

1A/11.00/sk-asc

**The House met at eleven of the clock,  
Mr. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.**

-----

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया :** मान्यवर, घड़ियां क्या टाइम बता रही हैं? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सीताराम येचुरी :** एक टाइम पाकिस्तान का है और एक टाइम बंगलादेश का है।  
...(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please, please ..(Interruptions).. There is a technical fault which is being corrected. ..(Interruptions).. Please, allow the new Members to take the oath.

### **MEMBERS SWORN**

Shri Nand Kumar Sai (Chhattisgarh)

Shri Shadi Lal (Haryana)

Shri Ghulam Nabi Wani (Jammu & Kashmir)

Shri Anil Dave (Madhya Pradesh)

Shri Kaptan Singh (Madhya Pradesh)

Shri Vilasrao Dagadojirao Deshmukh (Maharashtra)

Shri Ranjitsinh Vijaysinh Mohite-Patil (Maharashtra)

Shri Narendra Budania (Rajasthan)

Shri Jai Prakash (Uttar Pradesh)

(Followed by 1b-ysr)

-SK/YSR-LT/11.05/1B

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question No.461.

**सरदार तरलोचन सिंह :** सभापति जी..(व्यवधान)..हमने नोटिस दे रखा है..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** One minute please. (Interruptions)

सरदार तरलोचन सिंह : धर्म के बारे में ..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** One minute please. (Interruptions)

सरदार तरलोचन सिंह : सभापति जी, नोटिस दिया हुआ है..(व्यवधान)..जब तक इस बारे में डिसकस नहीं होगा..(व्यवधान)..

श्री एस.एस.अहलुवालिया : सभापति जी, हमने सस्पेंशन ऑफ क्वेश्चन ऑवर का नोटिस दिया है ..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please. (Interruptions)

श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह मजीठा : सभापति जी...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** No, one minute please. (Interruptions) None of this is going on record. (Interruptions)

सरदार तरलोचन सिंह : \*

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट ..(व्यवधान)..मेरी बात सुन लीजिए..(व्यवधान)..

श्री एस.एस.अहलुवालिया : \*

श्री सभापति : प्लीज आप बैठ जाइए ..(व्यवधान)..अहलुवालिया जी, आप बैठ जाइए ..(व्यवधान)..देखिए ..(व्यवधान).. Please. (Interruptions) This was discussed this morning. (Interruptions) It was decided that this matter would be taken up after the Question Hour. (Interruptions) Please observe the agreement reached. (Interruptions) Please. (Interruptions)

(Contd. By VKK/1C)

-YSR/VKK/1C/11.10

**MR. CHAIRMAN (CONTD.):** We decided on a course of action this morning. Please observe it. (Interruptions) We decided on a course of action this morning. (Interruptions) Please resume your places.

-----  
\* Not recorded.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

(Interruptions) Allow the Question Hour to proceed. (Interruptions) We decided on a course of action. (Interruptions) The House is adjourned till 12 o'clock.

-----

**The House then adjourned at  
ten minutes past eleven of the clock  
till twelve of the clock.**

-VKK-TMV-SCH/1D/12.00

**The House re-assembled at twelve of the clock,  
MR.CHAIRMAN in the Chair.**

-----

**MEMBERS SWORN (CONTD.)**

Shri Govindrao Wamanrao Adik (Maharashtra)

(Ends)

**PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE**

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY:** Sir, on behalf of Shri Pawan Kumar Bansal, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Water Resources) and the National Projects Construction Corporation Limited (NPCC), for the year 2009-10.

**(MR.DEPUTY CHAIRMAN, in the Chair)**

**SHRI PRITHVIRAJ CHAVAN:** Sir, I lay on the Table:

- I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:
  - (a) Twelfth Annual Report and Accounts of the Technology Development Board (TDB), New Delhi, for the year 2007-08, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
  - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
  - (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

mentioned at (a) above.

II. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Outcome Budget for the year 2009-10 in respect of the Department of Atomic Energy.

**...(Interruptions)...**

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY:** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the South Zone Cultural Centre (SZCC), Thanjavur, for the year 2007-08, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Cultural Centre.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.
- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National School of Drama, New Delhi, for the year 2007-08, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above School.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.
- (iii) (a) Annual Report of the Nava Nalanda Mahavihara, Nalanda, for the year 2007-08.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the Nava Nalanda Mahavihara, Nalanda, for the year 2007-08 and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (b) above.
- (iv) (a) Annual Report of the Central Institute of Higher Tibetan Studies (CIHTS), Sarnath, Varanasi, for the year 2007-08.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the Central Institute of Higher Tibetan Studies (CIHTS), Sarnath, Varanasi, for the year 2007-08 and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (b) above.

**...(Interruptions)...**

**SHRI AJAY MAKEN:** Sir, I lay on the Table:

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Home Affairs, under sub-section (3) of Section 156 of the Indo-Tibetan Border Police Force Act, 1992:

- (1) G.S.R. 518 (E), dated the 14<sup>th</sup> July, 2009, publishing the Indo-Tibetan Border Police Force, Assistant Sub-Inspector (Stenographer) Group 'C' posts Recruitment (Amendment) Rules, 2009.
- (2) G.S.R. 502 (E), dated the 7<sup>th</sup> July, 2008, publishing the Indo-Tibetan Border Police, Telecommunication Cadre (Group 'A' and 'B' posts) Recruitment (Amendment) Rules, 2008, together with delay statement.
- (3) G.S.R. 501 (E), dated the 7<sup>th</sup> July, 2008, publishing the Indo-Tibetan Border Police Force (Group 'B' and 'C' posts of Hindi Translators) Recruitment Rules, 2008, together with delay statement.

II. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Home Affairs Notification S.O. 1525 (E), dated the 22<sup>nd</sup> June, 2009, including Communist Party of India (Maoist) and all its formations and front organizations in the Schedule to the Unlawful Activities (Prevention) Act, 1967, under Section 53 of the Unlawful Activities (Prevention) Act, 1967.

**...(Interruptions)...**

**SHRI SULTAN AHMED:** Sir, I lay on the Table:

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) of Section 619A of the Companies Act, 1956:

- (a) Twenty-fifth Annual Report and Accounts of the Ranchi Ashok Bihar Hotel Corporation Limited, Patna, for the year 2007-08, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

II. Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (I) above.

...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI D. NAPOLEON:** Sir, I lay on the Table:

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under Section 15 of the National Commission for Backward Classes Act, 1993:

(a) Annual Report of the National Commission for Backward Classes (NCBC), New Delhi, for the year 2007-08.

(b) Review by the Government on the working of the National Commission for Backward Classes, New Delhi, for the year 2007-08.

II. Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (I) above.

....(Interruptions)...

(Ends)

**MESSAGE FROM LOK SABHA****THE RIGHT OF CHILDREN TO FREE AND COMPULSORY  
EDUCATION BILL, 2009**

**SECRETARY-GENERAL:** Sir, I have to report to the House the following message received from the Lok Sabha, signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha:

"In accordance with the provisions of rule 120 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to inform you that Lok Sabha, at its sitting held on the 4<sup>th</sup> August, 2009, agreed without any amendment to the Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education Bill, 2009, which was passed by Rajya Sabha at its sitting held on the 20<sup>th</sup> July, 2009."

(Ends)

....(Interruptions)....

**STATEMENT RE: STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF TWO-HUNDRED AND SEVENTH REPORT OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT**

**THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRI KAPIL SIBAL):** Sir, I make a statement regarding status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Two-hundred and Seventh Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Human Resource Development.

(Ends)

...(Interruptions)...

**STATEMENT RE: STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF ONE-HUNDRED AND THIRTY-SEVENTH REPORT OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON HOME AFFAIRS**

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI AJAY MAKEN):** Sir, I make a statement regarding status of implementation of recommendations contained in the One-hundred and Thirty-seventh Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Home Affairs.

(Ends)

...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Calling Attention, Shri Tapan Kumar Sen. (Interruptions)... Mr. Ahluwalia, it was agreed. (Interruptions)... Please sit down. (Interruptions)... Please sit down. (Interruptions)...

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया:** सर, राष्ट्र की सबसे पुरानी संस्था को तोड़ने का ...(व्यवधान) प्रधान मंत्री जी सदन में आएंगे, वे हम लोगों को जवाब दें।

**श्री उपसभापति:** अहलुवालिया जी, आपने ज़ीरो आवर में नोटिस दिया है, tomorrow we will take up this subject. (Interruptions)... We have agreed to take up this subject. (Interruptions)... Please sit down. (Interruptions)... We have agreed. (Interruptions)...

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया:** सर, यह राष्ट्र की सबसे पुरानी संस्था का सवाल है ..(व्यवधान) ।

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** We have important subjects. (Interruptions)...

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया:** प्रधान मंत्री जी सदन में आकर इस बात का जवाब दें ...(व्यवधान) ।

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** The House is adjourned till 1.00 p.m.

\*\*\*\*\*

**The House then adjourned at five minutes past twelve of the clock till one of the clock.**

PSV-VK/1E/1.00

**The House reassembled at one of the clock,  
MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Shri Tapan Kumar Sen to call the attention ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह मजीठा:** सर, ...(व्यवधान)... प्रधान मंत्री जी से ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एम० वेंकैया नायडु:** सर, एक मिनट। ...(व्यवधान)... आप मेरी बात सुनिए। यहाँ जो issue उठाया गया है, वह एक भावनात्मक विषय भी है और एक important issue भी है। मैं उस issue में नहीं जा रहा हूँ। इसके अलावा भी कई लोग हाउस में अपने-अपने issues को discuss करना चाहते हैं। इसलिए मेरा सुझाव यह है कि आप मुद्दा उठाने का मौका



दीजिए। उस पर सरकार respond करे, उसके बाद आगे जाएँगे। Otherwise, ये लोग resist करते रहेंगे और उससे कोई समाधान नहीं निकलेगा।

**श्री उपसभापति:** श्री वेंकैया नायडु जी, यह बात तय हुई थी कि हम इसे कल जीरो ऑवर में लेंगे और इस पर बात उठाने की इजाजत दी जाएगी। क्योंकि आज Call Attention है, जीरो ऑवर नहीं था, इसलिए सुबह में यह बात भी हुई थी कि हम 3 या 5 लोगों को यह मुद्दा उठाने देंगे, मगर उन्होंने इसे accept नहीं किया।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** सर, ऐसी बात नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)... आज रेडी हैं ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री एम0 वेंकैया नायडु:** सर, आज रेडी हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... कल क्योंकि last day है, इसलिए कल यह अच्छा नहीं रहेगा। ... (व्यवधान)...

**डा0 राम प्रकाश:** सर, ... (व्यवधान)... मुझे हरियाणा का मुद्दा उठाने का मौका दिया जाए। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री ईश्वर सिंह:** सर, ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री एम0 वेंकैया नायडु:** यह पंजाब-हरियाणा का झगड़ा नहीं है। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** सर, यह पंजाब-हरियाणा का झगड़ा नहीं है। ... (व्यवधान)... यह राष्ट्र की सबसे पुरानी संस्था SGPC का मसला है। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप उठाइए, ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री एम0 वेंकैया नायडु:** सर, मेरा सुझाव है कि इसे आप अभी करिए, यह हो जाएगा। ... (व्यवधान)... अभी भी करिए।

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप इसे उठाइए, ... (व्यवधान)... देखिए, अब मैं कैसे कहूँ कि वह नहीं बोलेंगे। ... (व्यवधान)... उनकी बात भी तो है ... (व्यवधान)... वे अगर उठाएँगे तो उन्हें भी मौका देना है न? ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** सर, ... (व्यवधान)... प्रधान मंत्री जी Leader of the House हैं। ... (व्यवधान)... Prime Minister Leader of the House हैं। ... (व्यवधान)... सिख हैं ... (व्यवधान)... वह बोलें। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** तब मुझे दूसरों को भी मौका देना पड़ेगा। ... (व्यवधान)...

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** दूसरों को क्या मौका देना पड़ेगा? ...(व्यवधान)... यह सिखों का धार्मिक मामला है। इस पर consultation करने की जरूरत नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)... वह तो पार्टी है। ...(व्यवधान)... Leader of the House हैं...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** Leader of the House क्यों? Why do you drag the Leader of the House into it? (Interruptions) Why do you drag the Leader of the House into it? (Interruptions) आप जाइए न? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** सर, ...(व्यवधान)... यह देश की सबसे पुरानी संस्था है ...(व्यवधान)... और उस संस्था को कानून बनाकर तोड़ना चाहते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... देश की सबसे पुरानी संस्था शिरोमणि गुरुद्वारा प्रबन्धक कमेटी है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एम0 वेंकैया नायडु:** सर, अभी समस्या का समाधान करिए ...(व्यवधान)... यह हो जाएगा। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** उसको तोड़ने की कोशिश हो रही है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** समाधान यही होगा कि I can't say that only one party will speak and the other party will not speak. (Interruptions) आप वह नहीं चाह रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... आप बोलिए न? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** सर, ...(व्यवधान)... स्पेशल मेंशन या जीरो ऑवर में क्या आप disassociate करने वाले को बोलने देते हैं? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** अहलुवालिया जी, यह जीरो ऑवर नहीं है न! ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** सर, यहाँ पर हमारा एक सवाल है। ...(व्यवधान)... हमारा सवाल यह है कि नेता सदन को यहाँ बुलाइए। वह सदन को एश्योर करें और सदन के माध्यम से पूरे राष्ट्र को ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** हर मामले में नेता सदन कैसे आते हैं! ...(व्यवधान)... Why do you drag the Leader of the House into it? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** यह राष्ट्र की सबसे पुरानी संस्था शिरोमणि गुरुद्वारा प्रबन्धक कमेटी को टुकड़े-टुकड़े करने की जो कोशिश है, उसे वह बंद करेंगे। इसका assurance दें वह। ...(व्यवधान)... वह इस बात की assurance दें। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एम0 वेंकैया नायडु:** सर, आप इन्हें शांति से बोलने दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... यह पाँच मिनट में हो जाएगा। ...(व्यवधान)... यह पाँच मिनट में हो जाएगा।

**श्री उपसभापति:** वेंकैया जी, मैं बोलने की इजाजत दूँगा। दूसरों को भी बोलने की इजाजत देनी है न? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** नहीं, कैसे देनी है? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सीताराम येचुरी:** सर, ...(व्यवधान)... इसे आप तय करिए कि अगर ये बोलते हैं, तब सब को मौका मिलेगा? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** क्या आप कभी जीरो ऑवर में या स्पेशल मेंशन में disassociate करने वाले को बोलने देते हैं? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** यह जीरो ऑवर नहीं है ...(व्यवधान)... It is not Zero Hour. ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** क्या आप कभी disassociate करने वाले को बोलने देते हैं? ...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** On important issues we have allowed it. (Interruptions)..

**श्री एम0 वेंकैया नायडु:** सर, ...(व्यवधान)... कोई associate करे या disassociate करे ...(व्यवधान)... क्या आपने कभी disassociate करने का मौका दिया है? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** कभी नहीं दिया आपने ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** यह जीरो ऑवर नहीं है न? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एम0 वेंकैया नायडु:** यह जीरो ऑवर नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** जीरो ऑवर भी हो, तब भी नहीं दिया है। ...(व्यवधान)... ऐसे कभी भी नहीं दिया है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एम0 वेंकैया नायडु:** हाउस में एक controversy आई। Tension is also, unnecessarily, building up. So, one way is the Chair can take an initiative to allow the Member to raise this issue and say what he wants to say and then the Government can respond.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** The Chair can definitely take an initiative, but ...(Interruptions). Then I will have to allow. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:** सर, प्रश्न काल स्थगन का नोटिस दिया। ...(व्यवधान)... आपने तब भी नहीं बोलने दिया। ...(व्यवधान)... जीरो ऑवर भी बोलने नहीं दिया। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: जीरो ऑवर नहीं है न? ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया: जीरो ऑवर भी बोलने नहीं देंगे, ...(व्यवधान)... तब कैसे यह होगा? ...(व्यवधान)... आप बोलते हैं कि हमने मांगा नहीं। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एम0 वेंकैया नायडु: लोक सभा में अलाऊ किया है। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: लोक सभा में अलाऊ किया है ...(व्यवधान)... हम भी अलाऊ करना चाहते हैं न? ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया: Leader of the House हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... उन्हें बुलाइए।  
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप बोलिए। ...(व्यवधान)... आप बोलिए। ...(व्यवधान)... आप बोलिए न?  
...(व्यवधान)...

(1एफ पर आगे)

1f/hms-ks/1.05

श्री एम0 वेंकैया नायडु : वहां कांग्रेस वाला कोई नहीं बोला?

MR DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not know that. It is independent of...  
(Interruptions) आप बैठिए, प्लीज बैठिए। मिस्टर तरलोचन सिंह, आप बैठिए।

डा0 राम प्रकाश : सर, हमें बोलने दीजिए।

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठिए।

## RE. ALLEGED BIFURCATION OF SHIROMANI GURUDWARA PRABANDHAK COMMITTEE

श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया : सर, लोक हित के महत्वपूर्ण विषय पर मैंने सुबह प्रश्न काल स्थगन का नोटिस दिया था। उस का मूल कारण था कि 1925 के एक्ट के तहत बनी राष्ट्र की सब से पुरानी संस्था शिरोमणि गुरुद्वारा प्रबंधक कमेटी, जो सिखों के धार्मिक मसले और सिखों के ऐतिहासिक गुरुद्वारों के रख-रखाव के लिए चलायी जाती है, जिस के प्रथम अध्यक्ष देश के स्वतंत्रता सेनानी शिरोमणि बाबा खड़ग सिंह थे, उनके नेतृत्व में वह एस0जी0पी0सी0 चली। महोदय, जब उस एस0जी0पी0सी0 का कानून पास हुआ, ब्रिटिश साम्राज्यवाद की

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

लाहौर एसैम्बली में जब यह कानून पास हुआ, तब एक बात महात्मा गांधी जी ने कही थी कि हम आजादी की जंग की पहली लड़ायी जीत गए। नेहरू जी ने उस आंदोलन में, जैतो के मामले में, जब मोर्चा लगा, तब वहां जाकर गिरफ्तारी दी, लाखों लोग शहीद हुए, लाखों लोग जेल गए, सजाएं काटीं। यह एक धार्मिक अधिकार पाने के लिए सिखों ने यह जंग लड़ी और जद्दो-जेहाद करते हुए यह एस0जी0पी0सी0 एक्ट पास किया। आज हरियाणा सरकार उसे तोड़कर, उस के टुकड़े-टुकड़े कर के, हरियाणा में एक अलग एस0जी0पी0सी0 बनाने के लिए एक अध्यादेश जारी कर रही है। मेरा कहना यह है कि 1925 में जो कानून पास हुआ है, उस में संशोधन करने का अधिकार पार्लियामेंट को है या 1925 से जो एक परंपरा चली आ रही है, उन सिखों को आहत करने के लिए यह अध्यादेश जारी कर रही है। महोदय, इस के पहले भी हम ने देखा है, भिंडरावाले पैदा हुआ, उस ने एस0जी0पी0सी0 में चुनाव लड़वाएं और जब वे नहीं जीत सके तो बंदूकधारी लोग अकाल तख्त पर बैठ गए। फिर ऑपरेशन ब्लू स्टार हुआ, देश की प्रधान मंत्री मारी गयी, भिंडरावाले मारे गए, सिख आहत हुए और हमारा धार्मिक स्थान टुकड़े-टुकड़े कर दिया गया। आज उसी धार्मिक स्थान की मर्यादाओं की रक्षा करने के लिए, उस की रक्षा करने के लिए जो कानून बना हुआ है ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री उपसभापति :** आप बैठिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... Alhuwaliaji, don't raise controversial issues. (Interruptions) Don't bring in all those issues. (Interruptions)

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया :** सर, इश्यू तो यही है, एस0जी0पी0सी0 का इश्यू यही है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री उपसभापति :** आप एस0जी0पी0सी0 का इश्यू लीजिए, आप हिस्ट्री में क्यों जा रहे हो? ...*(व्यवधान)*....

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया :** पंडित जवाहर लाल नेहरू का ...*(व्यवधान)*...सर, मैं आप को गुरुद्वारों के बारे में और सिखों की राय के बारे में पंडित जवाहर लाल नेहरू और मास्टर तारा सिंह का पैक्ट ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री उपसभापति :** वह तो ठीक है, आप सवाल उठाइए न। तारीख सब को मालूम है, आप सवाल बताइए?

श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया : उसके बाद लोंगोवाल का पैक्ट ...(व्यवधान)

श्री उपसभापति : आज विषय क्या है, उस पर बोलिए।

श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया : सर, विषय वही है कि आज हरियाणा सरकार एक अध्यादेश जारी कर के एक separate SGPC बनाने की कोशिश कर रही है। क्या यह देश के हित में, राष्ट्र के हित और सिखों के हित में है क्या?

श्री उपसभापति : ठीक है।

श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया : मैं सरकार से मांग करता हूँ कि इस सदन के नेता डा0 मनमोहन सिंह, जो इत्तफ़ाक से इस सदन के नेता भी हैं, प्रधान मंत्री भी हैं, सिख भी हैं ..(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति : आप उन को इस में क्यों ला रहे हैं? That is not the issue. It has nothing to do with the Prime Minister.

श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया : सर, सिख इसे कभी बर्दाश्त नहीं करेंगे। ...(व्यवधान)

श्री उपसभापति : नहीं, यह ठीक नहीं है। Don't drag the Prime Minister into it.

श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया : सर, मेरा तो सीधा सा सवाल है।

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** The issue that you have given here is 'Alleged Bifurcation of the Shiromani Gurudwara Prabandhak Committee in Haryana'. You restrict your submission to this subject.

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, I have just explained what happened in the past, पास्ट में क्या हुआ ...(व्यवधान)...

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Sir, he has not made any comment against anybody. He has only referred to history.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** That is not necessary. He may refer to so many things in history, 1857 also. But, for a meaningful discussion, let us not raise controversial issues. (Interruptions)

(Followed by 1g/tdb)

TDB-DS/1G/1.10

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया:** सर, फिर वही dirty politics की जा रही है। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप बोलिये न। ..(व्यवधान)

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया:** यही dirty politics उस समय भी जब एस.जी.पी.सी. को ..(व्यवधान)

**श्री उपसभापति:** आपका सवाल इतना ही है कि "Alleged bifurcation of the Sikh Gurudwara Prabandhak Committee in Haryana". ...(Interruptions)... You are in favour of it or not. ...(Interruptions)... That is all. ...(Interruptions)... That is all. ...(Interruptions)... अब बात को खत्म कीजिए। ..(व्यवधान)

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Yes, I want an assurance from the Government. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, Shri Gujral. ...(Interruptions)... Now, Sardar Tarlochan Singh. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया:** सर, इस सदन में (व्यवधान)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Do you want...(Interruptions)... Please take your seats. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह मजीठा:** सर, ..(व्यवधान)

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप बैठिये। ..(व्यवधान)... मैं खड़ा हूँ, आप तो बैठिये। ..(व्यवधान)...इतनी परम्परा तो निभाइये। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री नंदी येल्लैया:** सर, ..(व्यवधान)...

**डा. राम प्रकाश:** उपसभापति महोदय, ..(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप लोग बैठिये। ..(व्यवधान)... आप बैठिये ..(व्यवधान)... It is uncontrollable. ...(Interruptions)... If the Members of the Treasury Benches also start speaking together...(Interruptions)... देखिये ..(व्यवधान)... आप बैठिये न ..(व्यवधान).. बोलने देना, न देना मेरा अधिकार है। आप बैठिये ..(व्यवधान)... आपने यह ज़ीरो आवर के सस्पेंशन का भी सबमिशन दिया है और सस्पेंशन ऑफ क्वेश्चन



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

आवर के लिए भी दिया था। यह बात तय हुई थी कि इस विषय को उठाया जाए और यह भी तय हुआ था कि as an exceptional case, this will be allowed to be raised. Only three Members will speak on it; that was the understanding. The only thing is, it is an alleged bifurcation. Some people want it; some people do not want it. You put your point of view. Now, if you raise certain issues, whether it relates to history or some other thing, the other Members also have the right to put their points of view. ...(Interruptions)... You see, your issue is specific, and you raise a specific issue. To that extent, I will allow. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN:** He has finished, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I will allow you also. ...(Interruptions)... Now, Sardar Tarlochan Singh....(Interruptions)...

**श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह मजीठा:** सर, ..(व्यवधान)

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप बैठिये। ..(व्यवधान)... Mr. Keshava Rao, this is not correct. ...(Interruptions)... देखिये, आप बैठिये। मैं बोल रहा हूँ, आप सुनिये। ..(व्यवधान)

**श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह मजीठा:** सर, ..(व्यवधान)

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप बैठिये। आपकी पार्टी से मैं representation दे रहा हूँ, आप बैठिये। हम सबको नहीं दे सकते। आपकी पार्टी से we will give representation. ...(Interruptions)..... केशव राव जी, मैंने यह कहा था कि as a special case, Zero Hour पर morning में discussion हुआ है कि यह केस ज़ीरो आवर में लेंगे। The Chair is allowing this issue to be raised. If you want to say anything on this issue, I can't allow you because you have not given a notice. ...(Interruptions)... Please take your seats. ...(Interruptions)... Please take your seats. ...(Interruptions)... If you don't listen to the Chair, then, what

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

can I do? ...(Interruptions)... If you don't listen to the Chair, I will adjourn the House. ...(Interruptions)... You don't want the Business of the House to be taken up. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** Sir, they did not allow the Question Hour to proceed. ...(Interruptions)... They did not allow the Question Hour...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** What is it that you can't allow? ...(Interruptions)... You cannot say that. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Bagrodia, you are a senior Member. You cannot say, "I can't allow". ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** Sir, I did not say like that. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Then, what did you say? ...(Interruptions)... Who will not allow? ...(Interruptions)...

**डा. राम प्रकाश:** उपसभापति महोदय, ..(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** It has been agreed to. ...(Interruptions)... It has been agreed to. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN:** Sir, in the morning, they said that they would allow the Question Hour to go on, but they did not allow the Question Hour. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I can't hear you because there is so much of noise. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री गिरीश कुमार सांगी:** सर, ..(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You see, if five Members get up and start speaking together, nothing will be heard. ...(Interruptions)... Let one

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

Member speak at a time. ...(Interruptions)... At a time, one Member should put his point of view. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI M. VENKAI AH NAIDU:** Sir, you have called him. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I have not called him. ...(Interruptions)... I have called Sardar Tarlochan Singh. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह मजीठा:** सर, ..(व्यवधान)

**श्री उपसभापति:** मैंने आपको नहीं बुलाया है, आप बैठिये। ..(व्यवधान).. गुजराल साहब बोलेंगे या आप बोलेंगे? ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु:** गुजराल साहब नहीं बोलेंगे, बल्कि अकाली दल के नेता बोलेंगे। ..(व्यवधान)

**श्री उपसभापति:** ठीक है, ठीक है। मैं बुलाऊंगा, आप बैठिये ..(व्यवधान)

("1एच" पर आगे)

kgg-aka/1h/1.15

**DR. K. KESHAVA RAO:** Sir, issues become sensitive by their very nature. It is true that 3-4 Members went to you. As you have seen, while speaking on the subject, they might have spoken on that which they think pertinent, but which really affects the entire House. It is true that you have taken a decision to allow three Members, but the entire House also should accept that. If the other Members of the House feel that it is sensitive and they are interested in speaking, you must allow; if not all, as you have identified at least three Members; you allow the Members. (Interruptions) Sir, please hear me. Sir, most unfortunately, we are in the ruling party now. If I were in the Opposition, you would have given me the chance. I know. (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I have been listening to you but if all other Members get up and speak together, how can it be heard? If there is no

discipline, how can it be heard? (Interruptions) Let there be some discipline.

**DR. K. KESHAVA RAO:** Sir, nobody can object to what Mr. Ahluwalia has said. He has a right to say whatever he wants to say. But when it becomes objectionable, the other version has to be heard. The Chair should respond to that situation. Now, the question here is, the Haryana...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please do not go into the merits of the case. (Interruptions)

**DR. K. KESHAVA RAO:** Sir, I am not going into the subject. Sir, I am very particular about my words. I weigh my words and speak. A few Members here are also from Haryana and they too want to respond. The Chair must accommodate them. (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** It is the zero hour; you can either associate or disassociate. (Interruptions)

**डा0 राम प्रकाश :** सर, यह कैसा ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री उपसभापति :** आप बैठिए। ..(व्यवधान).. आप बोलिए सरदार तरलोचन सिंह जी। Please do not go into the background, the history of 1925... (Interruptions) Be specific on this.

**सरदार तरलोचन सिंह (हरियाणा) :** चेयरमैन साहब, मेरे दोस्त अहलुवालिया साहब ने जो मुद्दा उठाया है, मैं उस बारे में थोड़ी सी बात ही करना चाहता हूँ। हमारे सारे दोस्त मैम्बरान बैठे हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री उपसभापति :** आप बैठिए। तरलोचन सिंह जी बोल रहे हैं तो आप क्यों खड़े हैं?

**सरदार तरलोचन सिंह :** सर, यह मामला न हरियाणा, न पंजाब, किसी का नहीं है, यह मामला सिखों का है। सिख माइनोंरिटी कम्युनिटी है। हमारा देश ..(व्यवधान).. सर,

अगर मैं कोई गलतबयानी करुंगा तो मैं उसके लिए जिम्मेवार होऊंगा। सिखों ने देश के लिए सब कुर्बानियां कीं। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री उपसभापति :** आप बैठिए। आप बैठिए।

**सरदार तरलोचन सिंह :** सर, मुझे समझ नहीं आता कि मुझे बोलने क्यों नहीं दे रहे। क्या हमारा इतना भी राइट नहीं कि हम बोल सकें? यह क्या बात हुई? ..(व्यवधान).. आप बीच में दखल क्यों दे रहे हैं, क्या हम आपको बीच में दखल देते हैं?

सर, मैं बड़ी क्लिअर बात करना चाहता हूं कि यह सिखों का issue है, हमारा religious issue, हमारी तो एक ही अपील है कि religious issue में सरकार interfere न करे। किसी भी कौम के religious issue में interfere करने का सरकार को कोई हक नहीं है। पहली बात तो यह है।

दूसरी बात मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि टाइम बहुत खतरनाक है। किसलिए? क्योंकि, आज देश में अनाज की कमी है, पंजाब का सारा सिख राइस में लगा है, पंजाब का सारा सिख बॉर्डर पर बैठा है। आप हमें ऐसी नौबत पर न पहुंचाएं कि हमें agitation करनी पड़े और हमारी attention divert हो। ऐसी नौबत न आए, इसी में देश की भलाई है। हरियाणा बने हुए 43 साल हो चुके हैं ..(व्यवधान).. हरियाणा बने 43 साल हो चुके हैं, आज क्या जरूरत पड़ गई? इसलिए, सर, मेरी एक ही विनती है कि यह सिखों का religious issue है, इसे सिखों तक ही रहने दो। जो हमारा background है, आप उसे जानते हैं, इसलिए ऐसी पोजीशन मुड़कर न आए। हम देश के लिए कुर्बानी, देश की रक्षा और देश में उपज के लिए सब कुछ कर रहे हैं और यह issue बहुत गलत टाइम पर आया है, इसको आप रोकिए।

(समाप्त)

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN:** Please remember what happened...

(Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** This is not allowed. (Interruptions) I have said that no background should be quoted, and speak on the specific issue.

**श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह मजीठा (पंजाब) :** डिप्टी चेयरमैन साहब, आपके माध्यम से मैं सरकार को SGPC के मुतल्लिक कुछ कहना चाहता हूं और मेरे दोस्त, श्री अहलुवालिया साहब, तरलोचन सिंह जी ने और गुजराल साहब ने जो नोटिस दिया है, इन सबको मैं सपोर्ट करता हूं।

सर, बड़ी कुर्बानियों के बाद, सारे हिन्दुस्तान की जितनी भी कौमें थीं - चाहे वह हिन्दू हो, मुसलमान हो, चाहे सिख हो, चाहे जैन हो, चाहे बौद्ध हो - सबने SGPC को बनने में सपोर्ट दी और इतनी कुर्बानियां हुईं, मोर्चे लगे - जैतो का मोर्चा लगा, गुरु-का-बाग मोर्चा लगा। जैतो मोर्चे में पंडित जवाहर लाल नेहरु ने क्या कहा। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री उपसभापति :** आप क्या चाहते हैं, वह कहिए।

('1j/nb' पर आगे)

NB/KLS/1J/1.20

**श्री उपसभापति :** आप क्या चाहते हैं?

**श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह मजीठा :** हम चाहते हैं कि bifurcation नहीं होना चाहिए ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री वी. मैत्रेयन :** इन्होंने एक-दो शब्दों में अपनी बात खत्म कर दी।

**श्री उपसभापति :** आप बैठिए, आप तमिलनाडु की बात यहां क्यों लाते हैं ... (व्यवधान) issue एक ही है ... (व्यवधान) उन्हें बोलने देना, न देना, चेयर का काम है, आप सिफारिश मत कीजिए।

**श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह मजीठा :** \* (It is said that they are on the borders. Please listen. It is said, Sikh is a sleeping giant. Let them sleep. If you prick them... (Interruptions) They should be placed for protection of borders. Let them do farming, and, let the Government rule peacefully

---

\* English translation of the original speech in Punjabi.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

at Delhi. Let the Sikhs fight on border. We are ready for that sacrifice. A finger was pointed at us. We proved our mettle during the Kargil War. What else proofs do you want. You can see our sacrifices by reading our community's name on the walls of Andaman and Nicobar jails.

**श्री उपसभापति :** आप subject पर बोलिए, किसी के ऊपर allegation मत लगाइए, दूसरों को जवाब देना पड़ेगा ... (व्यवधान)

**SHRI NARESH GUJRAL:** My only point is that do not bring politics into it. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह मजीठा :** \* Sir, our SGPC is a religious elected body of the Sikhs. Nobody other than Sikhs are allowed to cast votes in its election. Only Sikhs elect this body, and, nobody other than the Sikhs is allowed to interfere in its affairs. There were pacts like Nehru-Tara Singh pact, and, Sant Longowal-Rajiv pact regarding the management of its affairs.

**श्री उपसभापति :** आपने नोटिस नहीं दिया, आप पंजाबी में बोल रहे हैं, दूसरे लोग समझ नहीं पा रहे हैं ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह मजीठा :** नोटिस दिया है, मेरे साथी मेंबर ने नोटिस दिया है।

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN:** He is speaking in Punjabi. (Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Interpretation is available in Punjabi. आप बोलिए और जल्दी खत्म कीजिए।

**श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह मजीठा :** सर, मैं जल्दी खत्म करूंगा। मैं कहता हूँ कि इतनी बहादुर कौम, जो बॉर्डर पर बैठी हुई है, जिसको आप सबने सपोर्ट किया, कांग्रेस ने सपोर्ट किया, गांधी जी ने सपोर्ट किया, नेहरू जी ने सपोर्ट किया, आज उसको पोलिटिक्स में आगे लाकर,

---

\* English translation of the original speech in Punjabi.

इलेक्शन में फायदा लेने के लिए इस इश्यू को उभारा जा रहा है। SGPC पहले कभी न तो bifurcate हुई थी, न कभी होगी। मैं आपसे सच्चे दिल से कहता हूँ कि आप सिख कौम को इम्तहान में न डालिए। यह बहुत सीरियस मामला है। पहले जो मामले हुए, भिंडरावाला, वह कोई बात नहीं, इस बात पर पूरी कौम इकट्ठी है। आप सरकार से कहिए कि प्राईम मिनिस्टर साहब या तो बयान दें या हमारी बात उन तक पहुंचा दीजिए। मैं सारे मेंबर्स से हाथ जोड़कर कहता हूँ कि यह उनका मामला नहीं है, हम उनको ऐसे नहीं बोलते हैं, वे हमारे सिखों के मामले में दखल न दें, सिखों का मामला सरकार तक और सिखों तक सीमित रहे ... (व्यवधान)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now the matter is over. ...(Interruptions)... They have said that do not do it, do not interfere in it. ...(Interruptions)... Why do you want it? ....(Interruptions)...They wanted to say that thing.

**डा. राम प्रकाश :** देखिए, आप सबने अपनी बात कही है, मैं .... (व्यवधान)

**श्री उपसभापति :** देखिए, उनका एक प्वाइंट ऑफ व्यू था, उन्होंने बोल दिया, यह हरियाणा असेंबली नहीं है, प्वाइंट ऑफ व्यू हो गया, छोड़िए ...

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Let the Leader of the House ...(Interruptions)... सर, लीडर ऑफ दि हाउस यहां आकर रिस्पांड करें .... (व्यवधान)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Do not bring the Leader of the House into picture. ...(Interruptions)... You ask for response to every issue. ...(Interruptions)... Every time the Leader of the House cannot come and respond. ...(Interruptions)... There are Cabinet Ministers; they do their jobs.

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** My suggestion is that if the Government wants to respond, let them respond. But a Member cannot respond.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** During Zero Hour I cannot compel the Government. ...(Interruptions)... It is over now. ...(Interruptions)... Now the next item, the Calling Attention. ...(Interruptions)...



डा. राम प्रकाश : सर, हमें भी अपनी बात कहने का मौका दीजिए ... (व्यवधान)

(Ends)

(Followed by 1K/SSS)

SSS/1K/1.25

**CALLING ATTENTION TO AVAILABILITY OF NATURAL GAS FOR  
POWER GENERATION AND OTHER NATIONAL PRIORITIES AT  
AFFORDABLE PRICE THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY**

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I beg to call the attention of the Minister of Petroleum and Natural Gas to the availability of Natural Gas for power generation and other national priorities at affordable price throughout the country.

