning.

The Games Village is being developed near the Akshardham Temple by the DDA, on Public-Private Partnership model. The work is being closely monitored by the Ministry of Urban Development. The work is well on schedule and will be completed in time.

The development and upgradation of the city infrastructure is the responsibility of the Government of Delhi. Major upgradation works have been planned and are under implementation, including the Barapulla Nala Elevated Corridor, which will provide a quick access to sportspersons from the Games Village to the Jawaharlal Nehru Stadium. The Chief Minister of Delhi is carefully monitoring these works and addressing issues as they arise. The GOMs also reviews these works regularly. The wide range of city development works including augmentation of road, metro and other transportation and communication networks, traffic management system, will leave a lasting legacy after the Games.

The Government is investing substantial amount for the upgradation of the various stadia to be used for the Games. These stadia will become state of the art venues of international standard. Some of them are really high level international standard stadia in terms

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

of architecture, etc. A revenue generation mechanism is being evolved which will ensure the upkeep and maintenance of these facilities at optimum levels, and, at the same time, their use for sports activities after the Games.

The Ministry of Tourism is also working on making available adequate accommodation for the visitors during the Games. Taking into account the current availability of hotel rooms in the NCR, an additional requirement of 30,000 rooms has been estimated by the Ministry of Tourism. Apart from the additional hotel accommodation being developed in Delhi and NCR, guest houses are being upgraded and housing units of DDA will be operated as guest houses. Together with bed and breakfast establishments in the city, the requirement of additional rooms for the Commonwealth Games should be met. A Task Force under the Secretary, Tourism is monitoring the availability of hotel accommodation.

The Prasar Bharati has been designated as the Host Broadcaster for the Games. The latest technology will be used for broadcasting during the Games. For the first time in the history of the Commonwealth Games, the entire transmission will be in High Definition TV (HDTV) format. The Prasar Bharati has already engaged a top level international consultant for production and coverage and is in the process of engaging a Consultant for the International Broadcasting Centre. The work is being done under close supervision of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

Security during the Games is a matter of utmost importance. The Ministry of Home Affairs and the LG of Delhi are closely monitoring all the security arrangements for the Games. An Empowered Security Committee headed by the Home Secretary regularly reviews the security schemes and arrangements for the Games. A Comprehensive Security Plan has been drawn up which incorporates Venue Emergency Management Plan, Disaster Recovery Plan, Transport Security Plan and Airspace Surveillance and Protection Plan.

(Contd. by 1Q)

RG/DS/12.15/1Q

**DR. M.S. GILL (contd.):** A fully integrated Venue Surveillance Scheme is being developed along with a Secure Security Communications System. The Ministry of Home Affairs has held security briefing of High Commissioners of Commonwealth Countries on 9<sup>th</sup> September, 2009, and a Security Administrators' Conference was held in Delhi on 23<sup>rd</sup> September, 2009, to apprise the representatives of all the countries, with the security arrangements for the Games. The Ministry of Home Affairs and the L.G. of Delhi are taking all necessary measures to ensure that the Games are completely incident-free and are conducted in a safe and secure environment.

To improve the performance of our athletes in the Commonwealth Games, for the first time, the Government has approved in June, 2008, a Scheme at a cost of Rs.678 crores for a comprehensive training and coaching of athletes. One thousand and sixty four core athletes of 17 sports disciplines have been selected and are undergoing intensive

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

training and exposure. One hundred and fifty eight Indian and twenty-four foreign coaches of the highest calibre have been engaged for their training, along with 70 other support personnel including sports analysts, sports medicine doctors and physiotherapists. Teams are being sent regularly on visits abroad for training and competitions. It is expected that with these measures, our sportspersons will do very well in the Commonwealth Games.

Finally, I would like to assure the House that the Government of India and the Organizing Committee are fully committed to complete all preparations for the Games in good time and to train our athletes for a good performance.

(Ends)

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA:** सर, आप घड़ी देख लीजिए। It is not showing the correct time.

**श्री उपसभापति:** मैं इस घड़ी के बारे में बता देता हूँ। It has not been functioning since yesterday. But we cannot fiddle with it because it has a centralised connection.

**श्रीमती वृंदा कारत:** सर, इसीलिए जब मैं बोल रही थी कि घड़ी इतनी तेजी से चल रही है ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री उपसभापति:** नहीं, नहीं। मैं यह घड़ी देखता हूँ, वह घड़ी नहीं देखता हूँ।

**डा. (श्रीमती) नजमा ए. हेपतुल्ला:** सर, इतना लम्बा स्टेटमेंट है। How can we finish it in one hour?

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Since it is an exhaustive statement, there is very little scope for any clarification.



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN:** You have said it right. I don't think anybody needs to speak.

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** There are indeed a lot of clarifications that we need to seek.

**श्री कलराज मिश्र (उत्तर प्रदेश):** उपसभापति जी, माननीय खेल मंत्री जी ने कॉमनवेल्थ गेम्स के बारे में जो तैयारियाँ चल रही हैं, उसके बारे में विवरण में बताया है। लागत क्या लग रही है, इसके बारे में भी उल्लेख किया है और यह भी कहा है कि ये सारी चीजें हो रही हैं, लेकिन कितनी हुई हैं, कब हो जाएंगी, कैसे होंगी? इससे पहले जो सारे विवाद उभर कर सामने आये थे, उनको इसमें सुनिश्चित नहीं किया गया है। यह तो सौभाग्य है कि कॉमनवेल्थ गेम्स हमारे देश में हो रहे हैं। यह प्रत्येक देशवासी के लिए एक गौरव की बात है। इसके पहले "एशियाड" हुआ था। "एशियाड" में जिस तरीके से भारत ने एशिया के देशों का अतिथि के रूप में सम्मान किया और जिस तरीके से वह यहाँ रहे, उससे स्वाभाविक रूप से सभी लोग प्रभावित हुए। इस कॉमनवेल्थ गेम्स पर पूरे विश्व की नजर इस दृष्टि से लगी हुई है कि भारत के अंदर इसके आयोजन को सफल बनाने की दृष्टि से किस ढंग से प्रयत्न किये जा रहे हैं। ऐसे समय में आयोजन समिति और खेल महासंघ के बीच में जो आपस के विवाद चालू हो गये हैं, इसके कारण लोगों को लगने लगा है कि आखिर यह सफलता हम कैसे प्राप्त करेंगे, क्योंकि दोनों महत्वपूर्ण हैं। आयोजन समिति के अध्यक्ष हमारे ओलम्पिक एसोसिएशन के प्रमुख कलमाड़ी जी और महासंघ के अध्यक्ष Mr. Michael Fennell के बीच जबर्दस्त विवाद चल रहा है। यह विवाद इस स्तर तक पहुँचा है कि महासंघ के अध्यक्ष ने प्रधान मंत्री को पत्र लिखा कि सही समय पर चीजें नहीं हो रही हैं। प्रधान मंत्री ने भी इसे स्वीकार किया कि सही समय पर चीजें नहीं हो रही हैं।

(1आर/वीएनके पर क्रमशः)

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**श्री कलराज मिश्र (क्रमागत) :** आपस में विवाद इतना बढ़ गया है कि दूसरे अधिकारी को हटाने की बात भी की जाने लगी है। अब इसका परिणाम यह हुआ है कि अंतर्राष्ट्रीय जगत में जो कॉमनवेल्थ के देश हैं, उनमें समाचार पत्रों के माध्यम से यह शुरू हो गया है कि हिन्दुस्तान में कैसे खेल होगा और इसको लेकर फिर चीजें इस तरीक से बढ़ी हैं कि आयोजन समिति को उपेक्षित करते हुए निगरानी समिति बनानी पड़ गई। निगरानी समिति की मॉनिटरिंग मंत्री महोदय के द्वारा और बाकी लोगों के द्वारा प्रधान मंत्री के पास जाएगी और मंत्री जी उसके मुखिया हैं। यह जो स्थिति बनी है, यह परस्पर विवाद पैदा करने की दृष्टि से बहुत भयंकर है और जब परस्पर विवाद होगा, तो कितनी सफलता होगी, इस पर एक प्रश्नवाचक चिन्ह लग जाता है। यह परस्पर विवाद क्यों हुआ, यह आगे स्वयं स्पष्ट होता जा रहा है। इतना ही नहीं, मान्यवर, मैं यह भी कहना चाहता हूँ कि जो आयोजन समिति के महामंत्री और ओलंपिक एशोसियन के महामंत्री श्रीमान रणधीर सिंह जी हैं, उन्होंने पत्रकार वार्ता में दो बातें कही हैं। एक बात तो उन्होंने यह कही है कि 38 ऐसी सब-कमेटीज हैं, जिनको activate ही नहीं किया गया है, जब ऐसी कमेटीज को activate ही नहीं किया जाएगा, तो काम कैसे होगा। उन्होंने यह भी कहा है कि एक सौ करोड़ रुपए में विदेश से Fennell के द्वारा 40 experts को बुलाया गया, ताकि समय से सारी चीजें हो जाए, इसके लिए बुलाया गया, तो फिर सारी चीजें समय से क्यों नहीं चल रही हैं? फिर Fennell और इन लोगों के बीच में विवाद क्यों शुरू हो गया? फिर निगरानी समिति बनाने की आवश्यकता क्या पड़ गई? एक अजीब प्रकार की विरोधाभास की स्थिति का निर्माण हुआ है, जिसके कारण भारत में ही नहीं बल्कि बाकी के देशों में भी एक आशंका की स्थिति का निर्माण हुआ है। यह जो स्थिति बनी है, वह आयोजन और आयोजन समिति के महासंघ, जिनके द्वारा सारी चीजें संचालित होने वाली हैं, के बीच में जब यह चीज पड़ गई है, तो यह बहुत विचित्र प्रकार की स्थिति दिखाई पड़ रही है और हिन्दुस्तान के आम नागरिक को यह महसूस होने लगा है कि सही में आपस में विवाद और झगड़े के कारण यह सफल हो जाएगा या नहीं हो जाएगा, हिन्दुस्तान की संस्कृति पर कोई प्रश्न चिन्ह न लग जाए, कहीं लोग इसको विवादित बनाने की कोशिश न करे!

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

इतना ही नहीं, आपने खेल परिसर के बारे में बताया कि 17 खेल परिसर हैं। 17 खेल परिसरों में से दो संस्थान में लगभग कार्य पूरे हो चुके हैं (समय की घंटी)।

**श्री उपसभापति** : आपके लिए पांच मिनट का ही समय है। For the main speaker, it is five minutes and, for others, it is three minutes each.

**श्री कलराज मिश्र** : श्रीमन्, मैं आपसे प्रार्थना कर रहा हूँ कि अभी मुझे और बोलने दिया जाए। श्रीमन्, अगर आपको लगता है कि मैं अनर्गल बात कर रहा हूँ, तो मुझे बैठा दीजिए ..(व्यवधान)..।

**डा.(श्रीमती) नजमा ए. हेपतुल्ला** : मंत्री जी ने पांच मिनट पढा है, इनको भी बोलने दिया जाए ..(व्यवधान)..।

**श्री उपसभापति** : यह तो clarification है।

**श्री कलराज मिश्र** : श्रीमन्, ये चीजें आई नहीं है। जो चीजें नहीं आई हैं, उसको हम प्रस्तुत नहीं करेंगे, तो कौन करेगा?

**श्री उपसभापति** : यह ठीक है, मगर समय की भी पाबंदी है।

**श्री कलराज मिश्र** : श्रीमन्, 17 खेल परिसरों में से केवल दो संस्थान ही तैयार हुए हैं, आप इसकी तथ्यात्मक जांच करा लीजिए, पांच स्थानों पर पचास फीसदी कार्य हुआ है, दस स्थानों पर अभी भी तीस फीसदी ही कार्य पूरा हुआ है, दो स्थानों की प्रगति चिंताजनक है, यह बाकायदा प्रश्न के जो उत्तर दिए गए हैं, उनमें से मैं बता रहा हूँ और तीरंदाजी के लिए यमुना खेल परिसर दिल्ली विकास प्राधिकरण जो बनाया जा रहा है, उसमें 6.75 परसेंट ही कार्य हुआ है, यह तैयारी की स्थिति है। आगे चलकर क्या स्थिति बनेगी, यह कहा नहीं जा सकता है।

मान्यवर, जो आवासीय व्यवस्था है, आवासीय व्यवस्था की स्थिति यह है कि लगभग आठ हजार खिलाड़ी और उससे जुड़े हुए लगभग एक लाख से डेढ़ लाख के बीच लोग आ सकते हैं। इनके लिए चालीस हजार कमरे की आवश्यकता पड़ेगी। इसका जिक्र आपने भी किया है। तब तक हमारे पास तीस हजार कमरे तैयार हो पाएंगे, बाकी लोगों को दिल्ली कैसे संभाल पाएगी, यह बहुत बड़ा प्रश्न है।

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

श्रीमन्, इसके लिए 2007 में खेलों के संबंध में जो सौ योजनाओं की घोषणा की गई थी, मैं तो आपके द्वारा जो आंकड़े दिए गए हैं, उन्हीं का जिक्र करना चाहता हूँ, उनमें से 60 पर ही कार्य शुरू हो पाया है और पर्यटन मंत्रालय के अनुसार 115 होटल साइट्स में केवल 63 सुनिश्चित श्रेणी में हैं, 21 संभावित श्रेणी में हैं और 31 अनिश्चय की श्रेणी में हैं।

(1s/MP पर आगे)

MP-TDB/1S/12.25

**श्री कलराज मिश्र (क्रमागत) :** यह हालत आवास की है। फिर आपकी आवासीय व्यवस्था कैसे पूर्ण होगी? मुझे नहीं लगता कि ऐसी स्थिति में आपकी आवासीय व्यवस्था पूर्ण हो पाएगी।

महोदय, आपने सुरक्षा के संबंध में भी बातें कही हैं। यह बात सही है कि इस समय इन खेलों को ध्यान में रखते हुए आतंकवादियों की दृष्टि भी हिंदुस्तान पर लगी हुई है और इसके लिए आपको विशेष व्यवस्था करनी पड़ेगी। जब चीन में ओलम्पिक खेल हो रहे थे, तो उस समय भी उन्होंने बहुत आधुनिकतम सुरक्षा व्यवस्था की थी लेकिन उसके बावजूद भी वहां कुछ आतंकवादियों ने गड़बड़ करने की कोशिश की थी और कुछ लोगों की जानें गई थीं। आपने सुरक्षा की दृष्टि से 370 करोड़ की योजना बनाई है और इस 370 करोड़ की योजना के अंतर्गत आप क्या-क्या करने वाले हैं, यह कुछ सुनिश्चित नहीं हो पाया है लेकिन इसमें से 85 हजार सुरक्षाकर्मी लगाए जाएंगे, यह बात कही गई है। अब उनकी भर्ती हो रही है या नहीं हो रही है, कब होगी, उनकी ट्रेनिंग कब होगी, कैसे किया जाएगा - इसका इसमें जिक्र नहीं है। साथ ही साथ चिकित्सा आदि की भी व्यवस्था आपको करनी है, जिसका आपने इसमें उल्लेख भी किया है, लेकिन किस प्रकार से होगी, किन स्थानों पर होगी, इसका कोई जिक्र नहीं है।

महोदय, बजट पहले की तुलना में ज्यादा बढ़ाया गया है। पहले 797 करोड़ का बजट था, जो अब बढ़ाकर 1620 करोड़ हो गया है। मान्यवर, सवाल इस बात का है कि जो आयोजन समिति है, वह इन खेलों से 1708 करोड़ रुपए के राजस्व प्राप्ति की उम्मीद करती है लेकिन जो निर्माण कार्य हैं, उसमें इतने पैसे को इतने कम समय में कैसे खर्च कर पाएंगे, कुछ कहा नहीं जा सकता। अभी तक जो निर्माण कार्य की स्थिति आपके सामने आई

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

है, उसकी गुणवत्ता में ज़बरदस्त कमी आई है और स्वयं दिल्ली में भी जिस तरीके से सारी चीज़ें उभरकर आई हैं, उसमें लगता है कि जो भी चीज़ें ली जा रही हैं, ये उचित मापदंड के आधार पर नहीं ली जा रही हैं। गुणवत्ता में कमी के कारण उनके अंदर खामियां पैदा हुई हैं और इससे लगता है कि जो इतना भारी भरकम बजट आया है, जिस तरीके से इसका समुचित utilisation होना चाहिए, उसका utilisation नहीं हो पा रहा है। कहीं न कहीं जो आपस में झगड़े हो रहे हैं, चाहे कमेटीज़ के हों, चाहे बाकी सारी चीज़ों के हों, तो कहीं वे पैसे के कारण तो नहीं हो रहे हैं? ..(समय की घंटी).. या बड़े बजट के कारण तो नहीं हो रहे हैं? ..(समय की घंटी).. तो इसमें यह भी संदेह दिखाई पड़ रहा है कि पैसे का दुरुपयोग, पैसे का गलत तरीके से उपयोग, एक तरह से हम कहें कि भ्रष्टाचरण के अंतर्गत हो रहा है, तो अतिशयोक्ति नहीं होगी। तो इसकी भी व्यापक स्तर पर जांच करनी चाहिए अन्यथा सम्पूर्ण मिलाकर जो आयोजन की तरफ से व्यवस्था की गई है, जो खेल की तैयारी की जा रही है, यदि सम्पूर्णता में देखा जाए तो ऐसा लग रहा है कि 3 अक्टूबर, 2010 से पहले यह तैयार हो जाएगा या नहीं हो जाएगा, यह कहा नहीं जा सकता है। साथ ही साथ यमुना की तलहटी में ...(समय की घंटी)...

**श्री उपसभापति :** कलराज जी....देखिए, बहुत से ऑनरेबल मैम्बर्स ने अभी बोलना है। ...(व्यवधान)... There are many hon. Members who have to speak on this, and we have to finish it within one hour. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री कलराज मिश्र :** यमुना की तलहटी में खिलाड़ियों को ठहराने की व्यवस्था की गई है। ...(व्यवधान)... एक मिनट .... तो जो व्यवस्था की गई है, उसके बगल से रेल लाइन गुज़रती है। उसके शोर को खिलाड़ी और अतिथि कैसे सह पाएंगे, ये सारी चीज़ें भी देखनी पड़ेंगी। जिन-जिन स्थानों पर ठहराने की व्यवस्था की जा रही है, नोएडा में ठहराने की व्यवस्था की जा रही है, वहां भी किस तरीके से चीज़ें की जा रही हैं ...(समय की घंटी).. अभी तक ढंग से साइट नहीं देखी जा सकी है। इसलिए मान्यवर, मैं चाहूंगा कि ये सारी चीज़ें सम्पूर्णता में देखते हुए कहां-कहां गड़बड़ हो रही है, उसको आइडेंटिफाई करें और जिस बात को हमने आपके सामने उठाया है, उसको स्पष्ट करने की कृपा करें तो बहुत

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

अच्छा होगा, विशेषकर आयोजन समिति और Fennell ने जो निगरानी समिति बनाई है, उसमें कौन-कौन हैं, किस तरीके से नॉमिनेट किया है और कौन विदेशी विशेषज्ञ आने वाले हैं, इसके बारे में अगर बताएंगे तो ज्यादा अच्छा होगा, बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, I would like to remind all of you about the Bulletin which we have issued only recently. As per that Bulletin, a Member who initiates the Calling Attention should not take more than seven minutes and other Members who are called by the Chair should not take more than five minutes each and should restrict themselves strictly to the prescribed time limit.

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Sir, we did not do it. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No, no. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Sir, how was it decided? Was it decided by all the political parties? ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No. See, time regulation is not decided by the BAC. Time is given only at the time of the debate. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Sir, we want to discuss it. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I request hon. Members let us not create a new precedent, and let us not try to change the rules.

(Followed by 1t-kgg)

kgg/1t/12.30

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** The initiator would have only seven minutes, Sir? The Minister's statement itself has five-six pages. How can the Calling Attention motion...

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Only clarifications should be sought. Please understand that it is only seeking clarifications and not getting into a debate. It is strictly said in the rules; it is no debating but only seeking clarifications. How much time will it take for seeking clarifications? If it is converted into a debate...(Interruptions) You may seek clarifications.

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA:** Sir, I understand that you have kept an hour for the Calling Attention.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** It is not me, but it is the rules which say that.

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA:** Sir, it may be the decision of the Chair, or the saying of the rule book or whatever it is, but one hour is allocated. My request is, that one hour should not include the Minister's statement. One hour should be for the Members to put forth points.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Even if that is given, seeing the number of Members who are participating, I would not be able to finish within an hour and twelve minutes, which is the total duration for this. I am just reminding this. Now, Mr. Lepcha.

**SHRI O.T. LEPCHA (SIKKIM):** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I have only a few questions. Only yesterday, it has been reported that DDA, which is in-charge of developing two important competition venues as well as the Commonwealth Village, has admitted that the deadline for completion of these venues has been extended from December, 2009 to March, 2010. A week before, the Minister of Urban Development had stated that the work was going on time. It has been further reported that even in

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

March, 2010, handing over of these venues shall be partial. This is not the first incident of delay. The construction of Tyagaraj Venue has overshot its deadline of September, 2009. Various venues under the Sports Authority of India have also been delayed. How is the Government of India going to complete the construction of the competition venues in time? It is also necessary that sufficient time is required for the Indian team to familiarize themselves with the new stadia. If these stadia are not constructed in time, our players may not get sufficient time to practice in that stadia or which may reflect on their performance. How would the Minister intend to tackle this problem?

At present, there are 60 lakh vehicles in Delhi and everyday, 1,000 vehicles are being added. Between 2003-07, MCD announced that 40 parking lots will be developed before the Commonwealth Games, 2010. Yesterday only, it has been reported that out of 40, only 4 parking lots will be ready till October, 2010. The Chief Secretary of NCT of Delhi has himself admitted that the MCD has been unable to decide on the execution plan and changing the consultants and companies engaged for these parking lots. How is the Government going to manage traffic during the Commonwealth Games in the absence of proper parking lots?

The Commonwealth Games, 2010 are slated as being the event that would showcase the new India to the world as a multi-cultural land that is fast becoming the world economic leader. What are the preparations in this regard? What are the preparations particularly relating to showcase the cultural heritage? How are the states going to participate in these preparations? Thank you, Sir.



Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

(Ends)

**SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN (UTTAR PRADESH):** Thank you, Sir, for allowing me time. I think, there is not much that I can say because you have said it all at the beginning itself.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I have not said that, but I have only said that the statement is exhaustive.

**SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN:** Yes, it is. Well, Sir, we have the proud privilege of holding the Commonwealth Games in August, 2010. This gives us an opportunity to showcase the efficiency and capability of the country and bid for the Olympics next time.

(Contd. By 1u/sss)

SSS-MCM/1U/12.35

**SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN (CONTD.):** I do not want to say much but, I want to really congratulate the Minister for the sporting spirit. We are a great nation laughing at ourselves. This is such a big joke. I am sorry, Sir, I do not have to elaborate on this. Kalrajji has said it in one word, "कब कैसे" I think, these are the most important things. It is too obvious. I do not think it needs elaboration. It is too obvious. We are here to laugh at ourselves, make a mockery of this whole show. This is what we think about games, sportsmen and our country. It is going to be the most humiliating experience of this nation. China was ready before the Olympics a month before it started, if not a year. By now we should have started our practice drills. Whether it is traffic, whether it is medicine, whether it is school bus, what are you going to do about them? August is the month of monsoon. In Delhi, one shower floods

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

the streets. There are many such questions. I do not want to take five minutes and repeat whatever has been said. It is obvious. It is very, very obvious and the worst is, Mr. Michael Hooper, the CEO of Common Wealth Games on 15<sup>th</sup> October, said that if you ask me whether India is ready for the games today, my answer is-No. Let us not kid ourselves. We all know a lot needs to be done. Like Mr. Fennel said, Time is our biggest enemy and every hour counts. But with the Government's assessment and reports and then action, I think, we are in big trouble. We should have already been on the road. I really, really feel sorry for the Minister because you have the baby on your lap but you have no nursemaid. I hope you are not going to create the shoddy work that was done as in the case of the disaster of Terminal ID where the roof got blown off twice. We have 70 countries coming in. I would like to help and support you please. If you need it -- I know you don't mind specially but there are other people in my party -- I am sure the rest of the House would be very happy to help.

जब आपसे कोई काम नहीं हो सकता है तो किसी को मांगने में उसमें कोई बुराई नहीं है, इसमें आपका ह्यूमिलिशन नहीं है। जमीन पर उतरिए, जो असलियत है उसको जानिए, लोगों से मदद मांगिए और अपना फेस सेफ करिए, हमारे नेशन का फेस सेफ करिए। थैंक्यू।

(समाप्त)

**श्री राजीव शुक्ल (महाराष्ट्र) :** धन्यवाद उपसभापति जी, जया जी के आखिरी शब्दों से मैं सहमत हूँ। जब यह जिम्मेदारी सबकी बनती है और सरकार को भी सबसे सहयोग लेना चाहिए, चाहे विपक्ष हो, चाहे अपक्ष हो या पक्ष हो, सबसे सहयोग लेना चाहिए कि इस इवेंट

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

को सफल बनाएं, क्योंकि इसमें पूरे देश की प्रतिष्ठा जुड़ी है। किसी एक पार्टी की या एक सरकार की प्रतिष्ठा नहीं है।

**(उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० पी०जे० कुरियन) पीठासीन हुए)**

यह कमिटमेंट वाजपेई जी के जमाने में लिया गया था, उन्होंने जो किया था उसको पूरा करना हमारा फर्ज बनता है। तो अब जब यह सब के ऊपर आई है, पिछली सरकार - एन०डी०ए० गवर्नमेंट के कमिटमेंट को पूरा करना हमारा फर्ज है इसलिए अच्छी तरह से हम इसको करें। इसलिए इसमें हमें सब के सहयोग की जरूरत है। दूसरी बात यह है कि इसमें सबकी चिन्ता है, कलराज जी ने भी चिन्ता प्रगट की है, जया जी ने भी चिन्ता प्रगट की है, हम सब ने भी चिन्ता प्रगट की है। हम सब भी चिंतित हैं कि इसमें कितनी जल्दी काम पूरा होगा। लेकिन जो मिनिस्टर साहब का स्टेटमेंट है, वह निश्चित रूप से काफी विस्तार में है और उसमें एक ही बात बताई गई है। जहां पर ये इवेंट्स होने वाले हैं, उन सबका पूरा ब्योरा और उनकी डैड लाइन भी दी गई है।

(1W/GS पर क्रमशः)

-SSS/NBR-GS/1W/12.40.

**श्री राजीव शुक्ल (क्रमागत) :** जवाहर लाल नेहरू स्टेडियम, आई०जी० स्टेडियम, मे० ध्यानचंद राष्ट्रीय स्टेडियम, श्यामा प्रसाद मुखर्जी तरणताल परिसर, कर्णी सिंह शूटिंग रेंज, सीआरपीएफ परिसर कादरपुर, आर०के० खन्ना टेनिस परिसर, दिल्ली विश्वविद्यालय, त्यागराज खेल परिसर, सीरी फोर्ट खेल परिसर, यमुना खेल परिसर, तालकटोरा इंडोर स्टेडियम, ये जो 18 वैन्युज हैं, इन सबके सामने उन्होंने डेडलाइन्स लिखकर दी हैं। चूंकि क्लेरिफिकेशन का मामला है, इसलिए मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहता हूं कि जो आपने डेडलाइन्स दी हैं, इन पर काम समय से पूरा हो जाएगा, इसके लिए क्या-क्या आपने बंदोबस्त किए हैं ? इसमें सबसे जरूरी इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर का मामला है, अगर इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर पूरा नहीं हुआ तो बहुत मुश्किल आने वाली है। हम इस मामले में क्लियरकट आश्वासन चाहते हैं कि जो डेडलाइन्स आपने दी हैं, उनके हिसाब से यह काम पूरा हो जाएगा।

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

दूसरी बात पावर सप्लाई की है। उन दिनों अगर पावर कट्स हुए, अगर ऐसी स्थिति दिल्ली में आ जाए, तो इसके लिए आप क्या बंदोबस्त कर रहे हैं ?

तीसरी, एकोमडेशन की एक बहुत बड़ी प्रॉब्लम होने वाली है। 30 हजार लोग बाहर से आएंगे और जो गेम्स देखने आएंगे, टूरिस्ट आएंगे, उनकी संख्या अलग से है। अभी कहा जा रहा है कि कुछ घर वालों को घरों में गेस्ट हाउस कंवर्ट करने के लिए कहा जा रहा है। होटल और घरों में गेस्ट हाउस का आप किस तरह से अरेंजमेंट कर रहे हैं, इस मामले में माननीय मंत्री जी, अगर डिटेल में बताएं, तो अच्छा रहेगा। एक बात बार-बार झगड़े की आ रही है, मुझे लगता है कि झगड़ा काफी कुछ निपट गया है, जो कलमाडी साहब और उनके बीच में था।... (व्यवधान)... उसके लिए मैं उनसे पूछना चाहता हूं। ... (व्यवधान)... आप कलराज जी को ध्यान से सुना करिए, आपकी समस्या है कि आप अपने नेता की बात ध्यान से नहीं सुनते हैं। आप कलराज जी को सुन लेते, तो पूरी बात समझ में आ जाती।... (व्यवधान)...

**उपसभाध्यक्ष ( प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन):** प्लीज़, प्लीज़। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री राजीव शुक्ल :** उन्होंने इस पर कदम उठाया है और एक अधिकारी को सीओ के रूप में अपाइंट किया है, जो पूरी मॉनिटरिंग कर रहा है। इस तरह से जो भी डिसप्यूट्स हैं, उनको रिज़ाल्ट कराने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं। मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि टीम्स की प्रिपरेशन का क्या हो रहा है ? क्योंकि यह काम भी बहुत महत्वपूर्ण है, अगर भारत इवेंट कराकर भी टैली में सबसे नीचे रहा तो यह भी अच्छी बात नहीं है। मेरा मानना है कि अगर माननीय मंत्री जी इन सब बातों पर प्रकाश डालें, तो बहुत अच्छा रहेगा। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, according to the hon. Minister's statement, the governing document was signed in 2003. But, the construction of stadia started only in 2008. I would like to know from the hon. Minister as to what has been done during these 4-5 years.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

My second question is regarding meeting power requirements during the Games period. The main power comes to this area from Dadri Power Project and DBJ first plant. But, Dadri Power Plant's first unit and DBJ's first plant have not yet operationalized. In 2006, DBJ first plant was in a position to become operationalize, but has not yet operationalized. So, what will happen to power supply?

So far as parking is concerned -- Mr. Lepcha has already mentioned this -- I would like to say that the NDMC has decided to construct automated multi-level parking long ago. But, it started construction only in 2007. I would like to know the progress of this.

The next clarification I would like to seek is: What is the theme and concept of the Opening Ceremony and how much expenditure earmarked for this?

Sir, my last clarification is: I would like to know the selection criteria to act as a volunteer in this major event. Is it only school students, NCC and Scouts are selected to participate as volunteers in this mega event? Or, others are also allowed?

I would like to know these things from the hon. Minister. Thank you...(Interruptions)...

(Ends)

(FOLLOWED BY USY "1X")

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

-NBR-USY/1X/12.45

**DR. N.K. SINGH (BIHAR):** Thank you very much, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir. The first point that I would like to raise before the hon. Minister, through you, is that whether he is the in-charge. There are too many cooks in the kitchen. There is one cook who handles Delhi's infrastructure. There is one cook who handles tourism and adequate provision of rooms. There is one cook who handles security. There is one cook who handles different kinds of coordination. So, there are too many cooks in a kitchen. But, is there a principal chef? And, can we designate the hon. Minister, who has to answer, as the principal chef in the kitchen, who has to coordinate all these divergent responsibilities? (Interruptions) He is suggesting that you are in soup, which I will ignore. But I don't think that you are in a soup. We would like you to be the principal chef. And, if you are the principal chef, I am sure, the brew would be the one which has all the amalgams right. There are three more questions, Sir.

There is a mention in the statement about the public-private partnership. All that the statement says is that this work is on track and would be completed in time. Could the Minister share with us more details of the nature of this public-private partnership, which has been mentioned in his statement? Who is the private entrepreneur? Who is the partner? What is the reason that we remain so sanguine that this part of the work will be done.

My third question to the hon. Minister is that in the Annexure, which is there in his detailed statement, he has given the details of the

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

work that is directly connected, namely, the sports part of it. There is a whole lot of work, that is, connecting infrastructure, upgradation of the city, doing up the old city. There is no statement of physical and financial progress. So, could the Minister, through him directly or through the concerned agencies, would like to share with the hon. House the details of the physical and the financial progress in respect of the infrastructure.

My last question to him is that there are repeated newspaper reports on shortage of rooms. He claims that there is a shortage of 30,000 rooms. But the newspapers say that there is a shortage of 50,000 rooms. Who is constructing the rooms? Who is responsible for it? What is the kind of physical availability that you will have? With the large number of guests, which you would be receiving, would the Minister like to share with us the progress being achieved by that coordinating entity on the adequacy and the availability of rooms which is adequate enough for us to be so sanguine regarding overall matrix of the planning that has undergone. Thank you.

(Ends)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Now, as per the rule, each Party had given one name. That is over. I can call some more names which had also been given. Please put specific questions only. And do not take more than one minute. After one minute, I will ring the Bell. Sardar Tarlochan Singh.

**SARDAR TARLOCHAN SINGH (HARYANA):** Sir, we are all grateful to Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayeeji who brought the Games to India. Because of

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

him, India is hosting these Games. The hon. Minister has explained in details but my specific question is this.

The Games were allotted in 2003. And these Games will be held in 2010. For this delay of seven years, the Indian Olympic Committee or the Organising Committee is not responsible. It was the responsibility of the CPWD and the Delhi Government. But the blame is coming on the Managing Committee. The Minister should have come out with a statement on why this delay occurred and who was responsible for that and also why India is getting a bad name for this. The Organising Committee is appointed by the Indian Olympic Committee which is an autonomous body and which has all the authority; and the Games are allotted to the Olympic Committee.

Secondly, Sir, the Minister has assured that we will be able to successfully host the Games on time. But my point is that now we are more concerned about the results that we will achieve. As Shri Kalraj Mishra has also said, the Minister should come out with a statement detailing the games in which we are doing more, the games which are our priority and the areas where we need to give more attention and money. The country wants to know, with all this expenditure what results we are going to achieve. Thirdly, Sir...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** No, no. Saman Pathak.

**SARDAR TARLOCHAN SINGH:** Lastly, Sir, the traffic will be a big problem and the Minister has not mentioned anything about it. Delhi's traffic will be in chaos. Thank you. (Ends)

(Followed by 1y/pk)



Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

-ASC/LP-PK/12.50/1Y

**श्री समन पाठक (पश्चिमी बंगाल) :** थैंक यू, डिप्टी चेयरमैन सर, मंत्री जी का जो स्टेटमेंट आया है, मैं उनके प्रयासों का और उन्होंने जो ब्यौरा दिया है, उसको अभिवादन देना चाहूंगा। मैं कुछ सवाल करना चाहूंगा, मेरी कुछ क्लैरिफिकेशन्स हैं। जो तैयारी चल रही है, कुछ समाचार-पत्रों में आया है कि अभी भी कुछ ऐसे क्षेत्र हैं, जहां पर अभी भी तैयारी बाकी है। पांच क्षेत्रों को रिस्क जोन बताया गया है। इसको किस तरह से पूरा करने का प्रयास कर रहे हैं या यह किस तरह से पूरा होगा, मंत्री जी जरा बताइए। कहीं ऐसा न हो कि हम लोग जल्दबाजी में कार्य करें। पहले भी कुछ हादसे हुए थे, जैसे पहले मेट्रो का पिलर गिरा था, दो-तीन हादसे हुए थे, कहीं ऐसा न हो कि जल्दबाजी में ऐसा कुछ हादसा हो जाए। मंत्री जी क्लियर करें कि आप इसको किस तरह से पूरा कर पाएंगे? कॉमनवेल्थ गेम्स के चलते इसके इन्फ्रास्ट्रक्चर का जो निर्माण है, यह इन्हीं निर्माणकर्मियों से बनना है, इन्हीं मजदूरों से यह बनना है, लेकिन इनकी बहुत सारी समस्याएं हैं। इसको लेकर एक कमेटी भी बनी थी, उसकी हीयरिंग भी हुई थी। इन मजदूरों को, जो दिन-रात काम कर रहे हैं, यह कार्य इन्हीं के द्वारा पूरा होना है..(व्यवधान)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Mr. Saman, that is enough. (Time-bell) Please take your seat.

**श्री समन पाठक :** मंत्री जी यह बताने की कृपा करें कि इनकी समस्याओं को लेकर क्या कदम उठाए गए हैं?

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:**Sir, he has to make one more point.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** No, he has finished. He has made his points.

**श्री समन पाठक :** एक इम्पोर्टेन्ट बात यह है कि कॉमनवेल्थ गेम्स का जो अभ्यास स्थल है, इसका ढांचा तैयार करने के लिए मुंबई की कोई कंपनी डी.डी.ए. ने नियुक्त की थी। यह छत्तीस प्रतिशत काम करके छोड़कर चली गई है, उसके बदले में दूसरे कांट्रेक्टर को लाए है। इसका काम अभी चल रहा है, लेकिन इस कंपनी के विरुद्ध सरकार की ओर से क्या कानूनी कार्यवाही की गई है, कृपया यह बताएं।

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

(समाप्त)

**श्री राजनीति प्रसाद (बिहार) :** सर, मैं एक मिनट में ही खत्म करूंगा, घण्टी बजाने की जरूरत नहीं है। मैं यह बता रहा हूँ कि अभी तो ट्रैफिक का यह हाल है कि यदि एक जगह से दूसरी जगह जाना हो तो एक घंटा लगता है, जब कॉमनवेल्थ गेम्स का ट्रैफिक होगा तो उसमें और समस्या हो जाएगी। मैं मंत्री जी से यह पूछना चाहता हूँ कि जो लाखों लोग यहां आएंगे, दूसरी जगहों पर जाएंगे, उनके लिए आप ट्रैफिक की क्या उत्तम व्यवस्था करेंगे? यह मेरा एक सवाल था। मेरा दूसरा सवाल यह है कि आपने यह कहा है कि बाहर से जो खिलाड़ी आएंगे, वह हजारों की संख्या में आएंगे। बाहर से देखने वाले भी आएंगे, हिंदुस्तान से ही लोग नहीं होंगे, बाहर से भी देखने वाले लोग आएंगे, आप जो उनके रहने की व्यवस्था की बात कह रहे हैं, वह व्यवस्था कितनी पर्याप्त है? क्या आप रामलीला मैदान में भी कुछ टैन्ट लगाएंगे?

(समाप्त)

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे.कुरियन) :** श्री राम नारायण साहू। सिर्फ एक मिनट।

**श्री राम नारायण साहू (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** सर, अभी हमारे साथीगणों ने कॉमनवेल्थ की तैयारी के बारे में बताया और पूछा। जैसा कि हमारे खेल मंत्री जी, जो काफी इंट्रस्ट ले रहे हैं, मैं इन्हें बताना चाहूंगा कि इनके आने के बाद से खेल में थोड़ी सी प्रगति जरूर हुई है। खेल की तैयारियों के बारे में जो बताया गया कि खेल की तैयारियां चल रही हैं, उसके बारे में कोई विशेष बात सामने नहीं आई है। अभी तक के जो पिछले परिणाम रहे हैं, वे बड़े दुखदायी रहे हैं। ओलंपिक में शूटिंग के अंदर केवल एक गोल्ड मेडल लेकर हम पीठ थपथपा रहे हैं। एक अरब बीस करोड़ की आबादी वाले देश में हम एक गोल्ड मेडल लेकर खुश हो रहे हैं। कहते हैं कि अंधे के हाथ बटेर लग गई, हम उसी को लेकर खुश हो रहे हैं। जो हमारा मेन खेल है, जिसको सभी लोग जानते हैं, हॉकी हमारा राष्ट्रीय खेल है, फुटबॉल, लॉन टेनिस, बैडमिंटन, कबड्डी आदि उसमें शामिल नहीं हैं। कहने का मतलब यह है कि ..(व्यवधान)..

**उपसभाध्यक्ष :** हो गया है।

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**श्री राम नारायण साहू :** आपको इस बात के ऊपर ध्यान देना चाहिए। हम ऊपर थे, लोग आगे बढ़ते हैं, हम पीछे हट रहे हैं। आप फुटबॉल देख लीजिए, हॉकी देख लीजिए, बैडमिंटन देख लीजिए, भारत का ध्यान केवल क्रिकेट के ऊपर है। क्रिकेट मैच के अंदर माल ज्यादा आता है, पैसा ज्यादा आता है, इसलिए ध्यान उधर है। यह जो खेल है, जो हमारा राष्ट्रीय हॉकी खेल है,, हमारा उसमें कहां पर नंबर है? अभी जो वर्ल्ड की रिपोर्ट आई है, उसमें हम 250 देशों में 165 वें नंबर पर हैं।

(Akg/1z पर जारी)

PB-AKG/1z/12.55

**श्री राम नारायण साहू (क्रमागत) :** कहा जा रहा है कि हम तीसरी ताकत बनने जा रहे हैं, लेकिन वहाँ तो हम 165वीं ताकत हैं... (व्यवधान) ...

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन) :** आप बैठिए, आपका समय समाप्त हो गया ... (व्यवधान)

...

**श्री राम नारायण साहू :** गेम्स की तैयारी करने के लिए वर्ल्ड के जो अच्छे-अच्छे नामी कोच हैं, उनको बुलाया जाए ... (व्यवधान) ...

**उपसभाध्यक्ष :** श्री अरुण जेटली ... (व्यवधान) ... No; please take your seat.

...(Interruptions)...

**श्री राम नारायण साहू :** उनको ट्रेनिंग दी जाए ... (व्यवधान) ... और जो अच्छे-अच्छे खिलाड़ी हैं, उनको रखा जाए ... (व्यवधान) ...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** No; please take your seat. ...(Interruptions)... I

have already called the LOP. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री राम नारायण साहू :** इसमें भाई-भतीजावाद को दूर किया जाए ... (व्यवधान) ...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** No; no; please. ...(Interruptions)... No; no; take

your seat. ...(Interruptions)... No; take your seat. ...(Interruptions)...

Please take your seat.

**श्री राम नारायण साहू:** बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

(समाप्त)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** When I called the LOP, then he should sit. Even otherwise, when the LOP gets up, he should sit.

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY):** Sir, we are in a state of a last minute panic and there is a legitimate concern as to whether the infrastructure necessary for the Games will be completed or not.

Sir, in 2003, the Games were allotted to us; 2005 was the year when the International Committee first visited us and there is no plausible reason why the stadium construction should have started in 2008. The most important component of the Game is the sport itself. Now, because we started in 2008, the hon. Sports Minister should consider the fact that the stadiums will be completed in 2010. If we look at, whether it is Olympics or Commonwealth Games or Asian Games, the host nation always promotes a large number of its sportsmen, and, therefore, there is a host advantage that you have. China topped the tally in the Beijing Olympics; they got the host nation advantage because we are familiar with the local conditions, we are familiar with the stadia. Now, by getting our stadiums to be completed at the eleventh hour, have we lost the host nation advantage completely? And, therefore, the expectation that there will be a major boost to Indian sports and our medal tally will go up actually suffers when our preparations take us to the last minute itself.

The second question, Sir, no nation today in various disciplines of sport is a master of all. There are countries which steadily declined. The

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

example of Britain is there. But, then, they concentrated on three or four sports which became areas of their core competence and increased their overall medal tally. It happened in the last Olympic. That is how England improved its medal tally by just concentrating on three or four sports for medal purposes and playing the others for the general purpose of the Game itself. We don't seem to have done that. It is now clear that wrestling, boxing, rifle shooting, are all areas where we are producing sportsmen. So, would it not be better that the special concentration and training is on those four-five sports which are really of medal prospects rather than those where we read there is no hope we have of even qualifying anywhere for the final rounds of the Olympics?

