

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

1a/11.00/skc-gs

The House assembled at eleven of the clock,
MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

RE. FDI IN RETAIL TRADE

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Minister of Commerce and Industry.

THE MINISTER OF COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY (SHRI ANAND

SHARMA): Mr. Chairman, Sir, the Government has taken a view that the decision to permit 51 per cent Foreign Direct Investment in multi-brand retail trade is suspended till a consensus is developed for consultation among various stakeholders.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Sir, will the hon. Minister clarify who all the stakeholders would include?

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, we want all political parties as well as State Governments to be consulted. We would like the hon. Minister to tell us whether the definition of stakeholders includes them.

SHRI D. RAJA: The word 'stakeholders' is actually used in business. When we talk about it in politics, for Parliament, I think the Minister should clarify who the stakeholders are.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

MR. CHAIRMAN: The hon. Leader of Opposition and other Members have raised a point which would be clarified.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, as the hon. Leader of Opposition and hon. Members have asked, it is very clear that this policy, the enabling policy framework, is such that the States have a discretion. Therefore, when we say consultation with the stakeholders, that would include Chief Ministers and States, and it certainly does not exclude, but includes, the political parties.

(Ends)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question 201.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, I had give notice for suspension of the Question Hour to discuss the Mullaiperiyar Dam issue.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We would take it up during the Zero Hour.

प्रो. एस.पी. सिंह बघेल: चेयरमैन सर, बहुजन समाज पार्टी की राय है कि FDI पूरी तरह से रोल बैक होनी चाहिए।

श्री सभापति: देखिए, वह आपने...(व्यवधान)...

प्रो. एस.पी. सिंह बघेल: सर, बहुजन समाज पार्टी की राय है कि FDI किसानों के हित में, राष्ट्रीय हित में, खुदरा व्यापारियों के हित में नहीं है, इसलिए हम इसको पूरी तरह रोल बैक करने की बात कहते हैं। आप इसे स्थगित करने की बात कर

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

रहे हैं। इसको स्थगित करने का मतलब यह है कि सरकार की मंशा ठीक नहीं है। यह वेंटिलेटर पर है, कभी भी यह इश्यु पुनर्जीवित हो सकता है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: We are not having a discussion on this, please.

प्रो. एस.पी. सिंह बघेल: अगर आप इसको रोल बैक नहीं करते हैं, तो हम यहां से वाकआउट करते हैं।

(At this stage, some hon. Members left the Chamber.)

(Ends)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question 201.

Q. No. 201

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, the Minister has given a very elaborate reply. In the recent past, there have been efforts by both the Government of India and the Government of Pakistan to improve relations. I appreciate the recent measures taken by both the Governments. After all, we want India and Pakistan to have normal relations, and they must engage themselves in a meaningful dialogue to take this composite dialogue to a further higher level. Having said that, trade forms an important element in normalizing our relations with Pakistan. Now, the Minister has said that with the entire phasing out of the Negative List the transition process to the Most Favoured Nation status shall be complete. Is there any time-frame for that? How long will the phasing out of the Negative List take? India has already given the Most Favoured Nation status to Pakistan. When will the Most Favoured Nation status be given by both the countries to each other, that is, Pakistan giving the Most Favoured Nation status to India and India giving the Most Favoured Nation status to Pakistan? India has already given the Most Favoured Nation status to Pakistan. When will Pakistan give the Most Favoured Nation to India?

Q. No. 201 (contd.)

MR. CHAIRMAN: A question should be a question.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, it is true, as the hon. Member has said, that in recent months both India and Pakistan have taken well-considered steps to move towards normalisation of trade between the two countries. The trade as such is healthy. The Commerce Secretaries of the two countries had met in Islamabad on the 27th and 28th of April.

(contd. at 1b/ksk)

KSK/LP/11.05/1B

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (CONTD): Thereafter, in the month of September -- 28th September, to be precise -- Pakistan's Commerce Minister, Makhdoom Muhammad Amin Fahim, had come here, and we have agreed that Pakistan will move towards a Negative List. Earlier, it was a Positive List which was not giving access to a large number of tradable goods from India. Now, the discussions have been completed on the Negative List. Negative List will be formally notified by Pakistan in February, 2012. This is being done in two

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 201 (contd.)

stages — first, the Negative List stage, and the second stage would be that they will move towards trade normalisation to phase out the Negative List, hopefully, by the end of 2012, though no definite date has been given. In February, 2012, when they move to the Negative List, I am informing the House that Pakistan's Minister has extended an invitation and I will be leading the Indian delegation to Pakistan on that occasion.

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी : सभापति महोदय, मैं वाणिज्य मंत्री जी से आपके माध्यम से पूछना चाहूंगा कि कई समाचार-पत्रों में काफी दिनों से छप रहा है कि पाकिस्तान की आई.एस.आई. ने, यहां से जो पान निर्यात होते थे और इसी तरह की अन्य छोटी-छोटी चीजों पर, यहां से निर्यात न होने देने पर दबाव डाला और उन पर रोक लगा दी गई है। यह महत्वपूर्ण चीज है कि आप पाकिस्तान से इस पर चर्चा कर रहे हैं, बातचीत कर रहे हैं, यह बहुत अच्छी बात है, लेकिन क्या आपने पाकिस्तान से उन मुद्दों पर भी बात की है कि वहां पर आई.एस.आई. की जो एक पैरलल सरकार चल रही है, वह आई.एस.आई. की सरकार पाकिस्तान की सरकार पर हमारे जो तमाम व्यापारिक समझौते हैं और आयात-निर्यात की जो व्यवस्था है, उन पर अपनी शर्तों के अनुसार कर रही है और उसी के अंतर्गत

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 201 (contd.)

पाकिस्तान में पान के आयात पर आई.एस.आई. के कहने पर रोक लगाई है, क्या माननीय मंत्री जी इसके बारे में बताएंगे?

श्री आनन्द शर्मा : सभापति जी, माननीय सदस्य ने जो कहा है, मुझे ऐसी किसी सूचना या शिकायत की जानकारी नहीं है कि पान के निर्यात पर कोई पाबंदी है। यदि ऐसी कोई जानकारी मेरे पास आती है...(व्यवधान)..

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी : निर्यात पर।

श्री आनन्द शर्मा : जहां तक इनका दूसरा प्रश्न है, मैं उस पर कोई उत्तर देने में सक्षम नहीं हूँ, क्योंकि वाणिज्य मंत्री के रूप में, वाणिज्य से संबंधित जो बातें हैं, MFN List, Negative List, ट्रेड नॉर्मेलाइजेशन की बात है, हमने उन पर चर्चा की है।

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी : गृह मंत्री से पूछ लें, पास में बैठे हुए हैं।

MS. MABEL REBELLO: Sir, as he said, as per SAFTA Agreement, tariffs will be reduced to 5 per cent by 2012. Now, it is on Sensitive List, and I would like to know from the hon. Minister as to what are the tariffs today and what are the Negative Lists that are there on Indian side and on Pakistan's side.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I would like to inform the hon. Member that India currently maintains a Sensitive List of 868 tariff lines. Pakistan

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 201 (contd.)

has a Sensitive List of 930 tariff lines. However, due to Pakistan's present Import Control Order, the MFN principles have not yet been operationalised even by India.

Regarding the peak tariff rates, India has a current peak tariff level of 11 per cent for SAFTA-related imports from Pakistan and Sri Lanka. This peak tariff rate is to reduce to 8 per cent in January, 2012, and further to 5 per cent from 1st January, 2013.

(Ends)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Now, Question No. 202.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, before that, can I just make a small comment, not a question? I would like to thank the Government for allowing the Question Hour to proceed after ten days by agreeing to make the Statement that they have made. So, thank you very much. So, we are finally having the normal course of the House.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q.No. 202

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether China Ocean Mineral Resources Research and Development Association (COMRA) has signed a contract with the International Seabed Authority to explore 10,000 square kilometre of seabed in the southwest Indian Ocean. Had the Directorate of Naval Intelligence expressed a concern that COMRA's access could have strategic implications for India's security?

(followed by 1c – gsp)

GSP-AKG-1C-11.10

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the question? Do you have any other question to ask?

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: No, Sir, this...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. You are satisfied with it. No other second question. Now, Dr. Chandan Mitra.

DR. CHANDAN MITRA: Sir, through you, I would like to ask the hon. Minister that while we have entered into an agreement with China so that prospecting can be done in the Indian Ocean region, has China shown any laxity in allowing the Indian prospecting in the South China

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 202 (contd.)

Sea, which has been reported widely in the media and which was discussed in Bali as well when the Prime Ministers of the two countries met. China has adopted a very belligerent posture about India prospecting in collaboration with Vietnam in the South China Sea. What steps is the Government taking to ensure that Indian prospecting in the South China Sea proceeds uninhibited?

SHRI A.K. ANTONY: Hon. Member's question is slightly different. This question is about exploration right given by the International Seabed Authority to India in several particular areas and to China for exploration of polymetallic sulphides in certain other areas. These are all international waters. India got the right years back for exploration of polymetallic nodules and China got it later but both are in the different areas. China is exploring in the South-West Indian Ocean Ridge and India is exploring in the Central Indian Ocean range; 2,500 km. away from our shore. The nearest landmass of Chinese exploration area is Medagaskar, and, our area is 2,500 km. away but our country has the right to international waters. International waters are nobody's property. These were given under the UN Convention.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 202 (contd.)

Even though India and China got this right, of late, many countries are showing interest. Russia, France, Germany, Korea; all are applying for these rights. Only the United Nations can give permission in respect of international waters. The area of national waters is different. These are international waters. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. The question is on Indian Ocean.

SHRI TARUN VIJAY: Sir, the hon. Member had asked whether the Directorate of Naval Intelligence had expressed a concern that COMRA's access could have strategic implications for India's security. The hon. Minister has not answered this question. Whether the Naval Intelligence had expressed any concern about China's entry into Indian Ocean is a very significant question, and, it should be answered. Thank you.

SHRI A.K. ANTONY: The answer is general and there is nothing to hide. I agree that the Directorate of Naval Intelligence conveyed their concern. After that the Government of India constituted an inter-Ministerial Committee under the Ministry of Earth Sciences. They are examining the whole thing and the Government is there to protect the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 202 (contd.)

security interests. The Committee decided to move to the Seabed Authority for licence to India for exploration of polymetallic sulphides also.

श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास : सभापति महोदय, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूँ कि हिन्द महासागर में अंतर्राष्ट्रीय समुद्र-तल प्राधिकरण के साथ जो समझौता है, क्या भारत उसका हिस्सा है, चूँकि वह हिन्द महासागर में हो रहा है और अंतर्राष्ट्रीय है?

SHRI A.K. ANTONY: In fact, the International Seabed Authority gave licence for the first time to India, and, China got it later only. Each country has the right to apply to the International Seabed Authority, and, if they are satisfied, they will give rights to various countries.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 203

SHRI N.K. SINGH: Sir, the hon. Minister is aware that in the last six months, there has been a sharp decline in the exchange value of the rupee vis-a-vis the dollar.

(contd. by VKK-1D)

-GSP/VKK-PSV/1d/11.15

SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD.): Also, during this period, the Chinese currency has appreciated somewhat significantly against the US dollar. In the light of this currency movement, what fillip does the Minister expect will our exports get to the Chinese market?

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I would like to inform the hon. Member that the Government is taking every possible step to ensure that the adverse impact of the volatility of our currency on the Indian exports is cushioned or minimised. Therefore, after discussing this matter with the Finance Minister, firstly, for the SME sector, we have got a relief in the form of interest subvention for the Indian manufacturers and exporters. That covers the entire micro, small and medium industries sector and labour-intensive industries. Secondly, we have some schemes where we give incentives to our exporters like the Focus

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 203 (contd.)

Market Scheme, the Focus Product Scheme and this year, we have brought in a Special Focus Product Scheme which has a further incentive of two per cent as bonus over and above what entitlements were and we have included China in January 2010. First, we diversified in August 2009 because of the global economic scenario in 39 markets — 26 under one scheme and 13 under another scheme — covering Africa, Latin America and Central Asia. In January 2010, we consciously included China and Japan after discussions with our industry and exporters. I hope that satisfies you. Though it is true that we have a trade imbalance as I have given the details in our reply, at the same time, we have taken every possible step to ensure that value-added exports to China increase. In addition, lastly, I would like to add that we have also made available a dollar credit window to the Indian exporters so that if there is a sharp deterioration, particularly for those exporters who have booked the orders in dollars, this remedy is available.

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: Sir, in the reply, it is stated by the Ministry that for reducing trade deficit, efforts were made to diversify the trade

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 203 (contd.)

basket. It is mentioned in the reply. My specific question is this. Is the Ministry or the Government in a position to emphasise inclusion of some special sectors like leather, jute, jewellery, etc.? These products are manufactured by small and medium sector and labour-oriented industries in our country. If it is so, the trade deficit may decline and imbalance, to some extent, may be reduced. So, that is my specific question. What is the attitude of the Government to include these SME products as I have mentioned?

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, the Government has been concerned about the increasing trade deficit with China. We have taken a number of steps, some of which I did elicit earlier in response to the query by Shri N.K. Singh. This matter has also been taken up at the political level — I would like to share with the House — and that too, at the highest level, between the two Prime Ministers. The Prime Minister Dr. Manmohan Singh made it very clear two years ago and as recent as this year in the BRIC Summit in Sanya that this imbalance is untenable and we have to take steps towards more balanced trade between China and India. In January 2010, when the Joint Economic Group met

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 203 (contd.)

in Beijing, we entered into an MOU for increased access to the Chinese market, particularly for value-added goods made out of India, in IT sector where most of the orders are given, whether by banks or companies or their parastatal companies.

(Contd. by KR/1e)

SCH-KR/11.20/1E

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (CONTD.): .. and also for our pharmaceutical products and Indian agriculture produce. After the MoU, there has been substantial improvement though China has been the largest trading partner. We have over \$63 billion of trade between the two countries. China is a major exporting country. What has happened in the past is that the trade as such has been skewed whereas India has been exporting raw material and China has been exporting finished products. As the hon. Member would know, China is the largest exporting country in the world. They have overtaken Germany about two years ago. But after the MoU, our exports have increased by 85 per cent through value added goods. The overall India's exports have increased by 66 per cent. By the end of this financial year, we will be

Q. No. 203 (contd.)

in a position to make a realistic assessment of the steps being taken and what will be its impact.

श्रीमती विप्लव ठाकुर: माननीय सभापति जी, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहती हूँ, जैसा कि इन्होंने कहा कि हम लोग रॉ मैटीरियल बाहर भेजते हैं और बाहर से फिनिशड प्रोडक्ट्स आते हैं। क्या रीज़न है कि हम यहां पर अपने रॉ-मैटीरियल को यूज़ करके फिनिशड प्रोडक्ट्स नहीं बना सकते? जैसे बनारस का सिल्क प्रसिद्ध है, उसके लिए चायना से सिल्क आ रहा है, लेकिन हमारे जो कारीगर हैं, उनके भूखों मरने की नौबत आ रही है। इसके लिए ये क्या स्टेप्स उठा रहे हैं?

श्री आनन्द शर्मा: मैं माननीय सदस्या को यह बताना चाहता हूँ, जैसा कि अभी पहले भी मैंने कहा कि जो वैल्यू ऐडिड गुड्स हैं, भारत से उनका निर्यात चीन के लिए ज्यादा हो, इसके लिए हमने कदम उठाए हैं और वे सार्थक रहे हैं। इससे वैल्यू ऐडिड गुड्स का एक्सपोर्ट बढ़ गया है। मैंने पहले पूरक प्रश्न में इसका प्रतिशत भी बता दिया है, इसलिए सदन के समय को देखते हुए मैं उसे फिर से दोहराना नहीं चाहता।

जहां तक सिल्क का सवाल है, यह सही है कि भारत सिल्क का एक बड़ा उत्पादक देश है, लेकिन चीन दुनिया में सबसे अधिक सिल्क का उत्पादन करता है। अगर आयात होता है, तो वह माल को देख कर एवं सप्लाई डिमांड की

Q. No. 203 (contd.)

सिचुएशन को देख कर होता है। हमारे भारत की सिल्क इंडस्ट्री को जितनी जरूरत है, केवल उतना ही चीन से आयात होता है।

माननीय सदस्या को मैं एक जानकारी और देना चाहूंगा कि बुनकरों की हालत को देखते हुए केन्द्र की सरकार ने कैबिनेट के फैसले के माध्यम से अभी हाल में बुनकरों को एक बहुत बड़ा पैकेज दिया है और उस पैकेज का बुनकरों ने स्वागत किया है।

(समाप्त)

DR E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN: Mr Chairman, Sir, actually this particular enactment was brought in by Madam Indira Gandhi as a socio-economic reform. I would like to know from the hon. Minister, even after 35 years of the enactment of this Act, whether the Government has made any mapping of the people who are in the grip of this bonded labour system. Many of the NGOs and reputed organisations have come forward with statistics that there are 65 million people in the bonded labour system. Many of the people from the neighbouring countries like Bangladesh, Nepal and Maldives have come into our country on the basis of bonded labour system. When the State Governments are not coming forward with the real position, what steps the Central Government has taken to abolish this? The Mumbai High Court and the Supreme Court have found that in Tamil Nadu itself there are 35 million bonded labourers. May I know from the hon. Minister whether the Government will follow the mapping system aggressively to abolish the bonded labour system? ..(Interruptions)..

श्री हरीश रावत: माननीय सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने बाँडिड लेबर की एक बड़ी लिब्रल व्याख्या दी है और उसके अनुसार हमने टास्क फोर्स को यह काम सौंपा था कि

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

हमारा 1976 का जो ऐक्ट है, क्या उसमें किसी तरीके की अमेंडमेंट की जरूरत है? टास्क फोर्स ने हमें यह संस्तुति दी है कि उस ऐक्ट में किसी तरीके के अमेंडमेंट की आवश्यकता नहीं है। दूसरा, जहां तक(व्यवधान)

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Mr. Chairman, Sir, since the House did not function for ten days the Technicians are not used to the volume levels. Please issue directions.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Chair knows about it.

SHRI HARISH RAWAT: Should I speak a little louder?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Yes.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

(Followed by 1F)

DS-TMV/1f/11.25

श्री हरीश रावत: सर, ऐक्ट के मुताबिक identification of bonded labour, release of bonded labour as well as rehabilitation of the bonded labour are under the purview of the State Government. The Act has entrusted the task to the State Government और हम लोग time to time स्टेट गवर्नमेंट्स को सर्वे कंडक्ट करने में मदद करते हैं। स्टेट गवर्नमेंट्स हर तीन साल में एक बार सर्वे करें, उसके लिए उनको दो लाख रुपये दिये जाते हैं,

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

Awareness Programme के लिए भी 10 लाख रुपये दिये जाते हैं और जो काम हुआ है उसके अनुसार bonded labour के incidence में कितनी कमी आयी है, इसके evaluation के लिए भी उनको पाँच लाख रुपये दिये जाते हैं। इस संदर्भ में हम लगातार राज्यों के सम्पर्क में हैं और राज्यों से अनुरोध किया जाता रहा है। हम उनसे फिर से अनुरोध करेंगे कि वे इस स्थिति का संज्ञान लें।

जैसा कि माननीय सदस्य ने यहाँ पर कहा है कि बाहर से भी कुछ लोग यहाँ bonded labour के तौर पर लाये जाते हैं। ऐसी सूचना मंत्रालय के पास नहीं है, लेकिन फिर भी हम संबंधित राज्य सरकारों से और विशेष तौर पर तमिलनाडु की राज्य सरकार से माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाये गये बिन्दु के अनुसार जानकारी collect करेंगे और उस जानकारी को हाउस के सम्मुख रखेंगे।

DR. E. M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN: Sir, the second part of the question is regarding bringing an amendment. Section 21 of this enactment which empowers the State Government to give judicial power to the Executive Magistrate was already struck down by the Maharashtra High Court as also the Madhya Pradesh High Court because it is against the mandate of the Constitution, namely, article 50, where the judiciary should be separated from the executive. Now,

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

even for heinous offences like this, the punishment is only one year. Normally, the District Magistrate gives punishment only till the rising of the court. Therefore, nobody has any fear of this Act against bonded labour system and is trying to abolish it. I would like to know whether the Government will come forward with an amendment to section 21 giving powers to the Judicial Magistrate so that proper punishment is given to the people who are violating the law.

श्री हरीश रावत: सर, माननीय सदस्य ने बहुत महत्वपूर्ण बिन्दु उठाया है। जैसा कि मैंने पहले प्रश्न के उत्तर में सदन के सम्मुख कहा कि हमने इन सारे बिन्दुओं पर विचार करने के लिए एक टास्क फोर्स गठित की थी। उस टास्क फोर्स में नेशनल ह्यूमन राइट्स कमीशन तथा आईएलओ के प्रतिनिधि भी थे। वह टास्क फोर्स इस conclusion पर पहुँची है कि एक्ट में अमेंडमेंट की आवश्यकता नहीं है, लेकिन bonded labour की जो समस्या है, उससे निपटने के लिए हमें एक holistic approach से काम लेना चाहिए। उसके लिए उन्होंने कहा है कि हम preventive measures पर ज्यादा जोर दें ताकि जहाँ लोग bonded labour की तरफ जा सकते हैं, हम उसको रोकने का प्रयास करें। उसके लिए लेबर मिनिस्ट्री ने आईएलओ के सहयोग से तमिलनाडु के दो जिलों के अंदर एक प्रोग्राम स्टार्ट किया है और उस प्रोग्राम को सरकार अब आन्ध्र प्रदेश, हरियाणा

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

और उड़ीसा में भी लागू करने पर विचार कर रही है। जहाँ तक मुझे जानकारी दी गयी है, आन्ध्र प्रदेश के अंदर उसके लिए जो कार्यक्रम है, वह तैयार कर लिया गया है तथा उसको भी शीघ्र लागू कर लिया जाएगा।

सर, माननीय सदस्य ने कहा कि यह जुडिशल पावर्स कैसे डिस्ट्रिक्ट मजिस्ट्रेट को, एक्जिक्यूटिव मजिस्ट्रेट को दिये जा रहे हैं। इसमें पहले एक्ट में साफ लिखा है, “Offences to be tried by the Executive Magistrate. The State Government may confer on an Executive Magistrate the powers of Judicial Magistrate of the First Class or of the Second Class for the trial of the offences under this Act”.

सर, एक्ट के जो नतीजे निकले हैं, उनके आधार पर हम यह कह सकते हैं कि जहाँ प्रारंभिक वर्षों 2000-01 में bonded labour के 8195 केसिज़ सामने आये थे, वहीं इस वर्ष 2010-11 में 865 केसिज़ रिपोर्ट हुए हैं। मंत्रालय का यह मानना है कि इस तरह का एक भी केस गम्भीर है और हम उसको उसी गम्भीरता के साथ लेते हैं तथा उसके लिए जो आवश्यक कदम उठाये जाने आवश्यक हैं, वे सब राज्यों के सहयोग से उठाएँगे।

(1g पर आगे)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

VK-HMS/1G/11.30

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the hon. Member, Dr. Natchiappan, has asked a pointed question and the answer is not at all satisfactory. He has asked, "Whether the Bonded Labour System Abolition Act, 1976 and its implementation is formally assessed?". The answer nowhere says whether it is assessed or not assessed. Just now in a supplementary, he has mentioned that so many cases have come to notice. Having said that, I would like to bring to the notice of the House that even now the bonded labour practices are there in States like Maharashtra. Very recently, last week, one labourer was caned for many days and finally he died. His entire family was chained and kept in custody. So, such incidents are still taking place. I would like to know from the Government whether it has come to their notice. If so, what action has been taken against the guilty, those Zamindars who have kept them in custody?

श्री हरीश रावत : माननीय सदस्य ने जिस केस का उल्लेख किया है, उस के विषय में राज्य सरकार से पूरी जानकारी लेकर हम माननीय सदस्य तक पहुंचा देंगे और जैसा कि माननीय सदस्य ने कहा कि क्या हम ने इस समस्या को

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

assess किया है, मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि अकेले केवल मंत्रालय ही इस को assess नहीं कर रहा है बल्कि सुप्रीम कोर्ट के दिशा-निर्देशन में National Human Rights Commission भी इस को लगातार assess करता है और राज्य सरकारों के स्तर पर workshops आदि conduct कर के इस समस्या के सारे पहलुओं पर National Human Rights Commission जानकारी देता है। उसे सुप्रीम कोर्ट को रिपोर्ट करता है। प्रधान मंत्री जी ने भी Secretary Labour and Employment की अध्यक्षता में Special Group constitute किया था। वे लोग भी राज्य सरकारों के साथ बराबर बैठक कर के इस को assess करते हैं। उस के अलावा मैंने अपने उत्तर में अभी जिस Task Force का जिक्र किया, उस Task Force ने भी इन सारे पहलुओं पर विचार करने के बाद कुछ संस्तुतियां दी हैं और उन संस्तुतियों को सरकार implement कर रही है।

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, the hon. Minister has avoided the basic reply to the question by not mentioning in the answer what the assessment of the Labour Ministry is. We know various agencies are busy in making such assessment, but it is the Labour Ministry which is the custodian for implementation and enforcement of the law along with the State Government. The Labour Ministry must have an assessment. The Minister has given in his reply what are the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

mechanisms in place at different places to make such assessment. The reply clearly shows that those mechanisms are not simply working despite the bonded labour situation being starkly and openly visible in brick kilns and even in manufacturing, in view of the fast informalisation of workplaces throughout the country. As Dr. Natchiappan has rightly pointed out, the law itself is not adequate. There must be much proactive initiative on the part of the Labour Ministry. I would like to know whether they are reconsidering their approach that this law does not require an assessment. Is the Ministry making some special efforts to make these number of mechanisms which are in place, a number of Committees headed by Secretaries, etc., which are being propagated, to work and to bring before the House as to what is the real situation prevailing, which is already clearly visible?

श्री हरीश रावत : मैं माननीय सदस्य की जानकारी में यह तथ्य लाना चाहता हूँ कि इस Act के enactment के बाद लगातार जो bonded labour की घटनाएं रिपोर्ट हुई हैं, उन की संख्या कम हुई है। पार्लियामेंट ने जो एक्ट पास किया है, उस ने assessment आदि के ये सारे अधिकार भी, जैसाकि मैंने शुरू में कहा

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

राज्य सरकारों को दिए हैं। डिस्ट्रिक्ट मजिस्ट्रेट की अध्यक्षता में एक विजिलेंस कमेटी है जोकि annual basis पर अपनी रिपोर्ट तैयार करती है। उस रिपोर्ट के आधार पर हम राज्य सरकार से जानकारियां लेते हैं और हम लगातार इस मामले में राज्य सरकार के टच में हैं, रहते हैं। जहां तक enforcement का मामला है ..(व्यवधान)

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Why doesn't the assessment figure in your reply? (Interruptions).

(Followed by 1H)

NB/RG/1H/11.35

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT: Sir, I need your protection. All these details should have been given in the answer...(Interruptions)

श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि : आप तो फिगर्स देंगे नहीं ... (व्यवधान)

श्री सभापति : पाणि जी, आप बैठ जाइए ... (व्यवधान) पाणि जी, आपकी टर्न नहीं है, आप बैठ जाइए ... (व्यवधान)

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT: I would request you to give direction to the Minister to come with a proper answer...(Interruptions)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

MR. CHAIRMAN: If you are not satisfied with the answer, you know the procedure...(Interruptions)

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: You give direction to the Minister to lay the assessment done...(Interruptions)

श्री सभापति : पाणि जी, आप बैठ जाइए ... (व्यवधान) बैठ जाइए ... (व्यवधान) You have not been given the floor...(Interruptions) Please sit down...(Interruptions) Please listen to the answer.

डा. भारतकुमार राऊत : मंत्री जी, आप pointed जवाब क्यों नहीं देते हैं? ... (व्यवधान)

श्री हरीश रावत : यदि माननीय सदस्य ईयरवाइज़ डिटेल्स चाहते हैं, तो मैं वह भी उनको देने के लिए तैयार हूँ ... (व्यवधान)

डा. भारतकुमार राऊत : वह answer में आना चाहिए ... (व्यवधान)

श्री सभापति : आपको वह इन्फॉर्मेशन मिल जाएगी ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI HARISH RAWAT: The incidents of bonded labour reported in the year 1999-2000 were 8,195; in 2000-01, it was 5,256; in 2001-02, it was 3,929; in 2002-03, it was 2,198; and in 2003-04, it was 2,465. Even in 2006-07, the reported cases were 197 only. In 2007-08, it was 716; in 2008-09, it was 543; in 2009-10, it was 364 and in 2010-11, it

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

was 865. Likewise, more than 26,000 people, who were identified as bonded labour, were rehabilitated throughout the country. I have the State-wise figures also. I will place the figures on the Table of the House.

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT: I want to put my supplementary again...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You will get the information.

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT: The House should get the information. We should be allowed to ask more supplementaries on that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We cannot depart from the practice.

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT: If the figures are not given, then, how do you expect us to put our supplementaries?(Interruptions)

श्री पुरुषोत्तम खोडाभाई रूपाला : इस पर Half-an-Hour Discussion दे दीजिए।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Give notice for it. That is a different matter...

SHRI HARISH RAWAT: Sir, the hon. Member has asked about a particular State...(Interruptions) Okay; there may be some more cases in the mind of the hon. Member; he may write to me. I will

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

forward it to the hon. Minister, and he will come back to you. He will answer you in detail.

श्री मणि शंकर अय्यर : सभापति जी, मैं हमारे माननीय मंत्री जी के जवाब के प्रति अपना असंतोष जताना चाहता हूँ। यहां खास तौर से इनसे पूछा गया था कि इस विषय के संबंध में क्या आप ग्राम न्यायालयों का इस्तेमाल करेंगे या नहीं? अब्बल तो इनके जवाब में इस बिंदु की पूरी तरह से उपेक्षा की गई है, दूसरी चीज यह है कि ग्राम न्यायालयों को गठित करने का एक कानून इस संसद ने पारित किया था। जब कानून मौजूद है, तो आपको यह कहने में क्या कठिनाई है कि हां, हम ग्राम न्यायालयों का इस्तेमाल करेंगे? यदि आपने ग्राम न्यायालयों का इस्तेमाल किया, तो चूंकि ये एक किस्म के सर्किट कोर्ट हैं, ये गांव-गांव जाएंगे और इनका कर्तव्य यही है कि ये हर जिले में जाएं, हर ब्लॉक में जाएं और जहां जरूरत पड़े, वहां तक पहुंचें और पता करवाएं कि क्या हो रहा है और कैसे हो रहा है। मेरी समझ में नहीं आता कि जब हमारी सरकार ने ग्राम न्यायालयों का कानून तैयार किया था और उसको पारित करवाया था, तो आप क्यों उनका इस्तेमाल करने पर इतना ऐतराज जता रहे हैं? अगर टास्कफोर्स ने इसकी तरफ ध्यान नहीं दिया, तो मंत्रालय का फर्ज बनता है कि वह इस पर ध्यान दे, शुक्रिया।

(1J/MP पर आगे)

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

MP-MKS/1J/11.40

श्री हरीश रावत : सर, माननीय सदस्य ने ग्राम न्यायालयों के महत्व को यहां इंगित किया, मैं उनकी भावना से पूरी तरह सहमत हूं। ग्राम न्यायालयों को अधिक से अधिक अधिकार सम्पन्न बनाना हमारी सरकार का दृष्टिकोण है और हम न्यायिक व्यवस्था के निष्पादन में ग्राम न्यायालयों के महत्व को समझते हैं, लेकिन जो बाधा है, जैसा मैंने शुरू में कहा कि ऐक्ट का जो सैक्शन 21 है, वह बहुत साफ तौर पर इस पावर को Executive Magistrates को देता है। जब यह सुझाव आया कि इस पावर को Executive Magistrates के बजाय न्यायिक मैजिस्ट्रेट्स को सौंपा जाए, तो उस समय टास्क फोर्स की तरफ से यह सुझाव आया कि न्यायपालिका पहले से ही overburdened है और इस तरीके के मामले भी यदि उनको सौंपे जाएंगे तो बेहतर न्याय नहीं दिया जा सकेगा, इसलिए identification के process में जो मैजिस्ट्रेट्स सम्मिलित हैं, उन्हीं को judicial power दे दी जाए ताकि वे ही उसका ट्रायल कर सकें। उसके बावजूद जैसा माननीय सदस्य ने कहा कि हम ग्राम न्यायालयों के महत्व को स्वीकार नहीं कर रहे हैं, उसको इग्नोर करने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं या उसको avoid करने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं, तो मेरा कहना है कि कहीं पर हमने ऐसी कोशिश नहीं की है। इसीलिए टास्क फोर्स गठित किया गया, लेकिन टास्क फोर्स ने अपने सुझावों में

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

इस बात को कहा कि ऐक्ट ठीक से काम कर रहा है, ऐक्ट में संशोधन की जरूरत नहीं है। उन्होंने हमको इस संदर्भ में काम करने के लिए एप्रोच बदलने की बात कही और हमने तदनुसार कई कदम उठाए हैं। उनमें से एक कदम यह भी किया, जो नाच्चीयप्पन साहब के जवाब में मैंने कहा कि हमने तमिलनाडु में एक पायलट प्रोजेक्ट शुरू किया था, आई.एल.ओ. के सहयोग से, उसकी सर्वत्र प्रशंसा हुई है। हमारा फोकस अब prevention की तरफ है ताकि इस तरीके के incidents कम हो सकें और फिर गरीबी उन्मूलन की जो हमारी योजनाएं हैं, उनका लक्ष्य ये ही वर्ग हैं, इन्हीं को लक्ष्यगत करके किया जा रहा है। इस विषय में जो हमारे 6 ऐक्ट्स हैं, जिसमें मिनिमम वेजेज़ ऐक्ट से लेकर दूसरे ऐक्ट सम्मिलित हैं, उन सारे ऐक्ट्स के enforcement के लिए भी हम लगातार राज्य सरकारों के सम्पर्क में हैं ताकि इसको समाप्त किया जा सके।
...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI RUDRA NARAYAN PANY: Sir, is the Minister saying that all these Acts have been implemented at the bonding level? That is, they have accepted the bonded labour practice. Whether the Central Government is accepting....(Interruptions)...

Q. No. 204 (contd.)

श्री सभापति : पाणि जी, आप बैठ जाइए। ... (व्यवधान)... बैठ जाइए, प्लीज़।

SHRI RUDRA NARAYAN PANY: Whether the Government is accepting the bonded labour practice or not.....(Interruptions)...