**THE MINISTER OF PETROLEUM AND NATURAL GAS (SHRI MURLI DEORA):** Sir, the production and supply of natural gas started in a major way in the country with the commissioning of the Hazira-Vijaipur-Jagdishpur (HVJ) line by GAIL in the year 1987. However, with no major discovery of gas for several years, the demand far outstripped the availability. The first step towards bridging the gap between demand and supply of natural gas was taken when the country embarked on an accelerated programme of exploration and production through the New Exploration Licensing Policy (NELP) bidding rounds in 1999.

Till the year 2008-09, the domestic availability of natural gas in the country was 105 million metric standard cubic metres per day (mmscmd), of which about 28 mmscmd was through import of LNG. Against this, the estimated demand of natural gas was around 197 mmscmd. With the commencement of gas production from KG D-6

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

fields and increased import potential of Liquefied Natural Gas (LNG), the gap between demand and supply has come down.

As on 31.3.2009, the domestic availability of gas in the country was 105 mmscmd, out of which about 53 mmscmd was produced from nominated fields given to Oil and Natural Gas Corporation (ONGC) and Oil India Ltd. (OIL), 24 mmscmd from pre-NELP fields operated by various Contractors, and 28 mmscmd was imported gas in the form of LNG. Out of this, about 40 mmscmd gas was being supplied to power sector, about 30 mmscmd to fertilizer sector and 5 mmscmd for city gas distribution projects.

From 1.4.2009, production of gas from KG D-6 block has started. Presently, 35 mmscmd gas is being produced. Empowered Group of Ministers (EGoM) was constituted for finalizing the price formula as was required under the Production Sharing Contract (PSC) and to finalise the Gas Utilisation Policy. The intention of the Government being to operationalize all gas based assets which were lying idle/unutilized due to non-availability of gas, the EGoM decided the distribution of the first 40 mmscmd from this block as follows:

15 mmscmd to existing gas-based Fertiliser Sector

18 mmscmd to existing gas-based Power Sector

5 mmscmd to City Gas Sector

3 mmscmd for existing gas-based LPG plants.

EGoM further decided that any shortfall in utilization should be allocated to gas-based steel plants and to existing power plants, including captive power plants.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

With the commencement of KG-D-6 production, over 100 mmscmd gas is being supplied to power and fertilizer sectors out of a total supply of 140 mmscmd. As a result of KG-D-6 supplies, about 4000 Megawatt (MW) of additional power is being generated and an annual saving in subsidy on fertilizer of Rs. 3000 crore will be achieved.

The gas at Administered Price Mechanism (APM) prices, which is produced from Government nominated fields, has been priced at about \$ 2 per million metric British thermal unit (mmbtu), except in North East, where it is \$ 1 to \$ 1.2/mmbtu. The prices of gas from pre-NELP fields have been approved in accordance with the Production Sharing Contracts for such fields and are in the range of \$ 3.5 to 5.73/mmbtu. Field-wise prices are at Annexe to my Statement. The price of gas from imported Regasified Liquefied Natural Gas (RLNG) in respect of term contracts is over \$ 5 /mmbtu. The spot price, however, varies from time to time.

(Contd. by NBR/1L)

-SSS/NBR-MP/1L/1.30.

**SHRI MURLI DEORA (CONTD.):** 7. Under the NELP PSC, it was the requirement that a price formula based on arm's length basis be approved prior to sale of gas. The formula submitted by the Contractor of KG-D6 block was considered by the EGoM. It was subjected to further examination by a Committee under the Cabinet Secretary and by Chairman of Economic Advisory Council to Prime Minister. Having considered the Report, the EGoM approved the price formula in its meeting held on 12-09-2007. The formula is linked to crude price and is based on arm's length principle. It leads to a price of 4.2 \$/mmbtu at a

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

crude price of 60\$/bbl or above. At a crude price of 25\$/bbl, it leads to a price of 2.5\$/mmbtu and for crude prices ranging between \$ 25-60/bbl, it varies between 2.5 to 4.2\$/mmbtu.

This price formula is fixed for a period of 5 years. The price of gas being made available to the priority sectors is substantially lower than the prevailing prices of alternate liquid fuels like Naphtha.

8. To make available the natural gas in all regions of the country, the Government has authorized several entities for laying gas pipelines to transport natural gas from the production centres to the potential consumers. As announced by the Finance Minister in his Budget speech, the Government proposes to develop a blueprint for long distance gas highways leading to a National Gas Grid. This would facilitate transportation of gas across length and breadth of the country.

9. A study to consider the feasibility of having a uniform cost price regime is being undertaken, the report of which is expected to be made available within 3 months.

10. I would like to inform the august House that the scenario of natural gas in the country has undergone a change for the better. The Government has awarded 203 blocks under NELP for exploration of oil and gas with a view to access investment and better technology. An investment of \$ 11.97 billion has already been made under NELP. I am confident that natural gas would fuel the economic growth of the country and Government will do all in its power to ensure its use for national priorities at reasonable prices.

**Annexure**

Source	Customers	Approx Qty	Gas Price
--------	-----------	------------	-----------

## Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009

		(in mmscmd)	(in \$/mmbtu)
PMT	All except RRVUNL & torrent	14.8	5.65
	RRVUNL	1.5	4.6
	Torrent	1	4.75
	Weighted Average PMT Price	17.3	5.51
Raava	GAIL	1	3.5
Ravva Satellite	GAIL	0.9	4.3
Lakshmi(CB- OS/2)	GGCL & GPCL	2.5	4.75

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I request the hon. Members to be brief, because there are about 20 Members who sought permission for seeking clarifications. So, it will be only pointed clarifications, not 3 or 4 or 5. It will be restricted, because we have started at 1.24 minutes and it should be completed by 2.24 minutes. One hour has been given for this Calling Attention Motion. I would also like to inform the House that there is no lunch today.

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (WEST BENGAL):** Thank you Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir. Even though the hon. Minister has presented a detailed picture, some of the important issues, which appears to be the crux of the whole issue, have been missing in the statement. The entire policy architecture of the Government of India of the day, on the natural gas, has landed the whole country in such a fuss that almost 70 per cent -- if you really recognise that KG Basin is going to be the single biggest

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

reserve of natural gas of our country in the days to come -- is being allowed and such a situation has developed to become a kind of personal reserve of some private contractors.

(CONTD. BY USY "1M")

-NBR-USY/1M/1.35

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (CONTD.):** This has created such a serious position that a number of expansion projects, in power, have been put on hold. A 2700 MW expansion project of the NTPC has been put on hold because of the absence of assured linkage of gas. Similarly, many of the gas-based power plants are being compelled to operate at a low plant load factor. The revival of the fertilizer plants, on which the Cabinet had given, in principle, approval, is still waiting because there is no assured gas linkage. Public transport system is being deprived of using the natural gas. It is also creating the problem of pollution and different other problems. So, in view of that, and in view of the experience that has cropped up, which is being widely discussed in the media, will the Government consider -- I have already raised in this House that it is an important natural gas, which is a national asset as per the Constitution -- and take an urgent step on a war-footing to take over and nationalise the distribution and marketing of the gas at the wellhead so that it can properly be allocated according to the national priority, and the national priority will not be subjected to \* by the private producer. (Interruptions)

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** Sir, \* is an unparliamentary word.

---

**\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.**

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Okay, it will be expunged.

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** Sir, my second point is, why this issue has come up....(Interruptions) Okay, no problem, Bagrodiaji. My second point is how this thing has come about. If it is a national property and a private explorer is exploring as per the NELP contracts, the distribution of this cannot be decided by the contractor himself. But this thing has happened. A private contractor had entered into an MoU in June 2005 to distribute 70 per cent of the gas of the KG Basin with two private entities. And, this was not objected to. Although these entities had written to the Ministry of Petroleum and to the Government about that in the year 2006 itself...(Interruptions) During that material time, a respected Member of this House, my colleague, Late Chittabrata Majumdar, from my party, had also written to the Government urging to stop this game of personalisation of the natural asset through the private MoU. The Government, practically, woke up much late after four years, and, no doubt, we welcome the assertion that while intervening it has been told that it is a national asset. So, we demand to please utilize it as a national asset and establish your ownership on it by taking over distribution and marketing instead of playing a role of a mediator between the two corporates. This is not the role of the Government. This is not the role of an owner of the national assets.

My third point is regarding pricing. This is a natural asset which should be utilized for the country's development and its pricing should be rationale. A price was discovered at the invitation of a Government entity, that is, the NTPC. International competitive bidding was there. The price was discovered at 2.3 dollars per MBTU, in 2004, at the

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

wellhead. And, at the delivering point the price was 2.97 dollars in 2004. So, my next question is this. On what wisdom this price was changed and allowed the private contractor to decharge the Government entity power generation utility, who are doing yeomen service to the nation by generating power. The private companies have been allowed to decharge even after participating in the international competitive bidding process, based on the draft GSPA. They had accepted that. The NTPC had issued the letter of intent in June 2004 itself. (Time-bell) They had accepted that. (Interruptions) In what wisdom had the Government enhanced that price which was arrived at through a transparent competitive international bidding process? That price has been enhanced by 2.5 times to 4.2 dollars. On what basis? The hon. Minister has stated in his statement that it was being proposed by the private contractor and the EGoMs had marginally moderated it from 4.3 to 4.2. What is the basis of this? Fixing the price is basically a techno-economic job.

(Contd. by 1n -- PK)

PK-MCM/1N/1.40

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (CONTD.):** Sir, this is not a job to be done by the Group of Ministers or by a group of politicians. The Government has played a role by taking a political decision and is giving subsidy to moderate that price. Fixing a price has, essentially, enhanced the price against the interests of the priority sector and allowing a windfall profit to a private contractor is not in the national interest. (Time-bell)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please conclude.



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** Sir, my last point is with regard to distribution. How is the distribution being done? The hon. Minister made a statement in this regard. What is the regional profile of the distribution? Out of 31 mmscmd gas from KG D-6, more than 50 per cent is flowing to West. I have no animosity towards the West, but it is flowing at that particular point where in their own soil, they are having a source of gas. It tantamounts to 'carrying coals to newcastle.' Why? ..(Interruptions).. And, in-between, the four Eastern regional States, West Bengal, Bihar, Orissa and Jharkhand are gas starved. The particular fertilizer plants need to be revived on which this Government's Cabinet was given a 'in principle' approval. (Time-bell)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please conclude.

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** I am just concluding, Sir. They are lying unutilised because no assured gas linkage was given to them. The power plants are also suffering and being compelled to operate at low plant load factor. What is this regional imbalance? If it is a national property, it should be equitably distributed to the ..(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Shri Ram Gopal Yadav. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** Sir, public transport is suffering in my State because of non-availability of gas.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Your time is over. I have called the next speaker. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** Sir, I am concluding in one minute. There are two basic issues. One is, it should be rationally priced. Its price cannot be linked up to the international crude oil price.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You have made your point.

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** Secondly, in regard to distribution, a proper regional balance has to be brought back, and this can only be done, I reiterate, by taking over the distribution and marketing of gas by the Government, through the National Gas Grid, to be operated by the Gas Authority of India Ltd., which was established for this purpose alone. Sir, we demand a concrete assurance from the hon. Minister in this regard. Thank you.

(Ends)

**प्र० राम गोपाल यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** महोदय, आपने मुझे बोलने का मौका दिया, इसके लिए बहुत धन्यवाद। मैं मुख्य रूप से कृष्णा गोदावरी बेसिन के B6 ब्लॉक के संबंध में बात करूंगा, क्योंकि इसमें गैस निकलने की इतनी अपार क्षमता है कि इस वक्त गैस की अवेलेबिलिटी की जो स्थिति है, वह उसको डबल कर देगी। प्रश्न यह है कि यह सस्ती दर पर कैसे उपलब्ध हो और जो तमाम आउट प्लान हैं -चल रहे हैं या चलने वाले हैं, उनको भी गैस की उपलब्धता हो। महोदय, मेरा पहला प्रश्न यह है कि एन०टी०पी०सी० और आर०आई०एल० के बीच में 17 साल का एक कांट्रैक्ट हुआ और वह 2.34 डॉलर प्रति यूनिट के हिसाब से हुआ। उसके बाद कांट्रेक्टर ने लागत बढ़ने के नाम पर प्राइस को बढ़ाने की कोशिश की तथा वह टालमटोल करने लगा। इस कारण एन०टी०पी०सी० को मुम्बई हाई कोर्ट में जाना पड़ा और इसी तरह से एक और कम्पनी -आर०एन०आर०एल० के साथ जो समझौता हुआ, उसमें भी हाई कोर्ट जाना पड़ा। गवर्नमेंट से कहने के बाद भी इसमें गवर्नमेंट ने कुछ नहीं किया। बाद में सेक्रेटरी की एक कमेटी बनी, एम्पॉवर्ड ग्रुप ऑफ मिनिस्टर्स ने फैसला कर प्राइस 4.2 डॉलर प्रति यूनिट के हिसाब से तय किया। श्रीमन, 4.2 डॉलर प्रति यूनिट के हिसाब से जब एक कम्पनी के पक्ष में प्राइस फिक्स की, उस वक्त भी एन०टी०पी०सी० को ओ०एन०जी०सी० 1.8 डॉलर प्रति यूनिट के हिसाब से और आज भी आपूर्ति कर रहे हैं। माननीय मंत्री जी से मेरा पहला क्लेरिफिकेशन यह है कि जब ओ०एन०जी०सी० 1.8 डॉलर प्रति यूनिट के हिसाब से गैस सप्लाई कर सकती है तो क्या

आवश्यकता थी कि सरकारी कम्पनी को इतना बड़ा घाटा देकर एक कम्पनी के पक्ष में 4.2 डॉलर प्रति यूनिट के हिसाब से एम्पॉवर्ड ग्रुप ऑफ मिनिस्टर्स इसका फैसला करे।

(10/GS पर क्रमशः)

GS-PB/1.45/10

**प्र० राम गोपाल यादव (क्रमागत) :** यह कौन-सा तरीका था ? क्या यह देश के हित में था, किसी व्यक्ति के हित में था अथवा जो पावर प्लांट्स को चलाने के लिए कम्पनियां या पावर फैक्ट्रीज़ हैं, उनके हित में था ?

मेरा दूसरा सवाल यह है कि उसी समय जब यह फैसला हुआ, तो एक और कम्पनी के साथ भी फैसला हुआ था, और 2004 में ही एशिया की सबसे बड़ी गैस आधारित परियोजना उत्तर प्रदेश के दादरी में स्थापित करने के लिए काम शुरू हुआ था। चूंकि वह कम्पनी टाल-मटोल करती रही, दोनों में झगड़ा रहा, एनटीपीसी को और आरएनआरएल को भी हाई कोर्ट जाना पड़ा और हाई कोर्ट ने फिर फैसला दिया, हाई कोर्ट ने एक मामले में फैसला दिया। हाई कोर्ट के फैसले तक गवर्नमेंट ने कुछ नहीं कहा, हाई कोर्ट के फैसले के बाद गवर्नमेंट सुप्रीम कोर्ट में गई और वहां कहा कि यह राष्ट्रीय सम्पत्ति है। हम लोग और सारा देश मानता है कि यह राष्ट्रीय सम्पत्ति है। ...(समय की घंटी)... जब यह राष्ट्रीय सम्पत्ति है, तो यह राष्ट्र के हाथ में होनी चाहिए, यह हमारी मांग है। यह राष्ट्रीय सम्पत्ति है, लेकिन जब गैस निकलने लगी, जब गैस की कीमत बढ़ने लगी, तब यह मामला आया। मैं मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूं कि तब तक आप क्यों सोते रहे ? अगर अब आपने यह माना है, यह ठीक है कि देर आयद दुरुस्त आयद, जब यह राष्ट्रीय सम्पत्ति है, तो मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहता हूं कि क्या आप कृष्णा, गोदावरी बेसिन डी-6 ब्लॉक को नेशलाइज़ करेंगे ? ...(समय की घंटी).... सर, अभी मेरा दूसरा पाइंट ही चल रहा है। मैं तो बहुत ही short में बोलता हूं, यह आप जानते हैं।

सर, मेरा तीसरा पाइंट दादरी के संबंध में है, जो इसी से संबंधित है। हमारा जो दादरी का प्लांट है, उसके लिए एनटीपीसी से भी और आरएनआरएल से भी समझौता हुआ था। अगर आप एक कम्पनी की एक बात को मानते हैं, तो उसने जो समझौता किया है, उसको मानिए और अगर उस समझौते को नहीं मानना चाहते हैं, तो जिस समझौते से आप

बंधे हुए हैं, जिस के जरिए से आपने उसको कांट्रेक्ट दिया था, उस कांट्रेक्ट को आप खत्म करिए। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या आप उत्तर प्रदेश के दादरी प्लांट के लिए गैस उपलब्ध करवाने का आश्वासन देंगे, जिससे वह प्लांट शुरू हो सके ? क्योंकि 2100 एकड़ जमीन वहां पर उपलब्ध है, उसकी बाउंड्री हो चुकी है। गवर्नमेंट की तरफ से कोई स्पष्ट आश्वासन नहीं मिल रहा है और इसका जो कांट्रेक्टर है, उसकी तरफ से भी आश्वासन नहीं मिल रहा है, इसलिए वहां पर इन्वेस्टमेंट नहीं हो रहा है।

सर, अंत में, मैं एक बात और कहना चाहता हूँ। माननीय मंत्री जी मैं आपसे यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि \* पूरा देश सम्मान करता है, आप यह सारा पाप उन्हीं के कंधे पर बंदूक रखकर क्यों करवाना चाहते हो ? आप इसको खुद करिए। यह सब \* के नाम से ...

**श्री उपसभापति :** आप उनका नाम क्यों ले रहे हैं ? ...(व्यवधान)... आप एक पार्टिकुलर मिनिस्टर का नाम मत लीजिए।.... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री मुरली देवरा :** आप मेरा नाम लीजिए। आप उनका नाम क्यों ले रहे हैं ?

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please remove the Minister's name.

**प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव :** अच्छा, उनका नाम नहीं लेता हूँ।

**श्री उपसभापति :** प्लीज, आप तो जानते हैं, आप तो सीनियर मेम्बर हैं।

**प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव :** ये सब काम खुद नहीं करना चाहते हैं, दूसरों से करवाना चाहते हैं। ... (व्यवधान)... मैं चाहता हूँ कि आप दादरी के लिए "हां" कह दीजिए। आप यह कह दीजिए कि दादरी के लिए गैस दिलवाएंगे। मैं उत्तर प्रदेश की बात कर रहा हूँ। इससे उत्तर प्रदेश को लाभ होगा, इससे दिल्ली को भी लाभ होगा। मैं तो कुछ नहीं कहना चाहता हूँ। मैं तो यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि आप इसको नेशनलाइज कर दीजिए। ...(समय की घंटी)... मैं कहां किसी के लिए कह रहा हूँ। मैं कह रहा हूँ कि यह राष्ट्र की सम्पत्ति है, इसको आप अपने हाथ में लीजिए और इसका लाभ उठाइए। आप इसका लाभ किसी एक व्यक्ति को क्यों देना चाहते हैं ? आप इसका लाभ सरकार को क्यों नहीं देना चाहते हैं ? ... (व्यवधान)...

-----  
\* Not recorded.

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009

**श्री उपसभापति :** प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव जी, हमें समय का अभाव है, हम क्या करें ? आप बोलना चाहते हैं, मगर समय ज्यादा नहीं है।

**प्रो० राम गोपाल यादव :** सर, मैं आपकी बात मानता हूँ और आपको बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद देता हूँ। मैं चाहूँगा कि माननीय मंत्री जी हमारी बातों का भी जवाब दें।

(समाप्त)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Shri Parimal Nathwani. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री परिमल नथवानी:** सर, सबसे पहले मैं यह कहना चाहूँगा कि मैं रिलायंस से एसोसिएट हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)....

**SHRI M.V. MYSURA REDDY:** Sir, my name is second.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I will call your name. It is according to the order. I said, there are 20 hon. Members who want to participate. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI M.V. MYSURA REDDY:** Sir, I had given notice first.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Your name is there.

**SHRI M.V. MYSURA REDDY:** Sir, I know my name is there. But I had given the notice first.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** That is not the criterion. Whoever had given notice will be called. Please, have some patience.

**SHRI M.V. MYSURA REDDY:** Okay; Sir.

(Followed by 1p/SKC)

ASC-SK/1P/1.50

**श्री परिमल नथवानी(झारखंड) :** सभापति जी, मैं कहना चाहूँगा कि I am associated with RIL and am an Independent Member from Jharkhand. यह जो KG basin को लेकर विवाद चल रहा है और हमारे यहां के सीनियर क्लिग्स ने जो बात उठाई है, मैं उनकी आधी बातों से सहमत हूँ और आधी बातों से सहमत नहीं हूँ, क्योंकि मैं यह याद दिलाना चाहूँगा कि KG basin प्राइवेट कंटेक्टर के लिए एक ठेका छूटा था, जिसको

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

global bidding बोलते हैं। 1990 में जब केन्द्र में NDA की गर्वमेंट थी, तब यह globalisation tender निकला था। इसके बाद 2000 में इनका price mechanism of private sharing तय हुआ था। चाहे UP के लिए power plant लगे या और किसी प्रदेश की जनता के लिए लगे, तो जो कॉन्ट्रैक्टर है, मैं as an MP उसको जानता हूँ कि इसमें उनका कोई roll नहीं है। यह कहा जा रहा है कि इस पूरी डील को private contractors के हाथ से लेकर GAIL को सौंप दिया जाए। हमें पता है कि GAIL and ONGC ने भी इन टेंडरों में भाग लिया था। सर, यह एक international image की बात है कि कोई आदमी पैसा लगाता है और देश के अंदर जो गैस की कमी है, मेहनत करके उसे पूरा करता है और जब गैस की रिकवरी हो जाती है, तब उसके ऊपर एलिगेशन लगाया जाता है कि कॉन्ट्रैक्टर अपना बिजनेस कर रहा है, but मैं यह याद दिलाना चाहूंगा कि यह ग्लोबल टेन्डर के माध्यम से एक कॉन्ट्रैक्ट था। सर, मैं आज भी यह कहना चाहूंगा कि यह price mechanism Group of Ministers ने किया है। जो allocation of the gas है, वह existing power plant के लिए है। गवर्नमेंट ने जो पॉलिसी तय की है, वह उनके आधीन है। यह कहना कि R&RNR and Dadri के लिए इनजस्टिस हो रहा है, इस बात में कोई दम नहीं है। यहां पर जो MoU की बात की जा रही है, वह प्राइवेट बात है, यह नहीं होनी चाहिए थी। मैं उस पर ऑब्जेक्शन करता हूँ, क्योंकि MoU में क्या है, वह प्राइवेट लोग नहीं जानते हैं। यह MoU दो भाइयों और दो कम्पनियों के बीच में है, जिसके अंदर कभी कम्पनी ने कोई वायलेशन नहीं किया है। All this is subject to Government approval. उसके अंदर मेंशन किया गया था। अगर हम इस बात को कहते हैं कि प्राइवेट कॉन्ट्रैक्टर गैस डील अपनी मनमानी से करता है, तो मैं इस बात से सहमत नहीं हूँ।  
...(व्यवधान)

(समाप्त)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** He has only disclosed his interest. (Interruptions) Under the Ethics Committee rules, if a Member is interested in a subject, he has to disclose it. Now, Mr. Mysura Reddy.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

**SHRI M.V. MYSURA REDDY (ANDHRA PRADESH):** Sir, I fully associate myself with what my colleague, Mr. Tapan Sen, has said, but I wish to add one or two points to his statement.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Mysura Reddy, your list is long; please do not read out such a long statement!

**SHRI M. V. MYSURA REDDY:** Sir, the list may be long but I shall conclude it within three minutes.

Sir, gas is the primary source for power, fertilizer, CNG, LPG, etc. The cost of gas plays a vital role in the prices of end-products like power, fertilizer, etc. That is why, my issues are based only on pricing, Sir.

The RIL, in its letter dated 22.05.2009 to DGH, has disclosed an expenditure of only 4.8 billion dollars. In the same letter, RIL has disclosed the 'post wellhead cost' per Million British Thermal Units of KG gas to be 0.8945 dollars. Why cannot the Minister place this letter on the Table of this House?

Sir, in reply to my Starred Question No. 336 on 27.07.2009, it was said that validation was done by some private agencies. I would like to know the following from the Minister: The Mustang Engineering company which evaluated RIL's investment estimates is the real contractor for Panna field development project and Mr. Gopalakrishnan is on the faculty of the School of Petroleum Technology.

(Contd. at 1q by ksk)

KSK/LP/1.55/1Q

**SHRI M.V. MYSURA REDDY (CONTD):** In view of the conflicting interests, I would like to know whether they have disclosed their interest

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

before they took up the assignment. If they had disclosed their interest, why did the Government appoint them as independent evaluators?

The third point is that the capital expenditure for development of gas fields was increased from \$ 2.47 billion in 2004 to \$ 8.8 billion in 2006. Whereas, if you look at the production, it only doubled to 80 MMSCMD. Normally, when the production is doubled, the capital expenditure has to come down. Even if you double the capital expenditure, it should be \$ 4.94 billion. Hence, it has nearly doubled. This simple proposition is known to common man. If so, how did the EGoMs forget this simple equation? This clearly shows that there is something fishy in this.

Sir, the next point is that Sasan, in Ultra Mega Power Project, quoted for Rs.1.19/kWh with indigenous coal, and Munda quoted for Rs.2.26/kWh with imported coal. Now, the Government fixed the price at \$ 4.23 MMBTU. Based on this, the cost will become Rs.2.30/kWh which is commercially unviable and uneconomical. Has the EGoMs considered this point before fixing the gas price?

Sir, the last point is regarding my State. How much of gas will be given to Andhra Pradesh from RIL's fields in K.G. Basin, out of the peak production of 80 MMSCMD?

(Ends)

**श्री आर.सी.सिंह (पश्चिमी बंगाल)** : उपसभापति जी, सबसे पहले तो मैं श्री तपन सेन जी और श्री राम गोपाल जी ने जो कहा है, स्वयं को उससे एसोसिएट करते हुए अपनी बात कहना चाहूंगा। मैं अपनी बात संक्षेप में कहने की कोशिश करूंगा। यह बात सच है कि सप्लाई और डिमांड में काफी अंतर है। देश के लिए इसको त्वरित गति देने की जरूरत है। मैं कुछ सवाल जानना चाहूंगा कि इस mismatch को पूरा करने के लिए हमारी जो सरकारी



संस्थाएं हैं, इनके द्वारा डेवलप करने के लिए सरकार क्या व्यवस्था कर रही है? ये आर.आई.एल. पर ही क्यों निर्भर रहना चाहते हैं? मेरी समझ में एक बात और नहीं आई कि जब 2.34 पर यूनिट का एग्रीमेंट हुआ था, तो उसकी जगह पर मंत्रिमंडल की तरफ से 4.2 पर यूनिट यू.एस. डालर देने के लिए इस प्राइवेट कंपनी को क्यों सलाह दी गई? दूसरी बात मैं यह जानना चाहता हूं कि KG Basin में जो गैस है, उसको निकालने के लिए और बढ़ाने के लिए सरकार क्या व्यवस्था कर रही है? एक बात मैं कहना चाहूंगा, मेरे साथियों ने भी कही है कि बजट के पैराग्राफ 93 में उन्होंने कहा है, "...business of laying and operating cross country natural gas or crude or petroleum oil pipeline network for distribution...". इसके तहत इन्होंने इनकम टैक्स के 1968 के कानून में छूट देकर, सैक्शन 35(a)(b) को जोड़कर 20,000 करोड़ रुपए की एक कंपनी को छूट क्यों दी? ऐसी क्या जरूरत पड़ गई कि एक कंपनी को छूट देने के लिए हमारे इस कानून में इस तरह से परिवर्तन करना पड़ा, जबकि इसका लाभ आम लोगों तक पहुंच सक ता था? वह लाभ आम लोगों को नहीं दिया गया। तीसरी बात मैं आपके माध्यम से कहना चाहूंगा कि KG Basin में quantum of gas के प्रॉडक्शन पर विवाद हो रहे हैं। मैं मंत्री महोदय से इसकी फिगर जानना चाहूंगा कि के.जी.(बी.-6) बेसिन में गैस का जो उत्पादन हो रहा है, आप मंथ वाइज उसकी एक फिगर दें, जिससे कि जो विवाद हो रहा है, उस तक जाया जा सके।

(akg/1r पर जारी)

GSP-AKG/2.00/1R

**श्री आर.सी. सिंह (क्रमागत) :** सर, मैं आखिरी बात यह कहना चाहूंगा कि इस तरह से इसका मूल्य बढ़ा कर 4.2 डालर प्रति यूनिट किया गया है, इसका 99 प्रतिशत लाभ RIL को मिलेगा और सिर्फ एक प्रतिशत ही सरकार पाएगी। यानी सिर्फ एक प्रतिशत ही देश के हित में जाएगा और 99 प्रतिशत व्यक्तिगत हित में जाएगा। इसलिए ऐसा क्यों किया गया, इसके बारे में डिटेल्स में जानकारी देने की कोशिश करें।

**श्री उपसभापति :** आपका आखिरी प्वायंट हो गया। आपने कहा है कि यह आपका आखिरी प्वायंट है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री गिरीश कुमार सांगी : सर, आन्ध्र प्रदेश के ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री उपसभापति : देखिए, आपने अभी अपना नाम दिया है। सांगी साहब, आपको रूल्स के बारे में जानना चाहिए और हमने बार-बार सर्कुलर भी दिया है कि कोई भी विषय शुरू होने के आधा घंटे पहले आपको अपना नाम देना पड़ेगा। We have been repeating this. ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री गिरीश कुमार सांगी : सर, इसका आन्ध्र प्रदेश से सम्बन्ध है।

श्री उपसभापति : सम्बन्ध है ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री गिरीश कुमार सांगी : सर, हमें अपनी स्टेट के बारे में कहने का कुछ मौका तो दीजिए।

श्री उपसभापति : आपको अपना नाम देने से किसने रोका है।

श्री आर.सी. सिंह : सर, मेरा टाइम चला जा रहा है।

श्री उपसभापति : नहीं, आपका समय खत्म हो गया था।

श्री आर.सी. सिंह : सर, मैं सिर्फ एक और प्वायंट रखना चाहता हूँ।

श्री उपसभापति : देखिए, इस तरह से नहीं होगा। ... (व्यवधान) ... अभी कई लोग हैं। आप क्यों बेकरार हैं।

श्री आर.सी. सिंह : सर, मैं सिर्फ एक सवाल करना चाहता हूँ ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री उपसभापति : आपने अभी अपना नाम दिया है। आप बैठ जाइए प्लीज़।

श्री आर.सी. सिंह : सर, मेरा कहना यह है कि इसका समाधान एक ही है कि इस total system को neutralize कर दिया जाए, ताकि देश हित में काम करे। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**SHRI N. JANARDHANA REDDY:** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I want to tell you an important issue (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No, no. I have not called your name. (Interruptions)

**SHRI N. JANARDHANA REDDY:** Sir, I want to raise an important issue. It is about Andhra. (Interruptions)

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Member from Andhra has already spoken. (Interruptions) How do you know all the names? (Interruptions) There are other names also from Andhra. Why do you presume that it is not there? (Interruptions)

**SHRI N. JANARDHANA REDDY:** Sir, the Assembly has taken a decision. (Interruptions) Sir, the State Government has taken a decision. (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** But we have to follow some order. (Interruptions) Please.

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI:** We are requesting you, Sir. (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You have just now sent the name. I have just announced that I have got a list of twenty Members. I will have to call them first, and, not your name. Please understand. (Interruptions) Please sit down. If you want to participate, I will call you. Please. (Interruptions) You have not given the request at all. Now, I will call you. (Interruptions) Please. Now, Shri Bharkumar Raut.

**SHRI BHARATKUMAR RAUT (MAHARASHTRA):** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, at the outset, let me thank Mr. Tapan Sen for bringing forward a very important and vital issue. Though I have some reservations about his contention, I really thank him. Sir, the Minister has given a detailed reply. Perhaps, Sir, more details are required. But at the same time, he has avoided the moot question that has been discussed and which is a matter of concern for the society. Sir, due to paucity of time, I will only mention a few points, which I have jotted down.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

Sir, oil and gas fields are natural assets and they are given to private parties for exploration, development and production. While the parties concerned derive economic benefits out of these activities, the Government also gets taxes, royalties as per the formula worked out under the Gas Utilisation Policy and the Production Sharing Contracts. Sir, whatever has been given is as per the policy, and, once these contracts are given, it is our responsibility, the nation's responsibility, and, it is a matter of pride also, to ensure that those words are kept.

We cannot half-heartedly say, "Now, you stop it." You cannot do that. You should honour whatever contract has been given. Sir, the private parties cannot bargain or barter a commodity which does not belong to any of the party, whatever may be the terms of the family MoU privately arrived at between them.

It is well settled that no private agreement can create a vested interest in a property which belongs to the nation. We should believe that it is a national property and no private treaty -- whatever may be the terms of the family MoU -- should be entertained here.

Sir, in this case, time is the essence of the matter. The Supreme Court has fixed 1<sup>st</sup> September as the date of hearing.

(Contd. by sk-1s)

1S/2.05/sk

**SHRI BHARATKUMAR RAUT (CONTD.):** Therefore, I suggest that early steps should be taken to bring up before the Parliament a proper Bill regarding gas. That will affect the High Court's order and settle the problem. Thus, Government's sovereign authority can also be proved. (Time-bell) I also suggest that the Government should also incorporate

clauses in the Bill for setting up a regulatory body to regulate pricing and allocation of gas. Thank you.

(Ends)

**SHRI N.R. GOVINDARAJAR (TAMIL NADU):** \* Hon'ble Deputy Chairman Sir, I thank you very much for giving me this opportunity to participate on behalf of my party AIADMK, in this calling attention motion on power deficit that has arisen due to shortage of natural gas. Hon'ble Deputy Chairman Sir, a nation's growth depends on the growth of industrial sector, agricultural sector and the basic infrastructural sector. Power is essential for the growth of these three sectors. Sir, as you know, power is the prime source for the growth of these three sectors. Power is generated through many sources such as coal, natural gas, wind mill, water resource, nuclear power stations, solar power etc. If a question arises whether the power generated in our nation through these various resources are sufficient to meet our need, I am sorry to say that the power generated is insufficient to meet the needs of the entire nation.

The share of natural gas in power generation is only 10-15% of the total power generation of our nation. But, we could not generate even this much power.

Hon'ble Deputy Chairman Sir, our industries have incurred a loss to the extent of Rs.43, 205 crore in the last financial year. In the year 2003, the loss incurred in the production sector is Rs.22,000 crore. But

---

\* English translation of the original speech in Tamil.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

now, the amount of loss has doubled in the production sector. The main reason for this is lack of proper planning, and the proper implementation of already planned schemes, at proper time. These shortcomings have to be rectified by the Union Government in future.

Hon'ble Deputy Chairman Sir, it is said that the Government has planned to increase power generation to the extent of 1,47,000 Megawatts before the year 2012. But it is really questionable whether the Government could reach at least 60% of the target. This is mainly because of the lack of proper planning on the Government side and delayed implementation of the planned schemes. Sir, as has been already mentioned by me, the share of natural gas in total power generation is 10-15% and we have not obtained even this meager share of natural gas. For instance, I could cite the case of Godavari Natural Gas Station. The required natural gas to be supplied from the Godavari Natural Gas Station, could not be supplied by it. As a result, the power generation plant with the production capacity of 5000 mega watts, established at the cost of Rs.20, 000 crore. But, the maintenance of this plant has incurred a heavy loss.

Our Hon'ble Leader Madam *Puratchithalaivi* ( mns. revolutionary leader) Ms. Jayalalitha, has understood that industrial sector, basic infrastructural sector and agriculture are essential for the growth of the nation and that power generation is needed for the growth of these sectors. That is why, she took special initiatives to increase power generation. During her rule, Tamil Nadu had generated surplus power so that even our neighbouring States could be benefitted.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

Nafta is used as alternate fuel whenever shortage of natural gas arises. But the production cost of nafta is double that of the production cost of natural gas.

Hon'ble Deputy Chairman Sir, our nation has the capacity to generate 13.4 Gigawatts of power through natural gas, but we could not get sufficient amount of natural gas even to generate 1.1 Gigawatts of power. Therefore Sir, through this August House, I request the Union Government to overcome these shortcomings in future and resolve the problem of power deficit by making sufficient availability of natural gas. Only then could we protect our industrial sector and lead our nation into the path of progress. With these words, I conclude my speech. Thank you (Ends).

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (BIHAR):** Thank you, Sir. I will begin by asking the first question from the hon. Petroleum Minister. I begin by complimenting him for the remarkable discovery that gas is a sovereign commodity and little later we will discover that air, water, gas, those things which are under the ground, are startling discovery and really are sovereign assets. Therefore, the first thing anyone would like to know is, why it took so long for the Petroleum Ministry to discover that gas, in fact, is a sovereign asset and needed, therefore, to be determined in sovereignty.

(Contd. by ysr-1t)

-SK/YSR-PSV/2.10/1T

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD.):** Sir, my second question is in relation to paragraph four of the Minister's statement. He has given an *inter se* allocation among different competing uses of gas, namely, fertilizer,

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

power and so on and so forth. In a situation where there is demand-supply disequilibrium, we would like to understand the logic which has determined the *inter se* priority among different competing uses of gas.

Mr. Tapan Sen raised a very important point about regional imbalance. I would add to that the demands of the rural sector. And let me add to that whether ecologically and environmentally important factors have been given the kind of premium they deserve in the *inter se* gas allocation in a situation where India is under increasing pressure for improving sustainable development where the ecological and environmental factors bring rural economy into play.

Today, really the maximum amount of arduousness of rural work is to rural women who have to meet their cooking needs out of wood. And the integrated energy policy of the Prime Minister enjoins upon us to replace this cooking medium which is the biggest creator of soot, which is the biggest creator of environmental degradation. So, we would like to understand the logic of paragraph four in the *inter se* allocation among different competing uses of gas, and whether it factored in the environmental factors and integration of rural economy.

