

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

GSP-ASC-1A-11.00

The House met at eleven of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

- - -

**RE. CONDOLENCES TO FAMILIES OF VICTIMS PERISHED IN  
EARTHQUAKE AT CHRISTCHURCH, NEW ZEALAND**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon'ble Members, as you are aware, a massive earthquake measuring 6.3 on the Richter scale devastated Christchurch in New Zealand on the 22<sup>nd</sup> of February, 2011, causing extensive loss of lives and widespread damage to property and infrastructure. More than 160 people are reported to have been killed and several hundreds are still missing.

I am sure, the whole House will join me in sending our heartfelt sympathy and deepest condolences to the people of Christchurch in New Zealand, who have lost their near and dear ones in the earthquake, and, pray for the early recovery of those who were injured.

I request Members to rise in their places and observe silence as

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

a mark of respect to the memory of those who lost their lives in this tragedy.

**(Hon. Members then stood in silence for one minute)**

**RE. SHIFTING OF QUESTION HOUR W.E.F. 07.03.2011**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, it has been observed that Members tend to raise matters of concern during and at the expense of the Question Hour. I have, therefore, decided, after consultation and in terms of Rule 38 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Council of States, that with effect from March 7, 2011, the period from 2.00 p.m. to 3.00 p.m. of every sitting, and, from 2.30 p.m. to 3.30 p.m. on Fridays shall be available for the asking and answering of questions.

**श्री एम.वेंकैया नायडु :** सर, थोड़ा समझ में नहीं आया। We have not been able to understand. (Interruptions) It means that the Question Hour will be shifted.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question Hour will be from 2.00 p.m. to 3.00 p.m. of every sitting, and, on Fridays, from 2.30 p.m. to 3.30 p.m. (Interruptions)

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** What will be taken up in the morning?

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** In the morning, we will start with 'Matters Raised with Permission of the Chair'. Thank you. (Interruptions) Now, Question No. 121.









## Q. No. 121

**SHRI N.K. SINGH:** Sir, let me ask my first supplementary to the hon. Minister. Sir, the CAT examination went online in 2009. Has the Government conducted any study on whether the online format has brought in uniformity of standards, greater transparency and diversified its intake, particularly, from the rural areas?

**SHRIMATI D. PURANDESWARI:** Sir, according to the convener of CAT, 2009, the traditional format of conducting CAT in the 'Pencil and Paper' format was becoming untenable in terms of the increasing numbers, and, therefore, CAT examination went online. We did have teething problems when CAT did go online initially. But the last CAT examination went on very smoothly, and, there were no issues at that point of time. Sir, these exams are conducted online, and, on the issue whether the rural children have been able to take the CAT exam successfully, these exams are not internet-based but rather centers are identified, and, children are notified about the centers where they will need to go and take the examination.

Since, it is not internet-based and children come to the centers and take the exam, in the last CAT exam which was conducted, there

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**Q. No. 121 (Contd.)**

were no issues raised, and, so far, no children have come forward and complained to us on their inability to take the examination.

**SHRI N.K. SINGH:** Sir, my second supplementary is that in March, 2010, there were announcements that students who wish to take the examination would need to have 80 per cent pre-qualifying marks in Class-XII. A committee under Prof. Damodar Acharya was also appointed.

(Contd. by SK-1B)

SK/1B/11.05

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD.):** Subsequently, in December 2010, there was another announcement made that for the IITs also, the Government propose to go for online examination. Another Committee under T. Ramaswamy had been appointed. Will the Government come out with a coherent policy to end the uncertainty and to clearly bring out the kind of changes they propose to bring in the examination system for effecting intake for IITs?

**SHRIMATI D. PURANDESWARI:** Sir, the students taking examination into engineering, pharmacy, architectural and so on need to have (a)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**Q. No. 121 (Contd.)**

good command over the subject, science subject, for that matter and (b) reasonable levels of analytical skills, intelligence, general awareness and also communication skills. Whereas the Common Entrance Examination usually tests the child only on the command over the subject and does not really test the child on analytical skills is the reason it was believed that we need to have a Common Entrance Examination which would address both the analytical skills as well as the command of the child over the subject. Damodar Acharya Committee was constituted to look and recommend or suggest ways in which we could come up with a Common Entrance Examination for the IITs. The Interim Report has been submitted. But since there has been no consensus on the Interim Report, it has now been submitted to the Ramaswamy Committee which will be looking into the recommendations and suggesting ways of implementation.

**SHRI N.K. SINGH:** When are you expecting the Ramaswamy Committee Report?

**SHRIMATI D. PURANDESWARI:** At the earliest possible.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 121 (Contd.)

**SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL:** Sir, there is a heavy demand for IITs and higher education courses but the students from the rural areas are not getting admission in those courses. While revamping the entrance examination system, will the Government consider starting new IITs? There has been a commitment by the hon. Prime Minister to start a new IIT in Kerala. Will it also be considered?

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Does it relate to the question? (Interruptions)

**SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL:** Yes, Sir, it is related to the question.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** How?

**SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL:** Sir, heavy demand is there but the rural students are not getting admission. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** But, does this relate to this question?

**SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL:** It is related to this question, Sir. (Interruptions) Genuine demands are related to the students from rural areas. (Interruptions)

**SHRIMATI D. PURANDESWARI:** It does not arise out of this question, Sir. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Thank you.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 121 (Contd.)

**DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT:** Thank you, Sir. Sir, education brings equality. That is what Dr. Ambedkar had said. With this type of examinations, particularly in the IITs, which is the high-end engineering course, my observation is that more and more students from urban areas, more so, who have taken education in English medium, tend to get admitted in the IITs. The answer which has been given talks about analytical and communication skill. When you say communication skills, which language do you believe in? Do you believe that only English language communication skills are skills, otherwise there are no skills?

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question please.

**SHRI BHARATKUMAR RAUT:** I would ask the hon. Minister, is there any method by which children from the rural areas, those who take education in the regional languages can also pass these examinations?

**SHRIMATI D. PURANDESWARI:** Sir, it is here that we need the support of the State Governments. We are looking at whether we can introduce a core curriculum in subjects like Science and Mathematics

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

**Q. No. 121 (Contd.)**

which would enable the children right across the country, be it in urban areas or rural areas, to have equal chances in the common entrance examinations. Definitely, Sir, unless the State Governments come on board and strengthen the elementary education, can not a child in the rural area have the same opportunity as a child in the urban areas. I am sure, all Members in the House will agree with me that today English is the global language. (Interruptions)

**डा. राम प्रकाश :** सर, सवाल है कि क्या ... (व्यवधान) ...

**श्री सभापति :** डा. राम प्रकाश, आप supplementary पूछिए, इस तरह से interfere नहीं कीजिए।

**SHRIMATI D. PURANDESWARI:** Sir, we respect all regional languages and many State Governments in their own elementary schools have actually introduced elementary education in the regional languages where English is a subject and when the child transits into class six, English becomes the medium of instruction. These have been the steps that have been taken by various State Governments. This, we hope, would definitely give the child advantage of the English in taking the entrance examinations as well. (Followed by ysr — 1c)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 121 (Contd.)

YSR-SCH/11.10/1C

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Dr. Ram Prakash, please. Please observe the Rule. Ask for supplementaries, you will get it. Thank you.

**डा. राम प्रकाश:** धन्यवाद सभापति जी, मेरा प्रश्न सीधा है कि कम्युनिकेशन स्किल से अर्थ यहां केवल मात्र इंग्लिश लिया जा रहा है, जबकि सभी प्रान्तों ने अपनी प्रादेशिक भाषाओं में बच्चों को पढ़ाना प्रारम्भ कर दिया है। अग्रेजी माध्यम को अनिवार्य करना देहात के बच्चों के साथ पूरी तरह से अन्याय है। क्या मंत्री महोदया यह आश्वासन देंगी कि उन्हें प्रान्तीय भाषाओं के अन्दर पढ़ने और इम्तिहान देने की अनुमति होगी?

**SHRIMATI D. PURANDESWARI:** Sir, we have never imposed it. Elementary education is with the State Government. And as I have mentioned earlier, some of the State Governments have introduced English as a subject in the elementary classes and transition to English as a medium of instruction takes place when it comes to upper elementary classes. These have been conscientious decisions taken by some State Governments. No language has been imposed from the Central Government on the State Schools. Whatever reforms we

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

**Q. No. 121 (Contd.)**

can bring in, they are restricted only to those schools affiliated to the CBSE Board. Out of twelve lakh schools that we have in our country..(Interruptions)..

**डा. राम प्रकाश:** सर, प्रश्न का सीधा जवाब नहीं आ रहा है ...(व्यवधान)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** No. (Interruptions) Please. (Interruptions) नहीं, आप इस तरह से इंटरफेयर नहीं करेंगे ...(व्यवधान) इससे कोई फायदा नहीं है ..(व्यवधान)

**डा. राम प्रकाश:** सर, ये प्रश्न का सीधा जवाब नहीं दे रही हैं ...(व्यवधान)

**श्री नरेश चन्द्र अग्रवाल:** सर, यह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्न है ...(व्यवधान)

**श्री सभापति:** नरेश जी आप बैठ जाइए ...(व्यवधान) प्लीज़ ...(व्यवधान) इससे क्या फायदा होगा ..(व्यवधान) कोई किसी की बात नहीं सुन रहा है ...(व्यवधान)

**SHRIMATI D. PURANDESWARI:** English is a global language. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please hear the answer. आप ज़रा बैठ जाइए ...(व्यवधान) एक मिनट, आप पहले बैठ जाइए ...(व्यवधान) बैठ जाइए न, प्लीज़ ...(व्यवधान)

**SHRIMATI D. PURANDESWARI:** Sir, if I may be allowed to complete my answer..(Interruptions)..

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 121 (Contd.)

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** सर, इस देश की राष्ट्र भाषा हिन्दी है ...(व्यवधान)

**श्री सभापति:** सत्यव्रत जी, प्लीज़ बैठ जाइए ..(व्यवधान)

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** सर, संविधान के माध्यम से आपने हिन्दी को राष्ट्र भाषा का दर्जा दिया है, लेकिन आप अंग्रेज़ी को आगे बढ़ाते चले जा रहे हैं ...(व्यवधान) यह बिल्कुल गलत है ...(व्यवधान)

**श्री सभापति:** देखिए, आप सवाल पूछ रहे हैं, सवाल का जवाब सुन रहे हैं या लैक्चर दे रहे हैं ...(व्यवधान)

**SHRIMATI D. PURANDESWARI:** Sir, English is a ..(Interruptions)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please one minute. आप ज़रा बैठ जाइए ...(व्यवधान) पहले आप मंत्री जी की बात सुन लीजिए ...(व्यवधान) आप ज़रा बैठ जाइए ...(व्यवधान)

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** सर, हिन्दुस्तान की राजभाषा हिन्दी है ...(व्यवधान) 80 फीसदी लोग हिन्दुस्तान में हिन्दी समझते हैं ...(व्यवधान)

**श्री वी. हनुमंत राव:** सर, यह हिन्दी भाषा का अपमान है ...(व्यवधान)

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** हम पूछना चाहते हैं कि हिन्दुस्तानियों के ऊपर अंग्रेज़ी क्यों लादी जा रही है? ...(व्यवधान)

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** It is an official language. (Interruptions)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 121 (Contd.)

**श्री सभापति:** सत्यव्रत जी, ज़रा आप बात तो सुन लीजिए ...(व्यवधान)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please one minute ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI KAPIL SIBAL:** Mr. Chairman Sir, I respect the sentiments of the distinguished..(Interruptions)..

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी:** हिन्दी में जवाब दीजिए ...(व्यवधान)

**श्री कपिल सिब्बल:** आप यहां अंग्रेजी में क्यों बोलते हैं? ...(व्यवधान) आपके लीडर ऑफ अपोज़ीशन अंग्रेजी में बोलते हैं कि नहीं? ...(व्यवधान)

**डा. राम प्रकाश:** सवाल हिन्दी में किया है, तो जवाब भी हिन्दी में ही दिया जाए ..(व्यवधान)

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया:** मंत्री जी ...(व्यवधान)

**श्री सभापति:** अहलुवालिया जी, प्लीज़ ...(व्यवधान)

**श्री कपिल सिब्बल:** आप लीडर ऑफ अपोज़ीशन को बोलिए कि हिन्दी में बोलें ...(व्यवधान)

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** How can they compel him to speak in a particular language? (Interruptions) We are all permitted to speak in English. (Interruptions)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 121 (Contd.)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Let us not start a totally different debate. Please listen to the hon. Minister. (Interruptions)

**SHRI KAPIL SIBAL:** I agree with you. (Interruptions) They must tell the Leader of the Opposition to always speak in Hindi. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Let us not get into this. (Interruptions)

**SHRI D. RAJA:** Sir, this is..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, let it not be a convention. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Siva, Mr. Raja, please. (Interruptions) Please.

(Interruptions) नरेश जी, आप बैठ जाइए ...(व्यवधान) प्लीज़, ज़रा आप भी बैठ जाइए, बात सुन लीजिए ...(व्यवधान) प्लीज़ ..(व्यवधान)

**श्री कपिल सिब्बल:** माननीय सदस्यों की जो बात है, वह कुछ हद तक सही भी है, लेकिन हमारे जेईई इग्ज़ामिनेशन हिन्दी में भी होते हैं ..(व्यवधान) ऐसी कोई बात नहीं है, लेकिन ...(व्यवधान)

**श्री सभापति:** भई, प्लीज़, प्लीज़ ..(व्यवधान)

**श्री कपिल सिब्बल:** जेईई इग्ज़ामिनेशन हिन्दी में भी होते हैं और अंग्रेज़ी में भी होते हैं, दोनों लैंग्वेजिज़ में जेईई इग्ज़ामिनेशन होते हैं ...(व्यवधान) दूसरी बात, जहां तक आईआईटी का सवाल है, I just want to mention ..(Interruptions).. The point is that the IIT system is an autonomous

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 121 (Contd.)

system. The Government does not impose decision making on the IIT system. Now it is for the IIT Council to decide how they are to conduct examinations; in which language they are to conduct examinations; whether the course material is available in those languages or not.. (Interruptions)

(Followed by VKK/1D)

PSV-VKK/1D/11.15

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** सर, ...(व्यवधान)... क्या IIT Council संविधान से ऊपर है? ...(व्यवधान)... क्या IIT Council संविधान से भी ऊपर है? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री कपिल सिब्बल:** संविधान यह नहीं कहता कि...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** सर, ...(व्यवधान)... मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** देखिए, यह बात गलत रास्ते पर जा रही है। ...(व्यवधान)... इसको आगे मत बढ़ाइए ...(व्यवधान)... Please. (Interruptions) One minute please. (Interruptions)

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** सभापति जी, ...(व्यवधान)... क्या यह संविधान से भी ऊपर है? ...(व्यवधान)...

**Q. No. 121 (Contd.)**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** One minute please. (Interruptions) One minute please. (Interruptions) Ahluwaliaji, just one minute please. (Interruptions) आप ज़रा बैठ जाइए। ... (व्यवधान)... आप ज़रा बैठ जाइए। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री विनय कटियार:** सर, ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** नहीं, नहीं, आप बैठ जाइए। ... (व्यवधान)... मेरी बात सुन लीजिए। ... (व्यवधान)... अगर हाउस की यह इच्छा है कि इस पर डिबेट हो, तो इसके लिए नोटिस दीजिए, मगर क्वेश्चन ऑवर को डिस्टर्ब मत कीजिए। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** सर, ... (व्यवधान)... यह संविधान से ऊपर नहीं है। ... (व्यवधान)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** The Question has been answered. (Interruptions) Question No.122. (Interruption)

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** सर, इस सवाल का जवाब आना चाहिए। ... (व्यवधान)...

**MS. MABEL REBELLO:** Sir, My question? (Interruptions)

**श्री सभापति:** यह जो हो रहा है, वह क्या है? ... (व्यवधान)... बहस ही तो हो रही है! ... (व्यवधान)...

Q. No. 121 (Contd.)

**श्री एस०एस० अहलुवालिया:** सर, यह स्वाभिमान की बात है। ... (व्यवधान)...

यह राष्ट्रभाषा के सम्मान की बात है। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** देखिए, प्लीज़। ... (व्यवधान) ... यह सवाल आई०आई०टी० के इम्तिहान का है। आप उस पर बोलिए। ... (व्यवधान) ... राष्ट्रभाषा की बात नहीं हो रही है। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस०एस० अहलुवालिया:** राष्ट्रभाषा स्वाभिमान का विषय है। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री शिवानन्द तिवारी:** हिन्दी, तमिल, बांग्ला, आदि सब भाषाएँ हों ... (व्यवधान)...

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** In regional languages also. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Can we go on to Question No.122? (Interruptions)

Can we go on to Question No.122? (Interruptions)

**श्री एस०एस० अहलुवालिया:** सर, संविधान में जो बातें लिखी गई हैं, उनको ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी:** सर, ... (व्यवधान)...

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** You cannot confine it to one language. (Interruptions)

**MS. MABEL REBELLO:** Sir, My question? (Interruptions)

Q. No. 121 (Contd.)

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** IIT Council संविधान से ऊपर नहीं है और संविधान में हिन्दी को राष्ट्रभाषा का दर्जा दिया गया है। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** आप बैठ जाइए। आप क्या कर रहे हैं? ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** IIT Council उसकी उपेक्षा क्यों कर रहा है? ... (व्यवधान)...

**MS. MABEL REBELLO:** Sir, My question? (Interruptions)

**श्री सभापति:** आप ज़रा बैठ जाइए। ... (व्यवधान) ... जोशी जी, प्लीज़। ... (व्यवधान) ... आप ज़रा बैठ जाइए। ... (व्यवधान) ...

**श्री एस०एस० अहलुवालिया:** सर, राष्ट्रभाषा स्वाभिमान का विषय है। ... (व्यवधान) ... इसके लिए डिबेट नहीं होता ... (व्यवधान) ... इसके लिए बहस नहीं होती। ... (व्यवधान) ...

**श्री सभापति:** सवाल आई०आई०टी० के इम्तिहान का है, राष्ट्रभाषा का नहीं है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** सभापति जी, ... (व्यवधान) ... सर, हमें आपका संरक्षण चाहिए। ... (व्यवधान) ...

**श्री सभापति:** आप बैठ जाइए। ... (व्यवधान) ... Please. (Interruptions)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 121 (Contd.)

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Civil Services examination can be conducted in regional languages also. (Interruptions)

(Contd. by RSS/1e)

1e/11.20/RSS-DS

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.):** How can we write it?... (Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Let us go on to Question No. 122... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, we want official status for our regional language. Till that time, we have to rely upon English only... (Interruptions)... All the regional languages need official status. Till that time, we have to rely upon English... (Interruptions)...

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया:** हम दक्षिण के बंधुओं से कहना चाहते हैं कि न हम तमिल विरोधी हैं और न मलयालम विरोधी हैं, बल्कि हम अंग्रेजी विरोधी हैं।  
..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I request all hon. Members to please allow the Question Hour to proceed... (Interruptions)...

Q. No. 121 (Contd.)

**श्री ब्रजेश पाटक:** हम यह चाहते हैं कि क्षेत्रीय भाषाएँ भी साथ में रहें।..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री नरेश चन्द्र अग्रवाल:** सभापति महोदय, ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री शिवानन्द तिवारी:** सर, ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री सभापति:** बैठ जाइए, प्लीज़।..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया:** सभापति महोदय, ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री सभापति:** मैंने क्या कहा? ..(व्यवधान)..मैंने यही कहा कि इस सवाल में..(व्यवधान).. Don't attribute remarks. It is wrong.

...(Interruptions)... Just one minute please. Please resume your places. ...(Interruptions)...

The question was about the language in a particular examination. The hon. Minister's answer was about that.

Now, some hon. Members had different views on it, and I said, if you

want to discuss that matter relating to the basic question whether that

examination should be conducted in this language or that language,

please give a notice...(Interruptions)...

**Q. No. 121 (Contd.)**

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया: सर, ..(व्यवधान).. 14 भाषाएँ मानी गयी हैं।  
..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** The House is adjourned for fifteen minutes.

**The House then adjourned at twenty three minutes  
past eleven of the clock.**

MKS-NB/11.35/1F

**The House reassembled at thirty-eight minutes past  
eleven of the clock, MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.**

-----

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Q.No.122.

**डा. राम प्रकाश :** सभापति जी, पहले प्रश्न संख्या 121 का उत्तर दिया जाए। ऐसा लगता है कि ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री सभापति :** आप बैठ जाइए ... (व्यवधान) Question 122.

**श्री नरेश चन्द्र अग्रवाल :** माननीय सभापति जी, मैंने बहुत specific question पूछा था ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री सभापति :** आप Question Hour के बाद बात कर लीजिएगा ... (व्यवधान)

Q. No. 121 (Contd.)

**श्री नरेश चन्द्र अग्रवाल** : सभापति जी, यह हिन्दी के सम्मान की बात है। देश में 2 परसेंट अंग्रेजी बोलने वाले अगर देश को ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री कपिल सिब्बल** : हम हिन्दी का पूरा सम्मान करते हैं ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री विनय कटियार** : यहां किसी भाषा का विरोध नहीं है। सवाल यह है कि किस तरह से भाषाओं को ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री सभापति** : आप दोनों एक साथ बोल रहे हैं, मैं किसकी बात सुनूँ? ... (व्यवधान) आप लोग प्लीज़ बैठ जाइए ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री विनय कटियार** : लोग क्षेत्रीय भाषाओं में परीक्षा दे सकें, क्या इसकी कोई व्यवस्था आप करेंगे? ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री सभापति** : आप प्लीज़ बैठ जाइए ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री विनय कटियार** : सरकार तो ये लोग ही चला रहे हैं। सरकार सर्वोपरि है या कोई संस्थान सर्वोपरि है ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री सभापति** : आप प्लीज़ बैठ जाइए ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री नरेश चन्द्र अग्रवाल** : श्रीमन, आप पूरे राष्ट्र के हैं, लेकिन उत्तर प्रदेश के भी हैं ... (व्यवधान) (Ends)

**श्री सभापति** : नरेश जी, प्लीज़, बैठ जाइए। Question No. 122.









## Q.No.122

**MS. MABEL REBELLO:** Sir, the reply given by the hon. Minister, especially parts (a) & (b), if you go through it, Sir, only shows that the Minister has no idea of LW Districts of Jharkhand, Chhattisgarh and Orissa.

(Contd. by TMV/1G)

-MKS-TMV-VNK/1G/11.40

**MS. MABEL REBELLO (CONTD.):** Sir, I am surely disappointed with the answer.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question, please.

**MS. MABEL REBELLO:** That is what I am asking. It says that only 107 telephone towers in Jharkhand and 46 telephone towers in Chhattisgarh are still to be activated. The block headquarters of Jharkhand do not have telephone towers. He is giving a reply as to why the telephone towers are not activated.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question, please.

**MS. MABEL REBELLO:** The USO Fund of the Government of India is given to activate these telephone towers so that the people can make use of it.

Q. No. 122 (Contd.)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** What is the supplementary?

**MS. MABEL REBELLO:** That is the question, giving connectivity to the people, especially, in LWE-affected districts. I would like to know from the hon. Minister...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** You could have said this straightaway.

**MS. MABEL REBELLO:** ... whether he is justifying the answer or whether he is going to pull up his machinery and see to the connectivity of the telephone towers which are installed and all of them are activated; and installation of telephone towers wherever necessary and connectivity to the people should be ensured. How will it be ensured? What is the time frame?

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Is your question over?

**MS. MABEL REBELLO:** What is the time frame that he has?

**SHRI SACHIN PILOT:** Sir, I respect the passion and the sentiments expressed by the hon. Member. It shows her deep concern for not only the State that she represents but also the entire population that lives in tribal areas and far-off areas. I wish to draw her attention,

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**Q. No. 122 (Contd.)**

through you, Sir, to the fact that instead of Jharkhand, there area total of 29,354 revenue villages. As of today, 28,700 of them are being given village public telephones. That is 98 per cent of the villages in Jharkhand is given either landline connection... (Interruptions)...

**MR. MABEL REBELLO:** No, Sir.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please.

**SHRI SACHIN PILOT:** I would like to explain to the hon. Member, Sir. She is mentioning only about the cell phones and mobile towers. We have a scheme in the Government of India to give landline connections to each village under the Bharat Nirman Yojana. The object of the UPA Government, as the hon. Member will agree, is to reach out cities and areas in towns and villages which are in far-off areas. She did bring up the question of Left Wing Extremist areas. I want to inform her, through you, Sir, that the Government has given satellite phones wherever there is no mobile tower for connectivity. We have given a total of 1,958 satellite phones, including 18 in Jharkhand and 243 in Chhattisgarh. (Interruptions)... I also want to inform her, through you, Sir, that our efforts through the USO Fund of the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 122 (Contd.)

Government of India is to make sure that there is proper connectivity in the hilly regions, tribal regions and North-Eastern Regions and those parts of Jharkhand, Chhattisgarh and Orissa. Wherever there is naxlite movement or LW extremism we will put more infrastructure, more resources and deploy more funds to make sure that there is proper connectivity in all villages of these four States which I have mentioned.

**MS. MABEL REBELLO:** Sir, I am quite happy with the answer of the Minister.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please, supplementary question.

**MS. MABEL REBELLO:** This is my second supplementary. The main problem of connectivity is lack of electricity, in Jharkhand particularly. I want to know from the hon. Minister, since the villages in Jharkhand will not have electricity for another 5-10 years, whether he will use solar energy to activate these telephone towers. A Clean Energy Fund is created in this year's Budget. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether he will use that Clean Energy Fund to activate all

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**Q. No. 122 (Contd.)**

these telephone towers in Jharkhand. This is what I want to know from the hon. Minister.

**SHRI SACHIN PILOT:** Sir, the hon. Minister is absolutely correct that in some of the States there is severe deficiency of power supply which impedes the implementation of towers getting established because they have to rely on generator. As the hon. Member will agree, and I expect also the House will agree, that putting generators and using diesel is not only expensive but also pollute the environment and cause a lot of emissions. We are looking at areas where we can cooperate with the Ministry of Renewable Energy and State Governments, get the private people to invest money and also use the USO Fund to have PVs and solar panels on the towers all over the country. This will have to be done in a phased manner. But the Government and the Department is very alive to the challenge that we have to solarise a lot of our towers. There are about half-a-million mobile towers in the country. They guzzle up a lot of diesel. So, the suggestion is well taken and we will actively work in this direction.

**Q. No. 122 (Contd.)**

**श्री अविनाश राय खन्ना:** सर, आज मोबाइल जीवन का एक अहम हिस्सा बन चुका है। लेकिन जो रिमोट इलाके हैं, जहां मोबाइल उस इलाके के टॉवर से कनेक्ट रहता है, जब उस टॉवर से उसकी connectivity खत्म हो जाती है, तब वहां के मोबाइल्स साथ लगे दूसरे स्टेट्स के टॉवरों से कनेक्ट हो जाते हैं और रोमिंग चार्ज लगाना शुरू हो जाता है।

(1h/mp पर क्रमशः)

MP-RG/1H/11.45

**श्री अविनाश राय खन्ना (क्रमागत) :** बहुत से लोगों ने बी.एस.एन.एल. के मोबाइल कनेक्शन इसीलिए disconnect करा दिए कि उनको signals पूरी नहीं मिल रहे हैं। आप तो remote areas की बात करते हैं, पंजाब जैसे राज्य में यहां पर ...

**श्री सभापति :** सवाल पूछिए।

**श्री अविनाश राय खन्ना :** वह रोमिंग न पड़े, ऐसी फैसिलिटी क्या आप हर एरिया में प्रोवाइड करेंगे? अगर करेंगे, तो कब तक और कितने कनेक्शन लोगों ने अब तक इसी कारण से कटवाए हैं, यह मैं जानना चाहता हूं।

**SHRI SACHIN PILOT:** Sir, I don't think the supplementary relates to the basic question. But I take the point that the hon. Member has

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 122 (Contd.)

raised. We have, in India, 22 telecom circles, and we give licences for each circle for operators to operate. There are technologies now in place that limit signals from radiating beyond a certain range. But it is a technicality that has to be implemented by the operators. If there is any specific block, region or a village, that you know of, where we can intervene and make sure that the private operators can put up the technology in place, if he brings it to my notice, I will, certainly, take action on this.

**SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS:** Sir, I come from the North-Eastern area. The main service provider in the North-Eastern areas is the MTNL/BSNL. But some of the towers of the BSNL, which have been installed there, have not been activated till now. And, we all know that telephone services are not available in remote areas. So, will the Ministry take initiative to activate those towers and give preference to those areas which are far away from towns, or, areas where tribals reside. I would request the hon. Minister to take necessary action in this regard.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 122 (Contd.)

**SHRI SACHIN PILOT:** Sir, it is a fact that the North-Eastern parts of our country are not as well-connected as some of the other parts of our country. And, the hon. Member will appreciate that in the North-Eastern regions, because of terrains, hilly regions, non-motorable roads, etc. inaccessibility, sometimes, pose constraints in mobile operations to be conducted satisfactorily. It is also a fact that some of the private operators are hesitant in going into the North-Eastern parts of the country, or, going into tribal areas or far-flung areas. That is why the BSNL has been asked to give special attention and focus to Jammu and Kashmir, the North-East and the far-off areas. Recently, two months ago, I had a meeting with the North-East Telecom Circles of all the seven North-Eastern States, at Aizawl, Itanagar and Guwahati, and, I asked the BSNL to take strong action to make sure that in respect of those blocks in villages, which do not have landline and mobile connections, we install the Digital Satellite Phone Terminals or the WLL. All the modes of communication, that are there with us, will be deployed to ensure that the North-Eastern parts of the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 122 (Contd.)

country are as well-connected, if not better connected, with metros and other parts of the country.

**श्री राम कृपाल यादव :** क्या यह बात सही है कि पिछले कुछ वर्षों में लैंडलाइन टेलीफोन लगाने वालों की संख्या कम हो रही है, उसके प्रति आकर्षण कम हो रहा है? अगर यह सच है तो इसकी क्या वजह है?

**SHRI SACHIN PILOT:** Sir, it is a fact that the number of landlines in the country is declining slowly. That has happened because of mobile telephony now becoming quite accessible. And, I would like to share with the House that as of today, the tele-density in India is 66.6 per cent. As far back as 2004, it was only 7 per cent. So, the maximum number of people, who are using mobile services, or, having access to telephones at some of the cheapest call rates, in the world is in India. That is because of increased competition. People, who had not ever seen or talked on phone earlier, have access to handsets and are able to make use of the cheap call rates that we have been able to provide through this competition. Of course, the landline business is on the decline. But it is more than made up by the number, quantum and the volume of people using mobile services. Sir, I would also like

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 122 (Contd.)

to mention that the focus now would also be to have other aspects of value added services. And, we are hopeful that those sections of our society which are still uncovered, which still do not have phones, will be able to get a lot more services through hand-held devices.

(Continued by 1J)

1j/11.50/-mp/sc-ks

**SHRI SACHIN PILOT (contd.):** So, the decline in landlines is more than compensated with the abundant availability of mobile phones.

(Ends)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question 123.









## प्रश्न संख्या 123

**श्री प्रभात झा :** सभापति महोदय, 25 तारीख को रेल बजट प्रस्तुत किया गया और बहुत जोश के साथ कहा गया कि 1 लाख 75 हजार लोगों को रोजगार दिया जाएगा। अभी हाल ही में जुलाई 2010 में रेलवे की नयी केटरिंग नीति आयी है। उसके तहत जो मेरा प्रश्न था, उसका उत्तर ठीक से नहीं आया। मेरा कहना यह है कि एक तरफ रोजगार देने की आपकी योजना थोथी साबित होगी, वहीं दूसरी ओर आपकी जो नयी केटरिंग नीति आयी है, उसके तहत स्टेशनों पर जो 60,000 वेंडर्स काम करते हैं, उन वेंडर्स की जिंदगी खतरे में आ गयी है, उनका परिवार कैसे चलेगा? मेरा प्रश्न यह है कि अगर आप Indian Railway Catering and Tourism Corporation से ये सब चीजें छीन लेते हैं तो क्या सरकार इसकी कोई वैकल्पिक व्यवस्था कर रही है? अगर नहीं कर रही है तो इन 60,000 लोगों के रोजगार छीनने का अधिकार उनको कैसे है?