श्री हरीश रावत : माननीय सदस्य ट्रेड यूनियन के नेता हैं, वे खुद ही अपने आपको संतुष्ट कर सकते हैं, लेकिन जितनी जानकारी मेरे पास थी, उस जानकारी को मैंने कहीं छिपाया नहीं है। यदि फिर भी माननीय सदस्यों का कोई ऐसा विशेष सवाल रह गया हो, तो हमको खुशी होगी कि हम आपको और जानकारी दे सकें क्योंकि यह एक ऐसा विषय है, जिसको कानूनन समाप्त किया गया है। माननीय सदस्य ने इंदिरा जी का स्मरण किया। इंदिरा जी ने 1975 में अपने 20-Point Programme में इसको सम्मिलित किया था और 1976 में enactment के ज़रिए पार्लियामेंट ने इस प्रथा को समाप्त घोषित कर दिया।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

(Ends)

SHRIMATI NAZNIN FARUQUE: Sir, I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether the Ministry has considered promotion of tea industry in the hilly areas of North-Eastern region on the lines of Assam as the flavour of tea varies with altitude; if so, the details thereof; and the details of plan for betterment of Assam tea.

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Sir, tea is a very, very strategic area for our country. It is an area that, in many ways, provides direct and indirect opportunities, for employment, to over 30 lakh people; 16.5 lakh people directly, and close to 13.5 lakh people indirectly. Having said that, tea also has a very, very important place, I believe, in the brand equity of India globally. Today, India produces close to 23 per cent of global production.

(Contd. by KS/1k)

1k/11.45/ks

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA (contd.): We have a market share of close to about 11 per cent of world exports, that is, 213 million kilos. In the last five or six years, the tea industry in India has experienced tremendous growth both in the price area, in terms of

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 205 (contd.)

prices firming up in the area of exports and in the area of production. Hopefully, this year, we will be able to close at over a billion kilos which is going to be for the first time in the history of our country for which I think not only Government and Tea Board but the tea growers, both small, medium and large tea growers, must be commended by this House as well as the nation. The tea industry is made up of two very important segments, the large tea gardens and the small tea growers. More and more, many more individuals are coming into this area which is a very, very heartening sign for the tea industry. Small growers today constitute close to about 26 per cent of the total industry in India, close to about 1,61,000 small growers from a basket of close to 1,68,000 growers. The hilly areas too, as my colleague, the Member of Parliament has pointed out, is an extremely important area and the Government is extremely committed to promoting tea in hilly areas as well as new areas. There are many schemes which have been formulated by the Tea Board which will promote this enterprise. The Tea Board's financial capacity has grown from Rs.350 crores in the Tenth Plan to about Rs.800 crores in the Eleventh Plan. In respect

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 205 (contd.)

of the hilly areas, especially in the North-Eastern Region, Uttarakhand, Himachal Pradesh, etc., we have taken many steps like a 25 per cent subsidy for new planting based on unit-cost basis, which is defined by NABARD, the Special Purpose Tea Fund which is looking at a greater amount of replantation and rejuvenation, financial assistance for market penetration for greater Orthodox production. One of the major areas which have barriers to entry is the cartage and the freight cost and the inland transport cost. For that, a subsidy of one-and-a-half rupees per kilo is being given by the Tea Board for cartage to Amingavai ICD for exports. Promotion of the Orthodox tea is also in process. We have, for new plants, a 25 per cent subsidy; for new mini factories, a 40 per cent subsidy; for leaf collection, weighing scales and other infrastructure required, a hundred per cent subsidy and also a revolving corpus of Rs.10,000 for training, for study tours and so on to help the growth in the hilly areas.

SHRIMATI NAZNIN FARUQUE: My second supplementary is this, Sir. I would like to know the details of the plan for the betterment of the Assam tea.

Q. No. 205 (contd.)

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Sir, Assam is a very, very important stakeholder in the tea industry, not only in India but, I believe, globally. Fifty per cent of the Indian production of tea comes from Assam and, therefore, whatever more we do for Assam is very much the need of the hour. As of now, in the Eleventh Plan period over the last four and a half years, we have dispersed funds to Assam close to about 188 crores of rupees. I will give you the details of the Heads under which this has been given. Under Plantation Development, for new plantation and rejuvenation, it is close to about Rs.31 crores; for Irrigation and Transport, close to about Rs. 50 crores; for QUPDS, Quality Upgradation Development Scheme, close to Rs.59 crores; and for Incentive for Production of Orthodox tea, close to about Rs.47 crores. So, a total of about Rs.188 crores have already been given to Assam.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA: Sir, the tea industry plays an important role in our economy. The Assam tea is a world famous tea. From the tea industry, the country is earning a handsome amount of

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 205 (contd.)

foreign exchange. In Assam, small tea growers play a very important role. Sir, 28 per cent of the total tea production of Assam comes from the small tea growers.

(cd. by 1l/kgg)

1l/11.50/kgg-gs

BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA (contd.): But, small tea growers are facing various problems; due to the monopoly of big tea merchants, they are not getting adequate market share. Since they do not get the market share, the cultivators of tea damage their production, they destroy their production. I would like to know from the hon. Minister of the steps his Ministry is going to take to safeguard the interests of small tea growers. In the last Session, the Monsoon Session of Parliament, the hon. Minister had announced a Rs.500 crores package to help the small tea growers of Assam. What is the status of this package? I would like to know on these from the hon. Minister.

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Sir, as I mentioned in my earlier answer, the small tea growers are increasingly growing in number across the length and breadth of the country, which is a very

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 205 (contd.)

heartening sign. Having said that, I would say that the Government and the Tea Board, together, are extremely committed to the cause of the small tea growers. We have a number of steps that we put in place to ensure that we encourage greater proliferation of smaller tea growers. We put in place a number of programmes—some of which I have detailed. But, specifically for the small tea growers, we have financial assistance to Self Help Groups. Each SHG is required to have a minimum membership of 50 small tea growers and to an extent of 50 acres in terms of acreage they are provided with a 100 per cent grant for setting up of a leaf collection centre, storage, godowns and purchasing leaf scales; transport vehicles are provided at a 50 per cent subsidy; Rs.10,000 per hectare is given to these SHGs to get inputs such as fertilizers, pesticides and sprays; a special training camp has been put in place. Very clearly, whether it is the quality upgradation or product diversification scheme a subsidy for machinery is provided; for SHGs, close to about 40 per cent of the subsidy is given. Study tours are being organised for small tea growers because our competition in this area with regard to small tea growers, and

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 205 (contd.)

where we can learn a lot from, is from the country called Kenya. They have specialised in the small tea growing model. We actually have sent study groups, of small tea growers, three times to Kenya—once in 2006, the second time in 2009 and the third time in 2011.

Now, the most important point that I come to is the issue of ensuring that the small tea growers get the maximum value for their produce. To allay the concern raised by the hon. Member, I would like to say that for the first time in our history, we have set up earlier this year, in May 2011, the Small Tea Growers Directorate to champion the cause of small tea growers. This is one of the largest and most important landmark steps this Government has taken for small tea growers. 95 posts have been granted formal approval -- 13 non-technical and 82 technical. One of the key issues that is, also, in the minds of the people—I would like to raise this issue even though the hon. Member has not raised it—is the relationship between the bought leaf factories and the small tea growers. To ensure that the small tea growers get the maximum value for their produce, one of the key reasons why monitoring was not as efficacious as possible was

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 205 (contd.)

because of the fact that we did not have inspectors who would monitor the bought leaf factories. Now, with these posts in place, we are appointing 22 factory administrative officers who will go and inspect the factories and make sure that according to the PSF, price sharing formula, the money is distributed to small tea growers.

श्री समन पाठक: धन्यवाद सर। जैसा कि माननीय मंत्री जी ने अपने जबाव में बताया है कि उत्पादकता को बेहतर बनाने हेतु Eleventh Plan की वे तरह कुछ फैसिलिटी और सब्सिडी देने जा रहे हैं। दार्जिलिंग गुणवत्ता के हिसाब से चाय के उत्पादन के लिए विश्व में प्रसिद्ध है। मैं सरकार से जानना चाहता हूं कि असम के साथ-साथ जो फैसिलिटी, सब्सिडी की स्कीम्स हैं, वे दार्जिलिंग में स्माल ग्रोवर्स को भी दी जा रही हैं या अलग से दार्जिलिंग को कोई विशेष पैकेज दिया जा रहा है? (1M/ASC पर आगे)

TDB-ASC/1M/11.55

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Sir, we look at tea holistically in our country. For us, the key issue is two-fold. On one side of the metrics, it is really the small tea growers and the large tea growers. Our concentration has to be to look after both areas in this. On the other side, it is geographical. For us, there the key issue is to

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 205 (contd.)

promote production of tea and growing of tea in hilly areas. The facts, I have enumerated in terms of what steps the Government is taking. Two more issues, Sir, I would like to bring to light because many of our colleagues are very, very concerned about the tea sector, and very rightfully so. Sir, the two steps that my Government has taken in the last two, two-and-a-half years are these. One of the key issues that is facing the tea industry is the issue of structural informatics and the social cost that is involved with that. We have put the Indian Institute of Plantation Management, IIPM in place to do a structural informatics study. They have come up with a number of recommendations with regard to labour cost, social cost, health, education of tea workers, many of which, we are taking on board, as we prepare our programmes and our plans for the 12th Plan. So, that is one issue.

The other, Sir, is really, as I mentioned, to make sure that we regain our foothold in the global market. I really believe that India's brand equity which is today known for Information Technology and areas of manufacturing should also be known in the plantation sector,

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 205 (contd.)

specifically tea, because tea has emanated from India, Sir, almost 2000-3000 years ago, and we must get that brand equity back. So, with that in mind, I have put in place a new Plan, which we call “555”, which means, five countries, five steps, five years. We are focussing on Iran, the U.S., Kazakhstan, Egypt and Russia, which are our prominent markets. For these five countries, from an export point of view, looking at five steps, over a period of five years, the Government of India -- and this is a proposal we are making -- wants to put in place close to about a Rs. 100 crore programme for this, which will be a PPP, public private partnership model, where the private sector will have to bring in 25 per cent and the Government will put in 75 per cent. So, we are committing ourselves, over a period of time, if it gets approval in the 12th Plan, to a Rs. 100 crore plan of promoting and branding India Tea in five tea export markets. (Interruptions)

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, my specific question is whether...

Q. No. 205 (contd.)

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Sir, if I may just respond to Mr. Yechury -- he talked about “555”, as a brand -- one he promotes...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, we are running out of time. (Interruptions)

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: He promotes a multi-national brand... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Roy, please go ahead.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, my specific question is whether the Government has introduced any special monitoring system to look into proper utilisation of what is called the Special Purpose Tea Fund, or, it is left to the discretion of the bureaucrats in the Tea Board.

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Sir, the SPTF is a very, very ambitious and a very important scheme, keeping in mind the present scenario of the tea industry in India.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: I want to know about the monitoring aspect of it.

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: One of the key issues that we are facing is the issue of the age and the senility of our tea

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Q. No. 205 (contd.)

bushes. We must make sure that more and more people come on board for this programme. We monitor it extremely closely, Sir. I would just like to apprise the hon. Member of our achievement, as of today. Over the last four-and-a-half years, we have, on a re-plantation basis, achieved 21000 hectares, rejuvenation 6000 hectares, and as a subsidy given out about Rs. 109 crores. Of these 1686 tea gardens, we are focussing on a sub-set of 1140, because these are where the senility of tea bushes are the maximum. And of 1140, close to 845 have committed to being part of the SPTF Programme; 728 of which have also given a seven-year programme for re-plantation and rejuvenation, where, over the seven years, they will re-plant and rejuvenate close to 60000 hectares of tea bushes.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Who is monitoring it?

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Sir, we are monitoring it. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. Question No. 206, please.

(Ends)

श्री कांजीभाई पटेल : सर, ललित कला अकादमी में असली चित्रों के स्थान पर नकली चित्रों को रखने का मामला गंभीर है, ऐसा लगता है कि सरकार ने इसको गंभीरता से नहीं लिया है। मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि यह मामला अकादमी के ध्यान में कौन लाया और कब लाया?

कुमारी शैलजा : सभापति जी, हमने अपने उत्तर में जवाब दिया है। यह 2003 में ललित कला अकादमी के नोटिस में आया। उस वक्त इसे टेक अप किया गया और 2006 में एक केस तिलक मार्ग पुलिस स्टेशन में रजिस्टर किया गया, बाकी प्रश्न का जवाब मैंने मूल जवाब में दिया ही है। इसके बाद ललित कला अकादमी में, जो कि एक ऑटोनॉमस ऑर्गेनाइजेशन है, 2004 में एक ऑथेंटिकेशन कमेटी सेट अप की गई थी और उसने करीबन..(व्यवधान)..

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question Hour is over.

(Ends)

-ASC/LP-KLS/12.00/1N

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN IN THE CHAIR)

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी : सर, एक महत्वपूर्ण विषय है, ..(व्यवधान).. देवानन्द जी की मृत्यु हुई है, वे देश के जाने-माने कलाकार थे,

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

..(व्यवधान)..लेकिन उनकी मृत्यु पर श्रद्धांजलि भी नहीं की, मुझे लगता है कि इस पर ..(व्यवधान)..करेक्शन..(व्यवधान).. करना चाहिए ..(व्यवधान)..

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

SHRI A.K. ANTONY: Sir, I lay on the Table, under sub-section (4) of Section 347 of the Cantonments Act, 2006, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Defence Notification No. S.R.O. 10 (E), dated the 4th November, 2011, publishing the Election of Vice-President of the Cantonments Board (Procedure) Rules, 2011.

KUMARI SELJA: Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (a) Annual Report of the Gandhi Smriti and Darshan Samiti, New Delhi, for the year 2009-10.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the Gandhi Smriti and Darshan Samiti, New Delhi, for the year 2009-10, and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Samiti.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) and (b) above.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Sir, I lay on the Table—

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry (Department of Commerce), Notification No. G.S.R. 811 (E), dated the 15th November, 2011, publishing the Spices Board Amendment Rules, 2011, under Section 40 of the Spices Board Act, 1986.

II. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry (Department of Commerce), Notification No. S.O. 2020 (E), dated the 30th August, 2011, imposing new rubber cess for enhancing the rate of cess on rubber to Rs 2.00 a kg. with effect from September 1, 2011, under sub-section (3) of Section 25 of the Rubber Act, 1947.

III. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) of Section 619A of the Companies Act, 1956:—

- (i) (a) Fifty-third Annual Report and Accounts of the Export Credit Guarantee Corporation of India Limited, New Delhi, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Auditor General of India thereon .

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.
- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the State Trading Corporation of India Limited (STC), New Delhi, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.
- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the PEC Ltd., New Delhi, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.
- (iv) (a) Forty-eighth Annual Report and Accounts of the MMTC Limited, New Delhi, for the year 2010-11, together with the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.

IV. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Diamond Institute (IDI), Surat, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Gem and Jewellery Export Promotion Council (GJEPC), Mumbai, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

- (iii) (a) Eighth Annual Report and Accounts of the Export Promotion Council for EOUs and SEZ Units (EPCES), New

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Delhi, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.

SHRIMATI PANABAKA LAKSHMI: Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Centre for Jute Diversification (NCJD), Kolkata, for the year 2009-10, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Centre.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (i) (a) above.
- (ii) (a) Forty-second Annual Report and Accounts of the Handloom Export Promotion Council (HEPC), Chennai, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Council.

(iii) (a) Fifty-seventh Annual Report and Accounts of the Synthetic and Rayon Textiles Export Promotion Council (SRTEPC), Mumbai, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.

(iv) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the South India Textile Research Association (SITRA), Coimbatore, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Association.

(v) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Bombay Textile Research Association (BTRA), Mumbai, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Association.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

(vi) (a) Sixteenth Annual Report and Accounts of the Powerloom Development and Export Promotion Council (PDEXCIL), Mumbai, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.

SHRI NAMO NARAIN MEENA: Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Seventeenth Progress Report on the Action Taken Pursuant to the Recommendations of the Joint Parliamentary Committee on Stock Market Scam and matters relating thereto (December, 2011).

SHRI M.M. PALLAM RAJU: Sir, I lay on the Table—

I. A copy (in Hindi) of the Ministry of Defence Notification No. S.R.O. 09, dated the 24th October, 2011, publishing corrigendum to Notification No. S.R.O. 65, dated the 21st July, 2008.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) of Section 619A of the Companies Act, 1956:—

(i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Bharat Electronics

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Limited (BEL), Bangalore, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Bharat Dynamics Limited, Hyderabad, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
 - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited (HAL), Bangalore, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
 - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

**PETITION PRAYING FOR RE-EXAMINATION OF THE POLICY OF
MAKING TUNNEL-BASED HYDROPOWER PROJECTS**

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir, I report to the House the receipt of a petition signed by Dr. Bharat Jhunjunwala, a resident of Uttarakhand and others praying for re-examination of the policy of making tunnel-based hydropower projects.

(Ends)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now matters to be raised with the permission of the Chair. I think first is Mr. Prabhat Jha.

श्री सैयद अजीज पाशा : सर, कॉलिंग अटेंशन नोटिस का क्या हुआ
..(व्यवधान)...दस दिन हो गए हैं..(व्यवधान)..तेलंगाना का इश्यू बहुत बड़ा
है..(व्यवधान)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can discuss it later.
...(Interruptions)...

श्री सैयद अजीज पाशा : कब?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will call you. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. M.V. MAITREYAN: I have given notice of suspension of Question Hour, Sir. ... (Interruptions)... So, it should have the priority over all other issues.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What I suggest, Mr. Maitreyan, let these three-four issues go, then we will take it up. ...(Interruptions)...क्या है?

श्री सैयद अजीज पाशा : तेलंगाना के इश्यू के बारे में जवाब दीजिए, दस दिन से कुछ नहीं हुआ है..(व्यवधान)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sir, for the Call Attention notice, there are certain days when it has to be taken.

DR. K. KESHAVA RAO: Sir, I understand that. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Keshava Rao, you know the rules, so why do you raise it again? ...(Interruptions)...

श्री सैयद अजीज पाशा : पिछले सेशन में..(व्यवधान)..नहीं आया, इस सेशन में भी दिया है..(व्यवधान).. नोटिस दीजिए बोलते हैं..(व्यवधान)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: For two days in a week, we take Call Attention. We are regularly listing Call Attention. ...(Interruptions)... You can take up the issue of your Call Attention with the hon. Chairman. ...(Interruptions)... That will be listed. ...(Interruptions)... It is listed twice in a week. ...(Interruptions)... अब सेशन चला नहीं तो हम क्या करेंगे?..(व्यवधान)..

श्री सैयद अजीज पाशा : अब तो सेशन शुरू हो गया है..(व्यवधान)..

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

श्री उपसभापति : आज ही तो शुरु हुआ है, चलने दीजिए, बाद में देखेंगे..(व्यवधान)..

श्री सैयद अजीज पाशा : उपसभापति जी, ठीक है, आप तेलंगाना का इश्यू सीरियसली रखिए..(व्यवधान)..

MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION OF CHAIR

RE: ISSUES RELATING TO MULLAPERIYAR DAM

DR. M.V. MAITREYAN (TAMIL NADU): Sir, recent weeks have witnessed escalating tension in the Tamil Nadu-Kerala border regarding the Mullaipaeriyar Dam. The Supreme Court in its order of 2006 declared the Mullaipaeriyar Dam as safe and directed that water can be stored up to 142 feet initially. The recent action of the Kerala Government insisting on the construction of a new dam alleging that the existing dam is unsafe and is tantamount to violating the Supreme Court order.

The hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu, Dr. Puratchi Thalavi, in her letters to the hon. Prime Minister dated 23rd and 29th November, 2011 had requested the hon. Prime Minister to use his good offices to advise the Kerala Government to abide by the Supreme Court order of 2006 and not to precipitate matters in the interest of both the States.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Subsequently on 2nd December, 2011, the AIADMK members of Parliament met the hon. Prime Minister and submitted a memorandum.

(Contd by 10/SSS)

SSS/10/12.05

DR. V. MAITREYAN (CONTD.): The hon. Supreme Court in its order of 2006, in unambiguous terms concluded that the Mullaiperiyar Dam is safe and the Government of Tamil Nadu has already taken safety measures to keep the dam as good as new. In such a situation, the Government of Kerala is spreading rumors to create panic and fear psychosis amongst the people of Kerala about the safety of the dam without any scientific basis or evidence. The Kerala Government has issued statements that 22 tremors had occurred in the last four months which is blatantly untrue. In fact, there have been only four mild tremors in the current year as per the IMD data and these tremors had occurred away from the Mullaiperiyar Dam and had no impact on the dam. Dams much older than the Mullaiperiyar Dam are functional. In Tamil Nadu itself, the Kallanai Dam was built by Karikala Cholan in the second century A.D. i.e. more than 1900 years old and is still

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

functioning without any problem. The materials used to construct the Mullaiperiyar Dam are the same as that of Karikala Cholan used for the Kallanai Dam 1900 years ago, stone and surki. The Advocate General of Kerala has gone on record before the Division Bench of Kerala High Court that even in the case of any eventuality the Idukky Reservoir, the Kulamavu and Cheruthoni Dam will take the water. The Kerala Government in its own admission recognises that all safety measures are in place. In the current situation of fear and panic created by the Kerala Government, there are reports of mob vandalism organised by certain Kerala political parties at the dam site. A mob of 200 people damaged the gate at the Tamil Nadu Electricity Board facility at the dam on 3rd December and on 4th December, (Time Bell) Sir, I have not even finished. What is this?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What are you saying? The mike is off.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: ...the lumpen elements marched towards the dam from Vallakadavu with a JCB with the intention of letting out water and wanting to damage the Mullaiperiyar Dam.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude. Your time is over.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Thus, the very security and safety of the Dam is being deliberately threatened. Hence, the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu wrote to the Prime Minister on 4th December, 2011 and requested to order the deployment of Central Industrial Security Force (CISF) at the Dam site to avert any manmade catastrophic consequences immediately.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You follow the rules very strictly. What happened today?

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Unfortunately, even after three days, there has been no response from the Prime Minister. Ayyappa devotees from Tamil Nadu on a pilgrimage to Sabarimala have been attacked.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not going on record.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: What is the problem? I will not accept it, Sir. I had given suspension of Zero Hour Notice and you do not allow me to speak for three minutes.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I had allowed you three minutes. What are you talking? No, no, your three minutes are over.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: This is not a matter of three minutes. This is a matter of life and death of crores of lives of the people of....

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You cannot do this. This is not the way.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Do you want to run the House or not?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why are you...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: I just want one minute, Sir.

SHRI A. ELAVARASAN: Sir, this is a serious issue.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You agree on something and now you are changing here.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Vehicles bearing Tamil Nadu registration plates are vandalised. Tamil establishments in Kerala and even journalists and professionals from Tamil Nadu who are on official work are threatened. The Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu had made a fervent appeal yesterday to the people of Kerala not to succumb to the machinations of ill-wishers and unscrupulous mischief mongers.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, you are breaking the rules. This is not right. I am sorry.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: I urge upon the hon. Prime Minister to intervene immediately and advise the Kerala Government to 1. Honour the rights guaranteed to Tamil Nadu under the 1886 Agreement followed by the supplemented agreements of 1970 in letter and spirit. 2. To

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

abide by the order of Supreme Court order of 2006. 3. Desist from the approach to construct a new dam and not to whip up fear and panic among the people of Kerala and 4. Deploy CISF force immediately at the Dam site to prevent any intentional damage that may be caused by lumpen elements.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is not correct. You are breaking the rules.

DR. N. JANARDHANA REDDY: Sir, when you are occupying the Chair, he dictates the Chair.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: The matter is very serious. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, please sit down.

DR. N. JANARDHANA REDDY: You cannot threaten the Chair.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: If the emotional issue of seven crores people of Tamil Nadu cannot be raised....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, this is the not the way of putting your words.

(Contd. by NBR/1P)

-SSS/NBR-SCH/1P/12.10.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN (CONTD.): Hon. Members, it has been agreed upon that each of you will take only two minutes. Now, Mr. Siva.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (TAMIL NADU): Sir, the Mullaperiyar Dam was built in 1886...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, one minute. Whatever I have spoken should all go on record. This is my fervent appeal...(Interruptions)...Sir, I am appealing you, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your appeal will be looked into. But, you cannot direct the Chair.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: The Mullaperiyar Dam caters to the drinking water needs of people spread across five districts in Tamil Nadu and also cultivates more than three lakh hectares in these five districts -- Theni, Madurai, Dindigul, Siva Ganga and Ramanathapuram. But for this Mullaperiyar Dam's water, all these areas will become desert and the future of the people will be a very big question. Sir, the dam is strong enough even though it has been more than a century old. The eminent experts appointed by the Supreme Court as well as the Chief Engineer of the Government of Kerala, the Chief Engineer of the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Government of Tamil Nadu and the Chief Engineer deputed by the Central Water Commission inspected and certified, by measuring the seepage, the dam is safe and strong enough to withhold more water than the present 136 ft. The Government of Tamil Nadu earlier agreed for 136 ft. and have also done the repairing works. Now, we insist that the dam's level must be raised to 142 ft. for which the dam is quite capable of withholding more water.

Sir, the Supreme Court has ordered, the Central Water Commission and all eminent experts have certified. And, recently, the Advocate General of the Government of Kerala has submitted an Affidavit before the High Court of Kerala saying that the dam is strong enough to hold more water -- even up to 142 ft.

DR. T.N. SEEMA: Sir, this is not proper.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Madam, please wait. Let me complete. Please don't disturb me.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Seema, please do not disturb.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I am expressing my views.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude, Mr. Siva.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I am concluding.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Apprehensions have been raised that the dam is situated on a seismic zone. I would say that all these apprehensions are baseless. It is not the political parties in Tamil Nadu which are saying this. All the experts who have inspected the dam have certified that the dam is safe. Now, some miscreants are trying to damage the dam. Our leader, Dr. Kalaignar, has written a letter and made a statement that the CISF has to be deployed for protection of the dam and we request intervention of the Central Government for raising water level of the dam to 142 ft. Thank you.

(Ends)

DR. T.N. SEEMA: Sir, I should also be given an opportunity to express my views.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, sit down. You have not given your name.

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: Sir, please allow her to speak for two minutes. She represents Kerala.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We are allowing Mr. Rangarajan to speak from your party.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN: Sir, the Mullaperiyar Dam's issue is pending before the Supreme Court. The hon. Supreme Court has already given its verdict that water level can be increased.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, today we have decided that all stakeholders should be consulted. In this case also all stakeholders should be consulted.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You don't become one of the stakeholders.

DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN: Sir, the hon. Supreme Court has already given a detailed judgment on this.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Natchiappan, please be brief.

DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN: Okay, Sir.

The hon. Supreme Court has already given a detailed judgment and said that the dam level can be increased as per the request of the Government of Tamil Nadu. But, at the same time, it has not been increased and now it stands at only 136 ft. We want that the Government of Kerala be taken a sympathetic view, because it is the life and death of our own people. At the same time, the livelihood of agriculturists has also to be looked into. The issue is before the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

highest authority of the country i.e., Supreme Court. The Supreme Court has constituted a three Member Committee consisting of former Chief Justice, Justice Anand, who presides over it with two other former Supreme Court Judges -- one Justice Thomas to represent Kerala and Justice Laxmanan. All the three are looking into the issue. If the Government of Kerala or the people of Kerala want to make any representation, they can make it before the Committee. The Committee can report to the Supreme Court and, in turn, there can be a very peaceful settlement. Instead of that, if we take it up as an emotional issue, both sides of the people are affected and there will be a law and order problem. Thank you.

(Ends)

(FOLLOWED BY USY "1Q")

-NBR-USY/1Q/12.15

SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU): Sir, the Mullaperiyar Dam has become an issue of conflict and contention between Kerala and Tamil Nadu. Now, there is tension on the border of Tamil Nadu and Kerala.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Emotions are being aroused on both sides. Political parties and various sections of people are agitating on both sides. In such a situation, I did meet the Prime Minister and I requested him to intervene. It is an issue between two States and it would be appropriate that the Prime Minister calls both the Chief Ministers and have a dialogue so that a meaningful amicable solution -- keeping in view the interests of both the States -- can be found out. There is a Supreme Court Empowered Committee which has been looking into the safety of the Dam. If there is any fear, that fear has to be allayed. We should go by the scientific reasoning and the opinion given by the expert scientists. A Committee has been looking into this issue. So, my appeal to the Central Government is that it should play a proactive role and should call a meeting of both the Chief Ministers. Both the States, Tamil Nadu and Kerala, have best of relations. Nothing should be done that adversely impacts the best relations that both the States enjoy. Both the States cannot fight each other and they should continue to enjoy the best relations. The issue must be sorted out amicably, keeping in view the interests of both the States. If there is a fear in Kerala, that has to be allayed and Tamil Nadu should get the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

water. We should strive for amicable solution, emotions should not be roused. I appeal to all political parties, all the sections not to arouse emotions, but to strive for an amicable solution.

(Ends)

SHRI P.J. KURIEN (KERALA): Sir, first of all, I would like to share the concern expressed by my colleagues, including Maitreyanji, Shiva and Raja that Tamil Nadu's interests should be protected; they should get the water. What they are getting today, they should get in future also, not a drop of water should be less. But why this issue came now. Actually what happened was that a study was made by the scientists of IIT, Roorkee. They have submitted a report that if there is an earthquake, higher than 5 degree at the Richter Scale, the dam cannot withstand it. That is the report. It may be correct or may not be correct, I don't know. But there is such a report. Unfortunately, quite a number of tremors happened in the last two months because there were a lot of torrential rains in the State of Kerala. I don't dispute with the exact number of tremors. But what is reported in Kerala is that there were 26 tremors, and on one day there were four tremors. Because of these tremors and because of the report of the scientists

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

of IIT, Roorkee, the people began to fear that the dam is not safe. The reason is that when the dam was constructed 116 years ago, there was no technology to construct a dam which can withstand a tremor. Therefore, there is a natural fear among the people. If anything happens to the Dam — I pray nothing should happen and I believe nothing will happen — the life and property of the 13 lakh people, down the stream in four districts, would be in danger. So, there is a fear in the minds of people of Kerala. We have to allay this fear. If the Dam is safe, and if the experts agree that the dam is safe, we agree to it. But the Government of Kerala has given an alternative proposal that if the dam is not safe, we can have another dam just below, fully protecting — I repeat, fully protecting — the interests of Tamil Nadu. Not even a single drop of water would be less.

(Contd. by 1r — PK)

-USY/PK/1R/12.20

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (CONTD.): The same amount of water, if not more, will be supplied. I am making this pledge here on behalf of Kerala. Believe me. How can I make you believe? I am saying that

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

all the people of Kerala are one. ..(Interruptions).. Sir, this river is not an inter-State river. This is a river in Kerala. An agreement was made by the British. ..(Interruptions).. About 116 years after the agreement, we have not objected to giving water. This is a fact. Therefore, I repeat, if at all second dam is necessary -- let us pray, it should not become necessary; let us pray for that—we can have it just below this Dam. Let us pray that the dam is safe. ..(Time-bell).. I am one with you on that. But, in case the dam is not safe according to the experts, then ...(Interruptions)..

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, safety of Dam cannot be judged by political. ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. Don't interrupt. He didn't interrupt you. ..(Interruptions).. Again, you are putting a wrong precedent. ..(Interruptions).. He didn't interrupt you. This is not an argument...(Interruptions).. Nobody interrupted you. Don't interrupt others.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: I am fully one with you. ..(Interruptions)..

DR. V. MAITREYAN: The Supreme Court has already said that the Dam is safe. ..(Interruptions)..

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, what is that you are doing?

..(Interruptions).. Please, please. ...(Interruptions)..

DR. V. MAITREYAN: It is not a question of water. ..(Interruptions)..

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: I have no quarrel with you. ..(Interruptions)..

DR. V. MAITREYAN: You are questioning the Supreme Court.

..(Interruptions)..

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: You are my brother. I don't want to fight with you..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kurien, please address the Chair.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: I would make it sure that the stand of the Kerala Government is that they give full water, not even a drop less and the second Dam be constructed only if the present Dam is reported to be unsafe by experts.

(Ends)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Rangarajan, be brief. Only two minutes.

SHRI T. K. RANGARAJAN (TAMIL NADU): Sir, this Mullaperiyar Dam dispute is between two States. There is a fear, there is a panic in some parts of Kerala. Even that has been well generated by a film,

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

999 Dam. Sir, my point is that Tamil Nadu is getting water for five districts. Three lac acres of land is cultivated. Because the level has been brought down from 142 ft to 136 ft , now we are holding only one crop. Previously, we used to have two crops. We are not able to have two crops because the level of Dam has come down from 142 to 136. It is not a question of Kerala agreeing to give water. What happened to the Supreme Court judgement already given on Cauvery? Karnataka refused to implement that judgement. So, now, again, the Supreme Court has taken up this issue. Five Judges have been appointed to go into this issue. Now, the devotees are attacked and lorries are attacked. This vandalism should stop. Sir, it should not be a law and order problem. We met the Prime Minister. We requested the Prime Minister that the Centre should intervene. They should call the Chief Ministers of these two States and they should discuss and settle this issue amicably. So, interest of Tamil Nadu should be protected. There is no question of constructing a new dam as long as this Dam is all right. Let experts say. You give 142 ft, which is the requirement of Tamil Nadu. So, I appeal to this august

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

House, from this august House to the Government of India, Prime Minister, to settle the issue between the two States. Thank you.

(Ends)

DR. T.N. SEEMA (KERALA): I thank you, Sir, for having given me this opportunity. First of all, I fully agree with what Prof. Kurien stated here. This water dispute between the two States should be resolved through an initiative by the Centre. For the last 1000 days, a strike has been going on in Vandiperiyar and Chappathu. Sir, huge protests are taking place in all the districts of Kerala. This is an issue of life and death of more than 32,00,000 people. They say that they have given an affidavit in the High Court that the Idukki Dam will contain all the water if something happens to Mullaperiyar Dam.