Two or three more questions, Sir. There has been a very ugly conflict between our Organizing Committee and the International Committee so much so that when you host international events, a certain level of statesmanship is required. We don't come up and say that this organisation of Game is actually a fight against imperialism -- and I am using the exact statement which emanated from our local Organizing Committee. Is the Government also going to make sure that when the actual event is on, we don't have this kind of an ugly scene where our Organizing Committee and the International Committee are at war with each other and therefore we hear less of sport and more of a conflict which is a clash of personalities? Is the Government monitoring the cost involved in all this? It is because we get an uneasy impression that when last minute tenders are being awarded and the work is being done in a hurried manner, the mark-up is very high and therefore the

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

whispers going around in town with regard to the allotment of tenders, the cost at which the tenders have been awarded because of this last minute. We are actually going to suffer a lot of extra cost because of this factor and subsequently we will have the CAG going into all these questions and how much we spent extra because of this. There is a special reason why a keen eye of the Central Government must be on this at the last minute. (Contd. By 2a/SKC)

2a/1.00/skc

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY (Contd.):** Lastly, Sir, it is being said that we are spending all this money, but that we will recover it from the profit of the Games itself. But does the Government seriously expect a profit? Why don't we be realistic? The main earning is only from in-stadia advertising and from television rights. Now, where the television rights of certain sports may get you a large amount of money, there are events where the television rights don't earn you any kind of money and, therefore, barring Cricket, and to some extent now Soccer, it is the Government which is substantially funding various sports, because those games are not able to earn anything as far as television rights are concerned. So, are we being realistic when we say that we expect a profit which would compensate the cost that we are putting in these Games, Sir? That's all I have to say.

(Ends)

**SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA (ASSAM):** Sir,...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN):** Your name is not there.

**SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA:** Can I take one minute, Sir?

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** One question; half-a-minute. Ask specific question.

**SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA:** Sir, we are all proud that we are going to have Commonwealth Games in this country, in the city of Delhi. This country has the experience of holding many Games like Afro-Asian Games, SAAF Games, World Military Games and many world championships already.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Ask your question.

**SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA:** So, the organisation of these Games is in able hands. The only issue is that of infrastructure. There is some infrastructure like the M.D.C. National Stadium, Karni Singh Shooting Range and the Thyagaraj Sports Complex which are supposed to be completed by...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN):** Please put your question.

**SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA:** I want to know whether these will be completed in the next month. My second point is that so many foreign consultants have been hired. I want to know whether you are thinking of reducing the number of foreign consultants. We have good sportsmen; we have veteran sportsmen; we have many of them in our Federations. Then, why have so many of the foreign consultants been brought in? We have experienced people in our country. Why are we not utilising their services?

**SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, ...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Put only the question. There is no time.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE:** I want to know that, since these are Commonwealth Games, why cannot other States be involved in the organisation of these Games, so as to give a boost to the sports activities in those States. I was told that since these are Commonwealth Games, the practice is that of holding the Games only in the Capital of the host country. I had asked the Department, why they do not raise the question of changing that practice. I did not get a reply. This was two or three years back.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** All right. You will get the reply. Yes, Mr. Minister.

**THE MINISTER OF YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS (DR. M. S. GILL):**

Sir, I have heard my distinguished colleagues with rapt attention and I take note of everything that they have said. Personally, as far as I am concerned, if you had allowed two, three or four hours, I would have been happy to sit here and listen, because it is a major issue. It is something that they are saying, and I am also saying, that having taken the Games in 2003, it is now a question of being sure that we come out of it with dignity and honour. There are no two opinions about it. It is not as if I do not think of it every day. I shall go over some of these issues. Sir, I would like you to give me a little time so as to share things with them, so that they know what is going on. I have been looking at it since 6<sup>th</sup> April, 2008 and we had four Ministers before me, of both Parties. But that is fine; we all do our best. I would not like to start discussing what was done. I want to say, as I have said publicly in the Press, that whichever way it happens and howsoever many years have



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

gone, the important thing is that today, the country, the people, the Parliament, the Cabinet and the Prime Minister are clear that we have to get it ready in time and we have to come out of this with honour. That is an objective and that is a direction as well, so that we get there and we do not, as you say, have an embarrassment. That is something which concerns me all the time. Let me first talk about this business of the Organising Committee and the Commonwealth Games Chairman, Mr. Fennel.

(Contd. by hk at 2b)

HK/2b/1.05

**DR. M.S. GILL (CONTD.):** That letter is public and read by all of you. That letter was not to the Prime Minister. He attended a meeting here in September, and he has been coming himself for four years also. But somehow after this meeting in the September 2009, two months back, he wrote a letter which became quickly public. That letter was written to the Executive Committee or the Organising Committee which does the day-to-day work. This Committee consists of three representatives from the Commonwealth Games Federation, then the Urban and Sports Secretaries of the Government of India, Delhi Government Chief Secretary, etc, as its members. He wrote that letter which immediately went public. Basically he raised issues about the internal management of the Organising Committee. The design of these games was made in 2003 unlike the Asian Games of 1982 or any games elsewhere. You referred to China. But China did not have this kind of a design to do the games. Here the design is very clear. The major stadiums like

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

Nehru Stadium, Indira Gandhi Stadium, etc., are to be completed by the Government of India through the Sports Ministry or the Sports Authority of India by funding the Central PWD. A fair number of other lesser stadiums are to be completed by the Delhi Government through the DDA and the Delhi Public Works Department. That is the design. We have provided all the money. As I said, the delays in the past have been overcome. Every week these five Ministers meet and every item is gone over to try and get there in time. Now I come to city infrastructure. It is a valid question. There is a vast amount of it. By the way, these Games are totally different from that of Melbourne or Glasgow next time. Remember India is a billion people country. There are about 16 or 17 million people in the city and we get one hundred or two hundred thousand immigration every month. Let us deal with reality. Therefore, this is on a different scale because somehow, as you correctly said, traffic, transport, hotels, security and everything else have to be got ready. It is one of the biggest cities of the world and we have all the problems of the modern world including security. Security is no longer an Indian phenomenon. When I went to Australia last year to see their stadiums, they said that their star athletes would come and all that kind of things would come, etc. I said, "Listen when the Australian team goes to England for Ashes, in a stadium of 30,000 or 40,000 even if the two of you are playing, there is always the danger of a little something. Even they have internal population. So, it is not only in our case." Therefore, the city infrastructure in this complex situation is important. I have heard it before and I heard my distinguished colleague casually

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

saying that of course India should be thinking of the Olympics. I am not sure that India should be. Look at the poverty of this country and look at the size and your urban problems. And when we go to solve them, this or that party comes. So, please be careful because there is a certain class of us who wants these great events because it is a good entertainment and good fun for that time. But I don't think people want an Olympic Game. China spent 50 billion. If you are ready and if you think that you can take care of everything, think of it. Otherwise even those in the OC sometimes casually say this. I don't contradict, but I think there is a point to think about seriously. Therefore, the Delhi Game is unique. Melbourne is a small city of 3 million. It is a super-rich country; you know its GDP and per capita. Please, can I have my say now? Let me have my say. ..(Interruptions).. Please don't interrupt me. ..(Interruptions).. Let me have my say. I heard everybody, so please don't cut me in the middle. I gave everybody courtesy.

(Contd. by 2c/KSK)

KSK/1.10/2C

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** But, you have made a comment that she is one of those who want...(Interruptions). That is not fair.

**DR. M.S. GILL:** So, she can answer me in due course. Please don't take up my time.

**SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN:** I want an opportunity to clarify my point.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**DR. M.S. GILL:** She made plenty of comments on me after all...(Interruptions). That is a different matter. And, everybody should be used to hearing criticism, or a thought.

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** That is a personal comment on her. That is not fair. You cannot make a personal comment like that.

**SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN:** Sir, please refer to the record. I did not say that.

**DR. M.S. GILL:** I have commented on the desire. It is a policy. You have suggested. I am commenting on the desire of anybody in India who want the next Olympic Games 2020...(Interruptions). I have heard it outside also. So, I have said what I have said.

**SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN:** So, you should say that you have heard outside.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Please, don't make running commentaries.

**SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN:** I am sorry, Sir. But, he has made a personal comment.

**DR. M.S. GILL:** It is not personal.

**SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN:** He has made a personal comment. I am just asking that please check the records. I have not said this.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** If there is a personal comment, there is a rule that after he speaks, I can give you time. There is no need of interruptions now.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**डा.(श्रीमती) नजमा ए. हेपतुल्ला:** इनसे कोई शिकायत नहीं है। यह तो बिल्कुल recently आये हैं। जो पिछले वाले हैं, उनसे शिकायत है।

Sir, whatever is said on the floor of the House is definitely not against the Minister. He has brought a very comprehensive statement to the House. Whatever anybody is commenting, his predecessors are also responsible. So, he should not take it on him.

**DR. M.S. GILL:** I don't.

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA:** And especially, Sir, for a lady. She does not mean anything against him.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** But, the predecessor is not here to defend himself.

**DR. M.S. GILL:** Now, both of us agree that we don't want the Olympic Games in the near future.

**SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN:** I never said that. I did not say that you should not have Olympic Games. I said that you should conduct these games so efficiently that you can get Olympics also, if you want to. I never asked you to...(Interruptions).

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Please, let the Minister reply. We are running short of time.

**SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN:** So, please don't make any personal comments. In fact, I was actually...(Interruptions).

**DR. M.S. GILL:** You are sure, but I am not sure. We had agreed. Sir, therefore, regarding infrastructure for such a big city, I have given you the list of all the stadia, and I have given you the carefully thought out expected time of completion. The Games will start on 3<sup>rd</sup> October.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

Yes, I would be happy to have stadia ready this year so that we could use them for a whole year. In some advance countries, that situation happened. I have gone and seen the London preparations going on this time in October, and last year also. But, here, we are in a situation where we are pushing the hardest, monitoring and personally going everywhere to see that we are ready. I have given you the estimated expert schedule with which we would still have plenty of time to use these things and also to have test events up to October.

Regarding the city infrastructure, a number of you have pointed out and that is a big issue. Along with that, hotel rooms and tourism issues are also there. When the games were given to the City of Delhi, Sir, that is, a design was allotted to the city of Delhi and that cannot be shared or dispersed. That is the way it is according to the Commonwealth. The City of Delhi infrastructure essentially is with the city Government through the Urban Development Minister. I made a small reference to it as much as I could because we asked that also in the Group of Ministers. Very detailed questions have been asked. I cannot really answer them to that extent. These are regarding even contracts given, or, for example, the Village for the Games next to Akshardham, and what is the contract. Frankly speaking, I don't need to see it. It was being built a long time ago. All I know is that it will be ready. That is what we are told and even the Press seems to think so. So, it will be ready for the Games. Then, regarding the Games proper, they are from the 3<sup>rd</sup> of October to the 16<sup>th</sup>. Arrangements for a few days earlier and later, by the time they all disperse, that has to be done

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

by the Organising Committee because the Games were allotted to the IOA (Indian Olympic Association). And, they were to form and they had formed this Organising Committee. I have referred to it in my statement. I am sorry I gave the longest statement. I liked to cut these. But, I thought I would give you as much information as I could which you may use later also. And, I have no doubt that you will go into it very deeply.

(continued by 2d - gsp)

GSP-VNK-1.15-2D

**DR. M.S. GILL (CONTD.):** They are with the Organizing Committee; yes, till recently, the old allotment was there. When the games were taken, an estimate of something less than Rs. 300 crores was shown. That too, I will say. When last year, I saw it, it was something less than Rs. 800 crores, or, let us say, about Rs. 800 crores for conducting the games and everything, as I have described. Now, I went and got the Cabinet sanction, which I have referred to, for Rs. 1,620 crores. You will say, आठ से डबल हो गया | Financially, that was raised. And, I am more concerned. Last year, when I came in, we pushed hard to have financial experts sitting there in the Organizing Committee where the decisions are taken, and, contracts and everything else is done. In that, two Joint Secretaries and other experts are sitting. Not satisfied with this sanction of Rs. 1,620 crores, I requested -- and the Cabinet has agreed -- that a strong committee of Secretary (Sports), Secretary (Urban Development) and Special Secretary (Finance) should be sitting in the Executive Committee of these fifteen to see everything that goes up and is to be done. I totally take the point, Sir, which you made. We

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

also are concerned. In other words, since last year, through Cabinet directions, we have been trying to tighten the financial supervision. Even when we have gone to double the money, what we have tried to do in the Expenditure Finance Committee is that they went over everything with a toothcomb. I have very fine civil servants -- Mr. Sudhir Nath, who was well known in the Enforcement Directorate -- to try and make sure that these financial people do as much of a check as possible, and, then, in spite of that, here is a three-Secretaries committee at the highest level.

Incidentally, in order to strengthen the Organizing Committee, and, on the question of Fennell's letter, the Government approved, the Prime Minister agreed and a Secretary-level man, who had just retired and had distinguished career with eight years in the Prime Minister's Office, with various Prime Ministers, has been sent there as Chief Executive Officer over everybody who is there before. We have three other senior officers. One of them is a finance expert from the Defence Accounts service. They already had an ex-Government of India man in the finance position, in other words, to try and check the finance and make sure that as much as human beings can control, it should be controlled. Because this is a democracy; Parliament, CAG, and, everybody will ask about it; I am aware of that, and, therefore, everything that can be done should be done.

About the tourism, rooms; various estimates are there. I have given you a brief one. With regard to the design of the Games, the details of getting the rooms ready and where and what, you have the



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

Ministry of Tourism, obviously, and, Delhi Government. Bread and breakfast and various other mechanisms, DDA flats - these are all out of the box solution which our Committee has been thinking; that there was whole set of DDA flats, why not to get them ready and upgrade them to 2 or 3-Star; everybody is not for 5-Star hotels. तो वहीं वे रह लेंगे। Every type of mechanism is there. One friend said about तम्बू। तम्बू का भी सोच रहे हैं। ऐसी बात नहीं है, हिन्दुस्तान है, अगर तम्बू लगाना पड़ेगा, तो तम्बू लगाएंगे। लालू जी तो ऐसा किया करते थे। (Interruptions) So, there are two aspects to the visitors. One is linked to security. I said about athletes.

**श्री बलबीर पुंज** : आप भी लालू जी के standard पर आ गए हैं ..(व्यवधान)..।

**डा. एम. एस. गिल** : नहीं, मैंने उसकी चर्चा की है, आप मेरी हिन्दी समझते हैं ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री बलबीर पुंज** : आपने कहा कि लालू जी ऐसा करते थे, इसलिए हम भी तम्बू लगाएंगे ..(व्यवधान)..

**डा. एम. एस. गिल** : क्योंकि मुझे उनसे बहुत कुछ सीखना है ..(व्यवधान).. Tourism is linked to security. First of all, with regard to the number of tourists, with the situation in the world and with the situation even in our South Asia, as we call it, people do have thoughts, and, it is very difficult to assess it but it is the Ministry of Tourism, which is assessing it, again and again, and, every effort is being made to make sure that they have enough rooms. But, sometimes, I worry; I want to get the maximum visitors and I want to get the maximum and the best athletes.

(Contd. by ysr-2e)

-GSP/YSR-MP/1.20/2E

**DR. M.S. GILL (CONTD.):** Security is being looked after by the Home Minister of India and the Lieutenant Governor of Delhi because the

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

Lieutenant Governor controls the Delhi Police. The Lieutenant Governor comes to the weekly meeting of the Group of Ministers. As the Sports Ministry we know, because my Secretary goes there, that everything possible is being done. A figure was given by Mr. Mishra. That is correct. They have asked for more than Rs.300 crore. The Cabinet is very clear that having taken up the Games whatever is necessary and essential in terms of expenditure whether on stadiums or on security or on anything, you read large figures will be given provided there is first a financial EFC check and then the Cabinet is satisfied that this much money is really essential.

I think India's security services have the professionalism. All agencies are involved in it. I believe that we should have confidence in them. In the worst situation, with every kind of terrorism in this country, I believe they will do a great job. I am confident, भविष्यवाणी तो मैं नहीं कर सकता कि वे कर देंगे और खेलों में सब ठीक होगा, भगवान ऐसा करे - यही मैं कह सकता हूँ, इससे ज्यादा मैं कुछ नहीं कह सकता।

Health also was mentioned. The Health Ministry is at it. New facilities are being built in the AIIMS like trauma centre, etc., or whatever they want. That is again a technical matter between the Delhi Health Ministry and the Union Health Ministry, because both together control and have the hospitals private or public.

As far as the controversy surrounding the remarks of Mr. Fennell is concerned, yes, the moment the letter came, we had meetings at the highest level. That is why the decisions were taken to make the changes I have described. The Organising Committee requested the

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

Government for help and promptly these people were sent. They are expected to perform to the best of their ability without any hesitation, so that we get where we want to. The Government, I can assure you, is totally focussed and is doing everything it can. That is why this very strong Group of Ministers under the leadership of Mr. Jaipal Reddy meets every week. And I write to the Prime Minister regularly, because that also is necessary, so that he knows the development. I am confident because I have to look to the future. Where I come from I cannot look this way. I can look only this way. So I am looking to the next year and it will be ready in a reasonably good time, say, six months early on this or that stadium. Three stadiums about which the Press has been writing are: the shooting range, swimming stadium and the cycling velodrome. When I came, there were ideological differences, if I may say, between federations, national and international. एयरकंडीशन्ड करो, नहीं करो, स्विमिंग प्रैक्टिस की चार लेन होंगी या आठ लेन होंगी, दोबारा इसको तोड़कर बनाओ। We resolved that. Even the Barapulla village was fixed where it was. That is history now. But how to get them there? On 6<sup>th</sup> April I came and on 8<sup>th</sup> April we took a decision somehow with the Group of Ministers because अगर दरिया पार athletes लाने हैं, तो लाने तो हैं! खेल कैसे होंगे? और यह पहली दफा मैंने देखा है कि दरिया पार आना पड़ेगा, पर ठीक है, ऐसा है तो करना है ! I asked the Delhi Government officers, when all of them were called, to tell me their options. I asked them tell me which is the least damaging. Nothing maybe can be perfect. It was on 8<sup>th</sup> of April, if I remember correctly, that it was sanctioned and I said to the Lieutenant Governor who was in that meeting, पंजाबी में कहा था, "Tejinder,

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

please start laying the bricks from tomorrow." And they are going hard at it. But I am also aware, as anyone would know, that it will go up to May or June next year. But if we had delayed the fundamental decision for another six months, then we would have been in difficulty. But, God willing, we are there now and we will get there and we will work together. All of us, the Government of India, the Delhi Government, the Ministries I have described, and the Organising Committee, are pulling ourselves together.

(Contd. By VKK/2F)

-YSR/VKK-SC/2f/1.25

**DR. M.S. GILL (CONTD.):** There are no dissensions. As I said, everybody is aware, this is the demand of the country, and the Cabinet. Thank you, Sir.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** No please. (Interruptions)  
No, No. (Interruptions)

**श्री कलराज मिश्र :** सर, 38 सब-कमेटीज़ के बारे में कहा गया। श्री रणधीर सिंह जी ने कहा था ..(व्यवधान)..

**DR. M.S. GILL:** Sir, if you allow, I will answer. Sir, Kalrajji referred to 38 or a large number of sub-committees which had not met and now they are beginning to meet. Yes, that question should be and will be addressed. The question was: Do we need such a large number of committees or there could be a more compact number with more focus and regular meetings? All that has been gone into.

(Ends)

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Okay, now, I have to take the sense of the House because Mr. Anand Sharma has requested that he would like to withdraw a Bill and introduce a new Bill. (Interruptions) It will take only a minute. (Interruptions)

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Sir, withdrawal of which Bill? (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** It is in the List of Business, but, it was to be taken up after lunch. He has requested to take it up now. If the House agrees, I will permit that. (Interruptions) It will take only a minute.

### **BILL WITHDRAWAN**

#### **THE FOREIGN TRADE (DEVELOPMENT AND REGULATION) AMENDMENT BILL, 2001.**

**THE MINISTER OF COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY (SHRI ANAND SHARMA):** Sir, I beg to move for leave to withdraw the Foreign Trade (Development and Regulation) Amendment Bill, 2001.

**The question was put and the motion was adopted.**

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** Sir, I withdraw the Bill.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

**BILL INTRODUCED**

**THE FOREIGN TRADE (DEVELOPMENT AND REGULATION)  
AMENDMENT BILL, 2009.**

**THE MINISTER OF COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY (SHRI ANAND SHARMA):** Sir, I beg to move for leave to introduce the Foreign Trade (Development and Regulation) Amendment Bill, 2009.

**The question was put and the motion was adopted.**

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** Sir, I introduce the Bill.

(Ends)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Now, the House is adjourned till 2.27 p.m. for one hour.

**The House then adjourned for lunch at twenty-seven minutes past one of the clock.**

RSS-MKS-GS/2.25&2.30/2G&2H

**The House reassembled after lunch at thirty-one minutes past two of the clock, MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.**

----

**THE REPRESENTATION OF THE PEOPLE (SECOND AMENDMENT)**

**BILL, 2008 - CONTD.**

**SHRI P.R. RAJAN (KERALA):** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, while introducing the Bill, the Minister has explained, in detail, the circumstances in which the Bill was presented in the House. He himself has agreed with rampant corruption and violation of rules in the years since 1996 when the last Bill was passed in the Council. Now, the position continues as such. That was his explanation. So, it has

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

become necessary to introduce a new Amendment Bill, 2008, plugging out the loopholes in the 1996 Election Rules. Therefore, the 22 proposals, received from the Election Commission for banning such loopholes, were issued. What were the proposals? One was about the district-wise Appellate Authority. In the first proposal made by the Election Commission, there were complaints, in the preparation of electoral rolls, of removing the names of voters from the electoral rolls, without taking any evidence from the persons concerned. This may be either at the intervention of the ruling party or of the other authorities concerned.

The other complaint was the intervention of the Commission in regard to the existing rules and regulations. In a democracy, in any parliamentary democracy, in any form of Government and democracy, the process of election has to be free, fair and equitable. But during the past many years, the entire process was done contrary to the above principles. In these circumstances, it was felt necessary that some need-based measures be taken to remove the loopholes noticed in the Representation of the People Acts of 1950 and 1951 (43 of 1951). In July, 2004, the Election Commission of India had forwarded a set of 23 proposals on electoral reforms to the Government for consideration.