**(THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair)**

Third, when it comes to prices, as we can see from the annexure to the statement, they have varied dramatically from 5.65 (\$/mmbtu) to as low as 3.5 (\$/mmbtu). We would like to understand the logic in which the price fixation modalities have been determined. To merely say that a Group of Ministers will determine price is not good enough. Whether the Ministry has any views on setting up an independent regulator which will have an arm's-length relationship to be able to



determine prices instead of foisting this responsibility either on officials or on a Group of Ministers.

Sir, I am asking this particularly because at the time when this sector was being deregulated, the Minister might like to jog his memory, there was also a *pari passu* commitment that there would be an independent regulator for downstream sector which will consist of experts and so on to be able to determine the price.

I would urge upon the Minister to enlighten the House on the regulatory issue and the methodology for the determination of prices.

(Ends)

**श्री तारिक अनवर(महाराष्ट्र):** महोदय, तेल और प्राकृतिक गैस राष्ट्रीय सम्पत्ति हैं। उन्हें निजी कम्पनियों को इसलिए दिया जाता है ताकि वे उनमें और खोज करके उस क्षेत्र को विकसित करें, और तेल या गैस का उत्पादन करें तथा इन कार्यकलापों के जरिए आर्थिक लाभ अर्जित हो सके। मैं मंत्री जी से सीधे तौर पर एक जानकारी प्राप्त करना चाहूँगा कि जब सरकार इन्हें राष्ट्रीय सम्पत्ति मानती है, फिर इसे निजी कम्पनी को इसके खोज-बीन के काम के लिए दिया जाता है, तो सरकार को छोड़ कर निजी कम्पनी को किसी के पक्ष में निर्णय करने का कोई अधिकार है या नहीं? उसके साथ-ही-साथ भारत सरकार की प्राकृतिक गैस के लिए किसी कंट्रैक्टर या किसी निजी क्षेत्र को सौदा करने का अधिकार है, हक है या नहीं है? मैं मंत्री जी से यह भी जानना चाहूँगा कि सरकार द्वारा निर्धारित जो मूल्य है या सरकार ने जो कीमत तय की है, उससे किसी निजी कम्पनी को गैस दिए जाने पर सरकार को कितने रेवेन्यू का नुकसान उठाना पड़ेगा? इसके साथ-ही-साथ हाई कोर्ट का जो आदेश आया है, हाई कोर्ट के उस आदेश से सरकार की जो Gas Utilisation Policy है, उस पर एक सवालिया निशान लग गया है।

(1यू/एच0एम0एस0 पर क्रमशः)

1U/VKK-HMS/2.15

**श्री तारिक अनवर (क्रमागत) :** मैं मंत्री महोदय से इस बारे में भी जानना चाहूंगा क्योंकि यह नीति काफी विचार-विमर्श के बाद, Empowered Group of Ministers के स्तर से तय हुई थी। उस के बाद हाईकोर्ट का यह फैसला हुआ है।

महोदय, मैं मंत्री महोदय से इन दोनों बातों का स्पष्टीकरण चाहता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया (झारखंड) :** उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मंत्री महोदय ने क्लैरीफिकेशन के लिए बहुत लंबा स्टेटमेंट दिया है। महोदय, वैसे भी natural gas is the cleanest, safest and most useful energy और इस का प्रयोग हमारे देश में पावर जनरेशन के लिए, फर्टिलाइजर इंडस्ट्री, स्टील एंड आयरन फाउंड्रीज, कास्ट आयरन और डॉमेस्टिक परपज के लिए भी किया जा सकता है। महोदय, भारत में इस का उत्पादन एच0वी0जे0, एक्स हजीरा, गुजरात, उड़ान, के0जी0 बेसिन, कावेरी बेसिन, असम और त्रिपुरा में होता है। महोदय, भारत के लिए गैस अब नई चीज नहीं है। यह 60 के दशक से, असम और गुजरात में उद्योगों में इस का प्रयोग हो रहा है। अंतर्राष्ट्रीय क्षेत्र में clean energy produce करने के लिए हम ने तरह-तरह के कदम उठाए हैं। साथ ही, इस की डिमांड भी बढ़ी है और उस डिमांड को पूरा करने के लिए अभी हमारा प्रोडक्सन पूरा नहीं है। हम ने गैस को इम्पोर्ट करने के लिए भी बहुत से कदम उठाए हैं। अभी ईरान, पाकिस्तान, इंडिया गैस पाइप-लाइन प्रोजेक्ट पेंडिंग पड़ा है। मैं जानना चाहूंगा कि इस का स्टेट्स क्या है, यह प्रोजेक्ट कब तक पूरा होगा और हम इस से कितनी उम्मीद करते हैं? महोदय, म्यांमार, बंगला देश, इंडिया गैस पाइप-लाइन प्रोजेक्ट का स्टेट्स क्या है और इस प्रोजेक्ट से हमारी खपत कितनी पूरी होगी? हम ने एम0ओ0यू0 साइन किया और बहुत से मंत्रियों ने दौरा भी किया है। महोदय, तुर्कमिनिस्तान-अफगानिस्तान-पाकिस्तान, "टैप" पाइप-लाइन के हम पार्ट नहीं हैं, किंतु तुर्कमिनिस्तान का जो दौलताबाद एरिया है, वहां पर बहुत सारे गैस रिजर्व्स हैं। तो आप ने "टैपी" बना ली, अब हम इस में हिस्सेदार बन गए, लेकिन हमें इस से गैस कब तक मिलेगी? मैं चाहता हूँ कि इस में हमारी हिस्सेदारी सिर्फ कागजी कार्यवाही न रहे। इसलिए मंत्री जी कृपया बताएं कि हमें वह गैस कब तक उपलब्ध होगी? महोदय,

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

एल०एन०जी० के इम्पोर्ट के लिए भी हम ने बहुत सोचा है और एल०एन०जी० को ओ०जी०एल० में भी लाया गया है। ...(समय की घंटी) Sir, I am only putting pointed questions. I am not giving any background.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** There is time constraint.

**श्री एस०एस० अहलुवालिया :** सर, एल०एन०जी० के ओ०जी०एल० में आने के बाद हम ने अपनी डिमांड सप्लाई में कितनी भरपायी की है? आप ने 20<sup>th</sup> December 2006 को Policy for Development of Natural Gas Pipelines and City or Local Natural Gas Distribution Networks की घोषणा की है। महोदय, कोलकाता, मुंबई, चेन्नई और दिल्ली के लोग उम्मीद लगाए हैं कि कब उनके रसोई घर में गैस पहुंचेगी अर्थात् कब यह प्रोजेक्ट लागू होगा? महोदय, फाईनेंस मिनिस्टर ने पिछली बजट स्पीच में कहा कि हम एक National Gas Grid हाईवेज के साथ बनाने जा रहे हैं जिस में ट्रांसपोर्टेशन की सुविधा होगी और सड़क से लगते हुए हमारे जितने शहर हैं, वहां पर छोटे उद्योगों को भी गैस मिल सकेगी। आप ने पिछले दिनों बहुत से लाइसेंस छोटे-छोटे पावर प्लांट्स लगाने के लिए, छोटे-छोटे टर्बाइंस लगाने के लिए दिए हैं, उन को गैस कब तक उपलब्ध होगी? कृपया उस का भी ब्योरा दें। (Ends)

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA (RAJASTHAN):** Thank you, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir. To begin with, I feel sad that Mr. Sen and a few other Members have levelled allegations against the Government of mediating between two corporates which I don't think is right. The Government is not doing this. (Contd. by TMV/1w)

-VKK-TMV-DS/1W/2.20

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA (CONTD.):** In any way, the Government is not involved in this kind of issues. It is his personal prejudiced opinion,

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

in my opinion, and far from the truth. The other allegations are also \*  
and far from reality. (Interruptions)...

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** How can he say that it was \*  
(Interruptions)... What is this? (Interruptions)...

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** Now, I come to the points which the  
hon. Minister... (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN):** Please.

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** How can he say that it was \*  
(Interruptions)... He put his point of view. How can it be \*  
(interruptions)...

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** If they can make allegations, I can also  
make a remark. (Interruptions)...

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** He can't say that it was \*  
(Interruptions)...

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** If they can make a remark, I can also.  
(Interruptions)... They made a remark against the Minister.  
(Interruptions)... They made a remark against the Government.  
(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** No, please. Mr. Santoshji, please listen to me.  
The Government will reply to them. You ask questions only.  
(Interruptions)...

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** I am not talking of reply.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Don't attribute things.

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** I am talking of \* (Interruptions)... I am  
talking of \* (Interruptions)...

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, it is against a Member.

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** If there is anything unparliamentary, you delete it. (Interruptions)... I have no problem. (Interruptions)...

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, every Member gives notice without any motive. (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** No, please. Let me listen to this.

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, every Member gives notice without any motive. Calling a Member and saying that they are \* questions or there is a motive behind it, that is bad on his part. That is wrong. (Interruptions)... He should withdraw it. (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** I will remove it. (Interruptions)...

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA:** He should withdraw it. (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please take your seats. (Interruptions)... I will deal with it. Please take your seats. (Interruptions)...

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** I have never attributed any motive to the hon. Minister. (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please take your seats. (Interruptions)... I will deal with it. (Interruptions)... Please take your seats. I will deal with it. (Interruptions)... Tapanji, please take your seat. I will deal with it. I will remove it. (Interruptions)...

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA:** He should withdraw it. (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please. That is what I am saying. I will go through the records. If there is any reference in terms of \* against a

-----  
\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

Member or even if there is any insinuation, that will be expunged. (Interruptions)...

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Sir, that is not the issue. The issue is that this allegation is wrong. He has no right to say. It is for the Minister to say. (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** I told him. It is for the Government to say. You can say your opinion. You ask questions. (Interruptions)... Please. You can ask your questions. (Interruptions)...

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** I am coming to the questions. (Interruptions)...

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** He is a very senior Member. We can recommend him to go to the Government, if the Government is willing! (Interruptions)...

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** Sir, you have already given a ruling and I have accepted it. (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** You should have done it earlier. Why do you do it late? (Interruptions)...

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** I compliment the hon. Minister for giving a detailed statement. Straightaway I would like to put the questions. How is the present production of KG-D6 being used? How is it going to be utilised now and in future?

The second point is: What is the Government doing to increase the production of natural gas in different parts of the country?

Sir, he has mentioned in the first paragraph that the country has embarked on an accelerated programme of exploration and production through the New Exploration Licensing Policy bidding rounds in 1999. How

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

has it, this NELP, helped the country so far? Now, I am just coming to the points. (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** You have asked three questions.

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** They have disturbed me, Sir. The next point is that in paragraph 4 he has mentioned how it is going to be used. He has mentioned that the intention of the Government is to operationalise all gas-based assets which were lying idle and unutilised due to non-availability of gas. Here he has mentioned that if there is any shortfall in utilisation it will be used for other purposes. I would like to know specifically from the hon. Minister whether the allocation of 15 mmscmd to existing gas-based fertiliser sector and like that 18 mmscmd, 5 mmscmd and 3 mmscmd, these will meet the full demand. Or, will they meet only partial demand? I would like know that.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Okay, fine. That is enough.

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** Just one minute, Sir. In the case of masses, it is more important that the entire demand of the city gas sector and the LPG plants should be first met.

The last point is regarding pricing. He has given an annexure. (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** No. You ask only questions.

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** I am asking questions.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please do that.

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** I am doing that. He has given different prices. How has he come to different prices? We must have the same price for all at every level all over the country. Does the Government have any plan to achieve this and by what time? Thank you.(Ends)

(Followed by 1X/VK)

VK/1X/2.25

**SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU):** Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I will confine myself to asking a couple of clarifications with regard to the domestic natural gas. I am not asking about the gas from Iran. I do not know when the US Government will allow the Government of India to go ahead. Nobody knows that.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Don't get distracted. Come to your pointed questions.

**SHRI D. RAJA:** Sir, I join my respected colleague, Shri N.K. Singh, who complimented the Government for declaring natural gas as the national asset. If that is so, I think, the Government has all powers to decide its pricing, marketing, distribution, etc. The Government should not be at the mercy of anybody. I would like to know whether the Government would have that power with itself. This is number one. Secondly, the statement begins by saying, "The production and supply of natural gas started in a major way in the country with the commissioning of the Hazira-Vijaipur-Jagdishpur line by GAIL in the year 1987." But the Minister has not mentioned where that gas pipeline is going, where that gas is going. The gas, I understand, has been brought to the North. I do not object to it. Sir, the gas from the Bombay High could have been taken to the South. But the Government has never cared for the South. There are certain fertiliser industries which are in very bad shape in the South. SPIC is not in effective operation. I do not know whether SPIC is closed or working. I do not know it. But it is in bad shape. MFL in Chennai is in bad shape. FACT is in bad shape because they have to depend on naphtha. They could have been



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

supplied natural gas. Why hasn't the Government done this? So far as the present KG gas pipeline is concerned, there is an attempt to take the gas to Gujarat. There is an attempt to take the gas to UP. I do not object to the gas being taken to Gujarat or UP. But what about the State of Andhra Pradesh where the gas is explored? What is the share of Andhra Pradesh? Is there any thinking on the part of the Government to supply substantial gas to Andhra Pradesh? Is there any thinking on the part of the Government to supply gas to Southern States which have to depend on other sources for power and fertiliser? I would like the Minister to clarify one thing. If I am wrong, I stand corrected. (Interruptions). I would like to seek the attention of the hon. Minister. Clearance has been given for a pipeline project in 2007, that is, Kakinada-Chennai pipeline, Chennai-Cochin pipeline, Chennai-Bangalore pipeline, Chennai-Tuticorin pipeline, but no work has started or no work has been done so far, if my information is correct. (Interruptions). In the case of Kakinada-Gujarat pipeline, the work was finalised. (Interruptions). Kakinada is on the Eastern Coast and Gujarat is on the Western Coast.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** What is the question?

**SHRI D. RAJA:** My question is: what is the approach of the Government? India is a country where there are many regions. The Government should have a balanced approach towards all the regions. If this regional imbalance continues, the UPA Government will be in trouble. This is the issue which the Government will have to address at the earliest. Thank you. (Ends)

**SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA (ASSAM):** Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I thank you for giving me this opportunity to speak. In his reply, the

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

hon. Minister said, "Till the year 2008-09, the domestic availability of natural gas in the country was 105 million metric standard cubic metres per day. Against this, the estimated demand of natural gas was around 197 mmscmd." So, from the statement it is very clear that the supply of gas is lower than the demand of gas in our country. Sir, I come from the North-Eastern Region of the country which is very much famous for its natural gas. Assam has huge quantity of natural gas. My question relates to the gas-based power projects. I am limiting myself only to the gas-based power projects.

(Contd. by 1Y)

RG/2.30/1Y

**SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA (contd.):** Assam is suffering very badly. Even after 62 years of our independence, our country is suffering on account of power shortage, which affects the common people, the cultivators and the industry. Due to shortage of power, small and medium scale industries, in particular, suffer very badly. So, it is high time for Government to generate power from the gas base. Most of the States of our country depend upon power projects from gas. In fact, Tanzania and other countries supply power from gas based power projects. Although Assam has the potential...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Seek your clarification.

**SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA:** Sir, though Assam has the potential for power generation, yet, due to the negligence of the Government, they are not doing anything, and we are suffering. I would like to say one thing...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Seek your clarification.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

**SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA:** Every day gas ignites in Assam. I tell you, it is a national crime. Instead of utilising it in the interest of the country, it is getting ignited in the North-Eastern Region. May I know from the hon. Minister whether he is thinking to establish power projects in Assam from the gas available there? This Ministry, in consultation with the Power Ministry, should think about establishment of gas base power projects in Assam. My second clarification is this. When the Government is engaging private parties, then, why are they not engaging the ONGC in this sector? (Ends)

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, in the statement of the hon. Minister, he has said, "However, with no major discovery of gas for several years...". I would like to know whether it is a fact that the before the K.G. Basin was privatised, when a fire broke out at a gas well in Amalapuram, -- incidentally, it was the constituency of the former Lok Sabha Speaker, late Shri G.M.C. Balayogi -- the gas was rejected to the ONGC, while, one fine morning, a private party gets gas. I would like to know from the hon. Minister why it was so, and why he is saying that no major discovery of gas has taken place. Secondly, the hon. Minister has admitted in his statement that even in case of gas allocation to power plants facing gas shortage, -- it is there in the statement -- power plants in the private sector have been given priority *vis-a-vis* the NTPC plants by the Empowered Group of Ministers. Why is it so? My third clarification is this. Regarding distribution, the Minister says, "Zero percentage to the Eastern region". Sir, we are coming from the Eastern region; especially, in the four States of West Bengal, Chhattisgarh, Bihar and Orissa, there is no proper distribution,

and the fertiliser plants have been shut down in Durgapur and other places. I would like to know why the Government is not in a position to have proper distribution of gas so as to reduce the imbalance of the country. The K.G. Basin is the national wealth, and it should be distributed, as a national property, to all the regions of the country. Sir, my fourth clarification is...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Please take your seat.

(Followed by 1Z)

1z/2.35/ks-vnk

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN:** Sir, it is not a fact. We have seen; in the Finance Bill, there is a special... (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please, ask specific question.

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN:** Yes, Sir. This is the specific question. Only for one company, which is related to this gas KG basin, has benefited by Rs. 20,000 crores -- which is a national property -- at the cost of the common people of our country. (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Now, Mr. Shri Mohammed Adeeb.

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN:** Sir, my last point is...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** No, no. I have already called Mr. Mohammed Adeeb. Take your seat now. (Interruptions)

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN:** ...would like to see, the Indian quality should not... (Interruptions) This is my opinion.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Shri Mohammed Adeeb.

श्री मोहम्मद अदीब (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदय, मैं अपने मंत्री जी को मुबारकवाद दे रहा हूँ।

جناب محمد ادیب (اتر پردیش): مہودے، میں اپنے منتری جی کو مبارکباد دے رہا

ہوں۔

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** There is no time to congratulate; just put your question.

**श्री मोहम्मद अदीब :** महोदय, उनके द्वारा यह detailed reply देने के बाद बहुत-सी बातें क्लीयर हो गई हैं, क्योंकि पहले यह लग रहा था, गैस की जो बातें अखबारों में आ रही थीं, उनसे यह लग रहा था कि यह कोई प्राइवेट कंपनियों का जिक्र है, लेकिन मंत्री जी के बयान के बाद यह सामने आया कि यह हुकूमत-ए-हिन्द की हैसियत है और यह देश के हित में है। इससे हम लोगों को इत्मीनान हुआ। इन्होंने reply बहुत सही दिया है, लेकिन मैं दो बातें जानना चाहता हूँ। दसवें पैराग्राफ में आपने लिखा है कि 203 block under NEPL के हमने ब्लॉक किए हैं और लगभग 12 बिलियन डॉलर इन्वेस्ट किए हैं, लेकिन इसके नतीजे क्या हुए? उससे कितनी गैस निकलने की उम्मीद है तथा कितनी गैस और निकलने की उम्मीद है? जहां तक distribution का सवाल है, तो हमको सब जगह जाना चाहिए। अभी हमारे एक साथी ने नोएडा का जिक्र किया है। वहां आज तीन-चार साल से किसानों की जमीन ली गई है, लेकिन वहां आज तक प्लांट नहीं लगा है और चंद दिनों पहले मायावती जी ने अपना एक इशतेहार दिया है, जिसमें उत्तर प्रदेश में 2017 तक के पावर प्लांट का जिक्र है, लेकिन दादरी प्लांट का उसमें कोई जिक्र नहीं है (समय की घंटी)। महोदय, यह एक चिंता का विषय है, क्योंकि वहां हमारी जमीन भी ली गई और वहां अभी तक कोई पावर प्लांट भी नहीं लगा है।

महोदय, मैं एक बात और कहना चाहता हूँ कि आपने EGOM के जरिए एक फार्मूला बनाया है, जिसके तहत आपने pricing की है। मैं यह मालूम करना चाहता हूँ कि अगर आपने इसे 4.25 फिक्स किया है और इस फार्मूले के तहत आपने लिखा है कि अगर डॉलर 25 से 60 के बीच रहता है तो यह price 2.5 मिलेगी या यह 4.25 रहेगी? बहुत-बहुत शुक्रिया।

(समाप्त)

**جناب محمد ادیب :** مہودے، ان کے دوارا یہ ڈٹیلڈ ریپلائی دینے کے بعد بہت سی باتیں کلئیر ہو گئی ہیں، کیوں کہ پہلے یہ لگ رہا تھا، گیس کی جو باتیں اخباروں میں آ رہی تھیں، ان سے یہ لگ رہا تھا کہ یہ کوئی پرائیویٹ کمپنیوں کا ذکر ہے،

لیکن منتری جی کے بیان کے بعد یہ سامنے آیا کہ یہ حکومت ہند کی حیثیت ہے اور یہ دیش کے ہت میں ہے۔ اس سے ہم لوگوں کو اطمینان ہوا۔ انہوں نے ریپلائی بہت صحیح دیا ہے، لیکن میں دو باتیں جاننا چاہتا ہوں۔ دسویں پیراگراف میں آپ نے لکھا ہے کہ 203 بلاک انڈر این-ای-پی-ایل۔ کے ہم نے بلاک کئے ہیں اور لگ بھگ 12 بلین ڈالر انویسٹ کئے ہیں، لیکن اس کے نتیجے کیا ہوئے؟ اس سے کتنی گیس نکالنے کی امید ہے اور کتنی گیس اور نکالنے کی امید ہے؟ جہاں تک ڈسٹریبیوشن کا سوال ہے، تو ہم کو سب جگہ جانا چاہئے۔ ابھی ہمارے ایک ساتھی نے نوئیڈا کا ذکر کیا ہے۔ وہاں آج تین چار سال سے کسانوں کی زمین لی گئی ہے، لیکن وہاں آج تک پلانٹ نہیں لگا ہے اور چند دنوں پہلے مایاوتی جی نے اپنا ایک اشتہار دیا ہے، جس میں اترپردیش میں 2017 تک کے پاور پلانٹ کا ذکر ہے، لیکن دادری پلانٹ کا اس میں کوئی ذکر نہیں ہے۔۔(وقت کی گھنٹی)۔۔ مہودے، یہ ایک چنتا کا وشنے ہے، کیوں کہ وہاں ہماری زمین بھی لی گئی اور وہاں ابھی تک کوئی پاور پلانٹ نہیں لگا ہے۔

مہودے، میں ایک بات اور کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ آپ نے EGOM کے ذریعے ایک فارمولہ بنایا ہے، جس کے تحت آپ نے پرائسنگ کی ہے۔ میں یہ معلوم کرنا چاہتا ہوں کہ اگر آپ نے اسے 4-25 فکس کیا ہے اور اس فارمولے کے تحت آپ نے لکھا ہے کہ اگر ڈالر 25 سے 60 کے بیچ رہتا ہے تو یہ پرائس 2-5 ملے گی یا یہ 4-25 رہے گی؟ بہت بہت شکریہ۔

(ختم شد)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Now, Prof. Alka Balram Kshatriya.

**پرو. اَلکا کْشتری (گُجرات) :** धन्यवाद, उपसभाध्यक्ष जी। देश के औद्योगिकीकरण में उपलब्ध बहुमूल्य संसाधन गैस राष्ट्रीय संपत्ति है, जो कि किसानों के लिए जरूरी उर्वरक के

लिए, सार्वजनिक परिवहन के लिए, इस्पात क्षेत्र के लिए, घरेलू क्षेत्र के लिए, विद्युत क्षेत्र के लिए बहुत ही जरूरी है, लेकिन दो सरकारी गैस कंपनियों ने इसको अपनी निजी संपत्ति माना है। मेरे कहने का तात्पर्य RIL और RNRL के बीच गैस मुद्दे से है, जो कि अब उच्चतम न्यायालय में पहुंच चुका है। मैं न्यायालय के विचाराधीन मामले के बारे में कुछ नहीं कहना चाहती हूँ, लेकिन इन दो कंपनियों द्वारा पारिवारिक निपटारे के लिए देश के प्राकृतिक संसाधन गैस को अपनी निजी संपत्ति मान कर आपस में बांटा गया है, उसके बारे में मैं बात करना चाहती हूँ कि तथाकथित समझौता-पत्र, जिसका ब्यौरा अभी भी गुप्त है, में गैस को निजी संपत्ति समझा गया और इसे हस्ताक्षरकर्ताओं ने 60:40 के अनुपात में बांट दिया है। यह बात पिछले चार सालों से चल रही थी और इस गंभीर बाबत की ओर अब सरकार का ध्यान गया है, जिसके लिए पहले तो मैं माननीय मंत्री जी को धन्यवाद दे रही हूँ और मैं सरकार से यह अनुरोध भी करना चाहती हूँ और पूछना भी चाहती हूँ कि समझौता-पत्र के बारे में वह सदन को बताए कि समझौता-पत्र में क्या लिखा गया है? दूसरी बात मैं यह पूछना चाहती हूँ कि क्या ऐसा कोई कानून है कि जिसके तहत ऐसे किसी कानून को अनुमति दी जा सकती है? तीसरी बात, जहां तक गैस आवंटन का संबंध है, उसमें सरकार द्वारा शुरुआत में क्या कदम उठाए गए थे? चौथी बात, ऐसी निंदनीय व्यापारिक कुव्यवस्था की रोकथाम के लिए, राष्ट्र की सार्वभौम और अधिकार की सुरक्षा के लिए क्या सरकार का कोई विधान लाने का प्रस्ताव है? और, आखिरी बात, क्या सरकार का स्वतंत्र Regulatory Authority बनाने का कोई प्रस्ताव है? महोदय, मैंने बहुत-ही point-wise जवाब मांगा है और मेरे सवाल का जवाब मंत्री जी देंगे। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Okay, Shri D.P. Sabharwal.

(Followed at 2a by mp)

**श्री धर्म पाल सभ्रवाल (पंजाब) :** महोदय, सांसद श्री तपन कुमार सेन ने सरकार का जिस मुद्दे की ओर ध्यानाकर्षण किया है, यह बहुत समय से चल रहा है। इसके बारे में मेरे सांसद साथियों ने बहुत खुलकर स्पष्टीकरण मांगा है और मंत्री जी ने भी जो बयान दिया है, वह बहुत विस्तारपूर्वक दिया है। महोदय, मैं ऐसा कोई प्रश्न या स्पष्टीकरण नहीं पूछना चाहूंगा जो मेरे साथी पहले पूछ चुके हैं। मैं केवल यह जानना चाहूंगा कि क्या दो निजी कंपनियां अपने पारिवारिक झंझट को निपटाने के लिए देश के प्राकृतिक संसाधनों जैसे गैस, तेल आदि को आपस में बांट सकती हैं? अगर सरकार द्वारा इस तथ्य की अनदेखी हुई है, तो क्या वह उसको जल्द पूरा करेगी, क्योंकि प्राकृतिक संसाधनों पर तो देश का अधिकार होता है। मीडिया ने प्रेस कॉन्फ्रेंस करके सरकार की आलोचना की है, जबकि मामला न्यायालय के विचाराधीन है। क्या सरकार उन कंपनियों के विरुद्ध Contempt of Court का मुकदमा दायर करेगी ?

मेरा दूसरा सवाल यह है कि क्या संसद के इस सत्र के बाद सरकार कोई अध्यादेश लाएगी, जिससे इस विवाद को विराम मिल सके और देश के बहुमूल्य प्राकृतिक संसाधनों को किसानों और आम जनता की जरूरत के लिए उपलब्ध कराया जा सके?

(समाप्त)

**DR. N. JANARDHANA REDDY (ANDHRA PRADESH):** Sir, this gas is now an important thing and is going to create problems if the Government does not take up distribution of gas properly. As my friend, Shri Raja was saying, it is in Amlapuram from where late Balayogi was the M.P., and now a young gentleman is an M.P. from that area. I know, so many times they came and represented to me. Farmers have lost thousands of acres of land because of the activities of the ONGC. The moving vehicles damage roads and create all these problems. So, we have all these sufferings for Andhra. Now, when the gas is available, some gentleman wants to take it to some other place, and some gentleman wants to take it to some place without asking what is the



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

need of Andhra. I know the hon. Minister is a very knowledgeable man; he will definitely look into Andhra needs. But I want to give one example here. Sir, 50 years ago, the IFFCO purchased 5000 acres of land, in my district, to start a fertiliser company for South India, not for Andhra alone. At that time, it was stopped because naphtha was a costly affair, and gas was not available for that plant. It was said that it would be commissioned only if gas was made available.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Now, put your question.

**DR. N. JANARDHANA REDDY:** Now, presently, the State has got its own gas. If we don't look into it, if we don't look into the Andhra needs, if we don't look into the various aspects of Andhra, how can one take the gas from Andhra? I am not threatening, but the situation is like this.

(Followed by 2b-kgg)

kgg/2b/2.45

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** You are not threatening but asking.

**DR. N. JANARDHANA REDDY:** Sir, that is why I said that this block is going to create problems. Yesterday, the Assembly passed a resolution and the Chief Minister has assured in the House that the needs of Andhriles will be met first and then the gas can be allowed to be taken anywhere. I am not threatening; being an MP, I should not do that. But, I am bringing the reality to the notice of the House and to the hon. Minister. I only request the Minister to inform the House, through which the people of Andhra may know, what he is going to do with the demand of the Andhra people and the rest of the nation. You can give it to U.P. or others. Thank you. (Ends)

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

**SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU (ANDHRA PRADESH):** Sir, the Minister, in his statement said that with the commencement of the KG's D6 production, over 100 mmscmd gas is being supplied to power and fertilizer sectors out of a total supply of 140 mmscmd. Not only that, he also said, as a result of KG D6 supplies, about 4000 MW additional power is being generated and an annual subsidy of fertilizer to the extent of Rs.3,000 crores is achieved. Such a huge contribution this KG D6 is making. When such a huge profit is provided, out of 140 mmscmd, 100 mmscmd is produced from the KG D6 basin. Then, the people of Andhra Pradesh had been expecting for several years, that taking regional balance into consideration, a considerable amount of gas would be given to the people of Andhra Pradesh, to the factories that are closed down, to the power plants that are starving, to those whose capacities are not fully utilised to their maximum strength. They had been expecting that a considerable amount of gas would be allocated for the Government of Andhra Pradesh to the domestic needs of Andhra Pradesh. I request the hon. Minister to announce in this House that such and such amount of gas is allocated to meet the needs of Andhra Pradesh. Thank you. (Ends)

**SHRI SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK (GOA):** Sir, gas is a national asset. I would like to know from the hon. Minister that when an impression is being created openly that it is an issue between two private parties, why did not you assert positively to remove the impression apart from saying that it is a national property? This is the first point. Secondly, is the Government proposing to bring in legislation to regularise the production,

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

utilisation and distribution of gas? If so, by what time do we expect such a legislation? Thank you.

(Ends)

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (KARNATAKA):** Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, thank you very much for giving me an opportunity to speak. I just associate myself with Dr. Janardhana Reddy and Shri Madhu. There is a total unrest in the minds of the people of that region saying that something should be done for the region and, then, the needs of others should also be taken care of.

(contd. by kls/2c)

MCM/KLS/2C-2.50

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (CONTD):** Sir, I represent a national party, I do not speak of one particular State, but, at the same, every State is a part of the nation. So, keeping that in mind, you should consider it. It is not from the sea, it is from the land and the land of the farmers of that region. They have given that land. Now this KGB VI is yielding really good results. The Andhra Pradesh Assembly unanimously passed a resolution, political parties are also agitated over this matter and public also is agitated over this matter. I request the hon. Minister to tell what is the thinking of the Government with regard to taking care of the needs of the State, and, then, subsequently take care of the entire nation also. I just wanted to focus on that point.

(Ends)

**श्री विजय कुमार रूपाणी (गुजरात) :** महोदय, इसको सरकार ने राष्ट्रीय सम्पत्ति घोषित किया है। नेच्युरल गैस के बारे में जो पोलिसी है, उसके बारे में सरकार से जानना चाहता हूँ।

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

एक्व्यूअली पॉवर जेनिरेशन में जो नेच्युरल गैस की आवश्यकता है, गुजरात के पिपावो में पूर्व प्रधान मंत्री श्री राजीव गांधी जी ने इसका उद्घाटन किया था और वहां हम 650 मेगावाट का पॉवर स्टेशन जेनिरेट कर रहे हैं, आपके अनुसार इसमें वहां से गैस मिलेगी, लेकिन अभी तक वह गैस मिली नहीं है। इसके बारे में सरकार क्या कहना चाहती है और सरकार क्या कर रही है? इस बारे में बताएं तो अच्छा रहेगा। दूसरे, यह जो बड़ी कम्पनियां हैं तथा छोटी-छोटी कम्पनियां हैं और स्मॉल एंटरप्राइजेज हैं, उनको गैस कब मिलेगी और कहां से मिलेगी? यह भी आप बताएं तो ठीक रहेगा। आंध्र प्रदेश को 70 परसेंट प्लांट लोड फैक्टर में से मिल रही है, बाकी राज्यों को 60 परसेंट मिल रही है। इसलिए बाकी सब राज्यों की भी डिमांड है कि आंध्र प्रदेश को भी 60 परसेंट देना चाहिए। पन्नामुक्ता में गुजरात को जो हिस्सा मिलना चाहिए, वह भी आप तुरन्त देंगे, इस बात की हमारी मांग है?

(समाप्त)

**SHRI SYED AZEEZ PASHA (ANDHRA PRADESH):** Sir, the point raised by my colleague, Mr. D. Raja, I just want to add only one sentence to that. ...(Interruptions)... The aspirations of the people of Andhra Pradesh should not be overlooked while you are allocating it. Even though it is a national asset but the people of Andhra Pradesh expect substantial allocation to be made to the people of Andhra Pradesh. That is the only thing I wanted to submit. Thank you.

(Ends)

**श्री गिरीश कुमार सांगी (आन्ध्र प्रदेश) :** सर, यह कहावत है कि -"दीया तले अंधेरा।" They celebrated this gas finding with a great hope that it will change their lives and the area will be developed. The Government of Andhra Pradesh also announced several projects in the vicinity and throughout Andhra Pradesh...(Time-bell)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Please put your question.

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI:** My straight question to the hon. Minister is, what percentage of the total gas finding in KG basin will be allocated to Andhra Pradesh and out of the royalty that the Government of India is getting, what will be share of Andhra Pradesh in that royalty?

(Ends)

**SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS:** Sir, the Government is going to establish a gas project in Assam. So, there is anxiety in the minds of the people about the availability of gas. I would like to know whether gas would be available till the completion of that project. That is my only question.

(Ends)

**THE MINISTER OF PETROLEUM AND NATURAL GAS (SHRI MURLI DEORA):** Sir, at the outset, I would like to thank my friend, Tapan Sen who was for the last four or five days was following that this subject should be taken up. I am very grateful to him and to all the other Members who have participated in this debate. The purpose of submitting such a big note was that there would not be so many questions and some of the questions, which are raised here, are already replied. But I would like to start with two or three very small points. Sir, 30 years back I was Mayor of Bombay. At that time, we had a man called Dr. N.B. Prasad -- Mr. N.K. Singh would remember him. He was also from Andhra Pradesh. Dr. N.B. Prasad was the Chairman of the ONGC. He came to sign an agreement with the Mayor of Bombay Municipal Corporation for supply of gas from Bombay High to the domestic city of Bombay. Bombay has domestic supply. I remember

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

now only last year Shri Vilasrao Deshmukh, who is sitting here, inaugurated that supply. It took 31 years for a Memorandum of Understanding to be signed between the then Mayor of Bombay and Dr. N.B. Prasad to be implemented and get the gas in reality.

(Contd. By 2d)

SSS-GS/2D/2.55

**SHRI MURLI DEORA (CONTD.):** That time, people were reading, "Bombay High Gas", "Bombay High Gas". Today also, "Bombay High" is producing 26 million tons of oil. After, Bombay High, there is a production of only six or seven million tons extra, that is, 31 to 32 million tons which is the total indigenous production of our country. We are importing seventy five per cent of oil. I would like to first make an appeal to my colleagues here; we must make some schemes or projects, and we should see to it that this oil or gas which is there in the oil fields or in the gas fields, is explored; it comes out. That is why the Government started a programme called 'NELP'. I can assure you that the NELP which is now working around the country, and specially, in Andhra Pradesh, etc. is doing very well. More than 50 per cent of the total gas, produced in India, may be coming from this one area of Andhra Pradesh, and if we keep on lending others and saying that this is belonging to him, that is belonging to him, this fellow is in this pocket, this fellow is in another pocket, I do not think, we will do any service to anybody. So, the first and foremost appeal, I would like to make to this House is that we should be proud that such vast reservoirs of, both, oil and gas are available in our country, and, I will be very grateful if the people will give a line to them rather than worrying about what to be

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

done. When I see my friend Sen, I remember, 30 years back or 25 years back, there was a controversy about the ownership or the nationalisation. Sir, at old days of nationalisation have gone. I have even discussed with your Chief Minister, several times, several projects. He does not talk about nationalisation! And you also, Mr. Raja!  
(Interruptions)

**SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU:** No, no, no. (Interruptions)

**SHRI MURLI DEORA:** What are you worried about? The nationalisation? (Interruptions) You are worried about the nationalisation? (Interruptions)

**SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU:** He is raising about different Chief Ministers. (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN):** Mr. Madhu, please, take your seat.

**SHRI MURLI DEORA:** I am praising him. Are you against the Chief Minister? (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please take your seat.

**SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU:** It is not a question of Chief Minister. Our party policy is for producing...(Interruptions)...not for private companies.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** That is known to everybody. Please sit down.  
(Interruptions)

**SHRI MURLI DEORA:** So, I am requesting you to please change your party policy, otherwise, you will change the Government from there!  
(Interruptions)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Please take it lightly. (Interruptions) Why are you taking it seriously? (Interruptions) Please take it lightly, Mr. Madhu.

**SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU:** I am taking it very lightly. I am trying to apprise the Minister. If they adopt the same tripartite private policy, they will be changed. Next time they will be changed.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** What is this, Mr. Madhu? Such remarks should be taken lightly. What is there?

**SHRI MURLI DEORA:** मैं मज़ाक में कहता हूँ, आप क्यों ...(व्यवधान)... It is just not possible to reply to every point. Some of them are very, very meaningful; I can assure you, we will take cognisance of that, and we will see that they are implemented. In case somebody wants in writing, I will reply to them in two or three days. But, I will come to the two or three points that are raised now, I would like to read for them, "The State of Andhra Pradesh has a lot of natural resources. Any State which produces so much oil and so much gas, must be given some priority." The Community, EGoM considered this issue. When we were talking about the priority, when we were talking about the price, this question came and the people of Andhra Pradesh can be rest assured that we will do full justice to the people of Andhra Pradesh. (Interruptions)

**SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA:** What about Assam?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** No, please, it is not from Assam. Assam is not the question, please...(Interruptions)... Please don't raise it unnecessarily. (Interruptions) Mr. Moinul Hassan, please sit down.



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

(Interruptions) On Assam, you can have another Motion. Mr. Sanghi, please sit down.

**SHRI MURLI DEORA:** आप मुझे बोलने दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... तेल और गैस के भंडार आन्ध्र प्रदेश में हैं यह वहां से आते हैं, उसके लिए कोई स्पेशल प्रॉविजन करेंगे, उनको पावर के लिए, फर्टिलाइजर के लिए या डोमेस्टिक यूज के लिए तेल और गैस मिलेगी, इसलिए घबराने की कोई बात नहीं है। ....(व्यवधान)....

(Followed by NBR/2E)

-SSS/NBR-ASC/3.00/2E.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** You take your seat ...(Interruptions)...Please...(Interruptions)...Let him reply. Why don't you allow him to reply? He gave you the reply that Andhra will be taken care of...(Interruptions)...Sit down.

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI:** Sir, this is a very vague reply...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please sit down...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI:** Sir, he has not given a proper reply...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** What is this, Sanghi? He has replied to your question first...(Interruptions)...Please, sit down.

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI:** Sir, the point is...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** No, no. It will not go on record.

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI: \***

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) :** Whatever Mr. Sanghi says will not go on record...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI: \***

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please take your seat...(Interruptions)...Let him reply.

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI: \***

**SHRI MURLI DEORA:** I am replying to your question...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Let him reply ...(Interruptions)...Please, take your seat...(Interruptions)...Let him reply. Please, take your seat ...(Interruptions)...Mr. Sanghi...(Interruptions)...It is not going on record.

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI: \***

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** You take your seat. Let him reply.

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** Sir, the hon. Minister is talking about nationalisation...(Interruptions)...Let him talk about privatisation ...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Tapan Sen, take your seat...(Interruptions)... Please take your seat...(Interruptions)...What is this?...(Interruptions)... Please, listen to the reply, Mr. Tapan Sen...(Interruptions)...You please address the Chair...(Interruptions)...Don't look at them, Mr. Minister...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI MURLI DEORA:** Sir, hon. Members have raised some very important points...(Interruptions)...Please allow me to reply.

---

\* Not recorded.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

Sir, under article 297 of the Constitution, the mineral resources of the country are owned by the Government. Since, E & P business is a highly risky business involving high level of technology and capital and to attract investments in E & P sector, the Government had approved the NELP Policy in 1997 to create a competitive and efficient regime based on award of blocks under international competitive bidding. The main objective of introducing the NELP was to intensify the exploration in the country so that more acreage is put on production to reduce the dependence on import of crude oil & gas by introducing attractive fiscal regime to the investors, both in public and private sector on a level-playing field.

The Government had initiated deregulation of the E & P sector during the year 1991 and made conscious efforts progressively to deregulate it completely by introducing the New Exploration Licensing Policy in 1999. The exploration is a very risky venture requiring high technology and capital, especially in deepwater areas and frontier basins, which require appropriate returns to encourage the companies. Such returns are assured under PSC regime where the contractors are entitled to recover the cost of exploration and development and also share profit petroleum along with the Government. There are cases where contractors undertake exploration activities by investing capital which may not lead to discovery. In such cases, the investments made by them will not yield returns and these expenditures cannot be charged for cost recovery in any other successful exploration block. Moreover, the Government has already signed 203 contracts under NELP and 28 PSCs under pre-NELP exploration regime, which are in different stages of

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

development and production. Now, reversing the Government policies would have adverse impact on these PSCs. Hence, the PSCs are required to be honoured in its entirety.

Sir, the price of US \$ 4.20 at crude price of US \$ 60 per barrel is a formula approved by the EGoM. Under the provisions of Production Sharing Contract, the Government has a role in approving the price formula. While approving the price formula, the Government has examined the price formula proposed by the contractor under the PSC and taken into consideration the interest of various sectors, including power, fertilizer, etc. The formula was also subject to scrutiny by the Committee of Secretaries and the Prime Minister's Economic Advisory Council for which the Chairman was Dr. C. Rangarajan. It was only thereafter the EGoM has approved the price formula with some modifications. It must also be noted that the contractor has made no proposal on the price formula for determining the pricing of supply of gas to be made to NTPC which is required under the PSC. This process not having been undertaken, EGoM's approved price is applicable.

(CONTD. BY PK "2F")

PK-LT/2F/3.05

**SHRI MURLI DEORA (CONTD).** As regards the court, some hon. Members raised some points. (Interruptions)..

**SHRI D. RAJA:** Why is this formula linked with the price of crude oil in the international market? ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI MURLI DEORA:** It has to be; otherwise, how would it be decided? ..(Interruptions)..

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

**SHRI D. RAJA:** It is a domestic product. It is available in our country. Why is there a linkage? ..(Interruptions)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Please, please...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI MURLI DEORA:** The final order of 15<sup>th</sup> June, 2009 of the Division Bench of the hon. Bombay High Court has implications on the Government's rights to formulate and implement the Gas Utilization Policy under the Production Sharing Contract. Notwithstanding the Government policies and the provisions of the PSC, the Order observes that the provisions of the MoU are binding on the parties. The MoU, as per the judgement, provides that 12 mmsmcd will be given to NTPC, 28 mmsmcd will be given to RNRL and the remaining, at the option of ADAG will be shared between RIL and RNRL in the ratio of 60 : 40. Under the circumstances, it was necessary to file an SLP in the hon. Supreme Court and, accordingly, action has been taken. I would like to dwell further on the subject but since the matter is *sub judice*, it prohibits me from speaking on this.

We have nothing to do with the private dispute of two industries or industrialists. I repeat, we have nothing to do with the private dispute of the two industrialists or industries. However, we have everything to do with protecting the interests of the Government and also of the public. This is our constitutional and legal obligation to protect the people of India and we will, honestly, honour it. Mr. Yadav, I am telling you, we will make all endeavours to protect the Government's legal rights to regulate the utilization of gas and its allocation. I am very grateful to all the Members and say that in case any Member has any other query,

please send me a note, in two or three days, I will reply to that. Thank you.

(Ends)

(Interruptions)..

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** Sir, at least one clarification must be allowed; otherwise, there will be no use of making this Calling Attention.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Please take your seat. (Interruptions)..

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** At least, one clarification must be allowed, and the hon. Minister must reply, specifically, to that. ..(Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please take your seat. The Minister has already stated in the House that whatever points are not replied here, he will be writing to every Member. He has already committed...(Interruptions).. Now, we will take up further discussion on the rise in prices of essential commodities. Now, Shri Gireesh Kumar Sanghi. ..(Interruptions).. Yes, yes, Mr. Sen, he will write to you. ..(Interruptions)..

**प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव :** उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, माननीय मंत्री जी ने कोई जवाब ही नहीं दिया है..(व्यवधान)..आप पहले से लिखकर लाए हैं..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री मुरली देवरा :** आप बाहर थे।

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Usually, Calling Attention takes one hour. It has taken more than that. ..(Interruptions).. He will write to you. ..(Interruptions).. Please take your seats. I have called Mr. Sanghi. ..(Interruptions).. Mr. Minister, you will reply to every Member, whatever is left. Won't you? ..(Interruptions).. Now, Shri Gireesh Kumar Sanghi. ..(Interruptions).. Nothing else will go on record except what Shri Gireesh Kumar is saying.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**  
**DISCUSSION ON THE CONTINUED RISE**  
**IN PRICES OF ESSENTIAL COMMODITIES**  
**IN THE COUNTRY (CONTD.)**

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI (ANDHRA PRADESH):** Sir, I thank you for having given me the opportunity to express my views on the availability of essential commodities and price rise in the country, which is a very burning subject of discussion. Sir, price rise is a natural phenomenon. Over the years, we have been seeing that either the prices go up or come down. This is based on demand and supply and the market forces, which apply to this. The Hon. Minister, rightly, stated, during his speech in Lok Sabha, that the price rise in our country, when compared to other countries all over the world, is very much in control. The price rise, over the last few years, in our country, has been almost to the tune of 16 to 17 per cent, whereas compared to other countries, developed countries also, it was right up to the tune of about 100 per cent.

(Contd. by PB/2G)

PB/2g/3.10

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI (CONTD.):** Sir, I will straightway come to some of the measures taken by our State, the State of Andhra Pradesh, by our hon. Chief Minister, Shri Y.S. Rajasekhara Reddy. When we talk of price rise, there are two different segments. One segment is the segment which is affluent, which can afford the price rise and which can go to various super markets to buy products of their needs. They want very high quality and high priced products. There is another segment which is our rural folk or our poor folk, and so also the people who are living 'Below Poverty Line'. For them, the Government

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

intervention is very much essential. I am confident, and I am sure that the kind of intervention that my State, the State of Andhra Pradesh, has done is highly commendable. I would like to put before this House the various steps taken by our State Government under the leadership of our hon. Chief Minister, Shri Y. S. Rajasekhara Reddy. Sir, you will be surprised to know that we have about 2 crore 30 lakh ration cards in our State. We supply rice at two rupees per kg., and up to 30 kgs. of rice is given to a family, up to 4 kgs., per head, in a family. We supply 10 kgs. of wheat at Rs. 7 per kg; sugar at Rs. 13.50 per kg; kerosene at Rs. 9.75 a litre and Palmolein oil at Rs. 35 per litre. As far as red gram is concerned, we supply red gram at Rs. 30 per kg to each family. Sir, the Public Distribution System, in our State, is working very, very effectively, and there are hardly any cases where people feel that they don't have a ration card. If somebody has got a white ration card, he is also covered under the Rajiv Arogyasri by which his health is also covered; his health is also insured. There are hundreds of ailments which are covered under the Rajiv Arogyasri Health Insurance Scheme; and the beneficiary can walk into any of the corporate hospitals and get himself treated. Since 2007 when this Scheme was started, up till now, our Government has spent on the Rajiv Arogyasri Health Insurance Scheme itself Rs. 1725 crores, benefiting 3 lakh beneficiaries. Now, this Scheme has been extended to 367 hospitals and 942 diseases have been identified under this Rajiv Arogyasri Health Insurance Scheme. Sir, this year, the Government has allocated Rs. 925 crores. ... ..(Interruptions)...

**श्री विक्रम वर्मा :** सर, यह discussion price rise पर है या health पर है!



Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI:** Sir, I am speaking on price rise, on essential commodities, on health, on ...

**SHRI VIKRAM VERMA:** You may continue.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Speak on price rise.

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI:** Yes, Sir. Essential commodities are also part of it; health is also a part of it. Similarly, our Government has started a new project through which they will be supplying mineral drinking water at two rupees for twenty litres to each house. It is a very unique scheme which the Government of Andhra Pradesh has started. Similarly, Sir, there are many such programmes which the Government has taken up to control the price rise and to support the farmers. Sir, because the farmers are the backbone of producing agricultural produce, our State Government is spending about Rs. 5600 crores, annually, to give nine hours' free power supply, per day, to about 30 lakh pump sets.

(Contd. by 2h/SKC)

2h/3.15/skc-sch

**SHRI GIREESH KUMAR SANGHI (Contd.):** These are the various measures that our Government has taken. To benefit the poor people, the Government of Andhra Pradesh has also taken up various innovative schemes like pension and other initiatives. This is how the Government intervened. Price rise is one thing, but strengthening and benefiting the common man to improve their purchasing power is also an issue directly related to price rise.

Now, Sir, when we talk of price rise, there are several issues related to the Ministry of Agriculture. I feel that there is a lot of gap

between the land and the lab. There is a huge gap between what is done in labs and the benefits that people at the grassroots level, the farmers, are getting out of the research done there. There is a lot of gap there and a lot needs to be done in this area. We have to do a lot of research, come out with new seeds, extension work needs to be improved, and so on. Statistics are available to show that the yield in our country is very poor. Take any crop's yield in our country; it is very poor. Be it rice, wheat, cotton, pulses or oilseeds, when compared to other countries, the crop yield in our country is very poor. So, our farm practices need to be improved. Our harvesting practices need to be improved. Our land use policy has to be changed. We have various types of land in our country; there are hills, mountains, plains and fallow lands. For each of these land types, land policies must be made according to the availability of resources. Similarly, Sir, irrigation is a big factor when it comes to controlling price rise and availability of commodities. It is directly related to agriculture. I am happy to share with this august House the initiatives taken by our State's Government in this area also. It is through a programme called Jalayagnam where initially 26 projects were taken up with a total outlay of Rs. 46,000 crores. Later on, we added 81 projects which would irrigate 21,75,000 acres of land. Ultimately, the plan is to bring about one crore acres of land under irrigation. It will definitely strengthen the farmers and increase yields. By increasing the yield, we will be able to supplement the shortfall in supply and reduce the gap between demand and supply. I would like to suggest to the hon. Minister, who is present here, is to ensure that proper extension work is done and the benefits extended to

the farmers. The transport system in our country is such that we find that a particular commodity is sold at a very cheap rate in a particular area, the growing centre, while in other centres the same commodity is sold at a very high price. So, proper logistics and transportation also need to be strengthened and enhanced so that we are able to do a better job.

(Ends)

**श्री शान्ता कुमार (हिमाचल प्रदेश):** मान्यवर उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, आज सदन एक बहुत ही चिन्ताजनक विषय पर चर्चा कर रहा है। मुझे अपने पूर्ववक्ता सांसद की बात सुन कर बहुत हैरानी हुई। महंगाई जैसे विषय के संबंध में इस प्रकार से विचार करना कि यह नैचुरल फिर्नामिना है, कभी बढ़ती है, कभी घटती है, सत्ताधारी दल का इस प्रकार का एटीट्यूड रहने के कारण ही आज महंगाई बढ़ रही है, घट नहीं रही है।

इस बात को भुलाना नहीं चाहिए कि भारत वर्ष में 26 करोड़ लोग गरीबी की रेखा से नीचे रहते हैं। United Nations Food Programme की रिपोर्ट के मुताबिक इस देश में लगभग 20 करोड़ लोग भुखमरी की हालत में रहते हैं, गरीबी की रेखा से नीचे रहते हैं, जिन लोगों के घरों में दो वक्त की सूखी रोटी भी नहीं होती है और जिस घर में रात को मां अपने बेटे को यह कहती है कि आज खाने को कुछ नहीं है, पानी का गिलास पीकर सो जाओ। इस किस्म की बातें सुन कर वे लोग क्या सोचते होंगे, यह विचार करने की बात है।

(2j/psv पर जारी)

-SCH/PSV-KSK/2J/3.20

**श्री शान्ता कुमार(क्रमागत):** उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, महंगाई आज आम व्यक्ति की कमर तोड़ रही है। गरीबी रेखा के नीचे रहने वाले लोगों तथा अति गरीब लोगों की टूटी हुई कमर और अधिक टूट रही है। मुझे दुख है कि देश के गरीबों की झोपड़ी से आने वाली सिसकियों को सुनने के लिए भी सत्ताधारी दल आज तैयार नहीं है। सबसे बड़ी हैरानी तो तब होती है, जब अखबार में यह खबर आती है कि मुद्रास्फीति कम हो गई, एक प्रतिशत पर पहुँच गई,

लेकिन जब आम आदमी बाजार में जाता है, तब उसको अरहर की दाल 95 रुपए प्रति किलो के भाव में प्राप्त होती है।

सर, मैं बड़े ज़ोर से एक बात कहना चाहता हूँ कि दुनिया-भर में आर्थिक नीतियों का निर्धारण मुद्रास्फीति पर होता है और भारत में मुद्रास्फीति बिल्कुल गलत ढंग से आंकी जाती है, थोक मूल्य सूचकांक के आधार पर। यहाँ आम essential commodities और गरीबों की जरूरतों के आधार पर उसको आंकने की कोई व्यवस्था नहीं है। Economic Survey के page 68 पर differences in WPI, CPI-- मैं उसका एक उदाहरण देता हूँ-- उसमें food prices WPI 25.43 और अंत में उपभोक्ता मूल्य agriculture-labour 69.15 है। इस प्रकार थोक मूल्य सूचकांक और खेतिहर मजदूरों के सूचकांक में 45 अंकों का अंतर है। इसी प्रकार से मार्च, 2009 में मुद्रास्फीति lowest 0.8 per cent है, परन्तु खाद्य-वस्तुओं में मूल्य-वृद्धि 10 प्रतिशत है। थोक मूल्य में manipulation होती है, वे manipulate किए जाते हैं। विश्व-भर में केवल 24 देश ऐसे हैं, जो थोक मूल्य सूचकांक के आधार पर अपनी नीतियों का निर्धारण करते हैं और 157 देश ऐसे हैं, जो उपभोक्ता मूल्य सूचकांक पर अपनी नीतियों का निर्धारण करते हैं। सरकार इस बारे में विचार करे। मार्च 2009 में मूल्य सूचकांक 0.44 है, लेकिन खाद्य-पदार्थों के दाम 10.16 प्रतिशत बढ़े हैं। दालें 11 प्रतिशत बढ़ीं और चीनी का मूल्य 23 प्रतिशत बढ़ा, लेकिन सरकार ने जो inflation बताया, वह 0.44 प्रतिशत है। थोक मूल्य सूचकांक 435 वस्तुओं पर आंके जाते हैं और देश के चार बड़े नगरों के आंके जाते हैं, उनका आम और गरीब आदमी के जीवन के साथ कोई सम्बन्ध नहीं है। 2007 में एक सरकारी समिति ने अपनी रिपोर्ट में भी यह बात कही थी कि थोक मूल्य सूचकांक सही नहीं हैं। इसलिए मैं यह चाहूँगा कि सरकार एक बहुत बड़ा आर्थिक सुधार करे। आप जो उपभोक्ता मूल्य सूचकांक भी बताते हैं, वह uniform नहीं है। यह agriculture-labour के लिए अलग है और industrial labour के लिए अलग है। वह भी भ्रामक है। मैं यह चाहूँगा कि भारत के अन्दर एक सुधार हो और गरीब के साथ, आम आदमी के साथ जो सम्बन्धित भाव हैं, उनके आधार पर इसको तैयार किया जाए। भारत में एक विश्वसनीय मूल्य सूचकांक की आवश्यकता है। आप बताइए कि जो 26 करोड़ गरीब लोग हैं, उनकी आवश्यकताओं के मुताबिक मूल्य सूचकांक क्या हैं? 20 करोड़ अति गरीब

लोग, जो लगभग भूखे रहते हैं, आप उनका उपभोक्ता मूल्य सूचकांक बताइए, तब असली चेहरा सरकार के सामने आएगा। यह सुधार किया जाए, तो हमारी नीतियाँ ठीक ढंग से निर्धारित होती हैं।

सर, मैं यह कहना चाहूँगा कि महँगाई तो एक लक्षण है, बीमारी तो कुछ और ही है। कुछ तात्कालिक कारण हैं, जैसे- सूखा पड़ गया, वर्षा ज्यादा हो गई, युद्ध हो गया, लेकिन मुख्य रूप से महँगाई के कारण बुनियादी हैं, जिनके कारण महँगाई बढ़ रही है और यह निरंतर बढ़ती चली जाएगी।

(2के/एच0एम0एस0 पर क्रमशः)

2K/HMS-SK/3.25

**श्री शान्ता कुमार (क्रमागत) :** महोदय, मुख्य कारण है गलत व अव्यावहारिक नीतियाँ, गलत प्राथमिकताएं, inefficient implementation और भ्रष्टाचार। महोदय, उत्पादन बढ़ेगा तब देश आगे बढ़ेगा, उत्पादन बढ़ेगा तब महँगाई कम होगी, लेकिन उत्पादन बढ़ाने की दृष्टि से जो बातें आवश्यक थीं, उन पर सरकार ने विचार नहीं किया।

महोदय, हमारा देश कृषि प्रधान देश है और जहां 70 प्रतिशत लोग कृषि पर काम करते हैं वहां जो कृषि को प्राथमिकता दी जानी चाहिए थी, वह नहीं दी गयी। आज हालत यह है कि Gross capital formation में, प्रारंभ में कृषि का भाग 23 प्रतिशत था, वह घटते-घटते 6 प्रतिशत रह गया। महोदय, देश आजाद होने के बाद जी0डी0पी0 में कृषि का हिस्सा जहां 58 परसेंट था, आज वह घटकर केवल 18 परसेंट रह गया। निवेश यानी investment छठी पंचवर्षीय योजना में उस समय 64 हजार करोड़ था, आज अगर पैसे की कीमत का हिसाब लगाया जाए तो एक और पांच का अंतर है। उस समय जितना निवेश था अगर उस में एक भी नया पैसा न बढ़ाना हो तो भी निवेश 3 लाख करोड़ होना चाहिए, लेकिन निवेश एक लाख करोड़ भी नहीं है।

महोदय, कृषि की पूरी उपेक्षा ही देश की आर्थिक परिस्थिति का सब से बड़ा कारण है। फिर सिंचाई की उपेक्षा की गयी है। हमारे यहां 142 मिलियन हैक्टेयर में से केवल 57 मिलियन हैक्टेयर सिंचित भूमि है और उस में 55 परसेंट उत्पादन होता है। महोदय, 85 मिलियन हैक्टेयर भूमि वर्षा पर निर्भर है और उस में केवल 45 प्रतिशत उत्पादन होता है।

यही कारण है कि आज उत्पादन में भारत दुनिया के बहुत से देशों से पीछे है। मैं देख रहा था, केवल पैडी में भारत की प्रति हैक्टेयर उपज 3 हजार किलोग्राम है और चीन की 6 हजार किलोग्राम है। चीन हमारे बाद स्वतंत्र हुआ और हमारे बाद एक देश के रूप में खड़ा हुआ तो भी चीन की पैडी की उपज 6 हजार किलोग्राम है, जापान की 5,800 है। महोदय, इंडोनेशिया भी हम से ज्यादा है। उस का उत्पादन 4,500 किलोग्राम है। यहां तक कि बंगला देश का उत्पादन भी भारत के उत्पादन से ज्यादा है। महोदय, उत्पादन के मामले में गलत प्राथमिकताएं तय करने के कारण हम उत्पादन नहीं बढ़ा सके हैं। Egypt का पैडी का उत्पादन 9,400 किलोग्राम है और हमारा 3000 किलोग्राम है। इस का क्या कारण है? वियतनाम का उत्पादन भी 4,600 किलोग्राम है। इसी प्रकार wheat में भी हम कितने ही देशों से पीछे हैं। ग्राउंड नट में हमारा उत्पादन 938 किलोग्राम है, चाइना का 2,624 किलोग्राम है, जापान का 2,308 किलोग्राम और वियतनाम का 1667 किलोग्राम है। आप देखिए सब से कम उत्पादन भारत का है क्योंकि हम ने कृषि पर ध्यान नहीं दिया, कृषि पर investment नहीं हुआ और irrigation पर जितना ध्यान दिया जाना चाहिए था, वह नहीं दिया गया, इसलिए आज हमारी यह स्थिति है।

महोदय, मैं बुनियादी बात कहना चाहता हूं। भारत जैसे देश में कृषि पर जितना ध्यान दिया जाना चाहिए था, भारत जैसे देश में irrigation पर जितना ध्यान दिया जाना चाहिए था, वह नहीं दिया गया। हमारे यहां irrigation, कृषि बिल्कुल उपेक्षित है जिस के कारण किसान भी खुदकुशी कर रहा है, जिस के कारण किसान खेत छोड़ रहा है, जिस के कारण उत्पादन नहीं बढ़ा है, जिस के कारण गरीबी है, जिस के कारण आज यह महंगाई बढ़ी है।

महोदय, जिस ढंग से यह सरकार प्रशासन चलाती रही है, यह भी महंगाई का एक और बड़ा कारण है। मुझे इस बात का दुख है कि जिस देश में 20 करोड़ लोग भुखमरी की हालत में रहते हैं, जिस देश में 26 करोड़ लोग गरीबी रेखा से नीचे रहते हैं, उस देश का प्रशासन नवाबी तरीके से, शहाना तरीके से चलता है और प्रशासन के स्तर पर भयंकर फिजूलखर्ची है। इस में बचत की कहीं, कोई योजना नहीं है। महोदय, मैंने पंचायत से लेकर प्रदेश और यहां के प्रशासन को देखा है। आज भारत सरकार का शुद्ध प्रशासनिक व्यय 4 लाख करोड़ रुपए है।

(2 एल/डीएस पर क्रमशः)

-hms/ds-ysr/3.30/2l

**श्री शान्ता कुमार (क्रमागत):** अगर यह सरकार उस गरीब की झोपड़ी की तरफ देखे तो 10 प्रतिशत की बचत कल सुबह हो सकती है। 40,000 करोड़ रुपये की बचत आप तुरंत कर सकते हैं।

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, 1977 में जब मैं हिमाचल का मुख्य मंत्री बना था और वहाँ के हालात देख कर बचत की कोशिश की थी तो दो वर्षों के अंदर हमने प्रशासन की 50 करोड़ रुपये की बचत की थी। छोटा-सा हिमाचल! उस वक्त बजट बहुत कम था। दाएं-बाएं टेलीफोन कम किये, सरकारी गाड़ियां कम चलानी शुरू की। उस समय मुख्य मंत्री के काफिले में 50-60 गाड़ियां चलती थीं। मैंने कहा कि दो से ज्यादा गाड़ियां नहीं चलेंगी। मुझे पता लगा कि गाड़ियों का सबसे अधिक दुस्प्रयोग होता है। मैंने यह नियम बनाया कि मुख्य मंत्री के साथ केवल दो गाड़ियां चलेंगी। ..(व्यवधान)

**श्री गिरीश कुमार सांगी:** सर, ...(व्यवधान)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Sanghiji, please take your seat.

**श्री स्त्रनारायण पाणि:** सर, ...(व्यवधान)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Panyji, please take your seat. What are you doing? Why do you disturb the Member of your own party?

**श्री शान्ता कुमार:** मैंने यह नियम बनाया कि शनिवार और इतवार को सरकार की कोई गाड़ी सड़क पर नजर नहीं आयेगी। इससे 50 करोड़ रुपये की बचत हुई। यह सरकार बचत क्यों नहीं करती? यह गरीब की ओर क्यों नहीं देखती? मैं समझता हूँ कि सरकार अगर इस किस्म से बचत करने की कोशिश करे तो बहुत बचत की जा सकती है। "नवभारत टाइम्स" के एक तारीख के सम्पादकीय में कहा गया है कि चार लाख टन दालें कोलकाता के बंदरगाह पर नष्ट हो गयीं, बरबाद हो गयीं। यदि यह फिजूलखर्ची रोकी जाए तो बहुत बचत हो सकती है।

मैं आपका ध्यान एक और बात की ओर दिलाना चाहता हूँ। सरकार का जो आर्थिक प्रबंधन है, उस पर अंत में मैं एक बात कहना चाहता हूँ। आर्थिक प्रबंधन ऐसा है कि जब मैं

इस वर्ष के बजट को देख रहा था - मैं लम्बी बात नहीं करता, केवल दो-तीन आंकड़े सदन के सामने रखना चाहता हूँ। इस बार के बजट में उधारों की अदायगी 3 लाख 43 हजार करोड़ रुपये है, इस साल के बजट में ब्याज की अदायगी 2 लाख 25 हजार करोड़ रुपये है और पेंशन की liability 48 हजार करोड़ रुपये है। मैं इससे आगे नहीं बढ़ा। जब मैंने इन तीन आंकड़ों को जोड़ा तो इन तीन आंकड़ों का योग 6 लाख 18 हजार करोड़ बनता है और हमारे देश की शुद्ध इनकम 6 लाख 14 हजार करोड़ है। यह सरकार अपनी आय में से ये तीन मदें भी पूरी नहीं कर सकती। दूसरे शब्दों में, इसका मतलब यह है कि सरकार अपने कर्मचारियों को वेतन देने के लिए एक-एक पैसा उधार लेगी। रक्षा के मामले पर भी उधार लेगी। मुहाज़ पर जो जवान खड़ा है, उसकी बंदूक की गोली खरीदने के लिए भी सरकार को उधार लेना पड़ेगा। ..(समय की घंटी).. तो इस प्रकार का जो प्रबंधन है, मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि यह देश गरीब है। गरीबी की रेखा से नीचे लोग रहते हैं। सरकार का आर्थिक प्रबंधन, सरकार की फिजूलखर्ची और यह जो मनी सप्लाई है, आप 4 लाख करोड़ रुपये उधार लेने वाले हैं! सरकार पर पूरा उधार 28 लाख करोड़ रुपये हो गया है। ये उधार बढ़ते जाएंगे। मनी सप्लाई, फिजूलखर्ची, भ्रष्टाचार, इनके कारण गरीबी और महंगाई बढ़ेगी। मनी सप्लाई केवल भारत में नहीं, अब पाकिस्तान भी नोट छाप कर भारत में भेज रहा है। देश की आर्थिक स्थिति बिल्कुल विकट है। जिस देश में हम अपनी सुरक्षा पर होने वाले खर्च के लिए उधार लेंगे, तनख्वाह देने के लिए उधार लेंगे, यह कैसा आर्थिक प्रबंधन है? महोदय, क्या यह mismanagement नहीं है? क्या यह दिवालियेपन की हालत नहीं है? यह सरकार तो महादिवालियेपन की हालत में पहुँच गयी है। महंगाई एक छोटा-सा लक्षण है। गरीबी एक लक्षण है, गरीब और अमीर के बीच बढ़ती हुई खाई एक लक्षण है। मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि सरकार इस पर गंभीरता से विचार करे। गांव की झोपड़ी में बैठा गरीब महंगाई की मार से बहुत दुखी हो रहा है, इसलिए मेरा यह निवेदन है। इसको सहज भाव से न लें। यह सब जगह बढ़ती है। कभी घटती है, कभी बढ़ती है। ऐसी बात नहीं है। देश का आम गरीब आदमी बहुत परेशान है। सरकार को अपनी आर्थिक नीतियों में आमूल-चूल



परिवर्तन करना होगा, तात्कालिक प्रबंध करने होंगे, महंगाई को रोकना होगा ताकि देश का आम आदमी राहत अनुभव कर सके। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

("2एम" पर आगे)

-DS/VKK/2m/3.35

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Now, Mr. P. Rajeeve. Your party's time is two minutes. But, you take five minutes.

**SHRI P. RAJEEVE (KERALA):** Thank you, Sir, for giving me this opportunity to participate in this discussion. I would not like to repeat the points which have already been raised by other hon. Members. But, I want to add one fundamental point, that is, shortage of foodgrains is not the major reason for the scarcity here. While India has recorded the highest production in foodgrains, the per capita foodgrains availability in this country is less than what it was during the Bengal famine. I would not like to elaborate this point because of shortage of time.

Sir, I would like to focus on my own State, Kerala. Kerala has one of the best public distribution systems in the country. By proper utilisation of this public distribution system, earlier, we had been able to control price rise effectively. But, the situation has changed because of the Central Government's policy. The Central Government is trying to dismantle this public distribution system, firstly, by introducing the targeted public distribution system instead of universal public distribution system and secondly, by introducing the division between APL and BPL. According to the Central Government guidelines, only ten lakh families are under BPL category. So, we are compelled to spend more than Rs.200 crore per annum to give rice to all deserving families through

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

ration shops. So, the Central Government should reconsider its decision on targeted public distribution system and give rice at BPL price to all deserving families in the State of Kerala. The Central Government is also trying to reduce the rice allocation to the State of Kerala. Now, there is a shortage of more than one lakh tonnes of rice. The State Government has been continuously approaching the Minister to give proper allocation to the State of Kerala. How the Government dare to export rice to South Africa and other countries when the people in this country are under starvation and States are continuously crying for proper allocation of rice to feed our own people? How is the Government dare enough to export rice to South Africa? I suspect the Government has some vested interests and they are not looking at the interests of the people of this country. Now, the Government has decided to temporarily ban export of rice. That is good. But, our demand is, proper allocation of rice for BPL and APL families should be considered positively. The public distribution system in Kerala not only includes ration shops but Neethi stores, consumer stores and festival type of *bazaars* are also there in the public distribution system. We also have Neethi medical stores to control the mediflation, that is, reflection of inflation in prices of medicines. So, we, the State, have taken some initiatives to control the prices. The Central Government should have an obligation or duty to give sufficient financial assistance, at least, in the ratio of 50:50 to the State of Kerala.

Sir, now, I come to my last point. All of us are aware that Kerala is a consumer State and geographically, it lies at the south end of the country. So, we have to spend more for the transportation cost. So, whenever the oil price rises, it is directly and severally reflected in the

prices of commodities. (Time-bell) In the answer to the Question No.439 in this Session, the Minister stated that the petroleum PSUs have reported heavy profit after tax. It started from Rs.656 crores to Rs.4,848 crores, as per the answer. So, there is no special reason for this oil price rise. So, I request the Government to reconsider this decision (Time-bell) and take a decision to control prices all over the country. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

(Followed by NB/2n)

NB/2N/3.40

**श्री अवतार सिंह करीमपुरी (उत्तर प्रदेश)** : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, यह price rise के ऊपर जो discussion है, हमारे ऑनरेबल मेंबर्स ने बहुत से सजेशंस और आंकड़े दिए हैं तथा reasons भी बताई हैं, मैं उससे थोड़ा हटकर अपनी बात कहना चाहता हूं। महंगाई कोई इस तरह की प्रॉब्लम नहीं है, जिसका सरकार के पास कोई इलाज न हो। मैं महसूस करता हूं कि महंगाई, सरकार की पैदाइश है। आज हम इसके कारण डिस्कस कर रहे हैं और फिर इसका solution पता नहीं कब सोचेंगे, कब नहीं सोचेंगे। हम यह कहना चाहते हैं कि आज़ादी के 62 साल बीतने के बाद, हमने दो-चार दिन पहले एक फिल्म दिखाई है - "Slumdog Millionaire" और हम उसको भी सेलीब्रेट कर रहे हैं कि हमारी उस फिल्म ने बहुत से इनाम जीते हैं। इस महंगाई के कारण कितने ही लोगों के घर चले गए, जो आज झुग्गियों में रह रहे हैं। पहले तो हमने वातावरण पैदा किया कि 12-14 करोड़ लोग झुग्गियों में रहें और फिर उस झुग्गी की सेलीब्रेशन हमने शुरू की है। हम यह कहना चाहते हैं कि हमारे देश का producer जो है, वह labour को exploit कर रहा है, consumers को भी exploit कर रहा है, क्योंकि producer के लिए हमने कोई ऐसे सख्त नियम नहीं बनाए, जिनके कारण price तय की जा सके। जिसका जो मन चाहता है, वह मनचाही price तय कर लेता है, free hand दे रखा है। महंगाई की जो मूल जड़ है, वह भ्रष्ट लोकतंत्रीय प्रणाली में है। भ्रष्ट लोकतंत्रीय प्रणाली में महंगाई की जड़ है। इलेक्शन के पहले

पेट्रोल और डीजल का रेट कम हो गया था, पता नहीं कैसे हो गया था, इलेक्शन निकल गया, तो वही पेट्रोल और डीजल फिर महंगा हो गया। राज करने वाले पहले भी वही थे, राज करने वाले अब भी वही हैं, पेट्रोल और डीजल की कीमत पहले भी वही थी, बाद में भी वही है। क्या यह जनता के साथ धोखा नहीं है? हम यह कहना चाहते हैं कि उद्योगपतियों से, पूंजीपतियों से चंदा लेकर इलेक्शन लड़ा जाता है और इलेक्शन में पानी की तरह पैसा बहाया जाता है। जब हम नॉमिनेशन पेपर्स भरते हैं, तो उसके साथ सुप्रीम कोर्ट की जजमेंट लगी होती है, उसमें सुप्रीम कोर्ट ऑफ इंडिया ने यह दर्ज कर रखा है कि millions of money इलेक्शन में लगाया जाता है और billions of money रिकवर किया जाता है।

20/VNK पर क्रमशः

-NB/VNK-VK/20/3.45

**श्री अवतार सिंह करीमपुरी (क्रमागत) :** हम यह कहते हैं कि यह उद्योगपतियों और political लोगों का जो गठजोड़ है, जिसके सामने हमारी पोलिटिकल पावर बेबस है, surrendered है, जिसके कारण महंगाई आसमान तक पहुंच गई है। आज गरीब लोग खाली पेट सोने को मजबूर हैं। चूंकि अभी बता दिया गया है, इसलिए मैं उसको repeat नहीं करना चाहता हूँ कि आज दालों के रेट क्या हैं और सब्जियों के रेट क्या हैं। शिक्षा सरकार की जिम्मेदारी है। हमारे संविधान के नीति निदेशक सिद्धांत में शिक्षा और हेल्थ की बात दर्ज है, लेकिन हम हेल्थ में क्या जिम्मेवारी निभा रहे हैं? आज कोई कैंसर का मरीज हो, तो वह इलाज नहीं करवा सकता। आज हर chronic बीमारी के लिए मेडीसीन का रेट इतना ज्यादा हो गया है कि लोग इलाज नहीं होने के कारण, दवाई नहीं लेने के कारण मर रहे हैं। आज विद्या व्यापार हो गई है। जो गरीब है, उसका बच्चा विद्या हासिल नहीं कर सकता है। ...(समय की घंटी)... पेट की भूख मिटानी है, हेल्थ को देखना है, शिक्षा को देखना है ...(समय की घंटी)...