(Contd. by 1S/SKC)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

1s/12.25/skc-hms

DR. T.N. SEEMA (contd.): There must be a proposal for disaster management. If something happens to the Mullaiperiyar Dam, water level in the Idukki Dam must be reduced in order to contain waters from the Mullaiperiyar Dam into the Idukki Dam or the Cheruthoni Dam. How can we go on like this? By today or tomorrow some solution must be found to the Mullaiperiyar Dam issue. There is danger. We cannot go on living in fear. We cannot live with this kind of a panic situation in Kerala. I would request the Prime Minister and the Centre to take some action. MPs from Kerala held protests inside the Parliament House complex. It is not a joke. It is a question of life and death for us. The Centre must intervene and resolve the issue as early as possible. (Ends)

NEED TO ENFORCE TRAFFIC RULES STRICTLY

श्री राजनीति प्रसाद (बिहार): धन्यवाद, सर। मैं आप के माध्यम से एक बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण विषय की ओर सदन का ध्यान दिलाना चाहता हूँ। सर, हमारे यहां सड़क पर पैदल चलने वालों की संख्या बहुत है। पैदल सड़क पार करने वालों के लिए Zebra crossing बनाए गए हैं और यह नीति बनायी गयी है कि दिल्ली में सड़क पर 40 और 60 की स्पीड पर गाड़ियां चलेंगी और zebra crossing के

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

पास गाड़ी slow चलायी जाएगी, लेकिन यहां सड़क पर सौ किलो मीटर की रफ्तार से गाड़ियां चलती हैं और सारे नियम और कानून धरे रह जाते हैं।

सर, कल एन0एच0 8 पर एक हैड कांस्टेबल रोड क्रॉसिंग करते वक्त तेज रफ्तार गाड़ी की चपेट में आकर मर गया, यानी zebra crossing पर भी गाड़ियां सौ किलो मीटर की रफ्तार से चलायी जाती हैं। सर, मैं चाहता हूं कि इस संबंध में ठोस कानून बनाया जाना चाहिए और जो लोग high speed में गाड़ी चलाते हैं, उन के लिए सख्त सजा के प्रावधान किये जाने चाहिए। यही मेरा कहना है क्योंकि pedestrian लोगों को भी road cross करने का अधिकार है।

(समाप्त)

**DEMAND FOR SUMMONING OF ITALY'S AMBASSADOR BY
EXTERNAL AFFAIRS MINISTER TO CONVEY DISPLEASURE OVER
INSULT TO THE SIKH COMMUNITY**

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL (PUNJAB): Sir, time and again, we have been raising the issue in Parliament of Sikhs being humiliated all over the world by being forced to remove their turban on the pretext of security.

Sir, this year, in March, one Mr. Amritender Singh, coach of the famous golfer, Jeev Milkha Singh, was humiliated, not once but twice, in Milan, Italy. The hon. External Affairs Minister gave us the assurance that the Italian Government would be appropriately

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

conveyed the sentiments of the Sikh community and that they would be sensitized about the turban and the Sikh religion. Despite repeated assurances, sadly, another incident has taken place at the same Milan airport five days back. This time, a Jet Airways commander, Sardar Ravjot Singh Dhupia, was asked to remove his turban. While he protested and tried to explain about the sanctity of the turban for a Sikh, the security officials callously forced him to remove his turban and publicly humiliated him.

Sir, one after another, Sikhs are being targeted in foreign countries. It happened with India's UN Envoy, Pradeep Singh Puri, in the US, it is continuously happening in Italy, and it repeatedly happens in France. This has outraged the entire Sikh community worldwide. The Government of India has been giving false assurances to the Sikh community, but so far, has failed to protect their honour and dignity.

I would urge the hon. Foreign Minister to urgently summon the Italian Ambassador and express his as well as the country's displeasure, in no uncertain terms, so that the brave Sikh community is not insulted again.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

SARDAR SUKHDEV SINGH DHINDSA (PUNJAB): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया (झारखंड): सर, मैं श्री नरेश गुजराल द्वारा किए गए zero hour mention से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करते हुए कहना चाहता हूँ कि सिखों की पगड़ी के साथ खासकर इटली के मिलान शहर में जो कुछ हो रहा है, वह चिंता का विषय है। इस के पहले जीव मिल्खा सिंह के ट्रेनर को कहा गया कि पगड़ी उतार कर ट्रे में डालिए। वह scan होकर जाएगी।

(1 टी/एनबी पर क्रमशः)

KSK/NB/12.30/1T

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया (क्रमागत) : पगड़ी कोई ऐसी चीज नहीं है जो स्कैन की जाए, फिर उतारकर रखी जाए और टोपी की तरह पहन ली जाए। पगड़ी, सिर का ताज है, सम्मान है, respect है, recognition है और धर्म की एक पहचान है। उसको उतारकर सिक्योरिटी चैक का जो नया तरीका मिलान में ईजाद हुआ है, उसकी घोर निंदा होनी चाहिए। इसके पहले भी जब जीव मिल्खा सिंह के ट्रेनर के साथ ऐसा हुआ था, तो उस समय मैंने सदन में यह सवाल उठाया था। उस समय विदेश मंत्री जी ने कहा था कि हमने इटली के Ambassador को बुलाकर कहा है और उन्होंने क्षमा मांगी है। आज पुनः जेट एयरवेज़ के एक पायलट के साथ ऐसी दुर्घटना घटी है, यह दुर्भाग्यजनक है। हमारे साथ यह खिलवाड़ होता है। US में हमारी Ambassador मीरा शंकर की

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

साड़ी को चैक किया जाता है, हमारे डिप्लोमेट हरदीप पुरी के साथ ऐसा घोर अत्याचार होता है। ऐसा क्यों होता है? इस बारे में क्यों नहीं कोई पालिसी बनती? जिस देश का प्रधान मंत्री पगड़ीधारी हो, उस देश के पगड़ीधारियों के साथ इस तरह का अपमान बरदाश्त नहीं होगा ... (व्यवधान) यह सरदारी लेने के लिए गुरु गोविन्द सिंह ने अपने बच्चे शहीद किए हैं और देश की सुरक्षा, जनेऊ, तिलक और बोदी की रक्षा करने के लिए पहले उनके पिताजी शहीद हुए और फिर उनके बच्चे शहीद हुए, तब जाकर उन्होंने यह सरदारी ली, यह पगड़ी ली और यह पगड़ी पहचान बनी। हिंदू धर्म की रक्षा करने के लिए यह सब कुछ हुआ। जो दलित और पीड़ित लोग हैं, उनकी रक्षा करने के लिए, उनकी बाजू पकड़कर उनको ऊपर उठाया गया। आज उस पगड़ी पर जो सवाल उठ रहा है, वह दुर्भाग्यजनक है और सरकार इसको अच्छी तरह से नहीं ले रही है। फ्रांस में भी यही हुआ, यूरोपियन देशों में ऐसा हो रहा है, खासकर उस इटली में यह बार-बार हो रहा है, जिस इटली का चीज़ प्रोडक्शन, सिख कम्युनिटी करती है। आपको पता होगा कि पूरी इटली का जो फेमस चीज़ प्रोडक्शन है, वह वहां की सिख कम्युनिटी करती है, सिख फार्मर करता है। वहां पगड़ी के साथ यह अपमान बरदाश्त नहीं होगा। मेरी आपसे मांग है कि आप तुरन्त इटली के Ambassador को बुलाकर, उन्हें आगाह करें कि अगर आइंदा पगड़ी के साथ ऐसा कुछ हुआ, तो हमारे यहां अगर इटली का कोई डिप्लोमेट आएगा या कोई

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

और व्यक्ति आएगा, तो हम भी माफिया बनाकर, उनको यहां खड़ा करके, बिठाकर रखेंगे, ऐसा उनको बताने की जरूरत है।

(समाप्त)

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (KERALA): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by Shri Naresh Gujral.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (TAMIL NADU): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by Shri Naresh Gujral.

SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by Shri Naresh Gujral.

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by Shri Naresh Gujral.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, sit down. The entire House is in agreement. There is no need to speak. Then, the entire House should speak. Yes, you can speak.

सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा (पंजाब) : उपसभापति जी, नरेश जी ने जो विषय उठाया है, यह लोक सभा में और राज्य सभा में भी कई बार उठ चुका है। कई दफा सरकार ऐशयोरेंस दे चुकी है कि हमने बात की। उपसभापति जी, आपको याद होगा कि आप एक बार यूरोपियन पार्लियामेंट में हमें लीड कर रहे थे, मैं मेंबर था, तो उस वक्त भी हमने उनसे कहा था और फ्रांस में उस वक्त जो कुछ हो

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

रहा था, हम फ्रांस के एम.पी.जे. से भी मिले थे और उन्होंने भी हमें ऐशियोरेंस दी थी, लेकिन आज तक सरकार ने कोई ठोस कदम नहीं उठाया। वे ऐशियोरेंस तो देते रहे हैं, लेकिन ऐसा कभी नहीं हुआ कि किसी को बुलाकर ताड़ना की जाए कि आगे से ऐसा न हो। मेरी सरकार से दरख्वास्त है कि भविष्य में ऐसा कुछ नहीं होना चाहिए।

(समाप्त)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The entire House joins in condemning this incidence and this message should be conveyed to the Minister.

(Ends)

SPECIAL MENTIONS

NEED TO REVOLUTIONISE EDUCATION SYSTEM BY MAKING IT SKILL ORIENTED AND VOCATIONALISED FROM ELEMENTARY STAGE

DR. JANARDHAN WAGHMARE (MAHARASHTRA): Sir, our education system is the system of the elitist class, by the elitist class and for the elitist class from the very beginning.

It has always ignored the masses while framing the structure, the syllabi, the courses and the contents. The textbooks reflect, by and large, the urban elitism which we have harboured in the education system right from the colonial times till today with a few superficial

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

changes. The education reforms, that we have introduced after independence, do not alter the lives of the common people living in the rural areas.

Recently, we have passed a very important legislation making education a Fundamental Right. Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan is a laudable effort to educate the children. But, look at the pathetic conditions of our schools in the rural areas.

(continued by 1u – gsp)

GSP-MP-12.35-1U

DR. JANARDHAN WAGHMARE (CONTD.): No teachers, no teaching. Our children get schooling but no education. The education system is churning millions and millions without rudimentary knowledge and skills. Only a few elite schools in big cities are giving education worth the name. Most schools in urban slums and rural areas are like slaughter houses indeed. Only ten per cent pupils get good education, and, ninety per cent get sub-standard education. The motivational level of our teachers is very, very low. Our education system is geared to be counter-productive. Without human capital, we cannot develop our nation. The entire education system should be

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

skill-oriented. It should be vocationalized from the elementary stage onwards.

I urge upon the Government to revolutionize the entire education system.

(Ends)

SHRI GOVINDRAO ADIK (MAHARASTHRA): Sir, I associate myself with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member.

SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY (TAMIL NADU): Sir, I also associate myself with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member.

DR. ASHOK S. GANGULY (NOMINATED): Sir, I associate myself with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member.

SHRIMATI B. JAYASHREE (NOMINATED): Sir, I also associate myself with this matter raised by the hon. Member.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

**NEED TO BRING KEY STRUCTURAL REFORMS TO BOOST
SLOWING ECONOMY**

SHRI N.K. SINGH (BIHAR): Sir, the Indian Economy appears to be in the midst of a significant slowdown. Industrial production growth has stalled to a low of 1.9 per cent year-on-year in September. The consumer durables index has been trending lower, suggesting that even the Indian consumer has started to tighten spending on ‘big ticket’ purchases. Passenger car sales have nose-dived in recent months, falling by 15.8 per cent and 10.1 per cent year-on-year in July and August respectively. Evidently, the impact of higher borrowing costs, stubborn price pressures and falling asset prices has taken a high toll on domestic demand in India.

While Indian exports have remained remarkably buoyant, it does not appear to be a sustaining one in the light of declining world-wide economic conditions. Exports shrank 17.1 per cent month-on-month in August, taking the year-on-year rate down to just 46 per cent from 81.8 per cent in July. All these indicators clearly suggest that the current slowdown is not contra-cyclical but due to structural failures and due to structural frailties of the Indian economy. Major policy

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

reforms relating to land, labour and taxation have been completely stalled. Key legislation like the Land-Acquisition Bill, Labour Laws Reforms, GST Bill and Direct Tax Code are yet to be passed. Additionally, measures ranging from opening investment into the aviation sector to the extension of banking licenses to private sector players still remain on the anvil. Therefore, for India to completely realize its economic potential, key structural reforms by the Government are essential to reinvigorate the economy.

(Ends)

DEMAND TO ALLOCATE TEXTILE PARKS TO PUNJAB

SARDAR SUKHDEV SINGH DHINDSA (PUNJAB): Sir, after adoption of new manufacturing policy, the Union Government has announced setting-up of 21 textile parks in various parts of the country. However, it is surprising that Punjab does not figure in the list of States, where textile parks are proposed to be set up. The exclusion of the State, which is one of the largest cotton producing State in the country, has shocked the people of Punjab in general, and, thousands of cotton producing farmers, in particular. Bathinda and its neighboring areas

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

are leading producers of fine cotton in the country. This year, the cotton production in Bathinda belt, which includes Mansa, Muktsar, Barnala, Faridkot, Fazilka and Ferozepur Districts, is expected to be around two million bales.

Therefore, to retrieve the situation, I urge upon the Government to review its decision regarding allocation of textile parks to various States, and, do justice to Punjab in this matter by allocating, at least, seven textile parks to Punjab. Thank you.

(Ends)

(Followed by YSR-1W)

-GSP-MP/YSR-SC/12.40/1W

श्री एस.एस.अहलुवालिया (झारखंड) : उपसभापति महोदय, मैं माननीय सदस्य के वक्तव्य से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ और कहना चाहता हूँ कि मेनचेस्टर की टेक्सटाइल मिल्स को चैलेंज देने वाला लुधियाना, जो कम्पेयर किया जाता था, आज उसको वंचित करके केन्द्र सरकार ने गलत मैसेज दिया है कि पंजाब को new manufacturing policy से वंचित रखा है। वहां पर टेक्सटाइल मिल जरूर होनी चाहिए और उसके लिए पॉलिसी में जो भी अमेंडमेंट लाने की जरूरत है, वह लाकर वहां टेक्सटाइल मिल घोषित की जाए। यह जो मांग है, मैं स्वयं को उससे संबद्ध करता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL (PUNJAB): Sir, I associate myself with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member.

डा० एम.एस.गिल (पंजाब) : महोदय, मैं माननीय सदस्य के वक्तव्य से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned to meet at 2 o'clock.

The House then adjourned for lunch
at forty-one minutes past twelve of the clock.

VKK-MCM/1x/2.00

The House reassembled after lunch at two of the clock,
THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair.

SHORT DURATION DISCUSSION ON THE SITUATION ARISING
OUT OF UNPRECEDENTED RISE IN PRICES OF FOOD AND
OTHER ESSENTIAL COMMODITIES AND ITS EFFECTS ON
COMMON MAN

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Now, Short Duration Discussion on Price Rise. Mr. M. Venkaiah Naidu.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (KARNATAKA): Thank you, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, is the Finance Minister coming?
(Interruptions)

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: The Finance Minister is not there.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): MoS is here.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: It was assured by the Government that FM will come. I know that he is in the other House and the debate has already been initiated. (Interruptions)

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the Finance Minister, the Agriculture Minister and the Consumer Affairs Minister should be here to understand the seriousness of the issue.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN : But, Venkaiahji, MoS for Finance is here and the Minister for Civil Supplies is also here.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: It shows the seriousness of the Government on this very important subject.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA): Sir, discussion is going on in the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

other House. He will come here. Look at the other side also. Gradually, people are coming in.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Okay. Now, you start.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I am neither going to gain nor going to lose anything by their presence or absence. But, the question is, let these people understand the gravity of the situation and if the Government is able to do something, it will be helpful to the people. That's my point. Otherwise, I have no problem with any individual Minister. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: No, it's okay. (Interruptions)

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the Finance Minister made a *suo motu* statement in the other House and it's a jugglery of figures. If figures are going to fill the stomach of the common man then the problem would have been solved. But, unfortunately, no tangible or concrete steps have been announced by the Finance Minister nor taken by the Government all these days.

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: The FM has come.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am happy the Finance Minister is here.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): After all, Mr. Venkaiah is speaking. How can I not be here?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, price rise is a silent killer. It is an assault on common man. It is a direct taxation on the common people which they will not be able to avoid. We must understand the seriousness of this being a silent killer. For seven years under the aegis of this Government, the common man is suffering very badly.

Sir, in February 2010, the hon. Finance Minister, Shri Pranab *Babu*, promised that high food inflation would ease in four months. The same assurance was repeated by the Finance Minister time and again and also by the hon. Prime Minister. But, nothing has happened. There is no downward trend. We have the figures with us. I will explain them a little later.

Sir, they have four experts in this Government. The Prime Minister himself is an economist. The Finance Minister is also a very experienced man. Then we have the hon. Home Minister who is also supposed to be an expert because he was earlier the Finance Minister. Then, we have the Deputy Chairman of the Planning Commission who is also an economist. In spite of the four people

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

being present there in the Government, in the last seven years, they could not even diagnose the ailment, leave alone the treatment. They are not able to understand basically why these prices are rising and why inflation is going up. That is the issue and people are really wondering. Even I, for myself, am wondering leaving politics aside. We have our own political ideological differences. We will fight them out separately. But, I was expecting that with the rich experience of these four leaders, they will be able to put their minds together and then do something concrete. But, in the first year, second year, third year, fourth year, fifth year and sixth year, continuously, the prices are rising.

(Contd. by KR/1y)

MCM/KR/1Y/2.05

SHRI M. VENKAI AH NAIDU (CONTD.): There is no remedy. There is no clarity. There is no unity. There is no proper application of mind to this burning problem. That is what I suppose. The Government has tried combination of fiscal, monetary and market intervention measures. But all of them have failed.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

I have the report of the Standing Committee on Finance, December, 2009. I am just quoting from the report. It says, "The Ministry of Finance which is responsible for formulating the policies and management of inflation has obviously failed to intervene timely and to address this burning issue with due seriousness. In such a dismal scenario, the Committee cannot but urge the Government to overcome this inertia", underline the word 'inertia', "and come to grips with reality of the unabated rise in prices of essential commodities." This is a scathing attack by the Standing Committee of Parliament. Unfortunately, the Government seems to be insensitive even to this scathing criticism by the Standing Committee of the Finance Ministry. There is a saying जब-जब कांग्रेस सत्ता में आती है तो महंगाई साथ लाती है। I do not know what is the umbilical link between the Congress Party and price rise. Whenever we go to the history, whenever the Congress Party came to power, there is shortage, there is price rise, there is black market and there is so much uproar that nothing is being done by the Government. Lack of foresight, lack of proper planning, lack of leadership and on the top of it, sheer incompetence, wrong economic policies, massive corruption in export

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

and import are the main reasons for the price rise. It is because of the Government's mismanagement only and wrong economic policies only. Sir, in 2011, 9.11 per cent was overall monetary food inflation.

The ASSOCHAM said that between 2005-06 and 2010-11, the prices of eight essential commodities have gone up by nearly 72 per cent. Inflation has caused several essentials like condiments, spices, eggs, fish, meat, milk and pulses out of the common man's reach. These items have witnessed a sharp increase ranging from 75 per cent to as high as 158 per cent. 158 per cent !

Sir, if the growth is moderate, inflation is acceptable. But there is no growth also. The growth rate is also going down. The Government has become complacent on inflation. The Government has become insensitive to the sufferings of the people of India. I always say people are weeping and the Government is sleeping. Same is the case this year also. Earlier also, we provoked the Government by using harsh words, not to hurt individuals, but to provoke them, at least, they come to the grips of the situation and try to do something. But unfortunately nothing has been done.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Sir, hike seems to be the word of the year. Hike, hike everywhere, people are saying when the next hike is. People will be looking towards newspapers, tuning radio and TV sets, when is the next hike. Hike in the interest rates, hike in fuel prices, hike in fertiliser prices, hike in EMIs are turning Aam Aadmi 's budget into a nightmare.

Sir, home loans have become a huge burden which used to be 6-7 per cent during the NDA's regime. Today it is 11 to 12 per cent. The Reserve Bank of India has hiked the interest rates 13 times in the last 19 months. Business loans rose between 14 to 16 per cent. How do you expect Indian manufacturing sector to be competitive in the world market? Instead of taking poverty alleviation measures, the Government thought that they can reduce poverty by fixing the daily earnings of a person at Rs.32 per day. What a great idea? Can anybody survive with Rs.32 per day?

(Continued by 1Z)

MKS-GS/2.10/1Z

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (CONTD.): With these high transport prices, with this rise in prices of essential commodities, how do you expect the common man to survive? And who gave this great idea to

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

the Planning Commission, I am not able to understand. If you are not able to fight poverty, if you are not able to alleviate the sufferings of the common people, then fix this limit and make people above the poverty line. And that seems to be the great idea of the Planning Commission, and of this Government. I only hope so even now. I have seen in the media that the Prime Minister has taken a meeting. Subsequently, nothing has been said openly. They have to correct this distortion. It is really, again, an assault on the common people of the country; 63 rupees a day is the biggest joke of the year.

Sir, the Government fiscal deficit was Rs.1,27,000 crores in 2007-08. In 2008-09, it was Rs.3,37,000 crores. Last year, it was Rs.4,18,000 crores. And I mentioned it in my Budget speech; the hon. Finance Minister said at that time, he is taking it as a challenge. But what happened, Sir? This fiscal deficit, so far, he is not able to contain! And the Government has run out of ideas. Now, the Finance Minister presented the figure as Rs.4,13,000 crores. He has added another Rs.9,000 crores recently. I do not know what he has done today.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Sir, even the rupee value is going down. What was the rupee value during NDA regime, what is the rupee value now, you just compare. 52.32 a dollar! It falls to an all-time low. In the last seven straight Sessions, it has lost 217 paise; that is 4.33 per cent. Pitiabale condition of the rupee! We are blaming the external factors. Sir, what has this Government done with regard to the report submitted by the Committee headed by Shri Narendra Modi? Maharashtra Chief Minister was there, and Tamil Nadu Chief Minister was there. There was a Committee set up by the NDC, I think. The CMs of Andhra, Maharashtra and T.N. were also members of the Committee. It was set up in 2010. The Committee Report, so far, we are not able to see; 20 recommendations with 64 detailed actionable points have been made. For example, some of the recommendations were that all essential commodities should be kept out of the future markets. What happened to the proposal? Setting up a Price Stabilization Fund. What happened to the proposal? Rehabilitation of the agriculture markets. What happened to that proposal? Expanding the priority-sector lending. What happened to that proposal? Dissemination of information at all levels. Nobody knows what has happened.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Unbinding of the Food Corporation of India. Some of these major recommendations are there. The Government, so far, is not able to explain to the people what is the action they have taken on the report of this very important Committee where Chief Ministers of all shades are there, be it Congress, or be it BJP or other parties. All these Chief Ministers are there as members of the Committee, and in their collective wisdom, they have made certain recommendations, but recommendations have not yet been acted upon. If the Government has taken note of them and if they have taken some action, I will be happy to know it from the Finance Minister.

Sir, see the widening gap between WPI and CPI, the wholesale price index and the consumer price index. It is really surprising that the wholesale price index, sometimes, they say, is showing a downward trend, or it is a marginal increase. But as per the consumer price index, the prices are running very high. And the distortion between these two has to be checked up at one stage or other. The hon. Finance Minister was very kind enough, if he may recall, to give an assurance to the House 'that he will attend to this

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

important programme and see to it that something is done in this regard.' Unfortunately, so far, nothing has been done.

Sir, in 1951-52, 89 per cent of what the consumer spent on food used to reach the farmer. 89 per cent! Now, only 34 per cent reaches him while 66 per cent goes to the middleman. There is something lacking in the system, which we all have to ponder ourselves and then try to act on that. A farmer gets only five rupees a kg. for onion whereas in the market we are purchasing it at 30 rupees a kg; 5 rupees a kg. for onion in the farm, and in the market, it is 30 rupees a kg.

MS. MABEL REBELLO: Who is responsible?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Who is responsible, I am asking you. You are in Government, not me. We have to understand this, Sir, that there are no refrigeration units; there is no cold storage facility; there is no proper transport facility; there is no marketing facility, and there is no communication system, there is no information dissemination campaign to awaken the farmer and tell him that this much prices are available. But they are all perishable goods; that is why they are losing heavily.

(Contd. by TMV/2A)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

-MKS-TMV-ASC/2A/2.15

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (CONTD.): We have been talking about this adding of cold storage chains. But nothing concrete has been done in this regard. That is also one of the reasons. The price of petrol has been increased eleven times in twelve months in the name of rationalisation. It has been increased 24 times since the UPA Government came to power. Twenty-four times the petrol price has been increased! Now, in recent days, they have decreased it nominally.

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN IN THE CHAIR.)

It has a cascading effect. It will have an effect on the essential commodities. The essential commodities have to be transferred from one place to another. Naturally, the prices of essential commodities will increase. The price rise is mostly taking place in food articles and we are all aware that 50 per cent of the common man's budget is spent on food items. The UPA Government has inherited a robust economy from the NDA. The then hon. Finance Minister and the present hon. Finance Minister are here. I quote from the Economic Survey of July, 2004. It states:

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

“The economy appears to be in a resilient mood in terms of growth, inflation and balance of payments, a combination that offers large scope of consolidation of growth momentum with continued micro-economic stability. The NDA Government can be credited for changing the face of the Indian economy by introducing second generation market reforms and integrating domestic economy and the world economy in real terms”.

This is from the Economic Survey. So, you have inherited a robust economy, lowest inflation and highest foreign exchange. There was no line, no queue, no waiting list, no shortage and no black market at that time. What happened to that in the last six years? How are you able to spoil it? What are the reasons? What are the remedies which you want to offer now? This is not my political statement. I have just quoted from the Economic Survey. There was a low interest regime. Just now I said that it was 6-7 per cent for housing and business loan was available at 11-12 per cent. Today it has gone up to 15-17 per cent. Inflation had touched a historic low of 3.7 per cent during our regime, not throughout but most of the time. But in your regime, if I remember correctly, it went up to 18.5-20 per cent at one time.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

There was record high inflation during the regime of Congress party and the UPA and the lowest inflation during the NDA regime. This is the comparison. What are you doing, all the great academics, four of you, sitting in the Government? The price of every item, sugar, rice, steel, coal, tel, dal, etc., has gone up considerably and it has gone up beyond the reach of the common man and the Government still has no clue.

The UPA Government has inherited a regime of surplus from the NDA and it has successfully converted it into a shortage on the food front. No country has so much irrigated land like India has. But, unfortunately, we are not able to increase the production. Chinese production is double than ours. We don't have a proper plan; we are not spending on agriculture research and also we don't have even proper storage. This year, if you attribute this shortage or food inflation to lower production, it is not correct because the production is 241 million tonnes. There is record production. The farmers are doing their best. I salute the farming community. What is the Government doing? In the last six-and-a-half years you have not added one metric ton of storage capacity. The Food Corporation of

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

India -- we got the information -- did not add any additional space at all on its own. Why? When you had food production and you had procured food and allowed it to rot in the open space, the Supreme Court went to the extent of saying to distribute the food to the common people instead of allowing it to be rotten. The Supreme Court had made such a stinking remark. Still the Government is unmoved. You are not serious on the godown front. The Food Corporation of India has no plan. Similar is the case with cold storage chains. Similar is the case with refrigerator van system in the rural areas. This is a very big challenge to us. Instead of doing that, what are you doing? You are saying that you have increased the MSP three times or four times. But what is happening to the farmers? You are just increasing the MSP nominally. But, at the same time, the prices of agricultural inputs are increasing manifold.

(Contd. by 2B/VK)

VK/2B/2.20

SHRI M. VENKAI AH NAIDU (CONTD): Sir, I have the figures with me of only one item - - I do not want to take much time of the House -- that is DAP, Diammonium Phosphate. In the last one year, from

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

March, 2010 to now, its price has gone up from Rs. 486 to Rs. 1046. This has happened in one year. How do you expect the farmers to survive? Are you serious and sensitive to the sufferings of the farming community? That is why I was saying that the Finance Minister, the Consumer Affairs Minister and the Agriculture Minister, all of them, should be present here. They should understand the seriousness. I am not holding one particular Minister responsible for this. It is the responsibility of the Government as a whole. Recently, I went to Andhra Pradesh to visit some of the drought affected areas. I talked to the farmers there. On the one hand the Government is giving rice at Re. 1 a kilo and on the other hand you are taking Rs. 1050 for one bag of fertilizer. What is this? How do we expect the agriculture to be viable? There is no response from the Government. I am quite fearful that this price may increase further. Then it is not available in the market. Even the DAP at this price is not available in the market. These are the figures. I would like to send these figures to the hon. Finance Minister also. How are the prices rising? In March, 2010, its price was Rs. 486. In April, 2010, its price was Rs. 517; in January, 2011, its price was Rs. 559; in September, 2011, its price was Rs. 800;

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

in October, 2011, its price was Rs. 924; and in November, 2011, its price was Rs. 956. Today, its price is Rs. 1046. It is horrible! It is the biggest assault on the farming community of the country. Is it the way you want to save the agriculturists from ruination? Farmers are leaving agriculture. Forty-three per cent of the farming community do not want to continue in agriculture. That is the statistics of the World Bank. Many of the people want to leave agriculture because it is not remunerative. Still, you have this policy of fertilizer. You want to go on increasing the prices every year and you expect the farmers to produce more and then you want to ease the food situation in the country! How is it possible?

Sir, as I was just explaining, petro-bombs were thrown on the people at regular intervals, that is, 24 times during the UPA regime. Every time, when petrol prices are increased...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Petro-bombs!

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Yes, petro-bombs. Petroleum prices are petro-bombs on the people. People are suffering. Every time, you increase the price, it has got a cascading effect on the prices of each commodity, including fertilizer, wheat, paddy, vegetables, and

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

all other essential commodities. So prices of these commodities are going up and transport charges are also going up. You have no remedy! You say that your Government is committed to the welfare of the common people. Is it the way to help the common people?

The Economic Times, recently, published an article. They made an analysis of the latest inflation figures last month. The food inflation is at six-month high of 11.43 per cent, with vegetables 25 per cent costlier on annual basis; fruits dearer by 11.96 per cent; milk dearer by 12.85 per cent; eggs, meat and fish dearer by 12.82 per cent. In October last year, the price rise stood at 14.20 per cent. Every time, when we or the media questions that, the Prime Minister says, "Wait up to September, the prices will come down". When we ask the Finance Minister in September, the Finance Minister says, "It will come down by March". It is 'March-September-March'. I remember, during my student days, when a boy failed in Class X exams, the teacher used to tell him, "Don't worry, the September exam is there". When he failed in September exam also, the teacher said, "March exam is there". 'March-September-March'. This Government is also doing the same thing. Whenever we ask them about the price

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

rise, they say, "By September, it will ease out and by March it will come down". But every time, they are failing. It is a total failure, not even compartment or pass, not even pass with grace marks. It is a total miserable failure. One has to say it.

If we come to retail prices, when we were in power, in last days of our Government in 2004, the price of sugar was Rs. 14.

(Contd. By 2C)

RG/2.25/2C

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (contd.): Today it is Rs.38. Tea was Rs.80; today, it is Rs.260. Refined oil, Rs.64; today, it is Rs.120. Mustard oil, Rs.40; now, it is Rs.80. Salt was Rs.6 a kg; now, it is Rs.14. Atta, Rs.10; now, it is Rs.22; rice was Rs.10 and the fine variety was Rs.12; now, it is Rs.25 and the fine variety is Rs.30. Zeera was Rs.75 at that time; now, it is Rs.260. Milk was Rs.14 a litre at that time; now, it is Rs.29. Petrol was Rs.34; today, it is Rs.66. Diesel was Rs.22; today, it is Rs.41. Cooking gas was Rs.240; now, it is Rs.395. Nothing has been spared. Coming to dal, Rajma was Rs.22; now, it is Rs.70. Of course, I do not want to talk about rajma; it has become a rich man's food...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: It is a protein-rich food for vegetarians.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: It is vegetarian's non-vegetarian food.

White channa was Rs.24; today, it is Rs.100. Moong Dal was Rs.25 at that time; now, it is Rs.90; Malka Dal was Rs.23; now, it is Rs.85. Channa Dal was Rs.21 at that time; today, it is Rs.60. Lobia was Rs.25 at that time; now, it is Rs.90. These are the figures which I have got latest from the market today. There is no hike from my side. These are the market figures. How do you expect people to purchase dal at Rs.80 to Rs.100 per kg? वे क्या खाते हैं? दाल रोटी। What is the explanation of the Government? Why is the Finance Minister, with all his rich experience, keeping quiet? Why is the Agriculture Minister keeping quiet? Have they become so helpless? Why is the Prime Minister keeping silent when the prices are violent? Why is the Government silent? They must explain. They owe an answer to the people that these are the steps they are taking and that these are the results which they have achieved. Otherwise, you just say one thing that you are not capable at all. It is very clear; it is written on the wall that you are not capable. People are very, very angry with you. People are weeping and you people are sleeping in the Government.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

That is the allegation of the people. The common man is crying. What is it that the Government is doing? What are the concrete steps they have taken? What are the follow-up actions of the recommendations made by the Committee of Chief Ministers? There is no answer to these things. What are the tangible steps taken by the Government? No answer. What is the effective coordination between the Agriculture Ministry, Finance Ministry and the Consumer Affairs Ministry? For that also, no answer. You are simply leaving people in the lurch. Is it your policy? You want people to die in the natural course. Farmers are committing suicide. Lakhs of farmers have committed suicide. Is it not time for us to address that burning issue, address the problems of the farming community and set things right? Is it not the minimum responsibility of the Government that all these Departments come together and work out a long-term strategy? Why are they not doing it? What is their response? I would like to tell the Government — I am not giving any *shaap* or curse to this Government — people's patience is running out. Don't test it further. They are waiting for an opportunity to throw you out at the earliest. It is written on the wall. Read the writing on the wall. As and when the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

opportunity comes, you will be thrown out without any mercy. The reason is that you have failed miserably. What the people expect from the Government is security first. I don't want to explain it further. And the other aspect is livelihood of the people, their food security. Now, more than 50 per cent of people are living below-the-poverty-line. You may try to bring it down by your jugglery figures. I am not going into that. Even presuming that it is 31 per cent or 36 per cent, whatever it is, please try to understand the problem and address it. Wake up from your deep slumber and then try to do something. If you are not capable of doing something, then, better get out of your position. I am not saying it for one Minister. I want this whole Government to go down. If you are not capable of controlling the prices, if you have run out of ideas, if you have become politically bankrupt with regard to ideas, better quit, and then, let the people decide. Thank you, Sir. (Ends)

(Followed by 2D)

SCH/2.30/2D

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर (राजस्थान): माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, इस महत्वपूर्ण विषय पर जो चर्चा हो रही है, इसमें मैं विपक्ष के नेता, माननीय वेंकैया नायडु

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

साहब का भाषण बहुत ध्यान से सुन रही थी। मैं विचार कर रही थी कि शायद वह महंगाई की इस चिन्ताजनक समस्या पर, जो सभी की समस्या है, कोई कंक्रीट उपाय बताएंगे, कोई सुझाव बताएंगे। लेकिन, ...(व्यवधान) अब आप मुझे बोलने तो दीजिए ...(व्यवधान)

श्री उपसभापति: ज़रा सुनिए, सुनिए ...(व्यवधान) आप उनको बोलने दीजिए।

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: आप इतने उतावले क्यों हो रहे हैं? ...(व्यवधान)

श्री उपसभापति: आप उनको बोलने दीजिए, खामोशी से सुनिए। जब आपकी बारी आए, तब आप जो कहना चाहें, कहिए ...(व्यवधान)

श्री बलबीर पुंज: उपसभापति, वह उपाय तो बताएं ...(व्यवधान)

श्री उपसभापति: बताएंगी, अभी तो इन्होंने बोलना शुरू ही किया है, आप डिस्टर्ब मत कीजिए। Please do not disturb. (Interruptions) Please.