(Contd. by TMV/2J)

-MKS-TMV-ASC/2J/2.35

**SHRI P. R. RAJAN (CONTD.):** While considering the proposals of the Election Commission it was felt appropriate to examine certain proposals in respect of electoral reforms and examine the aforesaid Acts of 1950

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

and 1951. The formation of an appellate authority within the districts is one among them.

While considering the above issue, it has to be remembered that no officer who is supposed to be engaged in the election process should be transferred just before and after or in-between after the declaration of the election. Another point is the simplification of the entire election process and disqualification of the person found guilty of corrupt practices. Telecast of exit polls has to be stopped because of the long process of election. It may affect the last election process.

Another proposal is regarding corrupt practices. The existing practice of election campaign sometimes runs against the spirit of the people's right to choose a candidate in a democratic manner. The recent election in Jharkhand is a clear example. Shri Madhu Koda has spent crores of rupees for the election campaign.

Another is regarding the officers who are supposed to be posted for election duties. No officer who is supposed to be engaged in the election process should be transferred just before and in-between after the declaration of the election.

An appellate authority must be appointed within the district for hearing complaints against corrupt practices. The Enquiry Officers must be appointed well in advance as a statutory body. The State Election Inquiry Commission must be appointed as a statutory body of the State.

The money flow in the election must be restricted with appropriate vigilance machinery. The complaints against corrupt practices must be taken into account immediately. If the Inquiry Commission notices any



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

corruption or the expenses involved in the campaign are beyond the prescribed limit, the elected candidate must be kept under suspension till he is cleared of the charges or disqualified.

Another point is that, as per the Representation of the People Act, in the case of parliamentary constituency the security deposit for a general candidate is now Rs.10,000 for a general seat and for the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes it is Rs.5,000. This provision should be amended and the security deposit for the general candidate should be reduced to Rs.5,000 and the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes must be exempted. In the case of Assembly Constituency, it should be reduced to Rs.2,000 for general candidates and the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes must be exempted. These points have to be included in the present Bill.

Now, I come to the election expenses.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Rajan, you have taken eight minutes. There is another Member to speak from your party. You have just left six minutes for Shri A. Vijayaraghavan.

**SHRI P. R. RAJAN:** I will conclude quickly. The Government, through the Election Commission, must bear the whole expenditure involved in the election campaign of a candidate. No other expenses should be allowed. If any expense other than the expenses provided by the Government is found to be incurred, the candidate must be disqualified on that ground itself. In the last Lok Sabha election also there was a general complaint against certain candidates. They are mostly millionaires and they reported their assets also. It is learnt from

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

newspaper reports that these present MPs have got assets worth crores of rupees. This will ultimately help only to bring down their image among the general public.

(Contd. by 2K/VK)

VK-LP/2K/2.40

**SHRI P.R. RAJAN (CONTD):** We may think over whether we have to convert the House into a House of billionaires or millionaires.

As a Constitutional Authority, the Election Commission has got independent powers. But in the recent elections, the Election Commission has acted as a political appointee and acted in favour of the Ruling Party and deputed defence personnel in the Kannur Parliamentary Constituency.

In the present Lok Sabha also, it is reported that most of the MPs are billionaires. Hence they can very well influence the defence personnel and the police authorities.

Then the security amount which has to be paid for the general seat and for the reserved seat must be reduced. This clause must be amended as such. Thank you.

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Your colleague is left with three minutes.

**श्री वीर पाल सिंह यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** धन्यवाद उपसभापति जी, मैं "लोक प्रतिनिधित्व दूसरा संशोधन विधेयक, 2008" के संबंध में समाजवादी पार्टी की तरफ से बोलने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ। महोदय, मैं कानून मंत्री जी की बड़ी इज्जत करता हूँ, क्योंकि बहुत दिनों के बाद हमको ऐसे कानून मंत्री मिले हैं, जिन्होंने खुलकर और सही बात कहने की हिम्मत जुटाई

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

है। इससे पहले नहीं जुटा पा रहे थे। महोदय, ये जो संशोधन लाए हैं, यह अच्छी बात है, लेकिन इसमें अभी बहुत-कुछ लाने के लिए बाकी है। हिंदुस्तान में लोकतंत्र को कायम रखने के लिए, लोकतंत्र को बचाने के लिए जो प्रयास किए जा सकते हैं, उसमें अभी बहुत-कुछ बाकी है। हिंदुस्तान में जिस तरह से चुनाव होते हैं उसमें धन का दुरुपयोग जमकर होता है। एक तरफ तो हमने चुनाव आयोग को यह अधिकार दे दिया कि वह हमारा झंडा भी नापे, हमारे बैनर भी नापे और तुरंत नोटिस भी दे कि आपने यह झंडा लगा दिया। जिसके लिए झंडा लगा है, उसकी अनुमति और जो प्रत्याशी झंडा लगा रहा है, उसकी भी अनुमति चाहिए। जहां बारह लाख की Constituency हो, वहां मुझे नहीं लगता कि यह संभव है कि हम झंडा लगाने की अनुमति प्रत्याशी से भी लें और जिसके यहां झंडा लग रहा है, उससे भी लें। जहां धन का दुरुपयोग होता है - आजकल अखबारों में बहुत प्रतिस्पर्धा चल रही है, समाचार-पत्रों में जो लाखों, करोड़ों रुपयों की ऐड आती हैं, उन पर नजर नहीं है, मगर जब एक झंडा लगा लेते हैं, उस पर नजर है। यह लोकतंत्र का एक बहुत बड़ा उत्सव है, त्यक्Sहार है। हमारा यह सुझाव है कि अगर इसमें झंडा लगाने पर रोक होगी तो मुझे नहीं लगता कि यह उचित है। मेरा दूसरा निवेदन यह है, जैसा कि अभी हमारे पूर्ववर्ती सदस्यों ने सुझाव दिया था कि इस चुनाव को सरकार को पूरा अपने ऊपर ले लेना चाहिए, सारा चुनाव सरकारी खर्चे पर हो, तभी धन का दुरुपयोग रोका जा सकता है, वरना आज जो दो सौ या ढाई सौ लखपति या करोड़पति मैम्बर आए हैं, एक समय ऐसा आएगा कि पूरी लोक सभा या राज्य सभा में कोई ऐसा आदमी नहीं होगा, जो साधारण किस्म का आदमी हो। वह भी लोक सभा या राज्य सभा में आ सके, आपको इसका भी ध्यान रखना होगा। मेरा एक और सुझाव है कि चुनाव आयोग जो प्रेक्षक भेजता है, वह प्रेक्षक नाम के लिए होता है कि हम नजर रखेगा, मगर वह पूरी तरह से जिले के कलेक्टर का मेहमान हो जाता है। वह जहां, जिस गेस्ट हाउस में उसे रखेगा, वहां रहता है और कोई भी शिकायत किसी भी प्रत्याशी की होती है तो वहीं के कलेक्टर, वहीं के एस.डी.एम. से, वहीं के अधिकारियों से उसकी जांच करवाते हैं। ।

(akg/2l पर जारी)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009

AKG-RG/2L/2.45

**श्री वीर पाल सिंह यादव (क्रमागत) :** मैं समझता हूँ कि जिनके खिलाफ हम कोई शिकायत कर रहे हैं कि फलॉ अधिकारी अपने पद का दुरुपयोग करके चुनाव को प्रभावित कर रहा है और वही जाँच करेगा, तो फिर मैं नहीं समझता कि कोई निष्पक्ष जाँच हो पाएगी। इसलिए चुनाव आयोग के द्वारा जो पर्यवेक्षक जाएँ, वे जिला कलक्टर के मेहमान कतई न बनें। उनका अलग से अपना set-up होना चाहिए, अलग से अपनी व्यवस्था होनी चाहिए। यह एक हमारा सुझाव था।

सर, मेरा दूसरा निवेदन यह है कि जैसा अभी मैंने पहले बताया कि चुनाव आयोग ने इस बार झंडा लगाने की permission के लिए कहा, तो उसमें नीचे लेवल का अधिकारी, खास कर पुलिस अधिकारी, जो मौजूदा सरकार होती है, जिस प्रदेश में जिसकी सरकार होती है, अगर उस सरकार की पार्टी का झंडा लगा हुआ है, तो उसको कतई नहीं टोकेगा, लेकिन अगर विपक्षी दल का झंडा लगा हुआ है, तो वह तुरंत कहेगा कि इसकी permission दिखाओ और इस तरह से कहेगा कि झंडा लगाने वाला अपनी बेइज्जती महसूस करे। इस सम्बन्ध में आपको जरूर कुछ संशोधन करने पड़ेंगे।

महोदय, मेरा तीसरा निवेदन यह है कि चुनाव सम्बन्धी झगड़ों का जो निबटारा होता है, चाहे कोई पिटिशन में जाए या और कोई मामला हो, उसमें बहुत देरी होती है। कई बार देखा गया है कि लोक सभा हो या विधान सभा हो, उसके खिलाफ कोई पिटिशन में गया, तो उसका 5 साल का कार्यकाल तो पूरा हो गया और पिटिशन तब तक अदालत में ही लम्बित है। इसके लिए भी इस तरह की चुनाव सम्बन्धी कोई विशेष अदालत नियुक्त हो, जो तत्काल उसका निर्णय कर सके और उसे न्याय मिल सके। इस सम्बन्ध में भी आपको सोचना पड़ेगा।

महोदय, मेरा आखिरी निवेदन यह है कि हम लोग धर्म निष्पक्ष देश में हैं। अक्सर मंच पर लोग धार्मिक नारे लगाते हैं, चाहे जय श्रीराम का नारा लग जाए या दूसरा कोई नारा लग जाए। मेरी मंशा केवल इतनी है कि चुनाव को धर्म से बिल्कुल अलग रखना चाहिए। अगर कोई इस तरह की चेष्टा करता है और चुनाव को धर्म से जोड़ने की कोशिश

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

करता है, तो निश्चित रूप से उस पर कार्रवाई होनी चाहिए। वह कार्रवाई तत्काल हो, तब तो वह कुछ मायने रखती है, लेकिन अगर उस कार्रवाई में 17 साल लग जाँ, तो फिर उस कार्रवाई का कोई मायने नहीं रहता है। यही मेरे चंद निवेदन थे। आपका बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Dr. K. Malaisamy. You have seven minutes.

**DR. K. MALAISAMY (TAMIL NADU):** For the relief and relaxation of our Deputy Chairman, let me submit that I will be brief and I will take a few minutes only.

Sir, we have always felt proud in saying that India is the largest successfully working democracy. And, this is the popular saying everywhere in the world. But there are several ills and evils in the system, and it is working. This is the way that I look at it. Sir, I am not going into the details. On the other hand, I will try to submit certain principles in this Amendment Bill. Now, we have come across several experiences and learnt a lot of lessons over a period of time, namely, over more than six decades since Independence, and we have seen 15 General Elections.

(Continued by 2M)

2m/2.50/ks

**DR. K. MALAISAMY (Contd.):** As such, we have learnt a lot of lessons from these elections. Periodical elections are a must because no law is static, no law is permanent. It is bound to undergo a change. Periodic amendments and changes are all right. But as far as I am concerned, I

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

have got a grouse against the well-informed hon. Minister who is very keen in bringing comprehensive reform in everything. In that process, what he has done is, he has selectively come out with a few amendments only. As far as I can see, there are a number of areas where he can bring a lot of amendments. Shri S.S. Ahluwalia was saying that the Election Commission has submitted a number of proposals and different forums have echoed different views and they have selectively brought in only four or five amendments.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Let me clarify. Twenty-two proposals had been forwarded to the Department-related Standing Committee. The Standing Committee has given report only in respect of five which we have brought. The rest of them are pending with the Standing Committee. I want to make it very clear. It is not that anything is pending with the Government.

**DR. K. MALAISAMY:** I am happy with his reply, Sir. But the reforms should have come in an exhaustive manner and in one stroke. As far as I could see, the main thrust of my entire presentation is that there is a failure of the system and there is a failure of the persons handling the system. This is the way I look at it. After having seen 15 General Elections and after having seen a number of other elections, I know -- and the entire House knows -- what is going on in the field. Now, a Constitutional body, the Election Commission, has been constituted. It has got autonomous powers. Everything is there. It is supposed to handle the election process only through the State machinery. The State machinery has to give assistance and whatever the Election

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

Commission wants, it is being done by the field-machinery, namely, the State Government machinery. As far as the State machinery is concerned, we all know what normally happens; the Chair also knows. The ruling Party is capable of using the machinery in their favour; the entire machinery in terms of Police, in terms of polling personnel and so on is used in favour of the ruling Party. One may agree or not but this is a fact of life. This is what I want to say. The entire House is aware of several cases of rigging of elections, several incidents of booth-capturing, incidents of misuse of the personnel, incidents of corrupt practices. I am sorry to say, corrupt practices in terms of giving money, in terms of giving presents are rampant. I will give you an illustrious example. Recently, by-election for Thirumangalam was held. The entire country knows that the ruling Party in Tamil Nadu was able to win the Thirumangalam by-election. How did they win? It was through money power. (Interruptions)

**THE MINISTER OF TEXTILES (SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN):** No, no. This is totally unwarranted. (Interruptions) This is wrong. (Interruptions)

**DR. K. MALAISAMY:** What is wrong? Tell me. (Interruptions)

**SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN:** Sir, he is a bad loser. (Interruptions) He is a bad loser. (Interruptions)

**DR. K. MALAISAMY:** I will put one simple question. (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Malaisamy, you are a senior Member. (Interruptions)

**DR. K. MALAISAMY:** Can you swear before the House that money was not given? (Interruptions)



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** That is not the issue. But when you speak before the House, you have to speak with authenticity. (Interruptions) But, then, why are you asking him? You address the Chair. (Interruptions)

**DR. K. MALAISAMY:** I will come back to the point. My simple point is this. Whatever may be the directions of the Election Commission, these are not implemented in practice.

(Contd. by 2n/tdb)

TDB/2N/2.55

**DR. K. MALAISAMY (CONTD.):** I mean, the machinery is weak or the system or the persons handling the system cannot do that or are not doing it. That is the point I want to make. I am submitting to the hon. Minister as to how the system can afford to be improved or how a right person can be put on the right job. This is the point I want to make. Sir, my second point is...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No, Mr. Malaisamy, you promised that you will not take much time. ...(Interruptions)...

**DR. K. MALAISAMY:** Sir, my time was taken by others.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Okay; I will allow you for one more minute.

**DR. K. MALAISAMY:** Sir, my second point is very important. ...(Interruptions)... The hon. Home Minister is always considerate with me. He will always encourage me to speak more and more. I am thankful to him. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** He may encourage but I will not encourage.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**DR. K. MALAISAMY:** Sir, my second point is this. Coming to the electronic voting machine, Sir, there is a very big controversy as to how to use this electronic voting machine. Even the experts have gone to the extent of saying that the electronic voting machine can afford to be manipulated. This is the point. That is why in some of the countries like USA, etc., etc., they are not using the electronic voting machine; on the other hand, they go to the conventional method. So, this is my second point whether the tool used is correct. (Time bell) ...(Interruptions)...

Coming to the amendments, Sir, I have five amendments. Out of them, the only one major amendment is, exit poll, in which, according to me, through the amendment, they want a total ban. As far as I am concerned, I am one who does not like any inducement, any influence or handling of voters in such a way. It should be prohibited. I am in favour of it. But the point is, whether the device, namely, exit poll prohibition or ban will be all right because Indian democracy stands on three pillars of executive, legislature and judiciary operating through bureaucracy and assisted by the fourth estate. So, the fourth estate, namely, the media and the press is one of the pillars of Indian democracy. If that be the case, can we afford to offend the fourth estate of Indian democracy? Instead of prohibiting, making a total ban, whether a self-regulatory mechanism on the part of the media can be done or not. That is the point. Otherwise, your propriety and your desirability will be questioned and a war will be waged by them. So, please go to that area also as to how to do that. Thank you very much, Sir.

(Ends)

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU):** Sir, the hon. Minister, Shri Veerappa Moily is one of the experienced Ministers in the Cabinet, who is open to suggestions and other views expressed by various Members. I have great respect for Mr. Moily for his commendable job as head of the Administrative Reforms Committee. We have great expectations, but seeing this Bill, I must point out his approach seems to be very limited and ad hoc one, and there should be a comprehensive approach to the entire issue.

Sir, the first line itself of the Statement of Objects and Reasons is very clear. It states, "In any Parliamentary form of Government and in a Democracy, the process of election has to be free and fair and equitable." If that is so, the electoral method is the crucial variable used in an electoral system in a country for its political process. The electoral method can be (a) plurality or majority system like in India; (b) proportional representation system like in Brazil; (c) the mixed system like in Germany. The choice of electoral method determines the way constituencies are delimited, registration of votes, design of ballot paper or ballot machine, the method of counting of votes and that influences, in a way, the entire electoral process.

(Contd. by 20-kgg)

kgg/20/3.00

**SHRI D. RAJA (contd.):** Sir, the first election to the Provincial Governments, the State Governments, took place in India under the British regime in 1937 and 1946. The electoral method employed was the first-past-the-post method. After all these years, we have become a

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

nation of minority Governments where a party with bare minimum votes, like 30 or 35 or 40 per cent, forms the Government and the candidates with as less as 18 per cent of votes polled are getting elected. There is a need to bring in proportional representation system and as a mature democracy---I consider the Indian democracy one of the mature democracies in the world---we need to hug it and go beyond the FPTP system which is a colonial legacy and a system.

So, Sir, keeping this in mind, I wish the Government would consider a comprehensive electoral reforms which is the need of our system. If you want to cleanse our system to make it free and fair and equitable, the Government should strive for comprehensive electoral reforms.

My second point is on the question of money power. It is one thing to get rid of the non-serious candidates by increasing the deposits, the amount of security deposits. But, at the same time, how are we going to deal with the money power which has got a very adverse impact on our electoral system. There, I sincerely request the Government. Why cannot the Government consider the question of State-funding in order to provide a level-playing field to all political parties? I know, there was a committee appointed by the Government when the NDA was in power; it was headed by comrade Inderjit Gupta, one of the outstanding Parliamentarians of our country. That committee has given a report. I do not know whether the Government has given any serious thought to that report. I think, it is time that the Government considers certain recommendations made by that committee. The State-

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

funding has become a necessity in a multi-party democracy like ours when we see the dirty role played by the money power in the entire electoral process and it is all the more necessary to provide level-playing field to all the political parties. There, I think, the Government will have to address this question with all seriousness. This issue cannot be further delayed. These are my two major points at this time.

Finally, Sir, among the amendments which have been proposed, I agree with many of the amendments. But, reduction in the security deposit can be considered in case of SC/ST candidates so that there could be an encouragement for those candidates to fight elections.

Regarding the exit polls, it is one thing that media follows their own codes not to influence the minds of the people at the time of elections. There, the exit polls can be after the polls are over in all phases because elections are held in a staggered manner. I do not know how the Election Commission arrives at that conclusion, that is a separate issue. In one State, there would be five stages or phases of election; that is a separate issue.

(Contd. by sss/2p)

SSS/2P/3.05

**SHRI D. RAJA (CONTD.):** But when such a thing takes place, it is reasonable not to influence the voters in any way. These things will have to be kept in mind. Again I urge upon the Government to come forward for a comprehensive reform, electoral reform in the coming days and this Bill serves a limited purpose. It is an ad hoc Bill. It is an ad hoc approach to certain limited issues but we should go for a

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

comprehensive reform. Indian democracy requires such a comprehensive reform in electoral process. Thank you very much.

(Ends)

**SHRI H. K. DUA (NOMINATED):** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, over 45 years ago, I was in the Press Gallery where I started my Parliamentary reporting. In these 45 years, I have travelled a distance of 10 years to avail...

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA:** You are looking down upon us.

**SHRI H. K. DUA:** I am not looking down. These are crucial ten years to reach here. I have never looked down. But certainly you know I never did that. But, thank you, very much for giving me a chance to speak here. Sir, in this maiden speech, as you said, I dedicate myself to the service of the House and the country and the values for which both have stood. Sir, I have gone through the Bill. It is well meant but I find it limited in scope and range. It tackles some of the minor glitches that have come to the notice of the Election Commission and others, which have been noticed in the 57 years of nation's electoral experience. But these 57 years have thrown up major challenges before the electoral system and if we don't meet those challenges, the electoral system will come into disrepute and that is a threat to the democracy also. The Bill does not prescribe ways to meet these challenges in a major way. I will just mention two of them. One has been -- Members have been trying to focus on -- the role of big money in election. It is a serious problem. I would like to draw the attention through you, the Minister, and

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

Members know about this more than me how criminals are threatening the electoral system and functioning of the democracy in the country. Sir, in large numbers criminals are infiltrating into the political system. In many Assemblies they have used their money and muscle. Earlier, they were supporting the candidates and now they are themselves the candidates and many of them are getting elected. In many States, because they are getting elected in numbers or because they are helping the candidates of different parties to win the elections through muscle power or money power which they extract again from the people, get into the Government and influence the policy making and the decision making of the State Governments. At the ground level -- Members would know more than me because they are fairly experienced -- the voters are afraid of the criminals and their gangs and that fear makes them vote for the leader, the mafia leader. Mafia leaders get into the Assemblies where numbers count. When the Government is formed, again, these people influence the formation of the Government or toppling of the Government at times.

(Contd. by NBR/2Q)

-SSS/NBR-VNK/2Q/3.10.