**श्री भरतसिंह सोलंकी :** सभापति महोदय, सम्मानित सदस्य ने जो प्रश्न पूछा है, उसका उत्तर हमने अपने जवाब में ही बताया है कि “Vendors are engaged by the licensee on their own terms and conditions and Railways do not have any contractual relations with the vendors appointed by the licensees, both erstwhile and present. Further, as per the Catering Policy 2010, all existing operationalised catering licenses for minor units have been permitted renewal, subject to satisfactory

**Q. No. 123 (Contd.)**

performance and payment of all dues, which will take care of interests of such vendors.”। कहने का तात्पर्य यह है कि आज जो कर्मचारी काम कर रहे हैं, वेंडर्स काम कर रहे हैं, उनके licensees का लाइसेंस भी रिन्यू किया जाएगा। वह इस बात पर आधारित होगा कि वे किस क्वालिटी का काम कर रहे हैं, जनता को ठीक से खाना देते हैं, उसकी क्वालिटी ठीक है, रिन्युअल फीस ठीक से देते हैं। उन सभी वेंडर्स को, वे licensees अपने पास रख सकते हैं, उनको निकालने की कोई जरूरत नहीं है। माननीय सदस्य ने जो दूसरी चिंता व्यक्त की है कि IRCTC के जो कर्मचारी हैं, वेंडर्स हैं, वे licensee के द्वारा ही हैं, क्या उनको निकाला जाएगा? सर, कहने का तात्पर्य यह है कि licensee को, सभी में नहीं, लेकिन कुछ में, रिन्युअल करने का प्रावधान किया गया है। इस नयी नीति को लाने का कारण यह रहा कि जनता को अच्छी क्वालिटी का खाना मिले, उसकी प्राइस ठीक हो और मुनाफा किए बिना यह सब किया जाए। ऐसा करने के पीछे हमारा उद्देश्य यही था, इसलिए वेंडर्स को काम से निकालने के बारे में चिंता करने की कोई जरूरत नहीं है।

**श्री प्रभात झा :** सभापति जी, रेल मंत्री जी ने सन् 2008 में Indian Railway Catering and Tourism Corporation को 'मणिरत्न' का पुरस्कार दिया था कि ये बहुत अच्छा खाना दे रहे हैं। मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि ऐसा क्या कारण था कि आपने उनसे वह छीनकर अपने मंत्रालय में ले लिया और फिर 60,000 वेंडर्स की

**Q. No. 123 (Contd.)**

गारंटी - उनको सुधारने के बजाय उनको हटाने की बात क्यों हो रही है? आप कह रहे हैं कि हमसे उनका कोई संबंध नहीं है। अगर ऐसा है तो आपके रेलवे स्टेशनों पर वे इतने वर्षों से क्यों मौजूद हैं? आपका ऐसा कहना कि उनका हमारा कोई संबंध नहीं है, हमारी कोई संविदा उनके साथ नहीं है, यह बहुत ही गैर-जिम्मेदाराना उत्तर है। सर, एक परिवार को चलाने के लिए आदमी को कितनी मेहनत करनी पड़ती है। इन 60,000 वेंडर्स को बेरोजगार करने का आपको कोई अधिकार नहीं है। आपको स्पष्ट बताना चाहिए कि....

**श्री सभापति :** आप सवाल पूछिए।

**श्री प्रभात झा :** इन साठ हजार वेंडर्स को बचाने की आपके पास कोई योजना या कोई वैकल्पिक व्यवस्था है या नहीं? दूसरा....

**श्री सभापति :** एक सवाल पूछिए।

**श्री प्रभात झा :** सर, इसी से जुड़ा हुआ प्रश्न है।

**श्री सभापति :** आप कितना टाइम लेंगे?

**श्री प्रभात झा :** आपने जो मणिरत्न पुरस्कार उन्हें दिया, उसे उनसे क्यों छीन रहे हैं?

**श्री भरतसिंह सोलंकी :** सभापति महोदय, जो रेलवे में केटरिंग व्यवस्था है, वह चाहे ATCTC चलाती हो या रेलवे खुद चलाती हो, उन्हें लाइसेंस दिया जाता है और जो licensee होता है, वह अपने वेंडर्स को अपनी terms and conditions

**Q. No. 123 (Contd.)**

पर contract पर रखता है। माननीय सदस्य जो 60,000 वेंडर्स की बात कर रहे हैं, उनमें से एबीसी category में 41,000 वेंडर्स हैं और 5,600 के करीब डीईएफ category के रेलवे स्टेशनों में काम करते हैं। माननीय सदस्य का कहना है कि क्या हम उनको निकाल रहे हैं? पहले तो रेलवे या IRCTC यह काम खुद नहीं करती है, licensees वेंडर्स को रखते हैं।

(1के-एमसीएम पर क्रमशः)

SC/MCM-KGG/1K/11.55

**श्री भरतसिंह सोलंकी (क्रमागत) :** और अगर एक लाइसेंस रद्द होता है तो दूसरा लाइसेंसी आता है, वह भी उन्हीं वेंडर्स से काम लेता है, क्योंकि वह एक्सपीरिएंस्ड है इसलिए उसको काम मिल जाता है। इसलिए जब इंडियन रेलवे कैटरिंग एंड सर्विसिज को लेती है तो उसके साथ अपने लाइसेंसी को कंटीन्यू करने की भी जरूरत है। अब उन्होंने जो चिंता व्यक्त की कि क्यों आपने पुरस्कार देने के बाद कार्पोरेशन से रेलवे ने काम लिया, इसकी यह वजह रही और पब्लिक परसेप्शन यह आया कि कैटरिंग सर्विसेज में काफी कमी आई है, तथा जनता से, मीडिया से और पार्लियामेंट में भी क्वेश्चन खड़े हुए कि इसकी क्वालिटी ठीक नहीं है, खाना ठीक से मिलता नहीं है और कार्पोरेशन ज्यादा प्राइस से पैसा लेता है, जबकि उसी पैसे में अच्छा खाना मिल सकता है। उस

**Q. No. 123 (Contd.)**

हिसाब से तय करके जुलाई, 2010 में यह तय किया गया कि जो हमारे जोनल ऑफिसिज़ हैं, वे जोनल ऑफिसिज़ इस बात को तय करें कि ठीक खाना मिले, अच्छी व्यवस्था तथा सफाई के साथ मिले और उसकी प्राइस भी कम हो, ठीक-ठाक हो, यह तय किया गया है।

**श्री नरेश चन्द्र अग्रवाल :** जहां तक उनकी नौकरी की बात है, इस पर कुछ नहीं बताया गया है।.....(व्यवधान)

**श्री सभापति :** नरेश जी, अगर आप हर चीज में इंटरफियर करेंगे इस तरह से तो .....(व्यवधान)

**श्री नरेश चन्द्र अग्रवाल :** सर, अगर आप माननीय सदस्यों को संरक्षण नहीं देंगे तो हम क्या करेंगे।

**श्री सभापति :** आप सवाल पूछने दीजिए।

**श्री नरेश चन्द्र अग्रवाल :** उनसे जवाब तो आना चाहिए।.....(व्यवधान)

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** Sir, it is curious to note that some people are operating on the railway properties and the Railways is withdrawing its responsibilities saying that हमको कुछ करने का नहीं है।

The fact remains that in the catering policy, after the pressure was mounted, thousands of vendors lost their livelihood. Now, the catering is to be done by the licensee. Am I to believe that the Railways is

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 123 (Contd.)

appointing the licensee and the licensee is appointing vendors and the Railways has got no responsibility? (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** What is your question? Please come to the question.

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** Sir, that is my question. What the questioner has asked has been evaded. The Railways is washing its hands off saying that it has no responsibility. The fact remains that thousands of small vendors lost their jobs because big private licensees are put in place, in different railway stations.

They established IRCTC and now they are dislodging it and the power is being taken over by the zonal offices of the Railways. Why, Sir? What is the reason? That is my question. You have established an institution and thereafter you are throwing the baby out with the bath water.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Do you wish to have an answer for this?

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** This is my question, Sir. (Interruptions)  
You are taking over the powers to vest with the zonal offices. You have been inconsistent and the Minister's response is inconsistent.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

Q. No. 123 (Contd.)

**SHRI BHARATSINH SOLANKI:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, the licensees and vendors relations are that they are engaged by the licensees on their own terms and conditions. Now, the hon. Member is concerned with what would happen to those vendors. The point is, the new policy does not ask the licensee to remove them. Even though the licensee may change, the vendors are always working with the new licensees. They were neither directly connected with the Railways...  
(Interruptions)

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** In appointing new licensees, you are not guiding them with new rules and regulations. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Shri Rajeev Shukla now.

**श्री राजीव शुक्ल :** रेलवे में, इस मामले में राष्ट्रीय एकता जरूर है कि कश्मीर से लेकर कन्या कुमारी तक हर प्लेटफार्म पर आपको घटिया खाना मिलेगा, चाहे आप जहां पर चले जाइए। मैं मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहता हूं कि ट्रेन के अंदर और स्टेशन पर जो खाना मिलता है, वहां जो वेंडर्स हैं चाहे वे किसी भी एजेंसी के द्वारा हों, चाहे कोई कैटरर्स हो, मैं यह जानना चाहता हूं कि क्या आपने कोई

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

**Q. No. 123 (Contd.)**

क्वालिटी कंट्रोल एजेंसी बनाई है जो समय-समय पर खाने को चैक करे, चाहे टेकेदार कोई हो, कार्पोरेशन कोई हो, उससे हमें मतलब नहीं है?

(1L/gS पर आगे)

TDB-GS/1L/12.00

**श्री भरतसिंह सालंकी :** सभापति महोदय। ... (व्यवधान) ... सभापति महोदय, सम्मानित सदस्य ने प्रश्न पूछा है कि हम नयी पॉलिसी क्यों ला रहे हैं? हमारा नई पॉलिसी लाने का मुख्य कारण है कि जब खाने के बारे में काफी कम्प्लेंट्स मिलीं, उसकी क्वालिटी के बारे में कम्प्लेंट्स मिलीं..।

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question Hour is over.

(Ends)

TDB-GS/1L/12.00

**SHORT NOTICE QUESTION NO. 1**

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, this is a very important multi-purpose project, which is going to affect around 15 districts of Andhra Pradesh. Its foundation was laid in 1980 by three successive Chief Ministers. More than Rs.3,589 crores have been spent on this project. Is the hon. Minister aware of it? Then, how much time is he going to take further to give final clearance? Let the hon. Minister be specific. Last time also, we have raised this issue. At that time, the hon. Minister said that he has written to the Andhra Pradesh Government and

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

awaiting response from them. Is the hon. Minister in agreement with the Andhra Pradesh Government regarding contention about the project?

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Sir, the environment clearance and forest clearance has already been granted for the Polavaram Multi-purpose Project.

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Sir, I am not able to hear the hon. Minister. Please, use the mike.

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** It has already been cleared. The forest clearance was given. The final stage-II forest clearance for the Polavaram Project was given way back in July, 2010. The issue before the Government of India is the declaration of the Polavaram Multi-purpose Project as a national project. That is being handled by the Ministry of Water Resources. The matter is under consideration of the Government of India. The limited point in which the Environment and Forest Ministry comes into play is the environment and forest clearance. The hon. Member, being from Andhra Pradesh, is rightly concerned about this Project. I would request him to also persuade his colleague, the Chief Minister of Chhattisgarh who has written a four-page letter to me, arguing against continuing the forest and environment clearance for the Polavaram Project on the grounds that there is going to be submergence in the State of Chhattisgarh. There have also been questions that have been raised by the Government of Orissa. Now, Sir, one of the conditions for giving clearance for this Project is that there will be no submergence in the State of Orissa and in the State of Chhattisgarh. For this, protective embankments have to be built along a 29 kilometres stretch on the river Sabari in Chhattisgarh, and along a 30 kilometres stretch on the river Sabari and

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Sileru in the State of Orissa. This is the factual position. Without the protective embankments being built, the submergence will take place, a condition of clearance will be violated. The condition for clearance is that there will be no submergence in the State of Chhattisgarh and Orissa.

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Sir, the Andhra Pradesh Government has communicated to the hon. Minister saying that these protective bunds are going to be constructed and there will be no submergence, and there is no need for pending clearance on that account. Is the hon. Minister aware of this fact? If so, is he going to clear it because they are going to provide protective bunds? Sir, the Project is getting delayed. The original cost of the Project was Rs.800 crores, and now it is Rs.16,600 crores. Already Rs.3,600 crores have been spent on it. And, if you just go on prolonging like this, for whatever reasons it is, it will further delayed. As the hon. Minister has rightly said, it is already under consideration for status of a national project also. Keeping that in mind, will he take initiative and see that the clearance is given at the earliest, basing on the assurance given by the Andhra Pradesh Government?

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Sir, the protective embankments have to be built physically in the territory of Chhattisgarh and Orissa. I am the Union Minister. I don't represent any particular State. I have to take Chhattisgarh and Orissa also along with me in this process. Now, the hon. Member's own colleague, the Chief Minister of Chhattisgarh has written to me, saying 'that we will not allow this Project to proceed'. Now, if he is so keen on this Project, he should persuade his colleague, the Chief Minister of Chhattisgarh to do so. Sir, what the Ministry of...

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Thank you.

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Sir, please give me one minute. Sir, the Ministry of Environment and Forest has said that there should be public hearing for the construction of these protective embankments. The public hearing has to be held in Chhattisgarh, and the public hearing has to be held in Orissa. Almost two years have passed, the public hearings have not taken place.

(Contd. by 1m-cls)

KLS/1M-12.05

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (CONTD):** Unless the public hearing takes place one of the conditions of the environmental clearance gets violated. Orissa and Chhattisgarh are not agreeing to the holding of the public hearings. We are in a difficult situation. I appeal to the hon. Member to ensure that, at least, Chhattisgarh is on board and we will discuss the matter with the Government of Orissa. ...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Normally, I do not seek permission, you must protect it. As he has rightly said, when the other State Governments are not allowing public hearing, do you expect the one State Government to go into the other State Government's territory and hold a public hearing. It is the duty of the hon. Minister at the Centre and not that of political parties to take initiative to call all the three Chief Ministers, hold a meeting and try to sort out this issue.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** It is a good suggestion.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** No, no, I would like the Minister to respond. He is a proactive man. I hope he will do something. Incidentally, he hails from Andhra Pradesh and in Rajya Sabha he is from Andhra Pradesh, to my knowledge.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Shri Mysura Reddy.

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Let him respond. ...(Interruptions)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I think you have asked your two supplementaries. ...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** We cannot simply go by rules only. ...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Sir, the public hearing, according to law, is conducted by the project proponents. There is nothing in the law which says that the Ministry of Environment and Forests should arrange for a public hearing. ... (Interruptions).. But I can take the hon. Member's suggestion. I have written to the Chief Minister of Orissa, I will write to the Chief Minister of Chhattisgarh and, if need be, we call a tripartite meeting to sort this issue out. This much assurance I give to the hon. Member. ...(Interruptions)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Shri Mysura Reddy. ...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** The Minister of Environment and Forests is conducting public hearing directly in Kerala. ...(Interruptions)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Why are you interfering? ...(Interruptions)... Let the question be answered. ...(Interruptions).. No, you do not have the floor. Please. ...(Interruptions)..

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**SHRI M.V. MYSURA REDDY:** Sir, as per the Minister's reply, it is not possible to conduct public hearings in Chhattisgarh and Orissa because the States are objecting. My request is that if the Government of Andhra Pradesh submits a plan of re-visiting less submersion, is it acceptable to the Ministry?

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Sir, if the Government of Andhra Pradesh decides to reduce the height of the dam that will obviate the need of the protective embankments, which is the easier solution. That means you do not need to construct the protective embankments in Chhattisgarh and Orissa. So, it is entirely up to the Andhra Pradesh Government. If the Government of Andhra Pradesh reduces the height of the dam, that would be the best solution. As of now, with the present height of the dam, we have to build the protective embankments in Orissa and Chhattisgarh. Sir, I have given you an assurance that I will call a meeting of the three States to find a way forward. ...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** Sir, is there any time-frame if a particular State delays deliberately? The public hearing has to be conducted in the State of Orissa. Suppose for any reason or deliberately, it is getting delayed, is there any time-frame that the Government has in mind? Will the Government think of bringing a legislation in this regard? This may be happening in so many cases, Sir. It will be contributing to the national food security. It is not only important for Andhra Pradesh but it is for the entire country.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** You have asked your question. ...(Interruptions)...

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** The giving of national status should be expedited, Sir. It is an advanced stage. We are requesting the Government of India for this. It is not entirely the fault of the Andhra Pradesh Government. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** You have asked the question. ...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Sir, on the national project status, I have already clarified that the administrative Ministry is the Ministry of Water Resources and my colleague, the Water Resources Minister, is the appropriate person to answer the question. ...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** Sir, I have asked about the time-frame. ...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** On time-frame for public hearing, according to the law, within 45 days public hearing has to be conducted. This is one of the unusual projects where you require a public hearing in three States. Sir, 99 per cent of the projects require the public hearing in their home States. This is a case in which public hearing is required both in Chhattisgarh and in Orissa. That is why the Ministry of Environment and Forests has issued a show-cause notice as to why the public hearings have not been held. I am perfectly in sympathy with the argument that is put forward by the Government of Andhra Pradesh that public hearings have not been held because Orissa and Chhattisgarh have been reluctant to allow the public hearing, for legitimate reasons. I am not criticizing any State Government, Sir. I assured you that I will try to find a way out by bringing all the three States together. ...(Interruptions)..

(Followed by 1N/SSS)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

SSS/1N/12.10

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Now, Shri Mohapatra.

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** Sir,...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** No, Mr. Seelam. I will not allow this.

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** It is a very vital thing.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** No, please sit down. This is not going on record. Please resume your seat. Allow Mr. Mohapatra to put his supplementary.

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** \*

**SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA:** Sir, actually we will be seeking protection. I put it to the Minister. He was not concerned in this particular matter when there was an agreement agreed to about the height between the three States. Central Water Commission had approved it. It was an approved project. Now, suddenly without involving the States of Orissa and Chhattisgarh, the Central Water Commission with the connivance of and on the assurances of the Principal Secretary of Andhra Pradesh Government's Water Resources Department agreed to increase the height of the dam.

-----  
\* **Not recorded.**

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

That is the problem. As the Minister very correctly said if the height could be restored to the previous agreed height, there is no problem in Orissa and Chhattisgarh. Why has the height been raised and on the raised height, Minister is concerned. On the raised height, his Ministry has given the clearance which they should not have, without finding out whether Orissa and Chhattisgarh have been parties to this new increased height.

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Sir, the matter is sensitive because eight villages of Malkangiri district of Orissa and four villages in the Dantewada district of Chhattisgarh are involved. In fact, these are all left wing extremist-affected districts. There are larger issues involved here on the submergence issue. Sir, when I gave the forest clearance in July 2010, I gave it on the information and the understanding that Chhattisgarh and Orissa were party to the agreement that the dam would be built subject to the construction of river bed protective embankments on the Saberi and the Sileru. Now the hon. Member has raised a doubt. I will go back to the records and check on this. But, Sir, I have to take all three States together. I understand the importance of the Polavaram multipurpose project. I have myself visited, not in this portfolio but in an earlier portfolio I have visited the project site but, I have also to be sensitive to the needs of Orissa and Chhattisgarh. I have got a long letter from the Chief Minister of Chhattisgarh objecting to this project. I cannot ignore the views of two very important States where submergence has to take place.

(Ends)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Papers to be laid on the Table. Shri Srikant Jena.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011****CANCELLATION OF CVC'S APPOINTMENT**

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Sir, the other day we raised the issue of cancellation of CVC's appointment by the hon. Supreme Court. We demand a response from the Government. When is the response coming? When is the Prime Minister coming here to give a response to this? It is a very important issue. It is very shocking.

**(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN IN THE CHAIR)**

**SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD:** I think, hon. Minister had said it on the floor of the House that he will respond to us.

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS**

**(SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR):** I had said yesterday in response to the observations of the Leader of the Opposition that the sentiments of the hon. Members of the Opposition will be conveyed to the leadership of the Government. I have done so. I believe that next week, if necessary, a suitable statement on behalf of the Government...

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** What is 'if necessary'? It is the right of this House. It is the right of Indian Parliament. The Supreme Court of India has slapped on the face of the Government. It is very shocking. (Interruptions) The entire country is....

**SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR:** Mr. Naidu, it is a matter to be shocked but don't be shocked so easily. I am saying that the Government will make a suitable statement next week and a statement on behalf of the Government will be laid. You don't have to get shocked so easily. (Ends)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011****PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE**

1. **SHRI SRIKANT JENA:** Sir, I lay on the Table—

I.(1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) of Section 619A of the Companies Act, 1956:—

(i) (a) Fifty-sixth Annual Report and Accounts of the Hindustan Insecticides Limited (HIL), New Delhi, for the year 2009-10, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.

(ii) (a) Forty-ninth Annual Report and Accounts of the Hindustan Organic Chemicals Limited (HOCL), Raigad, for the year 2009-10, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.

(2) Statements (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers: —

(a) Forty-second Annual Report and Accounts of the Central Institute of Plastics Engineering and Technology (CIPET), Chennai, for the year 2009-10, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

(c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

2. **SHRIMATI D. PURANDESWARI:** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

(i) (a) Annual Report of the Pt. Dwarka Prasad Mishra-Indian Institute of Information Technology, Design & Manufacturing (PDPM-IIITD&M), Jabalpur, for the year 2009-10.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

- (b) Annual Accounts of the Pt. Dwarka Prasad Mishra-Indian Institute of Information Technology, Design & Manufacturing (PDPM-IIITD&M), Jabalpur, for the year 2009-10 and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (i) (a) and (b) above.
- (ii) (a) Annual Report of the Indian Institute of Technology (IIT), Guwahati, for the year 2009-10.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (iii) Statement giving reasons for not laying the Annual Report and Accounts of the Auroville Foundation, Auroville, for the year 2009-10, within the stipulated period.
3. **श्री सचिन पायलट** : महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-
- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Centre for Development of Telematics (C-DOT), New Delhi, for the year 2009-10, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Centre.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

(Ends)

**REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT RELATED PARLIAMENTARY  
STANDING COMMITTEE ON HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE**

**SHRIMATI VIPLOVE THAKUR:** Sir, I present the following Reports (in English and Hindi) of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare:—

- (i) Forty-eighth Report on Action Taken by Government on the Recommendations / Observations contained in the Forty-first Report on

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Demands for Grants 2010-11 (Demand no. 48) of the Department of Health Research;

- (ii) Forty-ninth Report on Action Taken by Government on the Recommendations / Observations contained in the Forty-second Report on Demands for Grants 2010-11 of the Department of AIDS Control;
- (iii) Fiftieth Report on Action Taken by Government on the Recommendations / Observations contained in the Fortieth Report on Demands for Grants 2010-11 (Demand no. 47) of the Department of AYUSH;
- (iv) Fifty-first Report on Action Taken by Government on the Recommendations / Observations contained in the Thirty-ninth Report on Demands for Grants 2010-11 (Demand no. 46) of the Department of Health and Family Welfare;
- (v) Fifty-second Report on Action Taken by the Department of Health and Family Welfare on the Recommendations/Observations of the Committee contained in its forty-third Report on action taken by the Department of Health and Family Welfare on the Recommendations/Observations of the Committee contained in its Thirty-eighth Report on 'Major issues concerning the three Vaccine producing PSUs, namely, the Central Research Institute (CRI), Kasauli, the Pasteur Institute of India (PII), Coonoor, and the BCG Vaccine Laboratory (BCGVL), Chennai'; and
- (vi) Fifty-third Report on 'The National Institute of Mental Health and Neuro-Sciences, Bangalore Bill, 2010'.

(Ends)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**EVIDENCE TENDERED BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT RELATED  
PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON  
HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE**

**SHRIMATI VIPLOVE THAKUR:** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy of the Evidence tendered before the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare on 'The National Institute of Mental Health and Neuro-Sciences Bangalore Bill, 2010.'

(Ends)

**REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORT, TOURISM AND CULTURE**

**SHRI SYED AZEEZ PASHA:** Sir, I present the following Reports (in English and Hindi) of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture:—

- (i) One Hundred and Sixty-second Report on Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations /observations of the Committee contained in its One Hundred and Fifty-fourth Report on Demands for Grants (2010-11) of the Ministry of Tourism;
- (ii) One Hundred and Sixty-third Report on Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations /observations of the Committee contained in its One Hundred and Fifty-fifth Report on Demands for Grants (2010-11) of the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways;
- (iii) One Hundred and Sixty-fourth Report on Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations /observations of the Committee contained in its One Hundred and Fifty-sixth Report on Demands for Grants (2010-11) of the Ministry of Shipping;
- (iv) One Hundred and Sixty-fifth Report on Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations /observations of the Committee contained in its One Hundred and Fifty-seventh Report on Demands for Grants (2010-11) of the Ministry of Culture; and

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

(v) One Hundred and Sixty-sixth Report on Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations / observations of the Committee Contained in its One Hundred and Fifty-eighth Report on Demands for Grants (2010-11) of the Ministry of Civil Aviation.

(Ends)

(Followed by NBR/10)

-SSS/NBR-SCH/10/12.15

**ALLOCATION OF TIME FOR DISPOSAL OF GOVERNMENT LEGISLATIVE AND OTHER BUSINESS**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, I have to inform the House that the Business Advisory Committee at its meeting held on 3<sup>rd</sup> March, 2011, has allotted time as follows for Government legislative and other Business :

<b>Sl.No.</b>	<b>Business</b>	<b>Time allotted</b>
1.	Consideration and passing of the following Bills:- (a) The Orissa (Alteration of Name) Bill, 2010. (b) The Constitution (One Hundred and Thirteenth Amendment) Bill, 2010.	2 hours (To be discussed together)
2.	Consideration and passing of the Commercial Division of High Courts Bill, 2009, as passed by Lok Sabha and as reported by Select Committee of Rajya Sabha.	3 hours

3. The Committee also recommended that the House may sit up to 6.00 p.m. daily for transaction of Government legislative and other Business.

(Ends)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**  
**ANNOUNCEMENT RE: GOVERNMENT BUSINESS FOR THE WEEK**  
**COMMENCING 7<sup>TH</sup> MARCH, 2011**

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS**

**(SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR):** Sir, I beg to announce that the Government Business in this House for the week commencing 7<sup>th</sup> March, 2011, will consist of:-

1. Consideration of any item of Government Business carried over from today's Order paper.
2. Consideration and return of the Appropriation Bill relating to the Supplementary Demands for Grants (Railways) 2010-11, after it is passed by Lok Sabha.
3. General Discussion on Budget (General) for 2011-12.
4. Consideration and return of the Appropriation Bills relating to Supplementary Demands for Gants (General) 2010-11, after it is passed by Lok Sabha.

(Ends)

**MATTER RAISED WITH PERMISSION OF THE CHAIR**

**RE: SUFFERING OF INDIANS IN MIDDLE-EAST, PARTICULARLY IN LIBYA**

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE (KERALA):** Sir, this august House is well aware of the unrest in Libya. The hon. Minister of External Affairs had made a statement and also given several assurances regarding evacuation process. But, Sir, the present status of evacuation is totally unsatisfactory. More than 18,000 Indians are living in Libya and majority is from my own State -- Kerala -- and most of them are ladies working as nurses.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Only one or two ships and two or three aircraft are used for evacuation process. There is no proper mechanism to monitor and control the evacuation process from Libya.

Sir, now, the Libyan Government has given an ultimatum to evacuate all foreign nationals on or before 7<sup>th</sup> March, 2011. I got several SMSs/SOSs. In one of the messages that I got, it says, 'If we are not evacuated within this period, we cannot see our family in India in our life.' This is the content of most of the SMSs/SOSs.

Sir, the Government is trying to evacuate the people from Benghazi and Tripoli. But, there are several people who are living in other places. Sir, 2,000 people are living in Jufra and Sebah. It is around 700 kms. from Tripoli. There is an airport at Sebah, but we have no landing permission for our Indian aircraft in this airport. So, I urge the Ministry to seek landing permission of Indian aircraft at Sebah airport for evacuating Indian people stranded in Jufra and Sebah regions in Libya. It is very difficult to reach the Tripoli airport, because the road transport is very unsafe for travel at present. The protesters are standing on the road with weapons and are also looting at gunpoint.

Sir, around 2,000 Indians are trapped Sirt which is 500 kms. away from Tripoli. The problem is either they have to move to Tripoli or they have to board a ship, if ship from India or from any other associated countries arrives at Sirt seaport. There is a seaport at Sirt. If we use the seaport, we can evacuate the people.

(CONTD. BY USY "1P")

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

-NBR-USY/1P/12.20

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE (CONTD.):** Same is the position in Kufrah also. Around 800 Indians are living there. So, I request the hon. Minister to make proper arrangements. Sufficient staff is not there in our Embassy. At the time of Gulf War, the then Government had sent Special Crisis Management Team and sufficient aircrafts. Therefore, I would like to urge upon the Government to send a special team today itself. Also, sufficient ships and aircraft should be sent for immediate evacuation of Indians. Thank You, Sir.

(Ends)

**SHRI SYED AZEEZ PASHA (ANDHRA PRADESH):** Sir, I associate myself with what the hon. Member, Shri P. Rajeeve, has said.

(Ends)

**SHRI K.V. RAMALINGAM (TAMIL NADU):** Sir, I associate myself with what the hon. Member, Shri P. Rajeeve, has said.

(Ends)

**SHRI NARESH GUJRAL (PUNJAB):** Sir, I associate myself with what the hon. Member, Shri P. Rajeeve, has said.

(Ends)

**श्री अवतार सिंह करीमपुरी(उत्तर प्रदेश):** सर, मैं अपने आपको इस विषय से सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Shri Tiruchi Siva to associate. (Interruptions)

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (TAMIL NADU):** No; Sir. We are discussing a very serious issue. (Interruptions)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Sir, the Government is not serious about what is happening there. (Interruptions) We have been reading this in the newspapers also. (Interruptions) Somebody from the Government side should...(Interruptions) Okay, you complete first. Then, I will speak. (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Siva, you please associate only because we are not starting a debate on this. (Interruptions)

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Sir, all of us are very concerned about this. This is a very serious matter. Please do something. (Interruptions) People are crying. (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No doubt, it is a very serious matter. (Interruptions)

**श्री अवतार सिंह करीमपुरी:** सर, जो लोग ...(व्यवधान)... उनको लाने का खास तौर पर कोई प्रबन्ध किया जाए। (व्यवधान)

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, we are discussing a very serious issue. Please give me an opportunity to....(Interruptions) Sir, considering the seriousness of the issue, you can allow me. (Interruptions) We have already given notices. (Interruptions) The hon. Minister for External Affairs, while replying to the queries raised by the hon. Members on his own *suo motu* statement, said that the Indian Government had started working for evacuation. (Interruptions) Sir, please allow me to speak. (Interruptions) By this time, we have come to know that till today only about 7000 people might have been evacuated from Libya. At the same time, through this House, I would like to bring it to the knowledge of Government that China has already evacuated all its citizens from there. The numbers may

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

differ. Someone says that it is 29,000; but, our Secretary, Ministry of External Affairs, says that it is 20,000. Whatever be the number, all the...(Interruptions) Please allow, Sir. All Chinese have been evacuated from Libya. Philippines have evacuated all its citizens. Why is there a slow progress on the Indian side? One could very easily perceive the speed of deterioration, in a country where chaos and unrest is persistently increasing. The Army, which has to bring it under control, is also split. The people are stranded there. There are no sanitary facilities. (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Siva, it is a... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, people are stranded in another country and we are bothered about time. I am very sorry. (Interruptions) No; no, you have to understand the seriousness of the situation. (Interruptions) Tamil Nadu people, Karnataka people,....(Interruptions) We are always concerned about time, not the lives of the people who are stranded in another country. (Interruptions) We are receiving phone calls from people. They somehow get access to some phones and they call us. They are pleading for their lives. And, you are not permitting us to express our views. (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Siva, I have permitted you and you are still saying that I am not permitting you. What is this? (Interruptions) Don't say like this. (Interruptions)

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Kindly permit me just for two minutes. (Interruptions) That's all. (Interruptions) Those people are reposing their faith in this country.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

(Interruptions) And, this august House is not....(Interruptions) What does this mean? (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** This is not a debate. (Interruptions) Let us not start a debate. (Interruptions) I agree...(Interruptions)

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Let us vent our feelings. It is just a matter of two minutes. (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please sit down. (Interruptions) I direct the Government to come out with a statement on Monday. (Interruptions) Listen please. (Interruptions) I direct the Government because of the urgency of the situation. (Interruptions) The Government should come out with a statement on Monday. (Interruptions) What else can I do? (Interruptions)

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, please allow just for two minutes to express our feelings. (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You have said whatever you wanted to say. (Interruptions) Everything has gone on record. Whatever you wanted to say, you have said. (Interruptions) I agree. (Interruptions) I respect the sentiments of the House. (Interruptions)

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** There is a turmoil. There is no certainty. (Interruptions) People are worried about the safety of their lives. That is the issue. (Interruptions)

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, this is a very serious issue. And, you are not allowing even for two minutes to express our feelings on behalf of those people who are suffering. (Interruptions)

(Followed by 1q – PK)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

-USY/PK-DS/1Q.12.25

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Why are you shouting? You are saying whatever you want to and I am allowing you. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Sir, people from Andhra Pradesh, Tamil Nadu, Karnataka are suffering there...(Interruptions).. Their relatives are worried. That is why... ..(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I agree with you. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Let us express our concern. It is a human issue. ..(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** That is why, I have directed the Government that it should come out with a Statement. Your purpose will not be served by just speaking on this. Some decision has to be taken. ..(Interruptions)..