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: उनका जो सार्थक और कंक्रीट सुझाव आया और जो उनके दिल की बात भी है, वह यह आया कि एक-दो मंत्रियों को नहीं, पूरी की पूरी सरकार को ही चले जाना चाहिए और हमको आ जाना चाहिए। इसके लिए उनके उपाय भी बड़े जोरों से चल रहे हैं, कभी अन्ना साहब आ रहे हैं, कभी उधर से बाबा रामदेव आ रहे हैं, इस तरह वे बड़े उपाय कर रहे हैं। महानुभव, इन उपायों से कुछ नहीं होगा, क्योंकि देश की जनता को आप इस तरह से बरगला नहीं सकते हैं। यह इतना गंभीर विषय है और हर वक्त हर विषय पर राजनीति हो, यह उचित नहीं है।

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

महोदय, एक समय वह भी था जब पंडित नेहरू ने खुले मन से, मुक्त कंठ से अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी जी की प्रशंसा की थी। माननीय श्री राहुल गांधी जब बिहार गए, तो उन्होंने नीतीश कुमार जी की कार्यशैली की प्रशंसा की थी, लेकिन शायद ...(व्यवधान) मैं बता रही हूँ ...(व्यवधान) आपमें सुनने का धीरज ही नहीं है, थोड़ा धीरज रखिए ...(व्यवधान)।

श्री उपसभापति: आप बोलिए, आप उनकी तरफ ध्यान मत दीजिए ...(व्यवधान) देखिए, आपके लीडर को हमने सुना है, अब आप भी सुनिए।

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: महोदय, आज हम सबकी यह कलेक्टिव रिस्पॉसबिलिटी है, हां, सरकार की थोड़ी ज्यादा है और सरकार इसके लिए पूरे तौर पर सार्थक प्रयास कर रही है। प्रधान मंत्री जी, हमारे माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी, यूपीए अध्यक्ष, माननीया श्रीमती सोनिया गांधी जी और हमारे सारे सहयोगी दलों के साथ समूची सरकार इसके लिए पूरे तौर पर कटिबद्ध है। इसके लिए कई उपाय भी किए गए हैं।

महोदय, पहले तो मैं यह बताना चाहूंगी कि इस महंगाई के कारण क्या हैं। यूपीए की सरकार ने इसके लिए क्या-क्या उपाय किए हैं, उन पर भी मैं रोशनी डालना चाहूंगी। आंकड़ों पर तो आपने विस्तार से बता ही दिया है, इसलिए उस पर मैं दोबारा नहीं जाऊँगी।

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

महोदय, मैं जानती हूँ कि गृहणियाँ या महिलाएं महंगाई की मार से ज्यादा आहत होती हैं, क्योंकि एक सीमित आमदनी में उन्हें घर का बजट चलाना होता है, गृहस्थी चलानी होती है। उनके लिए यह बहुत चिन्ता का विषय है।

महोदय, हमें इसके कारण जानना भी बहुत जरूरी है, जैसे जब डीजल महंगा होता है, पेट्रोलियम पदार्थ महंगे होते हैं, ये सब अंतर्राष्ट्रीय बाजार से जुड़े होते हैं। उनकी दरें अंतर्राष्ट्रीय बाजार से नियन्त्रित होती हैं। यह केवल हमारी ही समस्या नहीं है, हमारे सभी पड़ोसी देशों की भी यही समस्या है। ऐसे में ही इस प्रकार के हालात उत्पन्न हो जाते हैं, क्योंकि सब चीजें ट्रांसपोर्टेशन के ज़रिए आती-जाती हैं।

सर, अभी पेट्रोल व डीजल को सरकार ने अंतर्राष्ट्रीय बाजार से जोड़ा है और पेट्रोलियम पदार्थों के, पेट्रोल व डीजल के प्राइस भी रोल बैक किए हैं। सरकार नहीं चाहती है कि वह अनावश्यक रूप से आम जनता पर किसी भी तरह से महंगाई का अतिरिक्त बोझ डाले। इसके लिए रसोई गैस में यथासंभव सब्सिडी दी गई है, वरना आज रसोई गैस का सिलेंडर 100 रुपये और भी महंगा हो सकता था। आज किसानों के न्यूनतम कृषि उत्पादों के मूल्य में बढ़ोतरी हुई है। केन्द्र सरकार अथवा जहां भी कांग्रेस की सरकारें हैं, वे सभी यह देखते हैं कि वहां किसानों को कृषि का पूरा उचित न्यूनतम मूल्य मिले।

2e-psv पर जारी

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर (क्रमागत): इससे जब किसान को उसके उत्पाद का मूल्य लागत से ज्यादा मिलेगा तो यह स्वाभाविक है कि वह मंडी में भी कुछ ज्यादा लागत में जाएगा। लेकिन, इस सरकार ने इसके उपाय भी किए हैं। उसने सफल जैसे केन्द्रीय भंडार खोले हैं, जहाँ पर आम आदमी को बाजार से अपेक्षाकृत बहुत कम दाम में खाद्य पदार्थ मिल सकते हैं। वहाँ उन्हें बाजार से कम-से-कम बीस-पच्चीस प्रतिशत कम मूल्य में खाद्य पदार्थ मिल रहे हैं और लोग उनका उपयोग कर रहे हैं।

महोदय, इसके साथ ही कालाबाजारी, जमाखोरी और मुनाफाखोरी, जिनको हमारे यहाँ के उधर के लोग संरक्षण दे देते हैं और उन पर कोई कार्रवाई नहीं करते हैं, ऐसे कालाबाजारी करने वाले लोगों के यहाँ जिस तरह दिल्ली में दिल्ली सरकार द्वारा छापे मारे गए, उनके यहाँ से अनाजों को जब्त किया गया, उसी तरह राजस्थान में भी उन पर कार्रवाई हुई, मिलावटी चीजों के खिलाफ कार्रवाई हुई, इसके लिए अभियान चलाया गया और ऐसे लोगों को बन्द किया गया। उसी तरह से महाराष्ट्र में भी और जहाँ-जहाँ कांग्रेस की सरकारें हैं, वहाँ कार्रवाई हुई है। मैं यह जानना चाहती हूँ कि जहाँ भी विपक्ष की सरकारें हैं, बी.जे.पी. की सरकार है, वहाँ उन लोगों को संरक्षण क्यों दिया जाता है? आखिर, राज्य सरकारों का भी कोई नैतिक कर्तव्य और दायित्व होता है या नहीं? क्या राज्य सरकारों के पास कर्मचारी नहीं हैं, क्या राज्य सरकारों के पास

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

बजट नहीं है और क्यों नहीं वे सार्वजनिक वितरण प्रणाली की मॉनिटरिंग ठीक से करते हैं? ...(व्यवधान)... आप मेरी बात तो सुनिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री बलबीर पुंज: सर, ...(व्यवधान)... संरक्षण का आरोप लगाया जा रहा है।
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप उनको बोलने दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री बलबीर पुंज: ये राज्य सरकारों के खिलाफ आरोप कैसे लगा सकती हैं?...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप उनको बोलने दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... प्लीज़, आप उनको बोलने दीजिए।

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: तो क्या हुआ? ...(व्यवधान)... राज्य सरकारों की भी जिम्मेदारी होती है। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप उनको बोलने दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... आप बैठिए।
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री बलबीर पुंज: इस तरह से निराधार आरोप लगाना ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: पुंज जी, आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)... Please sit down.
उनको बोलने दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... उनको बोलने दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: सर, सच्ची बात कड़वी लगती है। ...(व्यवधान)...

सुश्री सुशीला तिरिया: कुछ अच्छी बातें सुनने का धीरज रखिए।
...(व्यवधान)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

श्री उपसभापति: ठाकुर जी, आप बोलिए। ... (व्यवधान)... पुंज जी, आप जो चाहते हैं, उसे तो वे नहीं बोलेंगी न? ... (व्यवधान)... नहीं, आप बैठिए। ... (व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती विप्लव ठाकुर: सच्ची बात इतनी कड़वी क्यों लगती है? ... (व्यवधान)...

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: सच्ची बात तो कड़वी ही लगती है। ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: ठीक है। ... (व्यवधान)... आप जो बोलना चाहते हैं, उसे आपके नेता बोल चुके हैं। ... (व्यवधान)... अब आप उनको भी सुनिए। ... (व्यवधान)... आप उनको भी सुनिए। ... (व्यवधान)...

एक माननीय सदस्य: ढंग से बोलें, तब सुनें न? ... (व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती विप्लव ठाकुर: यह गलत बात है। ... (व्यवधान)... ये शब्द वापस लिए जाएँ- 'ढंग से बोलें' ... (व्यवधान)... क्या मतलब है इनके 'ढंग से बोलें' कहने का? ... (व्यवधान)... एक मैम्बर बोल रहा है। ... (व्यवधान)... इसको वापस लिया जाए।

श्री उपसभापति: किसने क्या बोला? ... (व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती विप्लव ठाकुर: इन्होंने क्यों कहा कि 'ढंग से बोलें'? ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप बैठिए। मैं देखता हूँ कि यह क्या है? ... (व्यवधान)...

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: मैं कौन सा बेढंगेपन से बोल रही हूँ, सर? ... (व्यवधान)... मैं कौन सा बेढंगेपन से बोल रही हूँ, सर? ... (व्यवधान)... सच्चाई कड़वी लगती है, उसे आप सुनिए। पूरा देश इसे सुन रहा है। मैं जानती हूँ कि कई दिनों के

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

बाद तो आज संसद चल रही है। आज तो इसे कृपा करके चलने दीजिए। मुझे बोलने दीजिए।

श्री नारायण सिंह केसरी: सर, ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप उनको बोलने ही नहीं दे रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... आप उनको जुबान खोलने नहीं देंगे तो कैसे होगा? ...(व्यवधान)... उनको बोलने दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)... आप बहुत interfere कर रहे हैं। आप प्लीज़ बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)... आप बहुत interfere कर रहे हैं। आप उनको बोलने नहीं दे रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: सर, वेंकैया साहब ने कहा कि कांग्रेस जब सत्ता में आती है तो महँगाई बढ़ाती है। काश, वे यह भी कहते कि कांग्रेस जब भी सत्ता में आती है तो आम आदमी की आमदनी बढ़ती है। सर, कुछ लोग केवल ऐसे हैं, जो सिर्फ बातें करते हैं। इनको भी जनता ने मौका दिया है। उसने इनको दो-दो बार मौका दिया है। यहाँ छः-साढ़े छः वर्ष तक एन.डी.ए. की सरकार रही है। आपने उस समय महँगाई से निपटने के लिए क्या किया? महँगाई कितनी बार बढ़ी? तेल की कीमतें 13 बार बढ़ीं या 23 बार बढ़ीं, ये सारे आंकड़े अन्य लोग बताएँगे। इनके समय में महँगाई हर साल बढ़ी या कम हुई, यह भी वे बताएँगे।

महोदय, मेरे बोलने के समय बीच में जो डिस्टर्बेंस हुआ, उस समय को मेरे समय में न जोड़ा जाए। ...(व्यवधान)... महोदय, मैं एक बात यह कहना चाहूँगी कि अर्थशास्त्र का यह एक सत्य नियम है कि जब भी आमदनी में वृद्धि

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

होती है, तब महँगाई में या कीमतों में वृद्धि होती है और यह आज से नहीं, आदि-अनादि काल से होता आया है। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, मुझे वह समय याद है। जब देश आजाद हुआ था, उसके बाद गाँवों की परिस्थिति मैं बताती हूँ। जब एक रुपया प्रति किलो घी मिलता था और 200 रुपए प्रति तोला सोना मिलता था, तब लोगों के सर पर कच्चे झोपड़े की छत हुआ करती थी। उनको एक रुपया प्रति किलो घी भी नसीब नहीं होता था। तब किसी के यहाँ किसी तरह की कोई खुशहाली नहीं, जब में पैसा नहीं और शिक्षा भी नहीं, ये हालात थे। जब कांग्रेस की सरकार बनी, पंडित नेहरु आए और उन्होंने इस देश में क्रांति की। यह कांग्रेस की सरकारों की देन है कि गरीब आदमी को और किसानों को उन्होंने जमीनों का मालिक बना दिया।

(2एफ/डी.एस. पर क्रमशः)

-PSV/DS-TDB/2.40/2f

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर (क्रमागत): सर, किसानों के कच्चे घर पक्के मकानों में बदल गये। आज हमें यह देख कर खुशी होती है कि गाँवों में किसान अच्छे कपड़े पहनते हैं, वे फटेहाल नहीं घूमते व हर किसान के घर के सामने एक मोटरसाइकिल खड़ी हुई नजर आती है। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री उपसभापति: आप बैठिए।..(व्यवधान)..आप बैठिए न। आप क्यों डिस्टर्ब कर रहे हैं? अगर आप उठेंगे, तो ये भी उठेंगे, आप बैठिए।

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: सर, यह कांग्रेस की ही देन रही है। कांग्रेस की नेता इंदिरा जी ने कहा, "गरीबी हटाओ।" उन्होंने यह नारा दिया और यह अभियान आरम्भ किया। उन्होंने किसानों के लिए "हरित क्रांति" का नारा दिया और वे इस देश में हरित क्रांति को लेकर आईं।

महोदय, कांग्रेस "बातें कम और काम ज्यादा" में विश्वास करती है। ऐसे ही हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जी हैं। वे बहुत कम बोलते हैं, लेकिन काम करते हैं। लेकिन सर, यह सत्य है कि जब भी कोई बदलाव होता है, तो हमेशा उसका विरोध होता है। माननीय श्री राजीव गांधी जी ने जब कम्प्यूटर क्रांति की बात कही, तब भी हमारे विपक्ष के साथियों ने मजाक उड़ाया था और कहा था कि ये बड़े आये कम्प्यूटर क्रांति के अग्रदूत मसीहा! आज देश के घर-घर और गाँव-गाँव तक में कम्प्यूटर क्रांति, कम्प्यूटर शिक्षा का माहौल बना हुआ है। उनकी आँखों ने तब इक्कीसवीं सदी का विकास देखा था। परमाणु करार पर जब देश को सशक्त बनाने की बात आयी, तब भी इन लोगों ने विरोध किया। जब-जब देश को सशक्त बनाने की बात आती है, देश को आगे ले जाने की बात आती है, आज विपक्ष का धर्म रह गया है विरोध करना। सर, एफडीआई, यानी फॉरेन डायरेक्ट इन्वेस्टमेंट से देश को कितने लाभ होते, यह सरकार ने भी बताये और खुद बीजेपी के 2004 इलेक्शन मैनिफेस्टो में था कि वे एफडीआई लेकर आएँगे, लेकिन आज वे उसका जोर-शोर से विरोध कर रहे हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्रीमती माया सिंह: सर, ..(व्यवधान)..

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

श्री उपसभापति: माया जी, वे बोल रही हैं, तो उनको बोलने दीजिए। जब आप बोलेंगी, तब आप बोलिएगा। ..(व्यवधान).. आप बैठिए।

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: 2004 का मैनिफेस्टो लाकर दिखा दीजिए। ..(व्यवधान)..

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I want to put the record straight that from 1980... (Interruptions) none of the BJP Manifesto has any mention of FDI. (Interruptions)

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: मैनिफेस्टो लाकर दिखा दीजिए। ..(व्यवधान).. एक समय में आपने खुद परमाणु करार का समर्थन किया हुआ है। ..(व्यवधान)..

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ: Sir, please tell the hon. Member not to make baseless allegations. Sir, these are all baseless allegations. (Interruptions) ऐसा किसी भी मैनिफेस्टो में नहीं है। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री उपसभापति: पुंज जी, आप बैठिए। ..(व्यवधान)..आप बैठिए न।

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: हमारी सरकार ने यह महसूस किया है कि इससे महँगाई थमेगी। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया: सर, ऐसा है ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री उपसभापति: अहलुवालिया जी, ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया: सर, आप बैठने के लिए कह रहे हैं, तो बैठ जाएँगे, किन्तु कोई भी आरोप लगाने के पहले ..(व्यवधान)..

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: सुनिए, एफडीआई आने से महँगाई थमेगी। ..(व्यवधान).. यह सच्चाई है। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया: सर, सदन का यह नियम है कि कोई भी आरोप लगाने के पहले उसको substantiate करने के लिए डॉक्यूमेंट प्रोड्यूस किया जाए। आप या तो डॉक्यूमेंट प्रोड्यूस करें कि ऐसा किस मैनिफेस्टो में है या अपने शब्द वापस लें। ..(व्यवधान).. नहीं तो आप डॉक्यूमेंट प्रोड्यूस कीजिए। ..(व्यवधान)..

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: यह आपके "इंडिया शाइनिंग" में था। ..(व्यवधान)..

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, you ask her either to produce the BJP Manifesto on FDI or she should withdraw it. (Interruptions) She should place a copy of the BJP Manifesto on the Table of the House or she should withdraw this allegation.

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: "इंडिया शाइनिंग" में नारा था। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया: ऐसा नहीं है कि आप जो भी बोलेंगी, वह चला जाएगा ..(व्यवधान).. ऐसा नहीं है। ..(व्यवधान)..

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: अब इंडिया कैसे शाइन करेगा?

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया: नहीं सर, कोई भी आरोप लगाने के पहले ..(व्यवधान).. आप एक जिम्मेदार पार्टी हैं, ट्रेजरी बेंच पर बैठते हैं, इसका मतलब आप किसी पर भी कोई भी आरोप लगा देंगे? ..(व्यवधान)..

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: "इंडिया शाइनिंग" में तो यह नारा दिया था न? ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया: अगर आपके पास कोई डॉक्यूमेंट है, तो बताइये। ..(व्यवधान).. अगर ऐसा डॉक्यूमेंट है, तो बताइये। ..(व्यवधान).. आप अभी लाओ। ..(व्यवधान).. कैसे नहीं लाएँगे, आप अभी लाओ। ..(व्यवधान)..

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: एक महिला से लड़ने के लिए क्या इतनी सेना की जरूरत है? ..(व्यवधान).. महोदय, यह सच्चाई का असर है। ..(व्यवधान).. उपसभापति जी, यह सच्चाई का असर है। सर, सच्चाई बर्दाश्त नहीं होती। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया: अभी सबेरे हाथ जोड़-जोड़ कर तो विदड़ा किये और अभी ये बोलने के लिए खड़ी हो गई! ..(व्यवधान)..

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ: It is a baseless allegation. (Interruptions)

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: सुनिए, ..(व्यवधान).. हाँ, यह ठीक है। ..(व्यवधान).. सर, फैसला हुआ है, क्योंकि यह लोकतंत्र है और हमारी जो सरकार है, प्रधान मंत्री जी हैं, वे लोकतांत्रिक भावना का और सभी राजनीतिक दलों की भावना का सम्मान करते हैं।

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ: No; you cannot make this baseless allegation on the floor of the House. (Interruptions)

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: मुझे एक जिम्मेदार सांसद के रूप में अपने विचार यहाँ रखने की छूट है। ..(व्यवधान)..

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

श्री उपसभापति: प्रभा जी, उनका कहना है कि आप substantiate करेंगी क्या? उस हिसाब से आप बोलिए। ..(व्यवधान)..

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, you please tell the hon. Member to first place on the Table of the House a copy of the BJP Manifesto, which contains BJP is for FDI, or, she should be asked to withdraw this allegation. (Interruptions)

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर: मैं सरकार के कदम की सराहना करती हूँ, क्योंकि उसने सारे राजनैतिक दलों की भावना का सम्मान करते हुए कहा है कि सब से बात करने के बाद ही वह कुछ करेगी। ..(व्यवधान)..

(2जी/एचएमएस पर क्रमशः)

2G/HMS-KLS/2.45

डा० प्रभा ठाकुर (क्रमागत) : मैंने जहां तक इस के फायदे सुने हैं ..(व्यवधान)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will look into it. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, you should examine it and tell the Member whether she can authenticate it. ...(Interruptions)... She cannot make allegations against a political party. ...(Interruptions)... How can you do it? ...(Interruptions)...

डा० प्रभा ठाकुर : चलिए, आगे चलिए।

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: How can you say it when we are saying that it is wrong? या तो वह सत्यापित करें।

श्री बलबीर पुंज : आप के प्रधान मंत्री withdraw कर सकते हैं तो आप withdraw नहीं कर सकतीं? ..(व्यवधान).. Your Prime Minister has withdrawn the FDI. ...(Interruptions)... He has withdrawn the FDI. ...(Interruptions)... He has rolled back. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया : सर, यह क्या बोल रही हैं? इन की पार्टी ने तो एफ0डी0आई0 को एंटी नेशनल कहा था। 12 दिसम्बर, 2002 में पार्लियामेंट के अंदर कहा, इन के चीफ व्हिप ने कहा। अब यह क्या कहना चाहती हैं? ..(व्यवधान).. एफ0डी0आई0 को लाना एंटी नेशनल एक्टिविटी है। आज वही पार्टी यह कह रही है ..(व्यवधान).. आप पेपर लाओ, मैं आप को पेपर दिखाता हूँ कि एंटी नेशनल बोला है।

डा0 प्रभा ठाकुर : आप जोर से बोलकर मेरी आवाज को नहीं दबा सकते और न इस देश की आवाम की आवाज को दबा सकते हैं।

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ: They should authenticate it or they should withdraw it. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया : मैं आप की आवाज को नहीं दबा रहा। मैं तो आवाम की आवाज को सुना रहा हूँ। मैं कह रहा हूँ कि सच बोलो और सच के सिवाय कुछ मत बोलो। ..(व्यवधान)..

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठिए। ... (व्यवधान).. आप जो बोल रहे हैं वह रिकॉर्ड में नहीं जाएगा। प्लीज, बैठिए।

डा० प्रभा ठाकुर : सर ऐसा है कि सांच को आंच नहीं होती और * के पांव नहीं होते। * कितने कदम चलेगा? वह लड़खड़ाएगा और गिर पड़ेगा। इसलिए * का वातावरण इस देश में बहुत देर तक नहीं चलेगा।

श्री उपसभापति : आप सब्जेक्ट पर आइए।

डा० प्रभा ठाकुर : मैं उसी पर बोल रही हूँ। मुझे कोई बोलने तो दे। मैं महंगाई पर ही बोल रही थी क्योंकि वह भी एक महंगाई कम करने की कोशिश थी ताकि आम आदमी को सस्ती कीमत पर चीजें मिलें।

श्री एस०एस० अहलुवालिया : सर, * शब्द unparliamentary है, इसे कार्यवाही से निकालिए।

श्री उपसभापति : * शब्द unparliamentary है। इसे निकाल दीजिए। जहां-जहां * बोला है, उसे निकाल दीजिए।

डा० प्रभा ठाकुर : सर, एन०डी०ए० सरकार भी सत्ता में आयी थी, इन्होंने क्या किया किसानों के लिए? इन की सरकार कोई "महात्मा गांधी नरेगा" जैसी योजना लायी थी? ये disinvestment वाली पॉलिसी में पड़े रहे। सर, अगर "नरेगा" में कहीं भ्रष्टाचार है तो वह देखना राज्य सरकारों का काम है। केन्द्र

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

सरकार ने हजारों करोड़ रुपया "सर्व शिक्षा अभियान" में, "मिड डे मील" के तहत, "नरेगा" योजना में, राजीव गांधी विद्युतीकरण योजना में, ग्रामीण अस्पतालों के लिए, भारत निर्माण योजना में, बिना किसी राजनीतिक भेदभाव के हर जगह, राज्य सरकारों को एन0डी0ए0 से बढ़कर तिगुनी-चौगुनी राशि दी है। अगर उस का राज्यों में गरीबों को पूरा फायदा नहीं मिल रहा है, तो उसे देखना वहां की राज्य सरकारों का काम है। अगर वे नहीं देख सकतीं और हर बात की जिम्मेदारी केन्द्र सरकार पर थोपना चाहती हैं, तो पहले वे अपना इस्तीफा दे दें, उस के बाद केन्द्र सरकार खुद देख लेगी कि वहां काम ठीक से हो रहा है या नहीं हो रहा है। ... (व्यवधान)... महोदय, इसीलिए सरकार फूड सेक्युरिटी बिल ला रही है। इस के लिए मैं यू0पी0ए0 अध्यक्ष श्रीमती सोनिया गांधी जी को बधाई देना चाहती हूं। यह उन का एक बहुत बड़ा सपना है। प्रधान मंत्री जी की भी एक संकल्पना है कि आम आदमी को, गरीब आदमी को एक बहुत ही वाजिब और न्यूनतम कीमत पर खाद्यान्न उपलब्ध हो, अनाज उपलब्ध हो, भोजन उपलब्ध हो। इस के लिए फूड सेक्युरिटी बिल आ रहा है।

महोदय, इस के अलावा और भी केन्द्र सरकार ने उपाय किए हैं। साथ ही मैं यह भी चाहूंगी कि राज्य सरकारें भी कालाबाजारियों को नियंत्रित करें। जो पेट्रोलियम पदार्थ हैं, उन पर लगने वाले "वैट" को राज्य सरकारें नियंत्रित करें? यह शोर मचाने से काम नहीं चलेगा कि पेट्रोल की कीमतें बढ़ गयी हैं। केन्द्र सरकार ने "रोल बैक" किया है, उसी तरह राज्य सरकारें भी, आज

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

पश्चिमी बंगाल में, पंजाब में और भी जहां-जहां जितना-जितना "वैट" पेट्रोल व डीजल पर लगा हुआ है, उसे कम करने की जरूरत है।

(2 एच/एनबी पर क्रमशः)

NB/SSS/2H/2.50

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर (क्रमागत) : जरूरत यह है कि सब मिलकर उसे कम करने की कोशिश करें, सिर्फ हंगामा खड़ा करने का मकसद न हो। हमारी कोशिश यह हो कि सूरत बदलनी चाहिए और महंगाई से देश की जनता को निजात मिलनी चाहिए। हमारी आमदनी बढ़नी चाहिए। छठे वेतन आयोग की सिफारिशों को इसी सरकार ने लागू किया है, जिससे कर्मचारियों को महंगाई से राहत मिली है। अगर सौ रुपए आमदनी बढ़ती है और उसके अनुपात में 30 रुपए महंगाई बढ़ती है, तो लोग उसको सहन कर सकते हैं, उसका सामना कर सकते हैं। इसलिए ज्यादा जरूरी यह है कि आमदनी इस अनुपात में बढ़ती रहे, यह न हो कि महंगाई का बोझ उठाना मुश्किल पड़ जाए। आमदनी बढ़ती रहनी चाहिए, यदि तीन गुना आमदनी बढ़ती है और उसकी तुलना में एक गुना महंगाई बढ़ती है, स्वाभाविक है कि महंगाई बढ़ती ही है, अगर कोई कहते हैं कि नहीं बढ़ती है, तो गलत कहते हैं, देश की जनता को गुमराह करते हैं और * सत्य बताते हैं। देश की जनता को सत्य ही बताना चाहिए। इसलिए मैं यह कहती हूँ कि सच्चाई

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

बताएं और सच सामने रखें तथा सभी राज्य सरकारें मिलकर इस जिम्मेदारी को निभाएं कि कैसे लोगों को महंगाई से निजात मिले। (समाप्त)

श्री सीताराम येचुरी (पश्चिमी बंगाल) : उपसभापति जी, आपका बहुत-बहुत शुक्रिया कि आपने मुझे बोलने का अवसर दिया, लेकिन इस * सच और सच्चे * के बीच में इस गंभीर सवाल पर चर्चा करते हुए यह जरूरी है कि इस पर कोई तू-तू मैं-मैं न हो। आप पूछ रहे थे कि वे ठोस कदम क्या थे, जो सरकार को उठाने चाहिए थे और सरकार ने नहीं उठाए? अभी मैं उनके बारे में बताऊंगा, धीरज से सुनिएगा और यदि उनको आप लागू कर पाएंगे, तो यह केवल हमारे हित में ही नहीं, आपके हित में, आम आदमी के हित में और देश के हित में भी होगा। दूसरी बात यह है कि आमदनी बढ़ी है, इस बात पर मैं आऊंगा, लेकिन इससे पहले मैं यह कहना चाहूंगा कि यह तीसरी बार, लगातार तीसरे सत्र में महंगाई पर चर्चा हो रही है। पहली बार चर्चा तब हुई थी, जब माननीय चेयरमैन साहब ने एक प्रस्ताव मूव किया था और हम सभी लोगों ने उसका समर्थन किया था। उस प्रस्ताव के आखिरी वाक्य में यह कहा गया था कि इस महंगाई के बोझ से लोगों को बचाने के लिए सरकार सभी कदम उठाएगी, यानी लोगों को कुछ राहत मिलेगी, लेकिन कुछ नहीं मिला। दूसरे सत्र में फिर चर्चा हुई, विपक्ष की तरफ से एक प्रस्ताव पारित हुआ था, जिसमें हमने कुछ संशोधन मांगे थे, लेकिन वहां पर भी यही कहा गया था कि सरकार सभी कदम उठाएगी, लेकिन कुछ

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

कदम नहीं उठाए गए। इस बार हम चाहते थे कि यह चर्चा रूल 168 के तहत हो, जिसमें वोटिंग हो, ताकि सरकार पर कुछ कदम उठाने का दबाव पड़े। यह दबाव आज नहीं पड़ रहा है, यह अफसोस की बात है। चलिए, वोटों का दबाव न भी पड़े, लेकिन मैं समझता हूँ कि नैतिकता के आधार पर और उनकी आम आदमी के प्रति जो कमिटमेंट्स हैं, उनके आधार पर सरकार कुछ ठोस कदम उठाए। मेरे पास तीन ठोस कदम हैं, जो मैं मानता हूँ कि सरकार को उठाने चाहिए और वे ठोस कदम उठाने से पहले जो वास्तविकता है, उसके बारे में थोड़ी चर्चा करने की जरूरत है। दो साल हो गए हैं, food inflation 20 प्रतिशत से ज्यादा बढ़ गया है और फिलहाल food inflation 12 प्रतिशत से ज्यादा है। Vegetables are costlier today by 26 per cent, pulses are costlier today by 14 per cent, fruits are costlier today by 12 per cent, your eggs, fish and meat by 13 per cent and milk by 12 per cent. अभी अहलुवालिया साहब याद दिला रहे थे कि आप जो शेर पढ़ रहे थे, वह शायद हड़बड़ाहट में पूरा नहीं पढ़ पाए। एक पुरानी कहावत थी कि हम मुट्टी में पैसे भरकर ले जाते थे और बोरी भरकर अनाज ले आते थे, लेकिन आज बोरी भरकर पैसे ले जाते हैं, लेकिन मुट्टी भर अनाज भी नहीं मिलता है। यह वास्तविकता है। अब ऐसा क्यों हो रहा है? जब यह सवाल आ जाता है कि ऐसा क्यों हो रहा है, तो कहा जाता है कि लोगों की आमदनी बढ़ गई है। वित्त मंत्री ने यही कहा, प्रधान मंत्री जी ने भी यही कहा। प्रधान मंत्री जी जब G-20 की बैठक में भाग लेकर वापस आ रहे थे, तो उन्होंने

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

हवाई जहाज में यह बात कही थी And I quote what he said. He said, “If the economy is growing at 8 per cent and population at 1.6 per cent, then the per capita income must be growing at 6.5 to 6.7 per cent.” That is naturally putting the pressure on the prices to rise and what did the hon. Finance Minister -- he was here a little while ago — say when he made that eleven page statement in the House at the beginning of this Session? What did he say?

(Contd. By 2J/NBR-MP)

-SSS/NBR-MP/2J/2.55.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (CONTD.): He said, 'The steady rise in the incomes of our people is creating an excessive demand and that is the reason for this price rise. There is a mismatch between supply and demand.' Now, Sir, what is the reality? Just now we have heard Prabhaji. She was also talking about लोगों के हाथ में आमदनी बढ़ गई, पैसा बढ़ गया। What the reality is, Sir? Your own Economic Survey informs us and I quote, 'The growth of private final consumption expenditure falls from 8.6 per cent in 2005-06 to 7.3 per cent in 2010-11.' This is what the Economic Survey says. What is the other reality that we have before us? You say that the actual incomes have grown.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

But what does today's Times of India says? Today's Times of India tells you something on the basis of the Organization of Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD). Sir, the OECD is the holy cow for globalization and the *mantra* for all the PPP. The OECD today tells about India. Its Report has been published today and I quote. It says, 'The top 10 per cent wage earners now make 12 times more than the bottom 10 per cent, up from a ratio of 6 in 60s.' What does it say further? It says, 'The top 10 per cent earners make 5 times more than the median 10 per cent but this medium 10 per cent makes just 0.4 per cent times more than the bottom 10 per cent.' What is happening, Sir? अगर आमदनी बढ़ी तो यह चंद लोगों के हाथ में जा रही है। इस प्रकार दो “भारतों” की सृष्टि हो रही है। कई बार हमने यहां पर कहा कि अगर एक चमकता भारत है तो एक तड़पता भारत है। तड़पते भारत की तादाद बढ़ रही है और जितनी ज्यादा तड़पते भारत की तड़प बढ़ती है, चमकते भारत की तादाद और चमक रही है। ठीक है, हमारे राजीव शुक्ल जी यहां नहीं हैं, उनको खुश करने के लिए मैं कह दूँ कि, instead of Shining India and Suffering India -- he is a great avid cricket fan -- I can say there is an IPL India and the BPL India. These are the two Indias that have been created. Therefore, the question is: आमदनी अगर बढ़ रही है तो किसकी

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

बढ़ रही है और किस तरीके से बढ़ रही है? यह बात हमें सोचनी चाहिए कि आम लोगों की आमदनी नहीं बढ़ रही है लेकिन महंगाई की वजह से वे और ज्यादा पिस रहे हैं। तो इसके लिए करना क्या है? One thing we must understand is this. The hon. Home Minister, having dealt with the Finance Ministry for a long time, will understand that inflation is a classic mechanism which any economist will tell you of income redistribution. It is income redistribution from the wage-earners to the profit-earners. And, that is exactly what is happening in our country today. You are creating a chasm between these 'two Indias' and this chasm between these 'two Indias' and on top of it is the price rise of the dimension that I was telling you. That is what is creating today agony for the *Aam Aadmi*. If this agony from *Aam Aadmi* has to be resolved in terms of providing some relief, three steps have to be taken. सर, मुझे इकबाल का एक शेर याद आ रहा है —

“तेरा इरादा है कि तेरी आरजू पूरी हो,

मेरा इरादा है कि तेरी आरजू बदले।”

आप अपनी आरजू बदल लीजिए क्योंकि यहां पर आम आदमी को राहत चाहिए। यहां पर चमकते भारत को और चमकीला नहीं बनाना है। यहां पर चाहिए कि आम आदमी जब तक चमकना शुरू नहीं करता है, भारत न चमके। इंडिया

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

चमक सकता है, लेकिन भारत नहीं चमकेगा और इसलिए ये तीन कदम क्या होने चाहिए? पहली बात इन्होंने यह बताई कि हमारे हिसाब से आज महंगाई को जो contribute कर रहा है, वह है speculation in trade. अब आपके speculation in trade के बारे में हम आपको यह बता दें कि आज के दिन में, it is only rice and urd that is prohibited from forward trading. The latest data has been given by the Commodities Exchange. What does the Commodities Exchange tell you, Sir? The Forward Market Commission is headquartered at Mumbai. What do they tell you? From the period April 1 to October 31, 2011, the cumulative value of trade has gone up by Rs. 1,06,36,960.76 crores.