**SHRI H.K. DUA (CONTD.):** As you know, even one vote can make a difference in the survival of the Government. If a vote goes the other side, the Government will be thrown out. The bureaucracy in the States is afraid of these criminal leaders, because they have clout with top people in many States. There is no need to mention the names here. The bureaucracy is afraid, because they will be transferred or an enquiry

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

commission will be instituted against them. They do not take any action against the criminal activities. Police officials are also afraid of taking action against criminal and mafia leaders. When criminal leaders have clout with Chief Minister and the local bureaucracy is very deferential to them, the governance in several districts will suffer. Crime rate has gone up. The law and order problem is under threat. And, the developmental activities are also coming to a halt in some of the districts. The criminals again have association with wrong kind of elements. So, the entire atmosphere is polluted because of their activities and there is a failure of the system to check their entry into the system. If this continues, imagine, they will capture a State. They can capture more States and some of the criminal groups can always form some sort of a syndicate. I am looking at the dark side. They form into a syndicate and, either tomorrow or after 10 years or 20 years hence, can capture the States and become a threat to the stability at the Centre. I have a feeling. The political parties need to do something. They have to come to consensus how to ban their entry at the entry stage itself. Many parties are not stopping criminals getting into the political mainstream, because they want to win election, they want to use their muscle power and then give them seats without realising that tomorrow these people will devour the parties themselves. That is the danger not only to the country but also to the political parties. How can the parties do it? Just ban their entry. There is no point in looking for security while sleeping with enemy. They are enemies of the country. And, they are enemies to the parties themselves. The best thing is,



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

avoid them and shun them even if you lose election. That price is worth paying than sleeping with enemy. People have been warning the parties against criminals. The hon. Supreme Court came out with a suggestion to the Election Commission that it should take steps to prevent nomination of criminals and it is the right of every citizen to know the history of every criminal. Banning criminal candidate from filing their nomination papers when charges have been framed by a court is proper. The police can frame false charges. But, if a court frames charges, then it is the time that nomination paper should not be allowed to file by a person who has a criminal record, particularly if the offences fetch two years of sentence. The Election Commission was in favour of it. They called a meeting of political parties. Almost all the political parties opposed this provision. And, one of their arguments was, sometimes, frivolous charges can be framed and even the court can approve of those frivolous charges and whosoever in the opposition stands to disadvantage if the charges turn out to be false. I am sure, Mr. Moily's legal acumen and advice of his officials can find a way out and provide a safeguard against framing of charges which are mala fide. There should be an attempt by political parties to ban criminals at entry stage itself. There should be a serious attempt to ensure, where the charges are framed by a court law, to ban the entry of criminals into the election system by filing a nomination paper and getting elected.

(CONTD. BY PK "2R")

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**SHRI H.K. DUA (CONTD.):** There should be some safeguard to get over this particular objection. I am sure, Mr. Moily, who seems to be a very earnest Minister in doing things, would include this in the comprehensive reforms he is going to bring in. I hope he brings them soon to take care of this serious problem. Not doing at this stage will prove costly for the country and the political system. This problem is growing like cancer, because with every election -- various NGOs have collected this information and the Election Commission does not deny those figures - the number of candidates fighting the elections is growing. Some of the parties are able to deny the tickets but others are not able to deny the tickets. But, overall, in totality, the number is growing. If they capture the political system, what will be the fate of India's democracy? Thank you Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I am sure that the reforms the Law Minister brings in will include this. Thank you. (Ends)

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (TAMIL NADU):** Sir, I rise to support the Representation of the People (Second Amendment) Bill, 2008. Elections form the nucleus of democracy. People exercising their franchise to form their own Government, consisting of their own elected representatives, is the basic essence of elections. This process of elections, that too in a vast country like ours, is an enormous process and the task is being carried out very efficiently and successfully by the Election Commission, with the Representation of the People Act laying the road for a safer and smoother journey. Sir, nothing is static. At a point of time when the views are mounting that even the Constitution must be relooked into, our Representation of the People Act is taking up

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

its second amendment after 59 years. Yesterday, my colleague, Shri Shantaram Laxman Naik pointed out very clearly the reason for that. It has to be taken note of and it is something to be pondered over. Anyhow, the hon. Minister has mentioned in his introductory speech and as also mentioned in the Statement of Objects and Reasons of the Bill itself that elections have to be fair, free and equitable. The Ministry has come out with these amendments to be implemented in the Representation of the People Act. Sir, there are some suggestions which are being focussed upon for quite a long time. I too had a doubt which was cleared by the Law Minister some minutes ago. When the Election Commission has given 22 proposals, why has the Ministry taken only five out of them? What are the 17 proposals which were left out? But as he pointed out, it is the Standing Committee which has recommended five proposals which were forwarded by the Election Commission. It is a good starting point. Though much has to be done in this regard, let us take it is a kick start for the reforms that we have to do in the Representation of the People Act. Initially, I do not want to elaborate much because all the amendments which have been made are to be welcomed. All the Standing Committee's recommendations, except one or two, have been accepted. I would like to welcome one of the amendments very much because it brings in an amendment which is a must. (Contd. by 2S/PB)

PB-SC/2S/3.20

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.):** The Committee has recommended and the amendment has also been brought in that the inordinate delay which

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

occurs in the current procedure for disqualification of a person found guilty of corrupt practice defeats the very purpose of punishment of the guilty since he can take advantage of the delay to enjoy the benefits accrued to him during the interim period. So 'as soon as' has been replaced with 'three months'; and it is a welcome amendment.

As far as the non-serious candidates are concerned, the security deposit amount has been enhanced; but I don't think it will serve the purpose. In the present day context when the cost of living has soared up and even the expenditure for the elections has been increased by the Election Commission, the increase in the security deposit alone will not lessen the non-serious candidates. So, I would like to suggest to the Minister to find out some other ways and means to curtail the number of non-serious candidates who become a botheration during the time of elections.

So also, Sir, very much to be taken note of is the ban on exit polls, on the survey of the exit polls. Though the days now give more importance to the media -- of course, the activities of the media help us many a time and we also realise that -- but, at the same time, the survey of the exit polls also affect the subsequent elections. Moreover, it also lessens the turnout of voters to the polling booths because an impression is created that only this party will win or this party will lose. I don't think this serves any purpose. The survey or the result of the exit polls survey, I think, is only like going to an astrologer and seeing what may happen or what will happen in a day or two. So, in good interest,

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

the subsequent election results or the people's mandate should not be affected. This is also to be welcomed.

Finally, Sir, I would like to add two points. The Committee proposed many recommendations which have been accepted, except one or two, as I said. I would like to submit to the Minister -- though he is not here -- two things. One is, as one of my colleagues from the other side pointed out yesterday, a convicted person in a prison can contest the elections, whereas he cannot exercise his vote. This contradiction has to be removed. A person should not be deprived or denied of his basic right to exercise his vote at the time of elections. As a citizen of a democratic country, everyone has got the basic right and many such things have to be concentrated and this Bill, though has brought some amendments as all my colleagues have pointed out, we have to travel miles more to achieve the real purpose of democracy through elections.

Anyhow, the journey of a thousand miles begins with single foot. In the same manner, I take that this Bill is a very good start. Sir, I am sure, in the coming days, our efforts will bring more reforms in this Act and the elections will not only be a guide to the other countries, but we will also be proud of the election system of our country.

(Ends)

**श्री राशिद अल्वी (आंध्र प्रदेश) :** सर, सरकार काबिले-मुबारकबाद है कि इलेक्शन की कवानीन के अंदर, इलेक्शन को फेयर और ईमानदारी के साथ कराने के लिए ये अमैंडमेंट्स पार्लियामेंट के अंदर पेश किए जा रहे हैं। सर, हमारी आज़ादी को साठ साल हुए और

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

बिला-शुबा हिन्दुस्तान काबिले-मुबारकबाद है, हिन्दुस्तान के लोग काबिले-मुबारकबाद हैं कि दुनिया की जम्हूरियत में हमने नए सफहात जोड़े।

(2t-एमसीएम पर क्रमागत)

MCM-SKC/2T/3-25

**श्री राशिद अल्वी (क्रमागत) :** हिन्दुस्तान की डेमोक्रेसी, एस्टेब्लिशड डेमोक्रेसी है। जब हम आजाद हुए थे तो दुनिया को यह यकीन नहीं था कि हिन्दुस्तान के लोग जम्हूरियत को इतनी कांपिटेंस के साथ चला पाएंगे। 60 साल का सफर कौमों की जिंदगी में, मुल्कों की जिंदगी में कोई बहुत लम्बा नहीं होता है। लेकिन आहिस्ता-आहिस्ता डेमोक्रेसी में बहुत कमियां हैं, जिन पर मैं कुछ-न-कुछ चर्चा भी करूंगा। लेकिन हिन्दुस्तान के अंदर जब पहला चुनाव हुआ और कंस्टीट्यूट असेम्बली बनी, तो हिन्दुस्तान के सिर्फ उन 10 फीसदी लोगों को वोट देने की इजाजत थी जो टैक्स पे करते थे, जो जमींदार लोग थे उन्होंने इस कंस्टीट्यूट असेम्बली को चुना और उसके बाद हिन्दुस्तान आजाद हुआ, 35 करोड़ लोगों ने अपनी सरकार बनाई और आज 60 साल के बाद 120 करोड़ लोगों की यह जम्हूरियत है। जो पिछला चुनाव हुआ, उसमें 71 करोड़ 66 लाख 76 हजार से ज्यादा वोटर थे और 44 करोड़ से ज्यादा लोगों ने इलेक्शन में पार्टिसिपेट किया। ढाई लाख से ज्यादा पुलिस को डिप्लोय किया गया। एक रिपोर्ट के मुताबिक जितने ऑफिसर्स लगाए गए, जितनी पुलिस लगाई गई, बहुत से मुल्कों की इतनी आबादी नहीं है जितने लोगों को हमने इलेक्शन में फेयर पोल कराने के लिए जिम्मेदारी सौंपी। अगर यूरोप के 50 मुल्कों को जोड़ दिया जाए तो उससे बड़ी हमारा जम्हूरियत है। सर, 60 साल के अंदर स्मूथ ट्रांसफर और पॉवर के साथ 24 पार्टीज की सरकार इस देश में चली। आज कॉइलेशन सरकार चल रही है। दुनिया में किसी को हमारी डेमोक्रेसी पर कभी कोई शुबहा नहीं रहा। लेकिन इसके साथ-साथ यह भी सच है कि हमें बहुत कुछ रिफॉर्म इलेक्शन के अंदर करना पड़ेंगे। हर वोटर का रिप्रजेंटेशन होना चाहिए। दुनिया ने तजुर्बों से बहुत फायदा उठाया है। हमारे यहां भी इस मामले में बहुत बहस हुई है कि क्या इस पूरे सिस्टम को बदला जाए। सर, बहुत सारे मुल्कों ने अपने सिस्टम को बदला है। 1975 के अंदर तारकुंडे समिति ने अपनी पहली

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

रिपोर्ट रिफॉर्म के लिए दी थी। 1990 में गोस्वामी कमेटी ने दी, इलेक्शन कमीशन ने अपनी रिकमंडेशन दी और फिर जैसा कि मेरे साथी ने जिक्र किया कि इंद्रजीत गुप्त कमीशन ने 1998 में अपनी रिपोर्ट दी। सब की कोशिश थी कि इसमें पैसे का इस्तेमाल कम हो, क्रिमिनल लोग पार्टिसिपेट नहीं कर सकें। यह कहते हुए मुझे तकलीफ है कि 13वीं लोक सभा के अंदर एक आंकड़े के मुताबिक 150 एम0पीज0 ऐसे थे, जिनके खिलाफ छोटे और बड़े क्रिमिनल केसेज पेंडिंग थे। 2004 में जो चुनाव हुआ उसके अंदर भी एक रिपोर्ट के मुताबिक करीब-करीब 18 फीसदी ऐसे लोग थे जिनके खिलाफ क्रिमिनल केसेज पेंडिंग थे। 2007 के चुनाव में उत्तर प्रदेश और बिहार के अंदर 39 फीसदी लोग ऐसे थे जिनके खिलाफ क्रिमिनल केसेज पेंडिंग थे। सर, इसमें हम अपना कोई बहुत शानदार मुस्तकबिल नहीं देख सकते। इस देश के अंदर जब तक पैसे वालों को इलेक्शन में पैसे का इस्तेमाल करने से दूर नहीं रखा जाएगा, क्रिमिनल को डेमोक्रेसी से साफ नहीं किया जाएगा, तब तक डेमोक्रेसी साफ-सुथरी नहीं होगी। इसलिए एक बड़ा खतरा जो हमारे सामने आ रहा है वह रीजनेलिज्म का है। देश आजाद हुआ और देश को कहा गया कि यह एक सेक्युलर देश है। पाकिस्तान हमसे एक दिन पहले आजाद हुआ था। पाकिस्तान ने कहा कि यह देश सेक्युलर देश नहीं है, यह एक इस्लामिक देश है और उस वक्त जो देश के हालात थे, वह इतने खौफनाक थे कि उनसे किसी भी तरीके का रिएक्शन हो सकता था। लेकिन उस वक्त हिन्दुस्तान की सेक्युलर कयादत ने जिन्होंने आजादी की लड़ाई लड़कर इस मुल्क को आजाद कराया था, उन्होंने सोच समझकर यह फैसला किया कि यह देश सेक्युलर देश बने। सर, यह फैसला कोई सतही फैसला नहीं था, यह फैसला बगैर सोचे-समझे नहीं किया गया था, यह फैसला था कि देश को कैसे मजबूत रखा जा सकता है।

(2U/GS पर क्रमशः)

GS-HK/2U/3.30

**श्री राशिद अल्वी (क्रमागत) :** देश को कैसे मुत्तहद रखा जा सकता है, तब यह फैसला किया गया था कि यह देश एक सेक्युलर देश होगा। सर, आज देश के ऊपर बड़ा खतरा है।

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

महाराष्ट्र के अंदर जो कुछ हुआ, मैं उसी दोहराना नहीं चाहता हूँ, लेकिन यह डेमोक्रेसी पर एक हमला है, हिन्दुस्तान के कांस्टीट्यूशन पर एक हमला है और अगर हम इस तरीके के वाक्यात को नहीं रोकेंगे, तो यह खतरनाक नताइज देकर जाएगा। मैं बहुत अदब के साथ कहना चाहता हूँ कि कागज के ऊपर, सादे कागज के ऊपर कलम और रोशनाई से लाइन खींचकर देश का नक्शा तो बनाया जा सकता है, लेकिन देश नहीं बनाया जा सकता है। देश इन्सानों से बनता है, नक्शों से नहीं बनता है। हमको अगर यह गलतफहमी है कि हम अपने कागज के ऊपर एक नक्शा बनाकर और दीवार पर लटका लेंगे, तो हम बहुत गलतफहमी में हैं। देश-भक्ति का नाम सिर्फ किसी एक जुबान से मोहब्बत करना, किसी एक इलाके से मोहब्बत करने का नाम नहीं है। देश-भक्ति किसी शहर या जमीन से नहीं की जाती, देश-भक्ति उस देश में रहने वाले लोगों से की जाती है। देश दीवारों से नहीं बनता है, देश लोगों से बनता है और हमें यह सोचना पड़ेगा कि यह casteism, यह regionalism, यह communalism देश हित में नहीं है। अगर हमें ईमानदारी के साथ अपने देश से प्यार है, तो इन चीजों को हमें खत्म करना पड़ेगा।

सर, जो अमेंडमेंट्स आये, उसमें पहला अमेंडमेंट वोट की तब्दीली के लिए है। मेरा मानना है कि यह ठीक है और सरकार ने एक अच्छा कदम उठाया है। लेकिन वोट की जिम्मेदारी सरकार की होनी चाहिए। देश का एक भी आदमी वोटर लिस्ट से बाहर नहीं रहना चाहिए। दुनिया के बहुत से मुमालिक हैं, जिनके अंदर वोटर लिस्ट सिर्फ कागज पर नहीं, कम्प्युटर के अंदर होती है। एक भी आदमी उससे बाहर नहीं होता है। मैं अमेरिका के अंदर इलेक्शन कमीशन को देखने के लिए गया। वहां पर हर स्टेट के अंदर अलेहदा कमीशन है, बहुत कॉम्प्लीकेटिड सिस्टम भी है, लेकिन कुछ बातें ऐसी हैं, जिन पर हमें तवज्जो देनी चाहिए और हमें लगे कि यह बेहतर तरीका है, तो हमें उसे एडाप्ट करना चाहिए। वहां पर कम्प्युटर में हर आदमी का वोट मौजूद है, उसके सिग्नेचर मौजूद हैं, उसका बैकग्राउंड मौजूद है और अगर आप वहां पर घर से बैठकर किसी वजह से वोट दें, तो आप वह भी कर सकते हैं। कम्प्युटर के अंदर आपके सिग्नेचर को देखा जाएगा, टैली किया जाएगा, अगर आपके सिग्नेचर ठीक हैं, तो घर से बैठकर वोट दे सकते हैं। चलिए,



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

अगर हम यह नहीं कर सकते हैं, तो इतना जरूर कर सकते हैं कि हर वोटर की, हर हिन्दुस्तानी की वोट बनाने की जिम्मेदारी सरकार की होनी चाहिए। अगर कोई वोटर रहता है, तो उसकी जिम्मेदारी भी उसी आफिसर की होनी चाहिए जिसने वोट नहीं बनाया, बड़ी तादाद है जिनके वोट नहीं बनते हैं। इसके साथ-साथ एक और बड़ा मसला है, जब पोलिंग का दिन होता है, मैंने अपनी जिदगी के अंदर कम से कम आठ चुनाव लड़े होंगे और मेरा तजुर्बा है कि पोलिंग के दिन जिस पार्टी की सरकार होती है और उसको यह अहसास होता है कि कौन-कौन लोग हमें वोट नहीं देंगे, वोटर लिस्ट में से उन पेजिज़ को साफ कर दिया जाता है, पूरे के पूरे 15-20 पेजिज़ हटा दिए जाते हैं। लोग वोट डालने जाते हैं, उनके नाम वोटर लिस्ट के अंदर नहीं होते हैं और वे वापिस चले जाते हैं। इसके लिए भी कानून के अंदर कोई प्रावधान होना चाहिए।

दूसरी बात है कि जो डिपॉजिट बढ़ाने का काम किया है, यह कैंडिडेट्स की संख्या कम करने के लिए है, यह सरकार की एक अच्छी कोशिश है। लेकिन Exit poll इस सरकार का बड़ा कदम है। Exit poll के लिए एक कानून आया, इससे इलेक्शन के अंदर तरह-तरह के असर पड़ते हैं, लेकिन मैं एक बात का जिक्र करना चाहूंगा, जो सैक्शन 4 के अंदर यह तब्दीली की गई है, You see Section 4. In Section 8A of the Representation of the People Act, 1951, the words "as soon as may be after such order takes effect" जो तब्दीली की गई है, "as soon as may be within a period of three months from the date such order takes effect."

(2W पर जारी)

ASC-KSK/3.35/2w

**श्री राशि अल्वी(क्रमागत)** : सर, यह प्रेजिडेंट ऑफ इंडिया के पास जाएगा, जिसमें तीन महीने के अंदर फैसला करना पड़ेगा। मैं लॉ मिनिस्टर से कहूंगा कि देर तो हाई कोर्ट के अंदर होती है, देर तो अदालतों के अंदर होती है। जहां पर पांच-पांच साल तक मुकदमे पड़े रहते हैं। यह तब्दीली बहुत खुशहाली की तब्दीली है, लेकिन जो बड़ी प्रॉब्लम है, उसकी तरफ भी तवज्जोह देनी चाहिए। आपकी यह बात ठीक है कि सैक्शन-99 के मुताबिक हाई

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

कोर्ट फैसला देगा। आप कहते हैं कि वह तीन महीने में फैसला होना चाहिए, लेकिन सैक्शन-99 के मुताबिक हाई कोर्ट फैसला करेगा। उसके लिए दो, तीन, चार या छः साल तक वक्त की कोई पाबंदी नहीं है। मुझे याद नहीं पड़ता कि कोई चुनाव पांच साल से पहले कभी किसी पिटीशन के अंदर तय हुआ हो। पूरा का पूरा टर्म खत्म हो जाता है, उसके बाद फैसला होता है। इसके अंदर मेरी दरखास्त होगी कि हमें स्पेशल कोर्ट्स बनानी चाहिए, ताकि जल्दी से जल्दी फैसले हो सकें। दूसरी बात यह कही गई है कि हमारे देश के अंदर क्रिमिनल्स का मामला पुराना मुद्दा है। जैसा कि मैंने कहा है कि प्रपोर्सनल रिप्रजेंटेशन दुनिया के बहुत से मुमालिक के अंदर इम्पलिमेंट किया गया। हमारे यहां भी इस पर बहुत बहस हो रही है कि प्रपोर्सनल रिप्रजेंटेशन होना चाहिए, जिससे पैसे तथा ताकत का इस्तेमाल कम होगा, क्रिमिनल्स के पार्टिसिपेशन का इस्तेमाल कम होगा, पॉलिटिकल पार्टीज कंटेस्ट करेंगी। दुनिया के बहुत से मुमालिक ने इसको अपने यहां लागू किया है। साऊथ अफ्रीका के अंदर मैंने देखा कि एक लेडी पार्लियामेंट की मैम्बर है और वह न बोल सकती है और न सुन सकती है। मुझे ताज्जुब हुआ कि वह चुनाव में कैसे चुनकर आई। मुझे पता चला कि प्रपोर्सनल रिप्रजेंटेशन के अंतर्गत उसकी पार्टी ने उसको नोमिनेट किया था। उसको बाकायदा एक ट्रांसलेटर भी दिया गया था, जो उसके इशारों को समझता था और अपनी बात कहता था। उनकी पार्टी ने यह समझा होगा कि यह बहुत इंटेलिजेंट है, लेकिन प्रपोर्सनल रिप्रजेंटेशन पर हमारे मुल्क में बहस होनी चाहिए। हमें इस पर सोचना चाहिए और हमारे बहुत से नेताओं ने इस इस बात पर सोचा भी है और स्टेटमेंट्स भी दी हैं। प्रपोर्सनल रिप्रजेंटेशन होगा तो हर वोट का रिप्रजेंटेशन पार्लियामेंट के अंदर होगा, कास्टिज्म खत्म होगा, कम्युनलिज्म खत्म होगा और यह जरूरत नहीं पड़ेगी कि हम मजहबी नारों के सहारे राजनीति करें। इस पर खुली बहस होनी चाहिए। बेल्जियम, ऑस्ट्रिया, ऑस्ट्रेलिया, जर्मन और साऊथ अफ्रीका आदि तमाम यूरोपियन कंट्रीज के अंदर प्रपोर्सनल रिप्रजेंटेशन है। मैं यह नहीं कहता कि हमारा पार्लियामेंट्री सिस्टम एकदम से बदल दिया जाए, लेकिन इस पर बहस करने की जरूरत है। तमाम मुकर्ररीन नेता के कम्प्रीहेंसिव रिफार्म होने चाहिए। यदि कम्प्रीहेंसिव रिफार्म होने चाहिए, तो खुला डिस्कशन होना चाहिए और इस डिस्कशन के

