

YSR/11.00/1A

**The House met at eleven of the clock,
MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.**

--

MEMBER SWORN

Ms. Rekha (Nominated)

Q. No. 541**(Q. No. 541 -- Hon. Member absent)****MR. CHAIRMAN:** Any supplementaries?**SHRI D. RAJA:** Sir, I have one suggestion and one question for the hon. Minister.**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question, please.**SHRI D. RAJA:** Sir, the wages to workers under the MGNREG Scheme are not paid on time. There is a delay in making payment. Here, I think the system of Andhra Pradesh of automatic payment of compensation for delayed payment in workers' bank account can be considered by the Government. My question is this. Despite several court orders — one by the High Court of Andhra Pradesh and the other by the High Court of Karnataka — and despite the observations made by the Supreme Court in this matter, the wage given to workers

Q. NO.541 (Contd.)

under the MGNREGS is less than the minimum wages in many States. The House will be grateful to him if he throws light on the States where the wage given to workers under the MGNREGS is less than the minimum wages under the Minimum Wages Act. What is the Union Government thinking of dealing with the issue of minimum wages given to workers under the MGNREG Scheme?

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, as far as the wages under the MGNREGA are concerned, these were revised on 22nd March this year. While laying the statement on the Table of the House, I had said that it's the policy of the Government to revise them every year and they would be linked with the Consumer Price Index for Agricultural Labourers. That is the policy of the Government and we will stick to it. Even after the revision of the minimum wage rates for the MGNREGA of March 2012, there are six States in the country where the minimum wage under the MGNREGA is lower than the minimum wage for unskilled agricultural labourer under the Minimum Wage Act of 1948. These States are Kerala, Andhra Pradesh, Rajasthan, Mizoram, Andaman and Nicobar Islands and West Bengal. In all other States,

Q. NO.541 (Contd.)

the wage under the MGNREGA is higher than the minimum agricultural wage. Sir, the matter is in the Supreme Court. A Special Leave Petition has been filed by the Central Government. We are examining the issue whether we can amend the MGNREGA or the Minimum Wage Act to, once and for all, put an end to this controversy about the divergence between the agricultural minimum wage and the minimum wage under the MGNREGA. But I do want to tell the hon. Members that it is unfair to compare the minimum wage rate under the MGNREGA with the minimum wage rate under the Minimum Wage Act because the wage under the MGNREGA is subject to many other advantages. For example, any worker who completes 15 days of employment under the MGNREGA automatically enjoys the benefits of the Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojna. The workers under the MGNREGA enjoy many benefits which other workers don't enjoy under the Minimum Wage Act.

(Followed by VKK/1B)

Q. NO.541 (Contd.)

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Sir, it is deeply disturbing that the number of persondays generated under NREGA is only about half, and perhaps slightly less than half, of the number of mandays that ought to be generated under a programme dedicated to the proposition that the unemployed agricultural labourers of India need 100 days of employment per year. And this is being justified on the ground that this is a demand-driven programme. Now, given the fact that in many of the States where it is self-evident that levels of unemployment in agriculture are much higher than in other States and yet it is precisely in these States that the number of mandays generated is lower – very, very much lower – than 100 days of employment for household, would the Minister kindly consider re-conceiving the MNREGA Programme from being so-called demand-driven to be made into supply-driven because the fact of the matter is that in those parts of India where this programme is most needed, it is clear after five years that administrative arrangements are not such as to generally encourage and enable people looking for jobs to ask for it

Q. NO.541 (Contd.)

under NREGA or to receive it? In fact, it is not being treated as an entitlement programme but as a programme that is based upon the Budget funds that are allotted and the administrative arrangements that are being made.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, as the hon. Member has conceded, MGNREGA is a demand-driven programme. It's a demand-driven programme whose primary responsibility for implementation lies with the Gram Panchayats. Sir, I readily admit to the fact that in the three States where the MGNREGA programme should have been implemented on a much larger scale, namely, Bihar, Jharkhand and Orissa, we have not seen the level of activity under MGNREGA which would be warranted by poverty and unemployment ratios. So, I take this criticism and this is a valid point. We are in the process of looking at strengthening the Gram Panchayat institutions in these States. We are looking at remedying the supply side deficiencies which the hon. Member has alluded to. Delayed payment has been one important reason in Central and Eastern India why demand has been falling. There are multiple reasons why delayed payments take place. There

Q. NO.541 (Contd.)

are lack of banking facilities and lack of post offices. The fact that we have 78 naxal-affected districts makes the job of disbursing wages all that more difficult. That is why, now, we have allowed cash payment of wages in many of these areas and I am glad to say, Sir, delays have come down but, I do want to reiterate that MGNREGA will remain a demand-driven programme. It will remain a programme that would be run by Gram Panchayats. But, we will make every effort to ensure that these three States, in particular, will receive adequate attention.

श्री विनय कटियार : माननीय सभापति जी, मनरेगा के कारण देश में एक राज्य से दूसरे राज्य में मजदूरी करने का एक क्रम रुका हुआ है और लोगों को अपने ही राज्य के अंदर रोजगार मिला है। मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ कि बहुत से ऐसे स्थान हैं, जिनके लिए यह कह दें कि पूरा का पूरा भ्रष्टाचार मच गया है, तो गलत नहीं होगा। इसके कारण मजदूरों को जितना लाभ मिलना चाहिए या उनको जितना काम करना चाहिए, वे उससे विरत रहते हैं, क्योंकि उसी में कमीशन चल जाता है। इसके चलते देश को दोहरा नुकसान हो रहा है, एक तो गाँव के अंदर मजदूर नहीं मिलते, क्योंकि उनको बैठे बिठाए वेतन मिल रहा है, दूसरा भ्रष्टाचार तो है ही। मैं आपसे जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या आप इस समस्या का कोई समाधान निकालेंगे, जो नक्सल प्रभावित इलाके हैं, क्या आप इस

प्रश्न संख्या 541 (क्रमागत)

योजना को उन इलाकों में युद्ध स्तर पर चलाएंगे और उत्तर प्रदेश के फैजाबाद जिले के अंदर जो बड़ा भारी घोटाला हुआ है, क्या उसकी जाँच कराएंगे?

श्री जयराम रमेश : सभापति जी, मुझे खुशी है कि माननीय सदस्य ने माना है और स्वीकारा है कि मनरेगा के कुछ सकारात्मक असर भी हुए हैं। इसके कारण distress माइग्रेशन कम हुआ है, जो कि एक वास्तविकता है। जहाँ तक करप्शन का मामला है, घोटालों का मामला है, यह राज्य सरकार और ग्राम पंचायतों की प्राथमिक जिम्मेदारी होती है कि मनरेगा सही ढंग से चले।

(1c/akg पर जारी)

AKG-TMV/1C/11.10

श्री जयराम रमेश (क्रमागत) : हम इसमें ज्यादा हस्तक्षेप नहीं कर सकते। हम इसे राज्य सरकार की जानकारी में जरूर ला सकते हैं, ग्राम पंचायतों की जानकारी में जरूर ला सकते हैं, पर प्रत्यक्ष रूप से हम कुछ कार्रवाई नहीं कर सकते। अगर कार्रवाई करनी है, तो राज्य सरकारों को करनी है। फिर भी, चूँकि माननीय सदस्य ने पूछा है, तो मैं कहूँगा कि पहली बार हमने सीएजी से निवेदन किया है कि वह परफॉर्मेंस ऑडिट करे। अभी सारे राज्यों में सीएजी का नरेगा का परफॉर्मेंस ऑडिट चल रहा है। नवंबर तक उसकी रिपोर्ट आएगी, जो पार्लियामेंट में पेश होगी और उसके ऊपर बहस भी होगी।

प्रश्न संख्या 541 (क्रमागत)

इसके अलावा, हम पहली बार यह सोच रहे हैं कि हर ग्राम पंचायत में मनरेगा के खाते में जो पैसा जाता है, हर ग्राम पंचायत को हर साल करीब 18-19 लाख रुपए मिलते हैं, उसका अलग खाता रखने के बाद चार्टर्ड एकाउंटेंट से खाते का सर्टिफिकेशन होना अनिवार्य होगा। चार्टर्ड एकाउंटेंट सीएजी की सूची से लिया जाएगा और 10 या 15 प्रतिशत केसेज़ में प्रत्यक्ष रूप से कागजात की भी जाँच होगी। सीएजी और compulsory certification from Chartered Accountant होने से मैं समझता हूँ कि कुछ दबाव जरूर आएगा, जिससे घोटाले कम होंगे। इसके अलावा, जो कुछ जाँच की रिपोर्ट्स आती हैं, हम जाँच की रिपोर्ट्स भेजते हैं। जहाँ शिकायतें आती हैं, वहाँ जाँच की टीम भेजी जाती है और उस जाँच की टीम की रिपोर्ट के आधार पर हम राज्य सरकारों से निवेदन करते हैं कि वे कार्रवाई करें। कई ऐसे मामलों में कार्रवाई हुई है, पर मैं यह स्वीकार करता हूँ कि कई राज्यों में कार्रवाई करने में थोड़ा विलम्ब जरूर हुआ है। नक्सल प्रभावित जिलों के बारे में जैसा माननीय सदस्य ने पूछा है, खास कर जो 78 नक्सल प्रभावित जिले हैं, उनमें हमने मनरेगा के लिए विशेष प्रावधान किया है। हमने यह पाया था कि भुगतान के विलम्ब के कारण डिमांड घट रही थी। इसलिए हमने नक्सल प्रभावित जिलों में कैश पेमेंट का प्रबन्ध किया है। मुझे खुशी है कि बालाघाट, जो मध्य प्रदेश में है; दंतेवाड़ा, नारायणपुर, विजयपुर, कांकेड़, जो छत्तीसगढ़ में हैं, ऐसे जिलों में अभी मजदूरी की माँग बढ़ रही है। (समाप्त)

Q. NO. 542

SHRI T. M. SELVAGANAPATHI: Sir, the statement which has been laid on the Table of the House reveals that there are 21 vacant posts at the top level of the PSUs. For almost 18 months these top level posts of Chairman or Managing Director or CMD are lying vacant. Other than these 21 vacant posts, the posts of independent Directors numbering about 70 and whole-time Directors numbering 300 are lying vacant for years together. Is the Minister aware as to how it will affect the functioning of the PSUs where lakhs and lakhs of employees are involved and several million crores of rupees have been expended for all these industries to come up? The reason cited for such a delay is the wrangling between the administrative unit of the PSUs and the PESB, the Board which selects the candidates. The files have been tossed between pillar and post. The reason cited for such a delay is holding the post temporarily by someone at the Ministry level. Will the Minister take some initiatives to simplify the procedure in filling up the top level posts in the PSUs?

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Sir, I would like to submit that the hon. Member's observation that all these top level posts are lying vacant for

Q.No. 542 (Contd.)

18 months or more is not the accurate picture. Filling up the posts is an ongoing process. Barring one or two positions of companies which are not doing particularly well, most of the appointments to the top posts are ongoing process. As per existing procedure, filling up of these positions is notified by the PSUs, at least, a year in advance and the entire process kick-starts. While there may have been some delays due to procedural reasons, usually the PESB, after advertising and short-listing the candidates, conducts the interview, and post-interview, the administrative Ministry sends the names for the CVC clearance.

(Contd. by 1D/VK)

VK/1D/11.15

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL (CONTD): Sometimes, there are some delays on that account, but that should not be considered as a norm. Sometimes, there are aberrations where some complaints do take longer than normal time to get them cleared and examine. Notwithstanding that, the appointment of Independent Directors is done through the Administrative Ministry and, of course, it goes

Q.No. 542 (Contd.)

through the whole procedure. So far as the appointment of whole-time Directors is concerned, like the PESB has a procedure for appointments on top positions, the same process is adopted for appointment of whole-time Directors. So far as the number of vacancies cited by the hon. Member is concerned, I don't have the exact number, but the fact is that this is an ongoing exercise and it goes through the same procedure as is done in the case of appointment of CMDs.

SHRI T.M. SELVAGANAPATHI: I am authentic to the fact that there was an RTI application made with regard to this question which says that 15 posts were vacant for 18 months. If I am wrong, I stand corrected. But this is a report given by the PESB, that is, the Public Enterprises Selection Board. Sir, the Minister has stated on record that because of wrangling and delay in processing the papers and files by the Vigilance Commission, he has a succession plan in which the procedures would be simplified. Would the Minister state as to how the procedures would be simplified? How is the delay going to be reduced? Secondly, recently, the Department of Personnel has

Q.No. 542 (Contd.)

issued a Circular saying that there was an undue delay in such appointments at the Ministry's level and the Vigilance Commission's level. They have suggested that two months in advance before the vacancy arises, a proposal must be sent to the Department of Personnel....

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the question?

SHRI T.M. SELVAGANAPATHI: Even the ACC, that is, the Appointment Committee of the Cabinet has to go through a long procedure. Therefore, I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether these things would be simplified. Would he see to it that the heads are appointed on time?

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to correct the hon. Member again. As I said earlier, the process for filling up these vacancies starts exactly one year prior to the superannuation or retirement of a particular head of the PSU. It is not that the procedure does not start well in time. As I said, there are some procedural delays along the way. Of course, the entire process is conducted through the DoPT. But we, as the Department of Public Enterprises,

Q.No. 542 (Contd.)

certainly have an interface with them. The fact is, there are some delays on account of CVC clearance which are, of course, beyond the control of the concerned Department or the Ministry. But, at the same time, I do appreciate the sentiments expressed by the hon. Member. We will, along with the DoPT, try our best to see that these processes are limited to a particular timeframe so that such delays do not occur.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, the Minister has given a list of PSUs where CMD posts are lying vacant. There are companies like the Brahmaputra Valley and the Hooghly Dock in which cases the BRPSE has recommended a revival package and that is in the process of operation. If the head is not there in those companies, then who will lead the whole revival exercise? Even if the package is so sound, how could it be effectively implemented to turn it around? I have got some reply that except in some of the companies not doing well, the heads are there in other companies. I think in the case of those companies which are not doing well, you must give them priority and see to it that the captain remains there to lead the show. Secondly,

Q.No. 542 (Contd.)

there is a procedural suggestion. The PESB makes the whole exercise, and after that the things are delayed because of the vigilance clearance. Why not there be the vigilance clearance of the list first and then it goes to the PESB for short-listing and then the Minister puts up the final stamp? Sir, this point was suggested in the meeting of the Committee on Public Undertakings also. Sir, some of the blue chip public sector companies, where even the PESB has finalized the selection process, are suffering because of this reason and the things are getting unduly delayed. (Contd. By 1E)

RG/11.20/1E

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (contd.): Therefore, will the Minister consider getting vigilance clearance done for probable candidates first? Then, it should go to the PESB, and the PESB can do the shortlisting.

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Sir, I agree with the hon. Member that delays in obtaining the Vigilance Clearance have been instrumental in some cases, but I am not saying that this is the reason in all cases. And there is a case for trying to look at the suggestion for implementation.

Q.No. 542 (Contd.)

But again, we will discuss this with the DoPT and see if this can be done. If that finds agreement at all levels, then, maybe, that could be a good suggestion. The other thing is about the heads of these PSUs. I think the bulk of the lists contain many companies which are not in good health or which are under the purview of the BRPSE. That is why we have been finding some difficulty in appointing the suitable people to head these companies which are not doing well. I do appreciate the sentiment. At the same time, the BRPSE and the Administrative Ministry are also equally responsible to see to it that these companies do function in the best manner possible. But I do agree that it will be much better to have regular CMDs looking after the turnaround and to see that these companies are back on good financial health.

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Sir, I believe, the hon. Minister is just not the Minister of Heavy Industries but he is also the Minister of Public Enterprises. I am sure he would like to explain what he means by PSEs because even banks are under that. And the LIC does not have a head. There are also a lot of oil companies and others. So, there is

Q.No. 542 (Contd.)

a more comprehensive aspect about the public sector undertakings. But that is not my supplementary. My supplementary is very straight and specific. It is about appointments and role of PSEs. If I recall correctly, there is an organization called the NACIL, which is, now, the Air India. That was created in 2007, and it is one of the public sector undertakings. But there have been appointments made in such undertakings by something called the Search Committee. So, when the Government wants someone to come in the public sector enterprises, they create a Search Committee, and this Search Committee is created under the auspices of the Prime Minister who decides to appoint an individual or choose from a group of individuals. Similarly, I would like to tell the hon. Minister, who was heading the Department then, that they create a Search Committee, and thereby, appoint a person who may be manipulatively positioned there. And, when the matter was raised that the Search Committee had appointed someone as Chairman of the Air India who continued to be there for two years, then, the Government, subsequently, withdrew him and sacked him...

Q.No. 542 (Contd.)

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your supplementary?

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Subsequently, they appoint one more person as the Chairman of the PSE, who is, again, not an appointee of the Public Enterprises Selection Board. For the last seven years, the Government has chosen to appoint people and individuals to head Air India, who have not been appointees of the PESB. I would like to seek an explanation from him that apart from the mess which has come into existence, in what situation, when elections of the country are being held, they create a Search Committee...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please put your supplementary. Don't give a commentary.

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: My supplementary is this. When the PESB is existing, why is it that Search Committees are created in a hurry to appoint individuals? What is the background and the basis of that with reference to Air India?

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Sir, basically, the thrust of this question is more directly to do with the DoPT, which is the concerned Department dealing with both the PESB and the CVC, and which

Q.No. 542 (Contd.)

deals with all other issues involved. But, notwithstanding, I can only say that in some cases, the Government does appoint people through a Search Committee, and it, ultimately, goes for the ACC's approval...(Interruptions)

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: What is the purpose?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, let the Minister finish.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: You discover some person and put him as the head.

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Sir, I do not want to go into that debate at this moment because Mr. Rudy also, at some relevant time, had gone through the same process in appointing people of the Department he, then, headed. So, I don't want to go into the debate...(Interruptions)

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: It is no more Mr. Rudy's question. It is the question of the House. Let the Minister explain the purpose of the Search Committee.

SHRI PRAFULPATEL: Sir, I simply do not want to go into that debate. I am just telling him that what was done in the past was followed by this Government as well in the present.

(Followed by 1F)

Q.No. 542 (Contd.)

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the Minister's reply is not convincing. In the main question, when Mr. Selvaganapathi was authenticating that the total number of vacancies of whole time Directors and the part time Directors are lying vacant for 18 months, the Minister denied it. I would like to urge upon the Minister, through you, Sir, that the Minister could furnish the House since when these vacancies are existing and how many vacancies are existing. This is part (a) of my question. Part (b) of my question is, there are 21 PSEs. The Minister has given a list, out of which, many Public Sector Enterprises are very sick and are at a loss. One of the main reasons is that these organisations do not have a head for a long time. Sir, the Prime Minister is, time and again, insisting on the resilience of the Public Sector Enterprises. The Public Sector Enterprises are facing a very stiff competition with the private sector, and the Minister has to take it up. It is a very serious concern. Sir, I have only one point. The demand of the country in machine tools is Rs. 8000 crores, whereas the domestic production Rs. 2000 crores, out of which the PSE is only

Q.No. 542 (Contd.)

Rs. 200 crores. Sir, all these reasons have to be taken seriously when the economic situation indicates that the industrial slow down is one of the main reasons. The responsibility of the Minister for Heavy Industries is much more serious and one of that is, filling up of these vacancies and whole-time Directors. Let me know from the Minister, whether he has any time frame to fill up these things. And I submit to the Chair, kindly permit us to have a Half-an-Hour-Discussion on the working of the PSEs.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please give a notice on that.

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I have answered bulk of the question which the hon. Member asked about, how do you fill up these vacancies, and I think, I have nothing more to add expect the fact that I share your concern, PSUs which are headless for a long time should not go through this state for long. I appreciate that. But, having said that, out of the 21 lists, which have been provided, bulk of them are of companies which are not doing very well. It is not that the process of the PSEs is taking unduly long or major companies of our country...

Q.No. 542 (Contd.)

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: The vacancies are not getting filled up. This is one of the main reasons.

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: I appreciate, but, that is exactly what I am saying. The question was on the fact that PSUs are lying headless for a long time and of the 21 which have been listed out here, bulk of them are companies which are under BRPSE or companies which are not doing very well. Bulk of the companies which we consider, the so-called our blue chip PSUs or companies which, are doing well, are not facing this kind of a problem which you are trying to highlight here. I appreciate the other issues about machine tool industry and other things. That can be taken up separately. It is not part of this question.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question. No. 543.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: I asked about the time-frame. When will the vacancies be filled up?

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think he has explained the process.

(Ends)

Q. No. 543

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Sir, I would also like to point out that we had explained to the Secretariat the inadmissibility of this question because there is nothing arising out of this question, which I can answer here. We had sent it. But, still, the question has been admitted. I will endeavour my best to answer in whichever way I can.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think you have answered it. Let the supplementaries be raised.

श्री साबिर अली: सर, क्वेश्चन का जो आंसर आया है, वह बड़ा दुःखदायी है। क्वेश्चन का आंसर है: 'does not arise', यानी सवाल उठता नहीं है। सर, हमने सवाल सिर्फ यह किया था कि बिहार में आपने क्या कभी पैसे लगाने की चेष्टा की और अगर नहीं की तो उसकी क्या वजह रही? इस पर यह जवाब आता है कि सवाल उठता नहीं है, तो यह बहुत दुःखदायी है, सर। एक ऐसे प्रदेश के साथ, जो पिछड़ा हुआ हो, वहाँ के लिए कभी आपने चेष्टा नहीं की और इस तरह का जवाब आता है! सर, इस पर मुझे एक शेर याद आता है:

*आने वाला लापता है जाने वाला बेखबर,
किससे पूछें मंजिले-मकसूद कितनी दूर है। ..(व्यवधान)..*

सर, ऐसा लगता है कि सदन में वह प्रदेश, जो ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री सभापति: आप जवाब का पार्ट-ए पढ़ लीजिए।

प्रश्न संख्या — 543 (क्रमागत)

श्री साबिर अली: सर, सवाल का जवाब इतना दुःखदायी है कि जितना भी दुःख व्यक्त किया जाए, वह कम है।

श्री सभापति: नहीं, नहीं। This is wrong.

श्री साबिर अली: सर, यह बड़ा दुःखदायी है कि 'it does not arise.' सर, हमने पूछा कि इस देश की हेवी इंडस्ट्रीज़ का जो इतना बड़ा मंत्रालय है, जो देश में बड़े mechanism और instruments बनाता है, तो क्या आपको बिहार दिखायी नहीं दिया?

(1जी/एमसीएम पर जारी)

-DS/MCM-NBR/1G/11-30

श्री साबिर अली (क्रमागत) : जहां साढ़े दस करोड़ लोग रहते हैं, वहां पर आप इण्डस्ट्रीज लगाएं और पैसा दें।

श्री सभापति : नहीं-नहीं, please ask your supplementary relating to the main Question.

श्री साबिर अली : सर, उसी से रिलेटिड है। मैं बिहार से आता हूं, बिहार के बारे में क्वेश्चन है तथा वहां पैसा लगाने के बारे में पूछा है, जिसके उत्तर में उन्होंने कहा है कि question does not arise. इसके लिए मुझे यह कहना पड़ता है कि मैं कभी अपने क्वेश्चन के बारे में भाषण नहीं देता, लेकिन यह भाषण इससे रिलेटिड है। सर, मैं आपके माध्यम से मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूं कि क्या

प्रश्न संख्या — 543 (क्रमागत)

सरकार ने इसका प्रावधान किया है कि जो प्रदेश पिछड़ा हो, वहां पहले तवोज्जह देने की जरूरत है, वहां पर प्राइऑरटी देने की जरूरत है। आपकी वहां जो सबसे बड़ी इण्डस्ट्री है, भेल, वहां जितने भी आर्डर होते हैं, वे छः-छः महीने, एक-एक साल लेट होते हैं। आप बिहार में और इण्डस्ट्री लगाएं। क्या आपके पास कोई ऐसी सोच बनी है कि जो प्रदेश ज्यादा पिछड़ा है, वहां पर इण्डस्ट्री लगाएंगे?

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Sir, for the satisfaction of the House, I just want to read out the question. It says:

- "(a) the details of funds given and spent in Bihar by the Ministry i.e., the Ministry of Heavy Industries and its various organisations during the last three years and the current year so far;
- the purpose for which these funds were given; and
 - the steps being taken to increase those funds.

That is the question. Sir, the Ministry of Heavy Industries and Public Enterprises do not have its own Budget. This Ministry is only a nodal Ministry for some sectors within the Department of Heavy Industries. If the Ministry of Heavy Industry has not spent money

प्रश्न संख्या — 543 (क्रमागत)

directly, how am to answer to the hon. Member as to what is the amount spent. I have no way to answer this question. In fact, this was clarified to the Secretariat vide our letter that it is inadmissible due to the fact that no money has been spent.

Having said that, since the hon. Member has enlightened us with *share-aur-shairi*, I can only say one thing. During the deliberations of the Ministry of Heavy Industries in the Consultative Committee, we made a small sub-group under the Chairmanship of Shri Mohan Singh, senior Member of Parliament, and there is one Member from Bihar, Shri Bhola Singh, and there are two other Members, along with our officers, to examine and to give us a small working paper how we can see more industrialization of Bihar. I can tell you that much and no more. But, I can tell you, as far as your concerns are concerned, I am sure, these are the concerns of the entire House and the Government of India.

श्री साबिर अली : सर, मेरा दूसरा सवाल यह है कि गत तीन वर्षों में आपने किन-किन राज्यों में पैसा बढ़ाया है, जहां इण्डस्ट्रीज हैं, और उसका आपके पास क्या खाता है?