**DR. K.P. RAMALINGAM:** Ask the Government to come out with a Statement by today evening. ..(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You give a notice. Let us have a fullfledged discussion. If you want, you can give the notice. ..(Interruptions).. Mr. Siva, taking into consideration the sentiments of the House, I have directed the Government to come out with a Statement...

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** By Monday.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Yes, I said, "by Monday." ..(Interruptions).. What else do you want? ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** Sir, we want a Statement from the Government today itself. ..(Interruptions)..

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** If the Government makes a Statement on Monday, you will have the opportunity to seek clarifications. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** No, no. They should come with the good news that they have evacuated each and every Indian from Libya. ..(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I cannot say what news they are going to bring. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** They should come with this news. ..(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I said that I have directed the Government to come out with a Statement by Monday. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** They should not come with the news that they have not been able to do that. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** Sir, Monday is the ultimatum day. ..(Interruptions)..

**श्री अवतार सिंह करीमपुरी:** सर, इसको आज करवायें। ..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** See, if the Government makes a Statement, you will get an opportunity to seek clarifications. ..(Interruptions)..

**श्री अवतार सिंह करीमपुरी:** डिप्टी चेयरमैन साहब, उन्होंने यह बोल रखा है कि सभी विदेशी सात तारीख तक लीबिया छोड़ो। ..(व्यवधान)..

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** Sir, this is a pleading for their lives. ..(Interruptions)..

**श्री उपसभापति:** मेरी समझ में नहीं आ रहा है, See, you want that the Government be given a direction, I have given the direction. ..(Interruptions)..

**श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर:** सर, यह आज होना चाहिए। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप लोग बैठिए। ..(व्यवधान).. Please sit down. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI A. ELAVARASAN:** Sir, this should be done today. ..(Interruptions)..

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** See, this is a very sensitive issue. Everybody is concerned about it. The whole country is concerned about our people who are in Libya. Very recently, the External Affairs Minister had made a Statement that evacuation was going on and all that. But, there is a concern over the slowness with which this has been going on. The Government has to come out with a Statement by Monday. They will come out with a Statement. Then, you will get an opportunity to discuss and seek clarifications on the Statement. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, it is a minute to minute process. ..(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** The House will meet on Monday.

**DR. K.P. RAMALINGAM:** Why not today, Sir? ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Why not today? What is the present situation? ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI A. ELAVARASAN:** Sir, it should be done today itself. ..(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** See, I have said, 'by Monday'. If the Government chooses to reply today itself, I have no objection. ..(Interruptions)..

**DR. K.P. RAMALINGAM:** Why not today, Sir? ..(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, nobody is responding from the Government; I can't do anything. ..(Interruptions)..Please, keep quiet. ..(Interruptions).. I said, I have already given the direction that, on Monday, the Statement will be made. ..(Interruptions).. मंत्री जी बोल रहे हैं, उनको सुनिए।..(व्यवधान)..

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**THE MINISTER OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS (SHRI MURLI DEORA):** Sir, we will convey to the Government and try to make a Statement as early as possible...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, all the other countries are taking action. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI TARIQ ANWAR:** Sir, Monday will be too late. ..(Interruptions)..

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया:** सर, सात तारीख लास्ट डेट है। ..(व्यवधान)..उनको कहा गया है कि विदेशियो, सात तारीख तक हमारा मुल्क छोड़ो।..(व्यवधान).. तब तक वे हमारे लोगों को मार डालेंगे। ..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** The Government should come out with a Statement before the House rises for the day. ..(Interruptions).. You have just informed that 7<sup>th</sup> is the last date, the Members are concerned, the whole nation is concerned; so, before the House rises for the day, the Government should make a Statement. ..(Interruptions).. Mr. Minister, to evacuate our people who are all there in Libya, 7<sup>th</sup> is the last date. According to the Members, Libyan Government has said that everybody has to be evacuated.

(Contd. by PB/1R)

PB-NB/1r/12.30

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN (CONTD.):** Therefore, the hon. Members are concerned about the delay in the evacuation process. ...(Interruptions)... One minute. So, they want a statement before the House rises for the day on the steps that are being taken. ...(Interruptions)...

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011****THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS**

**(SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR):** Sir, it is a legitimate concern. This concern is shared by the Government. I will talk to the Minister for External Affairs. I will communicate it, and, I am sure, Sir, the statement will be made.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Before the House rises.

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** Today, Sir. Today; today.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Yes. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Siva, I have already given directions. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR:** Have I said, 'no'? ...(Interruptions)... I have not said, 'no'. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I have already given directions. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR:** Please let me say. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I have given directions. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR:** Have I said, 'it would not be made today?' I am saying that I am going to communicate it right away to the Minister for External Affairs.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please do that.

**SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR:** I hope I will get him right away and as soon as possible, before the House adjourns for the day, ... ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** He is saying, 'before the House rises.' ...(Interruptions)... Now, it is over. Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... आप क्या चाहते हैं? ... (ब्यवधान) यह ठीक नहीं है .... (ब्यवधान)

**श्री नरेश चन्द्र अग्रवाल :** उपसभापति जी, "as soon as possible" शब्द ठीक नहीं है ... (ब्यवधान)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No; no; it will be before the House rises today. 'As soon as possible' means that it may be even after two hours. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR:** Do I have the leave of the hon. Deputy Chairman to go now and communicate these sentiments?

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Yes; yes; you can go. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD:** Sir, this is your power. You have taken a tough stand and the Government has buckled down.

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, we take Supplementary Demands. Shri Namoo Narain Meena.

**SUPPLEMENTARY DEMANDS FOR GRANTS (GENERAL) 2010-11**

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI NAMO NARAIN MEENA):** Sir, I beg to lay on the Table, a statement (in English and Hindi) showing the Supplementary Demands for Grants (General), for the year 2010-11.

(Ends)

**SPECIAL MENTIONS**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, we take up Special Mentions. Shri Shanta Kumar; not present. Shrimati Maya Singh.

**DEMAND TO TAKE EFFECTIVE MEASURES TO CHECK INCREASING CRIMES AGAINST WOMEN IN DELHI**

**श्रीमती माया सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश) :** उपसभापति जी, यह अत्यंत चिंताजनक बात है कि देश की राजधानी दिल्ली में महिलाओं के विरुद्ध सबसे अधिक अपराध हो रहे हैं। दिल्ली की वार्षिक रिपोर्ट में यह चौंकाने वाला आंकड़ा आया है। कश्मीर से कन्याकुमारी और गुजरात से बंगाल

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

की खाड़ी तक हर प्रकार की सुरक्षा व्यवस्था पर पल-पल की निगाहें रखने वाली विभिन्न एजेंसियां दिल्ली में केन्द्रित हैं। ऐसे स्थान पर यदि महिलाओं के विरुद्ध होने वाले अपराधों में साल-दर-साल वृद्धि हो रही है, तो यह अत्यंत गंभीर बात है। आंकड़े असत्य नहीं बोलते और खासकर जब वे आंकड़े स्वयं सरकार ने रखे हों।

उपसभापति जी, इस वार्षिक रिपोर्ट के अनुसार राजधानी दिल्ली में 8 महिलाएं हर रोज विभिन्न अपराधों की शिकार हो रही हैं। वर्ष 2009 के मुकाबले, वर्ष 2010 में अपराधों के ग्राफ में 4 फीसदी की बढ़ोत्तरी हुई है। इतना ही नहीं, देश की राजधानी दिल्ली में बच्चियों के गायब होने की घटनाएं भी नितांत गंभीर हैं। ऐसा लगता है कि दिल्ली अपराधियों के लिए जन्नत है, क्योंकि वे यहां सुनियोजित तरीके से अपराध करते हैं और ज़्यादातर मामलों में बचकर भाग निकलते हैं।

उपसभापति जी, हमें इस बात को गंभीरता से सोचना होगा कि महिलाओं की सुरक्षा के पर्याप्त कानून होते हुए, प्रशासनिक खामियों के चलते महिलाओं की सुरक्षा तार-तार होती है और बाद में अपराधी भी बचकर भाग निकलते हैं। प्रशासनिक स्तर पर फैली खामियों को दूर करते हुए हर हाल में महिलाओं के विरुद्ध बढ़ते अपराधों को नियंत्रित करने की दिशा में कारगर कदम उठाने चाहिए, जिससे दिल्ली में अपराधों का ग्राफ कम हो और महिलाएं अपने आप को सुरक्षित महसूस करें।

(समाप्त)

**SHRI M. RAMA JOIS (KARNATAKA):** Sir, I would like to associate myself with it.

(Followed by 1s/SKC)

**SIMPLIFICATION OF PROCEDURE FOR WITHDRAWAL FROM PROVIDENT  
FUND UNDER NEW SCHEME**

**SHRI MANGALA KISAN (ORISSA):** Sir, the Central Government launched a new pension scheme some time in 2003-04 under which the new recruits in Government service are required to mandatorily contribute to the Contributory Provident Fund (CPF). Prior to this scheme, the Government employees were subscribing to the General Provident Fund (GPF) and persons who joined Government service before the launch of the new scheme would continue to subscribe to the GPF.

I would like to bring to the notice of the hon. Finance Minister that there is no clarity about withdrawal or refund from the contribution under the new scheme by a subscriber who quits the job midway. Large sums of money of such persons are locked in the Fund. I would, therefore, request the hon. Minister to kindly issue instructions to simplify the procedure of refund or withdrawal of a lump sum amount from the Fund in case a person quits the job before reaching the age of superannuation. A reasonable time-frame may be fixed within which the refund must take place from the date of request made by the subscriber.

(Ends)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**TO REVIEW THE PROCESS OF REDUCTION IN THE NUMBER OF POST OFFICES IN URBAN AREAS**

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE (KERALA):** Sir, the Department of Posts has decided to rationalize the existing postal system in the urban areas of our country. The existing postal network in urban areas consists of 15,797 post offices comprising of HOS and SOS. As per the rationalization scheme, the minimum distance between two post offices should be 1.5 km in cities with a population of 20 lakhs and above two kilometers in other urban areas. As per these norms, the urban areas in our country justify only 6000 post offices. They are planning to close the remaining 9797 post offices in the urban areas. Also, as per the existing norms, these post offices should earn a profit of, at least, five per cent. This too would lead to further closure of the existing post offices.

This would cause the postal system in our country to collapse. Therefore, I urge the hon. Minister to intervene in this matter and stop the closure of post offices immediately.

(Ends)

**TO ADDRESS THE PROBLEMS BEING FACED BY INDIAN STUDENTS OF TRI-VALLEY UNIVERSITY IN USA**

**श्री मोहम्मद अली खान(आन्ध्र प्रदेश):** महोदय, मैं इस ऐवान का ध्यान उन मुश्किलात की तरफ़ दिलाना चाहता हूँ, जिनका सामना कैलिफ़ोर्निया, यू.एस.एस. में ट्राईवैली यूनिवर्सिटी के हिन्दुस्तानी स्टूडेन्ट्स कर रहे हैं। हाल ही में ट्राईवैली यूनिवर्सिटी में पढ़ने वाले हिन्दुस्तानी विद्यार्थियों को पता चला कि उनके साथ धोखा हुआ है। वे जिस यूनिवर्सिटी में पढ़ रहे थे, वह एक जाली यूनिवर्सिटी है और उनको जारी किए गए वीज़ा भी गैर-कानूनी हैं। इस यूनिवर्सिटी

### Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

میں داخिला پانے والے کول 1555 ویدھارثیوں میں سے 95 فریسدی تالیب-ڈلموں کا تاللوک آंध्र प्रदेश سے है। उन सभी तालिब-डल्मों ने यह जाने बगैर कि ट्राईवैली यूनिवर्सिटी को अमरीकी सरकार के ज़रिए तस्लीम नहीं किया गया है, वीज़ा हासिल करने और उस यूनिवर्सिटी में पढ़ने के लिए लाखों रुपए खर्च किए थे। यह भी पता चला है कि इन तालिब-डल्मों पर रेडियो कॉलर भी लगा दिए गए हैं ताकि उन पर नज़र रखी जा सके। यह निहायत अफ़सोसनाक बात है। उन सभी तालिब-डल्मों को ब्लैक-लिस्ट कर दिया गया है। हालांकि वे बेकूसूर हैं और खुद ही हालात के शिकार हैं। इस सिलसिले में अमरीकी अथॉरिटीज़ के साथ बातचीत होने के बावजूद इस मसले का कोई हल नहीं निकल पाया है।

महोदय, भारत सरकार से मेरा मुतालबा है कि जल्द से जल्द अमरीका में भारतीय एम्बेसी को हिदायत दी जाए कि वह उन बेकूसूर तालिब-डल्मों को बचाने के लिए कार्रवाई करे और उनकी हिफ़ाज़त से वतन वापसी के लिए उनकी माली मदद करे या अमरीका की तस्लीम-शुदा युनिवर्सिटियों में उनके दाखिले का इंतजाम करे ताकि उनके तालीमी साल का नुकसान न हो।

(समाप्त)

**محمد علی خان (آندھرا پردیش) :** مہودے، میں اس ایوان کا دھیان ان مشکلات کی طرف دلانا چاہتا ہوں، جن کا سامنا کیلی فورنیا، یو۔ایس۔ایس۔ میں ٹرائی ویلی یونیورسٹی کے ہندوستانی اسٹوڈینٹس کر رہے ہیں۔ حال ہی میں ٹرائی ویلی میں پڑھنے والے ہندوستانی ودھیارتھیوں کو پتہ چلا کہ ان کے ساتھ دھوکا ہوا ہے۔ وہ جس یونیورسٹی میں پڑھ رہے ہیں، وہ ایک جالی یونیورسٹی ہے اور ان کو جاری کئے گئے ویزا بھی غیر قانونی ہیں۔ اس یونیورسٹی میں داخلہ پانے والے کل 1555 ودھیارتھی میں سے 95 فیصد طالب علموں کا تعلق آندھرا پردیش سے ہے۔ ان سبھی طالب علموں نے یہ جانے بغیر کہ ٹرائی ویلی یونیورسٹی کو امریکی سرکار کے ذریعے تسلیم نہیں کیا گیا ہے، ویزا حاصل کرنے اور اس یونیورسٹی

مہودے، بھارت سرکار سے میرا مطالبہ ہے کہ جلد سے جلد امریکہ میں بھارتھی ایمبسی کو ہدایت دی جائے کہ وہ ان بے قصور طالب علموں کو بچانے کے لئے کارروائی کرے اور ان کی حفاظت سے وطن واپسی کے لئے ان کی مدد کرے یا امریکہ کی تسلیم شدہ یونیورسٹی میں ان کے داخلے کا انتظام کرے تاکہ ان کے تعلیمی سال کا نقصان نہ ہو۔

(ختم شد)

**NEED FOR ACTION TO CHECK ILLEGAL TRADE OF NARCOTIC  
SUBSTANCES IN THE COUNTRY**

**SHRI RAMA CHANDRA KHUNTIA (ORISSA):** Sir, yesterday, 3.2 tonnes of *ganja* were seized by the Police in Balimeta, Orissa, while 133 poor *adivasis* were carrying the *ganja* packets to Chitrakunda. The poor *adivasis* have been arrested. *Ganja*, opium and liquor mafia are using the dense forests and poor, innocent *adivasis* in Orissa, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, Andhra Pradesh, West Bengal and Maharashtra regions for illegal trade.

This business has been going on for years now. How is it that the Police is not able to get at the root of this and arrest the real culprits? In the same way, ultra modern drug mafia is widening its nets in the metro cities through

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

educational institutions. Their targets are students and young people. The same situation is prevalent in the North-east. In spite of laws being there to deal with this, the drug mafia is very much active in the cities and educational institutions. The *ganja*, opium and liquour mafia is more active in the forest areas. The poor tribals are only the victims.

I urge upon the Government to constitute a task force to coordinate and to monitor these illegal activities. Also, State Governments may be asked to take stringent action against the persons behind this illegal trade.

(Ends)

(Followed on 1t/hk)

HK-MP/1t/12.40

**DEMAND TO CHECK ATROCITIES AGAINST DALITS IN PUNJAB AND CHECK  
FILING OF FAKE CASES AGAINST THEM**

**श्री अवतार सिंह करीमपुरी (उत्तर प्रदेश)** : उपसभापति महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से सदन के संज्ञान में लाना चाहता हूँ कि पंजाब में निर्दोष दलितों को मुकदमों में फंसाकर, जेल की सलाखों में डाल कर व्यापक स्तर पर उत्पीड़न किया जा रहा है, जिसके कारण दलितों में भय का वातावरण पैदा हो गया है। यह वातावरण उस समय और ज्यादा भयावह हो गया, जब पंजाब के करीब 2000 निर्दोष व्यक्तियों को गलत गंभीर मुकदमे लगाकर जेल में डाल दिया गया, जिनमें बहुत से लोग आज भी जेल में हैं। उनका कोई अपराधिक इतिहास भी नहीं है और न ही उन्होंने कोई अपराध किया है। उन सभी दलितों का कुसूर सिर्फ इतना है कि वे संत गुरु रविदास जी के आदर्शों को आगे बढ़ाने का काम करने वाले संत रामानन्द जी की आतंकियों द्वारा निर्मम हत्या के बाद शांतिपूर्वक आंदोलन कर रहे थे। आंदोलन लोकतंत्र की परंपरा का एक हिस्सा है, जिसकी सज़ा आज तक दलित समाज के बेगुनाह लोग भुगत रहे

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

हैं, जो दलित उत्पीड़न का एक ज्वलन्त उदाहरण है। विजय कुमार ढिल्लावां, जिला जालंधर, पंजाब की हत्या से पूरे पंजाब के दलितों व कमजोर लोगों में भय का आतंक पैदा हो गया है। आज तक हत्यारा खुले आम घूमकर आतंक फैला रहा है, परंतु सरकार इन गंभीर घटनाओं पर कोई ध्यान नहीं दे रही है।

अतः आपसे अनुरोध है कि आप पंजाब सरकार को निर्देश कर पंजाब के 2000 दलितों के केस वापस कराएं व विजय कुमार ढिल्लावां के हत्यारों को गिरफ्तार किया जाए, आपकी अति कृपा होगी।

(समाप्त)

**DEMAND TO CREATE A NATIONAL JUDICIAL SERVICE IN THE COUNTRY**

**SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL (KERALA):** Sir, I want to raise an urgent matter of public importance before the House for requesting the Government to initiate urgent steps to introduce National Judicial Service for looking after the recruitment, training, service matters, etc., of the judicial officers in the country.

A fair and independent judiciary is an ideal condition for any true democracy. If the judiciary and the judicial officers are restricted by any means from taking fair and free decisions, it would destabilize the values and concepts of a democratic society and the basic belief of our civil society in judiciary. The salary, service conditions and other perks are always to be protected from the unnecessary intervention of executive.

The selection procedure, promotion, service conditions and transfers are to be dealt with an independent mechanism which should be free from vested interests of any kind. Now, unfortunately, lot of complaints is coming about the

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

selection of judges, their transfers and other related matters. It is found, on many occasions, that these allegations are true.

The issues prevailing in the judicial system are to be addressed seriously. The self-centred and non-transparent methods should be avoided.

For a fair and dependable judiciary, an independent agency should be there to supervise the selection, appointment, promotion, transfer, etc., of the judicial officers. Further, it is very important to protect the belief of the common people in the judicial system. Hence, I urge upon the Government to take urgent steps to introduce a National Judicial Service.

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Dr. Prabha Thakur, not present; Prof. Saif-ud-Din Soz, not present; Shri Vijay Jawaharlal Darda, not present.

(Followed by 1u/KSK)

KSK/SC/12.45/1U

**DEMAND TO TAKE STEPS TO PRESERVE VARIOUS MOTHER TONGUES AND OTHER DIALECTS IN THE COUNTRY**

**श्री प्रभात झा (मध्य प्रदेश) :** महोदय, संयुक्त राष्ट्र संघ के एक अध्ययन के मुताबिक विश्व भर में मौजूद 5300 भाषाओं एवं बोलियों पर अस्तित्व का संकट मंडरा रहा है। इसमें भारत की भी कई भाषाएं एवं बोलियां हैं। भाषाओं एवं बोलियों पर यह संकट हर स्तर पर नजर आ रहा है। छोटे शहरों ही नहीं, देश की राजधानी दिल्ली में भी ऐसे तमाम जाति एवं समुदाय हैं जहां नई पीढ़ी के लोग घर के बाहर तो क्या, घर के भीतर भी अपनी मातृभाषा नहीं बोलते हैं। सवाल है कि एक ऐसे दौर में जब दुनिया फैलती जा रही है, सरोकार वैश्विक हो रहे हैं, इंटरएक्शन ग्लोबल हो रहा है, इन सबके बीच मातृभाषा क्यों सिकुड़ती जा रही है?

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

आज विचार करने की आवश्यकता है कि मातृभाषाओं एवं बोलियों को छिजने या उनके अस्तित्व पर संकट मंडराने से रोकने के लिए क्या किया जा सकता है? राष्ट्रीय, राज्य एवं स्थानीय स्तर पर मातृभाषाओं एवं बोलियों को अपने अस्तित्व को कायम रखने हेतु किस प्रकार से सहयोग किया जा सकता है? यह गंभीर चिंता का विषय है। अतः मेरा आग्रह है कि सरकार मातृभाषाओं एवं बोलियों के अस्तित्व को बनाए रखने के लिए आवश्यक कदम उठाए। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, Shri T.K. Rangarajan, not present. Shrimati Kanimozhi, not present. Shri Brijlal Khabri, not present.

Now, we will take up discussion on the Budget (Railways). Shri Khuntia. You have ten minutes.

**श्री रामचन्द्र खूंटीआ :** सर, थोड़ा और समय दीजिए।

**श्री उपसभापति :** आपकी लिस्ट लम्बी है। आपकी पार्टी से अभी दस लोगों को accommodate करना है।

**THE BUDGET (RAILWAYS) 2011-12 (CONTD.)**

**SHRI RAMA CHANDRA KHUNTIA (ORISSA):** Sir, today, I rise to support the Railway Budget placed by hon. Railway Minister. I do fully agree with our hon. Prime Minister, Dr. Manmohan Singhji, who has said that Railway Budget is the Budget of *aam aadmi*. There is no hike in passenger and freight rates. The Plan outlay is highest at Rs.57,630 crores. Rs.9,583 crores has been provided for new railways. Thirteen hundred kilometres of new lines, 867 kilometres of doubling, 1017 kilometres of gauge conversion have been targeted for 2011-12. Fifty-six new Express trains, three new Shatabdi trains and nine new Duronto trains are to be

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

introduced. Introduction of a pan-India, multi-purpose “Go-India” smart card has been proposed. 236 more stations are proposed to be upgraded as Adarsh Stations. Anti-collision Device (ACD) has been sanctioned in eight Railway Zones. A GPS based ‘Fog Safe’ device has been deployed. An All India Security Help Line on a single number has been set up. All unmanned level-crossing up to 3000 TVUs are to be manned. All North-East State capitals, except Sikkim, will be connected by Railways in seven years. A bridge factory will be set up in Jammu and Kashmir. A state-of-the-art Institute of Tunnel and Bridge Engineering is proposed to be set up at Jammu. A Diesel Locomotive Centre will be set up in Manipur. Eighteen thousand wagons are to be produced in 2011-12 under Pradhan Mantri Rail Vikas Yojana. Ten thousand shelter units are proposed for track-side dwellers. This Budget is definitely a good Budget and Gross Traffic Receipts are targeted at Rs.1,06,239 crore exceeding Rs.1,00,000 crores. Twenty additional hostels for the children of Railway employees will be provided. Around 1.75 lakh vacancies of Group ‘C’ and Group ‘D’, including 16,000 ex-servicemen, to be filled by the end of March, 2011.

During 2010-11, passenger traffic in the passenger KMS and PKM grew by 11 per cent, and freight traffic in NTKM grew by 2 per cent. In terms of achievement, with respect to Eleventh Plan targets, the passenger traffic has already surpassed the 2012 target of 8,80,000 million PKM. Freight traffic stands at 87 per cent of the 7,02,000 million NTKM target.

Sir, it is a fact that the main problem for everybody is the Railway projects and it is a fact that Railways have huge throw forward of ongoing projects under

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

new lines, gauge conversion and doubling of lines with limited availability of resources. There are 122 projects of new lines with projected cost of Rs.59,875 crores; 45 projects of gauge conversion with projected cost of Rs.17,261 crores; and, 160 projects of doubling with projects cost of Rs.21,216 crores. In total, there are 327 projects with projected cost of Rs.98,352 crores. From where will this money come? In order to complete these projects of the lifeline of the country, that is, the Railways, the biggest infrastructure sector, my appeal to the Government is to kindly consider this as a special case and allocate funds from the General Budget for next two years to complete all the Railway projects, or, to stand as security to get loan from any other financial institution to complete all projects in time. I think, this will be a great achievement for the country. The proposal to fill 1.75 vacancies of Group 'C' and Group 'D' posts, including backlog of SC/ST and 16,000 ex-servicemen, is good. But, the question remains as to why these posts have not been filled till today. On the one hand, thousands of Railway Service officers are working in various State and Central public sector undertakings on deputation. And, on the other hand, the vacancies of Group 'C' and Group 'D' posts and vacancies of SC/ST and physically-challenged persons are not filled on time. The General Managers of Railways have been authorised by the Government to appoint five per cent of general category and ten per cent of safety area posts without any formal interview.

(continued by 1w — gsp)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

GSP-12.50-1W

**SHRI RAMA CHANDRA KHUNTIA (CONTD.):** Will the hon. Minister kindly tell this House as to how many such persons have been appointed by the General Managers without interview, and, whether these workers will be regularized in service on time?

It is good that 10,000 shelter units have been proposed for track side dwellers but it could also include other places like Bhubaneswar, Bilaspur, Rourkela, Jharsuguda, Raipur and Ranchi. I urge upon the Railway Minister to have a permanent solution of the problem of railway vendors all over the country. There must be special consideration to grant more railway funds for backward States like Odisha, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, from where railway is getting more freight revenue from mining and coal handling.

Sir, the funds allocated to Odisha may be more than what was given in the past but it is much less as per the requirement of a State, which is having less railway line, and, where 4.5 lakh crore worth investment is coming in. Hence, I urge upon the Government to consider allocation of adequate funds for the following rail projects in Odisha. i) Lanjigarh Road-Junagarh, which started in 1993; ii) Khurda Road-Bolangir, which started in 1994; iii) Haridaspur-Paradeep, which started in 1996; iv) Angul-Duburi Road, which started in 1997; v) Talcher-Bimalagarh, which started in 2004-05; vi) Rupsa-Bangiriposi Gauge Conversion, which started in 1995; vii) Nuapada-Gunupur Road, which started in 1997; and, viii) Sambalpur-Talcher and Koraput Rayagada railway lines.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Funds allocated are not sufficient to complete these projects by 2012. I would also request for three missing links, namely, Rupsa- Burhamara to Chakulia, which is 35 kms., ii) Nuapada-Gunupur Broad Gauge Rail Link to Theruvali, and, iii) Banspani Barbil link, which is a new project.

Similarly, Sir, more money is required for new projects, namely, i) Meramandali-Angul-Talcher-Chhendipada; ii) Bhadrachalam Road-Malkangiri; iii) Jajpur-Junagarh-Lanjigarh Road, Talcher-Bimlagarh; iv) Badagada-Nuapada via Padmapur; v) Talcher-Gopalpur; vi) Puri-Konark; vii) Rupsa-Bangiriposi to Gorumahisani; viii) Badampahar to Keonjhar; ix) Berhampur to Phulbani; x) Khurda Road to Raja Athagarh; and, xi) Rayagada-Gopalpur via Gunupur-Bhismagiri-Digpahar.

For survey of Jajpur-Keonjhar Road via Navigaya Biraja Kshetra Jajpur, and, Aradi Kshetra to Dhamara Port, which will connect to a Hindu pilgrim place, and, also provide mining transportation to Dhamara Port.

Sir, I also demand for a multi-model logistics Railway Park at Kalinga Nagar, Angul, Jharsuguda, Rourkela and Choudwar for container freight station and extension of Ludhiana-Dankuni Eastern Dedicated Freight Corridor via Behrampur to Haridaspur.

I also demand for i) two more new railway divisions, one at Jajpur — Keonjhar Road, and, the other one at Rayagada; ii) modernization of Talcher station, and, iii) link of all express trains to Talcher railway station. Here, I would like to say that from Talcher railway station, Railways is getting around Rs. 5 crore revenue every day for coal transportation but no adequate steps are taken for the

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

modernization of the station, and, for linking of express trains to the station. Agitations are going on by all the parties, organizations, NGOs and local people. I also demand for stoppages of Rajdhani Express, Coromandel Express, Falaknuma Express at Jajpur-Keonjhar Road, which is very near to Kalinga Nagar Industrial complex -- many industries including TATA are coming up there -- and, which has link with five Districts, namely, Kendujhar, Dhenkanal, Jajpur, Kendrapara.

Sir, the agitations are going on for the last two-three years. So, once again, along with the local people, I also demand stoppages of Rajdhani Express, Coromandel Express and Falaknuma Express at Jajpur station. There is also a demand of the general public for a second flyover in Jajpur-Kendujhar Road, and, it has not been fulfilled till today.

(contd. by sk-1x)

SK/1X/12.55

**SHRI RAMA CHANDRA KHUNTIA (CONTD.):** I request the Railway Minister to have a look at it and also sanction a second flyover at Jajpur Road. (Time-bell)

Sir, it is a welcome decision to have a wagon factory in Orissa. But, I am sorry to inform that it was said last year that it would be at Kalahandi, but this time the hon. Minister has not declared the place. I demand that the coach factory should be in the most backward district at Kalahandi. Also, the medical college which has been declared for Orissa must be at Rourkela. I expect the Railway Minister to particularly declare the place of coach factory at Kalahandi, and also the medical college at Rourkela. We know that some people are also trying to

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

take this coach factory from Kalahandi to some other place which should not happen. I again demand that it should be based at Kalahandi. Sir, I think I have...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You have sufficiently made your demands.

**SHRI RAMA CHANDRA KHUNTIA:** Sir, I had to give some demands for my State. Sir, one more thing that I want to say is, many things have been said about the vendors. Today also, a mention was made in this regard in the House. I want to make it clear that the Railways just cannot say that they have no link with the vendors. These vendors were working in the Railways. Now, the hon. Railway Minister has allocated 10,000 houses for those who are residing on Railway's land. It means that they are going to settle those who are legal or illegal on railway land. But those vendors, those who are managing their livelihood on the Railways, we are not considering their situation. I think, those vendors also represented many times on this. I request the hon. Railway Minister to take a favourable decision on rehabilitation of the vendors. Thank you.