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जी. कुरियन) :** कृपया आप समाप्त कीजिए।

**श्री अवतार सिंह करीमपुरी :** महोदय, हमारी सरकार ने compulsory education का बिल भी पास किया है। बिल की हमारे पास कोई कमी नहीं है। अगर बिल को implement करने की will power भी आ जाए, तो हमारे पास समाधान हो सकता है, इसलिए मैं कहना

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

चाहता हूँ कि सरकार को इस पर जरूर सोचना चाहिए कि सरकार ने उद्योगपतियों के सामने जो surrender किया है, सरकार उस नीति को बदले। सरकार बकायदा दाम तय करने की नीति तय करे ताकि consumer और लेबर को उद्योगपति, Producer, आदि जो exploit कर रहा है, उस पर लगाम लगाया जा सके और देश के अंदर भुखमरी और मंहगाई के कारण जो वातावरण पैदा हुआ है, उसको कंट्रोल किया जा सके। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (TAMIL NADU):** Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, we are, once again, discussing a very important issue that is bothering the minds....

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Mr. Siva, you have five minutes. Actually, in the 'Others' category, there are 10 speakers. I want to allow everyone. But the total time is 23 minutes. I am giving five minutes each so that everyone can speak; otherwise, we will have to cut some names.

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, I have always cooperated with the Chair.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** If you cooperate, more people can speak. That is my point.

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, we are, once again, discussing a very important issue that is bothering the mind and day-to-day life of the common man whose misery is also soaring high along with the prices. I do not want to repeat what my colleagues have said earlier. I think the basic intention of this discussion is that the views and suggestions expressed by the Members may help the Minister to pull down the prices faster and in a better manner. Last year also, there was a price rise. We had a discussion here, like many other years, as Shri Venkaiah Naidu pointed out. The Government took certain measures to combat

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

inflation, including the ban on export of some commodities like rice and wheat, while allowing duty free imports. The Government had set a minimum import target for the public sector units and had also offered to subsidise some commodities distributed by the State Governments through the Public Distribution System. I do not know what is the outcome. The Minister may, in his reply, tell us as to what are the results we have derived out of that. This year also, the Government has taken some measures. When a question was put last month, the reply which was received was the same which Shri Mysura Reddy received yesterday.

(Contd. by 2P)

RG/3.50/2P

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (contd.):** And we don't expect the Ministry to change its strategy every month or every day. So, sticking to that, I would like to seek just three clarifications from the hon. Minister, whose reply, I think, will enlighten the House as well as the people outside. The inflation level on food items could go up in the coming months due to both demand and supply factors. Sir, the agricultural production, this year, could be adversely affected due to poor monsoons, which have resulted in droughts and floods in different parts of the country. On the other hand, with the increase in the availability of money, for obvious reasons, like, the implementation of the Pay Commission recommendations, NREGA and the other Government schemes, the demand would drive up the need for essential commodities. Sir, also, the Reserve Bank, in its Monetary Review Policy on 28<sup>th</sup> July, has indicated that it also expects a rise in prices at the end of the financial

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

year even though there are no supply shortages. I would like to know what the policy of the Government is in handling this potential increase in prices. The second thing is that there is a variation between the inflation based on the Wholesale Price Index and that based on the Consumer Price Index. This means that though the Government reports a decrease in inflation based on WPI, the Consumer Price Index shows a continued increase in prices of goods relevant to consumers. The main reason for this is that the basket of goods, used to compute these indices, varies. There are 435 goods in the WPI and 260 in the CPI. At the same time, essential commodities, such as food items, have a higher weightage in the CPI, and it also includes housing, education and transport, which are not included in the WPI. Sir, I would like to quote one thing. "The Consumer Price Indices, for industrial workers and agricultural labourers, taken with all their weaknesses, show a picture of inflation entirely different from that shown by the WPI. Far from stretching to zero or negative levels, the annual rate of inflation, measured by the Consumer Price Index, has been averaging just under 10 per cent for industrial workers and over 10 per cent for agricultural workers over the last six months of published data. Inflation in food prices significantly affects a much wider section of the population than industrial workers and agricultural labourers. The poorer the family is, the higher is the proportion of Budget on food and greater is the impact." I would like to know from the hon. Minister as to whether there is any plan to use the CPI as the main policy indicator rather than the WPI. Thirdly, the Government reports inflation on a year-on-year basis. This means that it compares the present level of the WPI with

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

the one prevailed around the same time of the last year, and announces a difference in percentage. This differs from the best global practices. Most countries report inflation as a change from the previous month, adjusted to, by seasonal fluctuations. Does the Government have any plan to bring in such a system? Sir, this is the federal structure, where the State Governments have a share of the Centre's in everything. We give agricultural loans to farmers at the rate of four per cent, as Dr. M.S. Swaminathan has suggested to the Central Government. We expect that the Central Government would also implement that in order to save the agriculturists as well as the agricultural workers, and thus help in bringing the prices down.

(Ends)

(Followed by 2Q)

2q/3.55/ks

**SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS (ASSAM):** Sir, retail inflation based on the consumer price index for agricultural labourers and rural labourers has already reversed the declining trend and gone up from 9.09 per cent in April, 2009 to 10.21 per cent in May. These are food-heavy indices that underscore the relentless rise in prices of food articles.

As increase in the retail price of petrol and diesel takes place, the retail inflation also starts rising. Again, poor monsoons bring more pressure on prices of food articles like dals and vegetables. Prices of basic vegetables like potato, onions, tomato, etc. have shot up. People are paying double the price now. What is worse is, local vendors are taking advantage of the situation and refusing to reduce the prices. The Government attitude towards such a situation is very casual.



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

The total pulses production of 14.9 MT in 2007-08 fell to 13 MT in the year 2008-09. Prices of black gram, pigeon peas, yellow gram and chana dal shot up by almost 20 to 50 per cent overnight. International prices of pulses are high and the dollar is now strong against the rupee. That is why private traders are not importing pulses. Therefore, my suggestion is that the Government should on its own import pulses to control the spiralling prices. On top of this, wholesale traders are hoarding stocks in order to make profits later. The Government is silent. I want to know whether any action has been taken by the Government against such traders so far. The State Food and Civil Supplies Department should also wake up from its slumber and devise an effective monitoring mechanism to keep a watch on prices of essential commodities and look into traders' justifications for effecting any hike. There is lack of coordination between State Governments and the Central Government in taking any such effective steps. Government should revamp the PDS that has been in the doldrums and that is beset with widespread corruption. The Government should establish a mechanism to check such arbitrary and unreasonable price increases. It is the failure of the Government and the administration of not having any control on the market. I want to know whether the authorities have ever put to test the claims of the trading community vis-a-vis prices at source and the rates of increase in prices. The Government authorities have totally surrendered before the traders' lobby.

Sir, we, the people of Assam, are facing grave problems; we face great disparity. As you know, Sir, the people of Assam are facing a serious law and order situation. There is a perennial flood problem. But

now, people are facing drought in every district of the State. The hike in prices of essential commodities is causing great despair to the *aam admi* in the State. The Government should take immediate and effective steps to curb rise in the prices of essential commodities. It is urged upon the Government to provide dal and edible oil at subsidised rates through the public distribution system and to restore Above Poverty Line (APL) categories as an interim measure towards universalisation of the Public Distribution System (PDS).

(Ends)

**सरदार तरलोचन सिंह (हरियाणा):** शुक्रिया, सर। हम यहां पर price rise की बात कर रहे हैं, लेकिन एक बात हम सब भूल जाते हैं कि आबादी स्पीड से बढ़ रही है। उसके संबंध में कोई कुछ कहने के लिए तैयार नहीं है। हर रोज़ हम बात करते हैं कि इतने करोड़ new mouths added, लेकिन कोई पॉलिटिकल पार्टी यह कहने के लिए तैयार नहीं है कि population की तरफ भी देखो। जब population इतनी ज्यादा increase हो रही है, तो फिर price rise को आप welcome करिए क्योंकि खाने वाले बढ़ते जा रहे हैं और production उतनी ही है। दूसरा, बात बड़ी क्लीयर है कि जिसने produce देना है, वह कौन है? वह farmer है। जिस चीज़ की आप बात कर रहे हैं, सिवाय ईंटे, सीमेंट और लोहे को छोड़कर, बाकी सबमें फॉर्मर involved हैं। मुझे खुशी है कि आज जो Minister of Agriculture हैं, वे खुद एक farmer हैं। बेसिक बात को समझिए कि आप farmer को जो दे रहे हैं, वह short measures हैं कि कभी थोड़ा सा यह दे दिया, कभी थोड़ा सा वह दे दिया। एक बार आपने loan waiver दिया है, लेकिन उसमें क्या discrimination है कि जो सबसे अच्छा farmer है, उसको नहीं मिलेगा। वहां पर भी वही पॉलिसी है कि गरीब को पहले मिलेगा। भाइयो, एक बात समझिए कि जिस farmer ने लोन वापस दिया, उसको कोई क्रेडिट नहीं है। जो नहीं देता, उसे कहते हैं कि तुम्हें हम देते हैं।

(2आर-एमसीएम पर क्रमागत)

MCM-TDB/2R/4.00

**सरदार तरलोचन सिंह** (क्रमागत) : सवाल यह है कि जो अच्छा फार्मर है, एफिसिएंट है उसको आप इंसेंटिव दो, उसको कहो कि तुमको डबल इंसेंटिव मिलेगा, लेकिन उसको तो कहते हैं कि तुम्हें कुछ नहीं मिलेगा और यही हुआ है कि जो आपने फार्मर स्कीम दी है, इसमें जो सफरर है वह पंजाब और हरियाणा है। हमें पंजाब में तो सिर्फ 1.5 परसेंट बेनिफिट मिला है और हरियाणा में दो परसेंट मिला है। हमारे फार्मर को तो बेनिफिट मिला ही नहीं, क्योंकि हमारा फार्मर अपना लोन वापिस करता था। इसलिए जो लोन वापिस करता था अब वह घर में बैठो। जब आप इंसेंटिव नहीं देंगे तो फार्मर से एक्सपेक्ट क्या करेंगे? मेरी दूसरी बात यह है कि फार्मर को आप हमेशा के लिए लोन की प्रोब्लम से फ्री कीजिए। सर, एक कंप्यूजन और है कि जो इन्होंने नई कमेटी बनाई है, जो फार्मर मनी लेंडर से पैसे लेता है, उसके बारे में ही करेंगे। I have written to the Union Finance Minister also. उसमें एक क्लॉज है महाराष्ट्र की। अब हमें सिर्फ यह लग रहा है कि यह स्कीम सिर्फ महाराष्ट्र के लिए है, बाकी स्टेट्स के फार्मर्स के लिए नहीं है। इस तरह हमें कंप्यूजन है कि वह जो स्कीम दे रहे हैं सिर्फ एक स्टेट के लिए है। If it is for all-India, then, please announce it. ताकि अन्य को पता चले कि they will also be free from the yoke of moneylenders. मिनिस्टर साहब, फार्मर्स के लिए ऐसी बात करिए जिससे उनका लोन चार परसेंट हो। इसके अलावा उनको जो बीज वगैरह की सब्सिडी दे रहो हो, उसको बढ़ाइए। अगर फार्मर हमेशा के लिए इन चीजों से फ्री होगा तो डबल प्रोडक्शन करेगा। इन सारी प्रोब्लम्स का हल फार्मर्स की सेटिस्फेक्शन है और फार्मर्स को आप क्या देते हैं?

Sir, my next issue is wastage of food. अब इसके क्या हाल हैं, मिनिस्टर साहब को पता है। पंजाब और हरियाणा में पिछले साल की प्रोडक्शन आज भी पड़ी हुई है। आपने उसको रिमूव नहीं किया है, इसलिए कि स्टोरेज केपेसिटी कम है, रेलवे ट्रेन की, वैगन की अवेलेबिलिटी कम है। जो स्टेट व्हीट और राइस प्रोड्यूस करती है और यह जिन स्टेट्स को जाना है, वहां उन स्टेट्स में स्टोरेज केपेसिटी नहीं है इसलिए मूवमेंट भी नहीं है। वेस्टेज की फिगर्स मिनिस्टर साहब को पता है। अगर वह वेस्टेज खत्म हो जाए तो

शोर्टेज है ही नहीं तथा प्राइस राइज होगा ही नहीं। There should be more storage capacity, and movement of foodgrains which are still lying there, और उसको कई जगह चूहे खा रहे हैं, अन्य जगह गनीबैग्स फट गए हैं, बारिश से परेशानी हो रही है। इसलिए भी आप मूव नहीं करते। हरियाणा और पंजाब की सरकारें आपको लिख रही हैं -प्लीज मूव करिए क्योंकि नई फसल आ गई है उसका क्या करें?

सर, थर्ड आइटम मिल्क के बारे में है। मिल्क की प्रोब्लम क्या है। यह सबसे बड़ी स्कीम है जो इंडिया में कामयाब हो सकती है। If every farmer, irrespective of हमारा क्या है, यह तो बी0पी0एल0 को जाएगी। जो अब स्कीम आ रही है वह बिलो पावर्टी लाइन के लिए है। जो एबव पावर्टी लाइन हैं, तो वह कहां जाएं, उनको आप क्या देते हो? कोई इंसेंटिव देते हो? अब हर रोज यह नया नारा है -वोट बैंक की बी0पी0एल0 लाइन। अगर मिल्क प्रोड्यूस करना है, तो जिसकी केपेसिटी है उसको लोन दो, ताकि और कैटल रखे और पैदा करे। जिनको देते हो वहां तो कहीं पैसा मिस-यूज हो जाता है। अगर स्कीम चलानी है तो इसमें आप वह देखो who is efficient, who can do it. -----(घंटी) सर, बस एक मिनट लूंगा। मंत्रालय की एक फिगर छपी है, जिसमें यह लिखा है कि जो प्राइस राइज है, वह डिफ्रेंट स्टेट्स में डिफ्रेंट है और यह इनकी अपनी फिगर्स हैं। इसमें लिखा है कि चेन्नई में दाल की प्राइस 97 परसेंट बढ़ी हैं, बाकी अन्य देशों में बहुत कम है। इसी तरह ऑनियन की प्राइस है। कोलकाता में पोटेटो की प्राइस 200 परसेंट इंक्रीज हुई है। There is a disparity between different cities. Who is responsible for it? The Government is responsible for it. इसी वजह से मूवमेंट नहीं होने के कारण से चेन्नई में और, कोलकाता में और, दिल्ली में और तथा मुम्बई में और प्राइस हैं। इसलिए आप मूवमेंट कीजिए। आप कहते हैं कि डेली ट्रेन चल रही हैं, तो ट्रेन इस काम के लिए भी चलाई जाएं, जो हर जगह इसको ले जाए। थैंक्यू।

(समाप्त)

(2s/GS पर आगे)

kgg/2s/4.05

**THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE):** Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, as the discussion on inflation and price rise is being debated, I did not have the privilege of listening to the Members directly sitting here, but I had the opportunity of listening to some of the observations made by the hon. Members, sitting in my room in Parliament House, and also from the notes which we have received. Various aspects have been raised by the hon. Members. I would like to deal with some of the issues in general terms. The detailed reply would be given by my distinguished colleague in the Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Consumer Affairs.

Sir, first of all, I would like to refer to the point, as has been pointed out by several Members, that inflation is because of the bad management of economy. Yes, it is our responsibility to manage the economy in such a manner so that the supply and demand management have some equilibrium and if that equilibrium is lost, naturally, it would adversely affect.

The second question that has to be kept in view while participating and trying to analyse the reasons for the price rise is that the entire situation does not depend on the domestic management policy. There is also a global factor. We may like it or we may not like it, but no economy in the world, today, is insulated from the external influence and that external influence also causes inflation or deflation in the economy.

The third factor is the seasonal factor; our economy is dependant, to a considerable extent, on the monsoon; particularly the agricultural

economy on the seasonal factor; and, it is not unusual that every year, at a particular point of time, we find that there is a tendency of the enhancement of prices in certain groups of commodities; these are usually being described by the economists as 'seasonal factors'.

The fourth aspect which has to be looked into is how to insulate the vulnerable sections of the society from the adverse impact of rising prices because they are the worst hit. No doubt, certain policies lead to inflation; or, there are certain Government policies and programmes which have the inflationary trend. Take the case of minimum support price mechanism. If we want to give a remunerative price to the farmers, which is absolutely essential to encourage them to produce more, to meet the requirements of the growing population, there is no carpet under which you can keep the impact of it. What best you can do is, you can insulate the vulnerable sections of the society by providing subsidies through a certain mechanism. And the mechanism which is prevailing here in this country is the Public Distribution System. If through the effective Public Distribution System, channelising the subsidies which are being provided to the targeted group, is effectively implemented, to that extent, we can achieve success in insulating a section of the society from the adverse impact of rising prices.

Now, as per the present practice,--I am not going into the merits--economists may give their views and theories; I am not going into that aspect of it; surely, that can be discussed. The current practice which is being followed in this country is---it is our Government, it is their Government, the practice is in vogue over the decades. All India averages of the wholesale prices and retail prices of 16 items are being

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

monitored by the Department of Consumer Affairs, and from there we arrive at the decisions about the price index. So far as the WPI is concerned, it is vetted; averages of 435 commodities traded in the wholesale market are classified in three categories.

(Contd. by kls/2t)

KLS/2T-4.10

**SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (CONTD):** Each classification has each group as a weightage. Primary articles have the weightage of 24.02 per cent. The second category is fuel, power and light. They have weightage of 14.23 per cent. Third category is the manufactured items, which has a weightage of 63.75 per cent. All these taken together come to 100 per cent distributed in three categories of commodities, primary commodities, primary articles, fuel, power, light and manufactured items. Always there is a point, which has been raised, as to why there is serious divergence between the Wholesale Price Index and the Consumer Price Index. The question is very legitimate and the answers are also being given because the weightage is different. The type of weightages, which you have in the Consumer Price Index and the type of weightage of the commodities, which you have in the Wholesale Price Index, are completely different. For example, in the Wholesale Price Index, sometimes you take the food items; the weightage of the food articles in the Wholesale Price Index is 25 per cent. The total weightage of the primary articles, as I have mentioned, is 22.02 per cent and of that if you take it as 100, the food items will be 25 per cent. There are four categories of the Consumer Price Index. There is Consumer Price Index for the industrial workers, there is Consumer Price Index for the

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

urban non-manual employees, there is Consumer Price Index for the agricultural labour, and there is Consumer Price Index for the rural labour. For historical reasons, these four Consumer Prices Indices are being maintained over the years. Now, I am giving the example of the food items. The weightage in the WPI is 24.4 per cent, for the industrial workers the weightage is 46.2 per cent and for urban non-manual employees, it is 47.1 per cent, Consumer Price Index for the agricultural labourer is 66.8 per cent and Consumer Price Index for the rural labour is 69.2 per cent. Therefore, if you go item-wise, you will find that the large variation in the weightage is there and that is why you will find that always there is convergence. But earlier our experiences had been that the convergences would have emerged after the divergence parallel lines moving for quite some time, at some point of time there has been convergence. But recently, we are noticing that convergence point is being delayed and this is an area of concern, which ought to be looked into. Therefore, these aspects are engaging our attention and we are taking care of it. The second question comes and which has been legitimately demanded and also is being debated now is that why we are maintaining two sets of indices and whether we can have one set of Indices. So far as WPI is concerned, it is mainly for the traders who have been trading in the wholesale market. The question is legitimately addressed whether there is need of four sets of Consumer Prices Indices. In fact, this issue was addressed by the CSO out of these four series. The CSO maintains one series, that is, for the urban non-manual employees. But for rural labour, agricultural labour, and industrial



workers, these Indices are being maintained by the Labour Bureau not by the CSO.

(Contd by 2U)

SSS/2U/4.15

**SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (CONTD.):** But CSO was asked whether a mechanism could be evolved through which instead of having four series of indices, we could have only one. They found it extremely difficult but still they are working on it. And the Central Statistical Organisation has asked them to look into that aspect. I understand that some discussions are still going on at the expert's level, and they are trying to emerge. The second aspect which was thought of, was: what are the steps which you are going to converge into one set of index? And what is the international practice? We have found that a large number of countries have only one set of index, particularly the developed countries; that is Consumer Price Index. But, obviously, you will recognise, Sir, and the hon. Members who are knowledgeable will also recognise that the variations of development in our society are so divergent that one set of consumer price index will not meet the requirement of the entire community or a big chunk of the community. Whatever indices you try to attain, you will find, as I mentioned, that in two important segments, food item is having the weightage of 66 and 68 per cent in respect of the agricultural labour, in respect of the rural labour. Therefore, you cannot simply ignore these aspects. So, variations would be there. Now, if the variations are there, and if, at least we maintain the WPI and CPI, efforts are being made, as I mentioned earlier, to look into whether, instead of having four CPI; we could have one CPI. The second aspect

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

about the food management, as I was saying, is that there are certain policies. Here, what would you do? We cannot go back and say, 'farmers will not get back the prices', every year. If you make a comparison, you will find that we have enhanced the procurement price of wheat by almost Rs. 350, per quintal, and paddy price, by Rs. 300, per quintal, over a period of five years. But, the demand is much more. Farmers are demanding more, and farmers are to be provided and given remunerative prices so that they produce more. No country of the world can feed 115 plus crore people. Nobody can feed. India will have to be self-sufficient in food production, in meeting its own requirements. Then a question comes: Are we taking adequate steps? Are we doing enough for the agricultural development? Of course, the answer will be given by the Minister in-charge of Agriculture, Consumer Affairs and Food. Only one point I would like to emphasise is that during the Eleventh Plan, this aspect has been recognised. There is no denial to the fact and it is not passing on the buck to this Government or to that Government. Over the period of the last 10 to 15 years, as the public expenditure in the agriculture sector was not substantially high, we had to pay a very heavy price because the agricultural growth has retarded. It has not matched the requirement and the component in the GDP. Of course, in a developed economy, primary commodities contribution of agriculture will have to be reduced and the other sectors like service sectors, manufactured items, industry, will have to take a more and more higher place but agriculture has a place. That is why it was recognised that, at least, at the level of four per cent, if for a longer period, we do not maintain the sustained development of agriculture in

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

real terms around four per cent plus, then it will be difficult to have the balanced growth, which has the objective of 'inclusive growth', through which every strata of the society can get benefit out of it.

(Contd. by NBR/2W)

-SSS/NBR-AKG/4.20/2W.

**SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (CONTD.):** I now come to the questions that have been raised by some hon. Members in respect of what you are going to do if you cannot control inflation. Everybody recognises that we depend on external sources for our fuel requirements. Nearly, 3/4<sup>th</sup> of our total fossil fuel requirements are coming from the external sources. We do not have the control over it. It has been calculated, at the present level of indigenous production and if the present level of consumption fossil fuels and hydrocarbons continue at this rate, at the end of the Eleventh Plan and during the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan, the requirement would be almost 90 per cent. Today, it is 72-75 per cent. But, after sometime, it would be around 90 per cent. Therefore, we are exploring the possibilities of alternate sources of energy where our dependence on the external sources of energy could be reduced to that extent. Various measures are being taken. But, that is outside the purview of the current discussion.

Sir, the short point to which I am trying to drive at is, these are the factors which are contributing. Now, to remove distortions in the demand and supply mechanism, we are taking steps. Hon. Members will recollect, during this period or a little earlier of the previous year, the rate of inflation was so high that the Government had to resort to a tight

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

monetary policy. Too much money chasing too few goods is the normal traditional example which the economists give to explain the inflationary impact. The Government had to resort to tight monetary policy. The liquidity in the market was reduced and after that the impact of the global recession and the series of other steps which we had to take had its adverse impact. Today, if the WPI is negative, it is not so much depending on the policy formulations of the Government. The substantial difference which takes place in the case of one item -- I can give many examples -- is oil price. The oil price, in August, 2008, has reached as high as US \$ 147 per barrel. It came down to almost US \$ 40-45 dollars per barrel or US \$ 50 barrel in the month of last May/June, 2009. Again, it has started moving up and reached to around US \$ 68-70 per barrel. It is varying. It is uncertain. Nobody can predict at what point of time it will again shoot up. One of the major reasons is there is international recession. Industrialised countries are not going to consume more oil. I expected that the oil prices should have further depressed. But, there is an apprehension that even though there is a demand, but, as there is strong dollar and the possessors of the dollar are converting their dollar into some sort of commodities -- of course, this is a speculation of the economists; it may be true or it may not be true, but, there is some suspicion -- as a result of which, certain commodity prices are stepping up.

Another important factor in the rise of prices was last year's totally unbridled rise in the prices of certain essential commodities, including food items. Now-a-days, the world is too small. Everybody knows everything. The total global production is known to the villagers living in

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

remote corners of India. Sir, be it agricultural production or industrial production or whether it is the trend of the GDP in different countries, advanced countries, developing countries or least developed countries, all this information is readily available and depending on such information, they take their own decisions. There is no way you can insulate that this type of information will be not available and action, arising out of information, cannot be prevented. But, still, what could be done in a given situation, we are doing it. For example, we have taken a series of measures to insulate the adverse impact of inflation on the common man.

(CONTD. BY PK "2X")

**PK/2X/4.25**

**SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (CONTD.):** The first thing that we had decided for maintaining the equilibrium in the prices of primary articles, particularly, the foodgrains was this. A ban was imposed on the export of foodgrains. Import was allowed liberally including that of sugar. Sometimes, it caused a real embarrassing situation; I will give you another example. Last time, because of the shortage of edible oil, we had decided to import about a million tonnes of edible oil, and a few hundred thousand tons were earmarked to be distributed at one kg per ration cardholder, with a subsidy of Rs.15/- per kg. The States were asked to lift this quantum of edible oil and to distribute it through their Public Distribution System. But hardly any State Government took it, and we had to pay a very heavy dose of subsidy. After all, money is coming from the people. Therefore, supply management, demand management, making availability of goods in short supply through

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

imports, etc. --all these steps are being taken in a timely manner. As and when these steps were taken, it had some impact on the prices.

Now, there is another question which has been raised more than often is: -- the Minister of Agriculture will reply it in detail; I will just like to touch upon it -- why cannot you have the legal measures against the hoarders, profiteers and black marketeers? At one point of time, this power was taken by the Centre, but, in 2006, we decided that the power should be vested in the State Governments. They are in a better position to assess the situation and also to take appropriate steps and it has been given to them. Therefore, they can take it. The two aspects which, in cooperation of the State Governments and their effective handling, are, absolutely, called for are as follows. One is the effective public distribution mechanism and the second is de-hoarding, or these types of malpractices which are taking place. There are certain issues which have been raised about banning the Forward Contracts. When it was found that the prices of certain items, particularly, on a speculation basis, were being raised, the ban order was issued by the Ministry of Consumer Affairs. Therefore, all these steps are being taken as and when the situation demands it. It is not that the situation remains static. A question was raised, because of the bad management, economy is not growing. Economy is growing. Economy has grown. For the full five years, we attained an 8.6 per cent GDP growth. Because of bad management, it was not possible. Knowledgeable Members of this House are fully aware of that. So far as GDP is concerned, we have a long-chequered history. In 1951, we began our developmental planning. From 1951-1979, our GDP growth was 3.5 per

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

cent. In the 80's, it was five per cent. In the 90's, it was 6.5 per cent average. Thereafter, we reached a growth syndrome of 8.6 per cent in the previous five years. This year, it has been less, that is, in 2008-09, it is 6.7 per cent, because of an international crisis, a global phenomenon. And, because of that, we had to inject Rs.10,086,000/- liquidity into the system, which did not get immediately converted into production. That also has an impact on the overall monetary expansion system. So, you will have to do the management to strike a balance. Sometimes, you will have to tighten it; sometimes, you will have to loosen it. As and when the economy demands, you will have to do it.

(Contd. by 2Y/PB)

PB-PSV/2y/4.50

**SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (CONTD.):** This time, the vegetable prices, the milk prices and the prices of a lot of other articles have been increased because the monsoon is erratic, which is causing concern to all of us. It has its symptomatic impact on certain other essential areas also.

All these aspects will have to be handled. We are sensitive to it. I fully appreciate the concerns of hon. Members who represent the various cross-sections of the people. The ultimate interest of everyone of us is to see how we can ameliorate the sufferings and difficulties suffered by our fellow citizens through appropriate policy means. So, through you, Sir, I can assure the hon. Members that the Government is responsible, the Government is responsive; as and when the appropriate policy measures are needed, it will be taken. Thank you, Sir, for giving me this opportunity.

(Ends)

**श्री शान्ता कुमार:** सर, मुझे consumer price index के बारे में एक बात कहनी है।  
...(व्यवधान)...

**SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE:** The reply will be given by him; I was just intervening.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** It was just an intervention.

**श्री शान्ता कुमार:** क्योंकि इन्होंने जवाब दिया है कि ...(व्यवधान)... Just one minute.  
...(Interruptions)... One minute, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** I will give you time before the Agriculture Minister replies, because the final reply will be given by the Agriculture Minister. That is only an intervention. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI VIKRAM VERMA:** Sir, about the inflation rate, I think, the Finance Minister can explain very well.

**SHRI SHANTA KUMAR:** Just one minute, Sir. एक बात तो यह है कि consumer price index ज्यादा realistic है। दूसरी यह कि दुनिया के 157 देश consumer price index का उपयोग करते हैं और केवल 24 देश whole-sale price index का उपयोग करते हैं। तीसरी बात यह कि आप consumer price index 4 वर्गों का अलग-अलग निकालते हैं, uniform नहीं निकालते। इस देश के हालात का विचार करते हुए अगर आप BPL के 26 करोड़ लोगों का consumer price index अलग से निकालेंगे ...(समय की घंटी)... तो वह ज्यादा realistic होगा। क्या सरकार इस पर विचार करेगी?

**SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE:** I have answered it. In my reply, I said that I have appointed a Committee.; the CSO is looking into it to see whether these four sets of consumer price indices could be converged into one Consumer Price Index, the CPI. I have already replied to that. Sir, 24 countries are still having the WPI. Please remember, except



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

China, there is no other country where so many people are there, so many divergent economic conditions are prevailing, which do not get reflected in only one series of indices of the consumer price index. We shall have to be practical. Therefore, so far as CPI is concerned, we are trying to converge four into one, and so far as WPI is concerned, the wholesale traders' practices, will also continue parallel. There are no two opinions on it.

**SHRI BHARATKUMAR RAUT (MAHARASHTRA):** Sir, I heard the hon. Finance Minister's speech with great care. He has given a macro level explanation of what happened. Though his explanation is perhaps correct, but, I am afraid, this type of macro-level thinking does not satisfy the last-level consumer, the person in the village, and doesn't help the poor housewife who has to meet the ends at home. Sir, I was surprised when I heard hon. Tarlochan Singh saying that all the loan waiver schemes are aimed at providing relief to only Maharashtra. Dr. Waghmare is sitting next to him. I suggest you to talk to him. In Marathwada, is the poor and the real farmer being helped by this scheme? Has his loan been waived or is it just a slogan that the Government has given? ...(Interruptions)...

**SARDAR TARLOCHAN SINGH:** Sir, I want that the Scheme should be for the whole of India. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI BHARATKUMAR RAUT:** I understand what you are saying. On the one hand, the farmer is left at the mercy of God, and, on the other hand, the consumer is annoyed and dissatisfied.

(Contd. by 2z/SKC)

2z/4.35/skc-hms

**SHRI BHARATKUMAR RAUT (Contd.):** Mr. Minister, you are sitting on a volcano of anger. The consumers in rural areas and the consumers in urban areas are dissatisfied; they are angry. Last week only, housewives in Mumbai came out on the streets protesting against the price rise. What does that indicate? It only shows that people in Maharashtra in particular and the nation in general are angry with you. If you don't take action now, this volcano would erupt and it will take its toll on the Government.

Sir, everybody has talked about the rise in prices of essential commodities, foodgrains, pulses, etc. There are many reasons which the Government can cite; it may say that the prices rose because of drought and because of some other reasons. I am bringing something else to your notice: There are domestic consumption items such as toothpaste, powder, toothbrush, OTC medicines etc. They have nothing to do with rains. They are not produced in the farms. I would request all of you to go home and check the label on the toothpaste pack in your house. There is an MRP printed on that. That MRP has been crossed and a new MRP has been stamped. Why is that so? Why is there a price hike in these items which have nothing to do with rains? This does not have anything to do with global meltdown. It has nothing to do with crude oil prices. Why should these prices be raised? There is a racket going on among the distributors and the retail vendors. Where is the extra margin going? Who is consuming that? Where is that extra money going? That money is not in thousands or lakhs; it is in crores. It is a State-wide and nation-wide phenomenon. These FMCGs are sold from house to house

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

and the cream is enjoyed by somebody else. It is the responsibility of the Government, the Minister, to see where this money is perforating. Where is the seepage? Who is eating away this money? Only then the consumers at large would be satisfied.

Sir, I have one more point to make. It is the responsibility of the Government to ensure that the public distribution system is further strengthened and these items are sold at fair-price shops. Only then the last consumer would get some respite from price rise.

Sir, I would like to again tell you that people's anger is on the rise. People are angry and dissatisfied. If this anger is allowed to rise further, we would be inviting anarchy. We have to save this country from this anarchy. Therefore, price rise has to be curbed and it is the responsibility of the Government to ensure that.

(Ends)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Shrimati Kusum Rai.

**श्री राजनीति प्रसाद:** सर, मेरा पॉइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है। When the hon. Minister has replied in detail, what is the use of arguing on the same things? What is the use? (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please, take your seat. It is no point of order. It is the hon. Member's maiden speech. Please, do not disturb.

**श्री राम नारायण साहू:** बहुत-बहुत बधाई।

**श्रीमती कुसुम राय (उत्तर प्रदेश):** सर, आप का आभार व्यक्त करती हूं और धन्यवाद देती हूं कि आप ने मुझे बोलने का अवसर दिया। इस अवसर पर मैं अपने सभी सम्मानित सदस्यों का सहयोग भी चाहूंगी, अपनी पार्टी के लीडर्स का भी सहयोग चाहूंगी।

महोदय, अभी हमारे नेता आदरणीय शान्ता कुमार जी ने अर्थ-व्यवस्था को यहां बड़े अच्छे तरीके से रखा है।

(3 ए/डीएस पर क्रमशः)

-hms/ds-ksk/3a/4.40

**श्रीमती कुसुम राय (क्रमागत):** उन सभी आंकड़ों से मैं अपने को संबद्ध करती हूँ, क्योंकि उन आंकड़ों को मैं दोहराना नहीं चाहती। आज जब मैं बोल रही हूँ तो एक गृहिणी के नाते भी बोल रही हूँ। जिस तरह से महंगाई बढ़ी है और जिस तरह से आज घरेलू महिलाएं परेशान हैं, पहले तो यह होता था कि अरहर की दाल महंगी है तो हम मसूर या मूंग को विकल्प के रूप में बना लेते थे, लेकिन आज ऐसी स्थिति हो गई है कि मसूर का दाम भी आसमान छू रहा है और मूंग का दाम भी आसमान छू रहा है। गरीबी की रेखा से नीचे जीने वाले लोग यह सोचने के लिए मजबूर हो रहे हैं, वे सुबह से शाम तक यह सोचते रहते हैं कि आज हम क्या खाना बनायें और कम बजट में अपने परिवार को हम कैसे पाल सकें? हमारे सभी सदस्यों ने बहुत आंकड़ों के साथ इस विषय पर बोला है। मैं आपके माध्यम से कृषि मंत्री जी और सरकार से यह कहना चाहूँगी कि जिस तरह से आवश्यक उपभोक्ता वस्तुओं के फुटकर भाव बढ़े हैं। अरहर की दाल महंगी होने पर आम आदमी मूंग, मसूर और चने की दाल के तौर पर उसका विकल्प ढूँढ़ लेगा, पर आलू, प्याज जैसी सब्जियों का क्या विकल्प है? वर्ष 2004 के मुकाबले गेहूँ के बाजार भाव में 60 प्रतिशत, चावल-दाल के दामों में 50 प्रतिशत और खाद्य तेलों में 40 प्रतिशत की वृद्धि हुई है। इसके अलावा, आम आदमी के अन्य सामाजिक खर्चे भी होते हैं। इतनी महंगाई में आम आदमी कैसे जिन्दा रह सकता है?

महोदय, पिछले एक साल में प्रति व्यक्ति आय में जितनी वृद्धि हुई है, उसकी तुलना में 300 प्रतिशत आवश्यक उपभोक्ता वस्तुओं के दाम बढ़े हैं। एक स्टडी रिपोर्ट के मुताबिक गेहूँ, दाल, चाय, चीनी, मसालों आदि के दाम पिछले एक साल में 19 प्रतिशत बढ़े हैं, जबकि औसत घरेलू आय सिर्फ 6 प्रतिशत बढ़ी है। स्टडी रिपोर्ट के मुताबिक निकट भविष्य में गेहूँ, दूध और दूध से बने उत्पादों के मूल्य में वृद्धि होगी।

महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से यह पूछना चाहती हूँ कि क्या 8 से 10 हजार रुपये मासिक आय पाने वाला व्यक्ति महंगाई में अपने परिवार का पेट भर सकता है? 8 से 10 हजार रुपये या इससे ज्यादा बहुत कम लोगों की आय है। "नरेगा" में आप सिर्फ 100 रुपये की मजदूरी ही देते हैं। इस हिसाब से लोगों की आय सिर्फ 3000 रुपये मासिक

होती है। पिछले साल "नरेगा" का राष्ट्रीय सालाना औसत सिर्फ 48 दिनों का ही रहा है। अब सरकार और सरकारी तंत्र अपनी अंतरात्मा से यह पूछ ले कि क्या अब भी सरकार का हाथ आम आदमी के साथ है? आज समाज के निचले तबके की स्थिति आजादी से पहले के बंधुआ मजदूरों से भी खराब है। कोई मजदूर दिन भर "नरेगा" के तहत मजदूरी करके अगर 100 रुपये कमाता है तो वह अपनी दिन भर की कमाई से 2 किलो आलू और 2 किलो प्याज ही अपने घर में ला सकता है। क्या यही निगेटिव इन्फ्लेशन है?