प्रश्न संख्या — 543 (क्रमागत)

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Sir, I seek your protection. Beyond that, I cannot say anything.

श्री रामविलास पासवान : सभापति महोदय, कहा जा रहा है कि बिहार ग्रोथ रेट में गुजरात से भी आगे बढ़ गया है। पिछले 6 साल में एक सुई का कारखाना भी नहीं लगा है। तो मैं मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि जिस राज्य में एक सुई का कारखाना भी न हो, उस राज्य की स्थिति क्या हो सकती है, यह आप समझ सकते हैं। ठीक है, उन्होंने कहा कि बिहार में पैसा देने का प्रावधान नहीं है। क्या बिहार सरकार ने सेंट्रल गवर्नमेंट से एप्रोच किया है कि वहां कोई कल-कारखाना या भारी उद्योग लगाया जाए? यदि हां, तो कब अनुरोध किया है?

श्री प्रफुल्ल पटेल : सर, मेरे मंत्रालय की जानकारी के अनुरूप, अभी कोई ऐसी योजना बिहार राज्य के लिए हमारे मंत्रालय के अधीन विचाराधीन नहीं है।

श्री तारिक अनवर : सर, बिहार की पीड़ा यह है कि जब बिहार का बंटवारा हुआ तो जितनी भी हेवी इण्डस्ट्रीज थीं, वे झारखंड में चली गईं। आज बिहार में कुछ भी नहीं बचा है हेवी इण्डस्ट्रीज के नाम पर। इसलिए आज जो प्रश्न उठाया गया है, खास तौर पर जो बिहार के लोगों को चिंता है वह इस बात की है कि किसी भी राज्य का जो आर्थिक विकास होता है वह इस बात पर निर्भर करता है कि उस प्रदेश में कितना औद्योगीकरण हुआ है।

(1H/hms पर जारी)

प्रश्न संख्या — 543 (क्रमागत)

श्री तारिक अनवर (क्रमागत) : लेकिन बिहार का दुर्भाग्य है कि वहां कोई भी इंडस्ट्री नहीं है और प्राइवेट सेक्टर के लोग भी वहां नहीं जा रहे हैं। इसलिए हम मंत्री जी से जानना चाहेंगे कि क्या सरकार या उनका मंत्रालय कोई ऐसी व्यवस्था करेगा, जिससे अगर हैवी इंडस्ट्री के पास धन नहीं है, तो प्राइवेट सेक्टर को वहां attract करने के लिए वह कोई ऐसा फॉर्मूला तैयार करे ताकि प्राइवेट सेक्टर के लोग वहां जा सकें और उद्योग लगा सकें जैसे कि दूसरे राज्यों में लगा रहे हैं? महोदय, वहां उद्योग नहीं होगा तो बेरोजगारी होगी और बेरोजगारी होगी तो वहां से लोगों का पलायन होगा। महोदय, यह बिहार की एक बड़ी पीड़ा है जिसे समझने की आवश्यकता है।

श्री प्रफुल्ल पटेल : चेयरमैन सर, चूंकि क्वेश्चन अलग-अलग तरीके से रखा जा रहा है, मैं इतना ही कहूंगा कि जहां तक हमारे मंत्रालय का सवाल है, भारत हैवी इलैक्ट्रिकल्स बिजली के यंत्र बनाता है, मशीनें बनाता है और बिहार में बिजली के जो कारखाने लग रहे हैं, वे सारे बीएचईएल के माध्यम से लगाए जा रहे हैं, लेकिन जहां तक industrialization का सवाल है, जैसा कि पासवान जी ने पूछा, अभी तारिक अनवर साहब ने पूछा, रवि शंकर प्रसाद जी भी हाथ ऊंचा कर रहे हैं, तो सभी की यह मंशा है और मैं समझता हूं कि वहां की राज्य सरकार के मुख्य मंत्री और वहां के आप सभी वरिष्ठ सांसद बैठकर इस बारे में चर्चा करें।

प्रश्न संख्या — 543 (क्रमागत)

फिर जो कुछ भी हम कर सकते हैं, हम बिहार की प्रगति के लिए करने को तैयार हैं।

श्री तारिक अनवर : बिहार में प्राइवेट सेक्टर क्यों नहीं जा रहा है?

श्री शिवानन्द तिवारी : सभापति महोदय, आजादी के बाद से बिहार एक इंटरनल कॉलोनी के रूप में बना हुआ है। महोदय, बिहार की जो स्थिति है, उसका कारण इसका आंतरिक उपनिवेश होना है। महोदय, रेलवे ने वर्ष 1994 तक freight equalization की नीति चलायी जिसके चलते बिहार में सिर्फ आयरन ओर के मामले में 1 लाख 10 हजार करोड़ रुपए से ज्यादा का नुकसान हुआ है। महोदय, आज भी वहां का C-D ratio नेशनल एवरेज के मुकाबले 32-33 परसेंट है। हमारे यहां का पैसा डवलप्ड स्टेट्स में जा रहा है और जहां हमारी पूंजी जा रही है, वहां हमारे यहां के लोग जा रहे हैं। फिर वहां उनके साथ बदसलूकी होती है। यह हालत हमारे बिहार की है और आज भी वहां इसलिए पूंजी का निवेश नहीं हो रहा है चूंकि वहां बिजली नहीं है। आप देखेंगे कि बिहार में per capita electricity consumption lowest है। इसके बावजूद केन्द्र सरकार हमको कोयला नहीं दे रही है, कोल लिंकेज तक नहीं दे रही है जिससे हम अपने यहां बिजली व्यवस्था में सुधार करें और अपने यहां इनवेस्टमेंट ला सकें। इसलिए मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से जानना चाहूंगा कि फर्स्ट फाइव ईयर प्लान से बिहार में per capita investment lowest रहा है और वहां पब्लिक

प्रश्न संख्या — 543 (क्रमागत)

इनवेस्टमेंट भी और राज्यों के मुकाबले लगभग शून्य रहा है तो बिहार में पब्लिक इनवेस्टमेंट हो, क्या ऐसी कोई योजना भारत सरकार की है?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let me clarify one thing, hon. Members. Supplementaries can only be asked within the ambit of the main question. It would simplify our working and save a lot of time if we were to observe this. Please go ahead. (Interruptions)

DR. CHANDAN MITRA: Sir, I want to ask the hon. Minister...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, you cannot. He is replying to another question. (Interruptions)

डा० चंदन मित्रा : सर, अगर उनके अख्तियार में कुछ नहीं, उनके पास पैसा भी नहीं है ..(व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is a statement. It is not a question. Please go ahead, Mr. Minister.

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Sir, I seek your protection here while I am attempting to answer questions. I have no issues in trying to satisfy the queries raised by hon. Members, but they will have to be within the purview of what I am looking after. Notwithstanding that, I would be more than happy, as I tell all the hon. Members, if we have a small

प्रश्न संख्या — 543 (क्रमागत)

get-together of all the hon. Members from Bihar, along with the State Government, and our Department and we can try and see what is the best way forward. I do not have any other recipe.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is a good suggestion.

(FD. By 1J/KGG)

Kgg-klg/1j/11.40

SHRI N.K. SINGH: Sir, with your permission, I would like to raise a question.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, you cannot raise it. (Interruptions) May I suggest something? The Minister has offered a discussion. Please give a notice for discussion. Let there be a proper discussion on a subject of considerable importance.

SHRI N.K. SINGH: Sir, I have a procedural point-of-order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You cannot have a point-of-order in the Question Hour. (Interruptions)

SHRI N.K. SINGH: Sir, I wish to draw a point for your kind attention. The questioner should not be penalized by the fact that this question has been wrongly allocated to the wrong Minister. On this question,

प्रश्न संख्या — 543 (क्रमागत)

the Chairman of the Planning Commission was here and the hon. Finance Minister was here. It was more appropriate for the Secretariat to put this question to the right Minister instead of burdening the Minister who was replying on a matter on which he had no say. I think, this is the fault of the manner in which this question has been allocated wrongly to the wrong Minister.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is not the job of the Secretariat to come in for this work. The Members know where to direct the questions. The question is worded in a particular manner. Had it been worded differently, I am sure, the Government would have replied to it differently. But, if you read the question, then that is the plausible answer that is possible. Supplementaries on that answer can be asked. But we cannot make it into a debating exercise.

Now, Question No.544, please. (Interruptions) We can discuss that separately, this is not the time.

SHRI BHAGAT SINGH KOSHYARI: Sir, there is nothing wrong in that question. (Interruptions)

प्रश्न संख्या – 543 (क्रमागत)

MR. CHAIRMAN: These are theological questions and we cannot discuss that. Please sit down. Q.No. 544 now. बैठ जाइए, प्लीज। क्वेश्चन 544, ... (व्यवधान).. आप अपने साथी को सवाल पूछने दीजिए, प्लीज।

प्रश्न संख्या — 544

श्री जय प्रकाश नारायण सिंह: मान्यवर, मेरा क्वेश्चन था कि नेशनल इंस्टीट्यूट ऑफ एलर्जी एंड इन्फेक्शन डिज़ीज़िस के अनुसार साइनेसाइटिस भारत में कितना फैला हुआ है, इसका आंकड़ा क्या है? सरकार का जो जवाब आया है, उसमें जवाब यह दिया है कि इसका सही आंकड़ा हमारे पास उपलब्ध नहीं है। हमारे भारत देश में यह डिज़ीज़िस फैल रही हैं और हमारे मंत्रालय को इसकी सही जानकारी नहीं है। दूसरे पैराग्राफ में मंत्री जी यह कहते हैं कि उच्च व्यापता के कारणों के बारे में व्यापक अध्ययन नहीं किया गया है। यह डिज़ीज क्या है, कितने लोग पीड़ित हैं, कहां-कहां पीड़ित हैं? तो बताया गया कि शहरी क्षेत्रों में 7-8 प्रतिशत के अध्ययन से अनुमान लगाया जा सकता है। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी और सरकार से यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि जब यह बीमारी पूरे व्यापक तौर पर फैल जाएगी, क्या तब इसका इलाज होगा?

श्री गुलाम नबी आजाद: सर, जैसा हमने उत्तर में बताया है, यह नेशनल इंस्टीट्यूट ऑफ एलर्जी एंड इन्फेक्शन डिज़ीजेस की सर्वे हमारी कण्ट्री की नहीं है, बाहर की है। यह उन्होंने एक एस्टीमेट बताया है, जो कोई पापुलेशन बेस्ड नहीं है। इसलिए हमने कहा है कि जहां तक हमारे पूरे देश का सवाल है, तो पूरे देश में इस तरह से कोई सर्वे नहीं किया गया है, जो पापुलेशन बेस्ड हो। अलबता दो-तीन रीजन्स में किया गया है और वह सेंट्रल पॉल्युशन बोर्ड के द्वारा किया गया है। दिल्ली में 2002 से लेकर 2005 तक एक ऐसा सर्वे किया गया था कि

प्रश्न संख्या 544 (क्रमागत)

हवा में कितना पॉल्यूशन है, तो दिल्ली की अर्बन पापुलेशन में 7 से 9 प्रतिशत लोगों में यह पाया गया कि यहां हवा में पॉल्यूशन की वजह से साइनेसाइटिस होता है।

(1के/एनबी पर जारी)

NB/TDB/1K/11.45

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद (क्रमागत) : विशेष रूप से यह मानूसन के दौरान होता है। इस सर्वे के मुताबिक 3 से 4 प्रतिशत बच्चे इससे पीड़ित हैं। एक और सर्वे Central Pollution Control Board ने किया था। उन्होंने अध्ययन किया था कि fuel की वजह से क्या असर पड़ता है? उन्होंने नॉर्थ इंडिया और साउथ इंडिया में इस बात की स्टडी की कि चूल्हे की वजह से जो धुंआ निकलता है, उसके कारण तकरीबन 25.9 प्रतिशत केसेज़ में sinusitis होता है। जहां पर LPG इस्तेमाल की जाती है, जहां चूल्हा इस्तेमाल नहीं किया जाता है, वहां पर 14.5 प्रतिशत केसेज़ में sinusitis होता है।

श्री जय प्रकाश नारायण सिंह : सभापति जी, sinusitis की रोकथाम कैसे हो और इसका इलाज क्या है, इसके जवाब में मंत्री जी कहते हैं कि चूल्हे, कल-कारखाने, गाड़ी के धुंए से यह बीमारी होती है। जिन लोगों ने कभी चूल्हे का मुंह नहीं देखा, उनको यह बीमारी कैसे हो गई? हमारी माननीय सदस्या आगे बैठी हुई हैं, वे कहती हैं कि उन्होंने कभी चूल्हा नहीं देखा, लेकिन वे इस बीमारी से

प्रश्न संख्या 544 (क्रमागत)

ग्रसित हो गई ... (व्यवधान) जिन लोगों ने कभी चूल्हे का मुंह नहीं देखा, उनको यह बीमारी कैसे हो गई, मुझे इसकी जानकारी चाहिए?... (व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Order, please. (Interruptions) आप सवाल पूछ रहे हैं या नहीं? (व्यवधान)

श्री जय प्रकाश नारायण सिंह : सभापति जी, यहां प्रदूषण के संदर्भ में चूल्हे की बात हो रही है। क्या प्रदूषण को शुद्ध करने के लिए और गांवों से चूल्हों को हटाने के लिए स्वास्थ्य मंत्रालय कुछ कर रहा है?

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, these are two different questions, but I am ready to reply both. I have said about the smoke only on the basis of a particular survey which was conducted by the Central Pollution Control Board in Delhi, in Southern part of the country and in the Northern part of the country. But there are other common causes also for sinusitis; these are not the only causes. The other causes are, nasal passage abnormality, such as, deviated nasal septum or nasal polyps, asthma, allergic conditions, indoor pollution, pollution due to pharmaceuticals, pollution due to diesel and petrol, and dust particles.

प्रश्न संख्या 544 (क्रमागत)

Sinusitis is also caused due to primary and secondary tobacco smoke and allergy associated with it and fungal infection. So, these are multiple reasons for sinusitis. There is not just one reason for it. One reason which I have mentioned is on the basis of the survey conducted. The other part of the question was...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One question, please.

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, it is related to that. The other part of the question was, as to what steps the Government of India has taken in this regard. The Government of India is not just the Health Ministry. On this issue, I think, the entire country shall have to rise to the occasion because it is not the Health Ministry alone, which is concerned with it. We are aware of the increasing number of cars and other vehicles across the country and the pollution caused by them. Yet, I would like to say that so far as the Ministry of Health and other Ministries are concerned, there is ban on smoking — I said about it in the beginning; both primary and ‘secondary smokers’ are affected by this. One who is smoking is called ‘primary smoker’, and all those who are sitting there are called ‘secondary smokers’ or ‘passive smokers’.

प्रश्न संख्या 544 (क्रमागत)

They are also affected by it. Then, the Government of Delhi and other Governments have taken measures to reduce vehicular pollution by introduction of CNG. Some measures have also been taken to reduce indoor pollution by replacing the biomass-based cooking, by improving the design of houses, *chulhas*, and also through introduction of cooking gas. So, significant measures have been taken in factories to deal with exhaust system.

(Followed by 11-GS)

GS-KLS/11.50/1L

श्री हुसैन दलवाई: सर, मिनिस्टर साहब ने बहुत सारे उत्तर दिए हैं कि किस वजह से sinusitis होता है, लेकिन उसमें धूल का उपचार उन्होंने किया नहीं है। धूल की वजह से बड़े पैमाने पर ये बीमारी होती है। क्या धूल को कम करने के लिए मंत्री जी की कोई स्कीम है?

श्री गुलाम नबी आजाद : सर, धूल कम करने के लिए तो इनको अल्लाह की तरफ नमाज़ ज्यादा पढ़नी पड़ेगी, ताकि जब ज्यादा गर्मी हो जाए, तो बारिश हो जाए और धूल बैठ जाए। वैसे धूल भी कारण है, डस्ट भी है और hay भी है, जो भूसा है, उससे ज्यादा होता है, बल्कि धूल से उतना नहीं होता है।

प्रश्न संख्या 544 (क्रमागत)

श्री अवतार सिंह करीमपुरी : सर, मंत्री जी ने जो मैजर्स initiate किए हैं, उनके बारे में उन्होंने अपने उत्तर में बताया है, खासतौर से ban on smoking and other efforts of tobacco control programme. इसके अलावा उन्होंने तीन और प्वाइंट्स दिए हैं। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि इसका out come क्या है? क्या सरकार ने कोई ऐसी स्टडी करवाई है कि जो कम्पेन लांच किया गया है, उसका कोई पॉजिटिव रिजल्ट आ रहा है?

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सर, मैंने पहले ही बताया कि बहुत सारे contributory factors हैं और इसके लिए Environment मिनिस्ट्री बहुत कदम उठा रही है। स्वास्थ्य मंत्रालय को जितने कदम उठाने हैं, उतने कदम वह उठा रहा है। लेकिन जो Environment में पॉल्युशन है, वह तकरीबन 9 से 10 प्रतिशत है ही, बाकी हम कहें 25 परसेंट, तो वह एडीशनल 10-15 परसेंट contributory हो सकता है, लेकिन 8 से 9 परसेंट हमारे देश में original पॉल्युशन है, जिसके अलग-अलग कारण हैं, धुआं है, पेट्रोकेमिकल्स हैं, गैस है, ये तमाम चीजें हैं, इसके लिए तो समाज को और पूरे देश को काम करना पड़ेगा, कोई एक मंत्रालय या दो मंत्रालय उससे निपट नहीं सकते।

SHRI TARUN VIJAY: Sir, I am really surprised to see that while there is no data, no study and the hon. Minister has not been able to quote the primary source and the secondary source. Only a news item

प्रश्न संख्या 544 (क्रमागत)

appearing about the National Institute, which is based in the United States, is being quoted by India's Health Minister about a disease which is so much prevalent in my Himalayan area, in Uttarakhand, in Nagaland, in Arunachal and in Himachal. I would like to ask the hon. Minister, Sir, if at all, this kind of a cursory answer is given which says 'ban on smoking and other efforts'. This takes care of hundred other diseases. What exactly is being done to check the prevalence of this disease which is so much spreading in the Himalayan areas especially? Has the Minister any data, any Indian data, any data collected by any Indian analysts or his Ministry officers who can tell us that this is the quantum of the disease in Uttarakhand, especially in Bazpur, Kashipur areas, in Nagaland, in Delhi, in Himachal Pradesh and in Arunachal Pradesh? These are the areas which are suffering from this disease. Do we have to have the United States of America's report to address the Indian diseases?

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have asked your question. ...(Interruptions)..

Let the answer be given.

प्रश्न संख्या 544 (क्रमागत)

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, I think, I had said in the beginning and I think, the hon. Member could not listen to that...(Interruptions).. Please, you have had your say. ... (Interruptions)..

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, please. ... (Interruptions).. आप बैठ जाइए, आप जबाव सुन लीजिए। ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: It is not the Ministry or the Minister quoting the external data. It is the question put by the hon. Member that this is the estimated number. So, while answering this, I have said this is a number mentioned by a particular agency, which is not a population based but it is an estimate. I have already said that the Central Pollution Control Board has carried out an epidemiological study to find the effects of the pollution on human health.

(Contd by 1M/PK)

-KLS/PK/11.55/1M

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD (CONTD.): Sir, I have mentioned about Delhi. I have already mentioned about the North and the South. I have also said that it is not only the Ministry of Health, but the Central

प्रश्न संख्या 544 (क्रमागत)

and State Pollution Control Boards are also involved in this. The Ministry of Environment, both at the national and at the State levels are involved in this.

(Ends)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Now, Question No. 545.

..(Interruptions)..

SHRI TARUN VIJAY: Sir, the Minister has given wrong information.

..(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Look, if you have a problem with the answer given, please give it in writing. ..(Interruptions).. Please Mr. Tarun Vijay. Now, Kumar Deepak Das.

Q. No. 545

SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS: Sir, in the reply, the hon. Minister has given some of the glaring examples of offenders in our North-Eastern Region, including the coal sector, oil sector and the cement sector. Sir, this is being done in connivance with the State Pollution Control Boards. The State Pollution Control Board is also involved in this.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please put your question.

SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS: Sir, I am coming to that. Recently, the National Green Tribunal has also submitted a report to the Government of India about various anti-environmental activities in the National Parks of our State, including Kaziranga. Not a single such offender is included in the list. There exists unchecked growth of hospitality in close confines of the park. Quarrying and mining activities are being carried out there. There are some environmental offenders. So, what steps have you taken in this regard?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, there are very specific rules about offences in National Parks. Environmental offender is a different kind of question. As far as the National Parks are concerned, we implement the rules very strictly. Even recently, there was a news

Q. No. 545 (Contd.)

report, in another State, of one of our Forest Guards being killed by tourists. We take these issues very strictly. Rules in National Parks are enforced very stringently. If the hon. Member wants more information, I will be happy to share it with him, ..(Interruptions).. This question relates to environmental offenders.

SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS: Sir, my second supplementary is regarding construction of the Subansiri Hydro Project, where the Ministry of Environment and Forests has given the green signal for continuation of the work. Sir, a minimum of three metre depth should be maintained in the dolphin habitat around Brahmaputra and other rivers. For survival of such species, what steps have you taken? There is a need for taking steps for preserving Dolphins. The minimum water depth has not been maintained in the construction of the Subansiri Hydro Project.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, with regard to each of the Dam projects in the North-East, there are specific steps for wildlife management; that are laid down in the rules of environment clearance and wildlife clearance. These are all considered by the

Q. No. 545 (Contd.)

National Board for Wildlife. Specific rules are laid down. Sir, the dolphin has been declared a 'National Aquatic Animal.' We are extremely conscious of the need to preserve the dolphins. We will continue to take steps to make sure that there is no danger to any dolphin in any area, either in the Subansiri area or in any other area. It is not the depth of the dam alone, it is the entire run of the river that we need to see.

SHRI SATISH CHANDRA MISRA: Sir, what is the reason? The hon. Minister said that the National Environment Assessment and Monitoring Authority has not been established till today. When are you going to establish it? Whether the reason is that, mainly, the ONGC, Hindustan Oil Corporation and all other State-owned Corporations are offenders, as per you. Is this the reason that you are not establishing this Authority, which you just mentioned? When are you going to establish it?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, it is not like that. I would like to assure the hon. Member that that is not the reason. Already, the NGT has been established and we are in the process of setting up the

Q. No. 545 (Contd.)

infrastructure for the NGT. You will appreciate that we have shared with you exactly who are the offenders, never mind whether they are PSUs or whoever it is. Steps are being taken against whoever is the offender.

SHRI SATISH CHANDRA MISRA: But when are you going to establish it?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: I am telling you. Regarding NEAMA, the reason is, it is a very large infrastructure.

(Contd. by 1N/PB)

-PK/PB/1n/12.00

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (CONTD.): We need a large number of people to create this infrastructure. The matter has been sent to the Finance Department. The matter is under consideration. The hon. Finance Minister is also here. We need that infrastructure to be set up; people should be appointed. It is just a matter of putting the infrastructure in place with the formalities and the expenditure approved. ...(Interruptions)... There is no other reason. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question Hour is over.

(Ends)

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, I lay on the Table —

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health) Notification No. G.S.R. 899 (E), dated the 27th December, 2011, publishing the Drugs and Cosmetics (3rd Amendment) Rules, 2011, under Section 38 of the Drugs and Cosmetics Act, 1940

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Jawaharlal Institute of Post-Graduate Medical Education and Research (JIPMER), Puducherry, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

{ **THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair.** }

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Heavy Industries and Public Enterprises) and the Engineering Projects (India) Limited (EPI), for the year 2012-13.
- (ii) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

of India (Ministry of Heavy Industries & Public Enterprises, Department of Heavy Industry) and Cement Corporation of India Limited (CCI), for the year 2012-13.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, I lay on the Table, under Section 26 of the Environment (Protection) Act, 1986, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Environment and Forests:—

- (1) S.O. 2866 (E), dated the 27th December, 2011, amending Notification No. S.O. 489 (E), dated the 30th April, 2003, to substitute certain entries in the original Notification.
- (2) G.S.R. 277 (E), dated the 31st March, 2012, publishing the Environment (Protection) (Third Amendment) Rules, 2012.

SHRI NAMO NARAIN MEENA: Sir, I lay on the Table —

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Economic Affairs) Notification No. LAD-NRO/GN/2011-12/38/4290, dated the 21st February, 2012, publishing the Securities and Exchange Board of India (Mutual Funds) (Amendment) Regulations, 2012, under Section 30 of the Securities and Exchange Board of India Act, 1992.

II. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Economic Affairs) Notification No. G.S.R. 257 (E), dated the 28th March, 2012, publishing the Coinage of the Sixty Rupees and Five Rupees coined to commemorate the occasion of the 60th Year of India Government Mint, Kolkata, Rule, 2012, under sub-section (5) of Section 24 of the Coinage Act, 2011.

SHRI NAMO NARAIN MEENA: Sir, I lay on the Table —

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Revenue), 1962, under Section 159 of the Customs Act, along with Explanatory Memoranda :—

S.O. 338 (E), dated the 27th February, 2012, regarding exchange rate of conversion of foreign currency into Indian currency or vice-versa for the purpose of assessment of imported and export goods.

S.O. 350 (E), dated the 29th February, 2012, amending Notification No. S.O. 748 (E), dated the 3rd August, 2001, to substitute certain entries in the original Notification.

S.O. 426 (E), dated the 15th March, 2012, amending Notification No. S.O. 748 (E), dated the 3rd August, 2001, to substitute certain entries in the original Notification.

G.S.R. 232 (E), dated the 20th March, 2012, amending Notification No. G.S.R. 185 (E), dated the 17th March, 2012, to substitute certain entries in the original Notification.