(Ends)

**SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY (TAMIL NADU):** Thank you, Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, for giving me this opportunity.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You have five minutes.

**SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY:** Yes, Sir. I will raise only a few points which were not covered by the other Member, Mr. Jinnah.

I would like to congratulate the Railway Minister, Madam Mamataji for this people-friendly Railway Budget. Year after year, the railway fares have not been

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

increased. My special congratulation goes to her for reducing the senior citizen age limit from 60 years to 58 years in respect of women. Eventually, this increases the booking population from 6 to 7 per cent day by day. So, I request that additional booking counters, at least in the metropolitan cities, should be created immediately. Not only the counters, but the staff strength should also be increased along with that. I also request that Traveling Ticket Examiners' strength should also be increased. This will avoid the loss by checking the ticketless travellers. Not only that, the theft that is going on happening in the moving trains causing much nuisance to the traveling public and creating an unsafe situation to them will also reduce.

My next request is that in the last Budget, special reservation counters as per MPs request were created but most of such reservation counters are not functioning in a proper manner. When enquired, the administrative reply is that minimum 120 tickets should be booked at a reservation counter for giving it the staff strength. I request that these reservation counters which have been created specially at the request of the MPs should function in a proper manner.

My next request to the hon. Minister is with regard to Thirukkural Express which runs on a weekly basis from Kanyakumari to Delhi. I request that this train should run on a daily basis. If that is not possible, I request that immediate announcement should be made to run it at least on alternate days which will facilitate a lot of people coming from Tamil Nadu to Delhi.

My next request is that creation of broad gauge facility from Madurai to Bodinayakanur was announced in the last Budget. It is just for 70 kilometers, but

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

work has not yet been initiated and the funds have also not been allocated. I request that this should be given immediate consent by our hon. Railway Minister.

My next request is with regard to doubling and electrification from Chennai to Kanyakumari.

(Contd. by yrsr — 1Y)

-SK/YSR/1.00/1Y

**SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY (CONTD.):** Of course, work is going on, but in a scattered manner. In the same way, work of doubling of railway line from Villupuram to Trichy and electrification was approved by the UPA I Government. In the Budget also, the announcement was made. But the work on this project has not yet been started and funds also have not been allocated. I would like to bring it to the notice of the Railway Minister.

Considering the floating population at the Madurai Railway Station, I request that escalator facility may be made available at the Madurai Railway Station. It should be done on a war-footing.

My next point is cleanliness. This has been the concern of every hon. Member right from the hon. Member, Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu, who spoke first on it. The reason why railway stations are not properly maintained is that the work is being given to private contractors who sub-contract the work and pay only fifty per cent payment to them and that is why the work is not being done properly. At most of the railway stations, including the Chennai Railway Station, the work is once again taken back by the Railways themselves and now they are properly maintained. As a woman representative, I would like to suggest this to our hon.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Railway Minister. In Tamil Nadu, more than one lakh self-help groups have been created by our Deputy Chief Minister, Mr. M.K. Stalin, and they have been given many jobs. Why cannot we give this work to them as an initiative to maintain cleanliness both at railway stations and toilets on running trains? Why don't we give this work to the NGOs on a trial basis? This way they will be better maintained.

Mr. Deputy Chairman, with these words, I thank you once again for having given me this opportunity.

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** The House stands adjourned to meet at 2.30 p.m.

-----

**The House then adjourned for lunch at two minutes past one of the clock**  
VKK-AKG/1z/2.30

**The House re-assembled after lunch at thirty minutes past two of the clock,**  
**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR) in the Chair.**

----

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Statement by Smt. Preneet Kaur.

**STATEMENT RE: EVACUATION OF INDIAN NATIONALS FROM LIBYA**

----

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS**

**(SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR):** Sir, I rise to share with the House information on the efforts undertaken by the Ministry of External Affairs and other Government of India Ministries and Departments to assist in the evacuation of Indian nationals from Libya.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

In view of the disturbed conditions in Libya, the Government of India took the decision to relocate Indian nationals out of Libya and assist in their return home. The first special flight of Air India left Libya on February 26. Since then, an air bridge has been established between Tripoli and Delhi.

By the end of the day today, 9209 Indian nationals would have been evacuated out of Libya including 1450 out of Tripoli and Sehba by Air India flights. We expect to complete the exercise of evacuating all those desirous of leaving Libya by March 10. It may be noted that some Indian nationals have opted to stay on in Libya.

(Contd. by RSS/2a)

RSS/2A/2.35

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR (CONTD.):** A passenger ship, Scotia Prince, has also ferried 1,188 Indians from Benghazi to Alexandria in Egypt from where they arrived in Mumbai and Delhi by special flights organized by the Government yesterday and early this morning. The ship turned around from Alexandria last night at 2330 hours for Benghazi, from where we are coordinating the transport of another 1,150 of our nationals back to India via Alexandria. The ship will dock at Benghazi early morning tomorrow.

As we speak, a passenger ship, Red Star One, is also on its way to Misurata and Sirte to ferry Indian nationals to Malta from where special flights are being arranged out of Valletta to bring them back. An air bridge is also being put in place from late tonight between Sehba and India and we hope to evacuate about 2000 Indian nationals from there over the next 5 days, beginning today.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

We have confirmed reports that 750 or so Indian nationals from Kufra in South East Libya have reached Benghazi by the land route. They will now be picked up by the passenger vessel en route to Benghazi.

A large number of Indian nationals have crossed the Libyan border into Tunisia and Egypt. They have been assisted at the border by Indian Embassy officials to be issued travel documents, temporarily housed in hotels and other shelters and provided assistance for their return to India by commercial and special flights. Similar assistance has also been provided by our Missions to Indians who managed to reach other countries such as Malta, Greece, Gulf States etc.

We have taken special care, in association with the Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs, that returning passenger to India are facilitated at Delhi and Mumbai airports. At the Delhi airport a special terminal has been made available for the returnees, who are now being met by the concerned company representatives and assisted by officials of the respective State Governments, the Ministry of External Affairs and the Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs.

An IAF IL 76 aircraft has been stationed in Cairo to undertake possible evacuation operations from Libya. A second IL 76 aircraft has also been put on readiness to be dispatched as and when the need arises. Two ships of the Indian Navy—INS Jalashwa and INS Mysore are en route and are expected to be in the region by March 8 to assist in the evacuation operations of any Indians that might still be in the coastal towns of Libya.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

As part of the effort to ensure the safe and orderly evacuation of Indian nationals from Libya, External Affairs Minister spoke to his Libyan counterpart on March 2. The Libyan Foreign Minister assured the External Affairs Minister that all Libyan authorities concerned would extend every possible assistance for this purpose.

As assured by the External Affairs Minister, the cost towards evacuation of Indians from Libya assisted by Government in their safe and orderly return to India is being met by the Government.

Hon'ble Members are aware of the complicated situation in Libya. The security of Indian nationals and their safe return to India is the Government's foremost priority. Despite considerable logistical challenges the Government has put in place a well coordinated operation 'safe home coming' to bring home our nationals in the quickest and safest manner possible. I hope the House will join me in extending support to all those involved in this operation for the safe return of Indian nationals from Libya. Thank you.

(Ends)

**SHRI V.P.SINGH BADNORE:** We commend the work that you have done. Is there any panic among the Indians who are still there and who are wanting to come from there? Is there any sort of a fear psychosis there? What is it and how soon can you get most of them out? That you have not really specified.

(followed by 2b)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

MKS/PSV/2.40/2B

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** I would like to, through you, Sir, tell the hon. Member that there is, certainly, some anxiety if you are stuck in a place which is undergoing turmoil. But I don't think there is a great deal of panic. For most of the people, there is one person being allocated. The officers allocated him to deal with different groups of people. Lists are available to them. The Embassy in Egypt is doing a commendable job as is the Embassy in Libya. They are coordinating. The people from Benghazi are being taken across the border, by ship, by road, to Alexandria, and, as I said, as of today, we have evacuated 9,209 Indians. We can't put the exact figure on how many people they are and, if estimated, there may be about 16,000 persons. As I said earlier, we hope that we will evacuate them all by the tenth of this month.

**SHRI V.P.SINGH BADNORE:** People are being targeted. Tell us the reasons for their being targeted.

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** No, no; we are not being targeted for any reason. In fact, we are getting cooperation from the Libyan Government, that they have allowed us to use two other stations as well, besides Tripoli, to land our aircraft. They have allowed us to bring ships into Alexandria. And this is in all parts of Libya. So, we are not being targeted. This is a general sense of turmoil there. That is their internal problem. Our people have been working there. And we are committed to bring them back, and, I think, with God's grace, we should be able to bring most of them home safely, and just those who don't want to come back by choice will be left there. Thank you, Sir.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR):** Some more Members want to seek clarifications from you. Let them seek together and you can reply after that.

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** Okay, Sir.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Sudarsana Natchiappan.

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN (TAMIL NADU):** Thank you, Mr. Vice-Chairman.

We are, really, very proud of Dr. Manmohan Singh's Government, Sir, especially the Foreign Minister, Foreign Secretary and the Minister of State, and most specifically the Ambassador, Ms. Mani Magalai, who is there in Libya, and is doing a wonderful job for the past two-and-a-half years because I know her personally that when some people from Sivagangai area were facing the harassment of the local people, 30 persons were repatriated with the help of the Ambassador. Therefore, we know how excellently the Embassy is working. During the recent memory sequences, we find that through the best teamwork they have done it. We are happy that the people are being protected, and that their assets also are being protected.

Now, I would like to pose a question. Is there any convention or agreement with the Government of Libya, be it this Government or a successive Government or any other Government, to protect the moveable and immoveable properties of the citizens of India who are coming out of that country now for the protection of their life? More specifically, their bank accounts and other movables, which are left there as it is, are to be protected, and they have to be transferred to the concerned persons.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Number two, Sir, is: Is there any compensation provision there for the people who are not having such type of income or property, who are losing their livelihood and are coming back to India? The third one, Sir, is regarding the rest of the people who are citizens of India and are living in Libya. They have to withstand all their attacks. Is there any provision made for the protection of those citizens? And in which way is the Government of India dealing with these issues?

(Ends)

**श्री तरुण विजय(उत्तराखंड):** उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, जब काहिरा से भारतीयों को यहाँ लाया गया था तो समाचार आए थे कि एअर इंडिया द्वारा उनसे दोगुना किराया लिया गया है। अभी जो हम लीबिया से भारतीयों को ला रहे हैं, उन्हें राहत दे रहे हैं, उनको मदद दे रहे हैं, मैं इसकी प्रशंसा करता हूँ। यह अच्छी बात है, लेकिन इसके लिए उनको कितना खर्च करना पड़ रहा है और क्या यह खर्च उनको सामान्य दरों पर करना पड़ रहा है या काहिरा की भाँति उनसे भी अतिरिक्त और दोगुना खर्च लिया जा रहा है?

दूसरी बात, वहाँ से अनेक लोगों से इस प्रकार की टिप्पणियाँ मिली हैं कि वे भारत में रह रहे अपने सम्बन्धियों से बात नहीं कर पा रहे हैं और इसमें उनको बहुत दिक्कत हो रही है। तो कम्युनिकेशन या संचार में मदद के रूप में सरकार उनकी क्या सहायता कर रही है?

मेरे ये दोनों बिन्दु हैं कि उनको कितना खर्च करना पड़ रहा है और संचार की क्या सुविधाएँ उनको दी जा रही हैं।

(समाप्त)

(2सी/डी0एस0 पर आगे)

2c/2.45/TMV-DS

**श्री नरेन्द्र कुमार कश्यप (उत्तर प्रदेश):** मान्यवर, सदन की यह जिज्ञासा है कि लीबिया में फँसे हुए व्यक्तियों की संख्या का सही आकलन क्या है? माननीय मंत्री जी ने तकरीबन 15 हजार

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

लोगों का एक आंकड़ा प्रस्तुत किया है और कुछ लोगों ने वहीं पर रहने की इच्छा व्यक्त की है। मान्यवर, मेरी दो जिज्ञासाएँ हैं। एक तो माननीय मंत्री जी इस बात को स्पष्ट करें कि लीबिया में रहने वाले भारतीयों की वास्तविक संख्या क्या है? दूसरा यह कि उस संख्या में से कितने लोग ऐसे हैं, जो लीबिया में रहना चाहते हैं और कितने लोग ऐसे हैं, जो भारत में लौटना चाहते हैं? मेरी निजी जानकारी यह है कि लीबिया में हजारों लोग माननीय मंत्री जी के स्टेट, पंजाब से हैं। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह भी जानना चाहता हूँ कि पंजाब से कितने लोग लीबिया में रह रहे हैं और वहाँ फँसे हैं तथा वहाँ से आने वालों की संख्या क्या है? कृपया यह स्पष्ट कर दें। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM (ANDHRA PRADESH):** Sir, I also join my colleague, Shri Natchiappan, in congratulating the hon. Minister, her team, the Foreign Secretary and the embassy officials for coordinating their efforts and relieving those people of their psychological pain. I would like to know from the hon. Minister, apart from Punjab, what the break-up of people State-wise is. These people are normally working in the service sector. What is the rehabilitation programme? It is not because of their fault that they are coming back. It is because of certain happenings there. What is the mechanism for rehabilitation and taking care of their livelihood back home?

(Ends)

**SHRI N. K. SINGH (BIHAR):** Sir, yesterday, I have, through a Special Mention, drawn the attention of the Minister of External Affairs to this issue. Considering the volatility and uncertain situation in the Middle East, has the Ministry of External Affairs drawn any strategy paper on the likely contingent effect of what is

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

happening in Libya on other countries, both from the point of view of the burden it might cast on the evacuation, and more importantly on the volatility of oil prices?

How will it really affect our overall economic strategy?

(Ends)

**श्री राम कृपाल यादव (बिहार):** सर, देश के अन्य भागों में लीबिया से बड़े पैमाने पर लोग आये हैं, जैसा कि माननीय मंत्री जी ने अपने वक्तव्य में बताया। सर, मेरे प्रदेश, बिहार के लोग भी बड़ी तादाद में वहाँ रह रहे हैं और अपनी जीविका का उपार्जन कर रहे हैं। पिछले कुछ दिनों में मैंने देखा है कि बिहार में भी कई लोग वहाँ से आये हैं। वे सब मजदूर तबके के लोग हैं। मैं समझता हूँ कि वहाँ से आने के बाद, जो काम वहाँ करके वे अपना रोजी-रोजगार चला रहे थे...

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री तारिक अनवर):** आपका क्लैरिफिकेशन क्या है?

**श्री राम कृपाल यादव:** हम वही जानना चाहते हैं।

**उपसभाध्यक्ष:** आप क्या जानना चाहते हैं?

**श्री राम कृपाल यादव:** जो लोग वहाँ से यहाँ आ गये हैं, जो मजदूर क्लास के हैं, वहाँ से आने के बाद बिल्कुल बेरोजगार पड़े हुए हैं। इन गरीब तबके के लोगों की व्यवस्था के लिए, खास तौर पर मैं अपने प्रदेश, बिहार के बारे में ध्यान आकर्षित कराना चाहता हूँ कि क्या उनके सेटलमेंट के लिए सरकार कोई व्यवस्था करेगी? क्या सरकार उनको किसी तरह का मुआवजा देगी या फिर उनको नौकरी देने की व्यवस्था करेगी, ताकि उनकी रोजी-रोटी चल सके? अभी समाचारपत्रों में यह खबर आयी है कि कई लोग ऐसे हैं, जो यहाँ नहीं आ सके हैं और उनके परिवार के लोग बड़ी परेशानी की हालत में हैं। क्या सरकार उनके बारे में पता करने की कोई व्यवस्था करेगी?

(समाप्त)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY (TAMIL NADU):** Thank you, Sir. While appreciating the sincere efforts made by the Union Government and the Ministry for bringing back our people, I would like to express my deep concern over the delay. When China claims that it has evacuated its people 100 per cent and small countries like Philippines have evacuated their people, our people are being deprived of their basic amenities. While we express our deep concern, we would like to know the reasons for the delay and request to see to it that all the Indians are brought back immediately. Thank you.

(Ends)

(Followed by 2D/VK)

VK-NB/2D/2.50

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE (KERALA ):** Sir, I raised this issue during Zero Hour today. According to the information given to me, the Government of Libya has already given an ultimatum to evacuate all foreign nationals on or before 7<sup>th</sup> March, 2011, that is, coming Monday. What is the status now? How many people have been evacuated till now? How many flights have you used for evacuation purpose? How many flights were of Air India and how many were of private airlines?

Secondly, as for Sebha Airport, we are not operating any flight now. Nearly 2,000 people are trapped at Jufra and Sebha, which is 700 kilometres away from Tripoli. It is very difficult to reach the Tripoli Airport because it is very dangerous to travel by road. I would like to know whether the Ministry or the Embassy have sought landing permission of Indian aircraft at Sebha Airport. I would also like to know whether any evacuation process has started from Sebha.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Sirt is 500 kilometres away from Tripoli. Around 1,500 Indians are trapped in Sirt. It is very difficult to reach Tripoli. There is a seaport in Sirt. What are the steps taken by the Government of India to evacuate the Indian people from these places?

Then the fourth place is Kufrah in western region, where 900 people are trapped. Out of that, 500 have already been shifted to Benghazi. What is the latest position?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR):** Please conclude.

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** Sir, it is a very important issue. I have raised this issue in Zero Hour today . It is a very important issue connected with the lives of several Malayalees and Indians. Please permit me.

I would also like to know whether the Ministry has created any crisis management team. I would also like to know whether the officials are sufficient to handle all these things. I have got several mails mentioning that there is no mechanism. They decide it on the basis of first-come-first-served to catch the flights. How many officials have you deployed to handle this issue in Tripoli Embassy? Is there any crisis management team? You have very good experience of handling such a situation during the Gulf crisis. It is an entirely different situation. The evacuation process is totally unsatisfactory. The people are pleading for their life. Most of them are under house arrest. They have no food and other things. What steps have been taken by the Government to address this issue? Thank you.

(Ends)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास (छत्तीसगढ़)** : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, सबसे पहले तो मैं इस व्यवस्था को धन्यवाद देना चाहूंगा कि इतनी शीघ्रता से माननीय अश्विनी कुमार जी ने हमें इस महत्वपूर्ण विषय के बारे में उत्तर दिला दिया, जिसका आश्वासन उन्होंने आज सुबह दिया था। माननीय मंत्री महोदया ने जिन प्रयासों के बारे में बताया है, उनको सुनकर भी कुछ समाधान होता है। मेरा प्रश्न यह है कि क्या आप यह जानकारी दे सकती हैं कि वहां किसी भी भारतीय व्यक्ति की जीवन-लीला समाप्त नहीं हुई है या वह घायल नहीं हुआ है? आप कह रही हैं कि वहां सभी प्रकार का सहयोग मिल रहा है और कुछ लोग वहां रहना भी चाह रहे हैं। यह कितने आश्चर्य का विषय है कि वहां इतनी भगदड़ मची है, उस देश के सभी प्रांतों से लोग भागे जा रहे हैं। क्या इसका पूर्वानुमान आपके मंत्रालय को नहीं था? यदि था, तो आपने इस विषय में क्या किया?

(समाप्त)

**SHRI S. THANGAVELU (TAMIL NADU)**: Sir, two workers, Murugaiah and Ashok Kumar, from Tirunelveli district of Tamil Nadu, who were employed with the Korean group, have been killed there. I request the Government to provide compensation and employment to the family members of the deceased.

(Ends)

(Followed by 2E)

VK/2E/2.55**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS**

**(SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR)**: Sir, a question was asked whether there was any agreement between India and the Libyan Government. I think it is the host country whose responsibility it is to protect all the assets of the residents in their

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

country, including foreign nationals. We are not aware of any compensation scheme in Libya for the losses incurred during this period of time.

A question was asked as to how many people want to live in Libya and it was also asked as to how many people are from Punjab. It is estimated that about 10 per cent might want to stay there. They are assessing the situation. So far as Punjab is concerned, there were nearly 300 people, mainly in the Benghazi area, working with two companies there. They have been in touch with me specifically throughout these days. They have been through a very difficult time. But they are safe. Whatever little their moveable assets were, they say, have been ransacked. They have all been loaded on the ship at Benghazi, which is going to leave for Alexandria. It will be docking on the 5<sup>th</sup> morning, that is, tomorrow morning, and they should be leaving tomorrow evening.

Our nationals are not required to pay any money for their repatriation. The condition in Libya is still very unsettled, so there is no arrangement regarding the protection of the properties that they are going to leave behind. This will be taken up with whichever Government ensue after this. We hope they will be cooperative and helpful in looking after whatever our citizens have left behind and compensate them accordingly.

Then a question was raised: is there any strategy? What is going to be the fall out of what is happening in the Middle East and oils prices, etc.? We are at the moment assessing the developing situation in the Middle East with close consultations with our Ambassador there. The welfare of our citizens is being monitored. I think we can only take a call on it after the situation improves there.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

The hon. Members wanted to know how many people are there from which parts of the country. As I said, there were nearly 300 people from Punjab. There are people from Kashmir, Kerala, Orissa and Bihar. There were some labourers from Bihar who had gone there. We, so far, have not compiled State-wise figures. As soon as we do that, I am sure, the Minister of External Affairs will inform the House.

The hon. Member wanted to know about the resettlement of Bihar labourers who have come back. Since they all went there privately and were working with private firms and companies, on humanitarian grounds, whatever the Government can do, it will take a look at it. We would also request your State Government to see how they can help in looking after these labourers.

(Contd. By 2F/RG)

MP-RG/2F/3.00

**श्रीमती परनीत कौर (क्रमागत)** : इन्होंने बिहारियों की बात की थी, हम सब भी हिंदुस्तानी हैं।  
...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री राम कृपाल यादव** : बिहारी नहीं, हिंदुस्तानी कहिए।

**श्रीमती परनीत कौर** : हिंदुस्तानी तो वे हैं। उन्होंने ही बिहार की बात की थी, इसीलिए मैं बात कर रही हूँ।

As far as arrangements that have been made to Indian Embassies, our Embassies in Tripoli, Cairo and Tunisia, they have all been strengthened with additional staff from various neighbouring Embassies. As I said, -- I spoke with the officials -- they are at the border between Benghazi and Egypt. They have already put in place five or six officials who are facilitating the people. Some of

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

them have gone by road, and the others have crossed over. So, whatever is possible is being done. And, in Embassies, where there are no officers, they have put responsible citizens as nodal officers...

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** How many officers have been deputed to Tripoli, specifically?

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** I don't have the exact figure...(Interruptions)

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** You are dealing with a major crisis in Libya, and as the Minister, you should know how many people are working there.

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** I am sorry for that. I will give you the number...(Interruptions)

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** You are taking this issue lightly.

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** We are not taking it lightly. I have just got the number. There are 12 officials in Tripoli.

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** My question is: What is the additional number of people who have been deputed to deal with this issue?

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** The additional staff are assisting the officers from Cairo...(Interruptions)

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** But how many of them are there? Sir, I seek your protection. People are crying for their lives there. I want to know how many people are there to facilitate the people in this time of crisis.

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** There are 12 people stationed at Sehba, which is on the border of Egypt.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** I want to know how many officers have been deputed at the Tripoli Embassy to deal with this crisis. That is the specific query.

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** There are 12 officers in Tripoli.

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** How many additional officers are there?

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** The additional officers are not there in Tripoli; they are in Egypt and Tunisia. And, from other Embassies, they have pooled in people to man the border and to facilitate our people going across the border...(Interruptions)

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** This is a very serious issue...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR):** I think she has replied.

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** She has not replied. The External Affairs Ministry has not deputed a single, additional person to Libya. They have deputed people to Egypt and Tunisia. That is okay.

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** People are crossing over the border at Egypt and Tunisia. So, there have been people from the Embassy of Cairo put at the border to facilitate these people. It means that they are helping the people from Libya going across, and there are seven in the Mission in Libya. I said that there are 12 people. So, if you want to know the additional numbers, there are five people, in addition, in Libya itself and seven people more who have been sent to Tripoli, where in addition to these twelve people, there are seven more who have gone there to Tripoli itself.

Then, another clarification, that was sought, as to whether there was an apprehension that 7<sup>th</sup> March was the cut-off date. There is no such cut-off date

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

given by them, allowing us to evacuate our people. We hope that by 10<sup>th</sup> March, we would have evacuated everyone from there. There was a question raised as to why China has taken out their people quicker than us, that there have not been so much delay. I would like to say that China has really not published any official statement regarding the number of people evacuated from there. And, to the best of our understanding, Philippines has not evacuated its nationals as yet. Our nationals at Kufra have been escorted, and, I think, at the moment, there is not a single Indian that is left in Kufra. And, from Sehba, as of today, we are planning to airlift 2,000 people. Permissions are there in hand. The Air India Flight — it is at Jeddah -- will operate its first flight today.

(Continued by 2G)

2g/3.05/ks

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR (contd.):** Sir, there was another question about how many have been hurt and how many have died during this crisis. We have had two accidental deaths during road travel between Tobruk and the Egyptian border. This was two weeks ago. Assistance had been provided by the Government. There has been none who has been hurt in the evacuation. But, yes, there have been these two accidental deaths in the road travel two weeks ago.

I think, Sir, I have covered everything. If there is anything else, I am ready to respond.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR):** Thank you.

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** What is the position of Indians... (Interruptions)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR):** This is not a discussion.

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE:** It is the question of the life of our people. What is the position of the Indians in... (Interruptions) ...I want to know. What is the position of Indians in....., that is, 500 kilometres away from Tripoli? Have any arrangements been made for them?

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** Sir, arrangements have been made for every single Indian who is living there. (Interruptions) I am just giving you the ground realities. If you like, Sir, I would have it put down on a piece of paper with all the facts and figures and you could have it.

**SHRI TARUN VIJAY:** Sir, we must record our appreciation for the good work that the Ministry of External Affairs has done in helping Indians living in Libya.

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** Thank you very much. (Ends)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Now, we shall take up Private Members' resolution. Shri N.K. Singh.

**PRIVATE MEMBERS' BUSINESS**

**RESOLUTION RE: REDEFINING CONTOURS OF FOOD SECURITY  
PROPOSALS AND RESTRUCTURING PROPOSED 'FOOD SECURITY BILL' AS  
'FOOD AND SOCIAL SECURITY BILL'**

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (BIHAR):** Sir, I move the following Resolution:-

“This House resolves to redefine the contours of the food security proposals to include minimum entitlements for health and education consistent with human dignity and to restructure the proposed Food Security Bill as the 'Food and Social Security Bill'.”

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

The current debate on food security neither fully addresses food nor security. There are two directions that the proposed Bill could take to strengthen Food Security: one, to look at the structural roots of agriculture and, the other, to focus on enhancing food production. We will need to address this sooner rather than later. I have no doubt that these will be important macro concerns.

Therefore, Sir, while I would like to mention some important considerations about food, I would like to concentrate more on security which is involved. Security at the national level does not automatically translate into food security at the household level: presence of food does not mean that it can be afforded by all people.

However, on the first part of my intervention, which is on food security, we have reasons to worry. India has the same climate worries as any region, if not more, given the dependence on the monsoon and its vulnerability to global climate change issues as well as regional issues like aerosol pollution. Secondly, the likely impact of ground-level ozone, which is expected to have an adverse impact on crop yields. Ozone's impact on crop yields is now well documented for decades.

(contd. on 2h/kgg)

kgg/2h/3.10

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD.):** Thirdly, the food price inflation is a sign, no doubt, among others, of production constraints, and look at the most likely culprit; both are systemic. Land's productivity is plateauing or declining after the green revolution bump. Structural reasons include land tenure system and limited

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

incentives it creates for either investment or willing consolidation to efficient scale, but also depletion of ecosystem services that requires public action, not just private action which needs to be addressed.

The supply chain remains weak and bloated even after the infrastructure programmes like Bharat Nirman and the agricultural reforms at national and state level. Again, this has structural roots. This time, it is in India's federal structure and the disjunct between district administration and rural political leadership. Basically, there are too many cooks involved in rural infrastructure; not enough sheds, not enough accountability, not enough specific deliverables.

So even if the funds that are allocated--and they always are—they do not turn up into actual infrastructure improvements and changes are necessary. Imports can make up some of the difference, Sir, but in some ways, this is also a sign of vulnerability. Because, given India's relative water endowment, these imports are likely to be more expensive in coming years, and in any case extensive 'outsourcing' of India's agriculture is inappropriate for a size of country, like India, given its security and other vulnerabilities.

In spite of this very basic and ever-tightening Budget constraints, we are attempting to guarantee food security and we have set out to reform the ailing Public Distribution System. And that too we attempt to do by only scratching the surface and not delving deep into it. I will deal with the affirmatives of the public distribution system.

The public distribution system with its limited goals is a huge burden on the exchequer without delivering the desired results. According to the Performance

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Evaluation Report of the Planning Commission of 2003-04, out of an estimated Budgetary consumer subsidy of Rs. 7,258 crore—and this is for only 16 States—as much as Rs. 4,197 crore did not reach the BPL households. Around Rs. 2,640 crore of the Central subsidy never reached any consumer--BPL or APL. But that seemed to have got siphoned off in the supply chain of the targeted public distribution system.

The beneficiaries will have to collect their entitlements from their fair price shops. The public distribution system has 4.99 lakh fair price shops all over country. The 2005 Planning Commission report suggest that they do not work for more than 2 or 3 days in a month, and the card holders are not allowed to lift their quota of previous months, or in instalments. And, the poor, Sir, do not always have the cash to buy 35 kgs. at a time and are not permitted to do so in instalments.

Taking all these, Sir, into account and all the inefficiencies in the public distribution system, it is shockingly found that the Government spends Rs. 3.65 to just transfer Re.1 to the intended beneficiary. This is the shocking ratio, Sir, which is really brought to light by the Planning Commission's latest evaluation report. Sir, as we try to see that this crippled system work, the debate is limited unfortunately to which grain—if you look at the entire debate, the current debate, Sir, on the proposed Food Security Bill, the entire debate seems to be limited to which grains, what entitlement, what prices and for whom. But, Sir, we are constantly ignoring the supply side challenges which need to be addressed.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

What are the challenges? Challenge number one is we still have to deal with small, fragmented holdings. How to move from that to a more efficient scale in a socially just, politically sustainable manner? This has many issues embedded in it. About land titling, let us get serious about it. We must begin to start integration into the formal economy, the surrounding land, its aggregation and rental improvements. We need to invest in rural roads and rural IT far more than we have done so far. We need to connect rural areas to centres of economic activity and good things and virtual circles will begin to happen. If we cannot do something more comprehensive, we need the focus in order to ensure implementation, transportation and communication that are arguably the best place to start because they change the economic geography dramatically.

(Contd. by tdb/2j)

TDB/2J/3.15

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD.):** Challenge 2, Sir, increase the flexibility of farmers who should be at the centre of the system of food production to respond to ecological and to market signals. How will this happen? Remove credit constraints that bind farmers into relationships around the supply of inputs, trading of produce, etc. We need to remove infrastructure monopolies in storage and processing. I am glad, Sir, the hon. Finance Minister in his last Budget Speech and in the previous Budget Speech has made some forward movement in that to enable smaller entrepreneurs to enter, bound into supply chains and into relationships. Episodically, Sir, this is just an instance of how supply and transportation chain inhibits farmers' choice; the farmers in Himachal know that

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

apple on account of global warming and climate change is, perhaps, not the most preferable crop. They would like to move into cherries. But, they cannot move into cherries because the transport union, local monopolists in transport, to aggregate loads which are suitable for apples but not cherries. So, farmers cannot adapt to climate change even though they know what needs to be done and how much less to do of the other things. So, the deeper question is, Sir, whether "Food Security" is actual security. I, therefore, now need to talk a little bit about security. We should not forget that the food security law, which is proposed, is not a panacea for a credible social safety net. And here I come to the second part of my intervention, Sir, which is, the problem is that we are choosing to ignore that the proposed Food Security Act which is both necessary and a step in the right direction for achieving economic inclusion. And, there is no denying the fact that guaranteeing food is crucial to fighting hunger and hence the core among our development priorities. However, Sir, a narrow view of food security; i.e., cheap food grains for the poor would not help us in addressing the issue of endemic poverty, disease and malnutrition.