(CONTD. BY USY "2K")

-NBR-USY-SC/2K/3.00

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (CONTD.): That means one crore six lakh some thousand crores is the cumulative value of trade in this Forward Market. It has grown by a percentage of 72.63 in these few months. And, what is it for agricultural commodities? If you take the agricultural commodities as a whole, it has grown to more than 10,83,000 crores; in percentage terms, it is nearly 54 per cent as forward trading in agricultural commodities during this period. If there

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

is so much of growth in the value of trade in forward trading, what does it mean? Nobody will invest in forward trading unless there is profit. And, there cannot be profit in forward trading unless prices rise. If the prices do not rise, those who make speculation in the forward trading do not make any profit. So, the pressure for prices to rise is automatically there when you have this sort of a cumulative value, which is there in this forward speculative trading. क्या कदम उठाए हैं? पहला कदम यह है कि ban all forward trading and speculative trading in agricultural commodities, and ban it for every commodity. अब आपको दिक्कत आ जाएगी that foreign finance capital is shouting why you are doing this. आप कहिए, आम आदमी के हित में है। We are banning this. चलिए, मैं यहां तक जाने के लिए तैयार हूं। सरकार कहेगी कि 6 महीने के लिए हम इसको सस्पेंड करते हैं और आप उसका असर देखिए। असर देखकर बताइए, अगर दाम नहीं घटते हैं तो ठीक है, हम आपकी बात मानने के लिए तैयार हैं, लेकिन आप करिए तो सही। मेरा पहला सवाल यह है। इसी फॉरवर्ड ट्रेडिंग के साथ भ्रष्टाचार जुड़ा हुआ है। कहां से आता है यह पैसा? यह पैसा कहां से आ रहा है, कहां पर जा रहा है, यह ब्लैक मनी क्या है, जो जेनरेट हो रही है? यह सब speculation के साथ जुड़ा हुआ है। जब तक आप इस speculation को नहीं रोकेंगे..(व्यवधान)..

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

श्री उपसभापति : येचुरी साहब, आप उधर भी देखिए और मुझे भी देखिए।

श्री सीताराम येचुरी : सर, मैं आपको धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ कि आपने मेरे ऊपर कृपा की कि वह बोर्ड सामने नहीं लगाया। मेरे लिए दिक्कत होगी क्योंकि दोनों तरफ देखना मुश्किल है। इसलिए मैं आपको इसके लिए धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ। महोदय, मैं चाहूँगा कि आज आप मुझे बोलने दीजिए क्योंकि यह बहुत ही गंभीर मामला है। मैं सरकार को कुछ ठोस बातें करने के लिए कह रहा हूँ, जिसमें पहली बात तो यह थी, जो मैंने कही। दूसरा, आपने कहा कि पेट्रोल के दाम कम किए गए। यह बड़ी अच्छी बात है कि आपने दो रुपए पेट्रोल के दाम कम कर दिए। आपने दो रुपए कम कर दिए, जबकि विदेश में पर बैरल तीन डॉलर दाम बढ़ गए। अभी तक तर्क यही था कि विदेश में दाम बढ़ रहा है इसलिए हम दाम बढ़ा रहे हैं। अब विदेश में दाम बढ़ गए, लेकिन आपने कम कर दिए। इससे यह बात साफ है कि विदेश के दाम के साथ हमारे यहां के दाम का कोई ताल्लुक नहीं है। लेकिन वह बात भी अगर आप नहीं मानना चाहते हैं, तो ठीक है, मत मानिए। आप यह कहते हैं कि oil companies are going under under-invoicing of Rs. 1.32 lakh crores. डा0 प्रभा ठाकुर जी ने बिल्कुल सही कहा कि हमने हमारे दाम अंतर्राष्ट्रीय दामों के साथ जोड़ दिए हैं। यह मामला था, जब Caltex हुआ करता था, ESSO हुआ करता था। उन दिनों अपने बचपन में हम लोग पेट्रोल Caltex से, ESSO वगैरह से लेते थे। इंदिरा गांधी जी ने नैशनलाइज़ कर दिया, बड़ी अच्छी बात है, हमने उसका समर्थन किया। नैशनलाइज़ करने

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

के बाद अंतर्राष्ट्रीय दामों के साथ अपने दाम जोड़ने की क्या जरूरत है? आप अपने दाम अपने उत्पादन के आधार पर जोड़िए। अंतर्राष्ट्रीय दाम से जोड़कर आप कहते हैं कि under invoice हो गए। अब under invoice में आप यह कहते हैं कि ऑयल कम्पनीज़ लॉस करती हैं। यह ऑडिटेड अकाउंट्स हैं, till 31st March, 2010. आपकी इंडियन ऑयल कम्पनी का नेट प्रॉफिट क्या है? The net profit of the Indian Oil Company, by audited account, is Rs. 10,998 crores. It is net profit after paying taxes. इसी तरह से आईओसी का रिजर्व्ड रेवेन्यू कितना है? The reserved revenue surplus of the Indian Oil Corporation is Rs. 49.472 crores. And, during April to December, two other major oil companies, the Hindustan Petroleum and the Bharat Petroleum have earned profits of Rs. 544 crores and Rs. 834 crores.

(Contd. by 2I – MCM)

SC/MCM-PK/2L/3-05

श्री सीताराम येचुरी (क्रमागत) : सर, किसे आप यह * बोल रहे हो कि वे कम्पनियां घाटे में जा रही हैं? यह उनके ऑडिटेड एकाउंट्स हैं, हम कुछ नहीं बोल रहे हैं, उनके ऑडिटेड एकाउंट्स कह रहे हैं कि ये-ये मुनाफा बना रहे हैं। अरे भाई, अगर वे मुनाफा बना रहे हैं तो उससे जनता को राहत तो मिले। एक

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

ओर आप दाम क्यों बढ़ा रहे हो, उसके बारे में किसी को समझ में नहीं आता, दूसरी ओर से आप कहते हैं कि हम चालिस हजार करोड़ रुपए की सब्सिडी दे रहे हैं पेट्रोलियम प्रोडक्ट्स पर! सर, अफसोस की बात है कि पिछले हफ्ते से यह सत्र नहीं चल पाया। लेकिन अब अच्छी बात है कि सरकार ने मान लिया है, वरना पिछले शीतकालीन सत्र जैसा ही होता, मतलब यह भी वेस्ट हो जाता। अगर उस समय जे०पी०सी० की बात मान लेते तो शायद वह विंटर सेशन वेस्ट नहीं होता। इस बारे में अब उन्होंने मान लिया, बात ठीक है। लेकिन 22 नवम्बर को वित्त मंत्री का इस हाउस में यह written answer in this House to a question asked by one of my colleagues, Shri Rajeeve. What is that? It is: What is the amount of money earned by the Government of India in 2010-11? The reply was: In 2010-11, the total amount, through indirect taxes collected and realised, is to the tune of Rs.1,02,827.77 crores. In addition, in 2010-11, they have got a dividend and royalty from the oil companies to the tune of Rs.22,240.47 crores. Then, the statement by the hon. Finance Minister says that sector-wise data of direct taxes -- personal tax and corporate tax-- is not maintained centrally.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

अगर उसको भी आप जोड़ेंगे तो revenue is more than Rs.1,30,000 crores. The subsidy you are giving to the people, you claim, is Rs.40,000 crores. People are subsidising the Government. You are making profit of Rs.90,000 crores from the petroleum sector. और फिर कहते हैं कि दाम बढ़ाना जरूरी है। सर, क्या यह उचित है आप ही बताइए? हम सरकार से यही पूछ रहे हैं कि पेट्रोलियम सैक्टर से 90 हजार करोड़ का आप मुनाफा बनाओगे और फिर कहोगे कि दाम बढ़ाने के अलावा और कोई चारा नहीं है? हम कह रहे हैं कि यह * छोड़िए, आप सीधा-सीधा दामों को घटाइए, रोल बैक करिए।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Yechury, I am afraid you have to conclude.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, last point is about foodgrains. As I told you, सर, यह गंभीर सवाल है।

श्री उपसभापति : टाइम भी गंभीर है।

श्री सीताराम येचुरी : बिल्कुल सर।

श्री उपसभापति : दो हफ्ते वेस्ट हो गए।

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

श्री सीताराम येचुरी : सर, रिकार्ड पर है कि मैं बिल्कुल अनावश्यक नहीं बोलता हूं, कोई तू-तू, मैं-मैं नहीं, मैं तर्क दे रहा हूं कि हमारे पास जो सरकार को तीसरा कदम उठाना है, वह यह है कि आज हमारे सेंट्रल गोडाउन में छः सौ लाख टन से ज्यादा स्टॉक है, जो बफर नार्म्स के मुताबिक कही जाती है, उससे ढाई गुना ज्यादा। बफर से ढाई गुना ज्यादा आप क्यों रख रहे हैं अपने सेंट्रल गोडाउन में? क्या यह चूहों के लिए है? आप आदमियों को, इंसानों को बचाइए। लेकिन आप चूहों को भी बचाना चाहते हैं, हमें कोई ऐतराज नहीं है, लेकिन छोड़िए अब उस बात को, लेकिन मैं यह चाहूंगा कि आपके पास जो अधिक है वह बी०पी०एल० दामों पर स्टेट को क्यों नहीं देते हो, ताकि पब्लिक डिस्ट्रिब्यूशन सिस्टम के तहत वह डिस्ट्रिब्यूट हो और दामों पर अंकुश लगाने के लिए इसका असर पड़े। सर, ये तीन कदम हैं। पहली बात, आप स्पेक्युलेटिव ट्रेडिंग पर एकदम बेन लगाइए। दूसरी बात, आप पेट्रोल प्राइसेज को रोल बैक करिए। तीसरी बात, जो फूड ग्रेन एक्सैस है उसको रिलीज करिए पब्लिक डिस्ट्रिब्यूशन सिस्टम के लिए। अगर ये तीनों काम करेंगे तो हमारे हिसाब से महंगाई पर अंकुश लग सकता है। अब जो दबाव है इस सरकार पर, क्योंकि वोट नहीं है, पता नहीं कैसे पड़ेगी। लेकिन हम चाहेंगे कि यह दबाव नैतिक तौर पर आम आदमी को पड़े। आखिर में एक ही बात कहना चाहूंगा कि Now, the tax concessions that you give to the rich was to the tune of -- Mr. Finance Minister is not here. In the last Budget, he presented the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

documents — Rs.5.12 lakh crores. Rs.5.12 lakh crores of concessions given in corporate and personal tax. If that was not given, there would be no fiscal deficit in this country. But concessions to the rich are incentives and concessions to the poor are subsidies. Subsidies are bad for the economy; incentives are good for the economy. यह आम आदमी या खास आदमी की सरकार है। यहीं पर जब हम कहते हैं कि Give these concessions to the people rather than the rich. Please implement these three points that I have raised, apart from everything else. और सर, उसी के आधार पर, I only urge upon the Government, though there is no vote, to seriously consider these three measures and start implementing them in the interest of the people of country to control prices.

(Contd. by 2M/SKC)

2m/3.10/skc-gs

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (contd.): I hope that the Government takes this seriously. Even though there is no vote, they must think of the moral vote that is there, and then take decisions.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

श्री एन.के. सिंह (बिहार): माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, मेरे से पूर्व जो सुझाव श्रीमान सीताराम येचुरी जी ने दिए हैं, उनमें से कई सुझाव सकारात्मक हैं। मैं समझता हूँ कि उन सुझावों पर सरकार को गंभीरता से विचार करना चाहिए। चूंकि यह मामला तकनीकी है, कुछ ऐसे मुद्दे हैं जिनको मैं आपके माध्यम से इस सदन के समक्ष रखना चाहता हूँ।

I don't have the privilege, Sir, of being a merchant banker, but if I were to be a portfolio manager advising any merchant banking company, I would advise them to only invest their money in one thing, which is inflation and prices, because that seems to be the only thing that is going up in value!

Sir, I would like to bring, basically, six issues before this Government.

The first is the relationship between inflation and poverty. The latest study by the Asian Development Bank, entitled "Global Food Price Inflation in Developing Asia" suggests that every 10 per cent increase in prices put 30 million people in this country back into poverty. An over 10 per cent annual increase in food prices, headline inflation, has been our characteristic over several years. This is because 65 per cent of the budget of an average Indian is spent on

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

food and this, Sir, because of the recent Oxford study brings out that 55 per cent Indians based on the multi-dimensional poverty index happen to be below the Poverty Line. So, the first is that inflation has a deep impact on enhancing poverty and under-cutting all anti-poverty steps.

The second ghost I want to set at rest, Sir, is the ghost of inflation and growth. This point has been repeatedly raised by the very able Congress speaker who spoke first, that whenever you have growth, you are likely to have high inflation. This is false, Sir, both in analytical terms and certainly completely false as far as sound economics is concerned. Countries, of course, have their own ethos of what they consider to be tolerable thresholds of inflation. But rates of growth, if there is an adequate response on the supply side, would only lead to a very tolerant increase in prices. So, there is no symbiotic relationship between inflation and growth. In fact, Sir, the most classic economic explanation of that is the famous Philips Curve according to which if inflation reaches and crosses a certain limit, then, of course, you have the backward-bending Philips Curve in which only unemployment would rise, growth will suffer and inflation

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

would prosper. In fact, Sir, the fact that the Government neglected for several years, regarding the increase in food prices to be entirely due to exogenous circumstances led to the unfortunate tragedy of the inflation becoming from headline inflation into a more generalized inflation which, of course, compounds Government's problems of overall macro-economic management.

My third important point, Sir, is at the heart of the Government's macro-economic policy and it is that a disproportionate burden on inflation management has been put on monetary policy alone. And the monetary policy has increased nearly 14 times, which has hurt investment sentiment. We now know that in order to get to a nine per cent rate of growth, the investment gearing ratio has to increase by, at least, four to five percentage points, which in the last few years it has not; it has remained stable. I do believe that unless, therefore, you bring into play fiscal policy and make the monetary policy act in tandem with fiscal policy, continuing with the policy of fiscal profligacy, in which expenditure remains uncontrolled and relying merely on a monetary policy instrument to reign in demand and to

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

reign in inflation, is in my view, short-term, counter-productive and anti-growth.

(contd. at 2n/ksk)

KSK/3.15/2N

SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD): Indeed, Sir, what the Government needs to place emphasis on is vastly better supply side responses and vastly better supply side management. Mr. Yechury did refer to some of the measures which have not been taken to improve agricultural productivity and agricultural yields. Agricultural productivity, Sir, has plateaued off, which we know. Improvement in agricultural supply side has plateaued off. Improving the credit penetration to Eastern Region has plateaued off. In fact, the Finance Minister, when he made a reference to improving the reach of the Green Revolution to the Eastern India, made a laughable sum of Rs.4,000 crores available for improving agricultural productivity in the whole of Eastern India. The penetration of formal credit remains miniscule. And, I think, Sir, it is a profound tragedy, which the Government is trying to perpetuate of equating improving agricultural supply chain, cold storage, rural network, improving farm prices to be co-terminus with bringing retail

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

into FDI through the instrument which they have just put in abeyance. Indeed, Sir, it is Government's hitherto policy. Will supply chain, cold supply chain, not improve if retail is not there? Has rural network not been improved because of the fact that this retail chain has been kept in abeyance? Equating agricultural strategy to Government's strategy of what they have kept in abeyance, in my view, is really highly fallacious. So, the first and most important thing is how to improve short-term supply elasticity in agriculture by doing the things which they had promised to do. For several years, they have promised to improve the issue on wastage, improving cold chain, improving rural road network, transportation, improving the penetration of telecommunications into the rural areas. This, Sir, is an agenda which the Agriculture Minister had promised to the House in the Agricultural Action Plan and he needs to reactivate this.

Second, Sir, I think, is something which the Finance Minister may like to give serious thought to. The centrepiece of any macro economic stability policy is fiscal rectitude. He has himself now admitted that this year, there will be a huge slippage in fiscal targets. Disinvestment is nowhere in reach. Tax buoyancy has plateaued off.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

There is no effort to check expenditure management. And, if fiscal profligacy continues, the centrepiece of macro economic stability, Sir, is in huge danger.

The last point, which I would like to raise, is clearly improvement in investment gearing ratio is inextricably linked with improving investor sentiment. Investor sentiment is not co-terminus with merely this retail thing. Investor sentiment, in my view, will depend on four important things. First, the recognition that the current slowdown in economic growth is not contra-cyclical; dependent on extraordinary circumstances, but, it is inextricably linked with factors which are endemic to our economy and require structural changes and structural improvements. What would be the ingredients of those structural changes and structural improvements? Would it not have been vastly better for Government at a time when there is a slowdown in the economy, when external capital is slow, when rupee is depreciating, the investment sentiment is down, to rekindle reform agenda, which is not retail, but something to which the NDA Government had committed itself, which is a big agenda of an unfinished kind of a legislative work? There is a whole agenda to which the NDA

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Government, when it was in power, had committed itself and should the Treasury Bench, therefore, have really reminded us that that was an unfinished agenda, surely, there would have been a more optimistic response than merely reviving the ghost of retail, to which the NDA Government never committed itself. In fact, Sir, just to remind really the Treasury Benches, I myself was the author, in the last stage of the NDA Government, of a report on improving the ceilings on Foreign Direct Investment. I think, there is a very big agenda and on the issue of retail, a deliberate sentence has been put there that retail was kept out of any suggestion on really relaxing the Foreign Direct Investment cap. But, there is a whole slew of things to which the NDA Government had committed itself, not only the FDI but in respect of the other legislations which remained, unfortunately, pending for nearly the seven years that the UPA has been in Office.

(continued by 2o – gsp)

GSP-LT-3.20-20

SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD.): So, I think, how to revive investors' sentiment and how to get structural reforms going, in my view, would be a critical factor.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Sir, recently, I have travelled all over the world and I had the privilege of some of my colleagues being with me. I had Mr. Yechury with me, and, of course, I had another very distinguished colleague of mine with me, and, I think, the centrepiece of the weaknesses of investors' sentiment arises out of what is perceived by investors, the weaknesses of Governments. Issues of transparency, long-term investment decisions, as the Prime Minister knows better than anybody else, is an act of faith, is an act of trust. But for a shaken investor, in the lack of faith, and, in the lack of trust, improving governance record and improving transparency of transactions, are, Sir, at the centrepiece of reviving investor confidence. I agree with you that there is no magic bullet solution to the ghost of inflation, and, more than inflation, inflationary expectations. It would require an integrated action. It would require action on the supply-side, on the demand side, and, also on improving market failures, reviving investors' sentiment, and, putting the growth trajectory back to what this country expects and what the urgency of the situation demands.

Thank you, Sir. (Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

DR. K. P. RAMALINGAM (TAMIL NADU): Hon. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I am pained and anguished to get an opportunity to speak on the alarming price rise situation. Of course, I thank the Chair for this opportunity to vent the grievances of the general public.

More than once in the last two decades, we had felt that India is shining but what is the ground reality? The price of oil has been rising steadily. Prices of every other commodity are also increasing. On more than nine occasions, the price of petrol has been increased in the last one and a half year. It has its cascading effect.

The prices of essential commodities have increased manifold and the common man is the worst hit. This is the price for our liberalization and globalization. We have been saying that our growth rate is increasing but the ground reality is different. The economic bubble alone is growing big. The fruits of liberalized economy benefitted only those who are working in AC rooms and the poor people have been hit hard every time.

Our economy is based on agriculture. More than one-third people of our country are agriculturists, and, then, we have the labour class in the unorganized sector. They are found both in villages and

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

rural areas. Their life is pitiable. That is why the Government itself brought Employment Guarantee Schemes. The need for such schemes gives a lie to the claim that we are prospering.

Our goals for prosperity through liberalization are lopsided. We have not taken into consideration the condition of our farmers. We claim that both in foodgrains' production and in milk production, we hold first two places in the world. In order to continue with this, we have to give importance to our agriculture sector. This will help increase our food production, sustain our growth and increase jobs while attracting people towards the farm sector.

It is not a good sign to see people deserting villages and agriculture. This is because of the unequal growth that we find in the liberal economy. The prices of foodgrains and agro products are sky-high. At the same time, the price benefits are not going either to the farmers or labour in the farm sector.

(Contd. by Sk-2P)

SK/2P/3.25

DR. K.P. RAMALINGAM (CONTD.): Only the middlemen and the men in the online trade are reaping the benefits. We must have a rethink on it.

If agriculture is given importance, agriculturists get all the needed inputs and a dynamic price mechanism is in place, the agriculture sector alone can be a very big money spinning sector for our economy. When we take care of our farmers, price fluctuation will not be there unnecessarily and unexpectedly. We must get back the men who are going away from agriculture. The traditional knowledge in cultivation gained over the years must be combined with modern methods. This will keep intact our village community and our agricultural community in particular.

Our civilisation gave the knowledge of cultivation to the world. Norman Borlaug, the American Agronomist and Nobel Laureate has stated that the Dravidians of the Indian subcontinent have taught agriculture to the world communities. Our agriculture, when ignored, gives rise to the extinction of artisans and small merchants who are

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

part of our national life and culture. The labour class, especially in the unorganized sector, forms part of this social fabric.

Neglect of farming sector leads to the sufferings of agriculturists, agricultural labour, unorganized labour in other sectors and also rural artisans. So, the increasing price rise causes sufferings to the vital sections of the society who are becoming poorer and poorer. The middle class people and the salaried class who get various benefits through different service sectors are still a minority in our population. The income divide between different working classes in the emerging economies is alarming. It is worst in India according to the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. The top ten per cent of the wage-earners have got twelve times increase in the last decade than the bottom ten per cent. It is also reported that our country's production rate, as far as daily wage-earners are concerned, is steadily increasing. That means the number of coolies is increasing. With this, I am afraid, the land of agriculturists may soon become the land of coolies. This must not happen. We must arrest this rising trend.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

The Government must not be satisfied with the increase in the income of the salaried class in the white collared jobs. That cannot be an economic indicator. Money in their hands contributes to consumerism. This consumerist culture gives rise to several unproductive services in the service sector. The money flow and the job situation there is just a bubble in our economy.

The real growth in production must be in our agriculture and agro-industries sector. (Time-bell) We must evolve policies towards this. We must think of bringing together the rural employment guarantee scheme and our agricultural activities. This is mutually beneficial as it will generate jobs and generate income while increasing our production. I want the Government to give serious thought to this.

The Government must also ensure that the wasteful expenditure is curbed. For instance, I find the head of a State Government using special flights even for their personal needs. They hire choppers even to travel small distances of fifty kilometers. Such leaders lavishly spend the Government money to bring a flight from the neighbouring State to ferry them back home. Even to attend court cases, they are

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

hiring the flights and incur an expenditure of rupees one crore or rupees two crore. ..(Interruptions)..

DR. V. MAITREYAN: He is saying as if ..(Interruptions)..

DR. K.P. RAMALINGAM: I am not mentioning..(Interruptions).. You want to mention your Chief, you may mention it. ..(Interruptions).. I am not mentioning it. ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Maitreyan, why are you ..(Interruptions)..

DR. K.P. RAMALINGAM: I am not mentioning any such leader. In such a leader's category, your leader is coming. Okay. No problem. ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. ..(Interruptions).. Mr. Maitreyan, please. ..(Interruptions)..

DR. K.P. RAMALINGAM: You want to record your leader's name, you record it. I am not recording your leader's name. ..(Interruptions)..

This is done when the same leader says that the Government has financial crunch. Using a special flight to travel fifty kilometers from one place to another place ..(Interruptions)..

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

DR. V. MAITREYAN: He is talking about * probably.

DR. K.P. RAMALINGAM: The State Governments are also..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, don't take anyone's name who is not present here and who can't defend. You can't take anybody's name who is not present. That is expunged.

(Followed by ysr/2Q)

-SK/YSR-SCH/3.30/2Q

DR. K.P. RAMALINGAM: I have not mentioned any name.

(Interruptions)

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: He has not mentioned any name.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is expunged.

DR. K.P. RAMALINGAM: State Governments are also increasing milk price and bus fare and throwing the blame on the Centre. When the Central Government agrees to petrol price hike, the State Government uses the opportunity to increase bus fare. Thus the common man is

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

being crushed by the Anaconda called 'price-rise'. There is a Tamil saying * (Kindly fill in Tamil)

Every Government must be very cautious while going for price rise. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

DR. YOGENDRA P. TRIVEDI (MAHARASHTRA): This is a problem on which probably there is near unanimity in the House. We are all consumers who are suffering the brunt of increase in prices. Scholastic speeches have been made and statistics have been given and thereafter speakers have just retired from the House thinking that probably the problem will be solved only by making the speeches, not by listening to others. This is basically a problem of economics. It is not a simplistic problem.

My party revised the price rise in two parts. Price rise in essential commodities which is a cause of concern for the common man, the *aam aadmi*. Their plight has to be considered. There is also a price rise in luxury goods. They are mainly consumed by a few. They include manufacturing goods like cars, TVs, air conditioners,

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

refrigerators, etc. As a result of increase in prices and slowing of production, the economy has suffered. The Reserve Bank of India has tried to bring it down by increasing the interest rates and by increasing the repo rates. But we believe that merely monetary control or fiscal measures will not be sufficient to arrest this decline in our economic growth. Today, Standards and Poor's and Moody's have downgraded us to a large extent. Rupee is falling. This is a question which is linked to the pride of our country. If rupee is strong, we feel proud. But when rupee goes down, we all feel unhappy. I personally believe that merely using fiscal measures will not be sufficient. If production is falling, it has to be arrested. So many things can be done. I believe that instead of just increasing the interest rate, we should think in terms of selective interest grading. The industry which is suffering should be given money at concessional rate of interest on its borrowing. And the industries, which are prosperous, can be given money at a higher rate of interest on their borrowing from banks. Selective rate of interest on borrowings is something which can be considered by the Reserve Bank of India.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Coming to the main issue of rise in the prices of essential commodities, there has been discussion on it from time to time, but we find that there is not much of result. I personally believe this is not a problem only of the Ruling Party or of the Opposition Party. When the Opposition Party was in power, only because of rise in price of onion, their Government came down. The rise in prices is a concern for all of us. I think it has to be thought out by all of us collectively. I believe that it is no use blaming one factor or the other. Mr. Yechury talked about commodity price control and commodity exchange.

(Contd. by VKK/2R)

-YSR/VKK-PSV/2r/3.35

DR. YOGENDRA P. TRIVEDI (CONTD.): He talked about the person who is going to the commodity market, who would like to see that the prices rise and who is always bullish. But, he forgets that when somebody is buying, somebody is selling. So, if somebody is selling and somebody is buying, the man who is buying is expecting the prices to come down. So, what is needed is not the abolition of the commodity exchange but a proper regulation of the commodity

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

exchange. If there is a bullish tendency, it has to be curbed by the Government by following adequate measures.

Then, we have to take into consideration other things. I am talking about my leader who is the Agriculture Minister. He is largely responsible for increasing the agricultural production, food production, substantially. Our granaries are full. Our farmers are very happy. I am told that some of the farmers in Punjab are moving in Rolls Royce. Now, if this is the product and this is the type of support price which is given to the farmers, I think, the farmers are not unhappy. Then, what is wrong? Our distribution system is not wrong. There must be proper distribution centres. Somehow or the other, we must see to it that there is no hoarding of the goods. And, if all this is properly implemented, the prices of commodities and foodgrains can be brought down.

Now, people are talking about subsidies. I believe that subsidies by themselves are not always to be supported. What is subsidy? Subsidy is something for which the man who is consuming does not make the payment, but the Government pays. When the Government pays, it is the nation which pays. When I am having three cars and I

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

am using petrol, why should the Government or the nation pay for my petrol? It is not as if all subsidies have either to be encouraged or discouraged. We believe there should be subsidies on food items. We believe there should be subsidies on kerosene. But, there need not be any subsidy on petrol which is consumed by some selected people who, probably, very often, may be squandering the petrol and wasting money. So, I personally believe that we need to have proper consideration. This is an economic problem where all the parties should come together and apply their mind to find out a solution, to see to it as to what extent the State Governments are responsible. I am not straightaway blaming the State Governments. The State Governments have to examine what is their role, what they are doing and what remedies they can have. It is something where we have spoken enough. Now, it is time for action and that action has to be a united action, not merely by the ruling party, but even by the Opposition, by giving constructive suggestions as to how to bring down the inflation, how to bring down the prices of essential commodities, etc. This is something which is needed. Thank you very much. (Ends)

श्री मंगल किसन (उड़ीसा): उपसभापति महोदय, बीते चार सालों से हर साल दाम बढ़ते जा रहे हैं और सरकार भी हर साल, प्रधान मंत्री से लेकर वित्त मंत्री तक, प्राइस कंट्रोल कैसे होगा, उसके बारे में prescription देते रहते हैं। देश की जनता आशा लगाए बैठी रहती है कि तीन महीने बाद या छः महीने बाद इसका समाधान होगा, मगर उसका समाधान होने के बदले दाम और बढ़ते जाते हैं। खाने-पीने की चीज़ों के मामले में आम आदमी की जो दिक्कत है, वह बढ़ती जा रही है। विशेष कर जो गरीब तबके के लोग हैं, मजदूर हैं, शैड्यूल्ड कास्ट्स और शैड्यूल्ड ट्राइब्स के लोग हैं, जिनकी per day income 20 रुपए से कम है, जिनकी तादाद 77 प्रतिशत से ज्यादा बताई जाती है, उनकी तकलीफ बहुत ज्यादा है। सरकार बजट में बता रही है कि देश का ग्रोथ बहुत हो रहा है और देश बहुत तरक्की कर रहा है, मगर जब 77 प्रतिशत लोगों को आज भी, आज़ादी के 64 सालों बाद भी, खाने के लिए अनाज नहीं मिल रहा है..।

(2एस/वी.एन.के. पर क्रमशः)

PSV/VNK-KR/2s/03:40

श्री मंगल किसन (क्रमागत): इस तरक्की से क्या फायदा हो रहा है? यह तरक्की देश के किस काम आ रही है? यह बात सरकार को सोचनी चाहिए। विशेषकर जो भाई लोग देश के दूर-दराज में रहते हैं, जहां इन्कम का कोई स्रोत नहीं है, जो कि आज भी जंगल झाड़ में बसे हुए हैं, उनके लिए जीविका और

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

उनके जीवन स्तर को ऊंचा उठाने के लिए सरकार के पास आज तक कोई ऐसा प्रोग्राम नहीं है, जिससे उनके जीवन में परिवर्तन आ सके। जो जंगल झाड़ में रहते थे और बड़े लोगों को देखने से डरते थे, आज वही लोग एक किस्म का आंदोलन कर रहे हैं, जो देश के लिए एक सिर दर्द बनता जा रहा है। हम लोगों का जो development process है, उसको बदलना पड़ेगा और जहां गरीब आदमी हैं, आदिवासी हैं, दलित हैं, मजदूर हैं, जिनकी तादाद ज्यादा है, उनके लिए सरकार को रोजगार की व्यवस्था करनी पड़ेगी। सीताराम येचुरी जी और डा. के. पी. रामालिंगम जी ने सही कहा है कि हम लोगों का जो development process हो रहा है, उसका फायदा अभी तक आम आदमी तक क्यों नहीं पहुंच पा रहा है? इस संबंध में सरकार को सोचना पड़ेगा और जो development process है, उसको बदलना पड़ेगा।

पहले इस देश में खेती करने वालों का percentage ज्यादा था, लेकिन जैसा कहा जा रहा है या so called तरक्की की बात हो रही है, उसके चलते गांव के लोग, जिनका profession खेती था, अपना profession change करते जा रहे हैं। 50 प्रतिशत चास की जमीन खाली पड़ी हुई है, क्योंकि उसके लिए अभी तक सरकार के पास सिंचाई का कोई ठोस प्रोग्राम नहीं है। बिना पानी के चास संभव नहीं है। इसी कारण से गांव के जो खेतिहर हैं, वे लोग गांव छोड़ कर शहर आ रहे हैं। जिसके चलते देश में खाद्य पदार्थ तथा अन्न का उत्पादन कम हो रहा है। आज देश में डिमाण्ड ज्यादा और सप्लाई कम हो रही है। इसी

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

कारण से खाद्य पदार्थों की कीमतों में वृद्धि हो रही है। इसके लिए सरकार को, जो ग्रामीण भारत है, जो दूर-दराज में भाई लोग रहते हैं, उनके लिए जीवन जीने और रोजगार की व्यवस्था करने के लिए ठोस कदम उठाने पड़ेंगे और सिर्फ multi-national companies के लिए FDI लाने से इस देश में कुछ नहीं होगा। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

SHRI D. BANDYOPADHYAY (WEST BENGAL): Thank you, Mr Deputy Chairman. When prices rise at the level beyond 3 to 7 per cent, particularly for a long time, we have a situation of inflation. We are having that situation of inflation for the last three consecutive years. In fact, the hon. Finance Minister in his statement which he laid on 23rd November, 2011 clearly mentioned that, according to him, the inflation rate remained above 9 per cent from December, 2010 to October, 2011 and subsequently it was 9.7 per cent. Now, it is true that we are not facing a situation in which to buy a loaf of bread we have to carry in our ration bag notes of high denomination as it happened in Germany after the First World War. But that does not give any credit to him. In the last two years food prices have almost risen by 75 per cent. Such a high rate of inflation is having deleterious

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

effects on the economy as well as on the household sector. In fact, my hon. friend, Mr N.K. Singh has already mentioned about the Asian Development Bank study of May, 2011,.....