S.O. 522 (E), dated the 21st March, 2012, amending Notification No. S.O. 748 (E), dated the 3rd August, 2001, to substitute certain entries in the original Notification.

S.O. 564 (E), dated the 22nd March, 2012, amending Notification No. S.O. 748 (E), dated the 3rd August, 2001, to substitute certain entries in the original Notification.

G.S.R. 258 (E), dated the 28th March, 2012, amending Notification No. G.S.R. 185 (E), dated the 17th March, 2012,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

to substitute certain entries in the original Notification.

S.O. 625 (E), dated the 28th March, 2012, regarding exchange rate of conversion of foreign currency into Indian currency or vice-versa for the purpose of assessment of imported and export goods.

G.S.R. 273 (E), dated the 30th March, 2012, amending Notification No. G.S.R. 185 (E), dated the 17th March, 2012, to substitute certain entries in the original Notification.

S.O. 703 (E), dated the 30th March, 2012, amending Notification No. S.O. 970 (E), dated the 31st August, 2004, to insert certain entries in the original Notification.

S.O. 704 (E), dated the 30th March, 2012, amending Notification No. S.O. 748 (E), dated the 3rd August, 2001, to substitute certain entries in the original Notification.

G.S.R. 284 (E), dated the 4th April, 2012, prohibiting import into India and export out of India of hazardous wastes specified in Schedule VI to the Hazardous Waste (Management, Handling and Transboundary Movement) Rules, 2008.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Revenue), under Section 296 of the Income-Tax Act, 1961, along with Explanatory Memoranda:—

S.O. 227 (E), dated the 6th February, 2012, publishing the Income-Tax (2nd Amendment) Rules, 2012.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

S.O. 343 (E), dated the 28th February, 2012, specifying the National Skill Development Corporation (NSDC), as a body constituted by the Central Government in respect of the specified income arising to NSDC.

S.O. 344 (E), dated the 28th February, 2012, specifying the Competition Commission of India, as a body constituted by the Central Government in respect of the specified income arising to the Competition Commission of India.

S.O. 626 (E), dated the 28th March, 2012, publishing the Income — Tax (3rd Amendment) Rules, 2012.

III. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Revenue), under sub-section (2) of Section 38 of the Central Excise Act, 1944, along with Explanatory Memoranda:—

G.S.R. 220 (E), dated the 19th March, 2012, amending Notification No. G.S.R. 117 (E), dated the 1st March, 2011, to substitute certain entries in the original Notification.

G.S.R. 225 (E), dated the 19th March, 2012, publishing the Pan Masala Packing Machines (Capacity Determination and Collection of Duty) Second Amendment Rules, 2012.

G.S.R. 226 (E), dated the 19th March, 2012, publishing the Chewing Tobacco and Un-manufactured Tobacco Packing Machines (Capacity Determination and Collection of Duty) Second Amendment Rules, 2012.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

G.S.R. 253 (E), dated the 27th March, 2012, publishing the CENVAT Credit (Fourth Amendment) Rules, 2012.

G.S.R. 275 (E), dated the 30th March, 2012, amending Notification No. G.S.R. 163 (E), dated the 17th March, 2012, to substitute certain entries in the original Notification.

G.S.R. 276 (E), dated the 30th March, 2012, amending Notification No. G.S.R. 169 (E), dated the 17th March, 2012, to substitute certain entries in the original Notification.

IV. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Revenue), under sub-section (7) of Section 9A of the Customs Tariff Act, 1975, along with Explanatory Memoranda:—

G.S.R. 231 (E), dated the 20th March, 2012, amending Notification No. G.S.R. 798 (E), dated the 31st December, 2007, to add certain entries in the original Notification.

G.S.R. 285 (E), dated the 4th April, 2012, rescinding Notification No. G.S.R. 14 (E), dated the 13th January, 2012.

G.S.R. 286 (E), dated the 4th April, 2012, seeking to levy definitive anti-dumping duty on imports of phosphonic acid of all grades and all concentrations originating in, or exported from, Israel and Taiwan and imported into India.

G.S.R. 287 (E), dated the 4th April, 2012, amending Notification No. G.S.R. 567 (E), dated the 29th August, 2007, to add certain entries in the original Notification.

G.S.R. 290 (E), dated the 12th April, 2012, amending

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Notification No. G.S.R. 683 (E), dated the 30th October, 2007, to add certain entries in the original Notification.

SHRI S. GANDHISELVAN: Sir, I lay on the Table —

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of AYUSH) Notification No. 12-6/2001-CCH (Pt.), dated the 14th October, 2011, publishing the Establishment of New Medical College, (Opening of New or Higher Course of Study or Training and Increase of Admission Capacity by a Medical College) Regulations, 2011, under sub-section (2) of Section 33 of Homoeopathy Central Council Act, 1973, along with delay statement.

II. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of AYUSH) Notification No. F. 12-6/2001-CCH (Pt.) 25500, dated the 21st February, 2012, publishing Corrigendum for making certain corrections in Notification No. 12-6/2001-CCH (Pt.), dated the 28th September, 2011 of the Central Council of Homoeopathy.

III. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Central Council for Research in Yoga and Naturopathy, New Delhi, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (i) (a) above.
- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Morarji Desai National

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Institute of Yoga (MDNIY), New Delhi, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (ii) (a) above.

SHRI R.P.N.SINGH: Sir, I lay on the Table —

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas Notification F. No. M(C)/2012, dated the 22nd March, 2012, publishing the Petroleum and Natural Gas Regulatory Board (Determination of Network Tariff for City or Local Natural Gas Distribution Networks and Compression Charge for CNG) Amendment Regulations, 2012, under Section 62 of the Petroleum and Natural Gas Regulatory Board Act, 2006.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas) and the Hindustan Petroleum Corporation Limited (HPCL), for the year 2012-13.
- (ii) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas) and the Indian Oil Corporation Limited (IOCL), for the year 2012-13.

SHRI SUDIP BANDYOPADHYAY: Sir, I lay on the Table —

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare Notification No. G.S.R. 80 (E), dated the 9th February, 2012, publishing the Pre-conception and Pre-natal Diagnostic

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Techniques (Prohibition of Sex Selection) Amendment Rules, 2012, under Section 34 of Pre-conception and Pre-natal Diagnostic Techniques (Prohibition of Sex Selection) Act, 1994.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the MNJ Institute of Oncology, Regional Cancer Centre, Hyderabad, for the year 2008-09, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Annual Report and Accounts of the MNJ Institute of Oncology, Regional Cancer Centre, Hyderabad, for the year 2009-10, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (i) (a) and (b) above.
- (ii) (a) Annual Reports and Accounts of the Jansankhya Sthirata Kosh (National Population Stabilisation Fund), New Delhi, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (ii) (a) above.

SHRI NAMO NARAIN MEENA: Sir, I lay on the Table, under clause (1) of article 151 of the Constitution, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports:—

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the year ended March, 2012: No.4 of 2012-13: Union Government — Department of Space — on hybrid satellite digital multimedia broadcasting service agreement with Devas; and

Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the year ended March, 2011: No.32 of 2011-12 and No. 3 of 2012-13 - Railways Finances: Union Government (Railways) and Appropriation Accounts of Railways — Parts — I and II including Annexure — G, for the year 2010-11.

(Ends)

**STATEMENT OF DEPARTMENT RELATED PARLIAMENTARY
STANDING COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL JUSTICE AND
EMPOWERMENT**

SHRI PRAVEEN RASHTRAPAL (GUJARAT) : Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Statement of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment on Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in Chapter-I and final replies in respect of recommendations contained in Chapter-V of the Thirteenth Report of the Committee (2010-11) (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Fourth Report of the Committee (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants (2010-11)' of the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment.

(Ends)

MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION OF CHAIR**REPORTED PLIGHT OF WIDOW OF A RENOWNED AIR
COMMENTATOR LATE SHRI MELVILLE DE MELLOW**

SHRI SHANTARAM NAIK (GOA): Sir, as a nation, it is our duty to recognise the talent in our citizens, and it is all the more necessary that the talent of individuals is not forgotten when the talented persons are no more alive.

Melville de Mellow carried an iconic stature as a commentator and newscaster in the All India Radio.

He created a record by his moving non-stop account for seven hours from a van of All India Radio on Mahatma Gandhi's last journey from Birla House to Rajghat in 1948.

His radio commentary of India-Pakistan Hockey Match was an event to remember.

His commentary of Republic Day Parade, rendered by him for several years, is remembered, even today, decades after he passed away at the age of 76 in 1989.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

The widow of this most talented citizen of India, Mrs. Coralie Emma De Mellow, aged 95, is longing to get a paltry sum of Rs. 1500 given to her by Prasar Bharati.

It is strange that the pension that was granted to her in March, 2008 was discontinued on the grounds that there was no provision to that effect.

There was also a talk of Prasar Bharti's intention to give Mrs. De Mellow a lump sum amount, but the same was not materialised. The lady herself is not making much efforts as she is 95 years of age and is herself helped by some well-meaning people to remain alive, and, secondly, she feels awkward to beg with the Government in view of the great service rendered by her husband to the nation, of which she is extremely proud of.

In the circumstances, I urge upon the Government, particularly, Prasar Bharati, to immediately sanction a reasonable lump sum amount to Mrs. De Mellow and help her to live with dignity in her last days. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

ASC-SKC/12.05/10

NEED FOR GOVERNMENT INTERVENTION TO LOOK INTO PROBLEMS BEING FACED BY INDIAN LABOURERS IN ANGOLA

श्री पुरुषोत्तम खोडाभाई रूपाला (गुजरात) : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से इस सदन का और भारत सरकार का ध्यान इस बात की ओर आकृष्ट करना चाहता हूँ कि दक्षिण अफ्रीका के अंगोला में 1200 भारतीयों को बंधक बनाया गया है, जिनमें 40 आदमी गुजरात के हैं। हमारे देश के कुछ लोग वहाँ आपनी रोजी-रोटी कमाने के लिए गए थे। गुजरात के पेटलाड के विजय नामक एक आदमी ने वहाँ से बात की और यह बताया कि वहाँ पर एक महीने से हड़ताल चल रही है। वहाँ की सिमेंट कम्पनी के मालिक ने स्थानीय पुलिस के साथ मिलकर, लोगों पर फायरिंग की है। वे लोग अपनी जान बचाने के लिए जंगल में मारे-मारे फिर रहे हैं। हम टेलीविजन के चैनल्स पर उनके परिवारों को क्रन्दन करते हुए देख रहे हैं। मुझे यह बताते हुए बहुत दुख हो रहा है कि यह मामला मीडिया में 15 दिनों से छाया हुआ है, मैंने भारत सरकार की तरफ से किसी को भी इस बारे में कुछ कहते हुए नहीं सुना है। भारत के 1200 लोग अफ्रीका की धरती पर बंधक बने हुए हैं और वे हम लोगों से गुहार लगा रहे हैं। गुजरात के मुख्य मंत्री श्री नरेन्द्र मोदी ने प्राइम मिनिस्टर को पत्र लिखकर सारी बातों से अवगत करवाया है। आन्ध्र प्रदेश का एक लड़का घायल हो गया है

और एक बेंगलुरु का आदमी भी बंधक बनाया गया है। इस देश के 1200 आदमी यह उम्मीद लगाकर बैठे हैं कि हम कभी दूरदर्शन पर या मीडिया में, भारत सरकार के किसी मंत्री को इस बारे में यह कहते हुए देखें कि हम इस इश्यु पर यह कर रहे हैं।

सर, मैं यह बताना चाहता हूँ कि जो वहां पर 1200 आदमी फंसे हुए हैं, उनके पास पोर्ट जब्त कर लिए गए हैं। यदि वे आना भी चाहें, तो बिना पासपोर्ट के कैसे आ सकते हैं? वे लोग अपनी जान बचाने के लिए जंगल में मारे-मारे फिर रहे हैं। उन लोगों को खाने की कोई सुविधा नहीं है। वे लोग जंगली पशुओं के बीच में बिना खाने के, बिना पानी के अपनी जान बचाते फिर रहे हैं। अभी तक भी यहां पर उस बारे में कुछ नहीं हो रहा है। अध्यक्ष जी, आप से और इस सदन के सभी सदस्यों से मेरी प्रार्थना है कि यदि भारत का कोई नागरिक विदेश की धरती पर इस तरह से बंधक की हालत में है, तो हम सभी सदस्यों का फर्ज बनता है कि सरकार को मजबूर करें, ताकि वह इस विषय में कुछ काम करे और हमें स्टेटस दे। 1200 परिवार सरकार से उम्मीद लगाए बैठे हैं, इसलिए सरकार उनको आश्वासन दे। यहां पर आकर राज्य के मुख्य मंत्री भी गुहार लगा रहे हैं, फिर भी उनके प्रति सरकार कोई प्रतिक्रिया नहीं दिखा रही है। ...(व्यवधान)..

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो.पी.जे.कुरियन) : आपका टाइम खत्म हो गया है।

...(व्यवधान).. आपका टाइम खत्म हो गया है। ...(व्यवधान).. बैठिए, बैठिए।

श्री पुरुषोत्तम खोडाभाई रूपाला : *

(समाप्त)

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Shrimati Smriti Zubin Irani to associate. (Interruptions) You may associate. The next speaker is Shri Kumar Deepak Das. (Interruptions)

श्री अविनाश राय खन्ना (पंजाब) : सर, माननीय सदस्य ने जो विषय उठाया है, मैं उससे अपने को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ। ...(व्यवधान).. Sir, this is a serious matter. सरकार को ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): It would not go on record. (Interruptions) बैठिए, बैठिए। ..(व्यवधान).. Shri Kumar Deepak Das. (Interruptions) आप लोग बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)..

* Not recorded

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री राजीव शुक्ल) : माननीय सदस्य ने जो मुद्दा उठाया है, यह निश्चित रूप से बहुत महत्वपूर्ण मुद्दा है। अंगोला की घटना के लिए हम सभी चिंतित हैं। मैं विदेश मंत्री जी को सदन की भावना से तत्काल अवगत करवाता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

THE VICE- CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The Minister is very considerate. (Interruptions) Please sit down. (Interruptions)

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : मंत्री जी यहां आकर तत्काल जवाब दें। .. (व्यवधान)...

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

THE VICE- CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Shri Kumar Deepak Das. (Interruptions) That is over. (Interruptions) Nothing will go on record. (Interruptions) The next speaker has been called. (Interruptions) आप लोग बैठिए। ...**(व्यवधान)..**

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : अध्यक्ष जी, यह तो गोल-मोल करने वाली चीज हो गई। ...**(व्यवधान)..**

THE VICE- CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): He has said whatever he could have said. (Interruptions) ठीक है। ...**(व्यवधान)...**

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : सर, यह हिन्दुस्तान के 1200 आदमियों का मामला है। अब तक भारत सरकार ने कोई कार्यवाही नहीं की है। अगर सभी सदस्य चाहते हैं तो ...**(व्यवधान)..**

THE VICE- CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): He has said whatever he could have said.

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : आप अभी बुलाइए।

THE VICE- CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No. (Interruptions) Mr. Agrawal, Government has taken note of it. He has said it. That is enough. (Interruptions) बैठिए।

(contd. at 1p/hk)

HK-LT/1p/12.10

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) (CONTD.): This is no discussion time. ...(Interruptions)... If you want a discussion, give another notice. ...(Interruptions)... This is Zero Hour. If you want a discussion, give another notice. ...(Interruptions)... आप बैठिए, अग्रवाल जी, यह जीरो ऑवर है, discussion के लिए दूसरा नोटिस दीजिए..(व्यवधान)..रूपाला जी बैठिए...(व्यवधान).. Not allowed. ...(Interruptions)... मैंने बोल दिया है..(व्यवधान)..Government has taken note of it. That is enough. ...(Interruptions)... Kumar Deepak Das. ...(Interruptions)... Nothing will go on record. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री विनय कटियार : *

श्री पुरुषोत्तम खोडाभाई रूपाला : *

श्रीमती जया बच्चन : *

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे.कुरियन) : मैडम जया बच्चन जी, दूसरा नोटिस दीजिए..(व्यवधान).. बैठिए; Let the Minister say. ...(Interruptions)... आप बैठिए..(व्यवधान)..मैंने बोल दिया है..(व्यवधान)..

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री राजीव शुक्ल) : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, हमारे साथ प्रवासी भारतीय कार्य मंत्री श्री वायालार रवि जी हैं, मैं उनसे अनुरोध करूंगा कि वे इसका जवाब दें।

THE MINISTER OF OVERSEAS INDIAN AFFAIRS (SHRI VAYALAR RAVI): Sir, two days ago, I have seen a report on the statement of the Chief Minister of Gujarat, Shri Narendra Modi, regarding some forty Indians in Angola facing problems. He has written a letter to the Minister of External Affairs or somebody else; not to me. As soon as I saw this, we immediately sent a letter to the Ambassador in Angola to get a detailed report. I could not go to office and find out whether that

*** Not recorded.**

report has come or not. We are in touch with the Ambassador. We will take all necessary steps to give all possible assistance to them. Earlier also, we have brought people back by paying money from our own funds. So, I can tell the hon. Members that as soon as I get the report, we will take all the steps to bring them back to India.

(Ends)

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Under what rule? You have to tell the rule.

SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN (UTTAR PRADESH): Sir, I am really amazed at the way we are functioning. There was a report in the papers today that there were 13 Indians who have died in a plane crash. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): It is not a point of order. ...(Interruptions)... I have to go by rules. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN: There is a new report about people in Angola who are ...(Interruptions)... यह आज से नहीं, कितने दिनों से आ रहा है, आज मुद्दा उठाया तो मंत्री जी बोल रहे हैं..(व्यवधान)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You can give notice. ...(Interruptions)... Hon. Member can give a notice. You can give a notice if you want a discussion. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI NARESH AGRAWAL: Sir, if we give a notice, will you accept it? ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No. It will be considered. ...(Interruptions)... Notice will be considered. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN: So, we are at your mercy, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Not at mercy ...(Interruptions)... You have every right. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN: Of course ...(Interruptions)... Of course, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please understand the rule. In Zero Hour, if you had given the notice in advance to the Chairman, Chairman would have considered it and allowed it. Thus, ten notices were allowed. During the Zero Hour, to react or not to react, it is up to the Government. Here, the Minister was very kind enough to come and reply. So, that is over. You cannot raise it again. That is what I am saying. Still, if you want a discussion, I advise you to give a notice. Hon. Chairman will consider it. The rule is same for everybody. Madam, please understand it. I have a lot of

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

consideration for you. But what can I do? The rule is same for everybody. ...(Interruptions)... Agrawalji, please ...(Interruptions)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, डेमोक्रेसी में * मत कीजिए। सदन में अगर कोई जीरो ऑवर में विषय रखना चाहे और आप रखने नहीं दें तो यह * है।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):* is expunged. ...(Interruptions)... That word is expunged. आप discussion के लिए नोटिस दीजिए।

(1q/ksk पर आगे)

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

**LACK OF PREPAREDNESS OF NORTH-EASTERN REGION IN
TACKLING FREQUENT EARTHQUAKES**

SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS (ASSAM): Sir, this is a very serious issue regarding saving the North-Eastern Region from quakes' devastation.

Sir, on 11th May evening, the 5.4 magnitude strong tremors rocked Assam and some other parts of the North-East whose epicentre was in Nagaon district. It was a reminder of the vulnerability of the North-Eastern Region to tectonic shift. The North-Eastern Region is seismically most active, as it is located in Zone-V.

During the last hundred years, the North-Eastern Region has experienced 210 tremors between 5 and 5.9 magnitude, 128 tremors between 6 and 6.9 magnitude, 15 tremors between 7 and 7.9 magnitude, and 4 tremors between 8 and 8.5 magnitude. So, one can understand how vulnerable we are to earthquakes.

Recently, we had the worst experience of disaster management in Assam. The force deputed by the Disaster Management Authority took 27 hours to reach Dhubri from Jorhat, where 300 people died in recent ferry accident. We mourned the death of the people who died

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

in this accident in this House. In Madertari, 300 people have died and the force has rescued only 80 people. Then, just imagine what will happen if an earthquake of major magnitude rocks Assam. This is the scenario of preparedness in our Region.

Sir, after the latest Sikkim devastation, it has become urgent to take more steps to invest our energies and also to bring expertise from professionals from outside in disaster management.

There is need for mock exercises to enhance the level of preparedness and to generate mass awareness on what they should do in the eventuality of massive quake. It is also the need of the hour that the Department of Science and Technology should come out with imperative quality research in earthquake engineering which might pave the way for earthquake forecast.

In the North-Eastern Region, though there is a need to generate mass awareness, the Assam Government, for instance, has done nothing worthwhile except publishing a few advertisements in the local newspapers just for the sake of maintaining that the Government is on the right track in the matter of disaster management and has concern

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

for the lives of people. We need a dedicated wing for disaster management exclusively for spreading awareness.

There is a possibility of devastation before the people of the North-Eastern Region unless corrective measures are taken to save their lives...(Time-bell).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Yes, your time limit is over.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA (ASSAM): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by Shri Kumar Deepak Das.

SHRI TARINI KANTA ROY (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by Shri Kumar Deepak Das.

(Ends)

**KALI MA BEER BEING PRODUCED BY A BREWING COMPANY
IN USA**

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद (बिहार) : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आपकी अनुमति से एक बहुत ही गम्भीर और संवेदनशील विषय सदन के सामने उठाने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ। मैं अपने सभी आदरणीय मित्रों से इस विषय पर ध्यान देने का आग्रह करूँगा। अमेरिका की एक कंपनी है, बर्नसाइड ब्रिउइंग कम्पनी, यह पोर्टलैंड में है। इसने एक बीयर बनाया है, जिसका नाम रखा है — “काली माँ बीयर”। इसका पूरा फोटो भी छपा है, यह मेरे पास है, यह हिन्दुस्तान टाइम्स में छपा है।

इसका जो विज्ञापन निकला, उसमें लिखा हुआ है, “ The advertisement for the beer read, “Come worship ‘the black one’ Kali as the ultimate reality or Brahman this Tuesday!”

माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, हम सभी विचार और आस्थाओं का आदर करते हैं। यही हमारे देश ने सिखाया है। लेकिन किसी भी आस्था का अनादर नहीं होना चाहिए। अमेरिका में यह कोई पहली बार नहीं हुआ है। इसके पहले एक टॉयलेट पर लक्ष्मी जी की तस्वीर लगाई गई थी, तो आपत्ति हुई थी। उसके पहले एक ब्रा पर किसी भगवान की फोटो लगाई गई थी। वहाँ की एक बहुत बड़ी सुपर मॉडल हैं, वे एक नाइट क्लब में माँ काली बन कर चली आईं। वहाँ पर एक टॉक शो चलता है, जो ह्यूमर शो है, उसमें भगवान गणेश को एक सेक्स ऑब्जेक्ट बना कर दिखाया गया। यह कौन सी बात हो रही है? यह बहुत पीड़ा की बात है।

(1आर/एससीएच पर जारी)

GSP-SCH/12.20/1R

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद (क्रमागत): अभी जब आपत्ति हुई, तो उन्होंने कहा कि हम इसको रोकते हैं। हमारा आपसे विनम्र निवेदन है, भारत सरकार, यूपीए की सरकार अमरीका के साथ अच्छे सम्बन्धों का दावा करती हैं, लेकिन इस देश और दुनिया की इतनी बड़ी आस्थाओं के प्रतीक का वहाँ इस तरह से असम्मान

होता है! क्या वहां कोई कोड नहीं है? क्या वहां कोई एडवर्टिज़मेंट कोड नहीं है? क्या वहां पर मेन्युफेक्चरिंग का कोई कोड नहीं है?

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, यह एक बड़ा सवाल है, जिसे मैं बहुत पीड़ा से उठाना चाहता हूं कि किसी अन्य आस्था के ईश्वर को अमरीका की कम्पनी क्या इस तरह से दिखा सकती है? यह बहुत बड़ा सवाल है। हम लोगों ने यह विषय बार-बार उठाया है, लेकिन भारत सरकार हमारी चिन्ता को गंभीरता से नहीं लेती है। उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मैं आपके माध्यम से आग्रह करूंगा, यह विषय बहुत गम्भीर है, सरकार इस पर जवाब दे। अमरीका के राजदूत को विदेश मन्त्रालय बुलाया जाए, उनसे बात की जाए और अमरीकी सरकार इसके लिए माफी मांगे। अगर यह कोई पहली गलती होती फिर भी समझ में आता है, लेकिन बार-बार यही हो रहा है, आस्थाओं के साथ खेल हो रहा है, भावनाओं के साथ खेल हो रहा है, यह बहुत ही अनुचित है।

महोदय, मैं इसकी भर्त्सना करता हूं और आपसे आग्रह करता हूं कि आप सरकार को निर्देश दें, विदेश मंत्री यहाँ आकर उत्तर दें। अमरीका के राजदूत को बुला कर आप अपनी प्रतिक्रिया और हमारा रोश एवं विरोध सब दर्ज कराएं। यही मुझे कहना है।

(समाप्त)

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA (MADHYA PRADESH): Sir, I also associate myself with this important matter raised by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad.

श्रीमती माया सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश): सर, मैं इनके द्वारा उठाए गए इस गंभीर विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करती हूँ।

श्री विनय कटियार (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर, मैं इनके इस गंभीर विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ: Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर (महाराष्ट्र): सर, मैं इनको एसोसिएट करता हूँ।

श्री रघुनन्दन शर्मा (मध्य प्रदेश): सर, हम इनके द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करते हैं।

श्री प्रभात झा (मध्य प्रदेश): सर, मैं इनको एसोसिएट करता हूँ।

श्री अविनाश राय खन्ना (पंजाब): उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, हम इनके इस गंभीर विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करते हैं।

श्रीमती स्मृति जुबिन ईरानी (गुजरात): सर, मैं इनके इस विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करती हूँ।

(समाप्त)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Okay. (Interruptions)

All are associating.