महोदय, महंगाई इसलिए नहीं बढ़ी है कि मांग और आपूर्ति का गैप है, बल्कि इसका कारण जमाखोरी और कालाबाजारी है। ऐसा भी नहीं है कि बढ़ी हुई महंगाई का फायदा किसान को मिल रहा है, जो अपनी मेहनत से अनाज पैदा करता है। उसे तो बाजार भाव का सिर्फ 1/3 भाग ही मिलता है। इसमें दो-तिहाई फायदा तो जमाखोर और बिचौलियों को होता है, क्योंकि वे बाजार को अपनी इच्छा के अनुसार मैनीपुलेट कर आर्टिफिशियल शॉर्टेज पैदा कर देते हैं और सरकार कुछ नहीं करती है। सरकारी तंत्र इसको रोकने की बजाय इसमें उनकी मदद करता है। एक ईमानदार आदमी जो ईमानदारी से टैक्स देता है, वह लाइसेंस, परमिट और इंस्पेक्टर राज से परेशान है, पर जमाखोर और कालाबाजारी करने वाले गलत करते हुए भी बचे रहते हैं। सरकार अगर इच्छा-शक्ति रखे और ईमानदारी से काम करे तो महंगाई रोकी जा सकती है। आप कृषि उत्पादों को बिना - कृषि मंत्री जी यहाँ पर बैठे हैं, अगर वह वास्तव में महंगाई को रोकना चाहते हैं तो जो किसान है, उसे बिना किसी टैक्सेशन और स्कावट के एक राज्य से दूसरे राज्य में अपने उत्पाद को बेचने का अधिकार दे दें। इससे किसान को अच्छी कीमत मिलेगी और उपभोक्ता को भी सस्ते दाम पर अनाज मिलेगा। राज्य किसानों के उत्पादन पर टोल टैक्स और अन्य टैक्स बंद कर दे।

(3बी/एकेए पर क्रमशः)

aka-sk/3b/4:45

**श्रीमती कुसुम राय (क्रमागत) :** FCI और अन्य गोदामों में प्रॉपर चैक नहीं है, जिसकी वजह से कालाबाजारी को रोका जा सके।

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से यह कहना चाहूंगी कि सरकार के पास ऐसे एक्ट हैं, जो जमाखोरी को और कालाबाजारी को रोक सकते हैं। मैं कहना चाहूंगी कि सरकारी तंत्र, कालाबाजारी और जमाखोरी करने वालों की मिलीभगत को समाप्त करने के लिए प्रभावी कदम उठाए जाएं और सरकार को अपनी महत्वपूर्ण नीतियों के क्रियान्वयन और मॉनिटरिंग के लिए नीतियां बनानी चाहिए।

अंत में मैं सरकार से एक बार और आग्रह करूंगी कि आवश्यक वस्तुओं की महंगाई को सरकार सिर्फ आंकड़ों की कलाबाजी से नहीं बल्कि वास्तव में रोकने का प्रयास करे, ताकि आम आदमी को अपनी अंतरात्मा से महसूस हो सके कि सरकार का हाथ वाकई उसके साथ है। बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J.KURIEN):** Thank you. Congratulations Shrimati Kusum Rai. You made a good speech. Your maiden speech was a good speech. Now, Shri Arjun Kumar Sengupta. But, you have to stick to time.

**SHRI ARJUN KUMAR SENGUPTA:** How much time? Five minutes?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** You need five minutes? Okay, you take one more minute.

**SHRI ARJUN KUMAR SENGUPTA (WEST BENGAL):** That is more than enough. I don't want to speak too much on this subject because this subject has been very much spoken about and the Finance Minister has already discussed the intricacies of price indices and all that. This House is quite grateful to him for explaining all this. But the fact of the matter is, the Minister is present here, yes, we know what is actually happening. The question is: What are we doing to control prices? The issue, as the Finance Minister has pointed out, and I am absolutely certain that Sharad Pawarji will also say the same thing that first our

attempt is to see whether these prices can be controlled. Obviously, the prices cannot be controlled in a situation where there is a production shortfall and where there is an international situation against you. Then, the question is: How to protect, at least, a section of the people from the adverse effects? The Finance Minister talked about *Aam Aadmi*. This is a question of common man. How do you protect that? Sir, this is a point I want to raise, and I hope the Minister-in-charge will be able to answer that. We need to have some kind of a long-term mechanism because this is going to happen again and again. It is not just a one-time phenomenon. It is not happening just because monsoon is failing this year. It happens with the change of the demand pattern and recession. So, this is expected to happen again and again and we must have a proper mechanism to tackle it.

The first mechanism is, of course, the public distribution system. The public distribution system is something which needs to be strengthened. Particularly, in view of the delivery mechanism, lot of criticism has been there. I hope that the Minister will be able to assure us that steps are being taken to see that the public distribution system runs without much complicity.

The second point is, in spite of all this, there will be a lot of speculation. Now, Sir, I do not believe that the speculation in the market can be arrested by sheer force, although after a point, if there is too much of hoarding, the State Government should take certain action. I am sure, the Central Government will support the State Governments to do that. But, this is not going to be the answer. The answer will have to be a financial answer to this question. I am sorry, the Finance

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

Minister has already left, but we have to find some fiscal methods and incentives to see that speculation is arrested. We had till this year a commodity exchange tax. This was a transaction tax. Transaction taxes are meant to prevent unnecessary speculation. Unfortunately, this tax has been withdrawn. There are many reasons for that. Most probably, the reason was that it was introduced last year by Mr. Chidambaram, but he did not really try to implement it. I am requesting the Government, through the Minister present here and to the Finance Minister to re-consider introducing this again. Specially now, with the view of the shortage in monsoon, there is definitely going to be a short pressure or speculation. This particular measure will not only add revenue but also be, to some extent, not to full, effective neutralisation on the speculative measures.

The third point is, and on this point, Sir, I would like a serious consideration. In a country like ours, we have got huge foreign exchange reserves and ability to import goods, and most of these goods are, what you call in economics 'tradable goods'.

(Contd. by ysr-3c)

-SK/YSR/4.50/3C

**SHRI ARJUN KUMAR SENGUPTA (CONTD.):** We may not be able to produce them at home. But they are produced somewhere in the world. Of course, there is a price factor. If you try to import much, the prices will go up. But that is for the Finance Ministry to see how to finance that import and how to subsidise that import.



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

But there must be a permanent regular mechanism which should know when to import; how to import; and which are the parties with which you should actually deal with.

For this purpose, I am suggesting the Minister to seriously consider creation of a Commodities Exchange Corporation or a Commodities Trading Corporation. It will not be like the Food Corporation of India. This particular corporation should be able to procure, say, dal, sugar and several other things, from home and from the world with a complete access to import market. The Government will only give it the assurance that if it is forced to sell or if it is persuaded to sell at a price lower than the import price, then the Government will subsidise it. Otherwise, this particular corporation will fend for itself.

If we have a large corporation with a huge amount of working capital, it should be able to get into the market at the right time and play against the market. Those of us who have been in this area for a long time know how the old thinking of the Government has changed. There was a time when the Government seriously considered taking the wholesale trade to be nationalised. Because when shortage is there, trade is a major factor, which has to be arrested, which we cannot do. We have now come out of that nationalisation spree, as Murli Deora was saying. We are not talking about that.

Therefore, we are saying let us play in the market. But let the public sector play the counterforce of the market. Come forward with enough resources, play in the market, and then this particular corporation can get into a long-term contract.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

In petroleum sector, if we are not producing it at home, we can get into a long-term import contract with producers who can produce it. There are many small countries in Africa which would be able to produce *dal* for us if we have a long-term contract. If we have a long-term contract with even some domestic producers, it will give us stability. This particular corporation should have sufficient financial resources to enter into this type of long-term contract and play in the market properly as a big trader. I am sure that will have an immediate effect. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

**DR. BARUN MUKHERJI (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, we have had enough of statistical jugglery, particularly regarding inflation figures. A couple of months ago and in the last year also, when we were eagerly reading newspapers in the morning, we were looking for inflation rate. We saw it gradually going up and then it reached at 12 per cent. But after that, when it reversed, it reached zero level and even negative level. But to our utter shocking surprise, we have found that it surpassed all our expectations, and the prices of essential commodities have not gone down. It is the shocking surprise.

Now we are listening to a lot of explanations and seeing the difference between the Wholesale Price Index and the Consumer Price Index. But, at that time, it was not discussed. The main thing is this. People are not bothered about this statistical jugglery. They are mainly concerned about prices of essential commodities. All my hon. colleagues here highlighted how the prices of even vegetables, edible oil, sugar, pulses, medicines, etc., have steadily gone up. The price of

these articles has reached such a stage that it is beyond the reach of the common man, the poor working class. The middle class families are not able to manage their household necessities at this precarious stage.

(Contd. By VKK/3D)

-YSR/VKK/3d/4.55

**DR. BARUN MUKHERJI (CONTD.):** So, it is essential and many a time, we have been demanding universal public distribution system. In this respect, only the targeted public distribution system will not do. It is not enough that only the people Below Poverty Line are given subsidised food items. Even the common people, middle class and APL people also need subsidised food commodities. Otherwise, they cannot survive. One main thing that we have been highlighting many a time is, positive steps should be taken against hoarders and people involved in forward trading or speculative trading. But, unfortunately, no such positive step has been taken. I believe, our hon. Members may recall that once the then Prime Minister, Shri Jawahar Lal Nehru, had said, "I will hang the black-marketeers and hoarders publicly on the lamppost." Perhaps, the present Government is far away from that line of thinking. But, the basic fact remains that hoarders and speculative traders have an important role to play in inflating the prices of essential commodities. It is high time to ban forward trading and speculative trading. It must be done. Moreover, one basic factor behind it is, the declining trend of agricultural productivity. It has declined steadily. Once it was six per cent. Then, it came down to 1.4 per cent. Now, of late, the Government has declared that the target is four per cent. But, it has not been clarified in what way they plan to reach the target of four per cent of agricultural productivity.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

(Time-bell) Even now, if we depend on monsoon, that will be very unfortunate. At this stage of developed technology, we have to think otherwise. We would like to say that there should be proper planning to build up the enough stock of food. As and when necessary, we shall have to import necessary food items at reasonable or competitive price, not in a fire-fighting measure. When there is acute crisis, you will be importing these things at more than twice the price of the present market price. On the other hand, proper planning should be done for building up food stock and its scientific preservation. Definitely, about the distribution, the targeted PDS will not suffice. (Time-bell) We must go in for universal public distribution system. Otherwise, people will have no relief from this souring and spiralling price rise. Thank you very much, Sir.

(Ends)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Now, Shri Sharad Anantrao Joshi. (Interruptions) What can I do? There is paucity of time. Otherwise, I would not have rang the bell.

**SHRI SHARAD ANANTRAO JOSHI (MAHARASHTRA):** Sir, the present discussion on the situation arising out of continued price rise started on the 4<sup>th</sup>. We have had a semicolon where the Finance Minister intervened to bring out the aspects that concern the financial management. Sir, before the discussion started, I was in Vadodara, Gujarat when the *tur daal* price had reached Rs.100 and people were really scared. This morning, newspapers show that price of *tur daal* has reached Rs.140 in Andhra Pradesh. So, it's not only the absolute level of prices, but, the speed and the rate at which prices are increasing from day-to-day which

is causing scare. Sir, the Finance Minister tried to maintain that this is not on account of bad economic management and what I am going to say, Sir, is precisely the opposite that it is bad overall economic strategies and management which is resulting in this kind of rise in prices.

(Contd. by TMV/3e)

-VKK-TMV-MP/3E/5.00

**SHRI SHARAD ANANTRAO JOSHI (CONTD.):** Sir, the Finance Minister has very correctly said that this is a question of demand and supply management. It is the demand and supply management...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN):** Just one minute. Please bear with me. There is a Half-an-Hour Discussion to be taken up at 5.00 p.m. If the House agrees, we can take it up later.

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir the concerned Member is sitting here. It can be deferred.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Yes, we will defer it.

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA:** There is this important business of price rise.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** If that is the sense of the House, we will defer it. The Member also agrees. The Member is very cooperative.

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Sir, he is a very good man as long as he is on this side.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Do you want to keep him there? They will not allow that. So, that is agreed. Please proceed.

**SHRI SHARAD ANANTRAO JOSHI:** Sir, although the Finance Minister took 40 minutes to explain that it was wise financial management and economic management, I have hardly four minutes to disprove him. It is

essentially bad economic management and bad equilibrating of supply and demand under what is called "inclusive economy". I may try to make it as simple as possible. The fiscal packages that have gone into the anti-recession measures, the Sixth Pay Commission, the National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme and all that have resulted in pumping of incomes into the hands of a certain class. Now this class is consuming certain things which it was not consuming in the same proportion earlier. These are commodities which are being consumed largely. (Interruptions)... Sir, I seek your protection. If you are giving me only five minutes, I would ask you to give me protection. For example, the commodities where the prices have gone high are pulses, oil-seeds, edible oils, sugar, milk and milk products. These are all commodities which are consumed by the lower middle class or the middle middle-class or the upper middle-class which now the *aam admi* has started consuming. That is the reason why the prices are going up and that is the reason why the housewives in Mumbai are coming out and they are the ones who are feeling the pinch of this aggression by the *aam admi* into the commodities that have been consumed exclusively by them.

Sir, there is another factor. The NREGS and other schemes, and the Sixth Pay Commission have made agricultural labourers scarce. The reason why the pulse prices are going up is also largely due to the fact that pulse is a highly labour-intensive produce. It requires a lot of labour and it involves a lot of cost. So, it is precisely those commodities that are consumed almost exclusively by the upper middle-class which are now having a higher demand and in lesser supply because of high cost of production. This is resulting in a mismatch between the demand and

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

supply. I would try to illustrate it by a simple micro model. If Rs.6,500 are spent from Delhi on any project, according to the report of the Planning Commission, only Rs.100 reach the *aam admi*. When Rs.100 reach the *aam admi*, he spends about Rs.70 on food articles. To produce Rs.70 worth of food item, you require a direct investment of about Rs.200. To make this Rs.200 reach the farmers, you require 65 times more than that amount, that is, Rs.1,30,000. For every rupee you spend on *aam admi*, unless you spend Rs.2 for encouraging production of those things, it would be seen that the inclusive economics is untenable, and it will always result in inflation and high cost. I often said that inclusive economics is politically a clincher, but it might prove to be an economic flop. Thank you.

(Ends)

(Followed by 3F/VK)-mp/sc-vk/5.05/3f

**श्री मंगल किसन (उड़ीसा)** : धन्यवाद, उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय। आज देश में हर चीज़ की कीमत बहुत बढ़ गयी है और बाज़ार में चीज़ें नहीं मिल रही हैं। आम आदमी, जो साधारण आदमी है, उसे अपनी ज़िंदगी में चावल, गेहूं, दाल, प्याज, आलू, लहसुन, खाने का तेल, नमक आदि की जरूरत है। उसके साथ थोड़ा प्याज, आलू, लहसुन और साग-भाजी एक आम परिवार के लिए जरूरी है। आज 77 परसेंट population इसी के बीच में लटकी हुई है और इसके आगे वह कुछ भी सोच नहीं सकती है। जब बारिश ठीक होती है तो ये साधारण चीज़ें, जो आम आदमी के लिए जीने के लिए दरकार है, जीवन के पोषण के लिए जरूरी हैं, वे मिल जाती हैं। जब मौसम में थोड़ी गड़बड़ होती है तो शाक-भाजी के दाम से लेकर हर चीज़ के दाम बाज़ार में बढ़ते चले जाते हैं और आम आदमी को परेशान होना पड़ता है। महोदय, पानी के बिना खेती संभव नहीं है। जैसे मछली बगैर पानी के ज़िंदा नहीं रह सकती है, उसी तरह irrigation में बिना पानी के पैदावार में वृद्धि होने की कोई

संभावना नहीं है। आज तक भारत सरकार ने irrigation को state subject मानकर, उसके प्रति जो ध्यान देना चाहिए, वह नहीं दिया है। स्टेट गवर्नमेंट के पास इतना धन नहीं है कि खेती योग्य जमीन की सिंचाई के लिए 100 परसेंट पानी का प्रावधान कर सके। आज सिंचाई का percentage अगर हम देखें तो पंजाब और हरियाणा को छोड़कर वह 35 से 40 परसेंट के बीच में अटका हुआ है। हम चाहे NREGA बनाएं या कितने भी प्रोग्राम बनाएं, लेकिन हर आदमी को जिंदा रहने के लिए दाल रोटी चाहिए। उसको और कुछ नहीं चाहिए, केवल दाल-रोटी चाहिए। दाल-रोटी के बिना आम आदमी का जीना मुश्किल है। जब दाल-रोटी नहीं मिलेगी तो हर जगह भले लोग भी आंदोलन करेंगे, मजदूर लोग आंदोलन करेंगे, middle class आंदोलन करेंगे और सब लोग आंदोलन करेंगे। जो बुनियादी चीज़ है, वह पानी है। पानी के बिना खेती संभव नहीं है। इस विषय पर भारत सरकार को सोचना चाहिए और irrigation facility बढ़ाने के लिए, जिस तरह से सरकार ने NREGA में पैसे का जुगाड किया जाता है, उसी तरह से स्टेट गवर्नमेंट को 100 परसेंट irrigation facility मुहैया कराने के लिए सेंट्रल बजट में सपोर्ट होना चाहिए। बिना सपोर्ट के केवल दाल-रोटी खोजने से कहां से मिलेगी? गेहूं-चावल खोजने से कहां से मिलेगा? जब पैदावार होगी, तब जाकर हम लोगों को दाल, रोटी, गेहूं, चावल और तेल आदि सब कुछ मिलेगा। Without having irrigation facilities, there cannot be good agriculture. That is why the Government should provide irrigation facilities to the people. Then only this burning problem can be solved; otherwise हर साल इसी प्रकार डिसकशन होती रहेगी और इसका समाधान नहीं होगा।..(समय की घंटी).. एक आखिरी बात पीडीएस सिस्टम के संबंध में कहना चाहता हूं। मैं केवल एक मिनट लूंगा। यह पीडीएस सिस्टम गेहूं, चावल, चीनी इत्यादि में फेल हो चुका है। बाजार को regulate और control करने के लिए जो authority है, जो mechanism है, वह फेल हो चुका है। आज non-government mechanism बाज़ार को कंट्रोल कर रहा है। यह non-government mechanism, जो बाज़ार को कंट्रोल कर रहा है, उसको पकड़ना पड़ेगा, तब जाकर जितना भी गोदामों में चावल और गेहूं है, वह मार्किट में आ सकता है और कुछ राहत मिल सकती है। धन्यवाद।

(3जी-एमसीएम पर क्रमशः)



RG/5.10/3G

**DR. JANARDHAN WAGHMARE (MAHARASHTRA):** Sir, our country is passing through hard times. We are facing recess on the one hand and inflation on the other. And, this is quite a paradoxical situation. We are grappling with the problem of skyrocketing prices of commodities which are essential for living. This problem has, however created an extraordinary situation which is unprecedented in nature and is far-reaching in effect. Prices have been on the rise over the years. But, today, the problem has assumed great seriousness. The failure of monsoon has aggravated the gravity and grimness of the problem. All the forecasts regarding monsoons have proved false and futile. The failure of monsoon has caused a widespread drought across the country. As a matter of fact, drought is a major cause of steep rising of prices of essential commodities this year. All parts of India have been badly hit by drought creating an apocalyptic situation in this country. Never before has India witnessed such a tragic situation. The common man, in whose name and honour we run the Government, is on the brink, and the situation has to be faced very squarely. The *Aam Admi's* plight is indeed very pathetic. His survival itself is in danger. He may get bread, but where is the dal to eat it with? The price of dal is beyond his capacity, even beyond his imagination. Wheat and rice, we have in stock, but pulses we do not have. The Government. should procure pulses even at high prices. The farmers should be induced to grow more pulses. The Government should indicate the requirements of essential commodities every year along with incentives to farmers. The

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

pattern of crops should be rapidly and radically changed. The condition of the people, who are below the poverty line, is indeed very pathetic. We have 260 million people below the poverty line. They are unfortunately undernourished. Most of them suffer from malnutrition. The Government has implemented the Employment Guarantee Scheme for the BPL people. But the Employment Guarantee Scheme does not mean Food Guarantee Scheme. The Employment Guarantee Scheme should mean 'Food Guarantee Scheme'. For this, the Government should take two measures; first, it should ensure employment to BPL people for 365 days. Second, it should undertake a massive 'Food for Work Programme'.

But we cannot ensure food security unless we ensure work security. Work should be made a Fundamental Right, like, primary education. Right to Life is a Fundamental Right in the Constitution. Without Right to Work, Right to Life has no meaning. Right to Education has emanated from the Right to Life. Right to Work also emanates, let us clearly understand, from the Right to Life. Let us aim at it.

Sir, it is a fact that the peasantry of this country has always been below the poverty line; it is the peasantry who provides food to us. The farmers have to feed not only their families, but also their cattle. The widespread drought in the country has created the problem of fodder and water. Fodder security is no less important than the food security. The Government should face this problem squarely and very urgently. When the farmers become helpless, they sell their cattle to the butchers. This is how they solve the problem of fodder and water. This year is

going to be a very dark year. I would like to call it the Eclipse year because we are facing this food problem. The Government should leave no stone unturned to curb the price rise of essential commodities. The Government must have the political will. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

(Followed by 3H)

KS-GSS/5.15/3H

**श्री राजनीति प्रसाद (बिहार) :** धन्यवाद सर। भाई शिवानन्द तिवारी जी, कभी-कभी अच्छी बात बोल देते हैं। हमें अच्छा लगा कि उन्होंने पुरानी बातों को याद किया। हम लोग बहुत पहले एक गाना सुनते थे कि दाल, रोटी खाओ, प्रभु के गुण गाओ। लेकिन अब दाल भी गायब है और रोटी के बारे में तो सोचना ही नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु :** अब केवल प्रभु है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री राजनीति प्रसाद :** हां, प्रभु है। ...(व्यवधान).... जब हम लोग बोलते हैं, क्या तभी आप लोग बोलते हैं ? ...(व्यवधान)...

**SHRI M. VENKAI AH NAIDU:** I hope, Shri Sharad Pawar has heard him.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN):** You have only five minutes. You don't get distracted. You address the Chair.

**श्री राजनीति प्रसाद :** सर, पांच मिनट में से तीन मिनट तो ये ही ले लेते हैं। ...(व्यवधान).... सर, मेरा टाइम अब शुरू होता है। मैं एक सजेशन देना चाहता हूँ। यहां पर कृषि मंत्री जी बैठे हैं। जो पीडीएस का डिस्ट्रीब्यूशन है, उसको पूरे हिन्दुस्तान में ठीक कर दीजिए, उसका रख-रखाव ठीक कर दीजिए, तो हमारे ख्याल से मूल्य में जरूर कुछ कमी आ जाएगी, इसमें कोई शक नहीं है। जब पीडीएस का ही डायवर्सन हो जाएगा, दुकान पर पहुंचने से पहले ही उसका डायवर्सन हो जाएगा, तब मूल्य में वृद्धि होगी, इसमें कोई शक नहीं है। हम लोग समाजवादी आंदोलन से आते हैं। हम लोग नारा देते थे - जब तक भूखा इन्सान रहेगा, धरती पर तूफान रहेगा। इसके अलावा एक नारा और देते थे - 'रोको महंगी, बांधो दाम, नहीं तो होगा चक्का जाम'। अब यहां चक्का जाम नहीं होता है। महंगी के बारे में कोई

विचार ही नहीं करता है।...(व्यवधान)... हम लोगों का सारा समय कैसे-कैसे जाता है, मैं तो इस बात पर हैरान हूँ, लेकिन हमारे यहां लोगों को खाना नहीं मिलता है। अब NERGA की बात है। अगर इसमें काम करने वाले लोगों को रोज सौ रुपये मिलेंगे, तो हम जो चावल खरीदने जाएंगे, हम जो गेहूं खरीदने जाएंगे, हम बाजार में जो सब्जी खरीदने जाएंगे, उसी दाम में यह सामान उसको भी मिलेगा और उसी दाम में हमको भी मिलेगा, चाहे हम पार्लियामेंट के मेम्बर हैं। उसको सौ रुपये मिलते हैं और हमको बीस हजार या 16 हजार रुपये, जो भी तनखाह है, उसमें क्या अंतर है, इसको देख लीजिए। श्री अर्जुनसेन गुप्त की जो किताब है, उसमें लिखा है कि 75 परसेंट का बीस रुपया रोज में काम चलता है, तो 20 को एक महीने से multiply करिए, वह कितना आता है? उसको भी वह उसी दाम में खरीदना पड़ेगा। इस पर माननीय मंत्री जी को विचार करना चाहिए। सर, आप मुझे ज्यादा समय नहीं देंगे। इसलिए मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से कहना चाहता हूँ कि आप पीडीएस सिस्टम को मजबूत कीजिए। सुश्री मैबल रिबैलो जी ने जो सजेशन दिया है, वह बहुत बढ़िया सजेशन है। वह कहती हैं कि गोदाम से सीधे अनाज पीडीएस की दुकान पर पहुंचना चाहिए, क्योंकि अगर वह सीधे दुकान पर नहीं पहुंचेगा।...(व्यवधान)... यह आपके यहां पहुंचता होगा, सब जगह पर नहीं पहुंचता है। अगर वह डायरेक्ट नहीं पहुंचता है, तो बीच में उसका डायवर्सन होता है। मैं शिवानन्द तिवारी जी की इस बात से सहमत हूँ कि बाजार में और एफसीआई के गोदाम में माल की कमी नहीं है, लेकिन आप उसको कहां-कहां दे देते हैं, किसको दे देते हैं, यह समझ में नहीं आता है। हमारे वित्त मंत्री जी ने यहां पर कहा कि थोक मूल्य में और कॉमन मूल्य में फर्क है। उन्होंने चार तरह के मूल्य बताए। हमारे यहां चार तरह के मूल्य का कोई मतलब नहीं है। वह थोक विक्रेता का क्या मूल्य है, उससे आम लोगों को कोई मतलब नहीं है, थोक विक्रेता का जो मतलब है, उससे सब लोगों का मतलब नहीं है।

(3जे पर जारी)

ASC-TDB/5.20/3J

**श्री राजनीति प्रसाद (क्रमागत)** : उससे कॉमन मैन का क्या लेना-देना है? कॉमन मैन को तो उसी से मतलब है, जो बाजार में बिकता है और शॉप पर बिकता है। सर, मैं यह निवेदन

करना चाहूंगा कि इस बारे में जरूर विचार किया जाए। मैं एक और बात कहना चाहता हूँ..(व्यवधान). खत्म हो गया? सर, एक मिनट रुकिए। ..(व्यवधान).. ऐसा मत करिए। आप जो कहते हैं, हम मान लेते हैं। सर, मैं एक बात और पूछना चाहता हूँ कि नार्थ एवेन्यू में चावल के दाम और दाल के दाम एक सौ रुपए प्रति किलो हैं, अगर हम सफदरजंग में जाएंगे, तो पाएंगे कि वहां पर इनके दाम 90 रुपए हैं। हम कहीं और दूसरी जगह पर जाएंगे, तो पाएंगे कि इनके दाम 70 रुपए हैं। इसका क्या मतलब है? यहां पर सब्जी किलो के भाव से खरीदी ही नहीं जाती है, बल्कि हम लोग यहां पर सब्जी पाव के भाव से खरीदते हैं। जो सब्जी हम अपने घर में बाजार से किलो के भाव पर खरीदते हैं, यहां पाव में मिलती है। हमने पूछा कि सब्जी का भाव कितने रुपए किलो है, तो उसने कहा कि यहां किलो नहीं बल्कि पाव मिलती है, यानी सब्जी किलो नहीं मिलती है, पाव में मिलती है। इसलिए इसके बारे में जरूर विचार करना चाहिए। अगर आप महंगाई को रोकना चाहते हैं, ...(समय की घंटी).. तो जो आपका mechanism है, आप उस पर दबाव डालिए, तभी महंगाई रुकेगी।...(समय की घंटी)...अगर महंगाई रुकी तो ठीक है, नहीं तो फिर चक्का फिसल जाएगा और दिक्कत हो जाएगी। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**श्री राम नारायण साहू (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** सर, सदन में जो price rise पर चर्चा चल रही है, आपने मुझे इस पर बोलने का समय दिया, इसके लिए आपका बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद। आज देश में जो चारों ओर दिक्कत और परेशानियां आ रही हैं और इस पर सभी लोग अपने-अपने विचार प्रकट कर रहे हैं कि देश किन-किन परिस्थितियों से गुजर रहा है, तो यह सरकार की गलत नीतियों के कारण है। यह सरकार जुगाड़ लगाकर चलाई जा रही है। ..(व्यवधान).. सरदार जी, आप समझिए। कभी तो लेफ्ट फ्रंट का सहारा लिया जाता है और कभी समाजवादी पार्टी का सहारा लिया जाता है। ...(व्यवधान)... अब ऐसे लोगों का सहारा लेने का प्रयास किया जा रहा है, जिन लोगों ने सरकार को paralysis की हालत में पहुंचा दिया था, ताकि जुगाड़ बना रहे। ...(व्यवधान).. आप सीनियर आदमी हैं। सर, अब महंगाई चरमसीमा पर है और बड़े घरानों की मदद पीछे के दरवाजे से की जा रही है। आज गरीबी की हालत क्या है, इस पर लोक सभा ने एक पिक्चर दिखाई थी। लोग तो उस पिक्चर की

तारीफ कर रहे हैं और सरकार भी कर रही है, तभी तो सरकार वह पिक्चर दिखा रही है। मीडिया भी उस पिक्चर की तारीफ कर रहा है। उस पिक्चर को सात या आठ ऑस्कर पुरस्कार दिए गए हैं। ...(व्यवधान).. आपने पिक्चर नहीं देखी? आपको वह पिक्चर देखनी चाहिए थी। सर, जो यूरोप व पश्चिमी सभ्यता वाले देशों के लोग हैं, वे यही काम किया करते हैं। उन्होंने "लगान" को प्राइज़ दिया नहीं, "जोधा अकबर" को प्राइज़ दिया नहीं, बल्कि एक ऐसी पिक्चर को प्राइज़ दिया है, जिसमें भारत को काफी गिरी हुई स्थिति में दिखाया गया है। कल हमारे एक सदस्य कह रहे थे कि हम आधा घंटा फिक्चर देखने के बाद बाहर चले गए। ये पश्चिमी देश हमेशा एक राजनीतिक चाल चला करते हैं। आप सभी लोग जानते हैं, जब पश्चिमी देशों की बात आ गई तो बताना ही पड़ेगा।

(क्रमशः 3K/LP पर)

-ASC/LP-KGG/3K/5.25

**श्री राम नारायण साहू (क्रमागत) :** उन्होंने देखा कि इंडिया में कॉस्मेटिक की डिमांड बहुत ज्यादा है। उन्होंने एक साथ पांच, छह मिस वर्ल्ड, मिस यूनिवर्स पैदा कर दीं और उनकी मार्केट खुल गई। अगर गरीबी देखनी है तो चाहे दिल्ली हो, लखनऊ हो या मुंबई हो, जब शहर में गाड़ी एंटर करती है और आप शहर के अंदर चलते हैं, तब आप देखिए कि लोग किस स्थिति में रहते हैं। यहां पर मच्छर गिरते हैं। इसका आपको नई दिल्ली के अंदर, मुंबई या नगर के कुछ हिस्सों में देखकर अहसास होगा। एक तरफ तो हम बात करते हैं कि हमारा देश 2020 में दुनिया की तीसरी ताकत बनेगा, हम से छोटे-छोटे देश..(समय की घंटी)..

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे.कुरियन) :** हो गया।

**श्री राम नारायण साहू :** सर, एक मिनट, बहुत इम्पोर्टेंट प्वाइंट है। चीन, जो हमसे बाद में आजाद हुआ है, वे देश जो देर से आजाद हुए हैं, वे देश विकास के रास्ते पर हमसे आगे निकल गए हैं। ये देश विकास के रास्ते पर हमसे आगे कैसे निकले? इसके लिए एक कमेटी बनाई जानी चाहिए, जो इस बात पर गौर करे कि वे हमसे आगे कैसे निकल गए। नकल हमेशा अच्छी बातों की की जाती है।

**उपसभाध्यक्ष :** साहू जी, तीन मिनट की बजाय पांच मिनट हो गए हैं, खत्म कीजिए।

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

**श्री राम नारायण साहू :** सर, मैं आपसे केवल एक बात कहना चाहूंगा कि सरकार अपने एतबार पर चलती है और यहां जो हालात पैदा हो रहे हैं - जैसे किसी मकान में बिल हो जाते हैं, वैसे ही सरकार एक बिल बंद कर रही है तो दूसरा बिल खुल रहा है। सन् 1977 में जो स्थिति थी..(व्यवधान)..

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे.कुरियन):** ओ.के. पांच मिनट हो गए हैं।

**श्री राम नारायण साहू :** सन् 1977 में जो स्थिति थी, उस समय इंदिरा गांधी जी हमारी प्रधानमंत्री थीं। अपने सहयोगियों से पूछा..(व्यवधान)..

**उपसभाध्यक्ष :** आपको तीन मिनट बोला था, पांच मिनट हो गए हैं..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री राम नारायण साहू :** पूछा कि देश में कैसी हालत है, उन्होंने जवाब दिया कि आप ही की जय-जयकार हो रही है। जो बिल निकल रहा है - उस समय भी बहुत बिल हो गए थे, हालात देखते हुए..(व्यवधान)..उत्तर प्रदेश की ..(व्यवधान)..गवर्नमेंट ने ..(व्यवधान)..

**उपसभाध्यक्ष:** आप बैठिए..(व्यवधान).. साहू जी, बैठिए..(व्यवधान)..टी.सुब्बारामी रेड्डी..(व्यवधान)..साहू जी, आप बैठिए..(व्यवधान)..मैंने बुलाया है..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री राम नारायण साहू :** बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY (ANDHRA PRADESH):** Sir, our UPA Government is determined to control inflation, to control prices and to achieve GDP growth. These are the three things before the Government. I would like to say that, today, instead of finding faults, first, let us analyse where we are having problems and how to solve them on a short-term and on a long-term basis. We must bear in mind the rapid growth of population, increase in purchasing power, and health improvements influence consumption of products. These three are major reasons for the shortage of products. Unfortunately, drought has started appearing. I am praying Lord Balaji of Tirupati to bless good rains all over the country. सबकी प्रॉब्लम आसान करनी है।

Most importantly, the Ministry must now concentrate on construction of cold storages. Several times, we have surplus food products and we would

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

not be able to sell them, and they would perish. We had been hearing about schemes on building cold storage capacities, but nothing is taking shape. Similarly, on warehouses, though we have warehouses, we must multiply the storage capacity all over the country. The Government must provide more funds in the Budget. If necessary, private sector also can be involved in constructing more warehouses and providing storage facilities. Addition of storage is solution number one. Secondly, to face drought-like situations, we must concentrate on agriculture, on irrigation facilities all over the country, not just in one particular State.

(Contd. by kls/3l)

KLS/3L-5.30

**DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY (CONTD):** Thirdly, we must have advance planning to import items of foodgrains. We must have advance planning for importing sugar, wheat, etc., from surplus countries. So, we must be very cautious, conscious and judicious in planning the whole system. Lastly, I would like to say that the challenge before the Government is how to control prices and how to make things available. People are saying that prices are very high and the quantum of commodities is very low. These are burning problems. Now, the problem of drought will be solved by Lord Balaji and with the capacity of the hon. Minister, we are going to solve the problem. Thank you. (Ends)



**DISCUSSION ON THE CONTINUED RISE  
IN PRICES OF ESSENTIAL COMMODITIES  
IN THE COUNTRY (CONTD.)**

**THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, CONSUMER AFFAIRS, FOOD AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION (SHRI SHARAD PAWAR):** Sir, I have been carefully listening to the discussion in the House on the rising prices of essential commodities. I was quite happy about the entire discussion because it was not restricted only to one subject, that is, rising prices, but some of the important agricultural problems have also been discussed in the House and a lot of constructive suggestions have been made. In fact, about ten days back, I got an opportunity to apprise the House regarding the overall monsoon position, delay in rains, its impact on production and productivity. We had very seriously discussed that subject also. Today we are discussing for the last two days one of the worsening problems, which people of this country are facing and all of us are worried, that is, the prices of the essential commodities. I am grateful that my colleague, the Finance Minister, has participated and he has also given a definite approach of the Government to the House. Let me assure the House that moderating inflation along with the robust or increasing growth are the most important policy planks of the economy. The Government is committed to the farmers and that the farmers from all over India receive fair and remunerative prices and that the terms of trade are maintained in favour of the farmers. Therefore, the Government has been working on these two policy planks, one, to give boost to the agriculture, and, second, to insulate the vulnerable sections of the society especially those who are

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

below poverty line and targeted population under the Antodaya Anna Yojana without adversely impacting the growth momentum necessary for the social and economic development of the country. I do not want to go into the details about the overall approach and progress and what we have done in the area of agriculture. But hon. Members are fully aware that the situation of the agriculture, agricultural growth, growth rate and availability of foodgrains in the country was not very comfortable. About five years back when Dr. Manmohan Singhji had taken over the reins of this country, conscious efforts have been made to give more weightage to the agriculture and do more investment in agriculture. A number of decisions have been taken. There was shortage of foodgrains. I recalled that a special meeting was called of the Chief Ministers of all the States and for one whole day only one subject was discussed, that is, how to improve production and productivity.