In fact, Sir, the definition of food security itself has undergone fundamental change in terms of the scope to include other variables like drinking water, health, sanitation and education, etc. The broader definition of food security, Sir, is also in conformity with the United Nations Charter on Human Rights. Therefore, Sir, it is imperative that the real meaning of food security is not lost sight of while enacting the proposed historic legislation to which both the hon. Prime Minister

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

and the Finance Minister alluded in the intervention during this Session itself. The Food Security Act by its very nomenclature will have to have food at its core, but other social services must be brought within the purview of the proposed Act to make it a meaningful tool for social development.

Sir, the World Health Organisation has redefined food security under three important pillars. The first pillar is, food availability i.e. sufficient quantities of food available on a consistent basis. Second, food access which implies having sufficient resources to obtain appropriate food for a nutritious diet. Third, food use, which involves appropriate use based on knowledge of basic nutrition and care, as well as adequate water and sanitation.

Sir, everybody knows and it is well-established that there is a very close nexus between food, hunger and poverty. Between 1950-51 and 2006-07, the production of food grains in this country increased at an average annual rate of 2.5 per cent compared to the growth of population which averaged 2.1 percent during this very period. There is incontrovertible evidence suggesting a nexus between food, hunger and poverty. And eradicating hunger and poverty requires an understanding of the way in which these are interconnected. It is a vicious circle because once hunger and malnutrition sets in, it prevents poor people from escaping from poverty because it diminishes their ability to learn, to work, and to care for themselves and their family members. This limits their access to health, to education and other social services.

(Contd. By 2k-kl)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

KLS/2K-3.20

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD):** This truncation of human development undermines a country's potential for economic development, maybe, for generations to come. Furthermore, India's poor human development records necessitate a holistic view towards "security," with food as one entry point towards solving a more complex challenge. The present human development indicators, for India, as all of us know, Sir, are quite disturbing. India, for instance, ranks a low 119 among 169 countries on the 2010, the most recent one, of the Human Development Index published annually by the UNDP. Over 30 years beginning 1980, India's HDI values have just crept up from 0.3 to 0.5 per cent rather a modest increase. India is a relative laggard, as many other countries have moved faster on the measured indicators, some more rapidly on some non-income ones while others such as China and many south east Asian nations on income indicators. Indians' life expectancy, as you know, is 64.4 years, compared to the world average of 69.3 years. We know, for instance, as far as per capita Income is concerned, the gross national income (GNI) per capita measured on purchasing power parity terms for India was less than a third of the global average of \$3,337 measured in 2008. We know, therefore, strong articulation of a multidimensional view of human poverty; India's policies have been overwhelmingly and unfortunately have confined themselves to income poverty. That has left a vast majority of people very vulnerable; two recent reports by the World Bank and the Asian Development Bank would substantiate this. Take the World Bank Report. The World Bank Report revised criteria of benchmark of extreme poverty is up by 25 cents from \$1

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

per person to \$1.25 per person per, the average of the national poverty lines of the world's 15 poorest countries, that is how they have computed it. The ADB has estimated a slightly higher benchmark of \$1.35 per person per day, based on surveys from 16 Asian countries. When these revised benchmarks of the ADB and the World Bank are used for estimating poverty levels in India, the situation is quite grave and alarming. By using the new poverty line of World Bank, the estimated number of poor in India during 2004-05 was 456 million or 41.6% of the total population. If you use the second poverty line as estimated by ADB, the number of poor in India turned out to be staggering 622 million, which is 54.8% of our total population. These estimates, Sir, as we all know are significantly higher the estimates accepted indicated by the Planning Commission or the estimates on which the Government has made its Plan strategy.

The education indicators also give no reasons for comfort to India. We are far behind the global average curb on school enrolments. But, of course, we must commend that the guaranteed education as a Fundamental Right is a matter of satisfaction to all of us. So, Sir, to break this nexus of poverty and developmental challenges, we have to address a complex set of social security issues and to give Constitutional guarantee to that effect. Poverty curse can't be addressed merely through food entitlements as food insecurity and hunger are an outcome of poverty and not the cause of poverty. The Indian Constitution in article 41 requires that the State should, within the limits of its economic capacity, make effective provision for securing the right to work, to education and to public assistance in case of unemployment, old age, sickness and disability. Article 42 requires of the

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Constitution requires that the State should make provision for securing just and humane conditions of work and for maternity relief. Similarly, article 47 enjoins upon the State to raise the level of nutrition and the standard of living of its people and improvement of public health as among the primary duties of the State. The obligations cast on the State in the above articles constitute the ingredient which I call, Sir, the Social Security. While we have already implemented The Right to Education and Right to Assured Employment Acts and in the process is the Right to Food.

(Followed by 2L/SSS)

SSS/2L/3.25

**SHRI N. K. SINGH (CONTD.):** But there are some other rights which are yet to be guaranteed and which are central to human welfare like health, like drinking water, like shelter which must therefore, form part of the composite process of a Food and Social Security Act. The desirability of each of these social security measures stems from the fact that food security for long has been seen from the prism of food alone while attention has not been paid to the related components that, directly or indirectly, threaten social security and in turn food security. Therefore, Sir, the right to food security needs to be enlarged to accommodate other more Fundamental Rights, the rights to achieve larger and composite goals of social security. The enlarged food security act, therefore, I plead, Sir, must take into account the Directive Principles of the Constitution forward. Diluting constitutional rights and presenting the watered down mix as a progressive legislation won't serve the larger goal of a new development matrix through a

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

'New Deal' that India awaits. Therefore, Sir, I propose for the consideration of this House and for the consideration of the Government that in the contours of the proposed Bill on food security we need to include seven important ingredients. First, Guaranteed supply of food to all BPL and APL families. In India, poverty is defined not by how many people suffer from poverty, but how many Government and how much Government is willing to pay for and hence the endless search constantly for a lower BPL figure. The clash between Governments on the issue of number of people to be brought within the ambit of the proposed legislation as we all know delayed proposed Food Security Bill. In the mean time, all three officially-appointed committees have turned up, we know, Sir, with varying estimates of poverty but all of them much higher than the estimates accepted by the Planning Commission. Therefore, Sir, why tag 'food security' to a Bill that will only make it more legitimate where the opposite is more true? In the absence of a methodology on poverty numbers which is acceptable to all and on which there is a national consensus, the best possible way would be to guarantee food both to APL and BPL families, so universal, yet perhaps a differential and differentiated pricing mechanism; universal in reach to do away with the ambiguity in poverty numbers and differential in pricing to keep the subsidy burden perhaps under check. How can we call something 'right' if everybody deserving does not get that right? Secondly, we need to be realistic and move towards a new definition of poverty on the identification of beneficiaries. In India, till recently, the official poverty lines in use were based unfortunately, on merely per capita consumption levels, which in 1973-74, were associated with commodity

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

bundle that yielded a specific number of calories which was then thought to be appropriate for rural and urban areas respectively. However, Sir, the new method of estimating poverty put forward by the Tendulkar Committee and unfortunately, adopted even by the Planning Commission adds education and health spending to poverty estimation numbers. The committee puts the number of poor in India, therefore, at 37 percent of our population. The expert group has taken a conscious decision to move away from anchoring poverty lines to a calorie intake norm in view of the fact that calorie consumption calculated by converting the consumed quantities in the last 30 days, recall of the NSS has not been found to be well correlated with the nutritional outcomes. The original link of calories was broken over time, mainly because consumption patterns have also changed dramatically from 1973- 74. The 2010 United Nations Development Programme Human Development Report introduces the concept of a Multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI). It is a new international measure of poverty now being widely accepted which complements the income poverty measures by reflecting acute deprivations that people face at the same time. Ten indicators namely nutrition, child mortality, years of schooling, children enrolled, cooking fuel, toilet, water, electricity, floor and assets cut across three dimensions- education, health, and living standards which are focussed in the new index of poverty which is now being internationally more and more accepted.

(Contd. By NBR/2M)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

-SSS/NBR-SCH/2M/3.30

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD.):** The Government should, therefore, Sir, enlarge its definition of 'poor' along these lines, so that poverty is not defined as lack of income but as lack of opportunities. Currently, about 645 million people or 55 per cent of India's population would be poor if measured under the revised index of multi-dimensional poverty indication.

The third one, I plead, of course, is for an improved delivery system. I plead for Conditional Cash Transfer. Fortunately on which the Government has now made a very commendable beginning and I wish compliment the Government. On that commendable beginning, we began this in Bihar quite sometime ago with very favourable results and people are increasingly calling the Bihar model as the 'Nitishnomics' which began to work in multiple ways in Bihar about which now people are becoming increasingly aware of. This Conditional Cash Transfer entails benefits of needy on fulfilment of certain criteria by them, generally related to children's healthcare and education, such as sending their children to school and getting their children immunised. The Brazil's Conditional Cash Transfer Scheme which we have talked about called the 'Bolsa Familia' has been a huge success. It has begun to pinpoint the political campaigning in the country. The program requires 85 per cent school attendance for school-age children, updated immunisation cards for children up to six years old and regular visits to health centres for breast feeding or pregnant women. Brazil, Sir, by adopting this, Gini Coefficient, which measures the income inequality, has made a substantial progress. The Gini Coefficient has improved substantially from 0.58 to

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

0.52 since 2003 when the program was expanded to cover a large number of households amounting to 12.4 million. About one sixth of Brazil's poor has immediately got wiped out in the few years in which this particular anti-poverty programme has been in operation and its costs are dramatically lower than the other kinds of anti-poverty benefits. Similarly, Sir, schemes in Bangladesh, Pakistan and Cambodia have succeeded in increasing enrolment number of girls in schools.

A World Bank Policy Research Paper titled, 'Conditional Cash Transfers: Reducing present and future poverty' also documented reduced child labour among the Conditional Cash Transfer beneficiaries. Other examples, apart from Brazil, are Cambodia, Ecuador, Mexico and Nicaragua to mention a few.

Nancy Birdsall, the President of the Centre for Global Development was famously quoted in *The New York Times* in January 2004, and I quote, "I think these programs are as close as you can get to a magic bullet in development. They are creating an incentive for families to invest in the future of their own children." Instead of transferring cash, transferring food coupons, which were tried very successfully in Bihar, could also be explored. Food coupons and currency in coupons which we are trying in Bihar also very successfully are pieces of secured paper or electronic cards now-a-days issued for the purchase of a fairly wide range of specified products. Consumers are usually free to use food stamps to buy any quantity --up to the limit set up for them -- of food they wish at market prices from any store that is convenient to them. While authorized

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

stores may also sell non-food products, food stamps cannot be used to purchase non-food items such as soap, toiletries, household paper or foods or medicines.

Some authors in India have argued that fake coupons will soon dominate distribution and will be bought and sold freely. However, they fail to see the solutions that technology now offers to make them non-transferable and to really have an exceedingly sophisticated mechanism which can be copied. The coupons and stamps can be built to be technologically superior and encrypted for identification. They can be swiped at the point of sale so that identity of the beneficiaries can be ascertained. They can also, of course, as proposed by the Government, be linked to the Unique Identification Cards that are going to be issued, hopefully, to all citizens in this India.

Since coupons can be redeemed at normal grocery stores, they can eliminate the need of Fair Price Shops which have become increasingly unviable due to shrinking margins and rising operating costs. Technologically superior coupons will also help monitor the system and will result in fewer leakages. Coupons will give more flexibility to beneficiaries, enlarge the bouquet of choice in choosing what items of food and what quantities they want to buy at a particular point of time.

All Chambers of Commerce, trade and everyone which have studied this kind of PDS programme have supported the high built adoption of a Conditional Cash Transfer at food coupons. It has suggested that Food Coupons should be exchanged of adults working for developmental activities in the village communities.

(CONTD. BY USY "2N")

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

-NBR-USY/2N/3.35

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD.):** Since coupons can be redeemed at normal grocery stores, they can eliminate the need of fair price shops which have become unviable due to shrinking margins and rising operating costs. Technologically superior coupons will also help monitor the system and will result in lower leakages. Coupons will give more flexibility beneficiaries and a larger bouquet of choice in choosing what items of food and what quantities they want to buy at a particular point of time.

All Chambers of Commerce, trade, and everyone, who has studied this kind of PDS programme, has supported the hybrid adoption of a conditional cash transfer and food coupons. It has suggested that food coupons should be exchange of adult working for developmental activities in their village communities.

The fourth important ingredient is right to water and sanitation. Without sanitation and health facilities, will the people of India be able to enjoy a life of dignity only by ensuring minimum food intake? Indians lose more lives on account of unsafe drinking water and related health hazards than any other known epidemic. But, these figures have gone unnoticed and remained unaddressed. In July, 2010, the General Assembly of the United Nations passed a resolution recognising 'the right to safe and clean drinking water and sanitation' as a human right. In India, unfortunately, there is no explicit right to water in the Constitution or in law. The right to water, as a fundamental right, is established by judicial pronouncements and interpretations even in the Indian context, especially of

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Article 21, which defines the Right to Life. It is important that the right, as recognized by the United Nations' Charter, should include the right to 'clean' water. In the Indian context, while adequate quantity of water is not available to millions, even where adequate quantity of water is available the quality remains a serious problem, with bacterial and other contaminations. Believe it or not, Sir, close to 217,000 habitations in the country are affected with excess iron, fluoride, salinity, nitrate and arsenic in water.

India has, unfortunately, the lowest sanitation coverage in terms of population coverage. Given the target for reducing the proportion of the households having no access to improved sanitation to 38 per cent by 2015, according to the Millennium Development goals, the proportion of households without any toilet facility has declined from 70 per cent in 1992-93 to 51 per cent in 2007-08. The rural-urban gap, in access and use of sanitation facility, continues to be very high. Sixty-six per cent of the rural households do not have toilet facilities, against 19 per cent of urban households, as per statistics available for 2007-08.

Sir, the Water Services Act, 1997, of South Africa shows a way and creates a developmental regulatory framework within which water services can be provided. It establishes water service institutions and defines their roles and responsibilities. It also provides for accessibility of water by domestic users and secures the right of access to basic water supply and basic sanitation, giving effect to the constitutional guarantee. The Free Basic Water Policy sets out the framework for the implementation of free 6,000 litres of safe water, per household,

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

per month. Other neighbouring countries, like, Sri Lanka, Ghana, Kenya and Brazil are also moving towards constitutional guarantees for water and sanitation through increased investments and new national policies.

Fifth, Sir, not surprisingly, is right to health. Health and health care is now being viewed very much within the rights' perspective, and this is reflected in Article 12 of our Constitution, which says, "The Right to highest attainable standards of health". It is also a part of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, adopted by the General Assembly, to which India has acceded. According to the general comment 14 of the Committee for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights states that right to health requires availability, accessibility, acceptability and quality with regard to health care and underlying preconditions of health. The Committee interprets the right to health, as defined in article 12.1, as inclusive right, extending not only to timely and appropriate health care, but also to the underlying determinants of health, such as, access to safe and potable water and adequate sanitation and adequate supply of food, nutrition and housing, healthy occupational and environmental conditions, and access to health-related education and information, including on reproductive health.

(Contd. By 20 – PK)

-USY/PK/20/3.40

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD.):** Sir, the prevalence of child infant mortality in this country has gone down from 125 per thousand in 1990 to 74.6 per thousand live births in 2005-06. Of course, we will not be able to reach the target of 42 by 2015,

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

accepted by the Millenium Development Goals. About 1.5 million children continue to die every year before completing even one year after their birth. India, Sir, is required to reduce its Infant Mortality Rate to 26.7 per thousand live births by 2015, according to the Millenium Development Goals. The trend, unfortunately, since 1990, if continued on this basis, whether India will achieve an Infant Mortality Rate of about 46 by 2015, which is far short of the Millenium Development Goal target.

Sir, now I come to the sixth important ingredient, that is, the right to shelter. The magnitude of housing shortage was estimated by a Technical Group in the context of formulation of the Eleventh Five Year Plan. The estimated housing shortage at the end of the Tenth Plan (2007) was around 24.7 million for 67.4 million households. The Group further estimated that 99% of this shortage and, that is a shame, pertains to the Economically Weaker Sections and the lower income group sectors. In US, President Obama signed recently the Homeless Emergency Assistance and Rapid Transition to Housing (HEARTH) Act into a Public Law in May 2009. The HEARTH Act allows for the prevention of homelessness, rapid re-housing, consolidation of housing programs, and new homeless categories.

In England, Local Councils are legally bound, I repeat, legally bound, to help homeless people find an accommodation. If a person is homeless or is likely to become homeless in the next 28 days, he or she can call the local council for help. Most councils have their own housing option or Homeless Prevention Fund.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Now I come to the seventh ingredient, that is, consolidation of Central Schemes and Inter ministerial group for monitoring. The proposed Food and Social Security Bill should not be lost among the plethora of many, many Centrally Sponsored Schemes, quite a few of which have outlived their utility. Given the scope of the proposed Bill that encompasses several Ministries like Food, Health, Rural Development, Water Resources, Consumer Affairs and Public Distribution etc., the best way forward would be to form some kind of a coordinating overarching framework to be able to administer this. The proliferation of the Centrally Sponsored Schemes (CSS), which we know, has been a matter of increasing concern. In a moment of *deja vu*, so to say, the National Development Council (NDC) in its 51<sup>st</sup> Meeting held in 2005 passed a Resolution directing the Planning Commission for setting up of an Expert Group for restructuring the Centrally Sponsored Schemes (CSS). But, the number of Centrally Sponsored Schemes has only grown over time. After the Group was set up, they have gone up from what they were, that is, 90 to 139 Centrally Sponsored Schemes, which are currently in operation. Sir, therefore, a composite policy framework with the above ingredients becomes imperative for India for the following reasons. First, to overcome the challenges of food security, without losing sight of the broad definition and components of food security that has come to be accepted all over the world. Second, the inter-relationship between food and social security can't be ignored and any effort of guaranteeing one without the other will render food security ineffective. Third, food grains alone

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

will not improve our human development indicators unless accompanied by nutrition, clean water and access to health care. Fourth, a holistic view on food and social security will be in line with the Directive Principles of State Policy enshrined in our Constitution by the founding fathers. Fifth, a composite food and social security legislation will satisfy our goals of inclusive development and will make the vast population a resource for the future development of India.

(Contd. by 2P/PB)

PB/2p/3.45

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD.):** Sixth, because ensuring access to foodgrains can't compensate for the absence of the trickle down effect of economic growth, widening regional divide, poor delivery system and abysmal levels of hunger and poverty. Hunger, Sir, can be tackled by foodgrains but human development remains a far cry.

Seventh, Sir, the nomenclature and methodology for the computation of the poverty numbers should be restructured by taking into account the new widely-accepted multi-dimensional approach of estimating poverty.

There is an inescapable necessity to guarantee social security to the vast majority of population to allow them to take advantage of the robust economic growth which we have experienced in the recent decade. I would urge the Government to accept this Resolution in the hope and belief that based on best international practice and given the enormous implications it has on the future and even the present generation, we need to move away from the traditional methods of addressing poverty and food security.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

I earnestly believe and hope that Government rises to this challenge of our time and enlarges the food security debate to include the components of human dignity necessary for the reasons and in the context pleaded by me.

In view of the aforesaid, Sir, I move this Resolution to redefine the contours of the food security proposals to include minimum entitlements for health and education consistent with human dignity and to restructure the proposed Food Security Bill as the 'Food and Social Security Bill.'

I plead for the acceptance of this House and the acceptance of this Government of this important Resolution for the reasons, Sir, which I have outlined. Thank you very much, Sir, for having given me this opportunity.

(Ends)

***The question was proposed***

**SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (NOMINATED):** Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I rise in my capacity as a Private Member of this House to thank my friend opposite, Shri N.K. Singh, for having brought to the attention of this almost empty House -- in the absence of all the Ministers directly concerned, except, perhaps, for the Minister for Food here -- issues which are of concern to the unsuccessful Indians.

Most of the time, Mr. Vice-Chairman, this House considers the problems of the successful Indians, of those Indians who happen to find themselves on the trajectory of fast and accelerating growth that has been so characteristic of the economic performance of the last few years. What gets neglected in the House very often during Government business is the problems of all those who are either

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

not on that trajectory of high growth at all or who have fallen off that trajectory of growth owing to the alternative forces that are drivers of this high economic growth. The consequence, Sir, is that back in the year 2007, a Report was tabled in Parliament in both Houses. It was authored by the Committee chaired by Arjun Sengupta who was a Member of this House in which it was pointed out that there is something inaccurate, I would say something obscene, about having a single arbitrarily-drawn National Poverty Line. Why? It is because where that line is drawn depends less on the poverty of the people than on the poverty of the Government for the Government decides what is the quantity of resources they are willing to hand over to the unsuccessful Indians and it tailors the number of poor to that figure, or, for purely politically reasons, decides that by changing the basis on which poverty will be measured. Suddenly we found, for example, at the beginning of this decade that the previous Government, i.e., not the UPI-I but the NDA, slashed poverty in India by 9 per cent in one stroke simply by changing the question asked in the National Sample Survey from 'what did you eat last week?' to 'what did you eat last month?'.

(Contd. by 2q/SKC)

2q/3.50/skc

**SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (contd.):** These games have been going on with the single most important problem of India, which is not the promotion of prosperity, but the removal of poverty. In consequence, we are told at the end of the 20<sup>th</sup> century that about 35 per cent of the people of India are poor. We are told at the dawn of the millennium that 26 per cent of our people are poor. Then,

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

we are informed at the beginning of the second decade of the millennium that in fact, 37 per cent of our people are poor. We then have alternative measures of poverty, which indicate that 41 per cent of our people are poor, as Shri N.K. Singh just now cited. We also have other figures which indicate that 54 per cent of our people are poor. We have the Arjun Sengupta Committee Report which defines those who are suffering from poverty as not just the poor but also those who are vulnerable, for those who are vulnerable are vulnerable precisely because the least mishap in their livelihood, the least mishap in their health, the least mishap in the circumstances in which they are living, results in their tumbling back below any line which you might describe as the National Poverty Line. Moreover, again, as Shri N.K. Singh pointed out, all the work being done by international academies — I am not sure, by our Planning Commission, but by international academies — would appear to indicate that it is completely misconceived to think of poverty exclusively in terms of either calorific intake or in terms of income poverty. Indeed, income poverty is a completely misused tool in India, for our National Sample Survey does not measure income. What it does is it measures consumption. So, when the Government in India undertakes an obligation, as it did at the beginning of the millennium development decade, to slash income poverty by half in the extreme case, it was an obligation which almost by definition could not be undertaken, for we do not know what the income levels of individuals in India or classes in India or the percentiles of the population are. That work is not being undertaken by the Government. It is being undertaken by the National Council of Applied Economic Research. The National Council of Applied

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Economic Research have categorically stated in their latest book, 'How India Earns, Saves and Spends' that approximately 55 per cent of our national income is not captured in the figures given in income surveys even after extrapolation, and this coincides very, very closely with the figure given by the Global Financial Integrity, which is a think tank led by an Indian but located in Washington. It says that over the period of economic reforms, the unaccounted share of the Indian economy has risen from 27 per cent before the reforms process to about 43 per cent now, which means that about 57 per cent, which is just about the figure of the National Council of Applied Economic Research, is actually captured in what is our income and where does it lie. The rest is unaccounted for. And we know that bulk of what is unaccounted for is unaccounted for on the part of the successful Indian who succeeds in stashing away a lot of his gain in Swiss banks and other tax havens abroad or round-trips it through Mauritius to make black money white inside this country. We know of the kind of concessions that are being extended to those who play the casino on Dalal Street or those who simply wait for property prices to rise, because so much of this black money is going into the real estate. They are the ones who are most benefiting from the high trajectory of growth while several are being thrown off that trajectory and while others have never got on to it.

(Contd. at 2r/hk)

HK/2r/3.55

**SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (CONTD.):** What do I mean, Sir, by having been thrown off it? In the last few years, the share of India's population in

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

agriculture and allied activities has remained at 65 per cent. The share of the population which is in agriculture and allied activities remains at 65 per cent but their share of the GDP has collapsed to 17 per cent. Sixty-five per cent of our people are living on 17 per cent of our GDP and 83 per cent of our GDP is being consumed by the remaining 35 per cent and of that 35 per cent the largest single share is that of the services sector at 57 per cent of our GDP and in that services sector are included all the privileged Indians -- Members of Parliament, Ministers of the Government, who earn salaries, all the Civil Servants, the Armed Forces. But, above all, the IT sector which perhaps accounts for about 40 per cent of our total GDP and does not directly employ more than 6 million people, just possibly 10 million people. Now in these circumstances, the faster we grow, the greater are the accelerating disparities in our economy. India is prospering, but Indians are not and it is precisely because we are not addressing this dilemma that we find according to the latest figure presented by the Home Minister -- there is not 35 and it is not 65, but it is 83 districts of India which are naxalite-affected, and the remaining, approximately 100 districts of India, are partially naxalite-affected. There is a serious dilemma of democracy and development in our country. If we continue on a path which makes India prosperous by keeping a few Indians sleazeball prosperous and ignore what is happening to the bulk of the people of India we are stoking a revolution against our own system. And there does not seem to be an adequate awareness anywhere in this House -- I am not talking about the Treasury Benches alone -- of how serious is this problem. So, I am very very grateful to my friend, Shri N.K. Singh, that he has chosen this afternoon

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

that is devoted to serious business in this Parliament to bring to the attention of the House and the country what are the real problems before us. The real problems are not those that result in the constant closing down of our democracy in this Rajya Sabha. The real problems are the ones that he has mentioned. While he has mentioned the real problems, I am not sure that his finger has yet pointed to the real solutions for what are these real problems in some dimensions other than those that he mentioned. He referred to how the latest UN Human Development Index shows India at position 119 among about 150 countries. One point that he has made in that is, there is a column which shows what is the change since the previous year. And that column exists only because there has been a change in the basis on which they are calculating positions on the Index, and they discovered from that that India's position in 2010 is the same as it was in 2009. Now the position in 2009 was that India was at position 134 on the UN Human Development Index. And if you go back to the first year when this Index was published, that is 1994, the position then of India was also 134.

(Contd. by 2s/KSK)

KSK/4.00/2S

**SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (CONTD):** Between 1994 and 2009, India has improved its position from '134 to 134'. And, when I brought this to the attention of the hon. Minister of Panchayati Raj and Rural Development, I was given the comforting answer that a few years earlier, we had actually fallen to 138, and, therefore, the Government was to be congratulated on having clambered back to position no. 134. Now, over this period, from 1994 to 2009 -- there is a period of

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

15 years -- the approximate increase in money terms, not in real terms, but in nominal terms, of our expenditure in the Central Government, and through the Central Budget, on social sector and anti-poverty programmes was a factor of 15. It had gone up from approximately Rs.7,600 crore in 1994-95 to Rs.135000 crores by 2009-10. The latest Budget, that we have for 2011-12, indicates that our expenditure is of the order of Rs.1,60,000 crore. Its an humongous sum of money. Where was Rs.7600 crore in 1994 and where is Rs.1,60,000 crore in 2011-12? The outlays have increased exponentially, but the outcomes - we were at position 134 in 1994 and we are still at position 134 despite a 15 times increase in outlays, which is now nearer 16 or 17 times. What has gone wrong? My friend, Shri N.K. Singh, pointed to technological possibilities of improving the amount of money reaching the poor. He also pointed to certain systemic or administrative changes that could be made in order to attain that figure. I welcome administrative innovations of the kind that he has suggested. I also think, it is important to underline the technological factors. But, where Shri N.K. Singh has fallen short of Shri Rajiv Gandhi is that he has failed to pinpoint the single most important factor which determines access to entitlements, and that is political and social empowerment. In the absence of political and social empowerment, all these tricks of the trade - the Unique Identity Card, smart cards, cash transfers - are not going to really work. For up to a point, they will, but they will come up against the block of systemic deficiencies that the beneficiaries are not empowered to access their entitlements. Indeed, I would say, at a conceptual level, not only my friend, Shri N.K. Singh, but also several others have got it

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

wrong. Rights are legal rights; entitlements are economic entitlements, and matters like education, health, food, drinking water and sanitation fall more in the realm of entitlements than to be equated with, for instance, the right to be considered innocent until proved guilty. There is a distinction to be made between what are the rights of man, as we have learnt from Tom Paine in the middle of the 18<sup>th</sup> century, to what are entitlements for poverty alleviation which we are only now beginning to learn at the end of the 20<sup>th</sup> century and the early 21<sup>st</sup> century. We have to have access to these entitlements and India has proved, more than any other country in the world, that political empowerment leads to entitlements, access to entitlements, and the combination of empowerment and entitlement leads to enrichment, and that is the story of the successful Indian of post-Independence India.

(continued by 2t – gsp)

GSP-GS-4.05-2T

**SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (CONTD.):** When we became independent, we created a power vacuum by merging all the princely States into India at the same time as we kicked out the colonial authority and brought in democracy. And, the most important legislation of the early days of our democracy was the abolition of Zamindari, various tenancy-related legislation, which effectively removed the old feudal classes and created space for a professional class to take over. And, that *aulaad* of the professional class are the ones who today, by and large, grace Parliament. It is very, very difficult for a *Maharaja* to get elected. It is very difficult

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

for a rich man in India to get elected, which is why most rich Indians in Parliament are in the Rajya Sabha and not in the Lok Sabha.

It is the middle class Indian, the professional, who succeeds in coming in, and, it is this political empowerment of a new professional class of administrators, of businessmen, of lawyers, of teachers, of Doctors that they immediately set about securing their entitlements of what - 'Education'. Where else in the world except in Nehru's India could you get the world's best education at the world's least cost? Don't ask me, Sir. Ask all these 'computer coolies', who have gone to California. They all got their education in IITs at next to no cost, compared to the expenditure, which they would have to incur, if they had the misfortune of being born Americans. They got this world's outstanding education at almost no cost, in consequence of which, there would not be an internet, if there were not IITs.

Equally important is access to medicine. We are all so well off but do you think that what we pay for the CGHS is anything comparable either to the cost of running the CGHS or to the facility that anybody can go into the All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Delhi; the Post Graduate Medical College in Chandigarh; or, JIPMER in Puducherry and get outstanding medical attention for next to no expenditure.

The empowered class of India secured its entitlements and that is why, this empowered class, finding that it was getting its entitlements, was such an avid supporter of 'socialist India'. Who accept 'eccentrics' in our society was against socialism through the 1950s, the 1960s, the 1970s, and, even into the 1980s. Why

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

my friend Mr. N.K. Singh, who is one of the best friends of India's capitalist class was himself a socialist when we were in college together. We were all socialist because this emerging professional class found that the State was on their side in the provision of entitlements at reasonable cost or at next to no cost. And, then, beginning with the 1980s, but in an accelerating manner since 1990s, this enriched middle class of India, combined empowerment and entitlement to secure enrichment, kicked the Nehruvian ladder up which it has risen.

And, that is why, even on our side of this House, it is only fools like me who rush into talk of socialism where the angels fear to fly. Socialism is written into our Constitution. Socialism is written into the Constitution of the Congress Party. But 'socialism' is a word which is almost 'taboo' for this enriched class, which now says, "Now that I have got into power, real power, I want it all for myself". It is why the attention of the nation is so much focused on the successful Indian. It is this successful Indian who wants Commonwealth Games. It is this successful Indian who wants to be known as growing at 8.5 per cent. It is this successful Indian who thinks that he is an ice-cream cone to become the flavour of the month at Davos.