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद: सर, मंत्री महोदय उत्तर तो दें, यह बहुत गंभीर विषय है ..(व्यवधान)

श्री अविनाश राय खन्ना (पंजाब): सर, यह बहुत गंभीर मसला है ...(व्यवधान)।

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री राजीव शुक्ल): सर, माननीय सदस्य श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद जी ने यह गंभीर मुद्दा उठाया है। हम यही कह सकते हैं कि हम इनकी चिन्ता से विदेश मंत्री जी को अभी, आज ही बात करके अवगत करा देंगे।

लेकिन इसके साथ मैं एक बात और जोड़ना चाहता हूँ। कुछ साल पहले, जहां रवि शंकर प्रसाद जी बैठे हैं, वहां मैं बैठा था और रवि शंकर प्रसाद जी यहाँ मंत्री बन कर बैठे थे। उस समय भी यह विषय आया था कि गणेश जी और शंकर जी की फोटो अमरीका के एक स्टोर में चप्पलों पर थी ...(व्यवधान)

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद: उस समय हमने विरोध किया था ...(व्यवधान) हमारी सरकार ने विरोध किया था ...(व्यवधान)

श्री राजीव शुक्ल: जब यह विषय हम लोगों ने उठाया था, उस समय न कोई कार्यवाही हुई थी और न ही कोई विरोध हुआ था, यह बात आप ध्यान में रखें, बस ...(व्यवधान) आप यह बात ध्यान में रखें ...(व्यवधान)

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद: उस समय सरकार ने विरोध किया था ...(व्यवधान)
माननीय मंत्री जी भारत सरकार के मंत्री हैं और वह इस तरह का बयान
...(व्यवधान)

श्री राजीव शुक्ल: उस समय कुछ नहीं हुआ था ...(व्यवधान) न वहां के मंत्री को
बुलाया गया न ही कुछ और हुआ ...(व्यवधान) कुछ नहीं हुआ था ...(व्यवधान)

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद: मंत्री जी सदन की भावनाओं के साथ राजनीति न
करें...(व्यवधान)

श्री राजीव शुक्ल: जब आप बोलें तो भावना है और जब हम बोलें तो भावना नहीं है
...(व्यवधान) सिर्फ आपकी भावनाएं हैं? ...(व्यवधान)

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद: उस समय हमने विरोध किया था ...(व्यवधान) वे ऐसी
बात न करें ...(व्यवधान) आज जो विषय उठाया गया है, आप उसका उत्तर
दीजिए ...(व्यवधान) सरकार से कहिए कि ...(व्यवधान)

श्री राम कृपाल यादव: सर, यह तो दोनों दलों के सदस्यों में कुश्ती हो रही है
...(व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Next, Shri Prabhat
Jha. (Interruptions) They can settle it. (Interruptions) Shri Prabhat
Jha (Interruptions)... They can settle it. No, no. (Interruptions) Mr.
Prabhat Jha (Interruptions)... (Interruptions)

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

श्री विनय कटियार: सर, इस गंभीर विषय को हंसी में क्यों उड़ाया जा रहा है?
...(व्यवधान)

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद: मैं आपसे हाथ जोड़ कर कहूंगा, हम लोगों की भावनाओं के साथ इस प्रकार ...(व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): He has reacted. (Interruptions) No, no. Mr. Ravi Shankar Prasad, the Minister has said... (Interruptions)...Please. (Interruptions)

श्री विनय कटियार: सर, यह बहुत गंभीर मामला है ...(व्यवधान) दूसरे पर आरोप लगा कर ... (व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन): विनय जी ...(व्यवधान) विनय जी, बैठिए ... (व्यवधान)

श्री विनय कटियार: हम कैसे बैठें, सर? ...(व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The Minister has already said that it will be brought to the notice of the External Affairs Minister for necessary action. What more do you want? (Interruptions) विनय जी, बैठ जाइए ...(व्यवधान) सुनिए ..(व्यवधान) मिनिस्टर ने यह बोला है कि वह एक्सटर्नल अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर के नोटिस में यह लाएंगे for whatever possible action. That is an assurance. What more do you need? Sit down. No, please. (Interruptions) That is an

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

assurance. Next is Mr. Prabhat Jha. (Interruptions) The Minister is kind enough to give an assurance. What more do you want?

(Interruptions) No, no. Mr. Prabhat Jha, please speak.

(Interruptions)

(Ends)

DISREGARD AND CARELESSNESS SHOWN TOWARDS THE CGHS CARDHOLDERS BY PRIVATE HOSPITALS IN DELHI

श्री प्रभात झा (मध्य प्रदेश): उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरे पास एक आइडेंटिटी कार्ड होता है, जिससे मैं गाड़ी चलाता हूँ, एक आइडेंटिटी कार्ड से मैं राज्य सभा में आता हूँ, एक आइडेंटिटी कार्ड से मैं बैंक में जाता हूँ, इस तरह बहुत सारे ऐसे आइडेंटिटी कार्ड होते हैं।

केन्द्र सरकार ने लाखों लोगों को सीजीएचएस के माध्यम से भी एक कार्ड दिया हुआ है कि जब आप बीमार पड़ें तो जहाँ पर इसकी मान्यता है, तत्काल वहाँ जा कर आप भर्ती हो जाएं, लेकिन इस कार्ड का इतना बड़ा मजाक हो रहा है। पिछले दिनों आपने सांसद महोदय के केस में देखा कि जगजीवन राम अस्पताल में उनके साथ क्या हुआ, एक्सपायर होने के बाद उनके शव को प्राप्त करने के लिए क्या-क्या किया गया।

1954 में यह अधिकार केवल दिल्ली में दिया गया था। इसके बाद देश के कुछ अन्य प्रान्तों में इस योजना को लागू करने के लिए भेजा गया। कुछ अस्पताल सिलेक्ट किए गए, उन अस्पतालों में आप यह कार्ड ले जाइए, आप

रिटायर्ड हैं, पेंशनधारी हैं, उप-राज्यपाल हैं, पूर्व-राज्यपाल हैं, न्यायाधीश हैं, ऐसे तमाम लोगों को यह सुविधा दी गई।

(1s-vnk पर जारी)

-SCH/VNK-SK/1s/12:25

श्री प्रभात झा (क्रमागत): जब परसों रात FCI का एक कर्मचारी इस कार्ड को लेकर दिल्ली के एक अस्पताल में पेट दर्द की शिकायत लेकर पहुंचता है, तो उस अस्पताल में उसका अल्ट्रा साउण्ड, आदि चेक अप करने के बाद उससे कहा जाता है कि आपको कुछ नहीं है, आपका इस अस्पताल में कोई इलाज नहीं होगा, क्योंकि तब तक उसको मालूम हो गया कि यह पेंशनर है और इसके पास कार्ड है और इसका पैसा जल्दी नहीं मिलेगा, इसलिए उसने उसको टरका दिया। इसके बाद उसका दर्द बढ़ने लगा, पेट फूलने लगा और उसकी हालत सीरियस होने लगी, तो फिर वह दूसरे अस्पताल में जाता है। उस अस्पताल में भी वह कार्ड को दिखाता है, उस कार्ड को दिखाने के बाद उसके साथ वही ज्यादाती होती है। वह आदमी मौत से जूझ रहा है, लेकिन उसको कहा जाता है कि आप सरकारी अस्पताल में जाइए, राम मनोहर लोहिया अस्पताल में जाइए। आपने लाखों लोगों को यह कार्ड दिया है। आपने यह कार्ड उनको इसलिए दिया है, ताकि उनकी हिफाजत हो, उनका इलाज हो। इसके बाद वह, यानी शारदा नाम का कर्मचारी प्राइवेट अस्पताल में एडवांस में पैसा जमा करके एडमिट होता

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

है और वहां उसका ऑपरेशन होता है, लेकिन उस कार्ड का कोई उपयोग नहीं होता है। ऐसे एक नहीं अनेक मामले हैं।

“कैग” ने अपनी रिपोर्ट में बताया है कि तमाम सारे ऐसे बिल्स के अम्बार लगे हुए हैं, लेकिन उनका निराकरण नहीं हो रहा है और इस कारण से अस्पतालों को पैसा नहीं जाता है। मेरा यह निवेदन है कि आप इस कार्ड को withdraw कीजिए। जिंदगी और मौत से जूझते आदमी के लिए यह कार्ड आशा की किरण होती है, उस कार्ड से उसके मन में हिम्मत होती है कि अगर मुझे कुछ दिक्कत होगी, तो मैं अस्पताल में जाकर दिखाऊंगा, लेकिन ऐसा होता नहीं है। देश में लोखों कर्मचारी हैं और पेंशनधारी हैं। (समय की घंटी)। ... (व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Your time is over. ..(Interruptions).. Your time is over. ..(Interruptions)..

श्री प्रभात झा: महोदय, मेरी यह मांग है कि लोगों की जिंदगी के साथ इस तरह का मजाक बंद हो और सरकार इस पर तत्काल ध्यान दे। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT (MAHARASHTRA): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI ANIL DESAI (MAHARASHTRA): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

(Ends)

SEXUAL ABUSE OF GIRLS AT KIDS' SHELTER

SHRIMATI JHARNA DAS BAIDYA (TRIPURA): Thank you, Sir, for giving me a chance to speak on the subject. The subject of my Zero Hour mention is Sexual Abuse of Girls at Kids' Shelter.

Sir, I want to tell you about the children living at a shelter home run by an NGO, namely, Apna Ghar, where they were sexually abused, beaten, molested and made to work as labourers on farms and construction sites. The shelter home which is run by an NGO, namely, Apna Ghar, had won a Haryana State award for women's empowerment in March this year. Around 12 girls, in their teens, alleged that they were exploited by the owner to earn money. One of them said that she was forced to sleep with a man. They were molested by various people. If any girl protested, she would be paraded naked and beaten. The girls had, in fact, been shifted to the Rohtak home from an orphanage in Gurgaon following allegations of sexual abuse there. Although they have been arrested for exploiting children and booked for sexual harassment and molestation of the inmates, the Government should take stringent action against the culprit in accordance with the existing rules and regulations and issue

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

immediate directions to ensure that these crimes are properly investigated and the criminals are apprehended. Thank you.

(Ends)

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member. How can they be awarded by the State Government? This should be enquired into, Sir.
..(Interruptions)..

SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL (KERALA): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member. This is a very serious issue, Sir.

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN (KERALA): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

श्री मंगल किसन (ओडिशा): महोदय, मैं स्वयं को इस विषय से संबद्ध करता हूँ।

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI (GUJARAT): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Okay, I agree with you. I hope the Government will take note of it.

(Ends)

**SUFFERINGS OF TRAVELLERS DUE TO CANCELLATION
OF AIR INDIA FLIGHTS**

SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY (TAMIL NADU): Thank you, Sir. My Zero Hour mention today is on the important subject of ‘sufferings of the travelling public due to cancellation of Air India flights’. The Father of the Nation, Mahatma Gandhi *ji*, said the customer is our God. But the Government, without any notice to the travelling public, has cancelled all the international flights. This has resulted in lots and lots of sufferings to the travelling public.

(Contd. by 1T-ysr)

-SK/YSR-DS/12.30/1T

SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY (CONTD.): Great inconvenience has been caused to passengers. Passengers wait for hours but nobody gives them any information. Neither food facility nor accommodation facility is given to them. Air India failed to make any alternate arrangements for passengers. Air India flies to Europe, the US and Canada. All the flights have been cancelled. Over 50 flights were cancelled since the pilots suddenly reported sick. The airline operates 16 international flights a day with large, wide-body aircraft to the US,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Europe, the Far East and South-East Asia. All the sectors are affected by the agitation of a section of pilots. Flights to London, Paris, Frankfurt, New York, Toronto, Shanghai and cities in the Gulf region were also affected.

On Sunday, it was reported that the Mumbai Airport's International Terminal had passengers waiting to be accommodated on other flights or waiting to hear about the status of their flights. Angry passengers tried to block the road outside the Mumbai Airport because they were frustrated with the lack of information given to them by Air India officials. Some of them were waiting for three-four hours without proper information. There was another testimony of a passenger in tears, whose last date of joining duty had lapsed. He exhausted all the money that he had brought for his day-to-day expenses while waiting at the airport. The expenditure includes cost of a bottle of water which is being sold at more than Rs.50 there. This happens after the merger of Air India and Indian Airlines! There is a disparity in giving promotion to the employees of these airlines. No employee should be placed at a disadvantage at any stage and no unilateral decision relating to service matters be forced upon the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

employees. The IPG is aware of its responsibility towards the travelling public. They have worked for more than four months without salary. It is surprising that though the pilots were ready for talks, the management was not prepared for it. It sacked them without any notice. It preferred sacking without giving them any notice. Considering the just demands of the pilots and considering the sufferings of the travelling public, I hope the Ministry will rise to the occasion and see to it that all the problems are solved. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

SHRI RAMA CHANDRA KHUNTIA (ODISHA): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (ANDHRA PRADESH): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI HUSAIN DALWAI (MAHARASHTRA): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI P. BHATTACHARYA (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

DR. ASHOK S. GANGULY (NOMINATED): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI RAM KRIPAL YADAV (BIHAR): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): All the hon. Members are associating themselves with it. (Ends)

REPORTED CLASH BETWEEN OFFICERS AND JAWANS OF ARTILLERY UNIT IN LADAKH

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT (MAHARASHTRA): Sir, I rise to express grave concern over something that happened last week at Leh, which is India's border area. It was reported and I only hoped that the newspaper report would be false. But that did not happen. Four days have passed. So far, the Defence Ministry has not contradicted that. The report is that at Leh, Indian Army Officers and *Jawans* clashed with each other. It was not just a clash. Colonel Prasad Kadam, Commanding Officer of the 226 Field Regiment, was admitted to a hospital. Ultimately, the artillery unit on the border had to be

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

disarmed. The arms of *jawans* were taken away from their possession. They remained without arms for three days. It is a matter of grave concern. I can understand there must be some problem. We are proud of our Army because it is the disciplined force. If indiscipline on the part of our *jawans* and officers like this takes place on our border areas, I, as a citizen, feel insecure. If they are fighting with each other, how would they protect me?

(Contd. by VKK/1U)

-YSR/VKK-MCM/1u/12.35

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT (CONTD.): Sir, here, I am not blaming either the *jawans* or the officers. What I want to say is that the Defence Minister, the Defence Ministry, the *babus* in the Defence Ministry or the senior Army Officers should take immediate cognizance of what has gone wrong and take appropriate measures. You should see what is their plight when they are in this type of situation. We must understand their plight and resolve their issues because this type of indiscipline would cost too dear to the nation and no Indian would like to do that. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN (UTTAR PRADESH): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by Dr. Bharkumar Raut.

SHRI PRABHAT JHA (MADHYA PRADESH): Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by Dr. Bharkumar Raut.

SHRI AVINASH RAI KHANNA (PUNJAB): Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by Dr. Bharkumar Raut.

(Ends)

ISSUE OF IMPORT OF OIL FROM IRAN

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE (WEST BENGAL): Sir, during her recent visit to Kolkata, the US Secretary of State commended the steps India has taken to reduce import of oil from Iran. For long, officially, the Government has been taking the stand that India's energy needs Iranian oil. Even the Finance Minister, on a visit to the USA, declared that India cannot cut back on oil import from Iran. Similar assurance has been given by the Finance Minister in Parliament. But, the reality is something different. In 2008-09, India imported 21.8 million tonnes of oil from Iran which came down to 18.5 million tonnes in 2010-11. And in 2011-12, it further came down to 14

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

million tonnes. Thus, the Government is adopting an official stand that India cannot do without Iranian oil but, at the same time, it is providing assurances to the United States that steps are being taken to cut back Iranian oil import. Facts show that India is succumbing to the US pressure. Considering the national importance of the issue, I demand a statement from the hon. Prime Minister. Thank you.

(Ends)

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by Shri Prasanta Chatterjee.

SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU): Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by Shri Prasanta Chatterjee.

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN (KERALA): Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by Shri Prasanta Chatterjee.

(Ends)

MEDIA REPORTS ON LEAKAGE OF ARMY CHIEF'S LETTER

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ (ODISHA): Sir, thank you very much for allowing me to raise a matter which has great implications for national security.

Sir, the Army Chief, General V.K. Singh, had written a letter to the hon. Prime Minister on 12th March, 2012. The letter basically

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

focussed on the shortage of equipment and ammunitions in artillery and armoured requirements. Sir, this was not the first time that an Army Chief was writing to the Prime Minister about the prevailing situation of shortages and problems of the Army. And, maybe, General Singh, who was to retire shortly, was putting on record his assessment about the requirements of the Armed Forces. Sir, after 16 days, that is, on March 28, the letter was leaked and it found its way to the media. That created a lot of sensation within the country. Sir, in-between, one more important thing happened. General Singh went on record and made a media disclosure that he was offered a bribe of Rs.14 crore by a former retired Lieutenant-General in a Defence deal. After that disclosure, this letter was leaked and there was insinuation inside the House and outside the House as if General Singh was behind this leak in order to embarrass the Government because of the controversy relating to his date of birth. But, I would say, Sir, General Singh acted very honourably and he went on record to call the act of leakage as 'high treason' and he also sought a probe into it. He also said, "Guilty be dealt with ruthlessly." Sir, 47 days have passed and we do not know as to who was responsible for the leak. The letter

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

originated from the Office of the Army Chief. It landed in the Prime Minister's Office. There has to be leakage somewhere and we have no reason to doubt what the Army Chief has said. There are media speculations and the Government owes it to the people of India and to this House as to who was responsible for this leak.

(Contd. by TMV/1w)

-VKK-TMV-HMS/1W/12.40

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ (CONTD.): An inquiry must be conducted. If an inquiry has been conducted, we don't know the results. The speculation in the media is that somebody in the Cabinet was involved. At least, the Prime Minister ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): The time is over. (Interruptions)...

(Ends)

श्री रामविलास पासवान : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मैंने भी नोटिस दिया है। एक मिनट सुन लीजिए। सर, बिहार के दो युवक श्री राजीव महतो और राकेश महतो, रेलवे की परीक्षा देने अहमदाबाद गए थे।... (व्यवधान)

श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर : आपने नोटिस दिया है? .. (व्यवधान)..

श्री रामविलास पासवान : हां, दिया है। ..(व्यवधान).. I have already given notice. (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN(PROF. P. J. KURIEN): No, please. (Interruptions)...

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: I have given notice. (Interruptions)... I have already given notice. (Interruptions)...

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, have you approved it? (Interruptions)... We have also given notice. (Interruptions)...

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: I have been permitted also. (Interruptions)...

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, are you permitting him? (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN(PROF. P. J. KURIEN): It is not permitted for today. (Interruptions)... It is not permitted for today. (Interruptions)...

श्री रामविलास पासवान : उन्हें चलती गाड़ी से फेंक दिया गया ...(व्यवधान)..

श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर : सर, हमने भी नोटिस दिया है ..(व्यवधान)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN(PROF. P. J. KURIEN): It is not included today. (Interruptions)... It is not being included today.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

(Interruptions)... Ram Vilas Paswanji, this subject is not included today. (Interruptions)... You give notice to the Chair. (Interruptions)...

श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर : सर, यह कैसे होगा? ..(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN(Prof. P. J. KURIEN): It is not included for today. (Interruptions)... It is not there. आप बैठिए। (Interruptions)... No. Ram Vilas Paswanji, if you want, you give a fresh notice. (Interruptions)... Notice must be given before 10 a.m. (Interruptions)... No, please. (Interruptions)... I have not allowed. (Interruptions)... It is not in the list, please. (Interruptions)... No, it is not there. (Interruptions)... I have told him that it is not there. (Interruptions)... It is not included. (Interruptions)... It is not admitted. (Interruptions)... I told you, Ram Vilasji. (Interruptions)... No, not allowed. (Interruptions)... Ram Vilasji, you can give a fresh notice tomorrow before 10 a.m. (Interruptions)... The Chairman may consider it. (Interruptions)... Now, take your seats. (Interruptions)... Sit down, please. (Interruptions)...

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: Sir, I have given notice. (Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

SHRI TARIQ ANWAR: It is not fair. (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): It is not permitted. (Interruptions)... Take your seats. (Interruptions)... I am not allowing. (Interruptions)... Take your seat. (Interruptions)... I am not allowing you. (Interruptions)... Take your seat. (Interruptions)... Ram Vilasji, आप बैठिए। (Interruptions)... I told you to go by the rules. (Interruptions)... आप रूल्स के अनुसार नोटिस दीजिए। ..(व्यवधान)..

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: The Chair has all the rights. (Interruptions)... You told me that you would give me two minutes. (Interruptions)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० पी०जे० कुरियन) : मैं कह रहा हूँ कि आप रूल्स के अनुसार कल नोटिस दीजिए, चेयरमैन consider करेंगे। The Chairman may consider it. (Interruptions)... No. Nothing will go on record. (Interruptions)... Take your seats. (Interruptions)... Hon. Members, Special Mentions will be taken up immediately before the House adjourns for the day. Now we will take up the Appropriation (No.3) Bill, 2012 and the Finance Bill, 2012. (Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: We can lay it on the Table of the House.

(Interruptions)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० पी०जे० कुरियन) : “ले” करेंगे? You agree. It is only laying. I have no objection. Special Mentions, Shrimati Smriti Zubin Irani.

SPECIAL MENTIONS*

HK/9a

DEMAND FOR STRENGTHENING SECURITY ALONG GUJARAT COAST

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI (GUJARAT): Sir, the State of Gujarat has the longest coastline in the proximity of Pakistan and furthermore development of mega-power projects, major ports, mega-petroleum refineries, SBMs, etc., in the coastal areas of Kutch and Jamnagar

* Laid on the Table.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

have increased vulnerability and sensitivity of the area from the angle of national security. Coastal security in Gujarat, therefore, needs to be given highest priority by the Government of India. The Government of India should accept and implement the Gujarat Government's comprehensive scheme sent on 30.05.2005 on coastal security involving an amount of Rs.392.47 crore. Thirty-one high-speed patrol boats sanctioned under Coastal Security Phase-II to Gujarat State should be delivered immediately and Regional Service Centre of Goa Shipyard Ltd., should be set up in Gujarat so that day-to-day maintenance and repair of boats can be done immediately, which currently takes 2 to 4 weeks. BSF (Water Wing) and the Coast Guard need ultramodern marine resources to cover the critical coastal stretch between Jakhau and Medi in Kutch District since the small islands in this stretch remain vulnerable as boats cannot navigate in less than 3 metre of water.

In the Creek area (extending from Kori Creek to Sir Creek), the Water Wing of BSF deploys three floating Border Outposts (BOPs), which function as the base for operating high-speed patrol boats. However, during the monsoon, these floating BOPs are withdrawn

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

and brought to shore. Consequently, for nearly five months in a year (May to September), the Creek area is not effectively patrolled. There is an immediate need to deploy suitable vessels or erect appropriate structure to have permanent presence of BSF in the Creek area.

(Ends)

KSK/9B

**DEMAND FOR ADDRESSING ISSUES PERTAINING TO PROBLEMS
BEING FACED BY WIDOWS IN THE COUNTRY**

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA (ODISHA): Among the worst practices of tradition and belief still practised in India is the socio-economic discrimination and stigma faced by the widows. These hapless women are considered inauspicious in their own homes and driven out to fend for themselves. They often turn to the last hope in travelling to Vrindavan in Uttar Pradesh, where they get some solace. There is equally a good number of such population in Varanasi and Puri. A majority of such population leads a miserable existence. Sanitation, regular meals, safe drinking water and a roof on their heads remain a major concern for them. A majority of them live in *ashrams* or open spaces like streets, railway stations, bus stops and *ghats*, where they

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

face sexual or other such harassment - physical or mental. They do not have any kind of regular income, that is, pension or financial aid through welfare schemes. They often fall sick and suffer from diarrhoea and other water-borne diseases on account of water contamination.

When the country is marching ahead in the economic field, there is an imperative need for organising welfare schemes for such hapless women by way of providing them access to regular pension, BPL cards, medical facilities to meet their basic needs and above all, a regular system for dissemination of such information to them.

Though there may be certain Government schemes to address most of the issues faced by widows of all age groups, there is no organised system to create awareness among them about such schemes. The Government must look into this to address the above issues.