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

बाद हमें किसी नतीजे पर पहुंचना चाहिए। सर, किसी ने कहा कि सरकार को इलेक्शन के अंदर फंडिंग करनी चाहिए। यह भी इंद्रजीत गुप्ता कमेटी के अंदर कहा गया है कि इसका भी एक तरीका निकालना चाहिए। आजकल चुनाव में 25 लाख रुपए खर्च करने की लिमिट है, लेकिन हम सब यह बात अच्छी तरह से जानते हैं कि 25 लाख के अंदर चुनाव नहीं होता है। आज करोड़ों रुपए के अंदर चुनाव होता है और दिन-ब-दिन यह पैसा बढ़ता चला जा रहा है। यह डेमोक्रेसी के लिए एक बड़ा खतरा है। मैं बहुत से लोगों को जानता हूँ, जो 10-10, 15-15 करोड़ खर्च करके लोक सभा के मैम्बर्स बनते हैं। इतनी बड़ी रकम के बारे में, तो एक गरीब आदमी सोच भी नहीं सकता है कि वह इस रकम के जरिए पार्लियामेंट का चुनाव लड़ सकता है। आज यही हाल असेम्बलीज का भी है। सर, यह करप्शन की बुनियाद है और यहीं से करप्शन पैदा होता है। इसको रोकने के लिए हमें जो भी कदम उठाने पड़ें, वे उठाने चाहिए।

(क्रमशः 2X/LP पर)

--ASC/LP/3.40/2X

**श्री राशिद अल्वी (क्रमागत) :** अगर सरकार को फंडिंग करनी है, तो इसके बहुत सारे तरीके हो सकते हैं। टी.वी. के ऊपर, रेडियो के ऊपर, प्रोपेगेट करने का जो तरीका है, उसे ज्यादा से ज्यादा किया जा सकता है। कैंडीडेट को इस बात की इजाजत दी जा सकती है। इस पर भी हमें बहस करने की जरूरत है, यह बड़ी तब्दीली लाने की जरूरत है। सर, अभी यहां पर मेरे किसी साथी ने जिक्र भी किया है कि 2001 के अंदर सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने इलेक्शन कमीशन से कहा कि सभी कैंडीडेट क्रिमिनल्स बैकग्राउण्ड और अपने असेट्स का एफिडेविट देंगे। हम लोग जो देते हैं, उस पर इक्कीस पार्टीज की मीटिंग हुई और तमाम नेताओं ने कहा कि यह नहीं होना चाहिए। उसके बाद एक बिल भी लाया गया जो सारे मैम्बर्स में सर्कुलेट हुआ, गालिबन 2003 या 2004 के अंदर आया था, इस बिल के अंदर कहा गया था कि अगर किसी कैंडीडेट के खिलाफ दो बार चार्जशीट फाइल हो जाए, इलेक्शन से छह महीने पहले फाइल हो जाए तो उसे कंटेस्ट करने की इजाजत नहीं होनी चाहिए। वह बिल पास नहीं हुआ। महोदय, सुप्रीम कोर्ट काबिले ऐहताराम है, इलेक्शन कमीशन भी काबिले ऐहताराम है,

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

लेकिन यह जरूरी है कि जो पार्लियामेंट के अख्तियारात हैं, वे किसी और के हाथ में नहीं जाने चाहिए। हिंदुस्तान के अंदर पोलिटिकल लोगों का, एम.पीज. का ऐहताराम दिन-ब-दिन कम होता जा रहा है। सुप्रीम कोर्ट कहती है कि ऐसा होगा तो वैसा किया जाएगा, इलेक्शन कमीशन कह रहा है कि ऐसा किया जाए। पार्लियामेंट कॉम्पिटेंट है कि हिंदुस्तान के अंदर कैसे इलेक्शन हो, कैसे न हो। मैं सुप्रीम कोर्ट का ऐहताराम करता हूं, आज हम लोग Affidavit भी फाइल करते हैं कि किसका क्रिमिनल बैकग्राउण्ड है। मुझे नहीं लगता कि इससे कोई बहुत बड़ा फर्क पड़ा है। यह फाइल कर देना कि कितने क्रिमिनल केसेज किसके खिलाफ पेंडिंग हैं, उसके बावजूद भी कितने लोग चुनकर आ रहे हैं। क्या यह सिर्फ इसलिए कि जनता को यह पता चल जाए कि जो चुनाव लड़ रहा है, उसने कितने क्राइम्स किए हैं या इसके पास कितनी दौलत है? इससे इलेक्शन के ऊपर कोई बहुत फर्क नहीं पड़ रहा है और इससे न ही क्रिमिनल्स को पोलिटिक्स में आने से रोका जा रहा है। जब कोई चुनाव लड़ता है तो उसे भी मालूम नहीं होता कि उसके बाप-दादा क्या करते थे, जनता उसे आकर बता देती है, कुछ छुपा हुआ नहीं होता है। चुनाव के अंदर एक भी उम्मीदवार ऐसा नहीं होता, जिसके बारे में जनता को यह पता नहीं हो कि यह ईमानदार आदमी है कि बेईमान आदमी है, यह बदमाश आदमी है कि शरीफ आदमी है।

**(उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे.कुरियन) पीठासीन हुए)**

लेकिन अगर वोट देने की बुनियाद कास्ट होगी, मजहब होगा, रीजन होगा, इलाका होगा तो आप इसे रोक नहीं सकते। इसलिए मैं कहूंगा कि इसके लिए सख्त से सख्त कानून बनाया जाए। आज इलेक्शन कमीशन को अख्तियार है कि अगर कोई भी पार्टी कांस्टीट्यूशन को वॉयलेट करती है, तो वह किसी भी पार्टी का सिंबल सीज कर सकता है। सर, इलेक्शन कमीशन के अंदर एक पार्टी के खिलाफ 2007 से केस पेंडिंग है। उत्तर प्रदेश के अंदर जब चुनाव हुआ था तो एक बहुत खतरनाक सीडी सर्कुलेट की थी। तीन साल हो गए हैं वह केस पेंडिंग हैं। इलेक्शन कमीशन कभी यू.पी. को भेजता है, मेरे पास वे सारे कागजात मौजूद हैं। पुलिस ने सारी रिपोर्ट दे दी है कि यह काम किसी पोलिटिकल पार्टी ने किया था, इसके बावजूद वह पेंडिंग है, उसके खिलाफ कोई कार्रवाई नहीं हो रही है। अगर इस देश के

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

अंदर कास्ट, क्रीड और कम्युनलिज्म की बुनियाद पर वोट दिया जाएगा, तब ऐसा मुमकिन नहीं है। आज जिस तरीके से हमारे मुल्क के अंदर पोलिटिशियन्स की इज्जत घटती चली जा रही है, उसकी यही वजह है कि हमने उनकी आदत बना दी है कि वे इसी बुनियाद के ऊपर वोट देते हैं। अगर वोट इसी बुनियाद पर देंगे, कोई गलत आदमी होगा, तो यह मुमकिन नहीं है कि वह पार्लियामेंट के अंदर आकर अच्छा आदमी बन जाए। अगर गलत होगा तो गलत होगा और उसके नतीजात गलत निकलेंगे। मैं सरकार से कहूंगा कि यह बहुत अहम मामला है। यदि ऐसी कोई भी पोलिटिकल पार्टी हो, जो कम्युनलिज्म को फैलाना चाहती हो, कास्टिज्म को फैलाना चाहती हो, तो उसके लिए सख्त से सख्त कानून बनना चाहिए। आज कास्ट की बुनियाद पर रोज एक नई पार्टी इस मुल्क के अंदर बन रही है।

(akg/2y पर जारी)

AKG-YSR/2Y/3.45

**श्री राशिद अल्वी (क्रमागत) :** आप कैसे election reform करेंगे? कैसे मुमकिन है कि आप सही लोगों के हाथों में इक्तिदार देंगे? इसके खिलाफ सख्त-से-सख्त कानून बनना चाहिए, लेकिन इसके बावजूद सरकार ने मौजूदा कानून में जो तब्दीली लायी है, वह मुबारकवाद है और मुझे यकीन है कि मुस्तकबिल करीब के अन्दर कोई comprehensive reform लाया जाएगा। थैंक्यू वेरी मच।

(समाप्त)

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास (छत्तीसगढ़) :** धन्यवाद उपसभाध्यक्ष जी। मुझे तो प्रारम्भ में एक ही बिन्दु पर बोलना था, परन्तु कुछ बातें सुन कर और भी कुछ मस्तिष्क में आ रहा है। मैं Statement of Objects and Reasons देख रहा था। हमारे सामने बहुत विद्वान कानून मंत्री बैठे हैं। इसके बिन्दु 4 में कहा गया है, "restricting the publication of results of all exit polls by whatever means.." और जो details बनाया गया है, उसमें 126A(1) says that no person shall conduct any exit poll and publish or publicise.." इसकी साइड में लिखा है, which is its heading, "Restriction on

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

publication and dissemination of result of exit polls, etc." मैं इस बात को ध्यान में लाना चाहता हूँ कि यह सम्भव है कि इस देश में जो fundamental rights का, मूलभूत अधिकार का प्रावधान है, उसमें आप किसी आदमी को तब तक नहीं रोक सकते हैं, जब तक वह समाज पर कोई समस्या नहीं बनता है। इसलिए इन दोनों में distinction करना चाहिए। "No person shall conduct any exit poll" एक प्वायंट है और दूसरा है "restriction on publication और उसके प्रचार करने में।" किसी आदमी को आप किसी काम को करने से तब तक नहीं रोक सकते हैं, जब तक वह किसी सामाजिक दोष में परिवर्तित नहीं होता है। मैं एक research scholar हूँ, मुझे लोगों से कुछ पूछना है, कोई सर्वे करना है, मैं उसका प्रचार नहीं करने वाला हूँ, तो आप मुझे कैसे रोकना चाहते हैं? यह मेरा मूलभूत अधिकार है। मैं सोचता हूँ कि इस पर विचार होना चाहिए, नहीं तो, कोई-न-कोई खड़ा होकर उसे चुनौती भी दे सकता है। यह भी एक आँकड़े जानने का विषय है कि क्या exit poll के कारण आगे होने वाले चुनाव पर परिणाम के आँकड़ें हैं, वे प्रभावित हुए हैं, कितने प्रतिशत हुए हैं। मैं यह नहीं कह रहा हूँ कि आप उस पर रोक मत लगाइए, परन्तु इसका आधार वैज्ञानिक विश्लेषण होना चाहिए। हमने देखा कि इतने exit poll होने के बाद इतने-इतने चुनाव पर ऐसे-ऐसे परिणाम हो गए। क्या ऐसा कोई scientific data है या हम केवल अंदाज और अनुमान से बोल रहे हैं? यह भी सोचने का विषय है, परन्तु मेरी उस पर इतनी आपत्ति नहीं है, जितनी इस पर है कि आप किसी मनुष्य को सर्वेक्षण करने से कैसे रोक सकते हैं। आपका उसके द्वारा प्रचार करने पर, प्रसार करने पर रोक लगाना तो थोड़ी देर के लिए समझ में आता है, परन्तु कोई व्यक्ति एक एक्टिविटी करता है, तो उसको आप कैसे रोक सकते हैं? विद्वान कानून मंत्री इस बात पर जरूर सोचेंगे, ऐसा मेरा उनसे निवेदन है।

अन्य बातें, जो वर्तमान में चल रही बातों के कारण निर्माण हुई हैं, मैं उनसे सहमत हूँ कि पूरी चुनाव प्रक्रिया पर बहुत व्यापक रूप से विचार होना चाहिए। बहुत सी बातें मुझे मेरे एक मित्र ने सुझाई हैं, मैं उनको पढ़ कर बता रहा हूँ। वर्तमान में विधान सभा और लोक सभा के लिए 14 दिन का प्रचार का समय मिलता है। एक लोक सभा क्षेत्र में 7-8

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

विधान सभा की सीटें होती हैं। उस प्रचार के लिए दोनों में समान समय रहना उपयुक्त मालूम नहीं होता है। कृपया इस पर विचार कीजिएगा।

दूसरा, अभी यहाँ पर विचार आया कि सब लोगों को अवश्यमेव मतदान करना चाहिए। यहीं पर हमारी ही सरकार ने compulsory voting का एक बिल लाया था और उसको वापस ले लिया गया। कारण तो बताया गया कि इस पर बहुत-कुछ विचार-विमर्श होना बाकी है, परन्तु यह भी आपके सोचने का एक विषय है।

फिर इलेक्ट्रानिक वोटिंग मशीन के बारे में मैंने एक विशेष उल्लेख लाया था। मुझे उत्तर देने वाले मंत्री महोदय को धन्यवाद देना है कि उन्होंने समझाने के लिए 3-4 पेज में उत्तर दिया।

(2जेड/एससीएच पर जारी)

SCH-VKK/3.50/2Z

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास (क्रमागत):** परन्तु इसके बाद भी समाचार छप रहे हैं। पश्चिमी जगत में भी इस पर प्रयोग हो रहे हैं कि इलेक्ट्रॉनिक वोटिंग मशीन्स फूल प्रूफ नहीं हैं। टेक्नोलॉजी में परिवर्तन लाने वाले लोग बहुत आगे बढ़ कर उसको प्रभावित कर रहे हैं, इसलिए इस इलेक्ट्रॉनिक वोटिंग मशीन के विचार पर ही फुल स्टॉप लगा कर ठहर नहीं जाना चाहिए। विचार आगे भी चलता रहना चाहिए।

अभी हमारे साथी बहुत अच्छी बातें कह रहे थे कि किसी वर्ग या सम्प्रदाय के आधार पर विचार नहीं होना चाहिए, लेकिन उसी श्वास में आप यह भी कह रहे थे कि प्रपोर्शनल रिप्रैजेंटेशन होना चाहिए। ये दोनों बातें साथ-साथ कैसे चलेंगी, कृपया इस पर विचार करने की आवश्यकता है। बहस होनी चाहिए, इस पर तो मैं सहमत हूँ, लेकिन दोनों बातें साथ-साथ नहीं चल सकती हैं। यदि हम भारत को एक स्वस्थ प्रजातंत्र के रूप में देखना चाहते हैं, तो हर नागरिक को यह मानना चाहिए कि मैं इस देश का नागरिक हूँ और इस मातृभूमि का पुत्र हूँ। इससे अधिक हमें कोई अधिकार नहीं चाहिए। न किसी पंथ विशेष का होना चाहिए, न किसी भाषा विशेष का होना चाहिए, न ही यह अधिकार होना चाहिए कि

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

पचास साल पहले मेरे पूर्वज कहीं से आए। यह देश मेरा है, यह मातृभूमि मेरी है और मैं यहां का नागरिक हूं, इससे अधिक कोई संज्ञान नहीं लिया जाना चाहिए। इस पर बहुत गंभीरता से सोचना चाहिए कि वर्ग के आधार पर प्रतिनिधित्व देना अपने आप में खतरनाक बात भी हो सकती है।

मैं एक बात और कहना चाहता हूं। चूंकि हमारे एक मित्र ने श्री राम का नाम लिया था, मैं उनको धन्यवाद देता हूं कि उन्होंने राम जी का नाम लिया। मैं यह तो मानता हूं कि अनावश्यक आपत्तिजनक नारे नहीं लगाने चाहिए, परन्तु राम का नाम लेने में क्या दोष है? भाई साहब, मैंने एक ग्रंथ पढ़ा, जो अमैरिका में प्रकाशित हुआ था और उसका नाम है, 'The White Umbrella' और उसमें भगवान श्री राम जी के राज्य का वर्णन है। उस किताब को लिखने वाले ने लिखा है कि वह दुनिया का सबसे अच्छा राज्य था। हमारे देश में भी हम लोग यह मानते हैं कि राम का राज्य सर्वश्रेष्ठ राज्य था। अरे भई! अगर कोई राम का नाम लेकर नारे लगा रहा है या उनको पुकार रहा है, तो यह समझना चाहिए कि उसके मन में राम राज्य की आकांक्षा होगी। राम द्वेष का शब्द नहीं है, राम तो प्रेम और सौहार्द का शब्द है, इसलिए उससे ऐलर्जी नहीं होनी चाहिए। मुझे केवल इतना ही कहना है ..(व्यवधान) भाई साहब, मैं आपकी भावनाओं से सहमत हूं।

**एक माननीय सदस्य:** राम के नाम से भड़कना नहीं चाहिए, राम नाम से दुःखी नहीं होना चाहिए।

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास:** मुझे और कोई खास बात नहीं कहनी है। सभी विद्वान लोग जानते हैं कि धर्म शब्द का पर्याय अंग्रेजी या किसी भी अन्य भाषा में नहीं है। Religion का अर्थ धर्म नहीं है, पंथ है। पंथ को उपासना या धर्म नहीं कहा जा सकता। धर्म में हमारा कर्तव्य भी शामिल है, इसलिए इसमें हमको भ्रम में नहीं पड़ना चाहिए। सभी लोग धार्मिक बनें, अपने कर्तव्यों का पालन करें, यही भारत का आह्वान है। इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ मैं अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूं।

(समाप्त)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Thank you. Now, Mr. Vijayaraghavan.



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN (KERALA):** Thank you very much, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir. I would like to raise one or two important points. Sir, now, we are amending this RP Act.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** You have only four minutes.

**SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN:** Sir, we are very much aware of the changes which have taken place in the last fifty years or so. Sir, the size of the electorate has increased manifold. Political parties, electorate, candidates, everything has increased manifold from 1952. In 1952, we had only 17.32 crore voters. Then in 2004, it is 64.4 crore. Now, it is little more than 80 crores or so. In such a situation, we have to address very serious problems which have been emerging during this period. Here, I think, Sir, the important aspect is the impact of money power in our political system. Recently, you see what happened in Karnataka. One mafia, iron ore mafia, could control 60 or 80 MLAs. This is the situation. A group is there. Sponsored MLAs are there by the mafia. 'कौन बनेगा करोड़पति', यह तो मेरे को पता नहीं, लेकिन देश के अन्दर ऐसी सिचुएशन पैदा हो रही है कि 'करोड़पति बनेगा एम.पी.' Sir, this is the situation. So, how to control this? I am not against a rich man sitting here. We have some of them with us. But, if this House or the other House is dominated only by crorepatis, then, what would be the future of this country where we have people earning only Rs.20 per day for nearly 70 per cent of the rural population?

(Contd. by MKS/3a)

--VKK/MKS-PSV/3.55/3A

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN (CONTD.):** So, whenever you come out with a reform for electoral rolls, utmost importance should be given to coming out of the clutches of an iron ore mafia, a liquor baron, a sugar lobby etcetera, etcetera. That aspect he has failed to address in this Bill. That is the most important aspect I want to mention.

Similarly, Sir, we are going to have radical reforms in our electoral system. You must have a comprehensive discussion with the political parties. This is the time when you have to start that process. I do not know what the attitude of the Government is. Mr. Veerappa Moily is a very experienced politician. I hope that he will start that process of reforming our electoral system in a big way. This is the time for you to start that process.

Sir, with regard to influence of money, we are now thinking of enhancing the security deposit. We are going to enhance it to Rs.25,000/- or so. Sir, my worry is whether it would be possible for a poor man, in this country, to contest an election if you fix it up Rs.20,000/-, Rs.25,000/-, one crore rupees or so. Here, Sir, we are addressing some small issues. On the one hand, the Election Commission is going to count the number of posters, wall writings, banners etc. But how much money are they giving through kickbacks? ...(Interruptions)... Packets are being given, Sir. How are you going to address this issue? This is the main question. This is happening in the country, Sir. Rather than making cosmetic changes, you should have addressed this issue urgently. I hope that while giving a reply, he will

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

give some solution for solving the issue of money packets which they are giving at the time of elections.

Sir, another aspect I would like to mention here is the influence of media. Of course, we have taken some steps with regard to 'exit polls'. Sir, a new tendency has developed in the country whereby the media is also asking for money from the candidates for showing the news-item. With regard to columns they are asking for money! This new tendency has started in the country. How are you going to address this issue? On the one hand, we are addressing the exit poll issue. It may be manipulated. We can address this issue by making an amendment. How are you going to address the question of mismanagement of funds or asking for money by the media and TV channels? There are more than 500 TV channels, and also the print media. This tendency is emerging. How are you going to address this issue? That is also very important.

Similarly, the proposals for State funding for electioneering are also there. That aspect we have to clinch. That is an important issue which we have to address immediately. (Time Bell)

Sir, another issue is, when we are delegating power to the Election Commission, we should be much more serious about some of the aspects highlighted here. Other than the Government officers, we are providing it to the banks and other public sector units. Naturally, they have these democratic rights. What would be the influence of those democratic rights once you are delegating this power to the Election Commission?

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

That is a very important aspect. On that, the Standing Committee has made a recommendation. Unfortunately, the Standing Committee recommendation is not being considered by the Minister. So, I hope that while giving his reply, he would consider all these aspects and make proper amendments. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Shri Brij Bhushan Tiwari. He is not here. Now, Shri Bharatkumar Raut.

**SHRI BHARATKUMAR RAUT (MAHARASHTRA):** Sir, I am sorry that I was not present when my name was announced. I was in the other building, busy with the Committee-related work.

Sir, I would like to raise only four points. While I appreciate and welcome this Bill, a lot more needs to be done. The Minister has assured us that a more comprehensive Bill will be coming later. So, I am waiting for that.