(Contd. by SK-2u)

SK/2U/4.10

**SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (CONTD.):** It is this successful Indian who thinks the country is for himself. How successful is this successful Indian? There was an interview published in the Indian Express of the 7<sup>th</sup> of February 2011, I am talking of just a month ago, on the business page, with a lady called Sutapa

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Banerjee who is described as the head of a wealth management company. She says in that interview that according to the published sources, in the year 2009, a total of 1,26,700 households in India, that is, about half a million people on the assumption of five persons per household, had wealth in the amount of 477 billion dollars. Just think about this, Sir. What more she added is that the growth of the wealth of the richest in India is so fast that by 2012, the expectation is that, the same 1,26,700 households will own a trillion dollars of wealth, a trillion dollars of wealth, in a country where the total national income is about three trillion dollars. The concentration of wealth is so huge that the first one million Indians are richer by far than one million Luxembourgers; where the first ten million Indians are richer probably than the ten million Belgians and about sixty million Indians have a disposable income comparable to the better of German, the better of French and the better of Brits. In consequence of which, in exactly the way in which India was a “सोने की चिड़िया” in the 18<sup>th</sup> Century, which attracted all these foreign mercenaries to turn up in our shores, we had become the month of the bunch in Davos because where else will foreign capital find investment opportunity as they do in India and where else will foreign producers of goods find markets as lucrative as those in India? So, they are coming in. We are proud of the fact that we are going to overtake the Chinese rate of growth during the course of this coming decade and that by the middle of the century, ChinIndia, that is, China and India, together will revert to the position that they obtained in the early 18<sup>th</sup> Century when 25 per cent of the world’s manufacturing was in these two countries. I welcome all that. I welcome it particularly because the combination

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

of high growth and low taxes means that Government's revenues have gone so much that between 1994 and today, expenditure on social sector programmes and anti poverty programmes has risen from 7,600 crores to 1,60,000 crores. Of course, I welcome this, and I am sure every section of the House welcomes this. But what is the result of all this money? Where does this money go? Whom does it benefit? According to the UNHDI, we were at position 134 fifteen years ago when we were spending only 7,600 crores and today we are at position 134. Why should this happen in a situation where our GDP growth rate has grown from the Hindu rate of growth to being the second fastest in the world next only to China? It is because out of the moneys that are reserved for the benefit of the poor -- as a friend of mine said 25 years ago, his name is not much mentioned, I will take it now with your permission, his name was Rajiv Gandhi -- 85 paise in a rupee does not reach the people. He did not mean that 85 paise were stolen by the politicians. He was just not talking of bribery or corruption. He said 85 paise were going into legitimate administrative expenses, leaving 15 paise to be taken partly by corruption and rest to reach the people. Why is it 85 per cent? For the reason that he gave us just now -- the Centrally-sponsored schemes of the Government of India are 139 in number. And, how many delivery mechanisms do we have for these 139 schemes? We have 139 delivery mechanisms for 139 Centrally-sponsored schemes, to the ludicrous level, and I am only giving this because it is a ludicrous example.

(Contd. by ysr — 2W)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

-SK/YSR/4.15/2W

**SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (CONTD.):** Under the Ministry of Rural Development, we have a Department of Drinking Water and Sanitation and another is Department of Rural Development. The Department of Rural Development has a scheme called the Indira Awaas Yojana. The Department of Sanitation and Drinking Water has a scheme called Total Sanitation Campaign (TSC). If you are building a house for the poor, why don't you provide a toilet along with it? This is the sensible thing to do. We say, 'no'. Because toilets are to be built by one department and houses are to be built by another department. We will have one scheme for building rural housing for the poorest of the poor and quite another scheme to enable them to have toilets inside their house. And the two Secretaries who are both reporting to the same Minister say how on earth they can coordinate in Delhi over 'a toilet with a house.' Whereas if you ask them whether they have a toilet in their house, they say, 'yes, of course, but that is because it is not a Government programme.' It is this system of 139 deliveries.

I am delighted to see that my very close friend, Shrimati Purandeswari, is here, because she is in charge of the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan. The Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan funds are largely used for building schools, not entirely but a substantial portion. Oh the Minister himself is here. Very good. I am delighted. I am absolutely delighted that he is here today listening to me rather than explaining the difference between the policy and implementation. He is here. I want to ask him this question. So much of your money is going into building schools. You need labour to build schools. Why not use a labour under the Mahatma Gandhi

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

National Rural Employment Guarantee Programme in the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan?

They are trying that. They are still proposing it. In the meanwhile, the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan has been running for several years. The MNREGA without the 'M' has been running for the last four or five years. We are still to arrive at an agreement as to how a programme run by the Ministry of Rural Development can be coordinated into another programme run by the Ministry of Rural Development! Why are they trying? They are trying because they are not able to arrive at an easy consensus. I too tried in those happy old days when I was a Minister, or, rather those sad old days when I was a Minister, but could not succeed. Those were very sad old days.

Again and again one finds this. The Minister, Prof. Thomas, is here. He is running the PDS. Why can't panchayats handle the PDS? Why can't women self-help groups handle the PDS? Who knows better than a poor man whether the Baniya in the PDS shop is not providing the kerosene that they are entitled to? The more you decentralise, Sir, the less it is a centrally-sponsored scheme. And the more it is a scheme that is run by institutions of local-self government, the greater is the degree of responsiveness.

Rajiv Gandhi said this that if you want a responsive administration, it has to be an administration that is responsible to those who are being administered. And to get a responsible administration, you need a representative one. So, there are three Rs. The need for 'responsiveness' leading to the need for 'responsibility' requiring 'representativeness'. The three Rs were put together by the person who identified 85 paise in the rupee as going into administrative

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

expenses to say that instead of relying on 139 mechanisms to deliver 139 schemes to the same set of beneficiaries why you don't devolve the functions, that is activities related to these functions, to the local bodies.

(Contd. by VKK/2X)

-YSR/VKK-AKG/2x/4.20

**SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (CONTD.):** And along with the devolution of the functions, you devolve the funds and the functionaries who are to work with them on exactly the same pattern. Then, the simultaneous devolution of the 3 Fs will lead to the realisation of the 3 Rs and those two together will provide you the 3 Es of Empowerment, leading to Entitlements, leading to Enrichment and the whole of this country can benefit. Instead, we still are running a *maai baap sarkar*. You want food, come to daddy; you want drinking water, come to mummy; you want education, come to daddy; you want health, come to mummy. So, the *maai baap sarkar* runs. And the *maai* and the *baap* cannot any more provide all this. It has to come from below, for which you require devolution. If I ask the hon. Minister, Mr. Thomas, who is a great friend of mine, to move towards the Panchayat-controlled system of PDS, the Civil Supplies Departments all over the country will rise in revolt. And, they will say, "What about us? What are we to do?" Therefore, we find ourselves at a roadblock. This is why, an empowered sub-committee of National Development Council was set up in the days of NDA under the Minister of Rural Development and then transferred to the Minister of Panchayati Raj as the Chairman of that committee. It submitted its report in June 2008 on how this form of empowerment of local government institutions could take place. That report of

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

the empowered sub-committee is still, even after close to three years have elapsed, to be brought to the attention of the National Development Council. Every attempt was made under the Renuka Vishwanathan Committee to try and modify guidelines of Centrally-sponsored schemes to place the primary responsibility as was the intention of the Constitutional amendments on these institutions of local self-government, to make them look after all the matters that the hon. Member, Shri N.K. Singh, raised like food, health, education, sanitation, drinking water, etc. They all are listed in the Eleventh Schedule of the Constitution. The amendments to the Constitution were moved along with a Statement of Objects and Reasons. The Supreme Court has said that this Statement of Objects and Reasons should be taken into account in interpreting whatever has been written inside the law. Therefore, I would say that we are under a Constitutional obligation to try and deal with these matters which Shri N.K. Singh raised, not only by framing them as rights. I will be quite happy if they are framed as rights and that the word 'security' gets added to it so as to bring the multi-dimensional index of poverty in line with a multi-dimensional strategy for removing poverty in this country which has a huge amount of poverty, howsoever defined. And then, to say that the thrust of our anti-poverty programme will be through the empowerment of locally elected institutions that are responsible through the Gram Sabha to their own electorate. The foundation stone of the 73<sup>rd</sup> Amendment or Part IX of the Constitution is not the Gram Panchayat. It is the Gram Sabha. That is where democracy gets introduced to the people. In our tribal areas, where there is so much disturbance now, we have a very special Act called

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

the Panchayats (Extension to Scheduled Areas) Act, under which the Gram Sabha's empowerment is very specifically laid down, much stronger than any State legislation. And, we find that a package of Rs.1500 crore is separately produced. It is said that it will go to the most badly terrorist affected areas of India. But, there is an argument going on between the Planning Commission and the Home Ministry which is in the public domain as to whether this money should go to the Panchayats or to the bureaucracy, the same bureaucracy which has not been giving it to the poor with the result that there is this revolution.

(Contd. by RSS/2y)

RSS/2Y/4.25

**SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (CONTD.):** And the answer being given is that give it to the same officials who failed to give it so far in the hope that they now will give it. Unless and until all the points raised by Shri N.K.Singh are taken up not only as a matter of legal right, but also as a matter of securing entitlements through empowerment, not as a matter of a benign Government distributing these goodies as public services and goods, will we be able to secure outlays that are some way near commensurate with the outcomes which are some way near commensurate with outlays. There is no relationship as of now in the social sectors and the anti-poverty programmes between outlays and outcomes, and I plead that issues such as those which have been raised by Shri N.K. Singh, be raised as part of the Government business when the House is present in larger numbers than it is today, and the decisions be taken which affect the lives of the unsuccessful Indians, for I believe that the duty of the Government is much more towards the

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

unsuccessful Indian than it is towards the successful Indian. The successful Indian, including Shri N.K.Singh and myself can look after ourselves. The Government must look after those who cannot look after themselves. Gandhiji gave us a Talisman, and with that, I conclude my remark. Gandhiji gave us a Talisman where he said that whenever you are in doubt, summon to your mind the weakest and poorest person you know and ask yourself the question whether what you propose to do will be a benefit to him, and if it is, he said, all your doubts will banish and you will know that you are on the right path. He called this the worship of "daridarnarayana", the worship of God as the poor. If we do not remember that moral imperative, if our attention gets too distracted merely to higher growth and not to the distributive consequences of higher growth, then we are putting not only development but democracy in danger, and therefore, I plead with the Government through the Minister of Food who is present over here that the issues raised by Shri N.K.Singh which partially concern his Ministry, but much more generally concern the Government as a whole, be taken up most seriously by the Government, and irrespective of whether the answer is found through legislation of rights or through administered measures of entitlement that we understand that neither rights nor entitlements will be secured until there is empowerment, and empowerment is available in the lowest institutions of our democracy, which are simply the most important institutions of our democracy, local self government, as mandated by parts 9 and 9A of the sacred Constitution of India. Thank you.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री तारिक अनवर): श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा।

श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा: पिलानिया जी ने बोलना था।

उपसभाध्यक्ष: आपको पिलानिया जी ने टाइम दिया है। हमने उनसे इजाजत ले ली है।

श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा (महाराष्ट्र): धन्यवाद, माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय। सर्वप्रथम मैं आदरणीय डा. ज्ञान प्रकाश पिलानिया जी का धन्यवाद करना चाहूंगा कि उन्होंने मुझे मौका दिया। मैंने मणि शंकर जी को अपना समय दिया और आपने मुझे दिया।

अभी मणि शंकर जी का यहां जो प्रवचन हुआ, उसे सुनकर मेरे मन में ज्ञान का प्रकाश हुआ। मुझे विश्वास है कि इनके इस प्रवचन से सम्पूर्ण सरकार जाग कर खड़ी होगी और उनमें भी वह प्रकाश जाग्रत होगा।

माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, आज हम खाद्य सुरक्षा विधेयक और उससे जुड़े पहलु पर श्री एन.के. सिंह जी द्वारा लाए गए प्रस्ताव पर चर्चा कर रहे हैं। इस प्रस्ताव पर श्री एन.के. सिंह साहब ने बड़े विस्तार से देश की खाद्य सुरक्षा पर अपने विचार अभिव्यक्त किए, जिसके लिए मैं उन्हें हृदय से बधाई देता हूं।

2z-psv पर जारी

-SCH/PSV-MKS/2Z/4.30

श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा(क्रमागत): श्री एन०के० सिंह साहब ने पी०डी०एस० ढाँचे से लेकर वर्तमान में किसानों की समस्याओं को, खाद्य सुरक्षा को सामाजिक सुरक्षा से जोड़ना, बी०पी०एल० तथा ए०पी०एल० परिवारों को अनिवार्य खाद्य आपूर्ति, विश्व खाद्य सुरक्षा, गरीबों तक खाद्य-आपूर्ति की समस्याएँ, पानी और सफाई का अधिकार, स्वास्थ्य का अधिकार, आवास का अधिकार आदि बुनियादी विषयों पर हमारा ध्यान खींचा है।

जब आज हम खाद्य सुरक्षा की बात करते हैं तो हम देश को दो वर्गों में बँटा हुआ पाते हैं। एक वर्ग में वे लोग हैं, जो इंडिया में रहते हैं और जिन्हें पैसा खर्च करने के बहाने ढूँढने पड़ते हैं, विश्व की हर महँगी चीज़ खरीदने के लिए उनके पास किसी चीज़ की कमी नहीं

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

होती तथा अच्छे-से-अच्छे होटलों में रह सकते हैं और खाना खा सकते हैं। वहीं, एक बहुत बड़ा वर्ग है, जो भारत में रहता है और जिसके बारे में अगर मैं दिनकर के शब्दों में कहूँ तो

‘श्वानों को मिलता दूध-भात, भूखे बालक अकुलाते हैं,  
माँ की हड्डी से चिपक ठिठुर, जाड़े की रात बिताते हैं।’

देश का बचपन भूखे, नंगे, बेसहारा, बिना शिक्षा और बिना सर पर छत के गुजर जाता है, जिनके लिए सारे संवैधानिक और मौलिक अधिकार सिर्फ किताबों में लिखी बातें हैं। एक तरफ आईपीएल होते हैं, करोड़ों की टीम खरीदी जाती है तथा अरबों रुपए पानी की तरह बह रहे हैं, वहीं दूसरी तरफ देश में और विदर्भ में किसान आत्महत्या कर रहा है। मेलघाट और आदिवासी इलाकों में malnutrition से बच्चे दम तोड़ रहे हैं।

मैं सरकार से इतना कहना चाहूँगा कि सड़कों पर बिखरे हुए मासूम बचपन को सिर्फ राख मत समझना, इनके अन्दर छिपी हुई चिंगारियों को भी देखो। कहीं ऐसा न हो कि यह चिंगारी भ्रष्टाचार और बेईमानी के महलों को आग लगाने का काम करे। बढ़ती हुई बेरोजगारी और शिक्षित जवानी के हाथ भी सरकार के दरवाजों पर दस्तक देते हुए घयल हो रहे हैं, अगर सही वक्त पर सही कदम नहीं उठाए गए तो हालत और खराब होंगे। गरीबों को रोटी, कपड़ा, मकान और सम्मानजनक जिन्दगी चाहिए न कि आर्थिक आँकड़े। आँकड़ों में हम विकसित देश हैं, लेकिन हमारी एक-तिहाई आबादी भूखे सोती है। करोड़ों लोगों के सर पर छत नहीं है। हमारे मंत्री और नौकरशाह दौरे कर के आते हैं, रिपोर्ट देते हैं और इन्क्लूसिव ग्रोथ की बात करते हैं, आँकड़े भी होते हैं। एनजीओ भी हैं, जो गरीबों और आदिवासियों का इन्टरव्यू लेकर आते हैं और उनकी तस्वीरें तमाम पत्रिकाओं में और अखबारों में प्रथम पृष्ठ पर छप जाती हैं। इन सब लोगों के लिए ये चीजें पिकनिक की तरह होती हैं, लेकिन आम आदमी आश्वासनों का बिछौना लेकर सो जाता है और दिल्ली में हम कहते हैं कि लोग हमारे कार्यक्रमों से खुश हैं। मैं कहना चाहूँगा कि आप दस्ताने पहन कर आग सेंक रहे हैं। गरीब और अमीर का फासला बहुत महँगा हो गया है।

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, गाँवों में और किसानों में अगर कुछ तरक्की होती भी है तो उसे बड़े नकारात्मक ढंग से पेश किया जाता है। हाल ही में आरबीआई के गवर्नर ने कहा है कि गाँव की समृद्धि की वजह से खाद्य-सामग्री के दाम बढ़े हैं तथा गाँव के लोग अच्छा प्रोटीन-युक्त भोजन करने लगे हैं। इस वक्तव्य से ऐसा लगता है कि सिर्फ शहरों के लोगों को ही अच्छा खाने-पीने का अधिकार है और अगर गाँव के लोग अच्छा खाते हैं तो यह एक आर्थिक अपराध है तथा ये लोग खाद्य-असुरक्षा से लेकर खाद्य सामग्री की महँगाई के लिए जिम्मेदार हैं।

(3ए/डीएस पर क्रमशः)

-PSV/DS-TMV/4.35/3a

**श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा (क्रमागत):** यह हमारे आरबीआई के गवर्नर साहब का वक्तव्य है। यह आपूर्ति की समस्या है। यह तो गनीमत मानिए कि आप किसानों को निर्यात नहीं करने दे रहे हैं, वरना दुनिया में खाद्य पदार्थों में 37 प्रतिशत तक की वृद्धि हुई है और भारत का किसान फिर भी घटे हुए दामों पर आपको रोटी दे रहा है और खुद गांव के अंदर आत्महत्या कर रहा है।

इंटरनेशनल फूड पॉलिसी रिसर्च इंस्टिट्यूट द्वारा जारी आंकड़ों के अनुसार ग्लोबल हंगर इंडेक्स में भारत का 67वाँ स्थान है तथा हम इस मामले में चीन से भी बहुत नीचे हैं। हम श्रीलंका, नेपाल और पाकिस्तान से भी नीचे हैं। इस पर हमें विचार करना चाहिए। भारत में योजनाओं की कमी नहीं है। हर मंत्रालय के पास गरीबों से संबंधित योजनाएँ हैं। खाद्य सुरक्षा और आवास आदि के लिए जो मंत्रालय जिम्मेदार हैं, उनके पास भी काफी योजनाएँ हैं। आप पीडीएस को ही लीजिए। इसमें 60 परसेंट तक leakage है। नये बजट में हम एक नयी स्कीम, सब्सिडी के स्थान पर कैश देने की लेकर आये हैं, लेकिन अगर हममें नीति लागू करने की नीयत ही नहीं है, तो कोई भी स्कीम नहीं चलेगी।

### Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

आज Below Poverty Line (BPL) को परिभाषित करने की समस्या है। तमाम मंत्रालयों ने गरीबी को अलग-अलग तरह से परिभाषित कर रखा है। जैसे, ग्रामीण विकास मंत्रालय की अलग परिभाषा है, खाद्य मंत्रालय में पीडीएस के लिए अलग परिभाषा है, वित्त मंत्रालय गरीबी को अलग तरीके से देखता है और प्रदेश सरकारों ने गरीबों को अलग तरीके से परिभाषित कर रखा है। विश्व बैंक और अंतर्राष्ट्रीय मुद्रा कोष, भारत में गरीबी को अलग तरीके से देख रहा है, लेकिन अभी तक हम देश में इसकी सर्वमान्य परिभाषा विकसित नहीं कर पाये हैं। इसके क्या कारण हैं?

ग्लोबल हंगर इंडेक्स के मुताबिक भारत की 22 प्रतिशत आबादी को पर्याप्त भोजन नहीं मिलता, पाँच साल से कम उम्र के 43.5 परसेंट बच्चे underweight हैं और 6.9 परसेंट बच्चे पाँच साल से कम उम्र में मर जाते हैं। इस संदर्भ में सरकार को इन तीनों बिन्दुओं पर सुझाव ही नहीं बल्कि युद्ध स्तर पर लगने की जरूरत है। हमारी 22 प्रतिशत आबादी under nutrition है, जो बहुत ही चिन्ता का विषय है, जबकि सरकार ने इस संबंध में तमाम कार्यक्रम चला रखे हैं और फूड सिक्योरिटी बिल इसी कड़ी का एक हिस्सा है।

माननीय सोनिया गांधी जी खाद्य सुरक्षा को लेकर चिंतित हैं तथा वे इसे अधिकार की तरह देखना चाहती हैं। गरीबी उन्मूलन से लेकर मिड-डे मील तक यूपीए के अनेक कार्यक्रम हैं। इन सभी कार्यक्रमों की सही मॉनिटरिंग नहीं हो रही है। अगर सही तरीके से निगरानी हो, तो गरीबी उन्मूलन में काफी सहायता मिलेगी। जिस प्रकार से भारत सरकार मिड-डे मील के अंदर दो या तीन रुपये देती है, अगर ऐसा अक्षयपात्र धरती पर चलाया जाए, तो इससे स्कूलों में बच्चों की अटेंडेंस बढ़ेगी, उनको सही nutrition मिलेगा और उनकी हालत भी सुधरेगी।

मैं इस बारे में बिहार में नीतीश कुमार सरकार की तारीफ करना चाहूँगा कि उन्होंने केन्द्र सरकार के सारे कार्यक्रम लागू ही नहीं किए हैं, बल्कि वे उनकी निगरानी और कोऑर्डिनेशन भी ठीक तरह से कर रहे हैं, जिसकी वजह से यूपीए सरकार द्वारा लागू योजनाएँ धरातल पर पहुँच रही हैं। जो गरीब बिहार से बाहर रोजी-रोटी कमाने गया था,

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

आज वह वापिस बिहार जा रहा है तथा वहाँ की समृद्धि में अपना योगदान दे रहा है। केन्द्र सरकार की कितनी ही योजनाएँ हैं, जिन्हें प्रदेशों में सरकारें सही ढंग से लागू नहीं कर रही हैं, या तो इन योजनाओं के नाम बदले जा रहे हैं या इन्हें लागू नहीं किया जा रहा है, जिसकी वजह से जो पैसा केन्द्र से प्रदेश सरकार के पास जाता है, वह unutilized होकर केन्द्र सरकार के पास वापिस चला आता है।

(3बी/एनबी पर क्रमशः)

NB/VK/3B/4.40

**श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा (क्रमागत) :** सरकार यह बताए कि प्रदेशों में निगरानी तंत्र को मज़बूत करने के लिए वह क्या कर रही है?

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री तारिक अनवर) :** अब आप समाप्त कीजिए।

**श्री राजीव प्रताप रूडी :** उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, दर्डा जी बहुत अच्छा बोल रहे हैं, लेकिन समय की तरफ थोड़ा ध्यान देना चाहिए, क्योंकि इसके बाद भी एक महत्वपूर्ण प्रस्ताव है, उस पर भी बहस होनी है ... (व्यवधान) दर्डा साहब बहुत अच्छा बोल रहे हैं, लेकिन अगर हर वक्ता अपनी समय सीमा को पार करेगा तो ... (व्यवधान)

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** You cannot restrict Members during Private Members' Business.

**उपसभाध्यक्ष :** अब आप समाप्त कीजिए।

**श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा :** उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मैं जल्दी ही अपनी बात समाप्त कर दूंगा। Efficient delivery एक मुख्य समस्या है। PDS में भी जिस प्रकार से diversion हुआ है, जिस प्रकार से घटिया तरीके का खाद्यान्न उपलब्ध कराया जाता है, वह ठीक नहीं है। मैंने अभी बताया कि Mid-day meal में बहुत ही घटिया तरीके का खाद्यान्न बच्चों को दिया जा रहा है। वितरण के लिए Biometric system का इस्तेमाल होना चाहिए और PDS के लिए भी इसका इस्तेमाल होना चाहिए। दूसरा बिंदु खाद्यान्नों की आपूर्ति का है। FCI के पास बहुत सीमित भंडारण क्षमता है तथा निजी सेक्टर में भी भंडारण क्षमता काफी सीमित है।

### Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, हमारे देश में स्वास्थ्य के ऊपर बहुत ही कम खर्च किया जाता है। WHO की रिपोर्ट के मुताबिक स्वास्थ्य पर खर्च के मामले में 175 देशों में हमारा 171वां स्थान है। 120 करोड़ लोगों वाले देश में GDP का 5.2 परसेंट ही स्वास्थ्य पर खर्च होता है और इसमें 4.3 परसेंट खर्च प्राइवेट सैक्टर से होता है तथा 0.9 परसेंट सरकार खर्च करती है। कई सालों से सरकार 3 परसेंट खर्च किए जाने की बात कर रही है। यह संख्या सहारा रीजन के देशों से भी कम है। इसलिए इसको बढ़ाया जाना चाहिए, ताकि आम आदमी को लाभ मिल सके। फूड सिक्योरिटी बिल के विषय में माननीय श्रीमती सोनिया गांधी की अध्यक्षता वाली National Advisory Council तथा सरकार द्वारा गठित रंगराजन समिति की सिफारिशों में बहुत अंतर है। NAC की सिफारिशों के अनुसार 35 किलो अनाज, 3 रुपए प्रति किलो की दर पर सभी को दिया जाता है और इसमें BPL परिवार की कोई सीमा नहीं है, जब कि रंगराजन समिति सिर्फ उन लोगों को अनाज देने की बात करती है, जो BPL के नीचे रहते हैं। इसे किस तरह से लागू किया जाएगा, यह भी मैं जानना चाहता हूँ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, भारत कुपोषण और भूख से ग्रसित है और खास तौर पर महिलाएं और बच्चे इसके शिकार हैं। कुपोषण के मामले में हम कई सहारा देशों से भी पीछे हैं। WHO के Hunger Index में हमारी स्थिति चिंताजनक है। यह सही है कि फूड सिक्योरिटी की बात की जा रही है, लेकिन चिंता की बात यह है कि हमारा कृषि उत्पादन पिछले कई वर्षों से नहीं बढ़ा है और खाद्यान्नों का उत्पादन पूरी तरह से स्थिर है। ऐसी स्थिति में किस प्रकार फूड सिक्योरिटी ऐक्ट लागू किया जाएगा, यह मैं जानना चाहूंगा।

अंत में मैं यह कहना चाहूंगा कि आज आम आदमी स्वास्थ्य, शिक्षा और रोजमर्रा की खाने की समस्याओं से जूझ रहा है। आज मुझे बढ़ती हुई महंगाई को देखकर श्री दुष्यंत कुमार की पंक्तियां याद आती हैं –

“ कहां तो तय था चरागाह हरेक घर के लिए,

कहां चिराग मयस्सर नहीं है नगर के लिए।

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

नहीं कमीज तो घुटनों से पेट ढक लेंगे,

ये लोग कितने मुनासिब हैं इस सफर के लिए?”

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, अंत में मैं एक बात कहना चाहूंगा कि सरकार का जेनेटिक फूड जैसे BT Brinjal पर क्या मत है और उत्पादन बढ़ाने के लिए क्या सरकार जेनेटिक फूड का सहारा लेने की कोशिश कर रही है? यदि हां, तो क्या इस पर विशेषज्ञों के साथ चर्चा हुई है? इसका हमारे स्वास्थ्य तथा वातावरण पर क्या असर पड़ेगा, यह भी सरकार स्पष्ट करे। अंत में मैं कहना चाहूंगा —

“जिंदगी तो सभी के लिए वही रंगीन किताब है,

फर्क बस इतना है कि किसी ने हर पन्ने को दिल से पढ़ा है

और किसी ने बस पन्ने पलट लिए हैं।”

(समाप्त)

(3C/VNK पर आगे)

-NB/VNK-RG/3c/4:45

**श्री राजीव प्रताप रूडी:** सर, कांग्रेस पार्टी का जो allotted time था, वह माइनस 22 में चला गया है, इसका मतलब यह है कि कांग्रेस पार्टी का कोई वक्ता अब नहीं बोल सकता है। ... (व्यवधान)... सदन की कोई व्यवस्था होती है। जब समय निर्धारित है, तो मैं समझता हूँ कि सभी पार्टियों का अधिकार है। यह सदन सबका है। अगर एक-एक पार्टी को आप 22-22 मिनट अधिक समय देंगे, तो सदन के बाकी सदस्यों का क्या होगा? मेरा सदन से आग्रह है कि इसका समापन समय से हो ताकि तेलंगाना का जो प्रस्ताव है, वह इस सदन में रखा जाए, क्योंकि दो बार इसी प्रकार से यह प्रस्ताव नहीं रखा जा सका।... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा:** सर ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री राजीव प्रताप रूडी:** यह मैं आपके लिए नहीं कह रहा हूँ। यह मैं overall कह रहा हूँ। मैं व्यवस्था की बात कर रहा हूँ, क्योंकि इसके बाद का एक महत्वपूर्ण विषय है, जिसे मैं सदन में

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

रखना चाहूंगा और उसे प्रारंभ करना चाहूंगा। ... (व्यवधान)... महोदय, हम लोग बैठ कर प्रस्ताव तैयार करते हैं और उसे तैयार करके लाते हैं। मैं यह दूसरी बार देख रहा हूँ कि मेरा प्रस्ताव किसी न किसी कारण से सदन में स्वीकार नहीं हो पा रहा है। ... (व्यवधान)...

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री तारिक अनवर):** ऐसी कोई बात नहीं है। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री राजीव प्रताप रूडी:** सर, मुझे तेलंगाना के प्रस्ताव को introduce करने का अधिकार दिया जाए, क्योंकि मैं हमेशा इसके इंतजार में यहां बैठा रहता हूँ। ... (व्यवधान)....

**उपसभाध्यक्ष:** पहले हम लोग इसको जल्दी समाप्त कर लें। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री राजीव प्रताप रूडी:** ठीक है, सर। यह जरूरी है, इसलिए इसमें मुझे आपका protection चाहिए।

**उपसभाध्यक्ष:** ठीक है। Dr. Gyan Prakash Pilania.

**DR. GYAN PRAKASH PILANIA (RAJASTHAN):** Sir, if it is considered necessary that I withdraw my name, then, let him speak on Telangana. I am willing for that. I am willing to forego, provided Telangana issue comes up... (Interruptions)

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Let everyone speak. But a senior Member of my party... (Interruptions)

**उपसभाध्यक्ष:** पहले resolution move होगा ... (व्यवधान).... The Resolution has not been moved... (Interruptions) पहले resolution move होगा, उसके बाद यह होगा। ... (व्यवधान)...

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** I am here for that. I have to move it... (Interruptions) Some Members cannot bulldoze the House. They are planning that the Resolution is not moved. My Resolution on Telangana has to be moved today... (Interruptions) The House cannot be taken for a ride. You have given 25 minutes extra to the Congress (I) Party. There are Members in the

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Congress (I) Party who would like to speak on Telangana. Our senior Member is willing to forego his chance. Let anyone speak from that side. But you cannot allow that Resolution to lapse. Otherwise, the Chair may give me permission to move it in the next Session.

**SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM:** Sir, we also want to speak on Telangana. But the procedure should be followed.

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री तारिक अनवर):** हम लोग देख लेंगे, यदि समय बढ़ाना पड़ेगा, तो समय बढ़ाएंगे। आप मत घबराइए। Dr. Gyan Prakash Pilania.

**DR. GYAN PRAKASH PILANIA:** Sir, I am grateful for your generosity for allowing me to speak on this issue. Eloquent speakers have already spoken, and very vital issues have been raised. Food security alone is not enough for human dignity because man does not live by bread alone. He needs something more. That is the crux; that is the philosophy behind this Resolution, and I am here to support it.

Overall, poverty issue is multi-dimensional. It is multi-faceted; it is multi-pronged. And that multiplicity is the reason because of which it has been mentioned that food security by itself is not enough. There should be other contours along with food security, namely, water security, shelter security, health security, sanitation security, education security, etc. Security has so many faces, and that is what was very eloquently brought forward by Shri N.K. Singh. Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar referred to a statement by the late Prime Minister, Shri Rajiv Gandhi that out of Rs.100 sent by the Centre, only Rs.15 reaches the targeted people.

(Continued by 3D)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

3d/3.50/ks

**DR. GYAN PRAKASH PILANIA (contd.):** Sir, I was there in that meeting in Rajasthan where Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar was present and where Shri Rajiv Gandhi made this announcement. I was the Director General of Police at that time. Since then, much water has flown under the bridge and, from 15 paise it has come down to ten paise or five paise. It has certainly come down because of the failure of the delivery mechanism and because of the in-built corruption in the system to which a reference was made. Until and unless corruption is rooted out, until and unless PDS, which is ailing and which has become a cesspool of corruption, is somehow improved, the delivery system would not be all right.

There was a reference to the plight of our farmers. Sir, 65 per cent of our population lives on land which it either tills or where it does a kind of labour. Sixty five per cent of our population is dependent on land, and in our GDP they only have a 17 per cent share. So, this scenario of 65 per cent people getting only 17 paise out of 100 paise of the GDP must be somehow improved if we want food security. Farmers are committing suicide; farmers' plight has to be improved. Otherwise, there would be no food security.