(Contd.by 2T)

MKS/3.45/2T

SHRI D. BANDYOPADHYAY (CONTD.): ...which states: “India will be badly affected by high food prices as ten per cent increase would push close to 30 million Indians to below the poverty line.” If we go by Tendulkar’s calculation, some 37 per cent are below poverty line. We have already had the universe of 44 crores of Indians below poverty line. That means, every year, we push another three crores down. We are having a very horrendous situation, an alarming situation, in our country. Such a high rate of inflation affects people in various ways. Fixed income groups suffer because they cannot make more than what they need. The value of the consumption basket changes. So, they substitute the lower-valued, lower-priced food for a high valued, better priced food. Their energy remaining the same, the energy input goes down. We have morbidity resulting in higher mortality. As a result, it is a highly iniquitous system in which the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

whole country runs. I just saw in one of the financial newspapers that with food inflation increasing, approximately 50 per cent cumulatively over the last two years, what would cost Rs.100/- then would now cost Rs.150/-. It came out in *The Hindu* a few days ago. There is no easy way out, I admit. But one has to look into a variety of situations. The Government has blamed the global increase in the commodity prices for costlier food items, costlier food imports for the higher petrol prices, and global recessionary conditions were affecting India's flagging exports. It is true to some extent, but is not wholly true because as the rupee value is going down, in fact, at a very low level of 52 point something a dollar, our export prices elsewhere are going down. So, there should have been much more exports than when the rupee is depreciating. That is the traditional economic theory. But it did not happen. So, the disease is much deeper and the cause lies, I see, in the neo-liberal economic policies which this Government has been following, pursuing relentlessly to achieve a spectacular rate of growth. It is true that India has achieved a high rate of growth. But indiscriminate pursuit of economic expansion without paying attention to how it is shared or how it affects the life and wellbeing of the people

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

is already having its deleterious impact on India's social development.

Sir, Amartya Sen wrote recently this in The Outlook of November 14, 2011 -- I just quote a sentence: "One indication that something is not quite right with India's developing strategy is the fact that India has started falling behind every other South Asian country (with practical or partial exception of Pakistan) in terms of social indicators even as it is doing so well in terms of per capita income."

(THE VICE-CHAIRMAN, PROF. P.J. KURIEN, in the Chair)

It then goes on to say: "There is probably no other example in the history of world development of an economy growing so fast for so long with such a limited result in terms of broad-based social progress." In fact, he asked a question: Whose growth is it anyway? "In fact, today, our neighbour, Bangladesh, with much lower per capita income, has gone much beyond us in social indicators like life expectancy, child survival, fertility rates, immunization rates, and even in the schooling rate."

(Contd. by TMV/2U)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

-MKS-TMV-HMS/2U/3.50

SHRI D. BANDYOPADHYAY (CONTD.): The Government blames the crude oil price as the villain of the piece. There is much truth in that argument, but it is not the whole truth. In July, 2008 crude oil price reached a record high of US dollars 147 per barrel. At that time, the combined inflation was 11.2 per cent and the combined food inflation was 7.7 per cent. Today, when the crude price is hovering around US dollars 94-95, petrol price is over Rs.66 per litre, with two rupees rolled back on 16.11.2011. So, the point is that when the price of crude was so high and the petrol price was Rs.40, and when the price of crude came to US dollars 94-95, we have almost 25 per cent higher growth rate. In fact, it has been mentioned by so many friends that the entire attempt has been to control the mechanism through monetary policy.

In fiscal matters, the Government has, in order to promote investment, abolished tax on dividend income. It has also abolished estate duty. Incidentally, the US has estate duty for a long time. It was reported in some magazine -- I don't know about the veracity of it -- that an Indian tycoon whose average annual dividend income is

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

around Rs.4,000-5,000 crores does not pay any tax because there is no dividend tax. Therefore, isn't it time that we think about some fiscal measures? As a result what has happened is that we have increasing disparity in our own country. Today we can say proudly that we have 56-57 per cent people who are billionaires in dollar terms while Japan has 25-26 per cent billionaires in dollar terms. If this is any solace to anybody, let there be solace. But it only indicates how the disparity is increasing.

Indirect taxes on consumer good items push the prices up. The exemption of direct taxes on the rich only enhances the liquidity resulting in consumption and, therefore, production of luxury items, while the people in the lower income bracket suffer for want of adequate supply in terms of food.

The RBI has been following an ineffective monetary policy in combating inflation. It is proved beyond reasonable doubt that in India fiddling with monetary interest rate does not have any impact on the hoarders and speculators. The visible culprits of the food price inflation are these fellows. But they don't operate with bank money. (Time-bell). I am concluding, Sir. Just one more minute. They

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

operate with liquidity money that they have and that leads to the situation. They are beyond the RBI.

I would like to say one thing at the end. The situation is very largely summed by the India Human Development Report, 2011. It states, "In India distribution of assets is extremely unequal with top five per cent household owning 33 per cent of the assets and the bottom 60 per cent owning only 13 per cent of the assets". Therefore, what is happening is this. I am just ending. Aren't we going against the ringing principle as embodied in the Preamble of the Constitution, justice, social, economic and political? One wonders whether the new policy of economic reforms is in a way indicates the article 39(c) of the Constitution which says that the operation of the economic system does not result in concentration of wealth and means of production to the common detriment".

Sir, the Government should take note of the fact that the policy package which benefits only a minuscule and causes distress to many is against the basic tenets on which our sovereign, socialist, secular, democratic republic is found. Thank you. (Ends)

(Followed by 2W)

NB/2W/3.55

श्री महेन्द्र मोहन (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, आज हम महंगाई पर जो चर्चा कर रहे हैं, इससे आम आदमी इतना त्रस्त है कि इस चर्चा के बाद क्या उस आदमी को कोई लाभ प्राप्त हो पाएगा, सरकारी नीतियों में कोई परिवर्तन होगा, सरकार उन्हें कुछ लाभ पहुंचाएगी या नहीं, इसका मुझे पता नहीं। मैं इतना ही कह सकता हूं कि जो स्थिति हो गई है, विगत चार-पांच वर्षों से जिस प्रकार से महंगाई भाग रही है, जिस प्रकार से खाने के सामान के दाम भाग रहे हैं - चाहे वह अनाज हो, चाहे वह दाल हो, सब्जियां हों, हर चीज के दाम बेतहाशा बढ़ते जा रहे हैं। इसके बहुत से कारण हैं। अभी हमारे वेंकैया जी ने तथा दूसरे साथियों ने सारी चीजें कहीं। यदि पेट्रोल का दाम बढ़ता है, तो ट्रांसपोर्टेशन की कॉस्ट बढ़ जाती है, यदि ट्रांसपोर्टेशन बढ़ता है, तो सब्जियों के दाम बढ़ जाते हैं, अनाज के दाम बढ़ जाते हैं, अन्य जो भी सामान बाजार में बिकते हैं, उनके दाम बढ़ जाते हैं और उसकी मार बेचारे उस आम आदमी को सहनी पड़ती है, जिसकी आय सीमित होती है। अभी हमारे सत्ता पक्ष की ओर से कहा गया कि वेतन आयोग की सिफारिशों के लागू होने के बाद सरकारी कर्मचारियों के वेतन बढ़ गए, उनकी purchasing power बढ़ गई। हमारे समाज में आमदनी बढ़ी है, purchasing power बढ़ रही है, इसके कारण दाम बढ़ रहे हैं, यह चीज सही प्रतीत नहीं होती है। यदि इससे लाभ होता भी है, तो वह लाभ एक विशेष वर्ग के लोगों को होता है, जो organised sector है, जो वेतन बढ़वा लेता है - चाहे सरकारी कर्मचारी हों

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

या ऐसे कर्मचारी हों, जिनका वेतन वेज बोर्ड के द्वारा बढ़ा दिया जाता है। इससे आम आदमी को कोई फायदा नहीं होता है और न ही इससे आम आदमी की आमदनी बढ़ती है। हमारे यहां आज भी वही मिनिमम वेजेज चल रही हैं, जो पहले निर्धारित हुई थीं, न जाने कब से मिनिमम वेजेज को रिवाइज़ नहीं किया गया है, जिससे एक आम आदमी की आय बढ़े और उसकी purchasing power बढ़े।

जहां तक दाम बढ़ने का प्रश्न है, डिमांड और सप्लाई का एक आर्थिक सिद्धांत है। अगर प्रोडक्शन नहीं होगा, सप्लाई नहीं होगी और डिमांड ज्यादा होगी, तो दाम बढ़ेंगे और उस ओर हमारा ध्यान बिल्कुल भी नहीं है। हमारे यहां बराबर प्रोडक्शन गिर रहा है और हम उससे परेशान हैं। प्रोडक्शन गिरने के अनेकों कारण हैं। बैंकों की ब्याज दरें बढ़ती हैं, उसके कारण जो प्रोडक्शन कॉस्ट बढ़ जाती है, उसका आम आदमी पर असर पड़ता है। इसी प्रकार जिस तरह से हमारा रुपया कमजोर होता जा रहा है, विगत चार वर्षों में रुपया 18 प्रतिशत गिर गया है और डॉलर के मुकाबले इसकी वैल्यू 52 से 45 रुपए हो गई है। इसके कारण पेट्रोल का जो इंपोर्ट हो रहा है, अन्य चीजों का इंपोर्ट हो रहा है, जिससे और चीजें बनाई जाती हैं, उन सबके दाम बढ़ रहे हैं और उनका भार उस आम आदमी पर पड़ रहा है, जिसके पास नियमित, बंधी हुई आमदनी है। इसी तरह हमारा जो किसान है, एग्रीकल्चरिस्ट है, जो रोज मेहनत कर रहा है, उसके खर्चों का भार बढ़ता चला जा रहा है, जब कि उसकी आमदनी के साधन

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

नहीं बढ़ रहे हैं। अभी हमारे पब्लिक डिस्ट्रीब्यूशन सिस्टम की चर्चा की गई कि इसमें कम दामों पर सामान मिल जाता है, लेकिन पब्लिक डिस्ट्रीब्यूशन सिस्टम से सामान चोरी होकर चोरबाजार में बिकता है। हमारा पब्लिक डिस्ट्रीब्यूशन सिस्टम बिल्कुल फेल हो गया है। इसे हम कैसे संभालें? इसके लिए बहुत जरूरी है कि सरकार इस ओर ध्यान दे कि इसको इंप्रूव किया जाए। हमारे यहां होर्डिंग बढ़ रही है, हमारे अनाज को चूहे खा रहे हैं, अनाज बरबाद हो रहा है, सड़ रहा है, लेकिन उस गरीब आदमी को अनाज नहीं मिल पा रहा है, जिसका उस पर हक है, जिससे कि वह स्वयं दो रोटी खा सके और अपने परिवार को भी खिला सके। मैं तो इतना ही कहना चाहूंगा कि सरकार को इन सारी चीजों की ओर ध्यान देना चाहिए कि किस प्रकार हमारा पब्लिक डिस्ट्रीब्यूशन ठीक हो, अच्छे रूप से हो। उसमें अगर प्रदेश की सरकारें अपना कार्य सही रूप से नहीं कर रही हैं, तो उनसे यह कार्य सही रूप से कराया जाए। इसके अलावा हमें यह भी देखना चाहिए कि कैसे हमारे देश में हर चीज का प्रोडक्शन बढ़े, जिससे डिमांड और सप्लाई का जो सिद्धांत है, उसके आधार पर काम हो सके। यदि चीज की उपलब्धता रहेगी, तो निश्चित रूप से जो भी कंज्यूमर है, जो भी खरीदार है, उसे कम दाम पर चीज मिलेगी और दाम कम होंगे। जब तक इन चीजों पर ध्यान नहीं दिया जाता है, तब तक निश्चित रूप से महंगाई की मार उस आदमी पर पड़ती रहेगी, जिसके पास हम पांच साल में केवल एक बार वोट मांगने के लिए जाते हैं। जब हम उससे वोट मांगते हैं, तो हम उससे बहुत कुछ कह देते हैं कि

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

हम तुम्हारे लिए बहुत कुछ करेंगे, हम आकाश से तारे तोड़कर ले आएंगे, लेकिन वोट मांगने के बाद जो लोग पांच सालों के लिए गद्दी पर बैठ जाते हैं, वे फिर उस आम आदमी को भूल जाते हैं और फिर उसी प्रकार से उस आम आदमी का शोषण होने लगता है। आज आम आदमी परेशान है, क्योंकि उसकी समस्याओं पर कोई विचार नहीं किया जा रहा है। इस महंगाई को रोकने के लिए कड़े से कड़े कदम उठाने चाहिए।

(2X/MP पर क्रमशः)

MP-RG/2X/4.00

उपसभाध्यक्ष (डा. ई.एम.सुदर्शन नाट्टीयप्पन) पीठासीन हुए

श्री महेन्द्र मोहन (क्रमागत) : जो hoarders हैं, उनके खिलाफ action लिया जाना चाहिए कि किस प्रकार से उनकी hoarding को रोका जाए। जो ज्यादा अनाज हमारे पास जमा है, Public Distribution System के माध्यम से या अन्यथा हमें उसको बंटवाना चाहिए, जिससे कि अनाज आम आदमी तक पहुंचे और वह कम से कम अपने पेट की भूख को तो मिटा सके। यदि इस प्रकार से महंगाई बढ़ती रही तो हमारे देश में अराजकता और बढ़ जाएगी, और परेशानियां बढ़ेंगी। उन सबको रोकने के लिए यह बहुत आवश्यक है कि हम उस चीज़ को देखें कि किस प्रकार से हम अपने रुपए की कीमत को भी मज़बूत करें। जब रुपया कमज़ोर होता है, तो अंतर्राष्ट्रीय स्तर पर भी भारत कमज़ोर हो जाता है। उस ओर भी हम देखें और उसके कारण इम्पोर्ट की गई चीज़ों के लिए,

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

जिसमें विशेष रूप से पेट्रोल तथा अन्य चीजें हैं, भारत सरकार अधिक पैसा देती है और उसका भार भी टैक्सों के माध्यम से और अन्य चीजों के माध्यम से आम आदमी के ऊपर ही पड़ता है। इस प्रकार से क्यों, किसको लाभ पहुंचाने के लिए रुपए के दाम गिराए जाते हैं, क्यों रुपए को कमजोर किया जाता है – ये सारी चीजें भी देखने की हैं। जहां तक आम आदमी की बात है, मैं यही कह सकता हूं कि हमारे देश में उस किसान का ख्याल किया जाए, उस मजदूर का ख्याल किया जाए जिसे एक निश्चित मजदूरी मिलती है और उसमें मिनिमम वेजेज को बढ़ाया जाए, जिससे उसकी मजदूरी बढ़े। उस किसान के यहां भी जो आदमी काम कर रहा है, उसके भी पैसे बढ़ें और इस प्रकार से उसकी परचेजिंग पावर भी बढ़े। हम केवल सरकारी तंत्र में बैठे हुए या organised sector में बैठे हुए लोगों के वेतनों को बढ़वा देते हैं, उससे ही हमारा हल नहीं निकलेगा और उससे यह कार्य पूरा नहीं होगा। अंत में डिमांड एंड सप्लाई को सही किया जाए कि किस तरीके से प्रोडक्शन को बढ़ाया जाए। इन शब्दों के साथ मेरा सरकार से अनुरोध है कि तुरंत कुछ ऐसे कदम उठाए जाएं जिनसे महंगाई कम हो और आम जनता को राहत पहुंचे, जिससे कि आम आदमी को खाने का सामान जैसे सब्जी, आटा, ये सारी चीजें तो कम से कम दामों में उपलब्ध कराई जा सकें। बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU): Sir, price rise is the most burning issue that is affecting all sections of the society, particularly, the poor and toiling people of our country. We had discussions on price rise twice in this House, and twice, the very same House passed the Resolution urging upon the Government to take adequate measures to contain inflation and to control prices. But I find the Government has completely failed in containing inflation and in controlling prices. What is the reason for this? I think the neoliberal policies and financial policies pursued by the Government are primarily responsible for this situation. Sir, the Committee to review the working of the monetary system, that is, the Chakravarty Committee, recommended, as a general guideline, an increase in prices of around four per cent. The Rangarajan Committee regarded six per cent of inflation to be the outer limit. The Tarapore Committee recommended three per cent level of inflation rate. Thus, the acceptable range of inflation rate in India lies between three and seven per cent. Now what is the inflation rate today? What are the prices of essential commodities and other items in the country today? And, here comes the question of policies of the last eleven months. The price of petrol has been increased by

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

32 per cent and vegetable prices have gone up by 28 per cent. The loan interest rates, particularly, in banks like the ICICI, have gone by 19.4 per cent. Electricity charges have gone up by 22.5 per cent. Now, there are proposals to privatise water. I do not know what is going to happen to the people of this country. This is that situation today. And the speaker from the Congress (I) Party here tried to defend the Government. But I must tell her that maternal and infant mortality rates in India are the highest in the world. What are the reasons for it? One is anaemia. The other is malnutrition.

(Continued by 2Y)

2y/4:05/ks

SHRI D. RAJA (contd.): People do not have access to food. They do not have the purchasing power, the money to buy essential commodities, particularly food. This is the situation in which we are living. The Government has promised to bring forward the Food Security Bill. The Food Security Bill that is available in the public domain is nothing but a food insecurity Bill. If you look at the provisions of the Bill, it is nothing but a food insecurity Bill. When it comes before the Parliament, we will, of course, deliberate upon it

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

and we will certainly try to change it and amend it. But there is a need to ensure right to food for the people of our country. Unless we ensure that right to food, we cannot ensure the right to live or the right to dignity. People should have a life of dignity, a life of decent living. That is absent today, particularly for the poor and the toiling masses. In such a situation, Sir, I must urge upon the Government to have some long-term and short-term perspectives of how to contain inflation, how to control the prices. Pranabda is sitting here. He is a very respected Finance Minister and a very senior Minister in this Government. We all respect him. We try to learn many things from him. He has a tremendous experience in Parliament. I remember he himself had remarked, "I do not have a magic wand". That is what Pranabda had said that he did not have a magic wand to contain inflation and to control the prices. I took it as the helplessness on the part of the Government. This Government, the UPA-II Government, the Congress-headed Government, is pleading helplessness before the market forces. That is what I find. Sir, I think the Government is Government. It has power in its hands. The Government can intervene in this situation. For instance, the Government went in for

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

decontrolling the fuel prices. In fact, one of the mass organisations of India, the All-India Youth Federation, went to the Supreme Court asking the Court to direct the Government to restore the Administered Price Mechanism and to direct the Government to give up decontrol and to restore the earlier system. The Supreme Court had said that this was in Parliament's domain and that the Court could not do anything in the matter. What I am trying to say is that decontrol of petrol or of diesel and LPG, as previous speakers have said, has led to frequent increase in the prices of fuel which has led to a cascading impact on the prices of all the essential commodities which needs to be addressed. That is why I think it is of no use to talk about the mismatch between the supply and demand. I honestly feel that it is a kind of mismanagement of our policies. On the one side, we find foodgrains rotting in godowns and we say that we do not have cold storages but, on the other side, you try to tell the people that it is a mismatch between the demand and supply. I do not buy that argument. But even if it is so, it is a kind of mismanagement. We should admit it honestly. There is a mismanagement of our policies. Otherwise, what is happening in the public distribution system? There

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

are some places, including Delhi and Karnataka, where we find cash transfers. People are asked to go and open bank accounts. They do not understand why they are being asked to open bank accounts. Then, they are told that if they have to buy food items or essential commodities, it is necessary. If the Government is contemplating to have this idea of cash transfers, then, I think it will have to reconsider it.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):

Please.

SHRI D. RAJA: I am finishing.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this is a burning issue. The entire country is looking up to Parliament. If we conclude it in just two hours or three hours, I don't think we will be able to do justice. Moreover, senior people from different parties, parliamentarians, should get adequate time. If it is not possible today, let it be tomorrow. There should not be any problem.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN : We will try to work it out.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Please, Sir.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): I can reply tomorrow. But please conclude it today because a lot of business is there.

(fd. by 2z/kgg)

2z/4.10/kgg

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, the cash transfer idea needs to be reconsidered. As a long-term policy measure, the Government will have to multiply the public investment in agriculture. Agriculture is one sector which continuously remained as a neglected one. Unless we address the issues related to agriculture, we may not be able to achieve any target that we are trying to fix. The Twelfth Five Year Plan, the inclusive growth, etc., will all remain on paper; nothing will happen unless we increase the productivity, unless we increase our investments in the agricultural and agrarian sector.

Then, as a short-term measure, I think, the Government will have to universalise public distribution system. The Government will have to seriously consider universalisation of the public distribution system. We discussed in the past also—the Government should make direct procurements from farmers; the Government should pay

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

remunerative prices to farmers; the Government should ban on-line trade or forward trade or future trade particularly in food items and essential commodities, on which many speakers have made comments. These are the measures which the Government can take with its power. The Government—particularly a person like Pranabda --should not plead that it has no magic wand. He knows the economy and our state of economy is very bad today. The rupee is depreciating; the unemployment is growing; the poverty is growing; the industrial production is declining; the manufacturing sector is showing a decline. We understand all these things. These are the problems not only with us but with other countries also. What is happening in the Wall Street is read by everybody. What is the Euro Zone Crisis in the E.U.? We all know. I find the Trinamool Congress, the DMK, which are a part of the Government, they are also critical of the situation, critical of the policies pursued by the Government. It makes the situation very glaring. So, the time has come when the Government will have to review its neo-liberal economic policies and try to go in for a mid-course correction.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

As far as price rise is concerned, the Government should address the question of strengthening the public distribution system. The Government should see how it can be universalised, how the Government can really reduce the tax component in the fuel prices.

I will end with the last point on fuel prices. Take petrol, for instance. If the price of one litre of petrol costs Rs.58.37, then the taxes are to the extent of Rs.26.93. The Central tax is Rs.17.20, the Customs duties are to the extent of Rs.2.42, the Excise duty is Rs.14.78. The Left Parties have been saying that there is a need for rationalisation of the duties on petrol and petroleum products. The Government can consider within its own power; that is what I am saying. The Government should be very realistic, very reasonable in addressing the price question. The prices are very high. I do not think the Congress party or those who are in Government think that the prices are okay. I do not think so. They are also concerned with the price rise. That is why the whole House is concerned with the price rise. That is why the House passed, two times, the Resolution asking the Government to take adequate measures. But, the Government is continuously failing. This failure will have to be acknowledged. At

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

least, at this point of time, the Government can contain inflation or control price rise. The Government should speak on this. Otherwise, the Government should speak on the problems of the Government—whether it is the question of governance or any programme. It must explain. This is what I tried to say, Sir. Thank you.

(Ends)

(Followed by tdb/3a)

TDB/3A/4.15

SHRI A.W. RABI BERNARD (TAMIL NADU): Hon. Vice-Chairman, Sir, it is my honour to be a Member of this august House of Parliament. I am grateful to you for giving me this opportunity to make my maiden speech. I salute the Indian Democracy which has given opportunity for people like me to come into this House and contribute to national development in my own small way.

Sir, first of all, I would like to express my profound sense of gratitude to my esteemed leader, the hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu, Madam J. Jayalalithaa. She has chosen me to this position. A significant manifestation of essential secularism, generosity, commitment and concern that each member of the party, each

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

member of the society is empowered and provided an opportunity in the task of nation building. It will be my constant endeavour, Sir, to live up to the political ideals of the founder of our party, Dr. Puratchi Thalaivar MGR, and his successful successor, Madam Jayalalithaa. I would like to give a solemn assurance that I will in my own modest way preserve the honour of this House. At this momentous period of my life, I pay my grateful respects to my parents, my teachers, my professors, my colleagues and countless friends. Tempting as it might be, I do not propose to mention in my maiden speech about the pervasive presence of scams and corruption the nation is witnessing for the past few years, the inhuman killing of Tamils in Sri Lanka. I may become very emotional when I mention, and when I think of the atrocities on the Tamils of Sri Lanka and Tamil fishermen in the waters of Indian Ocean. I may become more and more emotional, and I may not go directly to which I propose to speak today, which is on the topic of price-rise. Insinuations were made by a Member when he spoke. He wanted to provoke us, maybe; but we will not be provoked. We are aware that the nation is watching us. We are not here to make any political mileage. After a long time, the House is

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

discussing a very serious issue, and there is no place for insinuations and political mileage here.

While talking on the problem of poverty and price-rise in India, I do not want to reel out statistics in my speech. It is 4.15. Members may be tired and even bored. I am sure the Government of India has all the data. The Government of India is better equipped than me to measure qualitatively and quantitatively the impact of price-rise, particularly in the past four-five years on the vast majority of the Indian population. Even as per Government statistics, 70 per cent of our countrymen have to subsist on a measly per-capita income of Rs. 20 per day, but he is haunted by spiralling price-rise. Foodgrain prices are zooming; medical bills are mounting; even water has to be bought. Only polluted air is free. The situation of the poor is, indeed, desperate, and we cannot remain mute spectators.

(Contd. by 3b-cls)

KLS-3b-4.20

SHRI A.W. RABI BERNARD (CONTD): The primary reason for price rise and inflation are some of the major acts of this Government. One such reason is constant and regular increase of fuel prices. We are

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

one of the few countries where fuel is exorbitantly priced, taxed and sold. Recently, I had an opportunity to visit a couple of South East Asian nations. I studied in those countries and to my surprise after so many years, when I go back I do not find food prices very different from how they were when I was a student. I do not find price of fuel very different from what it was when I was a student long back. The price rise is a problem and this problem is due to inflation and the inflation is due to prices rise in fuel price and that is caused by this Government. The Government has to make a very serious attempt to reduce the fuel prices by reducing taxes on the petroleum crude. On the plea of helplessness, the Central Government should not be callous and do it channeling the so-called international problems to the hapless poor. Pro-poor action is called for. We should not forget that we are all here to be the voice of the voiceless, to lend a helping hand to the destitute poor of the country. I would just like to mention some of the impacts of poverty on the poor particularly the impact of high food prices on the poor. One, the nutrition status of pregnant and lactating women and the pre-school children is affected when the prices of foodgrains, vegetables and oil are hiked. Two, the health

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

status of women and children go down drastically. Three, there is an increase in child labour due to withdrawal of children from schools caused by lack of food at home, lack of income at home. Four, there will be a distress sale of productive assets. Whatever instruments of production a poor family may have will be sold to buy one day's meal. This will have a long-term invisible impact in our efforts towards eradication of poverty. Apart from reduction in food consumption, price rise causes the purchasing power to decline. The loss in purchasing power would affect buying of other goods and services which are essential for health, nutrition and education and to name a few, water, sanitation, lighting, medicines, etc. Let this Government not hide behind a mace of impressive numbers and graphs depicting rates of growth. I used to hear from our Ministers, officials of the Government talking very high about our growth rates but for the past couple of months, they are all keeping quiet for obvious reasons. Even you have failed in that. You have been promising us that there is huge growth coming; there is an oasis awaiting, travel some more. Like a dog running behind a pilgrim, we have been waiting for that oasis to come. Travelling to reach the oasis has also failed. So, you

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

have stopped talking about very impressive growth rates now. So, you do not have the privilege of talking about very high growth rate in your Government.

(Contd by 3Q/PK)

-KLS/PK/4.25/3C

SHRI A.W. RABI BERNARD (CONTD): Let the plight of the poor be the focal point of this Government's concern. I am reminded of the words of the late President Magsaysay of the Phillipines, the country which educated me, he said, "Those who have less in life should have more in law." Poverty, price rise are universal phenomenon. They may be. But, in India, Sir, it has a different colour. It is unique in India. Poverty is unique in India. Poverty is inherited in India. I would like to quote a few lines from a recent article in the Economic and Political weekly. The article is about how price rise, malnutrition and poverty have a colour of caste, region and religion in India. The article says, "It is clear that Muslim women seem to have a higher likelihood of being malnourished, followed by the women from the Scheduled Tribes, the Scheduled Castes and the OBCs, in this order. Thus, in the case of SCs, STs and Muslims, even after controlling of factors

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

such as income, educational level, access to health services etc., the malnutrition rates turn out to be high, indicating that there are constraints that are associated with their social and religious belongings. So, these are few lines which talk about the uniqueness of poverty, the uniqueness of inequality, the uniqueness of Indian price rise and Indian inflation. I urge the Government to take measures which are, specifically, oriented towards the poor, towards all poor and also towards those poor who are poorer among the poor, like the minorities, the Scheduled Tribes, the Scheduled Castes, the women and children. I am, once again reminding what Magsaysay said, "Those who have less in life should have more in law." In this context, permit me, Sir, to briefly mention some measures taken by our all-India Anna Dravida Munnetra Kazhagam Party's Government in Tamil Nadu, specifically, targeted to alleviate the sufferings of the poor. Mid-day Meal Scheme for the poor children was initiated by our respected leader Bharat Ratna, late Shri MGR and strengthened by our Chief Minister, Madam, Jayalalitha-- twenty kilos of free rice. Nowhere in the world is such a scheme there. I am a traveller and I have travelled to many countries. When we tell the people that our

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

Government, the Government of Tamil Nadu, gives 20 kilos of free rice to every family, for a population of eight-and-a-half crores, they say it is unheard of. 35 kilos of free rice per month are given for special categories of families. Then, distribution of four goats, a milching cow for landless rural poor families. There are many other such targeted measures. These measures protect the vast majority of people in Tamil Nadu from the impact of price rise and enhance their well being. Just two days ago, Sir, the amount of money allotted to the OBC, SC, ST students, who stay in Government hostels and Government-aided hostels, for their food and incidental expenses, has been substantially increased by our Madam Chief Minister, Jayalalitha. I believe that these schemes deserve to be replicated in other parts of the country.

(Contd. by 3D/SKC)

3d/skc/4.30

SHRI A.W. RABI BERNARD (contd.): Such welfare measures should receive adequate subsidy from the Central Government. Government of India should be forthcoming in appreciating these welfare measures and rise to the occasion.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

A recent survey conducted in Tamil Nadu and eight other States by Adhikari, Ankita Aggarwal, Megha Behl, Puja Balasubramanian, Balu and other research scholars and student volunteers is highly appreciative of the public distribution system adopted in Tamil Nadu. This survey was published in the economic and political weeklies recently. Madam *Amma* has virtually guaranteed food security for each member of the family in every family of Tamil Nadu. Hence, I request the Government of India to implement a universal public distribution system whereby all households are entitled to food subsidies unless they meet the well-defined exclusion criteria.

The Government should come forward to make special financial allocations to States like Tamil Nadu. The new Government in Tamil Nadu has inherited a lot of financial problems. I do not wish to go into details and create any disturbances while talking about the problems of the poor in the country. I would only like to say that the Government of India should come forward to help the State of Tamil Nadu which has inherited a lot of financial problems in the transport sector, in the power sector and in various other Government-run schemes.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

(THE VICE-CHAIRMAN, PROF. P.J. KURIEN, IN THE CHAIR)

We approached the Government of India on various occasions. Tamils all over the world and, particularly, Tamils in Tamil Nadu looked up to you and thought that you would come to our rescue, wipe away our tears and put an end to our cries, on various occasions. When millions of our Tamil brothers, with whom we share our DNA, were massacred and butchered, we looked up to you. You never listened to our cries. Our fishermen are constantly being killed, robbed and butchered in our own seas and we come to you, but you never listen to us. You talked in defence of those who attack us. At least, listen to these pleas. Provide a special allocation of financial assistance to a Government which was overwhelmingly elected by the people of Tamil Nadu, a Government which is tirelessly striving towards alleviating poverty, helping the poor. At least, listen to these pleas and help us to overcome the financial crisis.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please conclude.

SHRI A.W. RABI BERNARD: Sir, I am on the last point. I shall conclude.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

In the spiritual context, the Bible says, “Blessed are the poor for the Kingdom of God belongs to them”. In the context of a democracy like ours, I am constrained to say, as has been demonstrated in the recently held Tamil Nadu Assembly and Local Body elections, blessed are the poor for they have it in them to throw out a Government that works against their interests.

Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Thank you Mr. Bernard. That was your maiden speech. Hon. Members, we have to finish this discussion today. Therefore, everybody has to keep the time in mind. Now, Dr. Ashok Ganguly.

DR. ASHOK S. GANGULY (NOMINATED): Sir, I have the great fortune of having you in the Chair every time I speak! I do not wish to repeat anything here.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: I am not saying that to you, Dr. Ganguly. You are a person who always sticks to the time.

(fd. on 3e/ksk)

KSK/4.35/3E

DR. ASHOK S. GANGULY: I have nothing profound to say. My erudite predecessors have said everything that the hon. Finance Minister has to know and do, and, therefore, my speech is very simple. The issue is that I just want to touch upon two issues. One is the short-term issue and the other is the most systemic issue. Now, we have gone on saying that what is the supply-demand conundrum that we are facing. The point of the fact is that in spite of a record output of foodgrains, oilseeds, sugarcane, cotton, fruits, vegetables, prices are still going up. Therefore, there is a disconnect between output and demand. That is a reality. The fact that 20 per cent of foodgrains are being wasted is well known. And, there is no instant solution to that. We have been quarrelling on how to bring it down. In a particular district, it is 40 to 50 per cent. I do not wish to name the State. Fifty per cent of the potatoes were rotten on the field. This has been going on for the last 50 years and not enough warehouses could be built, or, cold storages could be built. Now, *rabi* production is going to be another record production. And, again, there is going to be wastage. But, because of anticipation of *rabi* production, already,

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

the inflationary pressures are being moderated. The inflation is coming down. We can criticise, we can do everything. There is a systemic issue that we cannot wish away. Now, I am not criticising or praising anybody, but we have to remember the fact.

But, in the long term, we face even a bigger crisis. Please, do not underestimate the crisis in Europe. 2008 will appear to be a very innocent year compared to what is going to happen this year and what is going to happen in the next 18 months. We will be affected. The United States' economy is still in doldrums. The European economy is in the disarray. Japan is going to take a very long time to recover. Our own currency is going down. Our stocks are being uncertain and our growth is under enormous stress and, therefore, please, do not look for short-term and instant solutions. Our resistance against both domestic and Foreign Direct Investment is a great calamity that we are bringing upon ourselves. Now, the obstructionist mindset about Foreign Direct Investment will further fuel inflation and it will depress growth. Let us acknowledge our own mistakes. Let us acknowledge and do something about it. We can have ideological and political differences. But, we cannot have any differences about what this

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

nation needs. The inflation is only one of the signals that we are getting about what is happening in this country. Let us awaken to the fact and let us listen to what hon. Finance Minister has to say about what are the measures that we need to take. It had all been coming out. We have disrupted this House from the very beginning of the Winter Session. We have wasted valuable time. There are number of Bills to be passed. Let us show the country that we are not going to accept the long-term impact on our economy by lying down. We are going to do something about it. We have to do it jointly. We cannot look at the left or right of the House. We have to look to the people of India.