(Ends)

SCH/9C

**DEMAND FOR MAKING A PROPER DRAINAGE SYSTEM
TO MAINTAIN CLEANLINESS
AND MAKE PROPER USE OF PONDS IN VILLAGES**

श्री ईश्वर सिंह (हरियाणा): देश के हर गाँव में तालाब हैं, जो ग्रामीण बस्ती के साथ-साथ होते हैं। गाँव की सारी बस्तियों का पानी गाँव के साथ लगते तालाब में इकट्ठा हो जाता है। वाटर सप्लाई, सिवरेज व बरसात का पानी इन्हीं तालाबों में इकट्ठा हो जाता है। इस पानी की निकासी कहीं नहीं होती, अतः इसमें सड़न पैदा हो जाती है। कुछ समय के बाद यह पानी इतना दूषित हो जाता है कि न तो इसे पशु पीते हैं और न ही यह कपड़े धोने या बर्तन साफ करने के काम आता है। इस पानी की सड़न सारे वातावरण को दूषित कर देती है और यह प्रदूषण आस-पास के सारे इलाके को प्रभावित करता है।

इस समय ऐसे हालात पैदा हो गए हैं कि यह तालाब महामारी का रूप धारण करते जा रहे हैं। राज्य सरकारों के पास ऐसी कोई नीति नहीं है, जो इस पानी को खेतों में पहुंचाया जा सके या रिफाइंड करके प्रयोग में लाया जा सके। राज्यों में इतना बजट भी नहीं है कि हर गाँव में पानी की निकासी की जाए।

अतः मेरा केन्द्र सरकार से अनुरोध है कि वह राज्य सरकारों के साथ मिल कर ऐसी नीति बनाए ताकि गाँव के इस दूषित पानी की निकासी हो सके।

(समाप्त)

9d/VNK

**DEMAND TO DECLARE A DAY AS NATIONAL HUMAN DUTIES DAY
ON THE LINES OF HUMAN RIGHTS DAY IN THE COUNTRY**

श्री अविनाश राय खन्ना (पंजाब): महोदय, मानव अधिकार एक अंतर्राष्ट्रीय विषय बन चुका है। मानव अधिकारों का हनन न हो, इसके लिए राष्ट्रीय एवं अंतर्राष्ट्रीय स्तर पर तरह-तरह के कार्यक्रम, जागरूक अभियान, सेमिनार करके लोगों को मानव अधिकारों के प्रति जागरूक किया जाता है और इसी तरह मानव अधिकारों के हनन को रोकने के लिए मानव अधिकार कमिशन, राष्ट्रीय एवं राज्य स्तर पर बनाए गए हैं। बहुत-सी अंतर्राष्ट्रीय कॉन्फ्रेंस भी होती हैं। यह मानव अधिकार हनन क्यों होता है? वह तब होता है, जब कोई अपना कर्तव्य पूरा न करके किसी के मानव अधिकारों का हनन करता है। सभी अपना कर्तव्य पूरा करें, इसके लिए जन-जन में अपना कर्तव्य पूरा करने की भावना पैदा की जाए, इसके लिए इस तरह का एक वातावरण तैयार करना होगा।

आज मानव अधिकारों के लिए बड़ी-बड़ी लड़ाईयाँ अलग-अलग ढंग से लड़ी जा रही हैं, लेकिन अपने कर्तव्य को पूरा करने के लिए राष्ट्रीय या प्रदेश स्तर पर ऐसा कोई मंच नहीं है, जो लोगों और अधिकारियों को अपना कर्तव्य पूरा करने के लिए कोई मंच प्रदान कर सके। कुछ कार्यक्रम सिर्फ प्रयोजन हेतु हो जाते हैं, लेकिन वे सामाजिक जिम्मेवारी निभाने के लिए सक्षम नहीं होते। मानवता के प्रति लोगों की एवं अधिकारियों की कोई जिम्मेवारी है, ऐसा एक वातावरण बनाने के लिए देश भर में कोई दिन निश्चित हो। जिस प्रकार 10

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

दिसम्बर मानव अधिकार दिवस के रूप में मनाया जाता है, उसी प्रकार सरकार को चाहिए कि कोई एक दिन तय करे, जिसे राष्ट्रीय मानव कर्तव्य दिवस के रूप में मनाया जाए। यह संदेश सारी दुनिया को भारत की धरती से दिया जाए और भारत इसका नेतृत्व करे। ऐसी सरकार से अपेक्षा है। (समाप्त)

GSP/9E

**DEMAND TO TAKE IMMEDIATE STEPS TO HOLD ELECTIONS FOR
THE VACANT POSTS IN LOCAL BODIES IN LAKSHADWEEP**

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN (KERALA): Sir, in the Union Territory of Lakshadweep, the authorities are violating the provisions of Panchayati Raj Act. The 73rd and 74th Constitutional Amendments mandate the authorities to fill the vacancies in local bodies within six months. But in Lakshadweep, the authorities are not holding elections to the vacant seats. In ward number 3 of Kavaratti Panchayat, the elected member resigned last year. The seat is vacant for more than a year. In Kalpeni Panchayat, the Chairperson, who was elected from ward number 5, has also resigned. This seat is also vacant for the last one year.

The administration of Lakshadweep is under the direct control of the Union Government. The responsibility of holding by-elections to the vacant posts rests with the Union Government. Therefore, I urge

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

upon the Government to take immediate steps to hold elections to the vacant seats. (Ends)

SK/9F

**DEMAND TO RESTORE FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE TO SPINNING
SECTOR UNDER TUF SCHEME IN MAHARASHTRA**

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT (MAHARASHTRA): Sir, Maharashtra is one of the largest producers of cotton which is grown in the backward regions of Vidarbha, Marathwada, etc. Maharashtra Government has announced new Textile Policy with an intention to process maximum cotton in these backward regions of the State. The new policy is applicable to textile projects approved under the TUF Scheme of the Government of India. Hence the extension of the TUF Scheme in present shape is completely beneficial to the cotton growers of the State. The re-structured TUF Scheme has been launched in April, 2011, after an evaluation by CRISIL. CRISIL has observed in its report that as spinning sector operates on low margin and needs high investment, there is a need to continue the financial support to spinning industry.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Now, there is a proposal to reduce Central assistance or altogether removal of the subsidy to the spinning sector under TUF during the Twelfth Five Year Plan. In this regard, I would submit that reducing assistance to spinning mills will further deny opportunity of value creation in the country and hurting cotton growers further.

The country has been exporting about 30 per cent of cotton without adding value. Value addition in textile chain starts with spinning. Hence reduction in the assistance or altogether removal of subsidy to spinning sector under TUF Scheme shall further adversely affect the value addition process in the distress regions of the State like Vidarbha and Marathwada.

Therefore, I would urge upon the Government that assistance to spinning sector under the TUF Scheme during Twelfth Five Year Plan may not be reduced.

(Ends)

YSR/9G

DEMAND FOR SPEEDY CLEARANCE AND ALLOCATION OF FUNDS FOR FOUR-LANING OF MUMBAI-GOIA NATIONAL HIGHWAY IN MAHARASHTRA

SHRI HUSAIN DALWAI (MAHARASHTRA): The Government of Maharashtra is making all efforts for early completion of four-laning of the Mumbai-Goa National Highway No.17, which is around 600 km long and passes through Panvel-Mahad-Ratnagiri-Sindhudurg-Panaji. There are 40 accident-prone spots on this Highway. During the last five years, 1,562 people died in accidents and 8,056 were injured as a result of heavy traffic.

This project has been approved by the Central Government under the National Highway Development Programme. Indapur-Zarap Section of this Highway has been divided into four phases costing Rs.3,500 crore. The Government of Maharashtra has submitted the physical report in this regard to the Central Government.

The work on Zarap-Patradevi Section has been taken up with the help of funds provided from the Central Government Budget. The Government of Maharashtra intends to complete this project at an

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

early date but the Central Government is taking a lot of time in sanctioning the work and providing environmental clearance.

The traffic on this Highway has increased more than three times. This is resulting in accidents, and their number has increased in recent years. The Central Government should ensure that all formalities are cleared speedily and required funds are sanctioned to the Government of Maharashtra for taking up this project. I urge upon the Central Government especially the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways to ensure speedy clearance and allocation of funds for this project.

(Ends)

VKK/9h

DEMAND TO PROVIDE MODERN PASSENGER AMENITIES AT RAILWAY STATIONS IN THE COUNTRY

SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL (KERALA): Sir, the railway stations in India need a lot of additional infrastructure to cater to the ever increasing passenger traffic. The country has around 65000 kilometres of rail route and commands fourth position among world railways according to the size. But, when we consider the facilities and services to the passengers, our position is pathetic. The facilities are not added and

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

upgraded with the passing of time and growth of passenger traffic. The major stations have very low number of Foot Over Bridges and, that too, built to cater to the passenger traffic of sixties and seventies, which has now become inadequate. Stampede like situation prevails when passenger trains arrive.

Thiruvananthapuram Railway Station which is in the Capital of Kerala has got only three Foot Over Bridges. Other major stations in Kerala also have only minimum facilities. Even the New Delhi Station which caters to 300 trains and five lakh passengers daily has got very meagre facilities.

Apart from Foot Over Bridges, the facilities for old people, patients and physically challenged are least cared for by the Railways. Escalators and lifts for those who need special care are not a luxury now. It is a matter of human right. But, even railway stations in State Capitals lack these people-friendly infrastructure facilities.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

So, I request the Central Government and the Railways to take urgent and special initiatives to provide more facilities including escalators, lifts and more Foot Over Bridges at major railway stations.

(Ends)

(Followed at 9j)

TMV-9J

**CONCERN OVER HORRENDOUS SCENARIO OF CORPORAL
PUNISHMENT TO CHILDREN IN SCHOOLS**

DR. GYAN PRAKASH PILANIA (RAJASTHAN): Sir, according to the survey conducted in 2009-10 academic year by the National Commission for Protection of Child Rights (NCPCR), 81.2 per cent students in schools across the country are humiliated by teachers who tell them that they are not capable of learning. Only nine out of 6,632 students in seven States who were surveyed denied that they received any kind of punishment in schools. “99.86 per cent of children reported experiencing one or the other kind of punishment. Getting beaten by a cane, being slapped on the cheeks, being hit on the back and ears getting boxed are the other four major punishments”.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

“These four punishments do not lag behind much in terms of their occurrence. Out of the total, 75 per cent reported that they had been hit by a cane and 69 per cent had been slapped on their cheeks”, the survey said. Even the “cruel practice of giving electric shocks” finds a mention.

The survey was conducted to study the scale and magnitude of corporal punishment in the every day school experiences of India’s children, types of violent punishment prevailing in Indian schools and analyse by age the prevalence.

In view of the above horrendous scenario of corporal punishment to kids in schools, I would request the hon. Minister of Human Resource Development to initiate curative steps.

(Ends)

(Followed by 1K)

VK/9K

**DEMAND FOR STRENGTHENING RURAL CREDIT NETWORK TO
COVER ENTIRE FARMING COMMUNITY**

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (WEST BENGAL): Sir, farmers are facing a terminal crisis of their livelihood. Despite good crops this year, farmers' suicide continues and a majority of the farmers are facing deepening impoverishment. Gains in production are not accruing to producers but expropriated by the rural vested interests and traders-cum-money lenders. Two-thirds of the farming community of the country, mostly small and marginal farmers, are not having access to institutional credit, this being one of the factors for crisis despite good crop this year. Need of the hour is to widen and strengthen rural credit by focussing on flow of rural credit to small and marginal farmers. But, unfortunately, the rural credit institutions, viz. NABARD and Regional Rural Banks are being weakened and their functional autonomy impaired. As recommended by the US Consultant, BCG, 15 District Development Managers' Offices of NABARD are being closed, besides putting a stop on recruitment of manpower. The

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Government has decided to offload its share of Regional Rural Banks to their sponsor commercial banks. This will weaken autonomy of RRBs, dilute their functional focus towards rural credit and establish dominance of sponsor commercial banks provoking diversion of deposits for commercial purposes. The Government must stop such moves of dismantling time-tested institutions for rural credit for benefiting the trade-money, lender-corporate-nexus in the rural economy. Rather, the NABARD and Regional Rural Banks network must be widened and strengthened with resources, enhanced manpower and greater autonomy with a determined bid to cover the entire farmers' community in institutional credit network. Thank you.

(Ends)

RG/9L

**SITUATION REGARDING SANITATION, AVAILABILITY OF
DRINKING WATER AND HEALTH IN SCHEDULED TRIBE AREAS**

SHRIMATI T. RATNA BAI (ANDHRA PRADESH): Sir, I would like to bring the attention of this hon. House to the current situation of sanitation, drinking water and health in the Scheduled Tribe areas.

Indian tribals are under-privileged in comparison to rest of the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

population, being weaker both socially and economically. A major reason for this is ill-health. Impediments in the system as administered by both the Centre and the States, and non-availability of timely medical assistance and Government sponsored health care projects are responsible. Additionally, since many tribals live in remote areas lacking in basic facilities, they become even more vulnerable to diseases.

Not enough dedicated health professionals work in rural areas, deterred by challenges such as wide forest areas, inaccessibility and resistance from extremist elements there. This is evident in the fact that, at present, there is only one Accredited Social Health Activist (ASHA) or community health worker for a population of 1,000 in rural and tribal areas.

The situation is exacerbated by absence of such basic amenities as drinking water since most available resources are put to use for irrigation purposes and industry, leaving the tribals bereft. Consequently, they resort to unfiltered water from natural sources such as surrounding rivers. This is despite flagship undertakings such as the National Rural Drinking Water Programme.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

The dire health status is also contributed to by lack of sanitation. There is almost nil access to toilets or running supply of water, and in the absence of sewerage systems, there is no way to get rid of waste other than through natural water systems, which contributes further to prevalence of diseases.

This aids transmission of oral-fecal diseases like diarrhoea, amongst other infections, and is the breeding ground for mosquitoes carrying Malaria and Dengue fever, fatal in the context of such low health standards.

It is requested that the Government take urgent notice of this sorry state of affairs and take steps to provide relief accordingly.

(Ends)

9M/DS

**DEMAND TO TAKE EARLY STEPS FOR ERADICATION
OF MALARIA FROM THE COUNTRY**

श्री प्रभात झा (मध्य प्रदेश): महोदय, राष्ट्रीय स्वास्थ्य नीति तथा पंचवर्षीय योजनाओं में तय की गयी प्राथमिकताओं के आधार पर केन्द्र सरकार द्वारा स्वास्थ्य देखभाल हेतु कई नीतियों एवं कार्यक्रमों को चलाया जा रहा है। इन नीतियों एवं कार्यक्रमों का प्रमुख उद्देश्य विकेन्द्रीकृत जनस्वास्थ्य प्रणाली तक पहुँच बढ़ाते हुए आम जनता में स्वास्थ्य के स्वीकार्य मानक प्राप्त करना है। इन नीतियों एवं कार्यक्रमों पर प्रति वर्ष करोड़ों-अरबों रुपए खर्च किए जाते हैं, लेकिन आम जनता में स्वास्थ्य के स्वीकार्य मानक प्राप्त करने में ये नीतियाँ एवं कार्यक्रम सिफर साबित हो रहे हैं।

केन्द्रीय स्वास्थ्य और परिवार कल्याण मंत्री ने लिखित प्रश्न के जवाब में स्वीकार किया है कि वर्ष 2010 के दौरान मलेरिया से देश भर में 1018 लोगों की मौत हुई। मलेरिया से ओडिशा में सर्वाधिक 247 लोगों की मौत हुई, जबकि महाराष्ट्र में इस बीमारी से 200 लोगों की और अरुणाचल प्रदेश में 103 लोगों की मौत हुई। देश में मलेरिया नियंत्रण के इस दयनीय प्रदर्शन से यह साबित होता है कि केन्द्र सरकार का स्वास्थ्य और परिवार कल्याण मंत्रालय महज खानापूति के लिए है, जिसका काम केवल नीतियों और कार्यक्रमों पर पानी की तरह पैसा बहाना एवं आंकड़े जारी करना है। संयुक्त राष्ट्र सहस्राब्दी विकास लक्ष्य के तहत

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

मलेरिया से निपटने की बात है, तो इस मोर्चे पर भारत में कोई खास प्रगति नहीं हुई है। अन्य वेक्टर जनित रोगों के उन्मूलन के मामले में भी स्थिति यही है।

अतः सरकार से मेरी मांग है कि मलेरिया सहित विभिन्न रोगों के उन्मूलन के कार्य में तेजी लाने हेतु शीघ्र कदम उठाए जाएँ, ताकि स्वास्थ्य क्षेत्र में सहस्राब्दी विकास लक्ष्य को पूरा किया जा सके।

(समाप्त)

(Followed by 1X/VK)

VK/1X/12.45

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (RPOF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, the Appropriation (No.3) Bill, 2012 and the Finance Bill, 2012. Shri Pranab Mukherjee.

**THE APPROPRIATION (NO.3) BILL, 2012
AND
THE FINANCE BILL, 2012**

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I beg to move:

“That the Bill to authorize payment and appropriation of certain sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

the services of the financial year 2012-13, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration.”

I also beg to move:

“That the Bill to give effect to the financial proposals of the Central Government for the financial year 2012-13, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration.”

Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, normally it is not the practice that at the consideration stage details of the provisions are discussed. But this year's Finance Bill had some important features. After the presentation of the Budget on 16th of March, while having general discussion in both the Houses, and outside the Houses, a large number of comments and observations were made on various provisions of the Finance Bill and also on the budgeted proposals. Thereafter, in the interregnum period, between the presentation of the Budget, obtaining the Vote-on-Accounts and the related Appropriation Bill, I thought certain amendments would be required in the financial Bills and I introduced them and obtained the approval of the Lok Sabha on those amendments. The Bill, which we have placed before this House, is not the original Finance Bill; it is the Finance Bill,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

as amended, by Lok Sabha. Therefore, you will notice on top of the Bill, it is written 'As passed by Lok Sabha'.

As all the hon. Members are aware, the Finance Bill was passed in the Lok Sabha on 7th and 8th and with the passage of the Finance Bill by this august House, curtains would be drawn on almost three months of strenuous exercise of Budget-making, particularly in a very difficult year, nationally and internationally, so far as the past fiscal year is concerned. So far as direct taxes are concerned, the recommendations of the Standing Committee on direct taxes were received only on 9th March, 2012.

(Contd. By 1Y)

RG/12.50/1Y

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (contd.): I presented the Budget, and along with the Budget, the Finance Bill was also introduced on 16th March, 2012. Therefore, it was quite natural that I could not take into account all the major recommendations of the DTC. And, as I mentioned in the other House, I will have an opportunity, after the Budget Session is over, to go through all the recommendations, and thereafter, with the approval of the Cabinet, in the next Budget

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Session, I will bring the DTC Bill for the approval of both the Houses. And, at that stage, many of the recommendations of the Standing Committee will be accepted. But I have already incorporated certain amendments. These include removal of the cascading effect of the Dividend Distribution Tax, allowing Venture Capital to invest in all sectors, introduction of Advance Pricing Agreements and raising the threshold limit for audit and presumptive taxation to Rs.1 crore, which have been endorsed by the Standing Committee. Those are a part of the Finance Bill. However, as I mentioned, I could not consider all other recommendations.

Certain provisions relating to General Anti-Avoidance Rules (GAAR) have also been proposed in the Finance Bill, 2012. In the light of the recommendations of the Standing Committee on GAAR provisions in the DTC Bill, 2010, I have proposed an amendment to the GAAR provisions in three areas; (i) Remove the onus of proof entirely from the taxpayer to the Revenue Department before any action can be initiated under GAAR; (ii) Introduce an independent member in the GAAR approving panel to ensure objectivity and transparency. One member of the panel will now be an officer of the level of Joint

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Secretary or above from the Ministry of Law. So, it is not confined to the Department of Revenue alone as it was the original policy; and (iii) Provide that any taxpayer (resident or non-resident) can approach the Authority for Advance Ruling for a ruling as to whether an arrangement to be undertaken by her/him is permissible or not under the GAAR provisions. These will provide additional safeguards to the taxpayer. A Committee has been constituted under the Chairmanship of the Director General of Income Tax (International Taxation) to give recommendations for formulating the rules and guidelines for implementation of the GAAR provisions and to suggest safeguards so that these provisions are not applied indiscriminately. The Committee has already held several rounds of discussions with various stakeholders including the Foreign Institutional Investors. The Committee will submit its recommendations by 31st May, 2012. Realising that more time is needed to put in place the administrative structure to implement GAAR and to address various apprehensions and concerns expressed by the industry, I propose to defer the applicability of GAAR provisions by one year. The GAAR provisions

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

will now apply to income of the Financial Year 2013-14 and subsequent years.

The hon. Members are aware that a provision in the Finance Bill which seeks to retrospectively clarify the provisions of the Income Tax Act relating to capital gains on sale of assets located in India through indirect transfers abroad, has been intensely debated within the country and outside the country, inside the Houses and outside the Houses. I would like to confirm that clarificatory amendments do not override the provisions of the Double Taxation Avoidance Agreement which India has with 82 countries. It would impact those cases where the transaction has been routed through low tax or no tax countries with whom India does not have a Double Taxation Avoidance Agreement. The retrospective clarificatory amendments now under the consideration of Parliament will not be used to reopen any cases where assessment orders have already been finalized.

(Continued by 1Z)

SSS/1Z/12.55

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (CONTD.): I have asked the Central Board of Direct Taxes to issue a policy circular to clearly state this

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

position after the passage of the Finance Bill. Currently, the long-term capital gain arising from sale of unlisted securities in the case of Foreign Institutional Investors is taxed at the rate of ten per cent while other non-resident investors, including Private Equity investors are taxed at the rate of twenty per cent. In order to give parity to such investors, I have proposed a reduction in the rate, in their case, from twenty per cent to ten per cent, on the same lines as applicable to others. To promote further depth of the capital markets through listing of companies, extension of the benefit of tax exemption on long term capital gains to the sale of unlisted securities in an initial public offer has now been proposed. For this purpose, I propose to provide the levy of Securities Transaction Tax (STT) at the rate of 0.2 per cent on such a sale of unlisted securities. It has been proposed in the Finance Bill that any consideration received by a closely held company in excess of the fair market value of its shares would be taxable. Considering the concerns raised by ‘angel’ investors who invest in start-up companies, I propose to provide an enabling provision in the Income Tax Act for exemption to a notified class of investors. In order to augment long-term low cost funds from abroad for the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

infrastructure sector, the Finance Bill proposes a lower rate of withholding tax of five per cent for funding specific sectors through foreign borrowings. To further facilitate access to such borrowings, I propose to extend the lower rate of withholding tax to all businesses. This lower rate of tax would also be available for funds raised through long- term infrastructure bonds in addition to borrowing under a loan agreement. The Reserve Bank of India is formulating a scheme for subsidiarisation of Indian branches of foreign banks to ring fence Indian capital and Indian operations from economic shocks external to the Indian economic scenario. To support this effort, I propose to provide tax neutrality for such subsidiarisation. The Finance Bill proposes that every transferee of immovable property (other than agricultural land), at the time of making payment for transfer of the property, shall deduct tax at the rate of one per cent of such sum. I have received a number of representations pointing out the additional compliance burden this measure would impose. I, therefore, propose to withdraw this provision for levy of TDS on transfer of immovable property. To curb the flow of unaccounted money in the bullion and jewellery trade, the Finance Bill proposes the collection of tax at

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

source (TCS) by the seller at the rate of one per cent of the sale amount from the buyer for all cash transactions exceeding Rs. 2 lakhs. Responding to the representations made by the jewellery industry, that this would cause undue hardship, I propose to raise the threshold limit for TCS on cash purchases of jewellery from Rs. 2 lakhs to Rs. 5 lakhs. The threshold limit for TCS on cash purchase of bullion shall be retained at Rs. 2 lakhs. However, it is being clarified that bullion will not include any coin or other articles weighing ten grams or less. As far as Customs and Central Excise is concerned, a related proposal was the imposition of Central Excise duty on unbranded precious metal jewellery at the rate of one per cent. In view of the outpouring of sentiment, both within and outside the House, the Government has decided to withdraw the levy on all precious metal jewellery, branded or unbranded, with effect from 17th March, 2012.

(Contd. by NBR/2A)

-SSS/NBR-SC/2A/1.00

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (CONTD.): The House would recall that certain amendments were proposed to the Customs and Central Excise Law in respect of the classification of offences as cognizable

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

and non-bailable. In response to concerns expressed by hon. Members that the proposal regarding grant of bail only after hearing the public prosecutor is too harsh, I have proposed omission of this provision. In addition, only serious offences under the customs law invoking prohibited goods or duty evasion exceeding Rs. 50 lakhs shall now be cognizable. However, all these offences shall be bailable.

As hon. Members are aware, taxation of services has undergone a paradigm shift with the introduction of a Negative List. This initiative has been widely welcomed.

The Negative List has been drawn keeping in view the federal nature of the policy. Some of the States, through the Empowered Committee of State Finance Ministers, have expressed their concerns. I have decided to address their concerns by making changes in the definition of "service" which will exclude the activities specified in the Constitution as "deemed sale of goods." The definition of "works contract" has also been enlarged to include movable properties.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Exemption for specified services relating to agriculture in the Negative List has also been extended to agricultural produce enlarging the scope of the entry.

There are some other minor changes in the definitions based on the feedback and suggestions that we have received from various stakeholders and are specified in the revised draft.

I look forward to the views of my distinguished colleagues from this august House on the proposals in the Finance Bill.

Sir, with these words, I commend these two Bills for consideration of the House simultaneously. Thank you.

(Ends)

The questions were proposed.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The House is adjourned for lunch for one hour.

**The House then adjourned for lunch at
two minutes past one of the clock.**

2b/2.0/ks

The House re-assembled after lunch at four minutes past two of the clock, THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Discussion on Appropriation Bill and the Finance Bill. Shri Piyush Goyal.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL (MAHARASHTRA): Thank you very much, hon. Vice-Chairman, Sir.

I rise to speak on the Finance Bill and the Appropriation Bill. Though they have already been approved by the Lok Sabha, we are still concerned and pained about many issues, especially those that have arisen from this Finance Bill. And, I thank you, Sir, for giving us this opportunity to discuss this Bill and bring our issues to the kind attention of the hon. Finance Minister.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Sir, it is a sad day to have this debate listed in this House, because the first thing we do when we get up early in the morning is to read the Economic Times, and right from page 1 to the last page all you read is *'Economic gloom to deepen: India Inc.'*, *'No Confidence on Business and the Political Economy'*, *'Foreign investments expected to slow down'*, *'Populism to worsen'*, *'Low on confidence; low on certainty'*, *'A Wake-up call for UPA'*. There is nothing in this newspaper, Sir, which would give some confidence to me or, bring some enthusiasm to a young man like me, who is looking to investing in India and looking to the future of India.