(Contd. by TMV/3B)

-MKS-TMV-DS/3B/4.00

**SHRI BHARATKUMAR RAUT (CONTD.):** Sir, I would like to raise the issue of deposit money that has been dealt with in this Bill. It says that hereafter Rs.25,000 will be the deposit money. Considering the amount that is spent on the election campaign, I think, the amount of Rs.25,000 is a meagre sum. If at all you want to curb the number of candidates contesting the election, I think, this amount can be raised multiple. A candidate who is ready to spend crores of rupees, officially or unofficially, can easily spend more. So, why should it be only

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

Rs.25,000? At least, we should be able to meet some of the expenses through the deposit money. Therefore, this deposit money has to be increased. That is my first suggestion.

My second suggestion is, which Shri Ahluwalia has also raised, regarding the issue of candidates contesting from more than one constituency. Here, I think, the provision is for increasing the deposit.

My suggestion is that it should be banned. No candidate should be allowed to contest from more than one constituency because unnecessarily we are putting a burden on the exchequer of the Government, as well as, we are making the voters to guess whether this man will be contesting from this constituency or that constituency. For example, in Maharashtra, one candidate contested from two constituencies and immediately, within 15 days, he had given up one seat. It means that within three months there will be another election. Why should the Government machinery be used for the whims and fancies or the fear complex of the candidate? It should not happen. If you are confident of winning one constituency, you should contest; otherwise, don't contest. This should be banned at once.

My third point, which many speakers have raised, is about exit poll. I belong to the media. Therefore, I should not speak against exit poll. But the way the exit polls are conducted, I think, definitely make an impact on the electorate. Here we are only talking about exit polls. My suggestion to the hon. Minister is that we should also include opinion polls. Here the definition of exit poll is very categorically mentioned and it does not include the opinion poll. Opinion polls are

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

done, published and telecast before voting and they definitely make an impact on the minds of the people, particularly where there is a keen contest. In Maharashtra, we had opinion polls. The opinion poll came just ten days before the election. The opinion poll was taken on the day when the withdrawal of the candidates was done. That opinion poll was carried and published just five or six days before voting. It definitely makes an impact on the Indian electorate. If you are banning the exit poll, you should also ban the opinion poll. That is even more important. Opinion polls should be banned. It is a good idea that there has to be an authorised agency for opinion polls. It is good. But, at the same time, it should be seen that opinion polls are not just done. Exit polls do not make any impact on the electorate. But opinion polls do make an impact, particularly, in the Indian situation where the people bank on the media.

I want to make one more point. I don't know whether it can be included now or later. The point is that in the Legislative Council Elections in the States, you have the Graduate Constituency and the Teacher Constituency. The funny part of it is that in a Graduate Constituency, a voter has to be a graduate, but the candidate need not be. A non-graduate candidate can contest the Graduate Constituency. The voters are graduates but the candidate is not a graduate. I think, there is a serious problem in this regard. Another example, we have the Teacher Constituency. In the Teacher Constituency, again, the teachers are the voters, but the candidate need not be. Now, at present, a Member of the Legislative Council, who has been elected from the

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

Teacher Constituency, is not a teacher. But it is the teachers' election. Only because you have a party behind you, you are making a fun of the Indian democratic system.

Sir, I will make the last point and conclude.

(Contd. by 3C/VK)

VK/3C/4.05

**SHRI BHARATKUMAR RAUT (CONTD):** My last point is in regard to the Legislative Council elections. If I am a Corporator -- of course, I am a graduate -- and if I am working as a teacher somewhere, I can cast four votes. As a general person, I vote; as a teacher, I vote; as a graduate, I vote; and I also vote as a Member of the Municipal Corporation. So one voter gives four votes! Where does it stand? We say, "One man, one vote." But here one man can vote four times. I think there is a serious lacuna in the system which needs to be corrected. The sooner we correct it the better it will be for the Indian democracy. I once again welcome the Bill. Thank you.

(Ends)

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA (RAJASTHAN):** Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I am not going to take much time of the House. There are two-three points which I want to bring to the notice of the hon. Law Minister. The Minister of Law is a very able person. He has presided over the Administrative Reforms Commission very well. Now he has brought before us the amendment to the Representation of the People Act. Sir, We appreciate his desire to improve the Representation of the

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

People Act, to plug the loopholes in the Representation of the People Act. I do not understand one thing. All of us are sitting here in this House, including you, Sir, because of the Representation of the People Act. We have been elected to this position because we have a particular Electoral College. That is why we are here. I am a Member of this House for 30 years. I have been hearing, time and again, that there is going to be an amendment to the Representation of the People Act, there is going to be a comprehensive Representation of the People Bill. Governments have come and Governments have gone. But no comprehensive Representation of the People Bill has been brought forward. Just now my colleague from Maharashtra was speaking. He was saying that one person can cast four votes. How can it be possible? There is something wrong in the Representation of the People Act. Now, teacher's constituency was made so that teachers could be represented, like we have nominated Members of Parliament here who are nominated by the President from special categories. Similarly, there is a special category of graduates and also of teachers where a non-teacher is elected by a teacher and non-graduate is elected by a graduate. It is just the tip of the iceberg. Just now the hon. Member has made his maiden speech. He has been a very important journalist. He was also an Ambassador. He referred to the criminals, politicalisation of criminals which is taking place because criminals are becoming politicians. Politics is not becoming criminal but criminals are becoming politicians. That is a very important point which should be looked into. We appreciate the Election Commission for conducting



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

elections throughout this vast country. It is not an easy job. It is a massive job. We appreciate the Election Commission for all the efforts which it has made. We brought these Electronic Voting Machines so that there is no malpractice. These EVMs were introduced in India much before the most modern democracies introduced them in their countries. People from other countries are coming to our country to see how these Electronic Voting Machines are working. I am sorry to say that in spite of using EVMs, excess voting is taking place. In the last Lok Sabha elections, in Arunachal Pradesh, more than 100 per cent votes were registered. How can it be possible? On these Electronic Voting Machines, more than 100 per cent votes were registered. What action was taken by the Election Commission? Arunachal Pradesh is a border State. It is a very sensitive State. The Election Commission was informed about it and a complaint was also registered about it, but no action has been taken. Why are double standards being applied? I only wanted to bring it to the notice of the Law Minister. I appreciate the Law Minister for taking so much interest in it.

When I am speaking on the electoral reforms, I cannot refrain myself from mentioning the Women's Reservation Bill.

(Contd. by 3D)

RG/4.10/3D

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA (contd.):** It has been pending before Parliament for so many years. It was introduced in the Rajya Sabha. But it is now pending before the Standing Committee; I was a Member of that Committee. We expected that before the Lok Sabha

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

elections, the Report would be submitted and there would, perhaps, be 33 per cent more women, at least in the Lok Sabha if not in the Rajya Sabha. I would request the hon. Minister to respond to this when he replies. Mr. Minister, the four Amendments, which you have brought in, are excellent ones. We are very happy that you are bothered about these Exit Polls. And, as my friends mentioned, before the Exit Polls, there are speculations about what the future of any political party would be. We are very happy that you have brought in an amendment for that. But what about the Women's Reservation Bill? So, these are the two important points which I would like the hon. Minister to respond. Firstly, in respect of Arunachal Pradesh, which is the border State and a sensitive State, why was no action taken? And, what are you going to do with the Women's Reservation Bill? One hundred days have passed, and I hope that before 200 days of this Government are over, there will be the Women's Reservation Bill in the Rajya Sabha when, perhaps, you will be in the Chair, Sir, and we will be voting for it.

(Ends)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** When it was introduced, I was in the Chair. Now, Shri Silvius Condpán.

**SHRI SILVIUS CONDPAN (ASSAM):** Sir, thank you for allowing me to take part in the discussion on this Bill. Before I make my submission, I would like to congratulate the hon. Law Minister for taking steps for bringing in at least four Amendments, and I only hope that the rest of the recommendations from the Standing Committee would also come up before the House for consideration and passing. I do not want to take

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

much time. But I would like to make a submission that steps should be taken for reduction of election expenditure. Election expenses are going beyond the reach of the common candidates, or, so to say, the common people who want to take part in the elections. In this connection, several Members have spoken in detail. I would like to subscribe to their views. Then, Sir, on the point about criminals entering politics, my colleagues have already made their submissions, and I subscribe to their views. I am also very much particular on this point.

Then, people, who have got money, -- moneyed men alone are able to do this -- contest from several seats, and after they win, they create a problem that by-election has to be called. This also has to be looked into. Another thing is that legal cases, pertaining to election-related issues, take a very, very long time for their disposal. I would suggest to the hon. Law Minister that there should be Special Courts for disposing of the election matters. Also, these Amendments, which are coming about in the Representation of the People Act, should percolate down to the Panchayati Raj Act and the Municipal Acts because these are essential at those levels too. So, I would request the hon. Law Minister to see to it these have far-reaching impact, that these percolate down to all levels where elections take place. These institutions have become greatly important for the development of our country, both in the urban areas as well as in the rural areas. Therefore, I would request the hon. Minister to keep in mind the fact that the Amendments in the Representation of the People Act should extend to the local self-Government and the Panchayati Raj systems.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

With these submissions, I conclude. Thank you.

(Ends)

(Followed by 3E)

3e/4.15/ks

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN):** Thank you very much. Sardar Tarlochan Singh.

**SARDAR TARLOCHAN SINGH (HARYANA):** First of all, Sir, I congratulate Mr. Moily, the Law Minister, for bringing forward all the amendments which were delayed for nothing for a long time. I just request him that I have been a member of the Standing Committee on Law and Justice previously and I am a Member of that Committee now also. There is one very important issue relating to my community. It is a small amendment pertaining to the Sikh Marriage Act. I will request him to bring forward that amendment also.

Sir, I support this Bill fully. But this is not enough. Exit Polls have been banned. Just now, my colleague from that side of the House mentioned about the opinion polls. We all watch television and we know how opinion polls are being misused. Every TV channel's bias is very apparent in these polls. I am from the State of Haryana. Elections were held recently. Two or three channels -- I don't know how they were motivated -- were giving Chautala's party less than ten seats, the Congress Party more than seventy seats whereas the results were just the opposite. The Congress got 40 and Chautala's party got 32. It had happened earlier also. So, I request the Law Minister to look into it and have a meeting of the Media Committee so that there should be some

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

code of conduct on this. Secondly, the Election Commission has framed such rules that are totally biased against the candidates. As per those rules, you cannot have posters, you cannot have handbills, you cannot have hoardings, you cannot write on the walls. Then, what is left for doing our propaganda, except going to the Press and the electronic media which is very expensive. The Election Commission is encouraging people to go to media in any form. Sir, I have seen a report from Maharashtra. In the recent elections in Maharashtra, every newspaper was getting money even for their news items. Even the news was being sold. Candidates were paying even for the publication of news items. This type of corruption is going on. How, then, are we asking the candidates not to do any propaganda? The other thing is that, now, candidates get only eleven days whether it is the Lok Sabha elections or the municipal elections. How will a candidate visit different areas of his constituency in such a short time? Then, a candidate in an election has to get the permission of the DC, the SDM, for any meeting. He is running after these offices for permissions all the time. I do not understand why we are putting so many restrictions on the candidates in elections. These rules of the Election Commission are also very wrong. Then, they say, if a leader comes to your constituency, the candidate will bear the cost of the helicopter, the aircraft and so on. What is the fault of the candidate if a political party is sending its leaders to that constituency? Such rules of the Election Commission should be examined by the hon. Law Minister so that candidates can have less expensive elections. Just now, our new Member, who is one of the very

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

brilliant journalists of our country, Shri H. K. Dua, mentioned about criminals entering the Parliament. This has been debated many times. But nothing has been done so far. In addition to this, moneyed people are now entering the Assemblies and the Parliament. I will give you one example of just what they do after they enter into the Legislature. Recently, elections were held in Haryana. There, the anti-defection law is manipulated in such a manner that one day you are elected, against a particular party, and after three days you join that party, saying that you are dissolving the earlier party. Money is a big player in all this. This is what is being done in Haryana. You have the Government of defectors because the Congress Party had forty and they wanted six more. So, all the Independents and one political party merged with them. Sir, we are a democratic country. How long will we expect such things to happen? A national-level party should wait for the things to happen. Why should it be in a hurry to spend money and get its numbers? I request the hon. Law Minister to convene a meeting of all the political parties to tackle these issues. Even after sixty years of our Independence, if we still have these *aya-Rams and gaya-Rams*, it is a shame for our democratic system.

(Contd. by 3f/tdb)

TDB/3F/4.20

**SARDAR TARLOCHAN SINGH (CONTD.):** I would request the Law Minister, he is doing so many good things, at least, now for such other things to please take note of it. In our Standing Committee we wanted that all political parties should come forward and form a consensus for

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

electoral reforms, but we could not do it. My sister, Najmaji was also a Member of that Committee and she had been giving valuable advice in the Committee, but we could not come to a consensus on certain matters. So, I would request the Law Minister that with his experience in the Assembly, in the Parliament and the position he held in the Government he will do this. Thank you very much, Sir.

(Ends)

**श्री राजनीति प्रसाद (बिहार)** : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आपको धन्यवाद देता हूँ कि आपने मुझे मौका दिया। महोदय, यह जो election process है, यह बरसों से चला आ रहा है लेकिन इसमें कोई बहुत ज्यादा सुधार हम लोगों ने नहीं किया। मैं एक बात कहना चाहता हूँ कि यह जो amendment आप लाए हैं और जो 25 हजार रुपए आपने amendment में किए हैं, ऐसा लगता है जैसे आप यह मानकर चलते हैं कि कोई भी गरीब आदमी चुनाव नहीं लड़ सकता है क्योंकि आपने पार्टी सिस्टम नहीं बनाया है। 25 हजार रुपए पार्लियामेंट के लिए आप जमा करने के लिए बोल रहे हैं, पार्टी सिस्टम नहीं है, कोई इन्डिविजुअल भी चुनाव लड़ सकता है, वह घर-घर जाकर अपने चुनाव का प्रचार कर सकता है। इस प्रकार का उदाहरण देश में रहा भी है कि गरीब आदमी डुगडुगी बजाकर पार्लियामेंट का इलेक्शन जीत जाता है, तमेड़ा बजाकर पार्लियामेंट का इलेक्शन जीत जाता है। एक फकीर को भी, अगर वह वोटर है, चुनाव लड़ने का हक है। मेरा कहना है कि आपने इसको जो बढ़ाया है, उसके बारे में आप पुनः विचार करिए। हमारे जैसे आदमी को ही ले लीजिए। जब राज्य सभा का नॉमिनेशन हो रहा था, उस समय हमारे पास उसकी जमानत के भी पैसे नहीं थे। उस समय चंदा इकट्ठा करके हमने वह पैसा इकट्ठा किया और राज्य सभा का चुनाव लड़ा, पार्टी ने हमें सपोर्ट किया। इस प्रकार हमारे जैसे आदमी के पास जब पांच हजार रुपए भी नहीं थे, उसे बढ़ाकर आपने 25 हजार कर दिया है तो कैसे चलेगा? मेरा सुझाव है कि इसके बारे में आप जरूर विचार करिए। आप अमाउंट बढ़ा रहे हैं जबकि आप जानते हैं कि यह गरीबों का देश है। यहां पर बीस रुपया रोज़ कमाने वाले लोग हैं। क्या आप यह कहना

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

चाहते हैं कि जो बीस रुपया रोज़ कमाने वाले लोग हैं, उनको election नहीं लड़ना है? हमारे यहां 80 प्रतिशत लोग बीस रुपया रोज कमाने वाले लोग हैं। क्या आप यह कहना चाहते हैं कि 80 प्रतिशत लोग इस देश में चुनाव नहीं लड़ेंगे, गरीब लोग चुनाव नहीं लड़ेंगे? दूसरा, मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि ईवीएम मशीन के बारे में बहुत सारी controversies हुई हैं। controversies यह हुई कि ईवीएम मशीन की वजह से जो वोटिंग होती है, उसमें कुछ गड़बड़ी हो जाती है। पता नहीं, इसके बारे में क्या investigation हुई है, लेकिन मैं इतना जरूर कहना चाहता हूं कि जो भी बड़े देश हैं, जहां रूल ऑफ लॉ है, जहां डेमोक्रेसी है, वहां पर भी ईवीएम मशीन पर वोट देने की बात को खत्म कर दिया गया है। इस प्रकार अगर उन लोगों ने इसे खत्म कर दिया है तो हम क्यों इसको लागू करना चाहते हैं? सर, इस ईवीएम मशीन के बारे में भी विचार करना पड़ेगा। जो हमारा पुराना सिस्टम था, जिसमें ठप्पा मारकर हम लोग वोट देते थे, उसके बारे में जरूर विचार करिए। हमारे एक मित्र ने कहा कि अमेरिका में electronic तरीके से भी आप वोट देने के लिए तैयार हो सकते हैं। हमारे यहां सिस्टम यह है कि बहुत गरीब लोग, अगर किसी ऐसे बूथ पर गए, जहां पर वर्चस्व बड़े लोगों का है - गरीब लोग हैंड टू माउथ वाले होते हैं, बीस रुपया रोज कमाने वाले लोग होते हैं - वे लोग उस बूथ पर जाकर वोट नहीं डाल सकते, उनको restrain किया जाता है। इस प्रकार यह कानून बनना चाहिए कि कहां पर कैसे गरीब लोग वोट देने जाएंगे। सर, आपने एक सिस्टम बनाया है कि सबके पास वोटर आइडेंटिटी कार्ड होगा। सर, हमारे यहां ऐसे लोग भी वोटर हैं जिनके मकान के ऊपर छत नहीं है, जो खानाबदोश की जिंदगी जीते हैं। उनका भी वोटर लिस्ट में नाम है। वे अपने सामान को कहां रखेंगे? वोटर लिस्ट कहां रखेंगे? वोटर आइडेंटिटी कार्ड कहां रखेंगे? सर, बहुत सारे ऐसे लोग हैं जिनका आइडेंटिटी कार्ड नहीं बन सका है, लेकिन वोटर लिस्ट में उनका नाम है।

(3जी-एमसीएम पर क्रमागत)

MCM-KGG/3g/4-25

**श्री राजनीति प्रसाद (क्रमागत) :** सर, मैं एक और बात कहना चाहता हूं कि आजकल नया तरीका मैंने देखा है। नया तरीका यह है कि इलेक्शन की वोटर लिस्ट में भी फोटो होता



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

है। अगर वोटर लिस्ट में आपने फोटो छापा है तो फिर इस वोटर आइडेंटिटी कार्ड का क्या मतलब हुआ। जब आप वोट के लिए जाएंगे तो वहां आपका फोटो मिलाएंगे कि लिस्ट में आपका फोटो है या नहीं है। अगर है तो आप वोट डाल सकते हैं। लेकिन अगर आइडेंटिटी कार्ड नहीं है तो इसके कारण.....(व्यवधान) सर, बोलने दीजिए, हमको तो कभी-कभी मौका मिलता है।

अगर उसके पास आइडेंटिटी कार्ड नहीं है या वह ले जाना भूल गया तो गरीब लोग वोट नहीं दे सकते हैं। उनको तो आइडेंटिटी कार्ड पहले ही दिखलाना पड़ेगा और वह भी प्रिसाइडिंग ऑफिसर को नहीं, पुलिस को दिखलाना पड़ेगा, क्योंकि पुलिस वाले उनको डंडा मारकर भगा देते हैं। जो गरीब लोगों की पार्टी होती है उनको आइडेंटिटी कार्ड का अभाव हो जाता है, आइडेंटिटी कार्ड नहीं होता है और उसके पास अन्य कोई सबूत भी नहीं होता जिसको लेकर वह वहां जा सके। इसलिए, सर, मैं यह बात कहना चाहूंगा कि इस पर जरूर विचार होना चाहिए।

सर, दूसरी बात, आपने कहा है कि अगर इलेक्शन में कोई गड़बड़ी है तो उसको हम दूर करेंगे। सर, यह बात हम कहना चाहते हैं कि अगर कोई इलेक्शन पिटीशन देता है तो आपके यहां कानून है कि तीन महीने के अंदर इसको दाखिल करें। हमारे एक मित्र ने कहा भी है। लेकिन यह लिमिटेशन हम पर तो लगता है, यानी जो लोग इलेक्शन पिटीशन दाखिल करते हैं उन पर तो यह लगता है, लेकिन हाई कोर्ट पर कोई रोक नहीं है। वह पांच साल नहीं, छः साल के बाद तथा तब तक दो बार इलेक्शन हो जाएगा, उसके बाद डिस्मिशन देंगे। तो, सर, उसका क्या मतलब होता है? इसके बारे में जरूर विचार करना चाहिए। अगर आप इस पर विचार करेंगे तो, सर, हम यह समझते हैं कि हमारा इलेक्शन रिफॉर्म का जो अमेंडमेंट है, वह अच्छा होगा।

सर, मैं एक बात और कहना चाहूंगा। हमारे श्री व्यास साहब ने कहा कि एग्जिट पोल को हम कैसे रोक सकते हैं। उन्होंने यह भी कहा कि इसका सर्वे होना चाहिए कि कितने लोगों को प्रभावित किया। सर, कितने लोगों को ही नहीं, बल्कि बहुत लोगों को प्रभावित करता है। जिनको कोई एप्रोच नहीं करते हैं, जिनके पास कोई कैंडिडेट नहीं जाता

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

है, जिनको कोई लेना-देना नहीं होता है, वे एग्जिट पोल से प्रभावित होते हैं, बिल्कुल होते हैं। मेरा अपना अनुमान है कि इसका साइक्लोजिकल प्रभाव पड़ता है। अगर साइक्लोजिकल प्रभाव पड़ता है तो वोट में भी कंवर्ट होता है। इसलिए, सर, मैं यह चाहूंगा कि.....(व्यवधान)

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० पी०जे० कुरियन) :** बस, खत्म करें।

**श्री राजनीति प्रसाद :** सर, मैं एक मिनट और लूंगा। आप 60 गिनिए और फिर मैं खत्म करता हूँ।

**उपसभाध्यक्ष :** बस, एक ही मिनट :

**श्री राजनीति प्रसाद :** सर, मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि एग्जिट पोल वाले सुप्रीम कोर्ट गए थे, क्योंकि इलेक्शन कमीशन ने तो इसको बंद कर दिया था। इलेक्शन कमीशन ने कहा था कि नहीं, आप एग्जिट पोल नहीं दिखा सकते। लेकिन सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने कहा कि आप इसको दिखा सकते हैं, कोई बात नहीं है। लेकिन, सर, हम इस बारे में कानून तो बना सकते हैं। जैसे इलेक्शन कमीशन ने आइडेंटिटी कार्ड का कानून बना दिया, हम लोगों ने कानून बना दिया कि इलेक्शन में पच्चीस हजार रुपए लगेगा। लेकिन आप कानून तो बना सकते हैं कि एग्जिट पोल नहीं दिखा सकते हैं। तो यह कानून हम लोग बना सकते हैं। अगर आप कानून बनाएंगे तो कोई *ultra vires* थोड़े होने वाला है, हम लोग तो कानून बनाएंगे कि आप नहीं दिखा सकते हैं। इसलिए, सर, यह एक पूरा रंग मंच है। इलेक्शन में गरीबों को नुकसान नहीं होना चाहिए, इस बात का हमेशा ख्याल रखिए। हम इसका समर्थन जरूर करते हैं। लेकिन जो आपने पच्चीस हजार रुपए वाली बात कही है, उसके बारे में जरूर विचार करिए, क्योंकि यह ज्यादा है और इससे गरीब लोगों को इलेक्शन में पार्टिसिपेशन रेस्ट्रेन होगा। इन्ही शब्दों के साथ मैं आपका धन्यवाद करता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

**THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY):**

Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I am grateful for and highly excited over the debate on an important measure containing five elements of this reforms

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

package. We are all proud that we have the largest Parliamentary democracy with the largest electorate with 80 crores on the electoral rolls.