I have always promised you that I will be brief. Mr. Vice-Chairman, I have taken less than the time allotted to me. I continue to maintain my record.

(Ends)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Thank you very much. You took less time and made very good points also in the short time. Now, Shri M.V. Mysura Reddy.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

SHRI M.V. MYSURA REDDY (ANDHRA PRADESH): Sir, for the first five years, that I have been a Member of this House, I think, it is the sixth discussion on price rise. Also, I have gone through lot of answers to lot of questions from the Members. The answers for the questions are the same. Actions are also same. The debate on those actions is also the same. I have analysed some points. Just now, the previous speaker mentioned about the supply and demand. This is the cause for the price rise. But, Sir, one thing I can bring to the notice of this House and also to the hon. Minister that in Andhra Pradesh, I analysed this thing that for the first five years, five lakh acres of agricultural land was converted to non-agricultural purposes in the name of indiscriminate land acquisition for the purposes of SEZ and infrastructure projects.

(continued by 3f – gsp)

GSP-4.40-3F

SHRI M. V. MYSURA REDDY (CONTD.): Sir, you know that the State of Andhra Pradesh is the granary of foodgrains. In such State, 5,00,000 acres of agricultural land in 5 years has been converted into non-agricultural land. If at all, has the Government taken any steps to

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

improve the efficiency of production or intensity of the cropping pattern? They did not take action. There has been no action for the development of infrastructure projects in the supply chain side to minimize the waste. Without these things, how will these actions stop the gap between the demand and supply? It is total failure of the Government policies, incoherent policies of various departments and they were unable to fulfill the gap between the demand and supply. It is the failure of the Government.

Regarding inflation, in the WPI, the gap is 14.3 per cent. In this 14.3 per cent, fruits, milk, vegetables and eggs are major components. If you analyze this, the farm gate price of these products and retail market prices, there is a large gap. In this, producer is not the beneficiary; consumer is not the beneficiary, and, only the middlemen are the beneficiaries. I will give you some figures. For example, in the case of egg, Rs. 2.83 per egg is the price fixed by the hatcheries. If you add transport, handling, packing and commission of thirty paisa, it comes to three rupee and some paisa. Now, in the open market, the price of egg is Rs. 3.75 to Rs. 4.00. Like that, tomato is priced at Rs. 7 to 8 per kg., while in the open

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

market, its price is Rs. 25 per kg. Similarly, the price of onion is Rs. 3.50 to Rs. 4.00 per kg., while in the open market, its price is Rs. 20 to Rs. 25. The price of *green mirchi* is Rs. 4-5 per kg., while in the open market, its price is Rs. 25/- per kg. In the case of low-fat milk, they are paying to the farmers, milk producers Rs. 16/- or something per litre, while, in the open market, they are charging Rs. 32 plus one rupee extra.

In this, only the middlemen are the beneficiary. The Government also knows that it is all the middlemen benefit because of hoarding and cartelling. Government also knows the cartelling and hoarding centers. Sir, in some report, I read that in respect of pulses, Akola and Mumbai are the centers for cartelling. Similarly, for *gur*, it is Maujapur Nagar; for pepper, it is Kochi; for chillies, it is Guntur-Nizambad; and, for groundnut oil, it is Bombay-Ahmedabad.

Sir, the Government might have taken action against these hoarders and cartellers. Without any action, the prices are also going up. I think, in some reply, it was mentioned by the Government side that there is a monitoring cell, which monitors 14 commodities from 18 centers, and, there is also a high-powered monitoring body to

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

regularly monitor the availability and the price, and, also to take appropriate measures including on exports-imports. And, these two bodies will review all this and report to the Cabinet Committee on Prices, and, also, to the Committee of Secretaries. Because there is a continuous price-rise, which is causing heartburn for the common man, I demand that the Government should come forward with details on actions taken by these bodies or committees to check the price-rise. Because of MSP, price stimulation is there. The MSP for only wheat and rice is protected by the Government. The remaining MSPs are there only for namesake, and, there is no control or protection for that.

(Contd. by sk-3g)

SK/3G/4.45

DR. M.V. MYSURA REDDY (Contd.): There is no protection to the MSP. How can this MSP stimulate the prices into the open market? It is because of this cartel and hoarding only that the prices are going up, which is not beneficial to the producer, which is not beneficial to the consumers, Sir.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

The last but not the least point is regarding the future trading. For future trading, there was Abhijit Sen Committee, of which, I think, Mr. Ganguly was also a member. They were unable to say yes or no whether future trading is influencing the prices or not. But, in 2009, regarding turmeric, if you see, the trading done was one crore thirty three lakh tons whereas delivery was only three thousand eight hundred metric tons only. That means, it is speculation; it is nothing but gambling. Because of inaction, ineffectiveness and incoherent policies of this Government, this price rise is there. They have to face the consequences for that. I demand the Government to take appropriate action to reduce the prices. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT (MAHARASHTRA): Thank you, Sir. This is the fourth time that I am speaking on price rise in my short term of three-and-a-half years so far. We keep on talking about price hike, and nothing is happening. But, since this is the House of deliberations, I wish to reiterate what I had to say in the past and I would be saying the same thing again in future, I suppose. I am not going to go into the blame game. I do not want to blame 'A' party, 'B'

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

party or 'C' party for whatever is happening. However, this is the time for introspection. Each stakeholder, who is responsible for the price hike, from within the House to outside the House, should do introspection and see why the prices are rising and finally they are affecting the much talked-about *Aam Aadmi* of the nation. Sir, I am not an economist; I am not an *Arthshastri*. However, whatever little I read and I come to know is that I keep chasing what is the tolerable limit for price rise. Sir, the committee appointed to review the monitoring system, the Chakravarty Committee, had regarded an increase in price of not more than four per cent as the limit. The Rangarajan Committee regarded six per cent of inflation to be the outer limit while the Tarapore Committee recommended three per cent as the level of inflation. So, is the acceptable range of inflation rate in India lies somewhere between three to seven per cent? We have crossed that upper limit of inflation and finally the last man of the society is affected. Why is it happening? There is no will to ride over the tide of price rise. It is not that the Government mechanism is not empowered or it is not so powerful that it cannot stop it. It is because there is no will in the Government and some vested interests, those

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

who are around the Government, do not want the prices to drop because that goes against their selfish interests. Sir, I have also read that rising prices adversely affect the economic condition of fixed income groups, particularly the wage-earners. When prices are high, the value of money is low and vice-versa.

(Contd. by 3h/ysr)

-SK/YSR-NB/4.50/3H

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT (CONTD.): There is always a lag between price rise and money wage adjustment. Poor people in the unorganised sector are hit the worst because their income is not linked to the price index. Their wages are not hiked as per the price index. They are the worst affected. However, the business firms gain during the price rise because the money value of goods of their stock keeps rising continuously. It is the business houses which are benefited by the price rise. Why does not the Government control them? Is the Government playing in the hands of business houses? Sir, I am not going into the details of it. I am not an *Arthashastr*i and I don't have much time at my disposal. How is it that in the current situation of crunch of price rise, the rich is becoming richer and the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

poor is becoming poorer? Yechuryji has mentioned that the gap between India and Bharat is widening day by day. India is becoming richer while the Bharat, which comprises the majority of people, is becoming poorer. Sir, here the Government has to come in the picture. The Government cannot be a silent spectator by saying that it is not a party to it. This is free trade. हमारी कुछ जिम्मेदारी नहीं है। You cannot say that. The Government has to come in the picture and stop this. That gap should be bridged. I wonder when there is price rise and people are harassed how I see advertisements of new models of luxury cars every day. Every day new cars are coming out. There is a slash in the prices of cars. Prices of high luxury items are slashed. Prices of air conditioners are coming down. On the other hand, the prices of commodities, which are used by the common man, are increasing. Earlier we used to say, and Yechuryji also said this, मुट्टी भर पैसा लेकर जाते थे और बोरी भरकर सामान लाते थे, लेकिन आज बोरी भरकर पैसा लेकर जाते हैं, लेकिन मुट्टी भर सामान भी नहीं मिलता है। Why is it happening? Why is the common man adversely affected? If the Government talks of *aam aadmi*, why cannot it control prices of cars? If I have to go for a loan of Rs. one crore for my house, I get huge

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

subsidy on interest. Banker comes to me and gives me loan. I keep getting SMSs that loan is granted to me. No questions are asked. But when the common man goes for an amount of Rs.10,000 for his seeds, he is asked ten questions and he is shooed away. This gap has to be bridged. And if at all we don't have to speak again on the same issue, I think the Government has to awaken now and then I am sure this issue can be sorted out. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

श्री गंगा चरण (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, पहले तो मैं माननीय वित्त मंत्री, श्री प्रणब मुखर्जी का आभार व्यक्त करता हूँ कि संसद का जो गतिरोध था, 15 दिनों के बाद इन्होंने विपक्ष से वार्ता करके उस गतिरोध को समाप्त किया। यह गतिरोध पहले भी समाप्त किया जा सकता था, लेकिन सरकार अपनी जिद पर अड़ी रही और सरकार की जिद के कारण संसद के बहुमूल्य 15 दिन बरबाद हुए। माननीय प्रणब मुखर्जी बहुत ही सीनियर नेता हैं और वे राजनीति में प्रधान मंत्री जी से भी सीनियर हैं।

(3J/MP पर क्रमशः)

MP/3J/4.55

श्री गंगा चरण (क्रमागत) : लेकिन संसद के जो 15 दिन बरबाद हुए और मीडिया के द्वारा जिस तरह संसद की गरिमा को घटाया गया कि जनता की गाढ़ी कमाई के 15 करोड़ रुपए सांसदों ने बरबाद किए, इससे अकेले सत्ता पक्ष की छवि खराब नहीं हुई बल्कि विपक्ष की छवि भी खराब हुई। बहुत छोटी-छोटी बातों पर हम लोग अड़ जाते हैं, सत्ता पक्ष भी अड़ जाता है। जब विपक्षी नेताओं ने महंगाई को लेकर Adjournment Motion दिया, हमारे नेता माननीय सतीश चन्द्र मिश्रा जी ने हमारी राष्ट्रीय अध्यक्षा बहन कुमारी मायावती जी के निर्देश पर 167 के तहत नोटिस दिया कि इस नियम के अंतर्गत महंगाई पर चर्चा होनी चाहिए, तो सरकार ने हमारी उस मांग को स्वीकार नहीं किया और संसद में गतिरोध हुआ।

उसके बाद सरकार ने एफ.डी.आई. का मुद्दा उछाल दिया, महंगाई को लोग भूल गए। एफ.डी.आई. देश के लिए उससे भी भयंकर मुद्दा था। विपक्ष से कोई वार्ता नहीं हुई, सहमति नहीं हुई और एफ.डी.आई. को कैबिनेट ने परमिशन दे दी। महोदय, लोकतंत्र आम सहमति से चलता है, बहुमत से नहीं। आखिरकार आपने विपक्ष की उस मांग को स्वीकार किया क्योंकि जब आपने देखा कि देश की जनता ही नहीं, आपकी पार्टी के भी कुछ लोग सड़कों पर उतर आए, जिन स्टेट्स में आपकी गवर्नमेंट थी, उन लोगों ने भी विरोध किया, पूरा देश सड़कों पर उतरकर एफ.डी.आई. का विरोध करने लगा, तब आपने कहा कि हम इस पर आम सहमति बनाएंगे। यह किसी की हार या जीत नहीं है, यह

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

लोकतंत्र की जीत है, देश की जनता की जीत है। मैं सिर्फ इतना कहना चाहता हूँ कि जिस तरह आज संसदीय परम्पराओं का उल्लंघन हो रहा है और नेताओं व संसद की छवि जनता की निगाहों में दिन-प्रतिदिन गिरती जा रही है, हम सब लोगों को बैठकर इस पर चिन्तन करना चाहिए। सत्ता पक्ष हो या विपक्ष, हम सब लोग देश की तरक्की के लिए हैं। कभी आप सत्ता में होते हैं, कभी थर्ड फ्रंट सत्ता में होता है, कभी बी.जे.पी. सत्ता में होती है, लेकिन हैं तो हम सब लोग देश के लिए। आखिर हम इन सब विषयों पर एक बंद कमरे में बैठकर पहले आम राय क्यों नहीं बनाते? यदि हम मांग कर रहे थे कि इस पर वोटिंग होनी चाहिए तो आपको सत्ता का इतना मोह क्यों था कि हमारी सरकार गिर जाएगी? गिर जाने देते, चर्चा कराते। सत्ता में तो आना-जाना लगा रहता है, किसी ने कोई पट्टा थोड़े ही करा लिया है! लेकिन जो आम जनता है... मेरे elder brother ने मुझे फोन किया और कहा कि संसद में क्या हो रहा है? उन्होंने कहा कि लोक सभा तो “हुल्लड़ सभा” हो गई है। आज हम जिस तरह देश की जनता की निगाहों में गिरते जा रहे हैं, यदि हमने उस पर चिन्तन नहीं किया, उस पर विचार नहीं किया, सत्ता के मोह में जकड़े रहे, तो आने वाले दिनों में लोकतंत्र की जो फ़ज़ीहत होगी, नेताओं की जो फ़ज़ीहत हो रही है, वह किसी से छिपी नहीं है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मैं ज्यादा समय नहीं लेना चाहता हूँ। महंगाई पर चर्चा कई बार हो चुकी है। उस चर्चा का क्या अर्थ है? सरकार कोई decision नहीं लेती है, कोई ऐक्शन नहीं लेती है, बिचौलियों के खिलाफ कोई कार्रवाई नहीं

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

करती है। सारे विपक्ष के विद्वान लोग अपनी-अपनी राय देते हैं कि बिचौलियों के खिलाफ कार्रवाई होनी चाहिए। जो चीज़ खेत में पैदा होती है, आज आलू दो रुपए किलो बिक रहा है, लेकिन वह दिल्ली में आज भी बीस रुपए किलो बिक रहा है। आखिर क्यों? आज उत्तर प्रदेश में जो फर्रुखाबाद, एटा, मैनपुरी का इलाका है, वहां आलू सड़कों पर सड़ रहा है, लोग शीतगृहों में उसको रख नहीं रहे हैं और दिल्ली में उसका दाम कम क्यों नहीं हो रहा है? आखिर कौन से वे बिचौलिए हैं, किनके माध्यम से वह दिल्ली तक आता है और दाम कम क्यों नहीं हो रहे हैं? आम जनता को आलू सस्ता क्यों नहीं मिल रहा है? आप उनके खिलाफ कार्रवाई क्यों नहीं कर रहे हैं?

(3K/SC-KS पर क्रमशः)

-MP/SC-KR/3K/5.00

श्री गंगा चरण (क्रमागत) : इन कारणों का जब तक जवाब नहीं देंगे, इन पर ऐक्शन नहीं लिया जाएगा, तब तक ऐसी चर्चाओं से कोई फायदा नहीं होगा। हम लोगों के अच्छे-अच्छे भाषण हो जाएं, आप उत्तर में आंकड़े पेश कर दें..(व्यवधान)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF.P.J. KURIEN): Mr Ganga Charan, one second. I hope the House will agree to extend the time and conclude the discussion.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: How many Members are there?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Five Members.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: No problem.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: No problem.

श्री गंगा चरण : माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी, इस बार इस संबंध में ठोस कार्यवाही होनी चाहिए, नहीं तो जनता की निगाहों में इस चर्चा का कोई अर्थ नहीं रह जाएगा। आप उन बिचौलियों के खिलाफ कार्यवाही करिए, उनको बंद करिए, उन्हें एनएसए में बंद करिए, वे राष्ट्रद्रोही हैं। आज किसान जो उत्पादन करता है, उसके उत्पादन का जो मूल्य है, वह बढ़ता जा रहा है, डीज़ल के दाम बढ़ गए, पेट्रोल के दाम बढ़ गए, आपने यूरिया के दाम दुगुने कर दिए, डीएपी के दाम दुगुने कर दिए, लेबर चार्ज दुगुना हो गया, लेकिन कृषि उत्पादन का दाम दस साल पहले जो था, आज भी वही है। आज मेरे गांव में छोटे बाजारों में गेहूं साढ़े नौ रुपए किलो बिक रहा है, लेकिन दिल्ली में आज भी गेहूं 15 रुपए किलो है। किसान का क्या हाल होगा? किसान की चीजों का दाम जब यहां दिल्ली में बढ़ता है तो कहते हैं कि महंगाई बढ़ गयी है। जब दाल के दाम बढ़ते हैं, गेहूं के दाम बढ़ते हैं, टमाटर के दाम बढ़ते हैं, सब्जियों के दाम बढ़ते हैं तो हाय तौबा हो जाती है, लेकिन जब डीज़ल का दाम बढ़ता है, डीएपी का दाम बढ़ता है, यूरिया का दाम बढ़ता है - वह दुगुना हो गया, आपने सब्सिडी समाप्त कर दी - उस पर हाय तौबा नहीं हो रही है। इसीलिए किसान आत्महत्या कर रहे हैं। एक कहावत सी हो गयी है कि "कांग्रेस आयी और महंगाई लाई।" ऐसा क्यों होता है? अभी

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

टीवी पर डिस्कशन चल रही थी। वरिष्ठ पत्रकार कह रहे थे कि आखिर कारण क्या है कि जब कांग्रेस आती है, तभी महंगाई आती है? जब थर्ड फ्रंट की गवर्नमेंट आती है, एनडीए की गवर्नमेंट आती है तो महंगाई कम क्यों हो जाती है? ये आंकड़े सबके पास हैं। हमारा मीडिया भी जानता है। आखिर कारण क्या है? क्या आपकी उन बिचौलियों से कोई सांठ-गांठ है? आपको उत्तर देना पड़ेगा। महोदय, महंगाई से सभी लोग पीड़ित हैं। आज दिल्ली में रहने वाला वह व्यक्ति, जिसके दो बच्चे हैं और जो तीस हजार रुपए तनखाह पाता है - चाहे प्राइवेट सेक्टर में हो या गवर्नमेंट सेक्टर में हो - वह अपने परिवार का भरण-पोषण नहीं कर सकता, न वह उन्हें अच्छे स्कूल में पढ़ाई करा सकता है, न अच्छा भोजन करा सकता है, न अच्छे कपड़े पहना सकता है और न ही अच्छे घर में रह सकता है। महोदय, ऐसी हालत में उन लोगों का क्या हाल होगा, जिनकी आमदनी प्रतिदिन 29 रुपए 50 पैसे है, जिनकी आबादी देश में 44 परसेंट है, जो बीपीएल कार्डधारक हैं, वे बेचारे अपना जीवन कैसे गुजार रहे होंगे? जरा सोचिए कि उनके बच्चों का पेट कैसे भर रहा होगा? उनका चूल्हा कैसे जल रहा होगा? इस पर जरा विचार करिए। आप कहते हैं कि देश बहुत तरक्की पर जा रहा है, इसलिए महंगाई बढ़ रही है। मैं उस तरक्की के आंकड़े जानना चाहता हूँ। आपने कहा कि 29 रुपए 50 पैसे पर जीवनयापन करने वालों की संख्या 44 परसेंट है। आज 29 रुपए में किसी के घर का चूल्हा नहीं जल सकता है। पति-पत्नी भी हों, तो भी नहीं जल सकता है। सौ रुपए भी हों, तो भी वह केवल नमक

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

रोटी, प्याज की तो छोड़ दीजिए, प्याज तो अब बहुत महंगा हो गया है, से गुजारा कर सकता है। यदि एवरेज इन्कम सौ रुपए मान लें तो ऐसे लोगों की संख्या 77 परसेंट हो जाएगी - यह आपके आंकड़े बताते हैं। देश में गरीबों की संख्या 77 परसेंट है। महोदय, अभी हिन्दुस्तान टाइम्स में एक आंकड़ा छपा था कि देश के आठ हजार लोगों के पास देश की दो-तिहाई सम्पत्ति है। अगर आठ हजार लोगों के पास देश की दो-तिहाई सम्पत्ति है और बाकी लोगों के पास एक-तिहाई सम्पत्ति है, तो आप किसका नेतृत्व कर रहे हैं?

(3एल-एमसीएम पर क्रमशः)

MCM-MKS/3L/5-05

श्री गंगा चरण (क्रमागत) : कांग्रेस पार्टी किस की तरक्की की बात कर रही है उन आठ हजार लोगों की? क्या वे आठ हजार मुट्टी भर लोग देश का संचालन करेंगे? उनकी तरक्की को देश की तरक्की माना जाएगा? मैं गांव का रहने वाला हूं, मेरे भाई, मेरे परिवार के लोग आज भी खेती करते हैं और मैं भी खेत पर जाता हूं। आज गांव की हालत पहले से बदतर हो गई है और इतनी बदतर हो गई है कि अगर उनके घर चार मेहमान, अतिथि आ जाएं तो गांव वालों को उनका भोजन कराना मुश्किल हो जाता है। जब हम जाते हैं तो वहां किसान हमसे पूछता है कि आखिर आप सांसद लोग क्या करते हो? यूरिया का दाम दोगुना हो गया, डी0ए0पी0 का दाम दोगुना हो गया और आपने कहा कि हम नई उर्वरक नीति ला रहे हैं जिससे किसानों को फायदा पहुंचाएंगे तथा अनुदान का

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

पैसा डायरेक्ट किसान की जेब में पहुंचाएंगे, वह आपकी नीति कहां चली गई? आपने इस बार किसानों को यूरिया और डी0ए0पी0 की शॉर्ट सप्लाई की और खास तौर से उत्तर प्रदेश में। वहां हमारी सरकार को बदनाम करने के लिए आधी सप्लाई दी। आपको यह नहीं लगा कि हम राजनीति कर रहे हैं, इस राजनीति का हश्र क्या होगा? कृषि उत्पादों का उत्पादन कम होगा तो महंगाई और बढ़ेगी तथा किसान आत्म हत्या करेंगे। आप सिर्फ राजनीति उत्तर प्रदेश की सरकार को बदनाम करने के लिए कर रहे हैं। आप क्या समझते हैं कि किसान मूर्ख है और क्या वह जानता नहीं है कि यूरिया कहां से आता है, डी0ए0पी0 कहां से आता है। मेरा कहना है कि राजनीति का स्तर इतना नीचे नहीं गिरना चाहिए। यदि हम राजनीति के स्तर को इतने नीचे गिराएंगे और जहां हमारी गैर कांग्रेसी सरकारें हैं, उनका हम आबंटन आधा कर देंगे, चाहे बिजली का हो, चाहे खाद का हो, चाहे पानी का हो, चाहे और सब्सिडी का हो, चाहे मनरेगा का हो, चाहे प्रधान मंत्री सड़क योजना का हो, तो यह ठीक नहीं है। ये तमाम ऐसी योजनाएं हैं जिनमें उत्तर प्रदेश को ग्रांट नहीं दी जा रही है। कह रहे थे बुंदेलखंड का स्पेशल पैकेज 7400 करोड़ है। केवल 860 करोड़ दिया है, जब मैंने इस पर सवाल किया था। यह कितना बड़ा असत्य है। अभी मोंटेक सिंह अहलुवालिया जी हमारे बुंदेलखंड में आए थे, झांसी में मीटिंग थी। हम दोबारा किस्त मांग रहे हैं कि बुंदेलखंड पैकेज की किस्त दो, तो नहीं दे रहे हैं। राजनीति में आलोचना-प्रत्यालोचना होनी चाहिए लेकिन देश की गरीब जनता का नुकसान करके नहीं

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

होनी चाहिए। आज हम इस स्तर पर उतर आए हैं कि हम उस किसान का, उस गरीब मजदूर का हक छीन रहे हैं कि दूसरी जो पार्टी की सरकार है वह बदनाम हो जाए और हम वहां स्थापित हो जाएं। मीडिया के माध्यम से, अखबारों के माध्यम से लोगों में इतनी चेतना आ गई है, लोग सब समझने लगे हैं कि आप क्या कर रहे हैं। उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, इनको समझाइए कि कांग्रेस की जो परम्पराएं रही हैं, कांग्रेस ने आजादी की लड़ाई मूल्यों और परम्पराओं को लेकर लड़ी है। आजादी के देशभक्त मतवालों की कांग्रेस पार्टी रही है। लेकिन अब वह कांग्रेस पुरानी कांग्रेस नहीं रही। जिस समय पंडित जवाहर लाल नेहरू और इंदिरा गांधी जी थीं, वे विपक्ष से राय मशविरा करते थे और उन्ही की सरकारों ने ही इतने सालों तक राज किया है। जो सत्ता पक्ष विपक्ष से राय मशविरा करके नहीं चलेगा वह ज्यादा दिन तक राज कायम नहीं रख पाता है। तमाम उदाहरण ऐसे आए, सी0वी0सी के मामले पर विपक्ष ने ऑब्जेक्शन उठाया, आपने नहीं माना। इससे आपकी छिछालेदार हुई।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो0 पी0जे0 कुरियन) : कन्कलूड कीजिए।

श्री गंगा चरण : 2जी स्पेक्ट्रम का मामला विपक्ष ने उछाला, आपने विपक्ष की मांग नहीं मानी, उसमें भी आपको मात खानी पड़ी।

उपसभाध्यक्ष : प्लीज कन्कलूड कीजिए, आपने चार मिनट ज्यादा ले लिए। आपके 11 मिनट थे, लेकिन 15 मिनट ले लिए हैं।

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

श्री गंगा चरण : मैं सिर्फ सजेशन देना चाहता हूँ कि जो एम0सी0एक्स0 है, जो बिचौलिए हैं, इस वायदा कारोबारी को समाप्त किया जाए। मैं ही नहीं, विपक्ष के सभी सांसदों ने लोक सभा और राज्य सभा के सभी सांसदों ने कहा है कि जो महंगाई बढ़ रही है वह वायदा कारोबार के कारण बढ़ रही है। जिस दिन आप वायदा कारोबार पर अंकुश लगा देंगे तो महंगाई पर अंकुश लग जाएगा। मेरा दूसरा कहना है कि आप किसानों का जरा ध्यान करिए। आप जो मनरेगा में पैसा दे रहे हैं, मेरा सजेशन है कि यह एक लाख करोड़ सीधा किसानों की जेब में पहुंचा दीजिए, इससे किसान उनसे अपने खेत में काम कराए, जिससे मजदूरी किसान को देनी पड़े।

(3m/gs पर क्रमशः)

TMV-GS/3M/5.10

श्री गंगा चरण (क्रमागत) : सीधे किसान के खाते में एक लाख करोड़ पहुंचा दीजिए, न प्रधान रहे, न बीडीओ रहे, न सीडीओ रहे। जिस दिन एक लाख करोड़ किसान की जेब में पहुंच जाएगा, उस दिन किसान के जीवन में कुछ बदलाव आएगा। मैं किसान हूँ इसलिए मैं किसान का दर्द जानता हूँ। जब मैं क्षेत्र में जाता हूँ, तो किसान झगड़ा करते हैं कि आपको हमने संसद में भेजा है, आपको राज्य सभा में भेजा है, आप वहां किसलिए गए हैं ? आप वहां ऐशो-आराम करने के लिए गए हैं ? हम गांव की बदहाली को देखकर उनको जबाब नहीं दे पाते हैं।

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): Yes, please conclude.

श्री गंगा चरण : किसान आत्महत्याएं कर रहे हैं, खासकर के बुंदेलखंड में।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN : Yes, please conclude.

श्री गंगा चरण : आज मजदूरी 50 रुपये से 150 रुपये हो गई है, लेकिन किसान के उत्पादन का दाम नहीं बढ़ रहा है। उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मैं एक बात और कहना चाहता हूं।

उपसभाध्यक्ष : जल्दी खत्म कीजिए।

श्री गंगा चरण : जी । भ्रष्टाचार भी महंगाई का बहुत बड़ा कारण है। देश में चारों ओर आंदोलन चल रहा है। अन्ना हजारे ने आंदोलन किया, आपने उसे दबाने की कोशिश की। आप जन आंदोलन को मत दबाइए। आप भी इस जन आंदोलन से पैदा हुए हैं। एक लड़ाई छिड़ गई कि जनता बड़ी है या संसद बड़ी है। ..(समय की घंटी)... हम जनता के सेवक हैं। हम कभी जनता से बड़े नहीं हो सकते हैं। यह संसद जनता के लिए है, न कि जनता संसद के लिए है। यह सही है कि उसकी गलतियों से कुछ गलत लोग चुनकर आ गए हैं। लेकिन हम सेवक हैं और जनता मालिक है। अगर हम अच्छा काम नहीं करते हैं और मालिक हमें कुछ भला-बुरा भी कह देता है, तो हमें बर्दाश्त करना चाहिए न कि उसके खिलाफ हम प्रिविलेज मोशन लाएं। हमें बर्दाश्त करना चाहिए। अन्ना हजारे के आंदोलन को हमें गंभीरता से लेना चाहिए। यह अन्ना हजारे का आंदोलन नहीं है, यह आम जनता का आंदोलन है। आज मैं टी0वी0 पर देख रहा था कि उज्जैन में

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

लोकायुक्त ने छापा मारा, नगर निगम के एक कर्मचारी, चपरासी के पास तीन करोड़ रुपये की सम्पत्ति मिली है। अब अन्ना हजारे कहते हैं कि “सी” ग्रेड के कर्मचारियों को लोकपाल में शामिल करो।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): Okay, please. Now, please conclude. आप खत्म करो। बस हो गया।

श्री गंगा चरण : सर, मेरा कहना है कि महंगाई में भ्रष्टाचार भी मुद्दा है और अगर भ्रष्टाचार पर अंकुश नहीं लगेगा, तो महंगाई दूर नहीं होगी। इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ, मैं अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूँ। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

श्रीमती माया सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश): माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, हम जनता की आवाज को, उसकी पीड़ा को, वोट के माध्यम से इस सदन में रखना चाहते थे, चर्चा करना चाहते थे, लेकिन सरकार ने उसकी अनुमति नहीं दी। मुझे समझ नहीं आता कि वोट से जीतकर सरकारें बनती हैं, लेकिन सदन के अंदर वोट से सरकार डरने लग जाए तो वह भी लोकतंत्र के साथ मज़ाक है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, आज देश की सबसे बड़ी चौपाल में आम जनता की सबसे बड़ी आम समस्या पर चर्चा हो रही है। जिस समस्या के लिए सीधे तौर पर अगर कोई जिम्मेदार है तो वह यूपीए की सरकार है। बड़ी हुई कीमतों का सबसे ज्यादा असर आम आदमी पर पड़ा है, जिसका नाम ले-लेकर यूपीए ने चुनावों में वोट मांगे और आज यहां सत्ता में बैठी है। यूपीए सरकार आम आदमी के बारे में

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

अपनी चिंता तो जाहिर करती है, लेकिन इसकी सारी नीतियां और फैसले आम आदमी के रोजगार और उसके जीवन यापन को चौपट करने वाले हैं। इस सरकार की आर्थिक नीतियां गरीबों को आहत करने वाली हैं और अमीरों को फायदा पहुंचाने वाली हैं। अगर इसी तरीके की नीतियां यूपीए सरकार की रहीं जिसमें कुछ लोगों को कमाई करने का नहीं, बल्कि लूट का लाइसेंस दिया हो, तो देश में गरीबों और भूखों की संख्या और बढ़ेगी। अभी मेरे से पूर्व जो सम्मानीय सांसद बोल रहे थे, वे बुंदेलखंड से आते हैं, मैं मध्य प्रदेश की हूँ और बुंदेलखंड का आधा हिस्सा मध्य प्रदेश में आता है। वहां की सभ्यता और संस्कृति की विरासत को देखा और समझा जाता है। वहां पर गांवों में छोटी-छोटी चौपालें लगती हैं और उन चौपालों में आला और ऊदल की वीरता के वीर रस के गीत गाए जाते हैं।

(3एन/ऐकेजी पर जारी)

AKG/3N/5.15

श्रीमती माया सिंह (क्रमागत) : उनको सुनकर लोग जोश में भर उठते हैं, लेकिन आज इस महँगाई ने उस वीर रस की तान को तोड़ दिया है और उस वीर रस की जगह रौद्र रस ने ले ली है। अब वहाँ पर चौपालों में “महँगाई डायन खाए जात है” और इससे संबंधित ऐसे अनेक गीत प्रचलित हो गए हैं और वे गाए जाते हैं। मैं कहना चाहती हूँ कि पिछले दो-तीन वर्षों से खाद्य पदार्थों, पेट्रोल और यहाँ तक कि घरेलू गैस की कीमतों में बार-बार इजाफा होने से इस महँगाई का दबाव

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

अगर सबसे ज्यादा किसी के ऊपर पड़ा है, तो वह गृहणियों के ऊपर पड़ा है। आज गृहणियों के घर का बजट बिगड़ गया है। यहाँ तक देखिए कि उनको समझ नहीं आता है कि वे अपने परिवार को किस तरीके से चलाएँ, बच्चों के भोजन में किस-किस चीज की कटौती करें। आज दूध का क्या भाव है? आज दाल, सब्जियाँ, फल तो सपने की बात हो गई है। यह बात बिल्कुल सही है कि गरीबों की रोटी छिन गई है। हर वर्ग की गृहणी के घर का बजट बिगड़ गया है। यहाँ तक कि किसान, मजदूर या कर्मचारी, ये सब इस बात को लेकर परेशान हैं कि यह एक अर्थशास्त्री की कैसी संवेदनहीन सरकार है कि जहाँ पर खाने के लाले पड़े हैं! इसके साथ-ही-साथ गृहणियों के साथ यह होता है कि, प्रणब दा यहाँ बैठे हुए हैं, घर की महिला सबसे पहले अपने परिवार के सदस्यों का, बड़े-बुजुर्गों का, बच्चों का पेट भरती है, उसके बाद स्वयं खाती है। आज देखिए, तो पूरे देश के अंदर कुपोषित माताएँ, गर्भवती कुपोषित महिलाएँ और कुपोषित बच्चे करोड़ों की संख्या में हैं। विभिन्न देशी और विदेशी संगठनों द्वारा हाल के दिनों में बड़े कुपोषण पर जो आँकड़े जारी किए गए हैं, वे महँगाई के ही अनेक दुष्प्रभावों का चित्र सबके सामने बयान करते हैं।