(Contd by 3M/SSS)

SSS/3M/5.35

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.):** The outcome of that meeting was:- suggestions came from all the Chief Ministers, that substantial amount has to be provided by the Government of India. The State Governments can take help from this amount. Freedom should be given to the State. Flexibility should be kept. And, in that meeting it was decided to provide Rs. 25,000 crores. And a new scheme has also been introduced, Rashtriya Krishi Vikas Yojana (RKVY), and money has been provided to the State with a guideline that whatever Budgetary provision will be made by every State for agriculture, an equivalent amount will be

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

provided by the Government of India, whether it is dairy sector, whether it is poultry sector, whether it is fishery sector, whether it is crop sector, or whether it is agro-processing sector. I am glad to inform this august House that most of the States have taken a lot of interest in this. What we have seen is substantial improvement in the production and productivity of wheat and rice in the last two years. Credit goes to efforts which the State Governments have made, and, to the policies which have been introduced by the Government of India. Another major programme was started, 'Food Security Mission'. In fact, there was a requirement of paying special attention to rice, wheat, pulses and oilseeds. Rs. 5000 crores have been provided and a definite target has been fixed that such and such quantity has to be produced in such and such time. Most of the States have taken advantage of this Scheme; particularly, they have concentrated in the area of paddy and wheat and we have got good results. If we have to give strength to agriculture, we have to see how farmers will get a better price and what are the new areas where there are tremendous opportunities. One important scheme has been introduced 'the National Horticultural Mission', and, practically, every year, 3000 crores have been provided. In the last four years, our experience is, a substantial new area has come under the horticulture, and, I am confident in another five to six years' time, India will be one of the major horticulture producing countries in the world. Of course, we have to make many other efforts. We have to see how we will be able to set up more agro-processing industries. We have to see how we will be able to improve cold chain and other facilities. We have to see how we will be able to enter in the international market, and, ultimately, price

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

will come to the villages. That particular section has been looked after by the agro-processing Ministry. The House is fully aware about some of the other important decisions that have been taken. One of the major decisions, which this Government has taken, is about loan waiver. In fact, about five years back, the Government has taken a decision to improve the agricultural credit. About five years back, the total agricultural credit which was provided -- crop loan particularly -- was somewhat near to Rs. 82,000 crores. It was decided to see that in three years time there should be a substantial jump. I am happy to inform the House that this year, we have reached somewhat near to Rs. three lakh crores. That type of amount has been provided as a crop loan to the farming community of this country. While we had gone in details about the scheme of loan waiver, our observation was, from Rs. 82,000 crores, we have reached, in the next year to Rs. 1,20,000 crores. In the second year, we have reached to Rs. two lakhs crores. In the third year, we have reached to Rs. two lakh and 60 to 65 lakh crores.

(Contd. by NBR/3N)

-SSS/NBR-PSV/3n/5.40.

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.):** But, one observation is, there was a sizeable section among the farming community which is not in a position to get any benefit from this new effort or approach. The reason is: This section was a defaulter. So, unless and until we remove that anomaly, we will not be able to bring them under this new direction or path which has been opened for them and from where they can get some money either through co-operative institutions or nationalised banks or other banks to invest in agriculture sector. There was a demand that this

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

particular scheme has to be introduced for each and every farmer. But, Sir, the financial burden was quite high. That is why it was not possible. There was a complaint from one of our colleagues from Punjab. So, ultimately, a decision was been taken only for marginal and small farmers. Why only a decision has been taken for small and marginal farmers? In fact, I would have been happy if the Government is in a position to take a decision which will help each and every farmers of this country. But, there was financial limitation. Ultimately, why we took this decision for the marginal and small farmers? It is because 82 per cent of farmers in this country have below 5 acres or 2 hectares of agricultural land. If this decision is applicable to 82 per cent of farming community of this country, I think, at least, a sizeable section will be out from debt trap. That is the reason why the Government took a decision. Sir, even though there is a provision of an amount of Rs. 71,000 crores for debt weaver, the money so far spent is nearly Rs. 67,000 crores. This is one of the important decisions implemented, practically, within one year. I have seen there is a tremendous change. This section, which was not getting any financial support from either co-operative sector or the banking sector, now will get money and this section is in a position to invest in his filed. I am sure, we will see, ultimately, the result. This is an important decision which this Government has taken.

Sir, one issue is always discussed and it is regarding rate of interest. I recollect, many a time, on many occasions, some of the hon. Members have raised the issue that if anybody wants to buy a Maruti car, he is in a position to get loan at 8 per cent rate of interest. If farmer wants to take loan and invest it in his farm, he has to pay 12 per

cent or 13 per cent interest. During the NDA regime, it was brought down from 12 per cent. During the UPA regime, it was brought down further up to 7 per cent. In this year's Budget, all of us are aware, the Government has given another one per cent incentive to those who pays regularly. So, ultimately, it has reached to somewhat 6 per cent. In fact, I will be happy if this is reduced to 4 per cent. But, one should not forget that we came down from 12 per cent to 6 per cent. And, I am confident, in another three years, we will be able to reach to 4 per cent. And, that is also one of the important decisions this Government has taken.

Sir, Shanta Kumar has said a very vital point that we have neglected irrigation. It is true that a substantial investment was not made in the irrigation sector. In fact, I would say that it is the responsibility of the State Governments. The Government of India never take this responsibility. But, a few years ago, a conscious decision was taken by the Government of India that, at least, to expedite those projects which are at a stage where if we provide some money or financial support, probably, those projects would be completed within one or two years and additional irrigation potential could be added. For this purpose, Sir, a new scheme was introduced and this scheme is known as Accelerated Irrigation Development Programme. I think, this year more than Rs. 10,000 was provided and this is a sort of support to the State Governments which are spending substantial money in the irrigation sector.

(CONTD. BY PK "30")

PK/3O/5.45

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.):** There is a new scheme, which has been discussed in the House on many occasions, that is, NREGA. Some Members said that because of NREGA, it has become difficult for the farmers to get somebody to work in their fields. There might be some problem in certain areas, but what I am observing is that NREGA will prove to be a very useful scheme for improving production and productivity because thrust in the NREGA is on water conservation, watershed development, minor irrigation tanks, percolation tanks, etc. Ultimately, these types of projects will improve the sub-soil water level and that will, ultimately, be a sort of support to the agriculture. Today, about 40 per cent of our agricultural land is irrigated. It fulfils 60 per cent requirement of the foodgrains in the country. The rest of 60 per cent of our land is dependent on erratic monsoon. Unless and until, substantial investment is made in the area of water conservation, we will not be able to get good results in the area of production and productivity. I am sure, it is NREGA, where more than about Rs.30,000 crores have been provided, which will be a very useful scheme for the overall development of the agriculture. Why I am saying all these things is to show you that we are not neglecting agriculture. We want to pay more attention to it. We want to provide more money for it and we are going in that direction. That is the reason that in the last few years, the Indian farmers have, successfully, produced maximum quantity of wheat and rice. Though everybody is worried about monsoon, the overall atmosphere of the country is somewhat different, our godowns and warehouses are in a good position. I can tell this House, and through

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

this House to the people of India, that there is a sufficient stock of wheat and rice available in Indian warehouses for the next 13 months. ..(Interruptions).. The Government is very concerned about the rising prices, particularly, food items. Before I go to the dynamics of inflation, there are certain points that I would like to place before the House. For the past two years, there have been certain developments in the farm sector, which are often glossed over. There has been a quantum jump in the MSP. The farmers are getting better prices. They are empowered and are able to make informed decisions on the timings and pricing of their produce. They have also made informed decision on the next crop to be cultivated. They are finally getting their dues. I am not belittling the issue of rising prices, I am only drawing the attention of the House that if the higher prices percolate to the farmers, it could have positive impact on food production and galvanise agriculture into engine of growth of employment. While I shall go into the details of the issue of the food inflation, I would like you to keep this backdrop in mind. I shall, briefly, mention the overall background of the influential places in our economy as well as anti-inflationary measures the Government has been taking in this regard. The world food situation is, currently, being rapidly redefined by the new divine forces -- income group, climate change, high energy prices, globalisation and urbanisation are transferring food conservation production in market. We cannot just bypass all these issues, but, practically, the whole world is suffering. Hon. Members are aware that on the inflation front, we have passed through a very difficult time. In fact, we have seen, about two years back what type of a situation was created in Gulf area. Suddenly, the



prices of petroleum products, which created a serious situation not only in India, but, practically, all over the world, in most of the developing countries, went up.

(Contd. by 3P/PB)

PB/3p/5.50

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.):** But we have successfully overcome that situation. We have seen the prices of edible oil. That was just like crude oil. I recollect, about two years back, in the United States of America, there was a trend to divert some of the oilseeds for ethanol, divert corn for ethanol and that had jumped the oilseed prices, edible oil prices and maize prices all over the world. We have seen that type of situation. But, now, the situation is improving. In fact, when we discuss the prices of foodgrains, we have to see that one of the important items, which concerns each and every citizen of this country is the prices of rice and wheat. As I said, the hon. Members are fully aware, that in the second successive year, we have a record production of foodgrains, totalling 233.88 million tonnes, which is estimated to surpass the previous year. Why? We have also made a record procurement of wheat and rice. In the current year, the procurement has already surpassed the procurement of last year. Sir, 25.23 million tonnes of wheat and 31.91 million tonnes of rice have been procured as on the 24<sup>th</sup> of last month, and the prices of wheat and rice are reasonably stable. In fact, one hon. Member said that the price of rice in Delhi and in some other places has gone to Rs. 40 per kg. I don't see that. In fact, I got this list of retail prices of the selective essential commodities in Delhi. For instance, one year back, the retail price of rice, in Delhi,

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

was Rs. 20 per kg, and, on the 20<sup>th</sup> of last month, it was Rs. 21. In fact, there is not too much change. Some of the varieties, which are exceptional varieties like Basmati or some other varieties, which are popular in Andhra and some other States, are, naturally, more expensive. But as far as the average rice variety is concerned, I don't feel, there is too much change in the prices. The price level is quite stable as far as rice is concerned. Similar is the situation about wheat. About one year back, exactly one year back, the per kilogram price of wheat was Rs. 13, and, today, it is the same Rs. 13 in Delhi markets, the retail price. Practically, for the whole year, it remained the same, i.e., Rs. 13. There might be some change in Trivandrum or Chennai. But that was just because of the transport cost, the additional transport cost and beyond that, it was nothing. So, we have successfully managed to maintain, at a particular level, the overall prices of wheat and rice. There are some other items like edible oil. In fact, India is not self-sufficient in some of the agricultural commodities and, particularly, in edible oil and pulses. We practically import about 40 per cent of our requirement of edible oil. We import from Indonesia; we import from Malaysia, and we also import from some other countries. We also need to import to augment the domestic stock to strengthen the food security and hence India cannot remain immune to global price situation.

(Contd. by 3q/SKC)

3q/5.55/skc

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (Contd.):** Yet, we have been able to lessen the impact of the international prices owing to timely policy decisions taken by the Government. Currently, in the international market, prices of

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

edible oil, as on 30<sup>th</sup> July, are lower than that compared to last year. The price of crude palm oil has declined by 37.76 per cent to US \$ 610 per tonne fob; soyabean oil, by 43 per cent, that is to US \$ 72 per tonne fob; and sunflower oil, by 46.69 per cent to US \$ 725 per tonne fob, and RVG palm oil, by 36 per cent. In the domestic market also, the wholesale prices of edible oil declined in the same period. In the case of soyabean oil, it came down by 31.58 per cent, that is, Rs. 3900 per quintal; sunflower oil, by 33.33 per cent, that is, Rs. 4500 per quintal and RVG palm oil, by 30 per cent. So, the situation in the case of edible oil is not that bad. There are some other items... (Interruptions)

**SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE:** Sir, there is a rise of two per cent in just one week in... (Interruptions) How can crude prices... (Interruptions)

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Sir, none of these things is...(Interruptions)

**SHRI MATILAL SARKAR:** Sir, prices of all commodities have increased. (Interruptions)

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Sir, are we living in two countries? (Interruptions)

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR:** No, we are living in the same country. (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Please, listen... (Interruptions) Please, hear him out. Don't talk in between... (Interruptions)

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR:** There are two areas... (Interruptions)

**SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE:** Sir, all prices have gone up. (Interruptions) We cannot agree to that. (Interruptions)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Sir, he is saying there is no price rise. How is that? ... (Interruptions)

**SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE:** Sir, the Minister has been referring to... (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Please listen. (Interruptions) What can I do if all of you stand up? (Interruptions) Please allow him to complete. (Interruptions) Let him complete. (Interruptions) Let him complete. Brindaji, let him complete. (Interruptions) Please, let the Minister complete. (Interruptions)

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR:** I am ready to answer... (Interruptions)

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** The hon. Minister should tell us the shop number also! (Interruptions) Give us the address of the shop and name of the bazaar... (Interruptions)

**SHRI M. VENKAI AH NAIDU:** Please tell us which shop... (Interruptions)

**SHRI D. RAJA:** Sir, allow me a minute. (Interruptions)

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR:** Hon. Mr. Raja, I shall reply... (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** All of you may please take your seats. (Interruptions) Please, take your seats. Please resume your seats. Let the Minister complete the speech. Please. (Interruptions) Brindaji, please, take your seat. (Interruptions) Please, allow him to complete.

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR:** There are two areas.. (Interruptions) I have not yet finished, Mr. Raja. I shall reply to you... (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please, take your seats. (Interruptions) If all of you talk simultaneously, what can I do? (Interruptions) Please take your seats. (Interruptions)

**SHRI MATILAL SARKAR:** There is no control over prices. (Interruptions)

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** There is no price rise at all according to the Minister... (Interruptions) There is no price rise... (Interruptions)

**SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE:** We would like to walk out... (Interruptions)

**(At this stage, some hon. Members left the Chamber.)**

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** Please, take your seats. I can allow you to seek clarifications. (Interruptions) I would allow you to seek clarifications after the Minister's reply. (Interruptions) Please. (Interruptions)

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** I would like to know from the Minister... (Interruptions) 103 rupees per kilo. This is what the... (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Let him complete his speech. (Interruptions) I will allow you to seek clarifications. (Interruptions)

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Where are all these rates available? Let him.. (Interruptions) He is giving a wrong impression... (Interruptions)

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Sir, we have been patient and we heard the Minister also. (Interruptions)

**DR. V. MAITREYAN:** Sir, it is not available...(Interruptions) We are also walking out.

**(At this stage, some hon. Members left the Chamber.)**

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Let him complete the speech. Allow him to complete the speech. (Interruptions) Why don't you listen to him? After the Minister has replied, I shall allow you to seek clarifications. (Interruptions)

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR:** Let me reply. (Interruptions)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Sir, the issue is very much concerned... (Interruptions) Sir, we have been patient. But he must guide us to the shop where these are available... (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):** For that you have to be calm; you must be seated. (Interruptions) Allow him to guide you. (Interruptions)

**SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR:** We have heard him for half-an-hour. He is adding to the... (Interruptions)

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** Neither the hon. Finance Minister's nor the Agriculture Minister's reply is anywhere near the truth or the situation. The entire country is disappointed. There is a Government ad which says oil is priced at Rs. 103?

(Contd. at 3r by ksk)

KSK/NB/6.00/3R

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (CONTD):** And, the hon. Minister is saying that prices are under control...(Interruptions).

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR:** I just said about the groundnut, mustard and *Vanaspati*...(Interruptions).

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, he is totally misguiding and misleading the House...(Interruptions).

**(At this stage, some hon. Members left the Chamber)**

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please, take your seats.

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR:** There are two areas where the situation is serious. One is sugar and the second is pulses. I accept that the as far as prices of pulses are concerned, particularly in case of *tur dal, urad dal, moong dal* and *masoor dal*, the situation is not very comfortable. In

fact, it is affecting each and every family of this country. We are quite worried and we have taken certain steps and we would like to take some more steps, which I will elaborate.

Second issue is about sugar. In fact, two years back, the country's situation about sugar was altogether different. Domestic sugar production this year is expected to be somewhat near to 150 lakh tonnes. In the year 2007-08, it was 264 lakh tonnes, that is, the final estimate. What was the situation this year? This year, the total production is somewhat near to 150 lakh tonnes, and if we add last year's carry forward stock in the country, that is somewhat near to hundred lakh tonnes. So, the total comes to 250 lakh tonnes. And, the domestic yearly demand is somewhat near to 225-230 lakh tonnes. In fact, the plantation of sugarcane this year and in the last season, as compared to two years back, is definitely less. Reasons are many. One of the reasons is that about two-three years back, there was too much production in our country, and because of too much production, prices dropped like anything. The farmer was getting somewhat near to Rs.650 to Rs.850, or a maximum of Rs.1000, per tonne price for sugarcane. So, that was not viable at all. In such a situation, sizeable section of the farming community, who were involved in sugarcane production, decided to shift from sugarcane to another area, particularly in U.P. and Northern India where lot of farmers have shifted from sugarcane to wheat. We have seen that wheat production has substantially improved and one of the reasons is that this Government has taken a conscious decision to provide Rs.1080 per quintal price for wheat. In fact, when the NDA Government was in power, the price of wheat was Rs.540 per

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

quintal. Within four years, from Rs.540, we have gone to Rs.1080. That is the reason that farmer has shifted to wheat and its production has increased substantially. But, that has affected sugarcane production and sugar production. And, this is happening not only in India; unfortunately, this year, globally, sugar production has been dropped and prices have been rising. They are going up like anything. In fact, I recollect, in this House, about three years back, when there was a discussion on the sugar prices, some hon. Members were insisting that prices should go further down and I made a statement, which is part of the record, that unless and until the prices of sugar reached to somewhat Rs.22 to Rs.23 per kilogram, farmer would not go in for sugarcane plantation, and if we were continuously taking actions where prices of sugar would come below Rs.12, Rs.13 and Rs.14, and the prices of sugarcane would come below Rs.1000, definitely, you would see, in two years' time, prices of sugar would go to Rs.30 to Rs.35.

(continued by 3s - sk)

3S/6.05/SK

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.):** That I briefed in this House about three years back. Exactly the same situation we are observing today.

There is one more problem this year that we are facing. As per out latest information, as compared to last year, the area under sugarcane production is little more. But, I am worried about productivity tonnage. One of the reasons for that is insufficient rain. India's major sugar-producing or number one State is UP. We have seen that UP Government has declared drought in about 48 districts or 49 districts. There is insufficient rain in UP. The second major sugar-producing State



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

is Maharashtra. Sufficient water is not there also. Farmers are not showing interest to go to the sugarcane plantation because they are worried about monsoon. But still some plantation is going on. Fortunately, there is good plantation in Karnataka, Tamil Nadu and Gujarat. That is the reason why I say there is more area under sugarcane production as compared to the last year. But still we have to keep a close eye on the situation.

We have taken many decisions just to improve the availability of sugar in this country. This year we have given better prices to sugarcane farmers. Number two, we have allowed duty free import of raw sugar. Why raw sugar? Because we want optimum capacity utilisation of Indian sugar industry and sugar mills also. So, they can now import raw sugar and process it here. We have not put any restriction on that. Let them make it available in the market. We have given this opportunity to all the sugar mills in this country. There are many sugar mills which are now importing raw sugar from Brazil and some other countries. They will be able to process it and make it available in the country.

I was not very happy to take one decision, but we have taken that that decision also. We have allowed our PSUs to import fine sugar, initially at one million tonne. That process has also started.

So, we are importing fine sugar; we are importing raw sugar; we are encouraging domestic farmers to grow more sugarcane; we are providing more prices to the farmers as compared to last year. Last year it was at 81 rupees per quintal. This year we have provided 107 rupees 30 paise or 40 paise per quintal. I am sure, farmer will get good

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

prices, and if there is a sufficient rain, he will definitely go for plantation of sugarcane and the situation may change. But it will not change within one year. It will take time because ultimately sugar is a yearly perennial crop. It will take one year or more than one year to get the final results.

Regarding pulses, as I said pulses are one of the major crops that are affecting us. India is the largest producer as well as the largest consumer of the pulses in the world. India has been a net importer of the pulses due to mismatch between domestic supply and demand of the pulses. Domestic production of the pulses has been around 14 to 14.5 million tonne during the last three years and the demand for the pulses is somewhat near to 17 million tonne. So, our production is 14 to 14.5 million tonnes and our demand is 17 to 18 million tonne. So, there is a gap between demand and supply of about 3.5 to 4 million tonne. The gap between demand and supply is filled by import of different varieties of pulses from different countries, depending upon the availability. In view of the limited source of availability of different varieties of pulses in the international market, domestic prices fluctuate.

(Contd. by yrsr-3t)

-SK/YSR/6.10/3T

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.):** Last year and this year also, what we have seen is that among pulses, production of two crops have been affected. One is *Tur* and the other is *Urad*. And a little bit of *Moong*. Also *jowar*. Unfortunately, these two crops, *Urad* and *Tur*, had been affected last year not just in India. The availability of *Tur* in international market was also limited. In fact, in the global market, the total

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

availability of pulses was, I think, about 5.5 million tonnes. India alone had procured 2.5 million tonnes. Fifty per cent of the pulses available in the international market have been bought by India. We tried to make it available in India. Still there is a gap and that is the reason why the prices are going up.

But there is one good thing this year. All of us here are worried about monsoon. All of us here are worried about the area under rice cultivation. But, this year, our observation, based on the reports from all the States, is that the area under pulses cultivation has substantially increased, particularly that of *Tur*. If we get good crop, I think, within a few months, the situation will be changed altogether.

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** Sir, what about prices?

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR:** We have given extremely good MSP and that is the reason why we are suddenly seeing more area under pulses cultivation.

We had taken some other decisions also. Firstly, when availability is a problem, we have taken a decision to remove all restrictions on import of pulses. Practically, there is no tax on it. It is allowed for anybody in the private sector. We instructed all our major PSUs to import. So, they have also imported it. PSUs, particularly STC, PEC, MMTC and NAFED have been allowed to import pulses. The Government has taken a conscious decision to support them even if they lose some money. For losses up to 15 per cent, the responsibility is taken by the Government of India, and for service charge, of about 1.5 per cent value of the operation.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

Under the scheme, in 2008-09, more than nine lakh tonnes of pulses have been imported. Out of that, eight lakh tonnes were disposed of and about one lakh tonne is available as on 29<sup>th</sup> of the last month.

We have also introduced one scheme. Under the scheme for distribution of pulses, a subsidy of Rs. ten per kg is given for imported pulses distributed through the Public Distribution System. Initially, 16 States have applied for it. They have shown willingness to accept the scheme. We have imported not directly from Government's account, but we told the PSUs that they should import and supply them to various Governments.

Ultimately, four States came forward. They are: West Bengal, Tamil Nadu, Kerala, and Madhya Pradesh. They have taken the responsibility to make available these pulses through the Public Distribution System in their own States.

Recently, my attention was drawn to a report on a television channel alleging rotting of huge stocks of imported pulses. In fact, one hon. Member has also raised this particular subject here. I have taken report from all the PSUs and found that this was factually not correct. As per the reports given by the PSUs, the unsold stock with them is 1.27 lakh tonnes of pulses of which yellow peas and dun peas account for 1.9 lakh tonnes or 74 per cent of the total unsold stock as on 29<sup>th</sup> July 2009.

Despite their higher availability at cheaper prices, the State Governments are reluctant to distribute yellow peas through the Public Distribution System.

(Contd. By VKK/3U)

-YSR/VKK/3u/6.15

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.):** There is no demand for yellow peas. This organisation has imported substantial quantity of the yellow peas. In fact, there is a demand in certain areas for yellow peas. But, States are not accepting yellow peas and that is the reason, particular quantity is still with them. There were reports that large quantity of imported pulses was lying uncleared in Kolkata port. I have the report from the PSU that there was a problem in Customs clearance in Kolkata port for the last two months. This has since been resolved and stocks are being cleared regularly. So, that is not the issue today.

In fact, I am very happy that some of the States are now taking lot of initiatives. The Delhi Government has taken a decision. They have provided subsidy. They have started distribution of pulses through the public distribution system. The Andhra Pradesh Government has taken that decision. Yesterday only, the Civil Supplies Minister from Maharashtra contacted me and said that they have also taken a decision in their Cabinet to provide pulses through public distribution system. Whatever additional price will have to be paid, they will pay from the Government side and they will make available comparatively cheaper pulses through PDS to all sections -- whether it is AAY, BPL or APL. I am sure, each and every State is going to take initiatives like these so that probably, those who are practically affected by high prices will get some relief. It is my appeal to all the State Governments that as the Government of India is discharging its responsibility, similarly, in such a situation, they should also take certain responsibility and try to protect the interests of vulnerable sections of the society.

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

Sir, there are certain issues which were raised today in the discussion and certain demands were also made. In fact, these Members are not here. There was one suggestion, particularly from an hon. Member from Kerala. Regularly, whenever they get the opportunity, they always try to raise this issue as to why universalization of TPDS is not feasible and why are we not taking it up. In fact, in 1996, the Government of India took the decision to introduce targeted PDS. Instead of providing cheaper foodgrains to every section of the society, let us concentrate on the poorest people, those who come under the BPL and provide them 35 kilograms on a particular rate, and we should also provide for those who are Above Poverty Line at a subsidized rate, but, according to our stock position. So, this scheme has been introduced in June 1997 and this scheme is continuing till today. At present, under TPDS, the level of food subsidy is 78 per cent and 88 per cent on wheat and rice for AAY category. It is 72 per cent and 70 per cent on wheat and rice for BPL category. It is 60 per cent and 56 per cent on wheat and rice which is supplied to APL category. So, we are already supplying this.

**(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.)**

Sir, one of the important things is, till today, we have not changed the price which was fixed nine years back for PDS. Though we have substantially improved the Minimum Support Price for the farmers, yet, we have not changed the issue price for BPL and AAY since last nine years because this Government feels that these vulnerable sections have a right to get foodgrains at a cheaper rate. That is why, that decision has been taken by the Government of India and that subsidy version has

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

gone somewhat from Rs.50,000 to Rs.55,000 crores which the Government of India has borne. It is possible to take such huge burden for only that section which is weaker, in the true sense. And, that is the reason why, this targeted PDS has been introduced and implemented for that section.

(Contd. by TMV/3w)

-VKK-TMV-MCM/3W/6.20

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.):** It is not possible to implement the scheme for each and every section of the society. That will be a substantial financial burden and that burden the Government of India is not able to take upon itself as of today.

There is also another complaint that allocation of foodgrains to the States under TPDS has been reduced. That is not correct. Each and every State is getting under BPL and AAY categories 35 kgs. per family per month and that is issued everywhere. The expected number of the BPL family, which has been given by the Planning Commission, is 6.52 crores, that is, 30%-35% of the total population. There is no reduction in the allocation for the BPL and AAY categories in the States and the UTs.

There is another complaint that we are not giving anything to the APL category at all. That is also not correct. In fact, the APL allocation during the year 2009-10 is 172 lakh tonnes. Previously it was 112 lakh tonnes. We have enhanced it and we are providing, at least, 10 kgs. per APL family per month. The States which are taking advantage of it are definitely getting this type of allocation which we are regularly sending to them. So, this was also one of the important issues

which were raised here. I tried to give a little more information about that.

One of the important issues raised by a few hon. Members was about futures trading and the rise in the prices of essential commodities was the effect of futures trading. In fact, I appreciate the concern of the hon. Members about the possibility of futures trading spawning excessive speculation and thereby causing price rise. The fact shows that this has not been the case in our country. There is no futures trading in urad and tur since January, 2007. It has been suspended. But the prices of these commodities are showing a sharp increase even today, though urad and tur are not traded in futures. Then, why are the prices going up? The prices are going up because there is a mismatch between demand and supply. Future trading is not responsible for it. This is the observation. As against, this, there is futures trading in gram. Year on year, change of prices of gram was negative. It was minus 6.8 per cent in 2008-09 and minus 3.1 per cent as on 18<sup>th</sup> July, 2009. The futures trading in wheat has been restarted recently. The prices of wheat are stable. There was a modest increase of 4.53 per cent in 2008-09 and 1.6 per cent this year. One of the reasons is that we have given better MSP. We have increased the MSP from Rs.640 to Rs.1,000 to Rs.1,080 per quintal. In fact, the price in futures trading is hardly 1.6 per cent. So, the conclusion which some of the hon. Members have drawn here is that futures trading is responsible. I am afraid, it is very difficult to reach that conclusion after going through the explanations that have been given.



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

In fact, we had appointed an Expert Committee to examine these issues. The Committee was appointed under the Chairmanship of the Planning Commission Member, Prof. Abhijit Sen, to examine whether the futures market was responsible for the rise in the prices of essential commodities. The Committee in its report acknowledged the fact that the futures market provide a platform for price discovery and price risk management, and the farmers would be benefited from this economic functions of the market. The Committee analysed the daily, weekly and monthly data on the price volatility, that is, spot price. The analysis made by the Expert Committee led it to conclude as follows.

(Contd. by 3X/VK)

VK/3X/6.25

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD):** "Given these conflicting results from daily, as against weekly and monthly data, no strong conclusion can be drawn on whether introduction of the futures trade is associated with decrease or increase of the spot price volatility. The Committee also analysed annual growth rate in the prices of sensitive commodities in pre-future period and post-future period and concluded that although inflation clearly increased post-futures in some of the sensitive commodities that have higher weight in consumer price indices, it is not possible to make any general claim that inflation accelerated more in commodities with futures trading."

Another issue was raised here about the volume of trade. I would like to mention that high volume of futures trade in commodities indicates the robustness of the market and should not be of much concern if the market is well regulated. It is true that futures trade value

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

has grown from Rs. 21.55 lakh crores to Rs. 52.49 lakh crores, from 2005-06 to 2008-09, but in respect of the agriculture commodities, there has been virtually no increase. Whatever is the gain of the increase that we have seen that is in other areas, that is, gold, silver, other metal, crude oil and natural gas. That is why one should not be worried about all these things.

Last point, which was raised by some of the hon. Members, was about the action taken under the Essential Commodities Act, 1955 to check the price rise and hoarding of the essential commodities. At present, there are 18 States and UTs which have issued orders imposing stock limits/licensing/stock declaration requirements for the essential commodities for which the Government of India has issued orders permitting the issue of such restrictions. These commodities are pulses, rice, paddy, edible oil, edible oilseeds and sugar. In the case of pulses, 13 States have issued orders imposing stock limits and another four have imposed licensing/stock declaration requirements. The Prevention of Black Marketing and Maintenance of Supplies of Essential Commodities Act, 1980, gives powers to the State Governments to detain persons up to six months if it is found that they could act in manner prejudicial to the Maintenance of Supplies of Essential Commodities Act. During the calendar year 2008, the States have detained 162 persons. These actions also help to keep in check the prices of essential commodities. My Ministry has been writing to the State Governments, from time to time, on the need for strong enforcement of these statutory provisions. As the august House is aware, these powers under EC Act have already been delegated to

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

the State Governments for effective implementation as per local conditions. We are also meeting with the State Government representatives on 8<sup>th</sup> August to discuss the situation along with various issues arising out of the current status of the monsoon. In this meeting, we would also be emphasising the importance of these regulations and the need for fully utilising the powers that are available with the State Governments today.

So far as the overall price situation is concerned, the situation is serious. But the Government of India is taking various steps. The Government of India is trying to augment the stock. The Government of India is trying to make availability of some of the items like pulses and sugar in open market. The Government of India has, practically, introduced a policy in regard to easy imports from anywhere in the world and also some financial support through the Public Distribution System. My request and appeal to the State Governments is, this is a different situation. Unless the State Governments and the Central Government come together and act collectively to protect the interest of the weaker sections of the society, those who are affected because of these higher prices, it will be difficult to improve the overall situation. I am sure the way the State Governments are taking initiatives, probably we will be able to improve the situation.

(Contd. by 3Y)

RG/6.30/3Y

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (contd.):** We are only worried about the overall situation of the monsoon. I am sure, if the months of August and September go well, we will see a different situation. This is a part of the

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

time of test. I am sure, this Government will waste no efforts to protect the interests of the affected people. With these words, I conclude. Thank you, Sir.

**SHRI ARJUN KUMAR SENGUPTA (WEST BENGAL):** Would the hon. Minister consider re-introducing the Commodity Transaction Tax which he had withdrawn during the Budget?

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR:** Sir, as far as introduction of new taxes is concerned, I am not the right person to say about taxation. But we will give a serious thought to this.

(Ends)

### **MESSAGE FROM LOK SABHA**

#### **THE METRO RAILWAYS (AMENDMENT) BILL, 2009**

**SECRETARY-GENERAL:** Sir, I have to report to the House the following message received from the Lok Sabha, signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha:-

"In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the Metro Railways (Amendment) Bill, 2009, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 6<sup>th</sup> August, 2009.

Sir, I lay a copy of the Bill on the Table.

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, we will take up clarifications on the statement made by the Minister regarding import of raw and white/refine sugar. Shri Santosh Bagrodia.

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009

**CLARIFICATIONS ON STATEMENT REGARDING IMPORT OF RAW  
AND WHITE/REFINE SUGAR**

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA (RAJASTHAN):** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, the hon. Minister...(Interruptions)

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, when are we taking up the Short Duration Discussion on education?

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** We will take it after this...

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** We can have it tomorrow.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Ahluwalia, it was made very clear yesterday...(Interruptions)

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** Let us finish this first...(Interruptions)

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** There should be no problem tomorrow. We have only the Metro Railways Bill. The Rubber Bill is not coming...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please listen to me. Tomorrow, we have to take up all the pending Zero Hour Mentions because since the last two or three days, we have been having Calling Attention Motions. So, the whole of the morning will go for this. Of course, a decision has to be taken by the Chairman whether the Private Members' Bill has to be dispensed with or not. Then, we have the Metro Railways Bill, and we also have the farewell speech for some of the Members who are retiring. Then, our usual valedictory remarks and the singing of Vande mataram. So, time has to be fixed...(Interruptions)

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** So, fix up a time for it tomorrow, Sir. That is exactly my point.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Ahluwalia, my only request is, when we took a decision yesterday...(Interruptions)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** At the fag end of the day, at 6.30 p.m., how can we discuss it?

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Let me remind the House that it was decided yesterday that the House would not adjourn till we completed the last item on the agenda. That is what was agreed upon. Now, it is for the House to decide.

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** That is why I am requesting the House...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Let this clarification be over....(Interruptions)  
I am sure you want the subject to be discussed.

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** We are all concerned about the price of sugar.

**श्री उपसभापति :** आपका ही नहीं है, दूसरे मैम्बर्स भी हैं। ...(ब्यवधान)....

**MISS MABEL REBELLO:** Sir, there is a lecture by Shri Rangarajan at 6.30 p.m. We want to attend that lecture.

**SHRI RUDRA NARAYAN PANY:** We support you.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** So, you don't want the discussion on education, is it?

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** Sir, we are on the question of clarifications at the moment. Let us take up the clarifications.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** When the Lok Sabha can sit up to 10 o'clock, then, why should we not?

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** Those who want to go for the lecture can go and attend it...(Interruptions) The House is guided by the discussion by Members, not by the lecture...(Interruptions)

**MISS MABEL REBELLO:** The Minister has answered all the issues.

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** He has not answered at all on the sugar issue.

(Continued by 3Z)

3z/6.35/ks-lp

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** He has not at all replied on the sugar issue.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please. (Interruptions) You see, let the House decide whether we should finish the agenda or not. That is a different thing. But one thing is... (Interruptions)

**SHRI D. RAJA:** Education next time, Sir. (Interruptions)

**MS. MABEL REBELLO:** Education tomorrow. (Interruptions)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Then, certain Members should give notice...

**THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRI KAPIL SIBAL):** He said education next time, Sir. (Interruptions)

**SHRI D. RAJA:** Yes, next time, Sir.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** It is not for the Chair, Mr. Raja. (Interruptions) First, you people force us to include all the subjects and we accommodate all that and, then, you ask us to...

**SHRI D. RAJA:** Sir, we are keen on discussing it. But, seeing the atmosphere, I am saying this; there has to be a better atmosphere. Take it up next time, not now. That is what I am saying.

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** Are you talking about education or sugar?

**SHRI D. RAJA:** Education. (Interruptions)

**श्री उपसभापति :** तो क्लैरिफिकेशन्स तो पूछो भई।

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA (RAJASTHAN):** Sir, it is very well understood that prices depend on demand and supply. The hon. Minister has himself said that, this year, supply of sugar will be about 43 per cent less. I would like to give small information here. In 2003-04, the average sugar price was Rs.1271 per quintal whereas the production was 139.95 lakh tonnes. Now, in 2005-06, it is 192.67; in 2006-07, 283.28; it is 263.28. Now, the hon. Minister has just mentioned that 100 lakh tonnes of sugar was in stock; the demand is 230 lakh tonnes; the total production is 150 lakh tonnes. Where is the security? In view of this, I want to make a few suggestions quickly. He has mentioned a limit on import of ten lakh tonnes. Ten lakh tonnes of sugar import is neither here nor there. If you want to have the sugar stock, you should give complete freedom; let any amount of sugar come into the country because, today, when the price of sugar is Rs.25 or Rs.26 per kilogram, we can also stop it.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** This is not a clarification.

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** I am suggesting, Sir.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No suggestions. You should seek clarifications.

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:** That is the clarification I want. He has mentioned ten lakh tonnes. I say I don't want ten lakh tonnes. I want to know whether he would like to increase it. He has talked about the quantity here. He should make it unlimited. Another thing, Sir, is that this SMP is introduced after the commencement of the season. Why should people produce sugarcane? SMP should be announced before the season; if necessary, even five years' SMP should be announced



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

because sugar production is a long-term thing. Then, the last thing that I want to suggest is that the hon. Minister should constitute a committee, to be headed by an eminent economist, having representatives of following sectors -- farmers, consumers, labour, industry -- to prepare the sugar policy which will remain in place without any change for a minimum of five years. Then, act upon the recommendations of the committee! Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I hope the hon. Minister who knows so much about sugar, will agree that today prices of sugar are very high -- not what he said in the previous discussion that there is no price rise.