As far as food is concerned, I have got a figure with me that I got through today's answer to a question. According to the Directorate of Economic Statistics, the annual production of foodgrains is 232.07 MT in the year 2010-11 against the corresponding demand of 229.12 MT in the country. So, there is a very slight leeway. If this is made compulsory, it would ensure 35 kilos to every BPL family. At present the trouble is, we do not know how many are there in the

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

BPL category, what is the BPL cut-off, what is the BPL census. On that aspect also, there are many views. Ultimately, they say, Suresh Tendulkar's figure of 46 per cent of the total population has been accepted by the Planning Commission to be used as the yardstick for this Food Security Act. But somehow, the correct census of BPL must be done. We must know whom we want to help; we must know their exact figure.

As far as the hunger index is concerned, much has been said about it. Statistics have been quoted. One more thing has also been spoken about. There is a divide in the country -- the rural-urban divide, Bharat-India divide, dark India-shining India divide! Till that divide is not somehow bridged, the nation would not progress, nor the Food Security Bill would come and even if it comes, it would not be successful.

With your permission, Sir, I would like to dilate on this issue of the division of the society in two, very rich and very poor, very educated and illiterate.

The National Sample Survey Organisation Report of 2008-09 released very recently states three basic necessities of life: tap drinking water, electricity, and sanitation. Food is basic, which is not mentioned intentionally because it is presumed that without food a man cannot exist. These three, together, are not available to 82 per cent of the rural households. These are the latest statistics and it is a horrendous scenario where 82 per cent of the rural households do not have these three facilities simultaneously, that is, safe drinking water, electricity connection and sanitation. More than 50 per cent of Indians defecate in open, a horrendous sight and the whole world is surprised at it. A survey of our one lakh

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

households on 'basic living standards in India' also shows that 20 per cent of our rural households do not have access to either of these three facilities. In urban India, 67.5 per cent of the households enjoy all the three facilities simultaneously.

(Contd. at 3e/kgg)

kgg/3e/4.55

**DR. GYAN PRAKASH PILANIA (contd.):** What a kind of glaring disparity, a disparity which makes people rise to rebellion! It may be Teheran; it may be any other country; it may be Libya. But, this is the threat which is looming large. The coverage in urban area between 1993 and 2008-09 is increased by about 20 per cent as compared to 12 per cent in the rural area. Just 30 per cent of households in rural area have access to tap drinking water as compared to 74 per cent in urban areas. These facts are very obvious. Only 11 per cent of urban households are without toilets as against 65 per cent in rural areas.

As far as health is concerned, the figures are absolutely staggering. In the health scenario, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, we have the poorest record. Health expenditures alone without expenditure on water supply, sanitation and nutrition was less than one per cent of GDP in 2004-05. This has only gone up marginally to 1.09 per cent of GDP in 2008-09. And, even now it has not reached 2 per cent. This is where our health scenario stands. It is a matter of great concern for everyone, particularly this House of Elders that India has one of the most privatized health care systems in the world because public expenditure on health as a percentage out of GDP in India is mere 1.45 per cent, less than 2 per cent, among the lowest in the world and ahead of only four countries—Burundi,

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Myanmar, Pakistan, Guinea and Lyes. The share of Government in health spending varies from 6-7 per cent in Europe to 34 per cent in South-East Asia. India's spending falls below the lowest even in this range. This is where we stand. Dutch account for 72 per cent of the total private out-of-pocket expense. 39 million Indians pushed into poverty from ill-health every year. This is because of providing not enough fund for public health. 34 per cent of rural India did not go in for treatment for financial reasons in 2004 up from 15 per cent in 1995. In cities, the figure was 20 per cent up from 10 per cent in 1995. These are the figures which are exactly correct. 47 per cent of hospital admissions in rural India and 30 per cent in urban India were financed by loans and sale of assets.

So, this is here we stand as far health care is concerned. This has a direct impact on maternal and child mortality. Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the globally it is estimated that an annual rate of decline of 4.4 per cent is needed to reduce death of children under 2-3 by 2015. In India, the rate of decline in child mortality between 1990-2008 is only 2.2 per cent. I can understand if health care is that type.

As far as education is concerned, we have the Education Minister here. It was talked that 6 per cent of GDP would be put into education. But, at present, it is not more than 3.78 per cent. This is the total Budget for education. And, as far as condition of girls is concerned, I would talk of only teenaged girls' situation, the health and social indications.

(Contd. by tdb/3f)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

TDB-MCM/3F/5.00

**DR. GYAN PRAKASH PILANIA (CONTD.):** Indian teen girls are most ill-fed. In terms of nutrition and empowerment, the condition of adolescent girls in India is worse than even those in the world's poorest region, Sub-Saharan Africa. In India, almost 47 per cent girls aged 11 to 9 years are underweight, 56 per cent are anaemic. In India, 243 million adolescents are there. Out of which, 40 per cent is out of schools and 43 per cent is married before the age of 18, out of whom, 30 per cent become teenage mothers. There are other facets also. But, I think, time restraint won't permit me to go ahead. Sir, I will stop it by saying only one thing that the Food Act which is coming up is welcome. (Interruptions) It is the right thing.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** He is my senior Member. How does it concern you? (Interruptions)

**DR. GYAN PRAKASH PILANIA:** Sir, Right to Information is also a good Act. MNREGA is a good Act. Right to Education is a good Act. But, along with that, care for health and proper education to the right standards is required. So, my commendation is that the proposal of Shri N.K. Singh should be accepted. Along with food, there should be other care for security syndrome so that human dignity is maintained. Thank you very much, Sir. There is a pressure of a peer on me.

(Ends)

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, we are ready to give all the 11 minutes which were allotted to the Bharatiya Janata Party to the opposition to speak. (Interruptions) We are giving that time to them.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR):** Shri Narendra Kumar Kashyap also wants to speak on this Resolution. (Interruptions)

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** Sir, on Private Member's Bills, party-wise time is not allotted. (Interruptions) There is no allotment of time to a party. It is only allotment. (Interruptions)

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, you cannot do it like it.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** The Private Members' Business will continue till 5.37 p.m. (Interruptions)

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, they are so happy. (Interruptions)

**उपसभाध्यक्ष :** हाऊस में प्राइवेट मेंबर्स बिजनेस की शुरूआत तीन बजकर सात मिनट पर हुई थी। तो हमें इसको ढाई घंटे देने हैं। उस हिसाब से पांच बजकर सैंतिस मिनट तक चलेगा।

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, they are very excited that that should be dropped. Sir, you have promised it from the Chair. You have directed that my Resolution has to be taken up today. Sir, it has to be taken up today.

**श्री नरेन्द्र कुमार कश्यप (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** महोदय, आपने मुझे इस महत्वपूर्ण संकल्प पर बोलने का मौका दिया, मैं आपका बड़ा आभारी हूँ। मैं माननीय सदस्य का धन्यवाद करता हूँ जिन्होंने देश के मुश्किल मुद्दों पर आज इस सदन में अपना प्रस्ताव प्रस्तुत किया है। विशेष तौर से दो महत्वपूर्ण बातों पर मैं बल देना चाहता हूँ, जो इस प्रस्ताव में अंकित किए गए हैं - स्वास्थ्य व शिक्षा की न्यूनतम हकदारी, खाद्य और सामाजिक सुरक्षा। महोदय, खाद्य और सामाजिक सुरक्षा बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण बिन्दु आज हमारे देश के लिए प्रतीत होता है। आज देश की आबादी 120 करोड़ से भी अधिक होने का अनुमान है, जिसमें से करीब 75 प्रतिशत लोग आज भी बीस रुपये प्रति दिन आय पर अपने जीवन का गुजारा करते हैं।

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, senior Ministers have come to the House to see my Resolution on Telangana. Sir, the senior Ministers are sitting here simply because of that Resolution.

**THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM):** Sir, I saw my friend very restless, so I have come here to calm him down.

**THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRI KAPIL SIBAL):**  
That is a very difficult exercise. (Interruptions)

**श्री नरेन्द्र कुमार कश्यप :** महोदय, भारत की विषमताओं में अंतर्राष्ट्रीय खाद्य नीति शोध संस्थान द्वारा जारी वैश्विक भुखमरी सूचकांक में भूख से लड़ रहे 84 देशों की सूची में आज भी भारत को 67वां स्थान दिया गया है।

(3g/GS पर क्रमशः)

S-KLS/3G/5.05

**श्री नरेन्द्र कुमार कश्यप (क्रमागत) :** आज भी भारत को 67वां स्थान दिया गया है, जबकि चीन आज भी नौवें नम्बर पर दर्शाया जाता है। महोदय, हमारे देश में हर साल तकरीबन 25 लाख बच्चे कुपोषण के शिकार होते हैं। ग्लोबल हंगर इंडेक्स के अनुसार भारत दुनिया के 119 विकासशील देशों की सूची में 96वे स्थान पर है। इस सूची में जिस देश का स्थान जितना नीचा होता है, वह उतना ही भूख से ज्यादा पीड़ित होता है। इससे अंदाजा लगाया जा सकता है कि आज भी हमारे देश में भुखमरी किस पैमाने पर प्रदर्शित होती है ! देश में ऐसे हालात क्यों पैदा हो गए, यह आज देश के सामने और संसद के सामने गंभीर सवाल उपजता हुआ नजर आता है। लगातार बढ़ती हुई महंगाई और बढ़ती हुई जनसंख्या, घटती हुई उपजाऊ भूमि ने देश की खाद्य आपूर्ति में असंतुलन पैदा कर दिया है। पानी, बिजली, कीटनाशक की कमी से लगातार खाद्य पदार्थों के उत्पादन में कमी का अहसास किया जा रहा है।

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से सदन के संज्ञान में लाना चाहता हूँ कि गलत उर्वरकों के प्रयोग से आज हमारे देश में 30 हजार करोड़ रुपये की कीमत के उत्पाद और फसल नष्ट हो जाती है और 30 लाख से भी ज्यादा किसान बीमार होते हैं। करीब 20 लाख लोगों की मृत्यु प्रतिवर्ष गलत कीटनाशकों के उपयोग से हो रही है। आज फसलों के बेहतर उत्पादन पर ध्यान नहीं दिया जा रहा है।

महोदय, आज देश के सामने खाद्यान्न की सुरक्षा का बहुत बड़ा संकट है। देश में warehousing की कमी है। अभी पिछले सत्र से पहले पूरे देश में इस बात को लेकर चिंता व्यक्त की गई कि बरसात की अधिकता और warehousing की कमी की वजह से हजारों टन गेहूँ या तो बरसात के पानी से भीगकर खराब हो गया या चूहों के कटान से वह खाने योग्य नहीं बचा।

महोदय, मुझे याद है, मैं जनपद गाजियाबाद से ताल्लुक रखने वाला हूँ, हमारे जनपद में, हापुड़ शहर में हजारों टन गेहूँ बरसात की वजह से खराब हुआ तथा हरियाणा और पंजाब में लाखों टन गेहूँ खराब हुआ। देश के सामने चिंता का विषय उस समय पैदा हो गया, जिस समय सर्वोच्च न्यायालय ने टिप्पणी की थी जो कि देश के तमाम समाचार पत्रों में प्रमुखता के साथ छपी थी और उसको देश के लोगों ने पढ़ा। सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने यह टिप्पणी की कि अनाज को खुले आसमान में सड़ने के लिए छोड़ने से बेहतर है कि अनाज गरीबों में बांट दिया जाए, ताकि भूखे गरीबों का पेट भरा जा सके और देश की सरकार को सुप्रीम कोर्ट में इस बात का हलफनामा देना पड़ा कि “हां” हम इसके लिए जल्दी कोई न कोई कानून बनाकर खाद्य सुरक्षा का प्रबंध करेंगे। सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने यह भी टिप्पणी की कि केवल नीतियां बनाने से ही काम नहीं चलने वाला है, बल्कि नीतियों को जमीनी स्तर पर लागू करने की भी जरूरत है।

(3H/ASC पर जारी)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**ASC-SSS/5.10/3H

**श्री नरेन्द्र कुमार कश्यप (क्रमागत) :** मान्यवर, हमारे देश में जहां आज खाद्य पदार्थों का घटता हुआ उत्पादन, बढ़ती हुई जनसंख्या और महंगाई का संकट पैदा हो गया है, वहीं पर खाद्य की सुरक्षा का समुचित प्रबंध न होना, हमारे सामने एक चिंता का विषय बना हुआ है। मैं इस मौके पर इस संकल्प के माध्यम से सरकार से यह अपील करना चाहता हूँ कि उसको अनाज के भंडारण के लिए अधिक से अधिक वेयर हाउसेज की व्यवस्था करनी चाहिए। हमारा यातायात बेहतर हो, सरकार को इस पर भी ध्यान देना होगा। चूहों और बीमारियों से अनाज को कैसे बचाया जाए, इसके लिए समुचित दवाई इत्यादि की व्यवस्था भी किए जाने की आवश्यकता है।

मान्यवर, आज के समय में BPL की जनसंख्या का रिव्यु किया जाना बहुत जरूरी है।  
...(व्यवधान)..

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री तारिक अनवर) :** आप संक्षिप्त कीजिए। ..(व्यवधान).. आपका टाइम ज्यादा नहीं है।

**श्री नरेन्द्र कुमार कश्यप :** मान्यवर, मैं संक्षिप्त ही कर रहा हूँ। मैं थोड़े शब्दों में ही अपनी बात रखकर समाप्त कर दूंगा। मैं हाउस की चिंता समझता हूँ। मैं रूडी साहब की चिंता भी समझता हूँ। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री राजीव प्रताप रूडी :** यह मेरी पीड़ा नहीं है, कांग्रेस की पीड़ा है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**DR. E. M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** We have to allow him to speak. We are speaking about poverty. That is more important. We have to protect the interest of millions of people.

**श्री नरेन्द्र कुमार कश्यप :** मान्यवर, इस संकल्प पर बल देने की आवश्यकता मुझे इसलिए भी हुई कि उत्तर प्रदेश देश की सर्वाधिक आबादी वाला प्रदेश है। उत्तरांचल प्रदेश बन जाने के बाद आज भी इस प्रदेश की आबादी बीस करोड़ है। उत्तर प्रदेश में काफी लम्बे अरसे से BPL

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

सूची का विस्तार नहीं किया गया है और APL सूची का विस्तार भी नहीं किया गया है। गेहूं के भंडारण के लिए कोई समुचित व्यवस्था नहीं की गई है। उत्तर प्रदेश पंजाब, हरियाणा व अन्य प्रदेशों से भी अधिक गेहूं का उत्पादन करने वाला प्रदेश है। इसके बावजूद भी उत्तर प्रदेश में समुचित खाद्य व्यवस्था न होने की वजह से कई बार हजारों टन गेहूं, दलहन व तिलहन का नुकसान होता है। मान्यवर, इसलिए मैं आपके संज्ञान में यह लाना चाहता हूँ कि उत्तर प्रदेश, जो कि सर्वाधिक आबादी वाला प्रदेश है, इसमें खाद्य भंडारण की उचित व्यवस्था के लिए सरकार को अतिरिक्त बजट की व्यवस्था करके किसानों के गेहूं और भंडारण की व्यवस्था पर जोर देना चाहिए। BPL सूची में गरीबी रेखा से नीचे जिंदगी बसर करने वाले जो लोग हैं, उनका रिव्यु करके, इसकी सूची को और बढ़ाया जाना चाहिए। मान्यवर, हमारे देश में इसके अलावा एक और गंभीर समस्या PDS की है। हमारे देश का पब्लिक डिस्ट्रिब्यूशन सिस्टम इस तरह का बना हुआ है कि चाहे राशन विक्रेता द्वारा गेहूं का डिस्ट्रिब्यूशन हो, मिट्टी के तेल का डिस्ट्रिब्यूशन हो या अन्य चीजों का डिस्ट्रिब्यूशन हो, सभी में धांधलियां होती हैं। जो लोग BPL कार्डधारक हैं या APL कार्डधारक हैं या अन्य लोग जो गरीबी रेखा से नीचे जिंदगी बसर करते हैं, उनको मिलने वाली सहूलियतें समय पर नहीं मिल पाती हैं। आज भी बहुत से लोग अपने अधिकार से कहीं न कहीं महरूम रह जाते हैं। इस व्यवस्था पर भी ध्यान देने की आवश्यकता है। आज देश में बहुत ज्यादा कालाबाजारी हो रही है, इस पर भी ध्यान देने की आवश्यकता है। अभी भी देश में लोगों के स्वास्थ्य को ठीक रखने के लिए ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में स्वास्थ्य केन्द्रों की कमी नजर आती है। हमें शिक्षा और स्वास्थ्य पर बहुत ध्यान देने की आवश्यकता है। मान्यवर, मैं आपका इशारा समझ रहा हूँ। माननीय सिंह साहब के इस संकल्प पर बल देते हुए मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि इसको कानून में तब्दील करके, देश में खाद्य व्यवस्था को दुरुस्त बनाने का कष्ट करें। बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

(31/NBR/AKG पर आगे)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

-SSS/NBR-AKG/3J/5.15

**DR. E. M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN (TAMIL NADU):** Thank you Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir.

Shri N.K. Singh has moved a very important Resolution which is attracting the national and international movements. More specifically, he has focused on food and social security. Sir, it is very important, at this juncture, to think about food security. When we made our Constitution, we declared in the Preamble itself that there will be justice -- social, economic and political. But, under many provisions of the Fundamental Rights, the human rights issues are given all importance. Not only under the provision of the Fundamental Rights but also under other provisions of the Constitution of India, the political human rights, social human rights, cultural human rights and civil human rights are fully protected. But, with regard to economic human rights, article 19, etc., are focusing on the right to profession. And, before the amendment of the Constitution regarding the Right to Property, the property rights were also given. The framers of the Constitution never dreamt that we will have so much of poverty, poor people have to be protected and there should be a Fundamental Right for that purpose. The Constitution and the Constitutional Government will look after the people's need, more so of food.

Sir, Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar and Shri N.K. Singh have already given a lot of data on the poverty and how it should be addressed through various schemes. There is no doubt that the Government of India, through its various Five Year Plans, addressed various issues relating to food security. But, at the same time,

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

the food security is the basic thing for any human being. Mahakavi Bharatiya declared, during the Freedom Movement, that if one individual does not get food, we will destroy the world. This was the declaration made through his poetry and it caught the common man that if we get the Freedom, poverty will totally be eradicated. But, various schemes have sincerely been implemented by the successive Governments with the cooperation of the State Governments. Subsequently, Shri Rajiv Gandhi has enunciated a three-tier system of governance in the form of Panchayati Raj Institutions through the Constitutional amendment. Those Institutions are not given all the powers that were guaranteed under the Constitutional Amendment. Sir, twenty-nine powers have been given for Panchayati Raj institutions and more than seventeen powers have been given for Nagarpalikas. But, they have not fully transferred by the State Governments to them, because the right to transfer these is given for State Legislatures. But, at the same time, various movements have taken place to address the issue and we are having the Millennium Development Goals under which we are going to reach certain targets to eradicate poverty as a part of democratic process.

Sir, this particular Resolution is focusing on food and also social security. There is law enacted in Brazil called Food Security and Nutrition of Brazil Decree 7272 of 25<sup>th</sup> August, 2010, for implementing that country's food and nutrition security law of 2006.

(CONTD. BY USY "3K")

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

-NBR-USY/3K/5.20

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN (CONTD.):** ...focuses on nutrition also.

Now, whether our system of giving only rice and wheat, as a part of the food security, through the PDS system, address this need of nutrition. That is why the present UPA Government, under the leadership of Dr. Manmohan Singh, and guidance of Madam Sonia Gandhi, has declared in the Budget that other millets will also be covered under the food security, which is a 'nutrition' part of it. In the tribal areas, it used to be the customary way to grow millets. Their food included that type of cereals and millets. The poor men, who are living in the dry areas of various parts of India, have been depending on these cereals and millets. These are also very important nutritious foods. This food security should also be given to the common man. We are not giving any sort of charity to the common man, but we are providing it, as a part of the incentive, to develop them as a human resource. Like education has been made a part of the Fundamental Rights -- it has, now, been implemented by the present Government, so that the people can develop their skill and assure themselves a better profession and earn through that -- we are assuring them health programmes so that they can have a good health, we have also come forward with housing schemes, landless poor are getting lands, and various other welfare schemes have been introduced; likewise, we have to see whether the production, which is done by common man, is fully addressing the food security or not. Many people are now going away from the agricultural sector to various other service sectors. But I would like to stress here that India, by using the huge resources that are available here, can be the food

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

bowl for the entire world, if there is a proper planning. By using the huge resources, which are available in India, complemented by the huge resources of the various types of earth, perennial rivers, ground water, and by focusing our GDP on developing agriculture, we can surely be the food bowl for the entire world, especially when other countries are going for urbanization. I am not against urbanization. But, at the same time, our vast land can provide both — agriculture as well as urbanization. When urbanization is alone the criterion of development, which we are doing nowadays by copying the Western countries, we will end up only in poverty. The main reason, as a layman I can say, of poverty is that we are not protecting the interests of the millions of people, who are basically dependent on agriculture. Also, the joint family system would protect every individual from scarcity of food. In the villages, nobody could say that he or she was starving because the system had been built up like that, till the colonial Government came into picture. We were having a system if one person is having labour, the other person would also participate in labour, and the joint family would bring forth wealth and would be divided equally.

(Contd. by 3I — PK)

-USY/PK/3L/5.25

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN (CONTD.):** But what is happening now? We are breaking the families. In the name of urbanization, families are moving from villages, leaving all their assets there, to the urban areas. Slum dwellers have all kinds of scarcities there. Mr. Singh, as a successful Finance Secretary, had done a lot of thinking at that time also, and now, also he has made us to

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

think over these important aspects. We all know, Sir, how the food items are produced and how the security is given. Basing my arguments on the Brazilian law, I would like to say that food products alone are not important; you have to also see how the food comes. Therefore, first of all, you have to improve the condition of small farmers, middle-level farmers and the skilled labourers who are all dependent on agriculture. They also need to be protected. Then only, we can have adequate production for all the people.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR):** Please conclude.

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** Sir, I will take only 15 minutes more...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDDY:** Sir, I am on a point of order. .(Interruptions)..

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** We have never seen this type of an interruption in the history. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Just a minute. ..(Interruptions)..

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** Nobody interrupts like this, Sir...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** I am not talking to you, my friend; I am addressing the Chair. ..(Interruptions)..

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** I feel it is not proper, Sir. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Can't I address the Chair?..(Interruptions)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please let him speak...(Interruptions)..

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Where does he figure, Sir? I am talking to the hon. Chair. ..(Interruptions)..

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** No, I am not yielding. Only when I yield, you can talk. ..(Interruptions).. I am not yielding, Sir. ..(Interruptions)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR):** Mr. Rudy, he is not yielding. What can I do?..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** The House has got the display machine just to monitor the speeches of the hon. Members. The time allotted to Congress Party has exceeded by 33 minutes. ..(Interruptions)..

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** I want to repeatedly say, Sir, for Private Members' Business, there is no political party allotment. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Having said that,..(Interruptions).. What is the purpose of having that machine?..(Interruptions)..

**DR. E. M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** I want to stress it again and again that we do not come through a whip; we come directly as Members of Parliament.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Yes, you have a right, but I am addressing the Chair. Sir, there is a very important Resolution..(Interruptions)..

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** He cannot go on interrupting like this, Sir. ...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, there is a very important legislation for separate Statehood..(Interruptions).. I am talking to the Chair...(Interruptions)..

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** No, you cannot talk without my yielding. ..(Interruptions)..

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** You are no one to tell me. ..(Interruptions)..

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** Sir, under article 105, I have got every right to speak in Parliament. ..(Interruptions)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR):** Natchiappan *ji*.  
..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, I am also elected to Parliament.  
..(Interruptions).. I have just not dropped in here, my friend.

**DR. E. M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** Then, I will sit, Sir. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** My only submission, Sir, is, this place is for debating and taking up issues. I find that there is a reason to believe that Resolution on Telangana, Gorkhaland and Ladakh Council is very important. This is the second time that my name has figured just after Mr. N.K. Singh's Resolution. My only submission to the House is that this issue is also causing agitation in the other House. This is an issue which concerns the whole nation today. So, I would like this Resolution to be brought forward. So, the hon. Member must consider the request of his colleague in Parliament. So, I request you that the Minister should reply. My only submission is that I may be given a minute to position this Resolution in the House and nothing more. So, in all these 24 hours, 365 days, I am just asking for ten seconds to move my Resolution. That is my only request. Can't you spare your ten seconds for me? That is my only submission. So, give me ten seconds. So, I request the Chair to allow me to position my Resolution.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Natchiappan *ji*.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** Sir, I was submitting that we have to focus upon how the food production can be increased, so that the food security can also be looked after properly. The Brazilian Government, in their security law, assures protection of the interests of the farmers, small farmers and how their productivity can be increased. It is part and parcel of that. That is why, I am just congratulating Mr. N.K. Singh for using the words 'social security' also. The words 'social security' have a broader meaning. Unless we protect the social sector which is engaged in food production, you cannot have sufficient quantities of foodgrains available for the people, as a part of the security.

(Contd. by 3M/PB)

PB/3m/5.30

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN (CONTD.):** Therefore, this is a very broad subject on which he has brought a Resolution. It is focused upon the millennium development, it is focused upon the poverty eradication and it is also focused upon how to address the problem of unemployment in the rural areas.

Therefore, Sir, I feel that when we are discussing this aspect, we have to see how the food is produced, how it is saved and how it is distributed. Now, we cannot concentrate on the distribution part alone. We are focusing too much on food distribution. Plenty of loopholes are there in the food distribution. There is no doubt that that has to be addressed. Mr. N.K. Singh has given the example of food stamps which are given in the American system or the European system. In most of the countries, they are giving food stamps to those people who do not have employment as a part of social security. In Bihar also, it is implemented.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Now the hon. Finance Minister, Pranab Mukherjee, has said that before 2012, a major part of the food distributive system will be made by way of cash transfers. So, there is a very clear plan that has been laid to take care of the distributive aspect.

No doubt, Sir, when we are talking about the food distribution, the part played by the State Governments becomes very, very important. Every State Government has to have proper coordination with the Central Government's aims and objectives.

Sir, as Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar said, this system of food distribution can be given in the hands of women self-help groups who are already working actively in the field of distribution. They can be motivated. Similarly, the Panchayati Raj institutions should also help in this process. They have to see that this food material is made available in time to all those people who are in need of it.

Sir, here again, I want to stress that before colonization, the village system was providing food security to its people as a part of its community life. It was part of the village system. The joint family was looking after the food requirements of the family. The whole village used to look after the food needs of the artisans and other people who were in such occupations. I can even cite an example. In the rudiments of certain villages, a washerman used to get freshly cooked food in noon and also in the evening. After doing the washing, when he comes back home, the society used to give him hot food. The food security was ensured like that at that time.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

Now, we are having the noon-meal scheme for the children. It was initiated in Tamil Nadu by Late Kamaraj when he was the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu. He introduced it and subsequently its scope was enlarged and today more than 12 crore children throughout India are benefiting from this Scheme of the Government of India, which has been enlarged more specifically by the UPA Government. We are now providing food security to our people sector-wise. We are giving it to our school-going children, to the newly-born children, etc. We are providing food security to the poor pregnant women which means the child is protected from the womb by way of nutritious food. So, from birth itself, the child is looked after through various programmes of the Government of India. When they go to school, they are protected. As young persons, even up to 10<sup>th</sup> or 12<sup>th</sup> Standard, they are protected in the school. In various places, various State Governments are coming forward for providing food security to the poor people, to the school going children, etc. The elderly people, the senior citizens, are also protected by various schemes.

But, Sir, this food security has to be further ensured by adopting various measures. We have to see that the food materials are properly protected and the wastage is not there. There should be minimum wastage. For doing it, Sir, what I feel is that we have to think about the whole village structure where the food is actually cultivated. That can be properly managed there itself. They can preserve it; they can distribute it in their villages according to the need. Instead of taking it from far away places which results in wastages, they should preserve it their villages itself. Now, because warehouses are not there, no preservation is done

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

although huge money is spent on that. The waste food is thrown out; it is just dumped. These things can be stopped by empowering the Panchayats and the villages so that they themselves can look after their food security needs by producing and preserving their food there itself. In this way, they also become accountable to the society.

(Contd. by 3n/SKC)

3n/5.35/skc-nb

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN (contd.):** At places where sufficient food is not available, to that extent, it could be distributed by the neighbouring villages. This was the system prevalent before colonization took place. India had a very strong network between one village and another, between one society and another.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, I would like to know why the senior ministers are looking only at the clock.

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** Sir, Mr. Rudy has been interrupting a lot.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR):** Please conclude, Dr. Natchiappan.

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** Sir, he has already wasted 30 minutes of my time.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please, conclude.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, an hon. Member from the Congress is given 41 minutes extra to speak while Rajiv Pratap Rudy from the Opposition could not be given even four seconds to present... (Interruptions)

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** No, no. That cannot be done. You must follow the procedures.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR):** You would be given sufficient time, Mr. Rudy; don't worry. You would get sufficient time when you move your Resolution.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, how can I move the Resolution? It would lapse if I don't move it. (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Let him conclude his speech.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, it has come after so many efforts; it comes in a lottery. (Interruptions)

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** Sir, he is interrupting a lot.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, pardon me, but is there a design behind this important Bill on Telengana...(Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please, Mr. Rudy...(Interruptions)

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, I am just wanting to know because...(Interruptions) I want to understand. Sir, this is an urgent matter. The whole nation is waiting to know about it.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** We have to go by procedures.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, I know that my Resolution is going to lapse...(Interruptions) This is making the hon. Minister feel very happy about it. I am very upset, Sir; I am very upset.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR):** Please conclude, Dr. Natchiappan.

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** Sir, I shall conclude within five minutes. My good friend, Mr. Rudy kept interrupting my speech; otherwise, I would have concluded it earlier. He just wants to drag the matter. I feel, he is not genuine about own Resolution and that is why he wants to bypass the procedures laid down by the House.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Are you referring to me? Are you trying to ... (Interruptions)

**DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN:** You want to take up the whole time. (Interruptions)

Sir, hon. Member, Shri N.K. Singh, has given a very clear indication that there should be redefining of the contours of the food security proposals.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Dr. Natchiappan, your time is over. Hon. Members, this part of the discussion on Resolution moved by Shri N.K. Singh would now be taken up for further discussion on the next day allotted for Private Members' Resolution during this Session. We now take up discussion on the Rail Budget.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, what happens to my Resolution? Is there any direction on my Resolution, Sir?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** No.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, what is the fate of my Resolution on Telengana?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR):** It is over now.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, what happens to the great and important Resolution on Telengana? Can I have a response on this from the Chair, Sir?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Now, discussion on the Railway Budget. Shri Shreegopal Vyas.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, can I have a response on this from the Chair? You said that you would increase the time-limit for this very important Resolution.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** What can I do about it?

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, so much effort has been made on this. It is very unfortunate that the Chair is not responding.