(Contd. by sss/3h)

SSS/4.30/3H

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY (CONTD.):** We are the largest Parliamentary democracy. We have the largest electorate with 80 crores on the roll. But, at the same time, the matter of concern is that I think, around 20-25 crore voters do not come to the ballot box and vote. It is a matter of worry. The debate has been quite a great learning experience for me. My confidence level to bring about more radical and comprehensive reform measure has now increased and I can feel that you are responsive. I can count upon you for the kind of change which needs to be brought about in our electoral system. Ultimately, when our friend, hon. Member, Shri Prasad ended, yes, we have to target the last man in the queue, whatever reforms we bring in, we need to address him. Otherwise, these reforms are of no significance, whatsoever. I never said even in the beginning when I introduced for consideration of this Bill that is an exhaustive one. I am not that happy. It is one of the measures or five of the measures but we need to do a lot of things because mere medicine is not enough. Mere physician is not adequate. We should have physicians, we should have surgeons to do both and it is not the peripheral reforms that the country is satisfied. Yes, a reference has been made that we have passed 57 years in our great march, great experiment on the electoral process. We have to learn a

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

lesson, revisit, get into the inside of it and find a way forward. We cannot stop at that. Reform is always a concept of creative destruction. We need to address many of those problems and I must thank the Parliamentary Standing Committee who has expedited this report and, by and large, we have accepted their recommendations. These are five out of 22 references made by the Election Commission of India. In 2004, we needed to expedite this. I am looking forward for the cooperation of the Parliamentary Standing Committee to come out with the recommendations in respect of other 17 items. Nothing is pending with us. Even if you send it within a week, I can reassure you, that we will take up these matters early so that you can even present the amendments for approval of this House, even during this Session and I assure you that we can do that. But, we should have consensus among all political parties. Ultimately, we need to obtain consensus. After all, we have to march together. No one political party marches alone in this great endeavour to bring about reforms.

(Contd by NBR/3J)

-SSS/NBR-ASC/3j/4.35.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY (CONTD.):** I need not mention all the twenty-two proposals here even though I have the facts. I don't want to take the time of the House. Sir, out of these twenty-two, we have taken up five proposals. We have considered these. We have interacted on all these proposals. We have one proposal in respect of voting of citizens of India but have gone abroad on employment or education or other purposes. There is a Bill. This has been examined. It is not a part of

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

the twenty-two proposals; you can say it as twenty-third. They sent it back advising to bring back a comprehensive Bill with all details. So, we are also shortly bringing that Bill. I will be finalising that Bill also after discussion with many of our colleagues. Sir, I am sure, it is very dear to you. So, I specially made a mention about that. It is ready. I need to discuss this with some of our friends and colleagues. If you are free, I may finalise this Bill within a week and bring the Bill in this Session itself.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** That is good.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, an issue has been raised whether article 19(1)(a) contravenes. In fact, it was debated. Thereafter, even the Supreme Court has upheld the guidelines issued by the Election Commission of India. So, I must tell you, by and large, we have consensus on all the points that have been incorporated in this Bill.

Sir, I will try to go one-by-one with regard to certain issues raised by the hon. Members. Our leader, Shri S.S. Ahluwalia, raised a point that a person in jail can contest but unable to vote. I think, if a person, according to my opinion, is in jail but not convicted, he is entitled to vote. I don't know how he can be denied voting. In fact, the Department-related Committee has said that the proposal to disqualify any person accused of an offence punishable by punishment for five years or more can contest election even if trial is pending. The Standing Committee gave a Report that the proposal of the Election Commission under reference is a major departure from law for the time being in force which provides that if a person is convicted for an offence and if a court

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

gives a judgment convicting him then such a person shall be disqualified from contesting election. That is why the *status quo* has been maintained. That is a matter which was referred to by our veteran journalist and hon. Member and he has also mentioned about criminals contesting election. It is a matter which we need to examine in depth. Maybe, we can have a discussion on this question.

The Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Home Affairs, in its Report, with respect to some of the provisions on the issues said that many Members have objected to auditing of accounts of donations by auditors proposed by the Election Commission or CAG or its appointed auditors. Again, there was no political consensus and even the Standing Committee did not consider it proper for an amendment to this.

Sir, Mr. Shantaram Naik raised an issue of several guidelines/Code of Conduct issued by the Election Commission under article 324 of the Constitution.

(CONTD. BY USY "3k")

-NBR-USY/3k/4.40

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY (CONTD.):** He said that these needed to be limited. This is a debatable issue. I think, an exercise can be made to revisit some of these guidelines and code of conduct; and we can have a discussion at an appropriate time on the larger issues like this because, by and large, we don't want the Government to interfere with the functioning of the Election Commission of India. But, need be, we can definitely discuss about this. The accounts issue, the donation

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

issue, are the issues that have been pending and have not been considered appropriately.

Hon. Member, Shri M.V. Mysura Reddy, has proposed an amendment to prevent non-serious candidates. In fact, section 154 of the RP Act provides for forfeiture of candidates' deposit which is proposed to be Rs. 25,000 for the Lok Sabha elections and Rs 10,000 for the Assembly elections. The limit has been examined to weed out non-serious candidates. That is the remedy that has been found. If there is any viable, suitable remedy, that needs to be discussed in greater details, instead of hurrying up with this kind of amendment. Therefore, I would like to request the hon. Member to reconsider this issue because we are open for a discussion and, then, take a subsequent political consensus on that. And, perhaps, if need be, we can think of bringing forward an amendment. But I don't think it will lie as on today. There are a lot of issues involved in that. So, the hon. Member may kindly withdraw this amendment. We can think of bringing it back at an appropriate time.

Many more questions have been raised in today's discussion. Particularly, the hon. Member, Shri Veerpal Singh, has raised many issues about the money power. He did say that the election is the festival of democracy. I think, our senior friend, Shri Arun Jaitley, also did say something like this at some of the forum. That is being curtailed sometime. It is dealt with by the Election Commission. Reasonable advertisement, reasonable approach will have to be made. I think, sometimes resorting to the television media, the print media, which

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

has not been prevented, in a surrogatory manner is not the right means for the candidates. This is an issue in which needs to be discussed in detail.

There are issues pertaining to appointment of observers. The observers do not act in accordance with the duties that are entrusted to them. I think we need to have a proper discussion on many of these issues whether it is the issue of code of conduct or the issue pertaining to guidelines or the issues that are dealt with by the Election Commission of India.

Now, I come to the question of electronic voting machines. Dr. Malaisamy had raised this issue. The hon. Member, Shri Shreegopal Vyas, wrote a detailed letter consisting of 3-4 pages, or even more, how it functions, how it should be examined, how it should be scrutinised. We examined it critically and, ultimately, found that nothing is wrong with the technology. The technology is perfect. You know India has the best brain in IT.

(Contd. by 3l -- PK)

PK/3l/4.45

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY (CONTD.):** You should not forget that. The Indian IT engineers have captured the IT world. They need not look for the other countries to testify the technology which has been adopted by us. So, it is not only technology savvy, but also people savvy. We had a fear that how the commonman would receive this kind of a new technology. The manner in which they have responded to this technology will go to the Indian wisdom. I think that is not a debatable



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

question as on today. Shri D. Raja raised a question that it does not fulfil the real need of the time and that you should have come out with a more comprehensive amendment to that. Yes, I started by saying that these 57 years of election process, it has proved to be the best in the world, but that does not mean that it has no challenges. We may have millions of challenges. There are millions of opportunities provided in this. I am telling you that I am for comprehensive reform measures. I would like to have a national consultation. I would also like to have a brain-storming debate with all the political parties, with all the stakeholders, to bring about the changes, to bring about the solutions to the problems which are being confronted in the system. At the same time, we cannot say that the present system is bad. It may be opened for mid-course corrections, but, at the same time, we need not be pessimistic about it. We will have a debate and, shortly, we will bring about -- if not possible in this Session, then, possibly, in the next Session - a comprehensive amendment in the electoral system which will, definitely, provide solutions to many problems which are confronted by us. I have heard the veteran journalist, who is a new Member of Rajya Sabha, who has delivered his maiden speech, raising it with a clarity and with a kind of message that has to be taken by the entire country. I compliment you; I commend you. Now, I come to the role of big money. Yes, there is a role of big money, which we have to disappear from the election scenario of this country. I need to take many drastic measures, but political consensus is a must for that. It is quite mandatory. Let us discuss about it. I am open for the debate. I

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

am open for the solution emerging out of that kind of a debate. Yes, we know that, earlier, these big people used to support candidates. Now, they themselves are becoming candidates. Earlier, they used to support the Ministry; now, they are entering into the Ministry. They may capture one State, they may capture another State. Ultimately, the entire democracy of this country will be put into peril. This has got to be halted. I am not going to name any State or any political party for that matter, but this is a cancer in the body politics of this country. That has to be acknowledged by all of us and we need to deal with it. Those elements may devour the democracy of this country. We need to put a halt to it. I think the sense of this House is, as I can feel, that we are all united to combat these kinds of forces. I am very happy and confident that we will be able to find a way out of this. Then the hon. Member, Shri Tiruchi Siva raised the question of the non-serious candidates. How do we deal with that? You have not come out with a solution. You have pointed out the problem. Let us all apply our mind on this. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** I did not support the amendment moved by Mr. Reddy, ..(Interruptions).. but I have asked the Ministry to find out the means.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** The hon. Member, Shri Raashid Alvi, spoke about the influence of religion.

(Contd. by 3m/PB)

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY (CONTD.):** He talked about the criminality which has really distorted the election process. In fact, we brought a number of Bills earlier also with regard to the criminal candidates. I have already dealt with the issue of filing of chargesheets, etc. No doubt the strict laws are necessary and we need to apply that.

Shreegopal Vyasji spoke about exit polls. After all, this is an issue which has been there the world-over. We may bring forward a Bill today but I must tell you that it is a practice the world-over. In many, many countries, these kinds of exit polls have been really banned. Incidentally, there is this talk about Shri Rama came. I have written a big epic poem on Shri Ramayana Mahaveshanam. But whether it is my Ramayana or any other Ramayana, I have heard, these Ramayanas are secular in nature. Incidentally, I won a national Award also for that.

**AN HON. MEMBER:** Sir, give a free copy to everybody.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** This is regarding not only my Ramayana. I have read the Valmiki Ramayana; I have read the Tulsidas Ramayana; I read the Kamba Ramayana. You read any Ramayana, there is no religion and politics mixed; there is no governance and religion mix. So, I think that is only incidentally; but I am just telling you that.

Then, Mr. Vijayaraghavan spoke about many things.  
...(Interruptions)... I said, 'incidentally'; I said it in lighter mood.  
...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI SHREEGOPAL VYAS:** I am not coming to that. I was only trying to differentiate between somebody carrying out the exit poll survey to do a research. That is one part. The other is to prohibit its presentation

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

and representation. I am not against the representation and the propagation of it. I am saying, how do you go about somebody's fundamental right to ask some people what have you done. This is one part. The other is, propagation. You are against propagation; I am also against propagation. But I am saying whether you would like to question somebody's fundamental right to ask some people to get some survey and wake up. That was my point.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** I think, the hon. Member can understand that we are banning only the exit poll and no research whatsoever by the scholars or any student of politics is being interfered with. I don't think we can stretch this amendment too far. So, I don't think you can stretch it too far and I don't think any research of that kind is prevented under this. I must tell you, the matter related to bar on persons from contesting elections facing charges is a subject which is dealt by the 18<sup>th</sup> Report of the Departmental Committee. They have disagreed on this policy and, maybe, we can revisit it, if the hon. Members want it. But again, it requires the political consensus but we can deal with that. In fact, regarding disclosure of the election petitions, there is already a restriction of time that the High Courts or the authorities are mandated to close the case within six months. But this is not happening. I do agree with it. Many a time, till the time is over, the decisions are not given. It is really a worrisome matter. We need to discuss it with the Judiciary. If necessary, I am prepared to bring about certain mandated law to fix the time, limit the time so that there is expeditious disposal of the cases.

(Contd. by 3n/SKC)

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

3n/4.55/skc

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY (Contd.):** You may kindly remember, in the 1990s, we had brought an amendment to the Representation of People Act for deploying people other than Government officers for election purpose, say, from banks, public undertakings and others. But, at that time, we had not included them in the disciplinary procedure. Thus, this is only a consequential amendment with regard to punishment or disciplinary action against election officers. It is only a consequential amendment which should have been brought at that time. In fact, we could not have punished them but for this amendment. So, this is only a consequential amendment.

My sister, and hon. Member, Dr. Najma Heptualla, had reiterated the need for a comprehensive Bill. She has also talked about criminals becoming politicians and also about nexus voting. May be it was the rarest of the rare instances that might have happened in Arunachal Pradesh. She has also talked about the Women's Reservation Bill. The matter is, again, before the Standing Committee.

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA:** You may use your influence, Sir. I don't say, use violence, but you may use your influence and your charm.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** The Chairman of that Committee is Shrimati Jayanthi Natarajan; I cannot use violence against her!

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA:** You could always use your charm.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** That may not work there!

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** If the Standing Committee finalises it and gives it to us and a political consensus is obtained, we would not hesitate to introduce the Bill even by the end of this Session.

**SHRI TIRUCHI SHIVA:** I am in that Committee, Sir. We are trying.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Kindly do that. We have been talking about it since 1996. I think, we need to bring it and we would like to see it being passed in this Session itself. I think, if the Standing Committee could finalise the report and give it to us, we shall definitely ensure that we could bring it over.

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA:** Sir, may I intervene for a minute? Many legislations are brought in this House, but Government never comes with a rider saying that there should be a consensus, not even on Budget. Why should the Women's Reservation Bill have consensus? Why should women coming to the Parliament have consensus from those who do not like women? At least, bring it to the House and then let us see who stands where. The major political parties, the Congress Party, the BJP and the Communist Party, are all very clearly in support of women's reservation. I would be happy if you bring the Women's Reservation Bill to the Rajya Sabha. There is no problem. But, why are you not doing that?

**SHRI D. RAJA:** If you talk of consensus, the consensus is not going to emerge.

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA:** Sir, as my Leader, Shri Arun Jaitley says, if you bring it after Lunch, half the Members who are opposing it may not be there and we shall pass it!

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Your suggestion is noted for action. Hon. Member, Shri Silvius Condpan, had said that some amendments that have been brought about will have to be there in Panchayat and local bodies too. I think that is a good suggestion and I shall definitely discuss it with our colleague, Dr. Joshi. Hon. Member, Sardar Tarlochan Singh, incidentally, started with the Sikh Marriage Act. I have no idea about that Act; I shall discuss it with you. You had also said that the opinion poll should be banned. That is a matter which we have already gone into. We had in some areas tried to interfere with the functioning of the media; I don't think, we should venture too far; we need to stop somewhere.

**SARDAR TARLOCHAN SINGH:** We may not interfere, but there should be some mechanism in place.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** You had also spoken about the Anti-Defection Act, taking steps to prevent "*aaya Ram-gaya Ram*" phenomenon. That also should not be a subject matter in this amendment; we can bring it on some other occasion. Hon. Member, Mr. Prasad, asked why we need to bring in the old system instead of the EVMs.

(Contd. by hk at 30)

HK/30/5.00

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY (CONTD.):** Our hon. Member, Shri Prasad, also talked why not to bring about old system instead of EVMs. I have already replied to it. With regard to Voters ID also, your suggestions are noted down. With this, I thank the entire House for the support which is

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

extended to this Bill. I have already said that this is only a peripheral thing. We will definitely come out with a substantial and comprehensive Bill for reforms in the electoral system. With this, I seek, through the Chairman, the support from all the hon. Members to pass this Bill. Thank you.

(Ends)



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** The question is:

"That the Bill further to amend the Representation of the People Act, 1950 and the Representation of the People Act, 1951, be taken into consideration."

***The motion was adopted.***

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** We shall now take up clause-by-clause consideration of the Bill. In clause 2, there is one amendment (No.4) by the hon. Minister.

**Clause 2 - Amendment of Section 24.**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

6. That at page 1, lines 11 and 12, ***for*** the words "district magistrate or additional district magistrate" the words "district magistrate or additional district magistrate or executive magistrate or district collection or an officer of equivalent rank" be ***substituted***.

***The question was put and the motion was adopted.***

***Clause 2, as amended, was added to the Bill.***

***Clauses 3 and 4 were added to the Bill.***

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** We shall now take up clause 5. In clause 5, there is one amendment (No.5) by Shri M.V. Mysura Reddy.

**SHRI M.V. MYSURA REDDY:** Sir, if the hon. Minister gives me an assurance, I will withdraw my amendment. But I want to bring one point to the notice of hon. Minister. During the last elections in Mehabubnagar Zedcherla Constituency, Andhra Pradesh, because people wanted to protest against an SEZ in Pollepalli, few hundred

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

people filed nominations. Similarly in Nallagonda Parliament segment also, few hundred people filed nominations. That became the headache to the Election Commission also. Some serious candidates managed to get B-forms so that their own men can file nominations for election agents, counting agents, security people. It became a big headache. I welcome the intention of the Minister that he is enhancing the deposit. In view of the assurance given by the hon. Minister, I am withdrawing my amendment.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** The amendment is withdrawn.

***Clause 5 was added to the Bill.***

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** We shall now take up clause 6. In clause 6, there is one amendment (No.6) by Shri A. Vijayaraghavan and Shri P.R. Rajan.

**SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN:** Sir, I move:

7. "That at page 2, lines 28 to 31, be **deleted**.

Sir, I have to have an assurance from the Minister. The Standing Committee in its recommendation No.4.8 has mentioned about this part. Sir, now we are delegating some extra powers to the Election Commission. Always we must be very careful about delegating the power. We are expecting a fair dealing from the Election Commission. So, what is aspect here? It is regarding the democratic right of the people who have been engaged in the election duty. Earlier only

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

Government officials were engaged, but now we are expanding the scope. We are expanding the scope for taking disciplinary action.

(Contd. by 3p/KSK)

KSK/5.05/3p & 3q/

**SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN (CONTD):** It may be utilised for curtailing their democratic rights. That is the apprehension raised by the Standing Committee also. And, accordingly, the Standing Committee requested to redraft that particular provision. Unfortunately, that has not been done. Let the Minister give an assurance that the scope would not be expanded to that extent which would curtail the democratic right of this section.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, hon. Member will understand that those officers are deployed by the Election Commission of India. They will be working under the Election Commission. If you do not empower the Election Commission or the officers to discipline the officers under them, who else can do it? This is the domain of the Election Commission. For anything which comes in the domain of the Election Commission of India, I do not think the Ministry can interfere and it is the duty of the Election Commission to discipline. That is the only thing. That is the only power that is delegated..(Interruptions).

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Please, no argument.

**SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN:** This is something that the Standing Committee has recommended, and the Government has not accepted this recommendation.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** If you go through the recommendations of the Standing Committee, it is not part of the recommendation. I have got full list of recommendations. We are not deviating from the recommendations. It may be a part of the discussion or deliberation, but it is not part of actual recommendation. I may submit that we will discuss about it. After all, it is not exhaustive amendment that we are bringing in. When we will bring comprehensive amendment, we will consider this aspect. In view of this, I request hon. Member to withdraw the amendment.

**SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN:** After considering the request of the hon. Minister, I am withdrawing my amendment. I do not move my amendment.

*Clause 6 was added to the Bill.*

*Clause 7 was added to the Bill.*

**CLAUSE 1 - SHORT TITLE AND COMMENCEMENT**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

2. That at page 1, line 4, the word "Second" be deleted.
3. That at page 1, line 5, for the figure "2008", the figure "2009" be substituted.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

*Clause 1, as amended, was added to the Bill.*

**ENACTING FORMULA**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

1. That at page 1, line 1, for the word "Fifty-ninth", the word "Sixtieth" be substituted.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009**  
***The Enacting Formula, as amended, was added to the Bill.***  
***The Title was added to the Bill.***

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

That the Bill, as amended, be passed.

***The question was put and the motion was adopted.***

(Ends)

**RE. ANNOUNCEMENT BY THE CHAIR**

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Hon. Members, I have to make two announcements. First, I wish to inform that there would be no sitting of the House on Friday, the 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2009, on account of Id-ul-Zuha.

I also wish to inform the House that the Private Members' Business scheduled for Friday, the 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2009, shall now be taken up on Thursday, the 26<sup>th</sup> November, 2009. The House is adjourned to meet at 11.00 a.m. on 26<sup>th</sup> November, 2009.

-----

**The House then adjourned at ten minutes past  
five of the clock till eleven of the clock on  
Thursday, the 26<sup>th</sup> November, 2009.**

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 25.11.2009