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR:** I said price rise.

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Anyway, Sir; price of sugar is Rs.28.50 per kg in the सरकारी भंडार and anywhere between Rs.30 and 35 in the market, depending upon the State in which you are buying sugar. So, today, the bitterest commodity in the market is sugar. Unless the Government wants to make entire India a victim of diabetes so that nobody wants sugar at all, the Government should be thinking of a policy, both short-term and long-term. I believe, Sir, the statement given by the Minister on the issue of import of sugar shows a complete failure of Government policy on this whole question of self-sufficiency in sugar production. As my hon. friend has said, two years earlier, we had so much of sugar that we were exporting.

(Contd. by tdb/4a)

TDB-AKG/4A/6.40

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT (CONTD.):** Two years down the line, we are so low that now we are importing. So, there is obviously something very wrong in the Government's approach and policy. That is helping whom? This is the question. Now, Sir, the first point that I have is this. Why is sugar production low today? Do kisans have something to do with it or not? The first question I want to ask from the hon. Minister is this. What are the arrears of sugarcane farmers in the States? Please don't blame the States, saying this is a State matter; we have nothing to do with it. You have just said how much you are doing for the farmers of this country. Please inform us, at present, because last year, I saw your answer in Parliament, in which you said, something like Rs.1,100 crores arrears for the sugarcane farmers in U.P. That was one answer I saw. You said, Rs.87 crores have been added, in the last three months.

**श्री उपसभापति :** वृंदा जी, आप clarification पूछिए न!

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Sir, this is the clarification because the kisan is not mentioned here. ...(Interruptions)... As though sugar supply has nothing to do with the farmers.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** See, in the garb of seeking clarifications, we again start another debate. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Okay, Sir; my first question is about the farmers. What are the supplies and what are the arrears?

Sir, my second question is this. First, you allowed import of raw sugar in January. And the import of raw sugar in January is going on right up till now. Sir, what I want to know from the hon. Minister is this. What happened to the imported raw sugar; how much of it was

processed; what are the stocks with the industry and how much of it is coming to the market? What my information is, Sir, whether it is right or wrong, I don't know, that there is a sugar scam growing. I don't know; these are some of the reports, which I have got, and the details of which I am giving before the House. It says that import has been done; raw sugar has been processed; and some of the millers and some of the other people involved in this have made a killing in the last six months, but it is not coming to the market. (Time-bell) I don't know whether it is right or wrong.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please conclude.

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Sir, the third thing is this. Sir, let me complete. Now, we are saying we are importing not only raw sugar but also white sugar.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** If clarifications take five minutes, then, what can I do?

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** When we are discussing the import of white sugar, the international price of sugar is hitting a high; it is 494 dollars a tonne, which is almost as much as it was at the peak, two years ago. And, India coming into the market for sugar, obviously, these prices are going to go sky-high. Now, you are importing. You are going to import; the high prices are back into India. That is also very clear. My point with the Government is this. What guarantee is there that in the name of import, what the trade is going to get out of it, because it is OGL, it is free; there are no duties... (Time-bell) So, what the industry is going to get out of it?

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Brindaji, if clarifications take five minutes, how am I to run the House? Please advise me. ...(Interruptions)... Does seeking clarifications take five minutes?

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Sir, what I want to know from the Minister is this. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, this policy ...(Interruptions)...Sir, I am finishing.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You may have questions. But on clarifications, if I go on allowing five minutes, I can't understand.

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Sir, this is my last question. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** If you start a debate, what can I do?

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** What I want to say is this. Does the Government have any intention...(Interruptions)... Sir, the statement does not say anything about it. What can I do, Sir? The statement does not talk about the consumer; it does not talk about the kisan. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, my last question is this. Does the Government have any intention of getting those stocks out in the market so that sugar consumers in this country can benefit?

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You may have points. But you should have participated and said all those things in the debate.

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Can you bring the stocks into market?

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No, no; then I must stop allowing seeking clarifications.

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Will the Government ensure that the cuts in sugar in the PDS...(Interruptions)... In Tripura State, there is no sugar,

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

not one grain of sugar is available in the ration shops there.  
...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Shri Vikram Verma.

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Where will they get sugar?  
...(Interruptions)... So, will the Government ensure that sugar is put in the PDS at reasonable price? ...(Interruptions)...

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Brindaji, time management is very important. We should learn to put our points within a given timeframe. ...(Interruptions)... I am not advising, but time management is very important; otherwise, we cannot run the House.

**श्री विक्रम वर्मा (मध्य प्रदेश) :** माननीय उपसभापति जी, मैं केवल तीन बिन्दुओं पर माननीय मंत्री जी से थोड़ा-सा clarification चाहूँगा। स्टेटमेंट में यह आया है कि 2007-08 में 263 लाख टन चीनी का उत्पादन हुआ था और 2008-09 में 150-155 लाख टन चीनी के उत्पादन का अनुमान है यानी 108 लाख टन चीनी का उत्पादन कम होगा।

(4बी/एससीएच पर जारी)

SCH-KGG/6.45/4B

**श्री विक्रम वर्मा (क्रमागत):** सर, चीनी एक साल की क्रॉप नहीं होती है। माननीय मंत्री जी कृषि मंत्री भी हैं और वह इस बात को जानते हैं कि गन्ने की एक साल की क्रॉप से पूरे दो-तीन साल तक प्रोडक्शन लिया जाता है, चीनी बनाई जाती है। हर साल कितना गन्ना बोया जाता है, इसके फिगर्स भी आ जाते हैं, तब क्या आपको इस बात की जानकारी नहीं थी कि कितना गन्ना बोया जा रहा है? क्या आपका कृषि मंत्रालय राज्यों से इस बात की जानकारी नहीं ले पाया था कि हमारा इस बार का रकबा घट रहा है? रकबे के घटने के कारण क्या परिस्थिति पैदा होगी, क्या उसके बारे में कोई प्रिकॉशन्स लिए गए? रकबा कम क्यों हुआ? वह इसलिए हुआ क्योंकि वास्तव में किसान को उसकी कम कीमत मिली। शुगर जब 13

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

रुपये थी, तब भी आपका सरकारी रेट 88 था और आज जब 30 रुपये हो रही है, तब भी आपका सरकारी रेट 88 है। किसान को गन्ने का कोई लाभ नहीं मिल पा रहा है। मैंने स्वयं इसी कारण 25 बीघे जमीन में पिछले साल गन्ना उखाड़ कर फेंक दिया और उसकी जगह कॉटन चालू कर दिया, क्योंकि गन्ने की कीमत नहीं मिल पा रही थी। जब किसान डायवर्सन कर रहा है, तब क्या आपने प्राइसिज़ के बारे में कुछ सोचा? इस देश में अभी तक गन्ने के बारे में, शुगर की कोई लॉग टर्म पॉलिसी नहीं है। उसका कारण बताएं ... (समय की घंटी)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, Shri D. Raja. ..(Interruptions).

**श्री विक्रम वर्मा:** सर, मेरा सैकेंड क्वेचन यह है, आपने बोला है कि 1 अगस्त 2009 को आपने कच्ची चीनी को शुल्क मुक्त आयात शुरू किया था। आपने देखा होगा कि इसके प्राइसिज़ मार्च-अप्रैल से बढ़ने चालू हो गए थे। जब आपने 1 अगस्त को यह चालू किया था, इससे पहले भी आपके पास रॉ शुगर आ रही थी, तब आखिर आपके यहां कितनी रॉ शुगर आई? उस सारी रॉ शुगर में से कितनी शुगर को रिफाइंड किया गया, कितनी शुगर बाजार में गई और फिर बाकी का क्या किया गया, हमें इस बात की सारी जानकारी नहीं है। यदि रॉ शुगर आया, उसके बाद हमारा अपना प्रोडक्शन और फिर आपने जो आयात किया, इस सब को मिला कर कुल कितना हुआ? उसके बावजूद भी फिर यह कमी क्यों आई ... (व्यवधान)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Shri D. Raja. ..(Interruptions)

**श्री विक्रम वर्मा:** लास्ट में मैं पूछना चाहता हूं, मेरा तीसरा क्वेश्चन यह है कि अब आप फिर इसे दे रहे हैं, इसके लिए आपने जो टाइमिंग दिया है, उसके अनुसार 31 मार्च, 2010 तक आपने इसे निजी व्यापार के लिए खोल दिया है। अब इसमें सफेद चीनी और रॉ चीनी दोनों आएंगे, लेकिन किसान का जो गन्ना आता है, वह नवम्बर से लगकर अप्रैल तक आएगा। यदि यह बाहर की चीनी मिल्स आ कर कहेंगी कि हम रॉ मैटीरियल को रिफाइंड कर रहे हैं, तो उस समय किसान का गन्ना कौन खरीदेगा? क्या तब आप किसान के गन्ने की खरीद की बात को सुनिश्चित करेंगे? इसके लिए आप सदन को एश्योर करें, नहीं तो किसान का गन्ना

खेत में ही खड़ा रहेगा और मिल मालिक कहेंगे कि हमारे पास इम्पोर्टेड चीनी है। इसके कारण किसान का गन्ना बिना बिके रह जाएगा ...(व्यवधान)

**श्री उपसभापति:** अब आप बैठिए, आप बैठिए, प्लीज़ ...(व्यवधान)।

**श्री विक्रम वर्मा:** इस तरह तो एक नया क्राइसिस खड़ा होगा। माननीय मंत्री जी कृपया इन तीनों बिन्दुओं के बारे में बताने का कष्ट करें।

**SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU):** Sir, thank you. Shri Sharad Pawar is a very able and experienced Minister and is looking after Agriculture as well as Food and Civil Supplies. My simple question is, the sugarcane growers are agitating to get a price of Rs.2,000 per tonne for the sugarcane. Even the Agricultural Prices Commission has fixed a price of, I understand, Rs.1,550 per tonne of sugarcane. I do not know what the stand of the Central Government is. It is an urgent issue. In Tamil Nadu, the farmers are agitating. I understand that in several parts, the sugarcane growers are agitating. What is the policy of the Government towards this? Will you consider their demand of Rs.2,000 per tonne for the sugarcane?

(Ends)

**SHRI MATILAL SARKAR (TRIPURA):** Thank you, Sir. I have 2-3 queries. Firstly, the sugarcane production has become less. This reason is not stated by the hon. Minister; I do not know why. The sugarcane producer, the farmer, is moving away from production because he does not get the benefit of the prices and the mill owners also are declining them in many ways. There is no remedy and that is why the production has become less. What would be the policy of the Government to raise production?

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

My second question is, in the Item No.2, the Minister has stated that the Government has now decided to extend the terminal date. The terminal date is being extended. But it is not stated, within the date, the amount they have collected. What is the amount of their import? It is not stated. But they have extended the time. So, I think, there is some hide-and-seeK policy. I am saying hide-and-seeK policy because what you have actually received by import is not mentioned here.

(Contd. by kls/4c)

-KGG/KLS-PSV/4C/6.50

**SHRI MATILAL SARKAR (CONTD):** It is sufficient or not, we cannot know. Third thing is that my State Tripura is suffering seriously from the crisis of sugar. In item No.5, you have extended the time up to 30<sup>th</sup> November. But the Holi Poojas are performed within this period and during this period we are getting additional quota. We are not getting our normal quota what to talk of additional quota. People of the North-Eastern Region, particularly Tripura, are suffering for the last four months because there is no supply. The State Government is compelled to reduce the quantity to ration cardholders. So, this is the situation. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether the situation will be improved and what steps the Government is going to take in this regard. Thank you.

(Ends)

**श्री महेन्द्र मोहन(उत्तर प्रदेश):** उपसभापति महोदय, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहूँगा कि देश में शक्कर की जो कठिनाई है, वह हर तीन-चार साल के बाद आ जाती है। इसके लिए जब तक कोई long term policy नहीं बनाई जाएगी, तब तक शक्कर की



दुविधाओं से हम लोग अलग नहीं हट सकेंगे। यह बहुत short term policy होती है। माननीय मंत्री महोदय ने कहा कि 150 लाख टन शक्कर का प्रोडक्शन हुआ। उनके यह कहते ही शक्कर के दाम बढ़ने शुरू हो गए, जबकि हमारे पास starting में 100 लाख टन शक्कर थी, 150 लाख टन का प्रोडक्शन हो रहा था और 220 लाख टन के करीब हमारे यहाँ consumption होता है, तो कोई ऐसी हालत नहीं थी, जिसके कारण इसके दाम 16 रुपए से बढ़ कर 30 रुपए किलो पहुँचा दिए जाते। लेकिन, इस प्रकार की जानकारी देने के साथ ही हमारी कठिनाई यह हुई कि उन्होंने जो इम्पोर्ट अलाऊ किया, उसमें यह सीमा लगा दी कि इसमें 10 लाख टन ही इम्पोर्ट हो सकता है। उस पर कोई सीमा नहीं होनी चाहिए। बाहर के दाम इतने अधिक हैं कि शक्कर वही मँगाएगा, जो यहाँ पर बेच सकेगा और सही दामों पर बेच सकेगा। लेकिन, इसमें जो असली बात है, जो मुद्दा है, वह यह कि इसकी कमी क्यों होती है? जब तक हम किसानों को गन्ने का पूरा मूल्य नहीं दिलवाएँगे, शक्कर के अन्दर लगभग 73 प्रतिशत जो लागत है, वह गन्ने से आती है, इसलिए जब तक उसको सही मूल्य नहीं मिलेगा, तब तक किसान गन्ना पैदा नहीं करेगा। इसलिए अगर हमें इसे long term के लिए सही करना है कि शक्कर की कमी देश में नहीं हो और आम आदमी को सही दाम पर शक्कर मिले, ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप क्लैरिफिकेशन पूछिए।

**श्री महेन्द्र मोहन:** मैं इनसे यही जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या वह किसानों को गन्ने का सही मूल्य दिलवाने की कोई व्यवस्था कर रहे हैं? क्या वह यह चाहते हैं कि शक्कर का जितना भी अधिक-से-अधिक आयात किया जा सकता हो, बगैर किसी सीमा के, उसको अलाऊ कर दें, जिससे कि देश में शक्कर की कमी खत्म हो तथा आम आदमी को पुराने दामों पर शक्कर प्राप्त हो? जब तक वह इस प्रकार के कदम नहीं उठाएँगे, तब तक शक्कर की कमी रहेगी तथा इस प्रकार के शक्कर के जो scams इस देश में होते रहे हैं, वे और आगे भी होते रहेंगे।

इसके अलावा एक बहुत बड़ा मुद्दा यह है कि जब चुनाव पास में थे, तब शक्कर के release orders शक्कर मिलों को release कर दिए गए। उस वक्त शक्कर traders के पास पहुँच गया। ...(समय की घंटी)... Traders को यह जानकारी मिल गई कि इसकी कमी

होने जा रही है, तो ट्रेडर्स ने उसकी hoarding कर ली। इस प्रकार traders के पास जो hoarding पड़ी है, यह कहेंगे कि होर्डिंग का विषय तो राज्य सरकारों का है, लेकिन, इसमें केन्द्र सरकार कुछ कदम उठाए और उस hoarding को समाप्त कराए। शक्कर की कमी देश में नहीं है, बल्कि इस वक्त उसकी hoarding है। इसके अलावा प्रोडक्शन में जो कमी हो रही है, उसका कारण केवल यह है कि किसानों को गन्ने का सही मूल्य ही नहीं मिलता। ... (समय की घंटी)... उस ओर ध्यान देना बहुत आवश्यक है। इस कार्य को किया जाए।

(समाप्त)

**श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर(महाराष्ट्र):** सर, मैं सिर्फ एक ही सवाल पूछना चाहूँगा। दिसम्बर, 2008 में जबकि सरकार को यह मालूम था कि देश में शक्कर का उत्पादन कम रहेगा और shortage आएगी, तब canalize import की बात की गई। उस समय दुनिया से, विश्व-बाजार से, 16 रुपए प्रति किलो के भाव में यहाँ आयात हो सकता था। आज आयात में इसका दाम 25 रुपए तक बढ़ गया है। यदि ऐसे में 25 रुपए में आयात करके उसे 30-35 रुपए में कोई बेचेगा, तो राहत क्या देंगे? इसलिए मेरा specific सवाल यह है कि आम आदमी को राहत देने के लिए BPL को राशन पर जो 500 ग्राम देते हैं, APL को तो कुछ दे नहीं रहे हैं, तो क्या सरकार 15 रुपए प्रति किलो में 5 किलो शक्कर देगी या नहीं देगी?

(समाप्त)

**THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, CONSUMER AFFAIRS, FOOD AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION (SHRI SHARAD PAWAR):** Sir, one should not forget about the sugar production and sugar availability. If we study its last 20 years, it is a cycle. The cycle is such that for three years you would see in India too much production, prices having been totally dropped, farmers facing problems and the mills becoming sick and in the other two years there is less plantation and availability of sugar in the market is less, the prices go up and the farmers get abnormal prices for sugarcane.

(Contd by 4D/SSS)

SSS/4D/6.55

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.):** After two years he will plant like anything that the prices will drop. So, this is a cycle which I am observing for the last 20 years and those who know this fate are fully aware of them. The sugar farmer immediately shifts from one crop to another crop if he feels he is not getting proper price. Recently, this is a regular phenomenon. A number of issues have been raised here. Firstly, why we had taken a decision of import? One point has also been raised that because it was disclosed that such and such production will be there, that is why prices have gone up. I have made the position absolutely clear today also in the House. Our assessment this year is: production will be 150 lakh tons. We have carry over stock of Rs. 100 lakh tons. That is last year's production. So, the total availability in the country is 250 lakh tons. Domestic consumption is between 223 to 225 lakh tons. That is why whatever the total domestic requirement maybe, we got more than the requirement. That is the overall position of the country today. Now, it was suggested that we should import more and, I said, that this year our plantation report shows that the production will be 160 or 170 lakh tons and that is why certain decisions have been taken. We have not encouraged to import refined sugar. If we encourage to import refined sugar, definitely, sugar will come here. It will be immediately available in the market. Instead of refined sugar, suppose we encourage to import raw sugar, raw sugar will be imported, it is cheaper. It will be processed here. Mills can utilise their capacity. Workers can continue to work in the mills. They can get the wages and instead of importing finished sugar, raw sugar

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

import is comparatively a better route and that is a conscious decision, with the consultation of industry and farmer, Government of India has taken. Now, it was asked what is the total availability and what is the contract basis? Whatever information which I got, the raw sugar contract is 29 lakh tons. Raw sugar arrive or in the process of arrival is 18.40 lakh tons. So, it is just contracted and they have come. The process has not started. The process generally starts when the bagasse is available. Now, mills are not working. If anybody wants to start a mill it requires fuel. Unless and until normal season starts, bagasse is not available. Unless and until bagasse is not available we cannot run the boiler. So, in such situations mills are not working today. There might be some mills in South, particularly in Tamil Nadu and others, where particularly round the year there is a practice of season, otherwise, in rest of the country whether it is Uttar Pradesh, whether it is Maharashtra, whether it is Gujarat, whether it is Karnataka, whether it is Andhra Pradesh, not a single mill is working there, barring some here and there. But mills are not working. That is why whatever contracts on sugar which has reached here, my own impression is the process will start when the sugar factories will actually start crushing. We have put a condition that after importing and processing within three months they have to dispose of in open market. There is no other restriction. But, they have to make available in the open market. Now, I come to import of white sugar. White sugar is hardly contracted. It is 1.25 lakh tons and it has reached here to 0.61 lakh tons. It is limited sugar but process has been started.

(Contd. by NBR/4E)

-SSS/NBR-DS/4E/7.00.

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.):** A decision, as I said, was taken not to encourage import of refined sugar, but encourage raw sugar which I have already explained.

Now, Sir, one more issue was raised here. It is that the farmer is not getting a proper price. In fact, I have already briefed the House today. Last year's price was Rs. 81 per quintal. This year's price is Rs. 107 per quintal. There is a difference between the Minimum Support Price and the Statutory Minimum Price. The Government of India always announces the MSP for other crops, like wheat, rice, jowar, bajra, etc. If the market goes below the MSP decided and announced by the Government of India, it is the responsibility of the Government of India to enter into the open market, procure the same and provide that price to the farmer. That is not the case of sugarcane. The price which has been introduced in this country for sugarcane for many years is SMP, not MSP. It means, Statutory Minimum Price. We are not in a position to purchase sugarcane. What will the Government do with sugarcane if the price goes down? So, this is called the Statutory Minimum Price. We give one indication that mills should not pay below this. If mills want to pay more than this, they are allowed. In fact, States like Uttar Pradesh, Punjab and Haryana have introduced the SAP -- State Advisory Price. They have passed a separate law in their respective States. As per that law, Uttar Pradesh is announcing a different price than the national price i.e., SAP. They are giving more than the Statutory Minimum Price which the Government of India gives. So, from Rs. 81,

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

we have gone to Rs. 105. Now, what is the meaning of 105? One should try to understand the economics of Rs. 105. Sir, Rs. 105 means, the farmer will actually get Rs. 1500 per tonne, plus Rs. 300 harvesting charges. That means, Rs. 1,800 per tonne is the cost of cane. We have to process the cane and convert it into sugar. The conversion charges are Rs. 500. That means, the total cost will be Rs. 2,300 per quintal. If Rs. 2,300 per quintal is the price, one should not expect that sugar will be available in the market for less than Rs. 24 or Rs. 25 per kg. Nobody should complain about that. In fact, the same thing I was telling in the House three years back that this will happen. I told the House, if you are going to insist that the price should be, somewhat, near Rs. 14 or Rs. 15, in another two years, the prices will go to Rs. 30 per kg. It is because the farmer immediately shifts. And, exactly the same thing happened in this country. So, today, Rs. 108 has been announced and the ultimate manufacturing price would be Rs. 2,300 and that is why the prices would be somewhat near to...

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** Sir, I would like to know whether the Commission on Agriculture Costs and Prices has recommended a higher price of Rs. 125.

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR:** Now, it is Rs. 108.

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** I would like to know whether CACP has recommended for Rs. 125.

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR:** Sir, the CACP has recommended twice. I will tell you what happened. About two years back, initially, the CACP sent a Report for Rs. 81 for 12 months. After four months, CACP gave another Report. When the Government had accepted the

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

recommendation of Rs. 81 of the CACP and communicated to all States, then, within three or four months, the CACP has given a fresh Report. In the fresh Report, it has recommended for something like Rs. 115. In that Report, the CACP had suggested that the Government of India should pay bonus. You see, in Uttar Pradesh, Bajaj is going to produce sugar.

(CONTD. BY PK "4F")

PK/4F/7.05

**SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.):** He is going to sell sugar there. He is going to earn money there. ..(Interruptions).. The Government of India has to pay bonus for this. ..(Interruptions).. So, we, still, have to accept that. That proposal was not accepted; that proposal was rejected. This year also the proposal came and what he is saying is correct that it was a little more. They gave some calculations, but they were not according to the guidelines. In calculation, one of the conditions is, whatever the price will be fixed, it will be including the cost of cultivation, return to the farmers and the price for the consumer in the open market. The CACP has bypassed the third category. They have not paid any attention to that. That is why, that particular section was not accepted by the Government and the Government announced the price as Rs.107/- with a proviso that mills have liberty to give more than this. This is the benchmark. This is the minimum price. So, they can give more also and there are many ways. I know that in Karnataka, Maharashtra and Tamil Nadu, mills are paying much more than the price which the Government has announced. I am not sure about Uttar Pradesh, but this is the position. About Brindaji's question that after

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

importing what they should do, I have already replied that within three months, they have to make it available in the market; otherwise, it will be taken for Public Distribution System. That condition has already been put. One point was raised here why you could not get proper information about not reaching such and such level of production. Why have you not collected information from the States in this regard? Yes, we are collecting information from all the States. All the States have given me, through the Government, different information within eight months. Initially, the State Governments, all together, had communicated in writing to the Government of India that production will be 220. Within three months, they communicated that the production will be 200. After two months, they communicated that production will be 185 and lastly, they have communicated that production will be 160. So, wrong information was communicated. Secondly, this year, the sugarcane productivity was dropped because there was a delay of monsoon in a particular sugar belt. That is why, the production was less. When we realised this with the last information which we got from various State Governments, immediately, we took a decision to allow raw sugar and from that day, the process has been started. With regard to the last question which was asked by Mr. Javedkar as to whether such and such quantity will be available at ration shops, I would say that unless and until the new season starts, I will not be able to say anything. But we will make efforts to take certain decisions which will, ultimately, help to improve the availability in all the three categories of PDS, that is, AAY, BPL, and APL. We would make available the sugar. The matter is under consideration. I do not want to give all the details,



**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

because, if I say something, suddenly, it will have some effect in the international market too. That is why, I have to be cautious, but we are moving in that direction. Without imports also, probably, we will be able to take some decision, which will make available sugar in the Public Distribution System. Thank you.

(Ends)

(Followed by 4G/PB)

PB/4g/7.10

### **SPECIAL MENTIONS**

GS

#### **NEED FOR MEASURES TO PROTECT LIFE AND PROPERTY OF TRAIN PASSENGERS IN VIEW OF THE INCREASING INCIDENTS OF CRIME IN TRAINS**

**श्री जय प्रकाश नारायण सिंह (झारखंड)** : महोदय, सरकार जहां रेलवे में यात्रियों की सुविधाओं के लिए, सुरक्षा पर प्रतिवर्ष करोड़ों रुपया खर्च करती है, वहीं रेलवे सुरक्षा को धता बताकर रेलवे में लूटपाट, चोरी, डकैती की घटनाएं प्रतिवर्ष बढ़ती जा रही हैं। इसी क्रम में 1 अगस्त को बड़बिल टाटा-हावड़ा जनशताब्दी एक्सप्रेस (2022) में घाटशिला और गिधनी स्टेशनों के बीच सशस्त्र अपराधियों ने दुस्साहिस ढंग से दो वातानुकूलित बोगियों में लाखों रुपये नगद, मोबाइल, आभूषण लूट लिए और अपराधी चैन खींचकर आराम से चले गए। लूट के शिकार होने वाले लोगों में भाजपा युवा मोर्चा के राष्ट्रीय अध्यक्ष भी हैं, जिनकी सोने की चेन, अंगूठी, मोबाइल व नगदी लूट ली गई।

अतः मेरा सरकार से अनुरोध है कि रेलवे में बढ़ती हुई आपराधिक घटनाओं को देखते हुए, ऐसे स्थानों की पहचान की जाए, जहां पर इस प्रकार की घटनाएं ज्यादा होती हैं। रेलवे अधिकारियों की जिम्मेदारी तय की जाए तथा यात्रियों के जान-माल की सुरक्षा हेतु ठोस कदम उठाए जाएं। धन्यवाद।

ASC

**NEED FOR A CLEAR POLICY ON SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH  
PERTAINING TO ANIMAL AND HUMAN CLONES AND  
ARTIFICIAL INSEMINATION**

**श्री राम नारायण साहू (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से सदन का ध्यान मानव अनुवांशिकी एवं प्रजनन पर चल रहे आधुनिक अनुसंधान की ओर आकृष्ट करना चाहता हूँ। मैं विज्ञान और विकास का पूर्णरूप से पक्षधर हूँ। मैं आश्वस्त हूँ कि वर्तमान समाज विकास के जिस सोपान पर खड़ा है, वह विज्ञान की देन है। इसके लिए मानव जाति विज्ञान की ऋणी रहेगी, परन्तु कुछ खोजों के दुष्परिणाम मानव जाति को सदियों तक भोगने पड़ सकते हैं। जब अल्ट्रासाउंड मशीन का प्रयोग शुरू हुआ, तो आशा बंधी कि गर्भस्थ शिशु को रोगों से बचाने में यह मशीन वरदान सिद्ध होगी। तब मुझे भी बहुत प्रसन्नता हुई थी। इससे गर्भ में पल रहे शिशुओं को लाभ पहुंचा होगा, मैं नहीं मानता, परन्तु अकेले भारत में नर्हीं बालिकाओं की जन्म से पहले ही हत्या, इसी मशीन की कृपा से हो चुकी है। यहां तक कि देश में महिला-पुरुष के अनुपात का संतुलन बिगड़कर, खतरे के निशान को पार करने लगा है।

महोदय, आजकल विश्व में तथा भारत में पशुओं और मनुष्यों के क्लोन बनाने की विधि पर तेजी से कार्य हो रहा है। इनमें भैंस, भेड़ और चूहे आदि के क्लोन सफल रूप से बनाए गए हैं। दूसरी ओर कृत्रिम शुक्राणु बनाकर बिना नर के सहयोग से बच्चे को जन्म देने में चूहों पर सफलता प्राप्त की गई है तथा मनुष्यों पर प्रयोग जारी है। मुझे विज्ञान से शिकायत नहीं है, मगर मेरा मानना है कि यह एक गंभीर मुद्दा है और इस पर गहन चिंतन एवं चर्चा की आवश्यकता है। इसके परिणामों एवं दुष्परिणामों को पूरी तरह समझना आवश्यक है। प्रकृति का संचालन प्राकृतिक सिद्धांतों के आधार पर होता है। उसे परिवर्तित करने के लिए प्रजनन प्रक्रिया के साथ बुनियादी छेड़छाड़ करना किस हद तक तर्कसंगत होगा और इसके परिणाम कितने हितकारी होंगे, यह प्रश्न चिंतनीय है। यह प्रश्न मेरा या आपका नहीं है, बल्कि पूरी मानव जाति की सृष्टि का है, इसलिए इसपर कोई कदम बढ़ाने

से पहले गहन चिंतन आवश्यक है। अतः सरकार को इस विषय पर अपनी नीति स्पष्ट करनी चाहिए। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

LP

**NEED TO PROVIDE SECURITY FORCES WITH VEHICLES FITTED WITH ANTI-MINE TECHNIQUE**

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास (छत्तीसगढ़) :** दिनांक 20-7-09 को लिखित प्रश्न क्रं. 2744 के उत्तर में कहा है कि सुरंग निरोधी वाहन तो बनाए जाते हैं, पर वे उपकरण नहीं बनाए जाते, जो सुरंग निरोधी हैं। आयात की जानकारी भी वर्तमान में उपलब्ध नहीं है। 10 राज्यों में ये वाहन काम में आ रहे हैं। इनमें अधिकांश नक्सल प्रभावित हैं। ज्यादातर सुरक्षा व पुलिस बल सुरंगों द्वारा उड़ाए जा रहे वाहनों में मारे जा रहे हैं। सूचना प्रौद्योगिकी का पूर्ण उपयोग कर इनको उचित उपकरणों से शीघ्रताशीघ्र शुरू कर लोगों की जान-माल की रक्षा की जाए, यह मेरा सरकार से आग्रह है।

(समाप्त)

Sk

**DEMAND TO OPEN ESIC MEDICAL COLLEGE IN ORISSA**

**SHRI RAMA CHANDRA KHUNTIA (ORISSA):** Sir, the ESIC Board decided to start a medical college for better medical care and super speedy treatment of insured persons and have more doctors. Replying to my Starred Question, the hon. Minister has replied that the ESIC has the proposal for opening of 27 medical colleges in different States, but not in Orissa. Orissa is a backward State having less medical colleges. Even though the original ESIC Board proposal included Orissa State and the medical college place was selected to be at Bhubaneswar, unfortunately, it is not included in the Ministry's reply. This has created

frustration among all the ESIC beneficiaries and all Orissa people in general.

The ESIC and the Ministry say that Orissa Government is not giving 25 acres of land which is required for the medical college. Whether Orissa Government is really not giving the land or the ESIC is not interested in having a medical college in Orissa, we do not know. But, Orissa State, as a whole, is losing a medical college proposed by the ESIC.

I, therefore, urge upon the Labour Ministry to discuss with the Orissa Government to get the required land for medical college or the ESIC may also directly purchase 25 acres of land and start a medical college or else Orissa people and ESIC personnel may start agitation programme to press for their right for having a medical college and a dental college of ESIC in Bhubaneswar, Orissa.

(Ends)

**AKG**

**DEMAND FOR LINGUISTIC MINORITY STATUS TO NEPALI SPEAKING PEOPLE**

**श्री समन पाठक (पश्चिमी बंगाल)** : महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से केन्द्र सरकार का ध्यान नेपाली/गोरखी भाषा-भाषियों को भाषायी अल्पसंख्यक दर्जा दिए जाने की ओर आकृष्ट करना चाहूँगा।

महोदय, नेपाली भाषा देश के हर क्षेत्र में बोली जाती है। यह भाषा बोलने और समझने वालों की अनुमानित जनसंख्या एक करोड़ से ज्यादा है। नेपाली भाषा बोलने वाले विशेष रूप से दार्जीलिंग एवं पश्चिमी बंगाल के विभिन्न क्षेत्रों से लगे सिक्किम, असम, मेघालय, अरुणाचल प्रदेश, मणिपुर, मिजोरम, दिल्ली, मुम्बई, हिमाचल प्रदेश, उत्तराखंड एवं दक्षिण भारत के कुछ हिस्से में निवास करते हैं।

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

महोदय, किसी भी जाति का चिह्न उनकी भाषा एवं भूमि से जुड़ा हुआ होता है। लेकिन हिन्दी भाषा और उर्दू भाषा भारत के हर क्षेत्र में बोली जाती है। उनको एक निश्चित प्रदेश की भाषा के रूप में नहीं जाना जाता है। वैसे ही नेपाली भाषा भी किसी एक प्रदेश की निश्चित भाषा नहीं है। वह देश के हर प्रांत में बोली जाती है। लेकिन हिन्दी एवं उर्दू की तरह नेपाली भाषा विकसित नहीं हो पाई है, क्योंकि हर राज्य/प्रदेश में यह भाषा क्षेत्रीय भाषा या अल्पसंख्यक भाषा के रूप में है। 1992 में नेपाली भाषा को आठवीं अनुसूची में मान्यता प्राप्त होने के बाद भी इसका आशानुरूप विकास नहीं हो रहा है।

महोदय, भारतवर्ष विभिन्न भाषा, साहित्य-संस्कृति एवं परम्परा मिश्रित देश है। यह विभिन्नता में एकता एवं अखंडता का बेमिसाल नमूना है। अगर नेपाली/गोरखी भाषा और भी सम्बद्ध एवं विकसित हुए, तो यह देश के मिश्रित भाषा, साहित्य-सांस्कृतिक धरातल को और मजबूत करने में मददगार साबित होगा।

अतः मैं आपके माध्यम से केन्द्र सरकार से अनुरोध करना चाहूँगा कि वह नेपाली भाषा-भाषियों को हर राज्य/प्रदेश में भाषायी अल्पसंख्यक का दर्जा प्रदान करने में मदद करे।

(समाप्त)

**DEMAND TO PROTECT THE FOSSILS AND CAVE PAINTINGS  
FROM MINING MAFIA AND SMUGGLERS  
IN SONBHADRA DISTRICT, U.P.**

**श्री कलराज मिश्र (उत्तर प्रदेश):** मान्यवर, उत्तर प्रदेश के सोनभद्र जिले में सलखन पार्क में 150 करोड़ वर्ष पुराने फासिल्स का रख-रखाव, संरक्षण करने में लापरवाही बरती जा रही है। इस स्थल की जानकारी वैज्ञानिक मैकलेनन ने 1831 में दुनिया को दी, लेकिन उसके 112 साल बाद 1933 में जे.वी. आर्डन ने सलखन आकर अध्ययन से यह साबित किया कि अमैरिका के यलो स्टोन नैशनल पार्क से भी फासिल्स का बेहतर उदाहरण यहां मौजूद है। जबकि सोनभद्र में ही एक और जटाशंकर फासिल्स पार्क के अस्तित्व ने पृथ्वी पर जीवन के प्रारम्भ के प्रमाण उपलब्ध कराए।

**Uncorrected/Not for publication - 06.08.2009**

5 दिसम्बर, 2002 को जब विश्वविख्यात भू-वैज्ञानिक एवं मैकनिल यूनिवर्सिटी कनाडा के एच.जे.हाफमैन यहां पहुंचे तो 150 करोड़ वर्ष पुराने फासिल्स को देखकर अपनी प्रसन्नता को व्यक्त करने से नहीं रोक सके। उन्होंने नाचते हुए कहा, "पूरे विश्व में इससे खूबसूरत और स्पष्ट फासिल्स और कहीं हैं ही नहीं"। अमेरिका से आई दो महिला वैज्ञानिकों ने माना था, सलखन के फासिल्स 150 करोड़ वर्ष पुराने व परिपक्व हैं, जबकि यलो स्टोन अमेरिका के फासिल्स अभी निर्माण प्रक्रिया में हैं।

वर्ष 2002 में फासिल्स पार्क को धरोहर का दर्जा दिया गया है। स्थानीय प्रशासन की लापरवाही की वजह से मूर्ति तस्कर और पत्थर माफियाओं की नजर इस पार्क पर है। इससे यह स्पष्ट होता है कि इसे धरोहर घोषित करने का कोई मायने नहीं रह गया है। यहां के स्थानीय लोगों ने राज्यपाल, राज्य सरकार ही नहीं, केन्द्र सरकार को भी कई बार ज्ञापन भेजे हैं और चिट्ठियां थमाई हैं, परन्तु कोई कार्यवाही नहीं हुई।

मैं सदन के माध्यम से सरकार से मांग करता हूं कि 150 करोड़ वर्ष पुराना फासिल्स व हजारों वर्ष पूर्व आदि मानव द्वारा पहाड़ियों पर बनाए गए चित्रों को खनन माफियाओं व मूर्ति तस्करों से बचाएं।

(समाप्त)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** The House is adjourned to meet tomorrow at 11. 00 a.m.

-----

**The House then adjourned at ten minutes  
past seven of the clock till eleven of the clock  
on Friday, the 7<sup>th</sup> August, 2009.**