(cd. by 2c/kgg)

Kgg/2c/2.05

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL (contd.): As they rightly say, Moody's add insult to injury. The rating of three of our best banks is downgraded and brought at par with the sovereign rating which, in the first place, is not something to be proud of. The rupee stays in a hole at Rs.53.97 to a dollar. There is nothing to enthuse the world. There is nothing to enthuse the Indian investor. There is nothing to enthuse even the middle-class, the poor people, and the corporate world. Nobody is

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

enthused in the present economic climate in the country. The Finance Minister mentioned in his Budget that he had to be cruel to be kind. Cruel he was and kind only in certain parts. I am glad that he was kind enough to correct some of the mistakes that I hoped were inadvertent when he presented his Budget. But, I hope, he will repair them, rectify them and bring them in a better form. I think, we have put in a lot of efforts in the Standing Committee recommendations on the Direct Tax Code, which he has very kindly said he would take into consideration. I can only appeal to the Finance Minister to look at those recommendations in the true letter and spirit. Do not let them get bogged down in bureaucratic hurdle which typically happens when good ideas or good recommendations come to the political leadership of the day.

Sir, we have just celebrated 60 years of the Indian Parliament. This is also a time to reflect, as we did on Sunday, on the state of the Indian economy. After Independence, we have gone through six decades of distinct characteristics in the India growth story. In the '50s, we had the pain of partition; the planned model, the socialist model where State investments in core manufacturing and heavy

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

industries with technologies largely from the Western block gave us the GDP growth of about 4 per cent. In the '60s, we had the pain of three wars. But, we also had the Green Revolution initiative in 1963 and the nationalization of many sectors such as banking. We got a growth of about 3 per cent during that period. In the '70s, there was a pain of political instability. In the Emergency, many of the colleagues, sitting in this House, were imprisoned. We went through a period of turmoil in the country. A Government which had come on the slogan of *garibi hatao* in 1971, which I personally believe sowed the seeds of vote-bank-politics in this country, was absolutely unable to manage the political environment and we had a situation of turmoil. Despite that, the GDP grew by 4.5 per cent. In the '80s, there was hope. A young man was elected as the Prime Minister for addressing some of the security issues that were prevailing in certain parts of the country. We had a great hope at that point of time. I was a young man; I was in my teens at that time. Unfortunately, Sir, despite averments to say that he would stop leakages in the Government system--which had gone as high as 85 per cent, as quoted by the hon. Finance Minister at that time--the country was saddled with major corruption scandals.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

And, once again, we saw a period of uncertainty. We saw the rise of sectarian politics and the GDP growth remained at about 5 per cent. As my colleague was saying, we saw for three decades the 'Hindu rate of growth'.

Sir, '90s was a decade of extraordinary challenges and extraordinary changes with the collapse of the Centrally-planned economies. It started with the Gulf War which led to a sharp increase in oil prices. The payment crisis of 1991 the country faced, the hon. Finance Minister referred to it in his speech in the other House, was not simply due to deterioration of the trade account. It was accompanied by other adverse developments on the capital account reflecting the loss of confidence in the Government's ability to manage the situation. I am quoting this from a statement of the Government of India titled, 'The Payment Crisis of 1991'. The cost of credit rose sharply. There was an outflow of NRI deposits. The IIP, Sir, fell during August 1990 to November 1991, from 10.9 per cent to minus 1.5 per cent.

(Contd. by tdb/2d)

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL (CONTD.): There was also evidence of expectation of default; therefore, of devaluation also. And these were creating significant imbalances in the economy. All this happened in a short span of nine months, Sir. I am saying all this to highlight that when we see the situation today, we are coming very close to a situation like that. The hon. Finance Minister has used some statistics, in the other House, while replying to the debate, where he said that we still have seven months of foreign exchange to cover our imports. Our short-term debt to the GDP has reduced significantly. Our external position is not as bad as it was. But, Sir, I beg to differ with the hon. Finance Minister. Today's situation shows that the foreign exchange reserves are at 16.9 per cent of the GDP, as the hon. Finance Minister himself said. The import cover has come down to 7.3 months from 14 months. External debt is still 20 per cent as proportion of the GDP, and the short-term debt is now 26.3 per cent. Sir, the situation may look quite cozy in terms of numbers to the Finance Minister, but when you juxtapose it to the high level of 130 billion dollars of repayment in the next 12 months with the FII investment for 200 billion dollars, in the Indian market, and large NRI deposits, all of

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

which, Sir, is hot money, in all of which, Sir, there can be a flight of capital in the climate that the country is in today, the negative mood, the negative sentiment prevailing. All of these, Sir, are worrying whether in the next six to nine months, the hon. Finance Minister, often quoting coalition trouble, will be able to handle the situation and improve the fiscal position. Of course, I don't subscribe to this theory of coalition compulsion because we have run a coalition also, Sir. We have had almost the same allies that this Government has. While Mr. Vajpayee ran the Government, I think, he ran it very credibly; he ran it taking the coalition partners into confidence; he respected the sentiments of the coalition partners, and he respected State-Centre relations and federalism. I am sure, if this Government was to look at these issues more seriously with an open heart and an open mind, they would also not have such serious problems with their partners.

Sir, apart from the new Government which came up in 1991, there was a period of economic liberalisation and substantial reforms. Some structural reforms on trade and industry, and the policy framework was improved, and certainly, there was some fiscal correction, some fiscal discipline, which was necessary to restore the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

macro-economic balance in the economy. But, then, we cannot deny that the economy came back on track for a few years. But what did they leave behind for the NDA to inherit in 1998? There was inflation at 9.3 per cent; the growth was at five per cent of the GDP; agricultural growth was negative; industrial production down; export performance less than three per cent of the growth last year; fiscal deficit at 6.1 per cent of the GDP; capital market in the doldrums; and huge infrastructure bottlenecks. The NDA was given a Government with all these problems. Apart from that, the NDA Government also had to face an unprecedented financial turmoil, the East-Asian Financial Crisis in 1998; followed quickly by economic sanctions, after the famous Pokhran Nuclear Tests, which finally brought India into the league of nuclear nations and made us a proud country. We also had to face the Kargil War. Despite all that, in the decade of 2000, the NDA Government focussed on fiscal consolidation, business and trade liberalisation. We had insurance, banking, telecom, power, land-ceiling laws, political reforms, the FRBM Act, huge road development and airport privatization programme, a very successful

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

disinvestment programme, and over all, we strengthened the macro-economic parameters.

Sir, the UPA Government came back to power in 2004, and I quote from the Economic Survey of 2004-05, prepared by the UPA Government. They say that the Economy had registered a growth of 8.5 per cent in 2003-04; Agriculture grew at 9.6 per cent; industry, 6.6 per cent; services maintained 9.1; inflation was down to 5.5 per cent; the Consumer Price Index in April, 2004 was at 2.2 per cent. The external debt position, thanks to prepayment of costly debt and rationalization of interest rates, had improved significantly.

(Contd. by 2e-cls)

KLS/2E-2.15

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL (CONTD): We had low interest rate. The Forex reserves had gone up to 113 billion dollars which showed almost 40 per cent growth. The current account surplus was there for the last three years of the NDA rule. The best sustainability indicators were in the positive. The external debt as a proportion of the GDP was at 17.8 per cent and the share of short-term debt, which the hon. Finance

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Minister was very happy to report at 20 per cent, was only 4.3 per cent when we laid down office. Fiscal deficit was at 4.6 per cent. This is what we gave them in inheritance, Sir. And look at what they have done in the last eight years of UPA rule. Every economic parameter has deteriorated. Look at the current year, 2011-12, figures. GDP growth has been revised to 6.9 per cent. I humbly submit that figure is not going to be achieved. Look at the last quarter's number as they are coming out. Every number is showing less than projected. I suspect the GDP will be at 6.5 per cent last year. We had double-digit inflation. Forex reserves have fallen in the last year to 293 billion dollars. The fiscal deficit is at 5.9 per cent and again the last quarter results can make that deteriorates further. Sir, S&P's downgrade says it all. They have projected a negative outlook on long-term credit servicing capability of India. This could lead to a possible downgrading of the sovereign rating within the next 24 months. There is little progress in economic reforms they say. The GDP growth rate will decline further. Fiscal deficit is unmanageable and will shoot up as subsidies will rise. Sir, when the NDA was in power, we are proud to say, the ratings had improved. It was from a negative to a positive

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

outlook when the NDA Government ran. Even the Fitch ratings had improved during the NDA Government. But what has happened now? Sir, please do not take the ratings lightly. This decline in the Sensex following the ratings, this rush of FII flowing out of the country, the stoppage of any new proposals, no FII no FDI coming into the country, well the Government may claim that in March eight billion dollars came out. But as an investment banker, I would like to submit that the 8.1 billion dollars included a deal which was consummated six months before, over 6 billion dollar of that was only from that deal. Right now there is absolutely no business in the market. All new investments have stopped, Sir. There is impetus for outflow of funds rather than inflow of funds. Indian businessmen, the **Economic Times** report says that the Indian businessmen are looking to invest outside the country. They have no confidence in my country any more. This is despite the fact that we have one of the most learned, one of the most experienced Finance Ministers at the helm of affairs. Well, the FM will say that it is a timely warning and there is no need to panic. I suspect, Sir, he did not need the S&P to be given this timely warning. In this very House, when I spoke on 11th August, 2011 on the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Appropriation Bill No.3, I had said and I quote: "India could get into a situation of downgrade similar to the USA situation now and the country cannot afford any downgrade at this stage which will result in an increase in the cost of our international borrowings." A common man can tell you what is happening in the economy, Sir. Of course, the Economic Advisor has revealed all when he said this in the IMF in Washington about the state of affairs of this Government. Sir, please do not blame every thing on global factors alone. We have a huge domestic economy, a huge domestic consumption demand. We have a huge demographic dividend to benefit from. The business environment is today shattered. The business environment wants confidence. The Indian entrepreneur, the investor is more than enough to overcome all these difficulties. Only the Government of the day would give an impetus to their efforts. But in the aftermath of this series of scandals, governance issues which have come to fore, have left this Government paralysed. Licences get cancelled. There is no clear policy on spectrum allocation. We do not know what will happen to the arbitration that global companies had initiated against India, and many of them are talking of withdrawing from India. Sir, the message

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

has gone out that the Government of India no longer cares about attracting investment.

(Contd by 2F/Pk)

-KLS/PK/2.20/2F

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL (CONTD.): I, very respectfully, submit that the hon. Finance Minister did not do justice when he said in the other House that India can live without ‘foreign investment.’ Certainly, India can live without ‘foreign investment.’ I will be the last fellow to say we need only ‘foreign investment’. I have tonnes and tonnes of cuttings here of the hon. Finance Minister, of the hon. Prime Minister, of the hon. Commerce Minister going all over the world, almost begging for foreign investment, coming to this House and almost pleading with this House to support multi-brand retail FDI. Is that the only form of the FDI to attract investment? FDI is permitted in a hundred other sectors. Why is that FDI not coming? What makes you to believe that multi-brand FDI will come? But FDI will not come in setting up cold storages, infrastructure, roads, and airports. That is because of the policy paralysis that this Government has gone into. The benchmark indices have declined drastically since March 16, the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

date of presentation of the Budget. As we all know, the rupee is depreciating. FDI investments have dried up in the last two months. Sir, this Budget was an opportunity to change all this negative perception about India. We had no elections round the corner. It could have made a road map for the future. However, all sections of the society were let down, as I will explain a little further. There is total policy paralysis, non-movement of reforms, no focus on energy security, no focus on investment in infrastructure, no focus on health and education, and no focus on farmers on whose sweat and toil this country runs. What is this Government giving to the people of India? The power sector is starved of coal and raw materials. They are lying idle. There is no coal; there is no oil; there is no gas. Infrastructure development is stagnating, because Ministries within the Government don't see eye to eye. The Ministry of Environment is out to stymie all the projects. The Ministry of Finance and the Reserve Bank together have made investments so expensive that it is unviable today. In health and education, there is an incremental increase in spending, that the Budget shows. But there is no focus on quality. We have huge NRHM scams and we have also huge MNREGA scams. Social

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

spending is good, Sir; we are not against it. But social spending should be directed; social spending should result in creation of infrastructure and in the well-being of the people. There are no concrete measures to promote agriculture in this Budget, as I will show later.

Sir, the disinvestment targets are not met. Disinvestment is not a year-end phenomenon. You didn't do disinvestment of the ONGC in the last quarter of the year. Then, when you do it, you mess it up. Your bureaucrats are advising you to keep the share price over and above the market price of that day. I am amazed that this Government has such Advisers. They should be sacked forthwith, if that is the level of advise that they give to this Government. When only five per cent of the disinvestment programme is subscribed on that crucial day, what does the Government do? The Finance Ministry steps in. They put pressure on a PSU like LIC, and make the LIC subscribe to 95 per cent of the issue, after closing hours. I demand that an investigation should be done on this and a White Paper should come out. Is that the cause of the LIC being downgraded in the current Moody's round? We must know where the truth lies, Sir.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

There are residual stakes of Hindustan Zinc Ltd. and BALCO, which are low-hanging fruits this Government can encash. I don't know why they can't take decisions on anything. I don't think they need coalition partners' approvals for day-to-day decision making. I think, Sir, India's finances are held hostage to political whims. We need to move out of vote-bank politics. We need to see fiscal prudence, we need to see cost of borrowing going down, capital investment being encouraged; we need to respect investors' sentiments and domestic consumption. Sir, in the last few years, tax revenue has only been used to fund short-term political gains. Investment activities have been given only lip service. As I had mentioned in this House earlier, in the last eight years of this Government, revenue expenditure has gone up by over 300 per cent at an average, Plan and Non-Plan, whereas capital expenditure has not even gone up by 100 per cent. Sir, the future generations are going to hold all of us responsible for the situation we are leading this country to and for what we will leave behind for them to suffer.

(Contd. by PB/2G)

PB/2g/2.25

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL (CONTD.): Sir, there is this policy flip-flop. The Finance Bill, not this year but the last year, provided for MAT and TDT on Special Economic Zones. Now, 'Special Economic Zones' was a visionary policy introduced by the NDA. We had expected them to be large format zones in rural hinterland, largely on wastelands with independent and new infrastructure, tax benefits and easier operating laws to reduce the pressure on existing villages. We wanted to create jobs, we wanted exports to grow, and we wanted Indian competitiveness in manufacturing to be there. But, Sir, what did this Government do? In UPA-I, they approved over 700 SEZs. Against the two that were approved by the NDA, they approved over 700 SEZs, as small as 20 acre SEZ in the heart of Mumbai -- and I don't know how many SEZs are there in Gurgaon, outside Delhi. They messed up a beautiful law and then when they realized that it has gone out of hand, they bring in MAT and TDT without any grandfathering provisions. This uncertainty has led to a complete loss of confidence in the ability of this Government to attract foreign investment.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Sir, investments in saving rates are falling. The monetary policy, which is being used to arrest inflation, is only causing more pain. In this climate of policy flip-flop, they bring in a large number of retrospective amendments. Nobody is against taxing foreign incomes which relate to assets in India. I think, this whole House can unanimously support such a Resolution. But not make it retroactive in nature and don't make the people lose confidence in the judicial system of India when the Supreme Court of India gives a certain ruling. When the Supreme Court could not understand and interpret the law -- anyway, it was the Congress Government which was in power when the IT Act came -- when all of us, the Chartered Accountants, could not interpret it, when the lawyers could not interpret it, the bureaucrats — I am not blaming the Finance Minister because, I am sure, he has been misled with information -- say, 'no', the law has to be clarified. In 1961, we meant it as follows. Now, if they had to bring a clarification to just attack one Company, they should have done it in 2007, in 2008, as the United Kingdom has done, as China has done. The hon. Finance Minister has quoted. Sir, I have all the details here. There is not much time. I could have

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

dealt on each of the retrospective amendments that took place in USA, China and the UK. All of them, Sir, grandfathered the past. The UK amendment, Sir, that you talked about, grandfathered the decisions of the Court when they brought in retrospective amendments. And, I spoke to the hon. Finance Minister of UK. He said, 'It was brought within two months of the event occurring and it was to tax 'a particular transaction.' It was discussed with that Corporate and it was settled that 'yes, this is how it is; this is how we are clarifying it.' There is a complete absence of consistent and coherent decision-making in this Government.

Sir, the oil and gas sector is suffering. Inequalities in the country are increasing and overall, there is a sense of doom and gloom which is stated in the newspapers every day.

Sir, I want to make a few suggestions. Let us focus on agriculture with 15 per cent of the GDP, but 55 per cent of population dependant on it. I think, the Plan target of 4 per cent is not enough. We need to look at incremental growth.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PRO. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Goyal, please conclude.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, I have talked to my leaders. We have only one speaker. He needs two-three minutes. So, don't worry.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): But even then, please stick to the time.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Don't worry. We will stick to the time unless the hon. FM tells me to sit down.

Sir, the Plan target of four per cent is not enough. We need to look for incremental gains in productivity. We need massive requirements to meet the Food Security Bill that the extra constitutional bodies are now forming, and, possibly, we will see it in this House. That additional requirement will have to be met by imports and that level of imports will make international prices of foodgrains rise exponentially and the Forex strain on the country will be huge. Not to say, Sir, I am against food security. Ensure food security, but not by imports; food security by encouraging my farmer to produce more, by giving him low-cost credit, by giving him money when he needs it most, by giving him low-cost high quality seeds, by not making fertilizer prices increase by 250 per cent in one year between 2010 and 2011, by giving storage facilities and warehouse chains so

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

that his foodgrains are not allowed to rot, and, if I may just add, by giving him jute bags in time, so that he doesn't have to suffer an ignominious loss of his produce.

(Contd. by 2h/SKC)

2h/2.30/skc

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL (CONTD.): Sir, that is what we need to address. The way forward would be to infuse technology in our farms. The way forward would be to invest in infrastructure in the farms, make prices commensurate with the cost of production, incentivize private sector participation in farm infrastructure by giving viability gap funding, because by itself, it is not viable and work closely with the States, this being a State Subject, to bring in uniform laws all over the country.

Sir, there is a risk of food insecurity in the coming years, and the problem of water shortages is looming large. There is a risk to ecology in Punjab and Haryana due to deterioration of soil and fall in the Water Table. We need to encourage crop rotation and stop grain mono-cropping there. Overall, Sir, I think, agriculture needs a focus, which is, sadly, lacking in this Government.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Health, Sir, is the other sector which I would like to talk about. Outlays have been increased, but there is no strategy to address the lack of infrastructure in the public healthcare delivery mechanism. Primary Health Centres are in a mess. There is a huge shortage of doctors and nurses. There is no effort in capacity building. It is so difficult to get a medical college from this Government, because they can't even have appointments and elections to the Medical Council of India.

Sir, the Budget is all about *asha*, but I think, it has left all of us with *nirasha!* The NRHM corruption and misuse of funds needs to be stopped. I think, the Government should seriously look at investing more of the GDP in health, and increase the health linkages in the sector with the private sector, something like the UK model, where doctors set up their Primary Health Centres and the Government funds their budgets, or the *Vatsalya* Hospitals or the *Narayanan Hridayalaya* experiment in Andhra Pradesh, with their own Government there.

Sir, in education, the less said, the better. They can keep tomming any figures of literacy but they don't mean anything. Their

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

own esteemed colleagues in the Treasury Benches point out to us that a IX Standard student can't read a III Standard textbook! We need 500 more skilled people in this country in the next ten years. And what kind of capacity building do we have? We can, at best, make five million people developed in skills in this country. We have a very illustrious person in Mr. Ramadurai to head the Skill Development Corporation, but I think, unless we dovetail some more projects, unless we dovetail education, skill development — and I would also suggest MNERGA — into one, we will never achieve skill development, because the poor man is not going to come for skill development, losing wages. I was going to recommend that MNERGA should be dovetailed with skill development and people given money to develop their skills over a period of time. That way, we can actually invest, not just Rs.3000 crores in skill development, which they have provided, but possibly, even Rs.40,000 crores.

Sir, job creation is the need of the hour. Jobs can come in manufacturing, jobs can come in tourism and jobs can come in housing. And, what have we done? We have just announced some manufacturing policy, but have dismally failed to create new jobs. The

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

share of manufacturing has fallen to 16 per cent. None of the issues relating to availability of land, connectivity, infrastructure, skills and finance at a reasonable cost have been addressed. There are multiple levels of taxation. Labour laws need to be rationalized. There is a shortage of power and water. About the Environment Ministry, the less said, the better. Manufacturing is at a standstill in this country.

Sir, talking of tourism, this Budget allocates Rs.1282 crores for tourism, which is just one per cent of the Budget. Malaysia allocates 5.1 per cent, China, 3.8 per cent and Singapore, 9.1 per cent of the Budget. We had 6.27 million international tourists last year. We can only hang our heads in shame; even China and Dubai, which are one-city States, have more international tourists than the whole of India. The USA had 62 million international tourists last year.

(contd. at 2j/hk)

HK/2j/2.35

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL (CONTD.): And what do we do? We increased the burden of service tax on tourism. We don't create any infrastructure in tourist locations. We don't provide any incentives to the private enterprises. We don't give any tax holiday from Civic,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

State and Central taxes because tourism is like export and there is adequate possibility to earn forex revenues out of tourism to help the hon. Finance Minister manage debts. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Goyal, you have taken 31 minutes. Only 12 minutes are left for your colleague.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: He is my colleague. He is right here. You can ask him. ...(Interruptions)... On housing, Sir, the Budget is silent, except providing 150 per cent Weighted Deduction. There is nothing else to give push to affordable housing and to give an encouragement and an impetus to the housing sector. We need an easier regulatory and environmental approach and low interest cost to make houses available to all in this country. Infrastructure, Sir, which is the most important sector is begging for this Government's mercy. We need to give an impetus to infrastructure projects through effectively using the viability-gap funding mechanism. Environmental and regulatory approvals should be obtained by the Government before they allocate projects to the private sector, rather than private sector running from pillar to posts and failing to get any approvals in time. The high cost of interests again and unavailability of long-term capital make

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

infrastructure projects unviable. In fact, Sir, in another scheme for MNREGA ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, please conclude. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: You could possibly dovetail MNREGA with viability-gap funding and promote Rs.1 lakh crore worth of projects. Using that, it would still put Rs.40,000 crore into the people's hands because labour cost is 40 to 50 per cent of infrastructure projects. Sir, the Roads Programme is at a complete standstill. Hardly, four or five kilometers of roads a day are coming up. The telecom industry, which was the blue-eyed boy and which was a show-case industry, is in a complete mess. They are in a state of flux with uncertainty. The regulatory regime is completely messed up. Owing to scandals and policy paralysis, costs to the consumers are increasing rapidly. Some recommendations have come out, which will take the country back to pre-NTP-99 days and you will be in a situation where we will again start paying Rs.2 or Rs.3 per call from mobile phones that we are so liberally using now. Overall, the telecom sector has plunged into uncertainty and a total policy failure. We need to create 200 new

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

airports in this country to connect the length and breadth of this country through low-cost airports. Please also make the taxes competitive. Don't kill the whole industry. Look at Goa. They halved the ATF and are encouraging the airlines industry to come in a bigger way. Your major airports in the country are so costly that nobody in the world wants to come there. Our Indian airports are ten times the cost of the Dubai International Airport. How are we going to encourage the airport sector? ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please conclude. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: We need to bring in new ports in the country. Expand the rail network. In the power sector, there is complete policy paralysis. We have been hearing that the Government will address these issues. But so far we don't see any light at the end of the tunnel. I wish there would be focus on the renewal energy, solar, wind and bio, which can remove the shortages of power.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, please conclude. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: I have been unwell for the last two-three days.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): For the sake of your health, you should conclude now...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, in the Finance Bill, I am going to highlight one or two things. Well, it is very good that section 35AD provides Weighted Deduction for investment in various sectors. It should be allowed to be set off against the other business income of the company. Otherwise, it is a failed section. You allow it to be set off against income of that same project, which will come over ten years. That benefit doesn't accrue to the business and it doesn't have any impact on making infrastructure easier.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, you have to conclude. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Also, Sir, they have withdrawn GAAR. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, you have to conclude. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, in the indirect taxes, in the taxes which are applicable on indirect transfers, they have not yet clarified the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

position regarding FII investment and for up-stream investors.

...(Interruptions)...

(Contd. by 2k/KSK)

KSK/2.40/2K

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL (CONTD.): I think the Government needs to address various issues in the Finance Bill and bring in a sense of confidence in the economy.

(Ends)

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (NOMINATED): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I thank you for allowing me to express my views on the Appropriation (No.3) Bill, 2012, and the Finance Bill, 2012, as passed by Lok Sabha, which I strongly support.

Sir, I begin by congratulating the hon. Finance Minister because under the prevailing domestic and global financial conditions, probably, nobody would have presented a better Budget and a better Finance Bill than the ones presented by the hon. Finance Minister, Shri Pranab Mukherjee, for 2012-13. Sir, taking into account the entire structure of the Budget and the Finance Bill, there is no doubt in my

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

mind that he is more kind and less cruel, if at all ‘cruelty’ is defined in that way. Sir, it is ridiculous to judge the performance of the economy of Indian size on the basis of what happened during the last two months, three months, or, last one quarter.