**DISCUSSION ON THE BUDGET (RAILWAYS) 2011-12 (CONTD.)**

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास (छत्तीसगढ़):** उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मुझे तो आशा नहीं थी कि आज रेल बजट पर कुछ बोलने का अवसर मिलेगा, लेकिन चूंकि कार्यावलि में लिखा हुआ है कि इसे गैर सरकारी सदस्यों के कार्य से पहले और बाद में लिया जाएगा, इसलिए आपकी भी बाध्यता हो गई है। इसके पहले कि मैं अपने प्रस्ताव की कुछ बातें आपके सामने रखूं, मैं एक-दो सामान्य बातों की चर्चा करना चाहता हूं। रेल मंत्रालय की उपलब्धियों के बारे में हमारे सरकारी पक्ष के माननीय वीरा जी ने बहुत सी बातें कही थीं।

(30/vnk पर क्रमशः)

-NB/VNK-HK/30/5:40

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास (क्रमागत):** उनमें से जो बातें जनता के हित में हैं, उनके साथ हम हैं और हम भी उन बातों की सराहना करना चाहते हैं। मैं अनेक बार रेल मंत्रालय के संबंध में एक बात

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

कहता आया हूँ और आज फिर से उसको कह रहा हूँ। हम सभी जानते हैं कि पहली बार गुप्त मतदान पद्धति से मजदूर संघों के चुनाव हुए थे। मैंने पिछले इसी सत्र में 26 तारीख को एक प्रश्न पूछा था कि क्या इन चुनावों की अनियमितता पर किसी प्रकार की कार्रवाई की जा रही है? महोदय, मुझे उत्तर मिला है कि दक्षिण पूर्व मध्य रेलवे में आयोजित चुनावों में अनियमितताओं के संबंध में कोई शिकायत प्राप्त नहीं हुई है। मैं यह रिकॉर्ड पर लाना चाहता हूँ कि इस संबंध में मेरे पास शिकायतें हैं। क्या मैं इस मंत्रालय के विरुद्ध किसी अन्य वैधानिक कार्रवाई के लिए बाध्य किया जाऊंगा? क्या मैं यह कहने के लिए बाध्य किया जाऊंगा कि इस संबंध में सदन को गुमराह किया जा रहा है? मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी से निवेदन कर रहा हूँ कि 26 तारीख को जो उत्तर दिया गया है, उसको या तो वे सुधारें या फिर मुझे इस बात की अनुमति सदन से लेनी पड़ेगी कि यह सदन को गुमराह किया जाने वाला वक्तव्य है और इस पर उचित कार्रवाई की जाए। यह एक बिन्दु है।

महोदय, मेरा इसी सत्र में एक और प्रश्न रसोई यानों के बारे में था कि एक हजार किलोमीटर से अधिक लंबी दूरी की गाड़ियों में से कितनी गाड़ियों में रसोई यान नहीं हैं? इसका उत्तर दिया गया है, जिसमें अनेक बातें हैं। उनमें से एक बात की ओर मैं आपका ध्यान आकर्षित कर रहा हूँ। वह है रसोई यानों की अनुपलब्धता अर्थात् इतने रसोई यान आप नहीं बना पा रहे हैं या उपलब्ध नहीं करा पा रहे हैं। आपने यह भी कहा है कि 154 मेल एक्सप्रेस गाड़ियों में रसोई यान नहीं हैं। इसके पहले भी जब मैंने यह विषय उठाया था, तब भी यही बात कही गई थी कि रसोई यानों की उपलब्धता नहीं है। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि इस पर सरकार की कोई योजना है या नहीं है? कौन-से कारखाने में ये बनाए जा रहे हैं और इसके लक्ष्य कब पूरे होंगे?

महोदय, मैं छत्तीसगढ़ से आता हूँ। इस बजट में भिलाई में पॉलिटेक्निक खोलने की घोषणा की गई है, मैं इसके लिए आपको धन्यवाद देता हूँ, पर साथ ही आपको दावत दे रहा हूँ कि यदि आप कहीं रसोई यान नहीं बना पा रहे हैं, तो भिलाई एक बहुत बड़ा क्षेत्र है, जहां

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

बहुत बड़ा स्टील प्लांट है और रेलवे का भी बहुत विस्तार से कार्यक्रम चलता है। छत्तीसगढ़ में रसोई यान बनाने का कारखाना स्थापति करने के लिए मैं आपको आमंत्रित कर रहा हूँ। आप आइए, इससे आपका यान भी बनेगा और हमारे लोगों को काम भी मिलेगा।

महोदय, इस सदन में अनेक बार रेल में दिए जाने वाले खान-पान के विषय पर चर्चा हुई है और उसकी क्वालिटी के बारे में अनेक बातें हुई हैं। मैंने एक प्रश्न इसी सदन में पूछा था कि IRCTC को खाना देने वाली सभी कंपनियों से भुगतान हो गया है? इसका मतलब है कि IRCTC को बहुत पैसा मिलना है। यदि नहीं मिला है, तो किन कंपनियों से नहीं मिला है और कितनी रकम मिलनी बाकी है और ऐसी कौन-कौन सी रेलगाड़ियां हैं? यदि उपरोक्त बातों की जांच हुई है, तो क्या जिम्मेदार लोगों के विरुद्ध कोई कार्रवाई हुई है? मैं यह नहीं कह रहा हूँ कि किसी प्रकार का घोटाला हुआ है, पर मुझे शक है और जनता में भी शक है। परंतु आपने उत्तर दिया है कि सूचना इकट्ठी की जा रही है और इसे सभा पटल पर रख दिया जाएगा। इतने वर्षों से हम इस खान-पान की व्यवस्था की आलोचना और उसके बारे में कई मांगें उठाते रहे हैं और आप अभी भी सूचना एकत्र कर रहे हैं, न जाने आप कब इसको सदन के सभा पटल पर रखेंगे।

महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से इस बात को शीघ्रता से बताने के लिए निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ।

(3p/mp पर क्रमशः)

MP-KSK/3P/5.45

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास (क्रमागत)** : महोदय, माननीय मंत्री महोदया का जो बजट भाषण था, अब मैं उसके कुछ बिंदुओं को उठाना चाहता हूँ। माननीय मंत्री महोदया ने अपने बजट भाषण के पृष्ठ क्रमांक 7 पर कहा है कि आपने उड़ीसा, झारखंड, छत्तीसगढ़ के अविकसित क्षेत्रों में कई परियोजनाओं को हाथ में लिया है। माननीय वीरा जी ने जहां आपकी तारीफ में कई बातें कहीं, वहीं उन्होंने छत्तीसगढ़ की पीड़ा की अभिव्यक्ति भी की। मैंने इस विषय में प्रश्न पूछा था,

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

आप भी जानते हैं कि छत्तीसगढ़ में दो महत्व की योजनाएं हैं – एक है रावघाट योजना और दूसरी है धमतरी के गेज परिवर्तन का काम। इन दोनों के बारे में आपके उत्तर किस प्रकार के हैं, वे मैं आपको पढ़कर सुनाना चाहता हूं। जहां तक दल्ली-राजहरा-रावघाट-जगदलपुर की बात है, इसके बारे में आपका जो उत्तर है - महोदय, मैं अधिक समय नहीं लूंगा, मैं केवल अंतिम वाक्य पढ़ रहा हूं – “आगामी वर्षों में संसाधनों की उपलब्धता के अनुसार परियोजना पूरी की जाएगी। परियोजना के पूरा होने के बाद ही गाड़ियां शुरू होंगी।” अब आप देखिए, इतने वर्षों से वोरा जी भी कह रहे हैं, मैं भी कह रहा हूं और इस विषय में अभी भी आपका निश्चित उत्तर नहीं है, तो कृपा करके इसके संबंध में तो निश्चित उत्तर दीजिए, यह मेरा आपसे निवेदन है।

महोदय, दूसरी योजना में रायपुर से धमतरी के guage conversion की बात है। इसके बारे में भी आपके उत्तर में कहा गया है –

“The gauge conversion project is not sanctioned.”

मैं यह जानता हूं कि वहां के ज़ोन के द्वारा इसका अनुमानित व्यय भी आपके पास भेजा गया है और आप कह रहे हैं कि “The proposal will need clearance from the Planning Commission and approval of the Government before further action can be taken in this regard.”

मुझे आश्चर्य है कि एक विषय जो इतने वर्षों से कहा जा रहा है, अभी तक आपकी कार्यसूची में नहीं आया है। ये दोनों विषय आपकी कार्यसूची में कहीं नहीं हैं, कृपा करके ऐसा न कीजिए। आप कहते हैं कि पिछड़े क्षेत्रों में विकास करने के लिए आप वचनबद्ध हैं, तो उसका कुछ पालन भी दिखना चाहिए। मैं रेल अभिमय समिति का भी सदस्य हूं। रेलवे की बहुत सारी खामियों के बाजूद हमने आपकी मांग मानी है और इन अविकसित क्षेत्रों में आप लोग कुछ करेंगे, इस आशा से आपकी बात को मानकर हम लोग आगे बढ़े हैं, कृपया इसको नज़रअंदाज़ मत कीजिए।

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

महोदय, कई प्रकार की वामपंथी गतिविधियों के कारण या जो कुछ भी बंगाल और उड़ीसा की सीमा में हुआ है, उसके कारण अनेक महीनों से मुम्बई और हावड़ा की रेलगाड़ियों में इतनी अनियमितता हो गई है कि कौन सी गाड़ी कब आएगी, कब छोड़ी जाएगी, कब पहुंचेगी, बीच के स्टेशनों का क्या होगा – इसके कारण लोगों को बहुत अधिक तकलीफ हो रही है। उससे कोलकाता और मुम्बई का व्यापार भी बहुत प्रभावित हो रहा है। मैं नहीं जानता हूं कि अब उसकी क्या स्थिति है? क्या आपने रात में छूटने वाली गाड़ियों को फिर से उसी समय में छोड़ना शुरू किया है या अभी भी उन्हें रात में न चलाकर आप सुबह से ही चला रहे हैं, मुझे यह मालूम नहीं है, पर इससे लोगों को बहुत ज्यादा तकलीफ हो रही है।

महोदय, अब मैं नए सर्वे के बारे में कुछ बातें आपके ध्यान में लाना चाह रहा हूं। सर्वे आपका प्राथमिक काम होता है। आप जानते हैं कि छत्तीसगढ़ लगभग 1000 किलोमीटर से अधिक, ऊपर से नीचे, उत्तर से दक्षिण प्रांत है। यहां पर केवल एक ही लाइन चलती है। हमारे मुख्य मंत्री ने, छत्तीसगढ़ शासन ने आपसे यह मांग की है कि नई रेलवे लाइन के बारे में आप केवल सर्वे करें, बेमेतरा, कवर्धा, मंडला, जबलपुर, राजनांदगांव – इनको जोड़ने का प्रयास करें, कम से कम सर्वे जरूर करें, यह मेरा आपके माध्यम से मंत्री जी से निवेदन है।

महोदय, एक और नई रेलवे लाइन के सर्वे के लिए मैं प्रार्थना कर रहा हूं। आपने अम्बिकापुर को दुर्ग से रेल से जोड़ा है, बहुत अच्छी बात है, पर उसमें जो AC Coaches हैं, उनकी संख्या बहुत कम है, इसलिए उसमें कम से कम एक पूरी बोगी लगाइए और सर्वे के लिए मैं आपसे मांग कर रहा हूं कि अम्बिकापुर से झारसुगुड़ा को जोड़िए। आपको ध्यान में आएगा कि वह सारा वनांचल क्षेत्र है, इससे वहां के लोगों को बहुत राहत मिलेगी और आगे जाकर अम्बिकापुर को मुम्बई हावड़ा मार्ग से, जो पुराना रेल मार्ग है....

(3Q/SC पर क्रमशः)

-mp/sc/3q/5.50

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास (क्रमागत) :** उसको चालू किया तो बहुत बड़े विकास की संभावनाएं बढ़ जाएगीं। महोदय, वहां की जनता की मांग है, हम भी अनेक बार यहां बोल चुके हैं कि छत्तीसगढ़ को हरिद्वार से जोड़ा जाए। हरिद्वार एक ऐसा स्थान है जहां सभी प्रांतों से लोग जाते हैं। एक गाड़ी है, 2409 और 2410, रायगढ़-निजामुद्दीन-गोंडवाना - इसको आप यदि हरिद्वार से जोड़ने का प्रयास करेंगे तो यह गाड़ी पूरी जनता को हरिद्वार तक पहुंचाने में समर्थ होगी, यह मेरा आपसे निवेदन है। महोदय, रायपुर सरीखे राजधानी के केन्द्र पर भी अभी विकलांग और वृद्ध लोगों के लिए सीढ़ी चढ़ना बहुत मुश्किल है, वहां पर escalator की बात तो बहुत दूर की है, ramp भी नहीं है। एक बहुत बड़े नगर के इन हजारों-लाखों लोगों को आप कृपा करके यह सुविधा जरूर प्रदान करिए। रायपुर एक महत्वपूर्ण स्थान है और प्रदेश की राजधानी है। मेरा अनुरोध है कि रायपुर, बिलासपुर और दुर्ग में विकलांगों के लिए, कमजोर लोगों के लिए, वृद्ध लोगों के लिए और महिलाओं के लिए आप कम से कम कुछ ramp बनाने को प्राथमिकता दें और इस बारे में लिखें। महोदय, एक गाड़ी है जो पुरी को जोधपुर से जोड़ती है। हम भी अनेक बार इसके संबंध में यहां पर कह चुके हैं। आप तीर्थस्थानों को आपस में जोड़ते हैं, जो चार-पांच प्रांतों से लोग हैं, 12 महीने वे लोग वहां जाते हैं, वहां आप गाड़ी चला रहे हैं, हमने उसकी फ्रीक्वेंसी एक से दो करने की मांग की है, तीन करने की मांग की है। मैं आपको आश्वस्त करना चाहता हूं, आप अपने अधिकारियों से पता लगा लीजिए, उस गाड़ी को यदि आप रोज भी चलाएंगे तो लोग उसमें जाएंगे। जगन्नाथपुरी, द्वारिका, रामेश्वरम् इस देश के ऐसे तीर्थस्थान हैं, जहां पर 12 महीने लोग जाते हैं। महोदय, रायपुर के पास एक मंदिर है, वह पूर्वी तटीय रेलवे ज़ोन में आता है। मैं जब समिति के दौरे पर गया था तब मुझे बातचीत से यह मालूम हुआ कि चूंकि वह स्थान भुवनेश्वर से बहुत दूर और रायपुर के एकदम निकट है, उस लाइन पर पहला ही स्टेशन है तो उसको क्यों नहीं आप बिलासपुर ज़ोन से जोड़ते हैं? उन लोगों को इसमें कोई आपत्ति नहीं है और इससे लोगों के लिए एक बहुत बड़ी सुविधा हो

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

जाएगी। रायपुर में एक नयी राजधानी बनने जा रही है, मंदिर का नियंत्रण यदि आपके बिलासपुर के ज़ोन से होगा, रायपुर के पास से होगा तो आपको वहां काम करने में सुविधा होगी, अन्यथा वहां नियंत्रण करने में काफी कठिनाइयां हो रही हैं। इस बात पर आपको सहानुभूतिपूर्वक विचार करना चाहिए, यह मेरा आपसे निवेदन है। महोदय, मैं आपको इस बात के लिए धन्यवाद देता हूँ कि आपके मंत्रालय ने कश्मीर से कन्याकुमारी तक का विचार किया है। कश्मीर के बनिहाल से काजीगुंड सुरंग के बारे में आपने उल्लेख किया है। मैं आपके ध्यान में एक बात लाना चाहता हूँ। मैं रेलवे समिति का सदस्य भी रहा हूँ। हम लोग वहां जाकर आए हैं। यह संसार में भारत का मान बढ़ाने वाली एक योजना थी। उसमें इतना सारा समय चला गया है, हजारों रुपए खर्च हो गए हैं, अनेक समितियां बनायी गयी हैं, कृपया आप उसकी जांच कीजिए, यह बहुत महत्व की बात है। इतने लाखों रुपए कहां चले गए, क्यों आप बार-बार समिति बनाते हैं और उसका निरीक्षण-परीक्षण करते रहते हैं? आपने आशा प्रकट की है कि इस साल तक हो जाएगी, मैं भी इसके लिए आपको शुभकामना देता हूँ। आपने रामेश्वरम् का उल्लेख किया है, उसके लिए आप धन्यवाद के पात्र हैं। आपने यह कहा है कि सुरक्षा के बारे में आप बहुत जागरूक हैं। आप आरपीएफ को कुछ अधिकार देने जा रहे हैं। हम सभी जानते हैं कि कानून का विषय राज्य सरकार का विषय है। आप यदि आरपीएफ को अधिकार देने जा रहे हैं, कोई बिल लाने जा रहे हैं तो यह बहुत अच्छी बात है, लेकिन कृपया इसको जल्दी से करिए। आरपीएफ और राज्यों के मंत्रालयों के बीच में हजारों मामले अटके हैं। इसलिए जहां मैं इसका स्वागत करता हूँ, वहीं दूसरी ओर मैं इस बिल को शीघ्र-अति -शीघ्र लाने का निवेदन भी आपसे कर रहा हूँ। महोदय, आपने पृष्ठ संख्या - 12 में मल्टी फंक्शनल कॉम्प्लेक्स की चर्चा की है। हम यह देख रहे हैं कि ऐसे अनेक राज्य हैं जहां पर आप बहुत से कारखाने खोल रहे हैं। आप खोलें, हमें कोई दिक्कत नहीं है, लेकिन ऐसे भी कुछ राज्य हैं, जहां पर यदि आप कुछ कारखाने खोलेंगे तो पिछड़े राज्यों का विकास करने में आप सहायक सिद्ध होंगे। इसके लिए मैं आपको छत्तीसगढ़ में आने का आह्वान कर रहा हूँ। मुझे आश्चर्य है

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

कि पश्चिम और पूर्व में गोल्डन रेल कॉरीडोर के बारे में कहा जा रहा है, इसके बारे में हम कई वर्षों से सुन रहे हैं।

(3आर-एमसीएम पर क्रमशः)

SC/MCM-SK/3R/5-55

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास (क्रमागत)** : परन्तु आश्चर्य की बात है कि अभी तक वह मामला फिजिबिलिटी रिपोर्ट की प्रि-कंडीशन में ही रुका है। जापान से सहायता मिलने वाली है। पहले तो मुझे यही आश्चर्य है कि भारत सरीखे देश को क्यों इधर-उधर भीख मांगनी पड़ती है।

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री तारिक अनवर)** : श्री व्यास जी, आपकी पार्टी का टाइम अभी बाकी है, लेकिन बहुत लोग बोलने वाले हैं। आप जल्दी कन्क्लूड कर दें, तो अच्छा है।

**श्री राजीव प्रताप रूडी** : महोदय, यह विषय मैंने अभी कुछ समय पहले ही उठाया था।.....(व्यवधान)

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास** : महोदय, मैं एक-दो बातें और कह कर समाप्त कर दूंगा और अगर आपकी अनुमति हुई तो बाकी मैं लिखित में उनको दे दूंगा। मैं बस एक मिनट ही और लेता हूं।

**श्री राजीव प्रताप रूडी** : अब सिर्फ दो-तीन मिनट ही बचे हैं, तो इनको बोलने दीजिए।

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास** : आपने रेलवे के किनारे बसे हुए लोगों के बारे में घर देने की पेशकश की है। बहुत पहले हम लोगों ने यह मांग की थी कि महानगरों के पास न देखने योग्य दृश्य हमें रेलवे के दोनों ओर देखने को मिलता है। इसके बारे में आपने सोचा है, जिसके लिए आपको धन्यवाद है। इस प्रकार से आप अपनी ही जमीन पर नई परियोजनाएं बना सकती हैं।

महोदय, मैं अधिक समय नहीं लूंगा, मुझे आपकी अनुमति चाहिए कि बाकी बिन्दु लिखित में मैं माननीय मंत्री जी को दे दूंगा।

**उपसभाध्यक्ष** : आप लिखित में नहीं दे सकते हैं। इस मामले में लिखित में रखने का प्रावधान नहीं है।

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास** : महोदय, गत वर्ष मैंने दिया था, जिसकी मुझे अनुमति दी गई थी।

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

**उपाध्यक्ष (श्री तारिक अनवर):** आपकी जो भी समस्या है वह आप मंत्री जी को दे सकते हैं, लेकिन पटल पर नहीं रख सकते हैं। बाकी बिन्दु आप मंत्री जी को दे दें।

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास :** महोदय, इतना ही कह कर मैं अपनी बात को विराम देता हूँ। बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**श्री संजय राउत (महाराष्ट्र) :** सर, मैं आपको धन्यवाद देता हूँ। ममता जी यहां नहीं हैं, फिर भी मैं आपके माध्यम से रेल मंत्री जी को धन्यवाद देता हूँ, क्योंकि पश्चिम बंगाल के अपने व्यस्त कार्यक्रम में से समय निकालकर आपने रेलवे को समय दिया है और संसद में 2011-12 का रेल बजट पेश किया है।

सर, यह तो तय था कि ममता जी एक पॉपुलर रेल बजट पेश करेंगी और बंगाल को एक विशेष प्राथमिकता देंगी। लेकिन इसके बावजूद यह भी अपेक्षित था कि वे भारतीय रेलवे के सुधार पर भी ध्यान देंगीं। लेकिन ऐसा नहीं हुआ। कहते हैं कि यह गरीबों का बजट है, रेल भाड़ा नहीं बढ़ा है, बढ़ती महंगाई के बावजूद रेलवे ने आठ सालों में किराया नहीं बढ़ाया है। सुनने में यह बात अच्छी लगती है लेकिन किराया नहीं बढ़ने से रेलवे की आय में अपेक्षित बढ़ोत्तरी भी नहीं हो रही है। इसलिए रेलवे के पास लगभग 400 नई योजनाओं के लिए अपेक्षित एक लाख करोड़ रुपए नहीं हैं। तो बहुत सी योजनाएं सिर्फ कागज पर ही रहेंगी या फिर विश्व बैंक से कर्ज लेना होगा, यानी कमाई का एक बड़ा हिस्सा कर्ज चुकाने में जाएगा।

सर, मैं मुम्बई से आया हूँ, इसलिए मैं मुम्बई के लिए जरूर बात करूंगा, क्योंकि इस बजट में मुम्बई को क्या मिला है, यह सवाल मुझे पूछना ही होगा? देश का हर दूसरा रेल यात्री किसी एक ही शहर का हो तो उस शहर पर कितना गौर किया जाना चाहिए? रेलवे के एक मोटे अनुमान के मुताबिक रोजाना एक करोड़ पिचहत्तर लाख लोग रेल यात्रा करते हैं, जिसमें 75 लाख रेल यात्री सिर्फ मुम्बई से हैं। ऐसे में इस शहर पर विशेष ध्यान दिया जाना जरूरी है। मगर विडम्बना है कि मुम्बई को उसका लाभ कभी नहीं मिला, जिसकी वह

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

हकदार है। सर, इस रेल बजट में मुम्बई की ट्रेन एक स्लो रेल ट्रेक पर थम गई है। वर्ष 1999 में एन0डी0ए0 के शासनकाल में मुम्बई की उपनगरीय रेल सेवा को सक्षम बनाने के लिए मुम्बई रेलवे विकास कार्पोरेशन लिमिटेड, एम0आर0वी0सी0 की स्थापना की गई थी। मकसद था कि मुम्बई की रेल को तमाम टेक्निकल और एडमिनिस्ट्रेटिव अड़चनों से दूर करें, ताकि मुम्बईकरों का सफर सुहाना हो सके। इस कार्पोरेशन को केन्द्र से जो ताकत और स्वायत्तता मिलनी चाहिए वह उसे नहीं मिल सकी। 11 वर्ष हो गए, लेकिन अब तक इस कार्पोरेशन को कोई एम0डी0 नहीं मिला है, कोई मुखिया नहीं मिला है।

(3S/GS पर क्रमशः)

YSR-GS/3S/6.00

**श्री संजय राउत (क्रमागत):** मुझे लगता है कि यह रेल मंत्रालय और मुम्बई का दुर्भाग्य है। सर, दूसरी बात MUTP की है। मुम्बई अर्बन ट्रांसपोर्ट प्रोजेक्ट यानी MUTP का पहला चरण 2011 में पूरा किया जाना था।

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री तारिक अनवर) :** संजय राऊत जी, आपको कितना समय लगेगा ?

**श्री संजय राउत :** सर, आप पांच मिनट बोलने का समय दे दीजिए।

**उपसभाध्यक्ष :** ठीक है। आप खत्म करिए, चूंकि 6.00 बजे हाउस Adjourned करना है।

**श्री संजय राउत :** इसका दूसरा चरण 2015 तक पूरा किया जाना है, लेकिन यह काम भी फंड की वजह से रुका है। सर, अगर MUTP फेज 2 पूरा होता है, तो मुम्बईवायियों को ज्यादा सुविधा मिल सकती है। इसमें सभी लोकल ट्रेनों 12 डिब्बे की हो सकती हैं, 800 नई सेवाएं बढ़ सकती हैं, 30 प्रतिशत ज्यादा यात्री सफर कर सकते हैं और प्रति लोकल में 5,000 की जगह 3,000 यात्री जा सकते हैं, लेकिन इस MUTP योजना को ऐसे ही अधर में लटका कर रखा है। यह वर्ल्ड बैंक का प्रोजेक्ट है, फिर भी, रेल मंत्रालय इसे गंभीरता से नहीं ले रहा है।

सर, 1995 में विरार से डहाणू 53 किलोमीटर के रेल खंड को उपनगरीय रेल का दर्जा दिया गया और जल्द ही उस पर उपनगरीय रेल गाड़ियां दौड़ाने की घोषणा की गई, लेकिन

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

16 साल बीतने के बाद भी, उस लाइन पर उपनगरीय रेल गाड़ी दौड़ना तो दूर बोरिवली से विरार के बीच तीसरी और चौथी लाईन पर भी ध्यान नहीं दिया गया है। कुर्ला और ठाणे के बीच की पांचवीं लाइन का काम भी अधर में लटका है, क्योंकि कहीं ट्रैक है, तो कहीं प्लेटफॉर्म नहीं है, अगर प्लेटफॉर्म है, तो ब्रिज नहीं है और ब्रिज है, तो बिजली नहीं है और बिजली है, तो कारशेड नहीं है। यह देश के उस शहर का हाल है जहां से हिन्दुस्तान का अर्थतंत्र संचालित होता है।

सर, लोकल ट्रेन को मुम्बई की लाइफ लाइन कहा जाता है, लेकिन यात्रियों की लाइफ हमेशा से खतरे में रही है। वहां कभी बम विस्फोट होते हैं, कभी कसाब जैसे आतंकी घुसकर हमले करते हैं, कभी एक्सिडेंट होते हैं, इन कारणों से लोकल ट्रेनों की यात्रा असुरक्षित होती जा रही है। मैंने कल ही जी.आर.पी. द्वारा 2010 क्राइम शीट पर नजर डाली। साल 2010 में रेलवे प्लेटफॉर्मों पर छेड़खानी की घटनाओं में वृद्धि हुई है। लोकल ट्रेनों में चैन खींचने और रेलवे ट्रैक से कटकर मरने वालों की संख्या में बढ़ोत्तरी हुई है। मैं सभी क्राइम के आंकड़े नहीं दूंगा, फिर भी, रेल मंत्रालय को इस ओर ध्यान देना चाहिए।

सर, मैं महाराष्ट्र से आता हूं और मैं दावे के साथ कहता हूं कि इस रेल बजट में 10 करोड़ महाराष्ट्रवासियों को निराशा के अलावा कुछ हाथ नहीं लगा है। महाराष्ट्र की स्थापना से लेकर आज तक 50 वर्षों में इस राज्य में रेलवे का विस्तार महज 18 प्रतिशत ही हो सका है। यह विस्तार कोंकण रेलवे की 982 किलोमीटर रेल लाईन को जोड़कर है। यदि कोंकण रेलवे कारपोरेशन को छोड़ दिया जाए तो महाराष्ट्र में रेलवे के विस्तार का अंदाजा और महाराष्ट्र से रेलवे के सौतेले व्यवहार का सबूत मिल जाता है। राज्य में अमरावती-नरखेड, अमरावती-बीड-परली-बारामती-लोबंद-पनवेल-रोहा आदि में 520 किलोमीटर का काम शुरू है। ये सभी काम मार्च 2011 तक पूरे होने थे, लेकिन फंड नहीं है, इसलिए ये सभी काम अधूरे पड़े हैं। इन पर 1500 करोड़ रुपये का खर्चा होना है।

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**

सर, मुम्बई-मंगलोर, कोंकण का यह मार्ग हिन्दुस्तान की ऐतिहासिक परियोजना है। इस मार्ग पर कुल 27 गाड़ियां चलती हैं। यह सिंगल लाइन है, इसलिए इस पर काफी परेशानियां होती रहती हैं। अब जरूरत है कि कोई बड़ी दुर्घटना होने से पहले इस मार्ग को डबल लाईन में बदला जाए। कोंकण रेलवे मार्ग के जोड़ने वाले मध्य रेलवे को पनवेल-रोहा के 70 किलोमीटर मार्ग के दोहरीकरण का काम मध्य रेलवे ने हाथ में लिया है, लेकिन वह काम अभी तक पूरा नहीं हुआ है।

सर, ममता जी ने एक घोषणा जरूर की है और मैं उनका आभारी हूँ। महाराष्ट्र के ठाकुरली में 700 मेगावाट का पावर प्लांट लगाने का ऐलान सुनने में तो अच्छा है, लेकिन हकीकत से दूर है। इससे पहले भी रेलवे ने दो पावर प्लांटों की घोषणा की थी, लेकिन अभी तक उनका काम पूरा नहीं हुआ है। सर, रेल बजट का जो सबसे खतरनाक ऐलान हमें लगता है, वह रेल पटरियों के किनारे की जमीन पर अतिक्रमण को कानूनी जामा पहनाने का प्रयास है। रेल मंत्री जी ने अतिक्रमणकारियों को मकान का वायदा कर अब तक इससे दूर रह रहे लोगों के लिए प्रोत्साहन का पैकेज पेश कर दिया है। इससे आने वाले सालों में नए इलाकों में रेल लाइनों के किनारे नई झुग्गियां देखने को मिलें, तो कोई आश्चर्य नहीं होगा। यह वोट की राजनीति है, लेकिन इससे नुकसान रेलवे को होगा। इससे पश्चिम बंगाल के रेल किनारे रहने वालों के वोट ममता जी को मिल जायेंगे, लेकिन रेलवे की कीमती जमीन हमेशा के लिए रेलवे के हाथ से निकल जायेगी। मुम्बई की रेलवे पटरियों के किनारे रहने वाले लोग कहां से आए हैं, कब आए हैं, इसकी भी जांच-पड़ताल करनी चाहिए।

सर, रेलवे भर्ती के मामले में रेलवे ने हमेशा स्थानीय लोगों के साथ अन्याय किया है। यह सिर्फ महाराष्ट्र की बात नहीं है। मैं पूरे देश की बात करता हूँ। रेलवे भर्ती में स्थानीय लोगों को दूर रखने का हर बार प्रयास होता है। चतुर्थ श्रेणी में स्थानीय लोगों को प्राथमिकता मिलनी चाहिए, लेकिन उसमें भी अनेक प्रकार की अड़चनें खड़ी होती हैं।

(3T/ASC पर जारी)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-04.03.2011**ASC-VKK/3T/6.05

**श्री संजय राउत (क्रमागत)** : मैं एक छोटा सा उदाहरण देना चाहता हूँ कि मध्य रेलवे में गैंगमैन, सफाईवाला, प्वाइंटमैन, खलासी के पदों पर रिक्लूटमेंट हो रहा है। इन पदों के लिए लगभग 3500 कर्मचारियों का रिक्लूटमेंट होना है। इनका रिक्लूटमेंट प्रोसेस बहुत मुश्किल है। मैं इन पदों के लिए फिजिकल फिटनेस की जरूरत मानता हूँ। इस फिजिकल फिटनेस टेस्ट में पुरुषों को 6 मिनट में 500 मीटर दौड़ना पड़ता है और महिलाओं को 400 मीटर दौड़ना पड़ता है। वहां के जनरल मैनेजर श्री कुलभूषण जी से मैंने बात की और कहा कि यह कोई ओलम्पिक की दौड़ नहीं है, यहां किसी को मेडल भी नहीं लाना है। ये जो छोटे-छोटे पद हैं, आप इनके लिए भर्ती प्रक्रिया को सरल बनाइए। अभी जैसा कि एक माननीय सदस्य ने कहा कि आपके पास हमारे लिए कभी टाइम होता नहीं है। हमें बहुत कम टाइम मिलता है...(व्यवधान)..

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री तारिक अनवर)** : आपको पूरा समय मिला और आपके समय से ज्यादा समय मिला है। आपकी पार्टी का जितना समय था, उससे ज्यादा समय आपको दिया गया है। जो भी आपकी समस्या है, आप मंत्री जी को दे दीजिए।

**श्री संजय राउत** : सर, ठीक है।

(समाप्त)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** The House stands adjourned till 11 a.m. on Monday, the 7<sup>th</sup> March 2011.

-----

**The House then adjourned at six minutes past  
six of the clock till eleven of the clock  
on Monday, the 7<sup>th</sup> March 2011**