महोदय, इसी तरीके से मैं कहना चाहूँगी कि योजना आयोग ने 32 रुपए और 26 रुपए रोजाना पर गुजर-बसर करने वाले लोगों को गरीब न मानने का जो हलफ़नामा दिया, उसको देख कर तो लोग आठ-आठ आँसू रोने लगे। मेरी पार्टी के सीनियर लीडर ने यहाँ सदन में जो भाव की तालिका प्रस्तुत की, जिसमें

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

उन्होंने बताया कि 80 रुपए से लेकर 100 रुपए के भाव से दालें बिकती हैं, तो आप अंदाज लगाइए कि 26 रुपए वाला और 32 रुपए वाला कैसे अपनी घर-गृहस्थी चलाएगा! इसलिए मेरा यह कहना है कि फ्रांस की जो क्रांति हुई थी, वह क्रांति ब्रेड के टुकड़ों से शुरू हुई थी। हमें उस चीज को भूलना नहीं है, उसको ध्यान में रखना है। जनता सरकार से महँगाई रोकने के एक सार्थक प्रयास की अपेक्षा रखती है, लेकिन सरकार प्रयास की बजाए कयास लगा कर खानापूर्ति कर देती है। इसके साथ-ही-साथ यह कहा जाता है कि महँगाई अगले तीन महीनों में कम हो जाएगी या महँगाई का प्रभाव अभी वैश्विक प्रभाव के चलते है, अगले साल हालत सुधरेगी। जैसे इनके अतीत के बयान हैं, अगर उनको देखें, तो मुझे समझ आता है कि न तो वह साल आएगा, न मुझे वह महँगाई कम होती नजर आती है। महोदय, मैं आपसे कहना चाहती हूँ कि इसके साथ-ही-साथ अगर मैं इनके पिछले बयानों को देखती हूँ, तो उन बयानों में ये लोग अपना चेहरा छुपाने के लिए कह देते हैं कि हम क्या करें, हमारे पास कोई जादू की छड़ी नहीं है। जो पिछले बयान दिए गए थे, मैं अपने वित्त मंत्री महोदय को याद दिलाना चाहती हूँ। यह भी कहा गया था कि लोगों के पास पैसा ज्यादा आ गया है, इसलिए महँगाई बढ़ रही है। महोदय, मैं यह कहना चाहती हूँ कि निश्चित तौर पर इस देश में लोगों के पास पैसा ज्यादा हो गया है, इसमें कोई दो राय नहीं है, लेकिन इस देश की गरीब और लाचार जनता के पास पैसा नहीं है,

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

बल्कि इस सरकार के शासन काल में अभूतपूर्व भ्रष्टाचार से सम्पोषित हुए लोगों के पास भ्रष्टाचार का, करप्शन का, काले धन का पैसा इकट्ठा हुआ है।

(3ओ/एससीएच पर जारी)

SCH/5.20/30

श्रीमती माया सिंह (क्रमागत): मैं आपसे कहना चाहूंगी कि आज हालात यह है कि जनवरी 2010 से ही मुद्रास्फीति की दर दहाई अंक के करीब बनी हुई है। तेल कंपनियों ने पेट्रोल के दाम अनवरत बढ़ाए हैं। सम्पूर्ण विपक्ष ने जब यूपीए सरकार से यह कहा कि आप पेट्रोल के दामों को कम कीजिए, उसकी बढ़ोतरी को वापस लीजिए तो प्रधान मंत्री जी ने पलटवार किया और जवाब दिया कि सरकार का उस पर नियन्त्रण नहीं है, वह दाम तो बाजार तय करेगा।

महोदय, इससे एक कदम और आगे बढ़ कर उन्होंने यह भी कहा कि डीज़ल और एलपीजी के दाम भी बाजार को तय करने चाहिए। यह सुन कर तो हमारे पैरों के नीचे से जमीन और भी खिसक गई। जब लोगों ने गुहार लगाई कि तेल के दामों के कारण हमारा बजट बिगड़ रहा है, हम मर रहे हैं, प्रधान मंत्री जी ने उस पर कोई ध्यान नहीं दिया, लेकिन जब एक बड़े नामचीन उद्योगपति ने उनसे कहा कि तेल के बढ़ते दामों की वजह से मेरी कम्पनी डूब रही है, कृपया आप उसे बचाइए, तो आपने कहा कि आप बैंक से बात करेंगे।

वित्त मंत्री जी कल तक पत्रकारों से कह रहे थे कि तेल कम्पनियों को घाटा हो रहा है, इसलिए उसके दाम बढ़ा दिए गए हैं, इसमें सरकार क्या कर

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

सकती है, लेकिन जैसे ही उस उद्योगपति ने आपसे आग्रह किया, मैं सदन में उनका नाम नहीं लेना चाहती हूँ, तो आप नरम पड़ गए। आपने कहा कि उस उद्योगपति की कम्पनी को सहायता देने के लिए, उसको राहत देने के लिए आप बैंक से बात करेंगे। एक तरफ जनता प्रधान मंत्री जी को सुन रही थी, जो कह रहे थे कि कीमतें बाजार तय करेगा, वहीं दूसरी तरफ यूपीए सरकार एक कम्पनी को बचाने के लिए उसकी चिन्ता को देख रही थी। आपने जनता की चिन्ता को नहीं समझा, महंगाई से त्रस्त गरीब जनता को आपने छोड़ दिया। आज जनता की जेब नहीं उसकी गरदन काटी जा रही है। जिस तरीके के चीजों के भाव हैं, उसके हिसाब से लोगों का जीवन जीना मुश्किल हो रहा है।

अभी सीताराम येचुरी जी ने बताया कि सब्जियों की कीमतों में 26.5 फीसदी की बढ़ोतरी हुई है, फलों की कीमतों में 11.7 फीसदी की बढ़ोतरी हुई है और दालों की कीमतों में 13.27 फीसदी की बढ़ोतरी हुई है।

महोदय, मैं कहना चाहूंगी कि देश में लगभग 70% लोग ऐसे हैं, जिनकी कोई निश्चित आमदनी नहीं है, जिसमें किसान और मजदूर आते हैं। इन लोगों की कोई निश्चित आमदनी नहीं होती। आम आदमी की कमाई का एक-तिहाई हिस्सा पेट भरने के लिए भोजन पर खर्च हो जाता है, ऐसे में अगर आटा, दाल, सब्जी, चीनी, तेल इत्यादि महंगे हो जाएंगे तो आप बताएं कि कैसे आम व्यक्ति जीवन जीयेगा। जिन्दा रहने के लिए, जीवन जीने के लिए जनता को बाजार में क्या कीमत चुकानी पड़ रही है, इसकी तरफ आपका ध्यान जाना चाहिए।

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

महोदय, मैं कहना चाहूंगी कि गरीब और लाचार जनता इस परिस्थिति को देख जरूर रही है, लेकिन वह इतनी लाचार नहीं है, जितना उसे यूपीए सरकार समझ रही है। उसे जवाब देना बखूबी आता है। भले ही इस सरकार से देश की अर्थव्यवस्था का हिसाब-किताब नहीं संभल रहा है, लेकिन इस देश की जनता का गणितीय ज्ञान इस सरकार से लाख गुना बेहतर है। उसे प्याज और ब्याज दोनों का हिसाब लगाना अच्छे से आता है।

महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से यह बताना चाहूंगी कि सरकार का ब्याज अब मूलधन से भी ज्यादा हो गया है ...(समय की घंटी)। यूपीए ने सात सालों के शासन में इस देश को 14 साल पीछे धकेल दिया है। महोदय, मैं जनता की ओर से, इस सदन के माध्यम से सरकार को यह सूचित करना चाहती हूँ कि जैसे-जैसे सरकार अपनी मियाद के दिन गिन रही है, वैसे वैसे जनता भी इसके शासन से अपना वनवास चाह रही है। बेहतर होगा कि सरकार फेसबुक पर लगाम लगाने की बजाय अपना ध्यान महंगाई पर लगाम लगाने में लगाए, इसी में जनता और सरकार सबकी भलाई है, धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

3p/5:25/ks

MS. MABEL REBELLO (JHARKHAND): Sir, I stand here to speak on the issue of price rise. Price rise is peculiar not only to India; it is a global phenomenon. I am not here to justify price rise. I do realise

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

that price rise hurts and hurts the poor the most. However, we need to analyse it. We also have to suggest ways of containing price rise. The previous speakers have spoken of price rise and they have squarely and plainly blamed the Government of India. The Government of India is not solely responsible for the price rise. The State Governments are equally responsible. How can you say that only the Government of India is responsible for containing the rise in prices? We are today living in a global village. It is a fully integrated world economy. When there is price rise in the outside world, it affects us. Last year the price of crude oil was 75 dollars a barrel. This year it is over a hundred dollars. When we are in the integrated global economy and when exports come down, it naturally hurts. Everybody is talking about price rise. They say prices of vegetables, fruits, milk etc. have all gone up. Now, fodder prices have gone up. Eighty per cent of the cost of milk that you produce is the cost of fodder. So, naturally, the prices of milk will go up. You cannot help it. Why are there these problems? The main problem is the disconnect between the agricultural output and the availability of it to consumers. But who is creating this artificial shortage? I would like to

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

ask Members of the Opposition sitting here as to who are the sufferers. Seventy per cent of our farmers are small and marginal farmers. What do they produce? They produce, maybe, sufficient for themselves. Or, it may not even be sufficient for them in which case they do not have surplus to sell. And even if they have some thing to sell, there are so many problems because they do not have the infrastructure. Who is responsible for infrastructure? It is the State Governments. Who is responsible for power shortage? It is the State Governments. Who is responsible for irrigation shortage? It is the State Governments. Now, how is it that the State Governments are not able to contain hoarding? Who is hoarding? It is the middlemen. And who is with the middlemen? I need not tell you all that. Everybody sitting here knows with whom the middlemen are and for whom they fight here and for whom the Parliament is disrupted here. Everybody knows that. Why was the FDI in retail stopped? What is the difficulty? Why is there this price rise? It is because there is mismanagement and there is a disconnect between the demand and supply. As the hon. Finance Minister said some time ago, the FDI in retail was brought in so that the farmers could directly sell their

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

produce to the retailer and so that the middleman is eliminated. Who is responsible for creating this black-market economy?

(cd. by 3q/kgg)

3q/5.30/kgg

MS. MABEL REBELLO (contd.): Why is that a lot of people—I do not want to speak about a particular class--do not bother spending money? Wherefrom are they getting this much money? This is all the hoarders, black-marketeers who have got abundance of money, enough to spend. So, it does not hurt them. It is the small man who is exploited. You may see what is happening even in villages, in tribal areas. Why is the naxal problem? Why is there shortage? Who have enjoyed the benefits of subsidy all these years, be it LPG, water, sanitation, electricity or anything? It is the urban dweller. It is the better-off man. What did we give to the villager, Sir?

For the sake of criticizing, here, everybody was criticizing the price rise today; they are saying that we must contain the price rise. But, see the interest that they are showing. Are we speaking to the gallery? Are we speaking to the media? Just to draw the attention that

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

we are concerned with the common man? Are we sincerely interested, Sir?

We all know that 70 per cent of farmers are small farmers in this country. But, what happens? We are talking about the fertilizer subsidy. Who gets this fertilizer subsidy? It is the big farmer. The small farmer does not even know about it. Similarly, Sir, finance is not available to the small farmer. Until and unless we make ample finance available to the farmer, our farmers cannot produce enough. As a result, the disconnect between demand and supply cannot be addressed.

Sir, we are talking about emerging economies. Everywhere, not only in emerging economies but also in developed economies, there is price rise. I am not trying to justify the price rise. Sir, Libya and some of the other Arab countries were in turmoil. Because of that, the oil prices have gone up. The food prices have gone up, although we have tried to isolate our country from its impact.

Sir, State Governments are levying so much of taxes on petrol. Why are they saying all the time that the Government of India is levying taxes? Yes, but what about the State Governments? A large amount

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

of taxes are levied by the State Governments on petrol. That is also giving rise to the price rise. So, the State Governments should withdraw these taxes. Why are they not doing that, Sir?

Sir, we are living in a globalised world where our economy is dependent on commodity imports in critical areas such as fuel, edible oil and other primary imports. In this situation, it is not possible for us to contain the price rise fully. Wherever there is growth, there will be some price rise. This year, we had excessive rains. Naturally, we could not grow vegetables. Even if they grew, they could not bring them to the market on time. All these have led to the price rise. Everybody is speaking here on vegetables and fruits. Yes, it has happened. We have got to admit that fact. Then, the rain God was so kind to the country that it rained excessively. What can we do, Sir?

Similarly, some of the countries, in order to give stimulus, have released a large amount of money into their economies. India, being an integrated economy, has also had an adverse impact.

(Contd. by tdb/3r)

TDB/3R/5.35

MS. MABEL REBELLO (CONTD.): Sir, I have already spoken about dollar.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Yes, your party has one more speaker. So, you can conclude.

MS. MABEL REBELLO: Similarly, Sir, the Euro Zone is in turmoil, and that is also affecting our country.

Sir, although the cost has gone up, the cereal prices have stabilized.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Yes, you can conclude now.

MS. MABEL REBELLO: You see, the wheat prices have slightly come down. The prices of *atta*, wheat have come down. Sir, I will give an example. The labour cost has gone up.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: There is one more speaker from your party.

MS. MABEL REBELLO: Yes, Sir. In Kerala, the labour wages used to be Rs.20. (Interruptions) Purposely, I am giving your example. Today, it is Rs.400. Maybe, 20 or 30 years ago...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Even for that, labourers are not available. That is the problem.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

MS. MABEL REBELLO: Sir, the wages might have been two rupees, and you could get a kilo of rice for one-and-a-half rupee. Today, the wages are four hundred rupees. From two rupees to four hundred rupees, where have the wages jumped? It is a jump of two hundred per cent. But rice prices have not gone up by 200 per cent. Still, you can buy rice at twenty rupees. You can buy ample rice for your family. So, just criticizing, criticizing for the sake of criticism, Sir, is not good.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): Now, conclude.

MS. MABEL REBELLO: One second, Sir. I want to suggest a few measures, Sir, how to contain this price-rise. One is that this Agricultural Produce Marketing Act that is there, Sir, we must fully dismantle it. The State Governments should do it. Similarly, Sir, we need to improve agricultural productivity, strengthen and supply cold chains and augment capacities in the manufacturing sector, Sir.

Sir, the Government of India has increased the storage capacity by something like four million tonnes. They have increased it tremendously, this year. Somebody said here that this year the wheat production will be bumper and that will create a storage problem. (Time-bell) Sir, there is one more small thing. Sir, the PDS is the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

most important item. Sir, the State Governments are responsible for PDS. The State Governments have to distribute foodgrains through PDS. The Public Distribution System has to be streamlined by the State Governments. The Government of India gives ample commodities. It is not that the Government of India does not give it. It gives it to the State Governments. But, how do they distribute it? Again, there is black-marketing; again there is hoarding. All these type of things are leading to price rise and the poor people are not getting...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: There is no price rise in the Congress-ruled States because they have managed everything. What are you going to say by this? (Interruptions)

MS. MABEL REBELLO: Of course, to some extent. You have got a large number of States (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): Ms. Mabel, please wind up. (Interruptions)

MS. MABEL REBELLO: You are having it in a large number of States. Who is responsible for this? Your fellows who are sympathizing with them are responsible for it. (Interruptions)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): Hon. Member, please wind up. Your time is over.

MS. MABEL REBELLO: So, Sir, I still once again reiterate that these people here are blaming the Government of India for the sake of blaming. Heart-to-heart, they know that they are responsible. Their Governments are responsible... (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. (Interruptions)

MS. MABEL REBELLO: They are responsible for it.

(Ends)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: No, that is all. Thank you very much. Now, Dr. Barun Mukherji.

DR. BARUN MUKHERJI (WEST BENGAL): Sir, when I rise to speak about price-rise, I have a sad feeling that it has become a ritual for us to speak and discuss about it in every Session of Parliament, but with what effect? We find, at least, during the last three years, there has not been appreciable improvement in the price position, rather it has deteriorated. And, even we have heard that hon. Prime Minister and hon. Finance Minister have said in public meetings that this price-rise is really a very grave problem for the country. (Contd. by 3s-kl)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

KLS/3S-5.40

DR. BARUN MUKHERJI (CONTD): But in that case, I wish and hope that this Session be a turning point. Unless this grave and gigantic problem is not tackled on a war footing and with all determination, we cannot contain the price rise. So, I hope let this be a last chance for us to discuss price rise in the House and from the next week or next month, we will start seeing the results. We are very often reminded about the traditional economic theory of production and supply mismatch. But we must definitely look at the supply side particularly in a country like ours and the agricultural production must have a great impact on the economic situation of the country. But we have noticed that even the agricultural growth rate sometimes has gone down to as low as 1.5 per cent even in the very meagre target of 4 per cent. So, there should be more public investment in agriculture. We have seen in the Budget Speech of the hon. Finance Minister that they have increased the public investment in agriculture. But that is not sufficient and still we feel that more and more public investment should be there in the agricultural sector as well as the production in the manufacturing sector should also be increased. Unless and until we

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

increase productivity in agriculture and in the manufacturing sector, we cannot contain the price rise. If we are able to do this, not only we will be able to contain price rise but we will be able to create more employment opportunities. We have a feeling that demand is increasing due to increase in the earning capacity of the people. But I think we have to look at some of the findings of the Committee appointed by the Government of India headed by Prof. Arjun Sengupta, a late hon. Member of this House. We know about it that 77 per cent of our population does not have capacity to spend more than Rs.20 per day. So, in that case, whatever statistics we do produce, but we cannot admit that the purchasing power of the people has gone up. So, the basic thing we have to give more emphasis on is the supply side. Rather we have been seeing a vicious circle which starts with corruption. It is very difficult to imagine but it has so happened in our country. From the 2G spectrum scam, the exchequer has lost no less than an amount of Rs.1.76 lakh crore. With this amount, I think we could have given more subsidies to our Public Distribution System and poor people could have been helped continuously for five years. So, the vicious circle, I feel, starts with

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

corruption. The corruption gives rise to generation of black money and the black money gives indulgence to unfair business practices and ultimately it leads to price rise. On the other hand, even the vicious circle goes, with the anti-people economic policy of the Government goes on giving enough scope for higher profits for the corporates and business houses. At least, we have not seen that their profits have gone down. No annual statements coming from these big businesses houses are saying that their profits have gone down. So, it also creates some economic inequality among our population and ultimately we suffer due to inflation and price rise.

(Contd by 3T/SSS)

SSS-NB/3T/5.45

DR. BARUN MUKHERJI (CONTD.): Sir, I know that my time is very limited. Lastly, I would put a few of my humble suggestions. Although it has been a continuous demand from the various Governors of the country that there should be a ban on forward trading in all the agricultural commodities but we do not know why Government has not come forward straight saying that no, it is not possible. We have not heard that from them. But it is an issue that

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

should be taking place and we should encourage universal Public Distribution System. We should check the loss of huge amount of foodgrains in the FCI and other godowns and we must take stern action against black-marketeers and hoarders. There is no point in saying, 'Pass the buck to the State Governments.' It is a national crisis. I do not think that the Union Government can be a mute spectator. So, without blaming the State Government they should come forward to control and take action against the black-marketeers and hoarders. We must make all out efforts to increase agricultural productivity and manufacture and as I have already said, it would increase employment. Lastly, we should reverse the de-regulation of petroleum sector. It should not be left to the market forces. We have experienced how it is affecting our economy. We want that there should be a rollback of high prices. Thank you, Sir, for giving me the time.

(Ends)

श्री राजनीति प्रसाद (बिहार) : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मुझे ऐसा लगता है कि आज सातवीं बार हम लोग इस price rise पर बहस कर रहे हैं और आप आंकड़े देख लीजिए कि जब-जब इस पर बहस हुई है, तब-तब price rise हुई है। एक बड़ा

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

अच्छा शेर है कि मर्ज बढ़ता ही गया, ज्यों-ज्यों दवा की। हम लोग 7 बार इस पर चर्चा कर चुके हैं और मुझे लगता है कि आज आखिरी बार मैं इस पर यहां चर्चा कर रहा हूं। यह price rise कभी थमती नहीं है। दुष्यंत की एक कविता है, जो मैं आपको सुना देता हूं -

" बढ़ गई है पीर पर्वत की, पिघलनी चाहिए,
इस हिमालय से कोई नयी गंगा निकलनी चाहिए।
मेरे सीने में न सही, तो तेरे सीने में ही सही,
हो कहीं भी आग, लेकिन आग जलनी चाहिए।"

हिंदुस्तान में कोई आंदोलन नहीं हो रहा है। आज गरीबों की रोटी मारी जा रही है, सब्जी गायब है, दाल गायब है, नमक गायब है, लेकिन कोई आंदोलन नहीं हो रहा है। इन चीजों को लेकर विदेशों में आंदोलन हो रहे हैं, लेकिन यहां कोई आंदोलन नहीं हो रहा है। इतने दाम बढ़ गए हैं कि हम लोग जब यहां से रिटायर होकर जाएंगे, तब हमको पता लगेगा कि मामला क्या है - चावल का दाम क्या है, सब्जी का दाम क्या है? अभी तो मामला ऐसे ही चल रहा है, अभी तो यहां खा लो, वहां खा लो, उधर खा लो। जब हम लोग aeroplane पर चलते हैं, तो कहते हैं कि पनीर की सब्जी मिलेगी, लेकिन साधारण सब्जी नहीं मिलेगी। मैंने कई बार इनसे कहा है कि पनीर की सब्जी बंद करिए, क्योंकि पनीर की सब्जी तो डुप्लीकेट सब्जी होती है। जब उतना दूध नहीं है, तो पनीर कहां से आएगा? हम लोगों ने नारा लगाया था कि - "रोको महंगाई, बांधो दाम, नहीं तो

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

होगा चक्का जाम"। अब चक्का जाम नहीं होता, हम लोग ही जाम हो जाते हैं। इसका एक कारण है, जो मैं आपको बता रहा हूँ। मैंने कई बार इसे डिस्कस किया, मैं जिस कमेटी में हूँ, उसमें भी डिस्कस किया कि आप यह forward trading को बंद करो। श्री सीताराम येचुरी जी ने बहुत अच्छी बात कही कि आप 6 महीने आजमाकर देख लीजिए कि क्या होता है। यह जो वायदा बाजार है, यह किसलिए है? वायदा बाजार इसलिए है कि उसमें मुनाफा कमाया जाए, अगर उसमें घाटा होगा, तो कौन वायदा बाजार करेगा? 50 साल पहले जो सोने और हीरे में खेलते थे, वह सब बेकार हो गया है, कबाड़ी हो गया है। पता नहीं यह वायदा बाजार यहां पर कौन ले आया है? फिर ये बोलते हैं कि चावल पर नहीं है, गेहूं पर नहीं है, लेकिन स्टील पर है, सीमेंट पर है, सभी चीजों पर है। अब एक छोटा सा घर बनाना है, तो सीमेंट की बोरी करीब 400 रुपए में आएगी।

(3U/MP पर क्रमशः)

MP/3U/5.50

श्री राजनीति प्रसाद (क्रमागत) : अगर आपको एक asbestos sheet खरीदनी है, तो वह दो-तीन हजार में आएगी। अभी हमारे एक परिचित मर गए तो हम कफन खरीदने के लिए गए। हमारे यहां किसी के मरने पर कफन देना पड़ता है, तो मुझे ताज्जुब हुआ, दो साल पहले जब किसी के लिए कफन खरीदा था, तो अब कफन का दाम तब से दोगुना हो गया। सर, अब मरने के लिए कफन के दाम भी बढ़ गए, तो कैसे चलेगा? हमारे लोगों ने कहा कि यह राज्यों का मामला

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

है, लेकिन मामला किसी का भी हो, कोई फर्क नहीं पड़ता। दाम कम होने चाहिए, चाहे जो भी मजबूरी हो और दाम कमाने के लिए आप लोग हैं। आप हमेशा कहते हैं कि दो महीने में दाम घटने वाले हैं, तीन महीने में घटने वाले हैं, लेकिन कहां घटते हैं? इसलिए मैं सरकार से निवेदन करूंगा, सब लोगों से निवेदन करूंगा कि आपको जनता ने इसलिए चुनकर भेजा है कि उनको रोटी मिलनी चाहिए, दवा मिलनी चाहिए, कपड़े मिलने चाहिए, घर मिलना चाहिए और ये तभी मिलेंगे जब आप थोड़े स्ट्रिक्ट होंगे, थोड़ा वायदा बाजार को कम करेंगे। अगर वायदा बाजार रहा, तो फिर यहां किसी ने कहा है कि 8000 लोगों के पास पैसा होगा और उसके बाद किसी का.... यहां तो कमाल है! यहां अखबार में निकलता है कि हिंदुस्तान में सबसे ज्यादा अमीर आदमी कौन है? वह एक आदमी का, दो आदमियों का नाम लेता है, तो कैसे चलेगा? हमारे फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर साहब बैठे हैं, इसलिए मैं निवेदन कर रहा हूं कि रोटी खाने के लिए दामों को कम करने में कोई राजनीति नहीं करनी है। किसका कुसूर है, किसका कुसूर नहीं है, यह बात नहीं है। आप कुछ ऐसा कीजिए कि आपको इतिहास याद रखे। फिर हम सब लोग तो जाएंगे, आप भी जाएंगे, हम भी जाएंगे, सब चले जाएंगे, कुछ दाम कम कीजिए। दाम कम नहीं करेंगे तो फिर हम लोग जहां थे, वहीं रहेंगे, धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा (महाराष्ट्र) : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, आज हम सदन में महंगाई और सरकार द्वारा महंगाई रोकने के लिए जो कदम उठाए गए हैं, उस पर बहस कर रहे हैं। जहां तक मैंने इस विषय पर माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी के तमाम वक्तव्य पढ़े हैं तथा सुने हैं, इनसे यह स्पष्ट है कि सरकार इस विषय पर अत्यंत गंभीर है तथा सरकार ने महंगाई को रोकने के लिए व बढ़ती हुई कीमतों को काबू में लाने के लिए गंभीर कोशिशें की हैं, जिसके फलस्वरूप हमने मुद्रास्फीति पर नियंत्रण किया हुआ है।

महोदय, देश में आवश्यक वस्तुओं की बढ़ती हुई कीमतें चिंता का विषय हैं। इससे देश का आम आदमी प्रभावित हुआ है। पिछले कुछ महीनों से मुद्रास्फीति में बढ़ोतरी हुई है तथा रुपए की कीमत डॉलर के मुकाबले गिरी है, जिससे आयात महंगा होने से आवश्यक वस्तुओं की कीमतों के साथ-साथ तेल की भी कीमतों ने भी महंगाई में इजाफा किया है। तेल के लिए हम मुख्यतः आयात पर निर्भर करते हैं और जब भी खुले बाज़ार में तेल की कीमतें बढ़ती हैं, तो इससे ट्रांसपोर्ट सैक्टर से लेकर खाद्यान्न और कृषि आधारित वस्तुओं के दाम भी प्रभावित होते हैं। आज पूरा विश्व एक इकाई के रूप में ग्लोबल विलेज है जिसके किसी भी कोने में होने वाले घटनाक्रम का असर विश्व पर पड़ता है। यही हाल भारतीय अर्थव्यवस्था का भी है। भारतीय अर्थव्यवस्था ने अभूतपूर्व प्रगति की है। आज लोगों के पास पूंजी है, विकास द्वारा लोगों के लिए नए दरवाजे खोले गए हैं।
(3W/SC पर क्रमशः)

[-mp/sc-usy/3w/5.55](#)

श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा (क्रमागत) : गांव से लेकर शहर तक, आम आदमी से लेकर अमीर तक और हर क्षेत्र में शिक्षा से लेकर सूचना प्रणाली तक परिवर्तन के दौर से गुजर रहे हैं। भारत भी विश्व बाजार की एक कड़ी है इसलिए भारतीय आर्थिक पटल पर विश्व बाजार की अर्थव्यवस्था का असर स्वाभाविक है। जब भी देश में आवश्यक वस्तुओं की कीमतें बढ़ती हैं, तो तुरंत वित्त मंत्रालय से लेकर खाद्य मंत्रालय और रिजर्व बैंक तक अपने दखल से स्थिति को काबू में लाने की कोशिश करते हैं, लेकिन कुछ स्थितियां ऐसी होती हैं, जिन पर हमारा कोई नियंत्रण नहीं होता है। उन्हें न हम अपने यहां संसद में price rise पर बहस करके नियंत्रण में ला सकते हैं और न ही उन पर नीतिगत बदलाव ला सकते हैं। हमें गंभीरता से विचार करना चाहिए कि आवश्यक वस्तुओं के दामों में बढ़ोत्तरी और महंगाई या मुद्रास्फीति के क्या कारण हैं? इसका सबसे महत्वपूर्ण कारण है, कच्चे तेल की कीमतों में लगातार वृद्धि। आज अरब देशों की हालत ठीक नहीं है। इसका असर कच्चे तेल की कीमतों पर पड़ेगा, जिससे हमारी तेल कम्पनियों का घाटा लगातार बढ़ेगा, डीज़ल की कीमतों में वृद्धि होगी और कृषि पर आधारित लागत भी बढ़ जाएगी। जब लागत बढ़ेगी तो निश्चित रूप से हर चीज़ के दाम बढ़ेंगे। इसी के साथ यह मांग और आपूर्ति के अंतर का मामला है। पिछले सालों में आर्थिक प्रगति के साथ लोगों की क्रय शक्ति में वृद्धि हुई है, जिससे मांग में तो

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

वृद्धि हुई है, लेकिन आपूर्ति में उसी दर पर वृद्धि नहीं हुई है। आज पूरा विश्व मंदी के दौर से गुजर रहा है। दुनिया की अर्थव्यवस्था के जिस तेजी के साथ पटरी पर लौटने की उम्मीद थी, उस तेजी से वह पटरी पर नहीं लौटी है। इसके विपरीत कई जगहों पर मंदी के लक्षण फिर से दिखने लगे हैं। बढ़ती हुई तनख्वाहें भी इसका एक कारण हैं। जब लोगों के वेतन बढ़ते हैं तो बाजार में मांग बढ़ती है जिससे मुद्रास्फीति भी आगे बढ़ती है। अभी रिजर्व बैंक ने रैपो रेट कई बार बढ़ाया है। इसका असर निश्चित तौर पर देखने को मिलेगा। सरकार से मेरा अनुरोध है कि वह यह देखे कि बढ़ी हुई रैपो रेट से हमारे आर्थिक विकास पर असर न पड़े। आम आदमी पर सबसे ज्यादा असर खाद्य मुद्रास्फीति का पड़ता है। हालांकि सरकार बहुत जल्दी ही फूड सिक्योरिटी बिल संसद में लाने जा रही है, जिससे आम लोगों को काफी हद तक राहत मिलेगी। हमें खाद्यान्न उत्पादन और वितरण पर ध्यान देना होगा। एक तरफ गरीब है जो खाद्यान्न नहीं खरीद सकता है, वहीं दूसरी तरफ देश के गोदामों में और बाहर तथा कहीं रेलवे स्टेशनों पर पड़ा हुआ अन्न सड़ रहा है। देश में हर साल लगभग 40 प्रतिशत वेजिटेबल्स, फ्रूट्स तथा खाद्यान्न पदार्थ सड़ जाते हैं। क्या हम इसे गरीबों तक नहीं पहुंचा सकते? एक अनुमान है कि देश में जितना खाद्यान्न पैदा होता है, उसका सिर्फ 20 प्रतिशत हम एफसीआई के गोदामों में स्टोर कर सकते हैं और बाकी 80 प्रतिशत खुली जगहों पर ही पड़ा रहता है। अभी आंध्र प्रदेश की खबर आयी थी कि वहां पर खाद्यान्नों को स्कूलों और उसके कमरों में रखा गया है, क्लासरूम्स में रखा गया

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

है। सरकार को पीडीएस की प्रणाली पर विचार करना पड़ेगा जिससे टारगेटेड लोगों तक इसका लाभ पहुंचाया जा सके। अचानक दाम बढ़ने का एक कारण खाद्यान्नों को अनाधिकृत रूप से स्टोर करना भी है। अभी हम लोगों ने एफडीआई की बात की थी कि एफडीआई को अभी रोक दिया जाए।

(3एक्स-एमसीएम पर क्रमशः)

USY-SC/PK-MCM/3X/6.00

श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा (क्रमागत) : मुझे ऐसा लगता है कि अगर वह आता तो निश्चित रूप से किसानों को, कंज्यूमर्स को उसका फायदा होता। नासिक जो महाराष्ट्र में है, यहां से चार रुपए किलो का प्याज निकलकर लोगों के घरों तक जाते-जाते 40 रुपए हो जाता है। हमारे पास स्टोरेज की फेसिलिटी नहीं है, हमारे पास एयरकंडीशनिंग की फेसिलिटी नहीं है, ऐसी कई चीजें हैं जिनके कारण ऐसा होता है। आपने देखा होगा कि बुंदेलखंड के अंदर लोग अनाज के अभाव में मर रहे हैं, जबकि उसके पास में ही कानपुर में काफी अनाज है। अमर्त्य सेन ने भी एक बार कहा था कि पश्चिमी बंगाल में, कोलकाता में जो अकाल पड़ा था, उसका मुख्य कारण डिस्ट्रिब्यूशन सिस्टम और साथ में उस प्रणाली को इम्पूव करने की आवश्यकता है।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Okay.

श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा : सर, मैं आखिर में इसको कन्कलूड करता हूं। आम आदमी के लिए बढ़ती हुई खाद्यान्न की जो कीमतें हैं वे सबसे ज्यादा

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-07.12.2011

मुसीबत की चीजें हैं। गरीबी रेखा की जो हमारी परिभाषा है, वह भी कंप्यूजिंग है। यह तय कर लेना चाहिए कि उसकी क्या परिभाषा होनी चाहिए। वह उतने पैसे से एक जून का खाना नहीं खा सकता है और हमारी कीमतें बढ़ती जा रही हैं। सर, मुझे आपने बोलने का मौका दिया, जिसके लिए मैं आपका आभारी हूँ। मैं और कुछ कहना चाहता था लेकिन समय की कमी के कारण ऐसा सम्भव नहीं है।

(समाप्त)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): Thank you very much. Now, discussion concluded. Reply will be made later on. The House is adjourned to meet tomorrow at 11.00 a.m.

.....

**The House then adjourned at one minute past
six of the clock till eleven of the clock on
Thursday, the 08th December, 2011.**