Before I proceed to analyse the Finance Bill and the Appropriation (No.3) Bill and the provisions of the Budget, I must make two broad observations in the beginning. Sir, in the entire history of Parliamentary democracy, probably, an opposition party is yet to be born which will find any merit at a point of time in any of the policy formulated by the ruling party. Second qualification is that there is difference between the political economy and abundantly mixing politics with economics. In my presentation, whatever time is available to me, I shall be speaking about more of economics of the Budget and the Finance Bill rather than mixing more politics with economics.

Sir, under what condition the Finance Bill and the Budget have been prepared? The world economy is limping under the global financial crisis of September, 2008. International prices of crude oil have been rising and hovering around between \$100 and \$120 per

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

barrel. Some countries have been manipulating the exchange value of their currencies which have been distorting the world commodity prices which have been showing upward trend. The EURO Zone is still in deep sovereign debt crisis, so much so that the credit ratings of Portugal and Greece, during 2007 and 2012, have fallen by 32.79 and 74.52 per cent respectively. Once upon a time, the EURO was itself on the verge of collapse. The entire Arab world is in turmoil. The world economy continues to be volatile. As a result, the economies of developed countries could barely grow at the annual average rates between two to three per cent during 2011. During the first three quarters of 2011, even the Brazil and Russia registered growth rates of 3.2 and 4.2 per cent respectively. Only China and Argentina, of all the countries in the world, could register growth rates of 9.2 and 10 per cent respectively. Sir, Indian economy's performance of 6.9 per cent growth for the last year is to be viewed in this context of international background.

Sir, as against the targeted growth rate of 7.5 per cent for 2011-12, the growth rate, as I mentioned, was 6.9 per cent. One reason for this was 13 times increase in the repo rate in 19 months by the Reserve

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Bank of India to control inflation that raised the cost of credit to the industry. The objective of the Reserve Bank of India is very noble, but it could not be fairly achieved because propelling of Indian inflation is essentially a structured problem. But, Sir, let me compare the growth scenario during the NDA and the UPA rules. Under the UPA rules, between 2005-06 and 2010-11, the rate of growth ranged between 6.7 per cent in 2008-09, which was the lowest, and 9.6 per cent in 2006-07, which was the highest. This means, even the lowest growth of 6.7 per cent in 2008-09 during the UPA rule was higher than that for the four years of BJP-led NDA Government, ranging between barely 4 per cent in 2003-04 to 6.7 per cent in 1998-99.

(continued by 2l — gsp)

GSP-KLG-2L-2.45

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (CONTD.): All said and done, the BJP-led NDA must gracefully accept that the UPA has outpaced them so far as the growth scenario is concerned. (Interruptions)

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: This is not politics! This is economics! (Interruptions)

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR: These are the figures.

(Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Javadekar, please.

Please take your seat. (Interruptions) This is his view.

(Interruptions)

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR: Sir, throughout my professional career, I have always argued that higher rate of growth is necessary but not sufficient condition for raising the levels of living of the people. Equally important, it depends upon the pattern and structure of the distribution of the benefits of economic growth. But it would be absolutely absurd to under-estimate the importance of higher rate of growth because in the absence of higher rate of growth, we shall have job only of distribution of poverty. Sir, there is wide variety of views, criticism and evaluation of Budget, 2012-13. Some have found it reasonable, pragmatic, routed in the ground, cautious, balanced and broadly acceptable to all sections of the population. Some have described it as second worst since 1970-71, and, some have, as usual, described it as anti-people.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Sir, in a highly in-egalitarian society like India, Budget is an exercise to balance, not only different but conflicting claims of different sections of the population. This is what is, in classical sense, political economy of the Budget.

Sir, Budget is not merely a mechanism of allocation of resources. It is also the mechanism of distribution of income among different sections of the society. Sir, with what is known in economic theory as the Budget constraint, the Finance Minister, according to me, has tried to the best of his ability to address major concerns of the economy. Personally, I would have liked him to do many more things, and, also to do, whatever he has done, on a larger scale, but I know his constraints.

Sir, first and the foremost, all the critics have failed to miserably understand that the Finance Minister has emphasized on the domestic demand-driven growth recovery. Sir, it is common knowledge in economic that there is difference between the size of population and the size of domestic market. The latter comprises only that section of the population that is relevant from the viewpoint of demand for consumption goods and services, and, investment goods, what Lord

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Keynes had described as 'Aggregate Demand', which, at a given point of time, through famous Keynesian principles of multiplier and acceleration, determines the level of income and employment, and, speeds up the process of economic growth. The size of potential market of Indian economy is just huge, the point which was all along emphasized by prominent Indian economists such as Nirmal Kumar Chandra, Ashok Mitra, Sukhamoy Chakravarty, and, K.N. Raj. I, therefore, compliment the Finance Minister for explicitly underlining the procedural importance of domestic demand driven growth for accelerating the process of economic development in the country.

Sir, the Finance Minister has tried to address the concerns with respect to supply-bottlenecks, again within the Budget constraints, in agriculture, energy, coal, transport, and, other infrastructure areas. Other steps include, stimulating private sector investment, tackling malnutrition through effective intervention 200 affected districts, ensuring improvement in the delivery system through transparent governance, addressing the question of corruption in public life, and, bringing out a 'White Paper' on black money.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Sir, the Eleventh Five Year Plan, during the UPA rule, under the able-leadership of hon. Prime Minister, Dr. Manmohan Singh, is a turning point in India's post-Independence economic planning. Not only was the Plan committed to securing faster and more inclusive growth but for the first time since Independence, it was the Eleventh Plan, which ushered an era of rights-based approach to development. It brought Right to Free and Compulsory Education to Children, Tribal Forest Land Rights Act, the Right to Information, and, most importantly, the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme. Let me now briefly deal with some important proposals and programmes initiated by the hon. Finance Minister, and, while mentioning this, I shall take note of certain points, I think, important, raised by hon. Member from the Opposition. Firstly, let me take agriculture. Sir, despite two decades of economic reforms concentrating mainly on services sector to be followed by industry, agriculture still provides 55 per cent of country's total employment and more than two-thirds of the people depend upon it for their livelihood but its share of agriculture in GDP has declined to 13.9 per cent in last year.

(Contd. by 2M-SK)

SK/2M/2.50

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (contd.): This is a disproportionate crisis. Agriculture is a State subject and the States must invest more in this sector without giving any excuse. In my first speech in the Rajya Sabha, Sir, I had suggested to the Government that let there be exclusive meeting of the National Development Council to deal with the problems of agriculture. The Finance Minister has allocated Rs. 20,208 crore to the Department of Agriculture and Cooperation, Rs. 9,217 crore to the Rashtriya Krishi Vikas Yojna and Rs. 14,242 crore to the Accelerated Irrigation Benefit Programme. Most importantly, agricultural credit is enhanced by rupees One lakh crore — from Rs. 4.75 lakh crore in 2011-12 to Rs. 5.75 lakh crore this year. I hope the small and marginal farmers who constitute about 70 per cent of the total farmers in the country shall get their due share from this substantial enhancement of farm credit.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Sir we saw a furore in the country, including the Parliament, over the poverty estimates recently released by the Planning Commission. I don't want to enter into the controversies relating to the methods of poverty estimation. But I must pay my tribute to my friend, late Prof. Suresh Tendulkar, who brought poverty estimates in this country out of calorie norms, and for the first time included expenditure on education and health. But, Sir, whatever method one may use, the extent of poverty in India has undoubtedly declined, though the rate of reduction has slowed down due to growing inequality in the distribution of benefits of economic growth. Sir, in this context, unlike what my earlier colleague said, I compliment Shrimati Sonia Gandhi ji for championing the National Food Security Scheme which is a very important scheme because at least 60 years after declaring this country as a sovereign, democratic republic, poor people in this country have a legitimate right to adequate food entitlements. Sir, the National Food Security Scheme has also an ethical dimension; it is not merely an economic programme because economics minus ethics would lead us to a jungle of figures and statistics.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

The allocation to the Integrated Child Development Scheme has been enhanced by 58 per cent. The Mid Day Meal Scheme, among other things, may have played an important role in reducing the drop-out rates at the primary school level and has been given approximately 12,000 crore.

Sir, contrary to severe criticism in some corners, I am proud of the achievements of the Nehruvian model of socio-economic development that laid down the foundation of an emerging Indian nation state, and that too, against all odds. Therefore, I discount the discovery of some professional economists and social scientists, some of them being even Lords, that the Nehruvian period was a wastage of time. There is a growing fashion of dismissing everything that happened before 1991. But, Sir, as Prof. Michael Lipton argued in 1981 in his celebrated book, *Urban Bias in World Development*, I am constrained to say that even the Indian economic planning in the initial years was not totally free from urban bias. This was particularly true with respect to access of rural people to good quality education and health facilities, drinking water, sanitation, roads, housing, electricity, entertainment and so on. It will be absolutely unfair to say that this

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

was intentional. In fact, several schemes and programmes were initiated during the intervening period by different Governments, and all of them happened to be the Congress Governments. One such revolutionary intervention was made by Shrimati Indira Gandhi ji when in 1969, she nationalized major commercial banks and brought agricultural credit under priority lending. Sir, I distinctly remember, as a student of Economics, that the then Bharatiya Jana Sangh and Swatantra Party vehemently opposed nationalization of banks, and as far as my understanding goes, left the House when the decision was taken in the Parliament. Napoleon once said, “Had there not been Rousseau, there would not have been French Revolution”. I say with a sense of pride, had Shrimati Indira Gandhi ji not nationalised the banks and brought the agriculture credit under priority lending, there would not have been Green Revolution.

The second revolution was brought in the area of communications and information technology for which the country shall permanently remain grateful to late Shri Rajiv Gandhi ji who knew the pulse of the 21st century. He was also the architect of the 73rd and 74th amendments to the Constitution that gave a new life to the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Panchayati Raj institutions, that empowered the rural people in general and women in particular through 33 per cent reservation for them in these institutions.

Thereafter, only the Congress-led UPA Government has made a decisive intervention through initiating the rights-based approach to development.

(Contd. by 2N-ysr)

-SK/YSR/2.55/2N

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (CONTD.): Sir, the Finance Minister has provided Rs.14,000 crore for rural drinking water and sanitation and Rs.24,000 crore for the Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana. According to an important study by the International Food Price Research Institute, access to good quality all-weather roads is shown to have a stronger poverty-reduction impact than even irrigation, due to the former's multi-dimensional linkages.

Widening inter-State and intra-State economic disparities have a crucial bearing on our federal polity. I, therefore, appreciate that the Finance Minister has allocated Rs.12,000 to the Backward Region Grant Fund and Rs.20,000 crore to the Rural Infrastructure Fund.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

The Eleventh Plan had allocated 20 per cent of its total resources to education sector. That had made the Hon. Prime Minister describe the Eleventh Plan as the 'Education Plan'. This time too, the Finance Minister has provided adequate amount for the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan and the Right to Education.

Sir, during the last several years, due to growing privatisation of health facilities, the relatively poor people are forced to spend much of their income on medication than before. I, therefore, compliment the Finance Minister for providing Rs.20,822 crore under the Rural Health Mission. I am happy to know that the Government shall be soon launching the Urban Health Mission also.

Sir, creation of productive skills in the labour force is one of the key and critical requirements for accelerating the process of economic growth, as was argued by Professor Theodore Schultz. Sir, we all know that in our labour-abundant country, barely 8-9 per cent of the workforce is endowed with training; three per cent for education and about seven per cent on job training. I am sorry to say that our entire university education system is largely irrelevant to induce employability in our youth. We have to seriously deal with this syndrome by totally

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

restructuring our higher education system. In view of this, I congratulate hon. Prime Minister on initiating the National Skill Development Mission during the Eleventh Plan followed by the formation of the National Skill Development Corporation, which is working satisfactorily with adequate financial provision.

Sir, the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme has become a toy in the hands of politicians and mainstream economists. According to me, the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme is the most novel programme that the UPA Government gave to the nation. Sir, nowhere in the world such scheme is thought of, let alone implemented. I gratefully mention the contribution of the Congress President, Smt. Sonia Gandhi, in initiating this scheme and Shri Rahul Gandhi's initiative in making it nationwide. Sir, the successive Economic Surveys have shown that about 50-60 million poor rural unskilled households are annually given assured jobs with varying number of days and with minimum wages. And who are these people who are working under it? The share of the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes in the total persondays of employment in the country was 61 per cent in 200 districts in 2006-07;

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

about 56 per cent in 330 districts in 2007-08; and about 52-54 per cent in all districts during 2008-09 to 2010-11. The remaining are from the most backward classes and the poor in general. I am sure the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme has played a crucial role in reducing the rural poverty.

Sir, I am closely aware of the shortcomings of the implementation of this scheme. There is enough scope for improvement. But I am also aware that the pressures are being developed from some corners to dilute the scheme in one way or the other, or, for one reason or the other. I strongly disagree with such views.

Sir, some influential mainstream economists in this country spend a lot of their intellectual energy like some politicians in condemning all schemes meant for the poor as sops, doles and electoral gimmicks. They distressingly fail to take into account the fact that at the aggregate level, such extraneous schemes become extremely important because the mainstream growth process by itself is not able to address the concerns of the poor in the country,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

particularly when the employment elasticity of growth is declining and due to market imperfections.

(Contd. by VKK/20)

-YSR/VKK/20/3.00

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (CONTD.): Sir, in this context, I would like to quote the Economic Survey, 2011-12. It says, “The critical task of inclusion, that is, inclusive growth, cannot be left to the free market. The untrammelled laws of the market play an important role in growth and efficiency but, they do not have a natural propensity to reach out to the poor and vulnerable. That has to be the responsibility of the Government”.

Sir, some have criticised the Finance Minister heavily for not containing the fiscal deficit to the promised level of 4.6 per cent of the GDP, which is revised to be 5.9 per cent of the GDP for 2011-12, which we heard just now. What surprises me is that the criticism is so harsh as if the fiscal consolidation is the only objective of economic policy. Sir, not much knowledge of economics is required to criticise the Finance Minister or any one for increase in the fiscal deficit. But, in view of the constraints that the Finance Minister explained in his

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Budget speech, the criticism is fully unfounded and misplaced. Sir, I cannot afford to be naive to even remotely justify the profligacy on the part of the Government. I am convinced that more expenditure does not automatically mean more welfare. It also depends upon the quality of expenditure, transparency, speed of governance, weeding out of vested interests and elimination of leakages in the system. And, yet, since day one, from my days in the Planning Commission, when the FRBM Act was in the making, I have always been surprised as to how in a growing and emerging economy like India with wide poverty, hunger, malnutrition, illiteracy and pervasive inequalities, fiscal deficit could be rigidly controlled by legislation, through preparation of annual time table. One could imagine as to what would have happened to the Indian economy had the Government, ten years ago, strictly followed the time table given by the Tarapore Committee for introducing full convertibility of the Indian rupee, particularly today, when the global financial market is so uncertain, so unstable and so volatile in an unprecedented manner and scale. I am addressing to all the mainstream economists, who have spent disproportionately huge energies in criticising the Finance Minister for not containing the fiscal

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

deficit. Sir, if I am not wrong, the Indian economy is still not fully equipped to go for full convertibility, particularly post-2008 global financial crisis.

Sir, I congratulate the Finance Minister for intending to amend the FRBM Act. I am also happy to know that in the area of expenditure reforms, he has rightly introduced the concept of 'Effective Revenue Deficit'. Some people have criticised that as a gimmick to which I disagree. That would reduce the consumptive component of revenue deficit and create space for increased capital spending.

Sir, let me come back to fiscal deficit. For 2011-12, the revised fiscal deficit is estimated to be Rs.5,21,980 crore, that is, 5.9 per cent of the GDP. Let us remember that. I repeat again, it is 5.9 per cent of the GDP. But, the critics have distressingly failed to know the accompanying facts. What are the accompanying facts? Sir, available information shows that the total tax revenue forgone due to exemptions, deductions and incentives by the Central Government, as estimated by the Union Finance Ministry, in the year 2011-12 was about Rs.5,29,432 crore, that is, six per cent of the GDP, which was 0.1 percentage point higher than the fiscal deficit. Let alone politicians,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

not a single serious economist can ignore the fact that the total tax revenue forgone was 0.1 percentage higher than the total fiscal deficit. This is not all. Of this, the revenue of Rs.57,063 crore was forgone only due to tax exemption given for the import of diamond and gold. And some political parties and some sections were demanding that the exemption should be restored. In 2010-11, this amount was Rs.49,164 crore.

(Contd. by TMV/2p)

-VKK-TMV-GS/2P/3.05

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (CONTD.): I am unable to reconcile to the Finance Minister's decision of giving exemption on the import of gold and diamond in the preceding two years knowing fully well that exemption once given is hundred times difficult to withdraw.

Besides forgoing revenue, what are the other economic consequences of tax exemptions given for import of gold and diamond? First, the most valuable foreign exchange of the equivalent value was spent, or rather misspent, for this purpose, that would have been used for other productive use. Second, to that extent the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

current account deficit was widened. The Finance Minister in his Budget Speech had categorically mentioned this, and I quote:

“ One of the primary drivers of the current account deficit has been the growth of almost 50 per cent in imports of gold and other precious metals in the first three quarters of this year, that is, 2011-12”.

Third, due to the progressive weakening of the rupee, the better off sections consider gold as a substitute to financial investment that has been pushing its price to the sky level. Sir, looking at the gold price today, nearly Rs.28,000 crores, sometimes, I take pleasure that I got married before this gold crisis because I could not have bought even the *mangal sutra* according to the Hindu tradition. It is no more true that the demand for gold is insatiable mainly for the ornamental purposes as in the olden days. Fourth, this has also affected the rates of savings and investment. For instance, the rate of gross domestic saving and that of investment, in 2007-08, was 36.8 per and 38.1 per cent respectively. These rates declined to 32.3 per cent and 35.1 per cent respectively in 2010-11. Let us not forget the fact, and I want to emphasise this in the presence of the hon. Finance Minister,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

that whatever the rate of growth during the last four or five years, say, 8.5 per cent plus, was achieved mainly consumption-driven and not investment-driven. For an emerging economy like India, this is certainly not a happy situation. What is most disturbing in this regard was that the Finance Minister was forced to roll back rationalisation of some tax measures with respect to the import of gold and other precious metals despite the adverse consequences that I mentioned above, which he also knows.

Sir, I am also disturbed over the fact that the Finance Minister has postponed to the next year the review of the Double Taxation Avoidance Agreement Treaty with Mauritius. Sir, Indian economy can't depend permanently, as the people argue with some sense of leisure, on Foreign Institutional Investment. By definition it can imply that it is intertwined. It is not the characteristic of any stable economy in the changing global financial situation. According to the Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion, cumulative Foreign Institutional Investment inflows from Mauritius into India -- we all know the size of Mauritius -- amounted to 55.20 billion US dollars accounting 42 per cent of the total Foreign Institution Investment

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

inflows into the country, making Mauritius the single largest FII source. The foreign investors having presence in Mauritius are legally exempted from the capital gains tax. According to Government's own admission, India is losing annually over 600 million dollars annually, for the 12 year period the amount is being estimated to be about 7.2 billion dollars.

Of late, the subsidies have rightly emerged as a major contestable issue which the people are not discussing. In 2011-12, of the Revised Estimates of total non-Plan expenditure of Rs.8,92,116 crore, subsidies alone accounted to Rs.2,16,297 crore and constituted 24 per cent of the total non-Plan expenditure. Of this, the subsidy on food, fertilizers and petroleum products amounted to about Rs.1.42 lakh crore and constituted 65 per cent of the total subsidy. This invariably contributed to the increase in fiscal deficit. Food subsidy comprises four components: support prices to the farmers, transport, storage and distribution charges. All these constitute economic costs and the difference between the economic costs and issue prices of foodgrains constitute foodgrain subsidy. The rising food subsidy bill is largely due to the continuous increase in

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

the support prices. I want to ask in this House: Which political party -
- people are talking about widening fiscal deficit and rising inflation
rate -- can dare say that support prices would not increase when the
cost of production in agriculture is increasing and when productivity is
virtually stagnant and lakhs of farmers are committing suicide for the
last seven or eight years?

(Contd. by 2Q/VK)

VK-ASC/2Q/3.10

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (CONTD): The farming
community has been under distress, that makes rise in support prices
imminent. I support the initiatives of the Government to rationalize
the prices of fertilizers and petroleum products. The former shall help
correct the distortions in the use of fertilizer-mix resulting into over
use or rather misuse of urea.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please conclude.

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR: I will take only five minutes more.

The same is true about the prices of petroleum products -- this
is the crucial point on which the Government is being criticized --
particularly in view of the facts that about 80 per cent of the country's

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

crude oil requirement is imported and the prices are rising. Second, relatively cheaper kerosene is used for adulteration of the diesel. The inflationary effect of the rise in petrol prices can partly be moderated by rationalizing the tax structure. Diesel should be partly decontrolled in course of time, and be subsidized strictly for public purposes such as transporting food grains. The prices of LPG cylinders should not be raised, but its supply should be strictly regulated to ensure that better off sections are not subsidized. Kerosene should be made available only on kerosene coupons and its potential misuse should be severely punished. I hope, the issue, as usual, is not politicized.

Sir, sound, realistic and rational taxation policy is a major instrument to mobilize resources for economic development and also for distributive justice, that could also help contain fiscal deficit. What is the scenario in the country? Let me quote the figures from the “IMF - Revenue Mobilization in Developing Countries, 2011”. The Tax-GDP ratio in the developed countries like Sweden was 50.1 per cent; Denmark — 49.1 per cent; France — 44.7 per cent; Netherlands — 39.5 per cent; the UK — 37.4 per cent and the USA — 27.3 per cent. Developing countries: Brazil — 34.2 per cent; Ghana — 22.4

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

per cent and China — 16.6 per cent. What is the situation in India? In India, according to the Economic Survey, 2011-12, the Centre's Tax-GDP ratio in 2011-12 stood at 10.5 per cent and our aim is 13 per cent by the end of the 12th Five Year Plan, that is, 31st March, 2017. Thus India is probably the lowest taxed country in the world. I, therefore, fully support raising the service tax from 10 per cent to 12 per cent, that is expected to yield around Rs. 18,660 crores and I find no reason for any fuss on that front. Even its potential inflationary impact and regressive character cannot be used as an excuse for not raising the service tax. The share of services sector in GDP in 2011-12 was 59 per cent, while the proportion of the services tax in the GDP was abysmally low at 0.9 per cent and it has continued to remain so almost since 2006-07.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please conclude.

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR: Sir, just one minute more.

If we do not adopt some of the urgent economic measures, I apprehend that we are awaiting a bigger economic crisis. In order to bring food inflation under control, we have to urgently manage the structural imbalance. Having said this, I must say that if inflation has

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

to be permanently controlled, we have to adjust ourselves to about six-seven per cent inflation.

With questionable relevance of the recommendations of the Bretton wood twins, the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund, from the viewpoint of the emerging economies, I appreciate the BRICS countries' recent decision to establish World Bank like organization for financing their infrastructure development. I also congratulate the Government for taking firm stand with respect to import of oil from Iran disregarding the contrary suggestion of Mrs. Hilary Clinton, Secretary of the State. Our total annual trade with Iran amounts to about dollar 14 billion.

Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, securing faster and sustainable growth in the fast changing and complex world environment is indeed a great challenge. But still greater challenge is to make growth truly inclusive in a highly differentiated, in-egalitarian and exclusive society like India. The ultimate aim of our socio-economic policies must be to increasingly share the benefits of economic growth with the toiling masses. Sir, America is presently facing a dilemma of one per cent

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

vs. 90 per cent. Let us avoid the dilemma between 25 per cent and 75 per cent. Thank you. (Ends)

श्री वीर सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, आपने मुझे बहुजन समाज पार्टी की ओर से वित्त विधेयक 2012-13 पर बोलने का अवसर दिया, मैं इसके लिए आपका धन्यवाद देता हूँ। किसी भी देश के विकासशील होने का प्रमाण उस देश के बजट से ही मिलता है। भारत का लोकतंत्र दुनिया में मजबूत हुआ है, जिसे हमने 60 वर्ष पूरे होने पर 60वीं वर्षगांठ के रूप में मनाया है।

(2r/lt पर जारी)

LP/3.15/2r

श्री वीर सिंह (क्रमागत) : लेकिन, भारत सरकार का बजट आज देश को खुशहाली व प्रगति के पथ पर ले जाने में असमर्थ लग रहा है। 2012-13 के आम बजट को पढ़ने के बाद ऐसा लगता है कि यह बजट देश के पूंजीपतियों, उद्योगपतियों के फायदे के लिए बनाया गया है तथा इस देश में रहने वाले गरीब लोग तथा अनुसूचित जाति व जनजाति के लोग इस बजट से अपने को ठगा हुआ महसूस कर रहे हैं।

मान्यवर, भारतवर्ष कृषि प्रधान देश है। देश के 70 प्रतिशत लोग कृषि पर निर्भर करते हैं, लेकिन आज कृषि का, जी.डी.पी. में मात्र 14 प्रतिशत का योगदान रह गया है, जिसके फलस्वरूप यह असंतुलन पैदा हो रहा है। आज 70

प्रतिशत से ज्यादा लोग ग्रामीण क्षेत्र में रहते हैं तथा कृषि पर निर्भर करते हैं। कृषि आज जीवन-मरण का प्रश्न बन गया है। आज केवल आन्ध्र प्रदेश के तेलंगाना, महाराष्ट्र के विदर्भ क्षेत्र के ही नहीं, बल्कि सारे देश के किसान परेशान व बेहाल हैं। कहीं सूखा पड़ रहा है, तो कहीं ओलावृष्टि हो रही है और कहीं बाढ़ का प्रकोप है, इसलिए किसानों को दी जाने वाली राज्य सहायता बढ़ानी चाहिए व उनकी मदद करनी चाहिए, जिससे वे प्राकृतिक आपदाओं से निपट सकें व अपना सही जीवन-यापन कर सकें। किसानों को आधुनिक कृषि यंत्र, उन्नतशील बीज व उर्वरक भी सस्ते दामों पर व समय पर उपलब्ध कराये जाएं।

महोदय, किसान देश का अन्नदाता कहलाता है। वह कड़ी ठण्ड, धूप और बरसात में रहकर अनाज पैदा करता है, किन्तु उसको अपनी फसल का वाजिब दाम नहीं मिलता है। जब किसान अपने अनाज को बेचता है तो उसका मूल्य बहुत सस्ता होता है, लेकिन जब वही अनाज मार्किट में, व्यापारी के पास चला जाता है तो उसका दाम बढ़ जाता है और किसान हाथ मलता रह जाता है।

मान्यवर, मैं आपके माध्यम से यह बताना चाहूंगा कि देश के कुछ प्रांतों में गन्ने की खेती होती है, लेकिन पूरे देश में किसान को गन्ने का वाजिब भाव नहीं मिलता है। सिर्फ उत्तर प्रदेश में, बहुजन समाज पार्टी की राष्ट्रीय अध्यक्षा, उत्तर प्रदेश की पूर्व मुख्य मंत्री एवं इस दल की नेता ने गन्ने का दाम 250 रुपये प्रति क्विंटल किया था, जोकि किसानों को मिला था। गन्ने की इस बढ़ी हुई कीमत से उत्तर प्रदेश के किसानों के चेहरे पर मुस्कान व खुशहाली आ गई थी। अन्य

प्रदेशों में गन्ने का भाव बहुत कम है और उन किसानों को गन्ने का वाजिब मूल्य नहीं मिल रहा है, इसलिए उत्तर प्रदेश की तरह, हर प्रदेश में उनको गन्ने का पूरा मूल्य मिलना चाहिए।

मान्यवर, जब कभी सूखा पड़ता है या बाढ़ आती है, तो किसानों को राहत सहायता मिलती है। किसानों को तो राहत सहायता मिल जाती है, किन्तु जो खेतिहर मजदूर होते हैं, जो खेती से जुड़े होते हैं, उनको कभी कोई सहायता नहीं मिलती है। जब भी कभी ऐसा कोई प्राकृतिक प्रकोप आता है या फसल मारी जाती है, तो जो खेतिहर मजदूर होते हैं, उनको भी उसी प्रकार से मुआवजा मिलना चाहिए, जिस प्रकार से किसानों को मिलता है।

मान्यवर, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी को अवगत कराना चाहूंगा कि आज हमारे देश में आवास की सबसे बड़ी समस्या है। आज इंसान के लिए रोटी, कपड़े के साथ-साथ आवास भी बहुत आवश्यक हो गया है। आज पूरे देश में यह एक बहुत बड़ी मूलभूत समस्या है। करोड़ों ऐसे लोग हैं, जो जुल्म-जबर्दस्ती के कारण दोहातों से, गाँवों से शहरों की तरफ, बड़े-बड़े महानगरों की तरफ पलायन कर गए हैं। आज करोड़ों लोग, बड़े-बड़े महानगरों में कहीं रेल की पटरी के किनारे, कहीं गन्दे नाल के किनारे झुग्गी-झोपड़ी डालकर अपना जीवन व्यतीत कर रहे हैं। केंद्र सरकार ने आज तक उनकी तरफ कोई ध्यान नहीं दिया है। मैं आपको बताना चाहूंगा कि आदरणीय बहिन मायावती जी ने

अपने मुख्यमंत्रित्व काल में उन गरीबों के लिए, जो शहरों में रहते हैं, एक विशेष योजना चलाकर सराहनीय कार्य किया है।

(2s/akg पर जारी)

AKG/2S/3.20

श्री वीर सिंह (क्रमागत) : मान्यवर, श्री कांशी राम शहरी गरीब आवास योजना चला कर महानगरों, शहरों में रहने वाले हर वर्ग के गरीब व्यक्तियों को मकान बना कर दिया गया। जब उन झुग्गी-झोपड़ी में रहने वाले, गन्दे नाले के किनारे रहने वाले, रेल की पटरी के किनारे रहने वाले गरीबों को, लाखों लोगों को, हर वर्ग के व्यक्ति को मकान मुहैया कराया गया, तो उनके चेहरे पर भी मुस्कान आ गई, क्योंकि उनको भी एक छत मिली। मैं निवेदन करना चाहूँगा कि जैसे उत्तर प्रदेश में लाखों लोगों को, शहरों में रहने वाले गरीब लोगों को मकान मुहैया कराया गया है, उसी तरह केन्द्र सरकार हर प्रदेश में ऐसी योजना लागू करे, जिससे महानगरों में झुग्गी-झोपड़ी में रहने वाले लोगों को आवास मिल सके।

मान्यवर, केन्द्र सरकार की तरफ से मनरेगा नामक एक योजना चलाई जा रही है। इस मनरेगा कार्यक्रम के ऊपर सरकार द्वारा समय-समय पर काफी बढ़ा-चढ़ा कर चर्चा होती है। यह कह कर इसकी तारीफ की जाती है कि इस योजना के तहत देश के गरीबों का बहुत भला हुआ है। मान्यवर, मैं आपके माध्यम से कहना चाहूँगा कि इस मनरेगा योजना से कोई बड़ा फायदा नहीं हुआ है। यह योजना पूरी तरह से फ्लॉप हो चुकी है। 2010-11 के बजट में मनरेगा के

लिए करीब 39 हजार करोड़ धन का आवंटन किया गया था, जबकि इसको 2011-12 में घटा कर 37 हजार करोड़ कर दिया गया। बजाय बढ़ाने के इसको घटा दिया गया। इसको बढ़ाना चाहिए था, लेकिन इसको घटा दिया गया। इसका मतलब मनरेगा के नाम पर मखौल किया जा रहा है, मज़ाक बनाया जा रहा है।

मान्यवर, इसके साथ-साथ मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी को बताना चाहूँगा कि केन्द्र सरकार ने मनरेगा के तहत गाँव में रहने वाले गरीब मजदूरों को 100 दिन के रोजगार की बात कही है। एक साल में 365 दिन होते हैं, जबकि रोजगार सिर्फ 100 दिन का। 265 दिन आदमी बेरोजगार रहेगा, उसको सिर्फ 100 दिन मजदूरी मिलेगी। इसका मतलब वह न इधर का रहा, न उधर का रहा। इन 100 दिनों में भी कितनी मजदूरी? जैसे उत्तर प्रदेश में 2010-11 में यह 100 रुपए थी और 2011-12 में इसको बढ़ा कर 130 रुपए प्रति दिन कर दिया गया। क्या 130 रुपए में वह अपना गुजारा कर पाएगा? वह भी उस गाँव के सरपंच या प्रधान के रहमोकरम पर है। जो पक्ष उसको सरपंच या प्रधान के चुनाव में वोट देता है, उसी को मजदूरी मिलती है। ... (व्यवधान) ... यह गाँवों में प्रधान के द्वारा ही किया जाता है। आपके यहाँ सरपंच कहा जाता है, हमारे यहाँ प्रधान कहा जाता है। यह उसी के रहमोकरम पर है। जो लोग उसे वोट देकर सरपंच या प्रधान बना देते हैं, उनको काम मिल जाता है, बाकी लोगों को काम नहीं मिल पाता है। मैं यह निवेदन करूँगा कि जो 130 रुपए मजदूरी दी जा

रही है 100 दिन के लिए, इसको 100 दिन के बजाय 365 दिन किया जाए और इसको 130 रुपए से बढ़ा कर कम-से-कम 250 रुपए किया जाए।

मान्यवर, पूरे देश में बीपीएल की समस्या है। बीपीएल के माध्यम से गरीब लोगों को चिन्हित किया जाता है। पूरे देश में अभी भी बहुत से गरीब लोग ऐसे हैं, जिनके पास बीपीएल का कार्ड नहीं है। हर प्रदेश से समय-समय पर माँग उठती रही है कि इसका सर्वे कराया जाए और सर्वे करवा कर बीपीएल का कार्ड बनाया जाए। यदि सही ढंग से बीपीएल का कार्ड बनेगा, तो काफी हद तक समस्या का समाधान हो जाएगा।

(2टी/वीएनके पर जारी)

-SCH/VNK-NBR/2t/3:25

श्री वीर सिंह (क्रमागत): मान्यवर, योजना आयोग की सर्वे रिपोर्ट को देख कर तो ऐसा लगता है कि देश के गरीबों के साथ उपहास किया जा रहा है। सर्वे रिपोर्ट में गांव में रहने वाला 26 रुपए में और शहर में रहने वाला 32 रुपए में अपना खर्चा चला सकता है। इसका मतलब तो यह हुआ है कि पूरे देश में कोई गरीब ही नहीं बचा। आप 130 रुपए एक दिन की मजदूरी दे रहे हैं, जो कि कम से कम है और 250 रुपए वह कमा रहा है, फिर आप कह रहे हैं कि वह 26 रुपए या 32 रुपए में अपना खर्चा चला सकता है। यह कैसी रिपोर्ट है? इस पर क्यों नहीं ध्यान दिया जा रहा है? सरकार ने इस पर उनसे क्यों नहीं जवाब मांगा कि यह कैसी रिपोर्ट है?

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

मान्यवर, आज हमारे देश में महंगाई एक बहुत बड़ा मुद्दा है, बहुत बड़ी समस्या है, हर क्षेत्र में महंगाई ने त्राही-त्राही मचा रखी है। यूपीए सरकार के द्वारा डीजल, पेट्रोल, गैस और केरोसिन की कई बार कीमत बढ़ाई गई, जिससे गरीब परेशान हैं। इतनी कीमतें बढ़ाई गई हैं कि गरीब का चूल्हा ठंडा हो गया है, उसकी थाली से इस सरकार ने रोटी छीन ली।

मान्यवर, हमारे देश में इतना गेहूं का उत्पादन होता है, इतना चावल का उत्पादन होता है कि वह हमारे देश की आबादी से कहीं अधिक ज्यादा है, किन्तु जब सरकार के द्वारा उसको खरीदा जाता है और खरीद कर भंडार में रखने का समय आता है, तो उसके लिए भंडारण की व्यवस्था ही उपलब्ध नहीं होती है, जिसके कारण अनाज सड़ जाता है, गल जाता है। 2011-12 की सरकारी रिपोर्ट के अनुसार 5,500 करोड़ रुपए का अनाज गल गया। माननीय उच्च न्यायालय को इसमें दखल देना पड़ा और कहना पड़ा कि आप जो अनाज सड़ा रहे हैं, उसको गरीबों में क्यों नहीं बांट देते हैं। फिर भी सरकार नहीं चेती। (समय की घंटी)। अभी तो एक मिनट बाकी है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे.कुरियन): हां, आपका एक मिनट बचा है।

श्री वीर सिंह: आप एक मिनट के बाद घंटी बजा लेते। ... (व्यवधान) ... मान्यवर, यदि यह अनाज गरीबों को दिया जाए या सड़ने से बचाया जाए, तो इससे कितने ही गरीबों का भला हो सकता है। यह यूपीए की सरकार गेहूं सड़ाने के लिए तो तैयार है, किन्तु उसको गरीबों को देने के लिए तैयार नहीं है। एक तरफ तो यह

सरकार गरीबों की बात करती है और दूसरी तरफ गरीबों के साथ अन्याय करती है।

मान्यवर, आज हमारे देश में शिक्षा का बड़ा अभाव है। आज हमारे देश में शिक्षा की दोहरी प्रणाली है। एक तरफ गरीबों के बच्चे सरकारी स्कूल में पढ़ते हैं, जिसका भवन भी सही नहीं होता है, बैठने की जगह भी सही नहीं होती है और अध्यापक भी उपलब्ध नहीं होते हैं और दूसरी तरफ अमीरों के बच्चे कॉन्वेंट स्कूल में पढ़ते हैं। जब नौकरी की बात आती है, तो बोलते हैं कि एक जैसे अंक आने चाहिए। अगर एक जैसे अंक की बात करते हैं, तो आपको उनको पढ़ाने की व्यवस्था भी एक जैसी करनी चाहिए। उनके लिए पढ़ने की सुविधा तो है नहीं, लेकिन जब सलेक्शन की बात होती है, तब कहते हैं कि एक जैसा होना चाहिए। रिजर्वेशन की जो बात होती है, उसको भी पूरा नहीं किया जाता है। आज पूरे देश में backlog पूरा नहीं है, जिसके कारण हर विभाग में तमाम पद रिक्त पड़े हैं, उनको भी नहीं भरा गया है। मैं चाहूंगा कि जो अध्यापकों की कमी है, भवन की कमी है, उनको पूरा किया जाए।

इसके साथ-साथ, मैं आपको बताना चाहूंगा कि Special Component Plan के तहत SC, ST के लिए जो 750 करोड़ रुपए था, उसको कॉमनवेल्थ गेम में खर्च कर दिया गया। जब यह बात हमारी पार्टी ने उठाई थी, तब माननीय मंत्री जी ने आश्वासन भी दिया था कि SC, ST के लिए जो पैसा था, उसको वापस कराया जाएगा। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह पूछना चाहूंगा कि SC, ST

का जो पैसा कॉमनवेल्थ गेम में खर्च किया गया था, वह वापस किया गया या नहीं किया गया?

इसके साथ-साथ, आज हमारे देश में स्वास्थ्य की बहुत बड़ी समस्या है। हमारे देश में डॉक्टरों की कमी है। गांवों में जब आदमी बीमार पड़ता है, तब शहर तक जाते-जाते उसकी मृत्यु हो जाती है। यहां तक कि शहर तक जाते-जाते कभी-कभी किसी महिला की डिलीवरी भी रास्ते में ही हो जाती है और ऐसे में कभी-कभी उसकी मृत्यु भी हो जाती है। सर्वे रिपोर्ट के आधार पर एक हजार की आबादी पर एक डॉक्टर होना चाहिए, किन्तु दो हजार की आबादी पर भी एक डॉक्टर नहीं है, क्योंकि डॉक्टरों की काफी कमी है। मैं निवेदन करूंगा कि सरकार को स्वास्थ्य की तरफ पहल करनी चाहिए और गांवों में रहने वाले लोगों की तरफ भी ध्यान देना चाहिए। (समय की घंटी)।

मान्यवर, मैं यही निवेदन करूंगा कि इस देश में अनुसूचित जाति एवं अनुसूचित जनजाति के जो गरीब लोग हैं, उनके स्वास्थ्य के बारे में, उनकी शिक्षा के बारे में, उनके आवास के बारे में, उनके सामाजिक, राजनीतिक एवं आर्थिक उत्थान के बारे में बजट में प्रावधान किया जाए। धन्यवाद, जय भीम, जय भारत।

(समाप्त)

(2u/ks पर आगे)

2u/3.30/ks

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I rise to make my observations on the Finance Bill and the Appropriation Bill, though with a little bit of frustration. I believe and, probably, the Government would also believe, that the need of the hour is to plug the loopholes and rein in tax theft, tax evasion and black money generation. I believe, when the Budget and the Finance Bill was prepared initially, they did try to build in an architecture to deter such kinds of tax theft and tax avoidance, but, unfortunately, as the Finance Bill was being considered in Parliament, one by one, all parts of that deterrent architecture got dismantled, sending a message to a bunch of thieves to have a go at the public exchequer, and to go on evading tax. That was the message being given to the speculators and manipulators, and both international and domestic corporate players. That is how the Bill was taken up with the introductory announcement of the hon. Finance Minister. It is abjectly frustrating.

Sir, the gist is that amendments were proposed when the Budget was placed to dilute the general anti-avoidance rules, for modification in the retrospective Income-tax amendment, diluting

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

many provisions, cut in long-term capital gains tax on private equity, cut in withholding tax on foreign borrowings and withdrawal of tax on property transactions, and all these are to make the Foreign Institutional Investor, merger-acquisition brokers, stock-market manipulators and real estate players happy. Is there any reason for the Parliament or the people of the country to be happy over this kind of indulgence in financial crime? I must say, no other word can describe it absolutely because these are all financial crimes. Tax evasion is a financial crime. You have dismantled all the deterrence; you have made a non-bailable offence a bailable one. And you are giving the message, 'go on committing the crime on the country's economy'. That is the most frustrating thing and I strongly oppose that.

Sir, the entire concern is to make the manipulators happy. That is the hallmark of the entire economic policy regime and that is the message the Finance Bill gives. The whole concern is to bow down to the pressure from the FIIs, speculators and manipulators. There is no concern for the people of this country. Only out of that concern, you have dismantled all restrictions on tax evasion. But, on the contrary,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

when from within your own Government, a request is made to reduce the excise duty on petroleum by six rupees per litre, which, at present is Rs.14 per litre, in a situation where for every one rupee petroleum price, fifty paise is the tax burden, in that situation, when a request comes, not from the Left, not from the Opposition, but from within your Government, to make the common people happy, you ignore that, and while ignoring that, you put further burden on them. You add an increased cess to the crude oil produce in the domestic market, that is, ONGC and Oil India. From Rs. 2500, you increase it to Rs.4500 and finally, that burden gets passed on to the consumer. It puts an additional burden of Rs.5000 crores on the common people. You are lessening the burden on the FIs, the manipulators and the speculators and you are increasing the burden on the people by refusing the request of the Petroleum Ministry to reduce excise duty on petrol and also, by adding an additional burden of Rs.2000 per ton on crude oil, which would ultimately be borne by the consumer.

(contd. at 2w/kgg)

Kgg/2w/3.35

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (contd.): What is this cess for oil industry development? In 1974, this cess was imposed for the development of the oil industry, through the Oil Industry Development Board. Till December, 2011, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the cess collected was Rs.99,428 crores. Out of this Rs.99,000-plus crores, how much has gone to the OIIB? Only Rs.902 crores. The rest is consumed by the revenue expenditure. Is that fair? Will that speak of financial prudence? Sir, it is absolutely shameful. The manner in which the common man's issues are treated and tackled by the Government is shameful. Their entire concern is for the business lobby, for the investors' lobby, the manipulators' lobby, by taking 99 per cent of the country to hell. I seriously disagree with my friend, Shri Mungekar, on that side. Not an iota of trickling down is possible through this Finance Bill. Rather, you may find that infamous Milton Friedman with this infamous theory of trickling down, "Bumps for the haves but don't bother about the have-nots; it will trickle down to the have-nots." Sir, I seriously oppose this with all the might at my command. These roll backs were not asked by your coalition partners. These roll backs

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

were not asked by the opposition partners. What is the compulsion? It is the corporate compulsion. It is the business compulsion. Otherwise, you have an alternate route--by reducing the petroleum price, you can tax on the windfall profits gained by the stand-alone refineries in the private sector who are earning crores of rupees by selling in the international markets. They are not catering to the internal market. If Australia can impose export duty on coal for its own resource mobilization, why not we impose duty on exports of petroleum and iron ore for our resource mobilization? Why can we not? If Brazil and South Korea can impose similar tax on derivatives, impose tax on FII transactions, why can we not? What is our compulsion to make a non-bailable offence a bailable one, to make a financial crime legitimate, which cut into our own economy? Why? Precisely, the same approach is reflected everywhere.

Sir, let me talk about 5 crore productive workers. You have reduced their PF interest rate from 9.5 to 8.25 per cent, unilaterally. The workers do not have business to plead their case. They do not have FIIs or corporates to plead their case. They have to plead their case themselves. Why should you not consider raising the rate to the earlier level, at least, above the GPF rate of interest? At the time of my Budget intervention, I had demanded a consideration on this without

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

ignoring it. I seek a reply to this question. I am ready to hear even a 'no'. But, do not skirt the question. What are you going to do on the employees' pension scheme? The Parliamentary Standing Committee on Labour made a unanimous recommendation to the Government to contribute at least half of the employee's contribution, at 4 per cent. It was a unanimous recommendation; it is a political consensus. You are talking so much for the same political consensus on reforms. I think, the hon. Finance Minister, while replying to the debate, will again appeal to the Opposition, "Please, let there be a consensus for reforms." But, for the pro-worker reforms, when there is already unanimity, why are you not implementing it? What is the monetary implication of Government's contribution towards the pension fund? It is just Rs.4,000 crores. Is it heavier than the direct tax concession you have given to the tune of Rs.4,500 crores to a handful of corporates? The relief under direct tax relief is given to a maximum of 50,000 or 70,000 persons. But, by giving this just Rs.4,000 crores relief on the pension fund, you will benefit 5 crore workers, who are actually making your GDP grow; it is not those 50,000 people who are taking your direct tax concession. Whom do you give priority? Is it for the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

50,000 people or 5 crores? Please make it clear. Please reply to this question and debate on it. With whom are you standing? With the 50,000 people or the 5 crore workers who are making the GDP grow?

(Contd. by tdb/2x)

TDB/2X/3.40

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (CONTD.): Sir, I demand that the Government must enhance its contribution to the Pension Fund; the Government must ensure that the Rural Bank employees get the same pension as the sponsor bank. They are the part of it. They are agitating over this issue. You must reply to this question. Sir, there is precisely the same bias against the 99 per cent. In favour of just one per cent of the population, this approach is reflected in every line and in the entire body of your Finance Bill. That is why you give a relief of Rs.4,500 cores in Direct Taxes to 50,000 persons, and you suck billions of persons by putting ten times more burden on them on account of Indirect Taxes to the tune of Rs.45,940 crores. In this way, you are burdening billions by ten times more, and you are giving a relief of Rs.4,500 crores to a handful of corporates. The same bias is

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

reflected in your entire tax management. You are giving concessions to only those who are already indulging in tax default and tax theft, which is a financial crime. As per your CAG Report, from 2005 to 2010, tax default has increased by 135 per cent. From 2009-10 to 2010-11, there is another tax default of 38 per cent. You are allowing deliberate tax default to these communities by not collecting the tax, and you have allowed to accumulate the tax default to the tune of rupees three lakh crores. Whose money is it? Is it anybody's personal money? You are here to govern the country. This is the business of your governance. Instead of that, you are patronizing tax thefts, sitting in the seat of governance. You are dismantling the deterrence to tax thefts and financial crimes. From this seat, I accuse the Government of this. Why are you allowing tax thefts? Why are you patronizing deliberate tax defaults, and, then lamenting on resource crunch, and, then opening the floodgates of the country's economy to the manipulators of foreign investors, FII's. In this way, you are provoking a similar situation which the entire Western economy is facing today. This is the market fundamentalism, as against orientation towards the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

people, that this Government is suffering. I demand that they need to be changed.

Sir, the Government has set a target to prune the subsidy to 1.75 per cent on the billions of common people. What is your target to cut the tax thefts? What is your target for that rupees three lakh crores' accumulation? What is the target for your collection? Come out with a clear reply. Because they are one per cent, because they are closer to your power corridors, how long will you allow them to commit this financial offence? You must come out with a clear reply. At the same time, my humble suggestion is this. Why should we not tackle them in the same line with the common people? When the common people pay tax, what do they do? They pay first, according to the...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, please conclude.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: I am concluding, Sir. According to the tax authority, they pay first; then, they lodge a claim for refund. You treat them on the same path. They are all citizens of the country. That is the constitutional mandate. You make the same system applicable for

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

them also. That is the only way to tackle deliberate tax default. There is no other way than this.

Sir, at the end, I would like to say this. When the demand of the situation is to address the grave employment situation in the country, my friend, Dr. Mungekar, who is not here, was talking loud about the Eleventh Plan achievements. What have you achieved in the Eleventh Plan? Yes, you have achieved a respectable GDP growth of 8.6 per cent per annum. But, on employment front, from 2000 to 2005, employment generation growth was 2.7 per cent. During the Eleventh Plan period, despite having 8.6 per cent annual average growth, your employment generation has gone down to 0.8 per cent. Any Keynesianism, Mr. Mungekar,...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, no; you don't have to address Mr. Mungekar. You address the Chair.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, this is my last point. I have finished.

(Contd. by 2y-cls)

KLS/2Y-3.45

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (CONTD): I missed many points.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You have said many points. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: There is a need for reversal of this pro-gambler policy in favour of pro-employment generation. Do not consider your * , the manipulators in the foreign and domestic money market. Please do the employment generation. You need to take the call from the Left...(Interruptions)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You have taken extra five minutes. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Just allow me for two minutes, Sir. Please do not take the call from the Left; you take the call from within your party, within your Government. You take the call, however feeble it may be than your FII lobby, for cutting down the petroleum tax and not go in for FDI in retail. You must tell me that by playing on our national resources, oil and gas fields, by Reliance, British Petroleum Bill and Kerala Vedanta deal 15 billion dollars were earned.

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

How much has come to your exchequer, please come out. Please see that FDI in retail is not allowed. Please see the contractors are not allowed to extract illegitimate premium from the natural and national resources of the country. (Time-bell) And they should not be allowed to cheat the country through the loopholes of Double Tax Avoidance Agreement which is nothing but an instrument of recycling the black money in the country. Please do not allow that to happen. Please do not take the call from us, but take the call from within in order to save the country. ...(Interruptions)... With this, I want a total reversal of the policy and conclude. Thank you.

(Ends)

SHRI N.K. SINGH (BIHAR): Thank you very much, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir. It is now 60 days that the Budget-2012 was presented. The economic outlook even during the short period of 60 days has deteriorated further. Since the Finance Minister is so fond personally of reading Shakespeare with some amount of interest, one cannot but recall in Hamlet itself in which Horatio utters his utter desperation but with imagination. Of course, the Finance Minister has come up with very imaginative solutions but would perhaps be suffering from

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

desperation that none of these suggestions have so far fructified. In fact, they are continuing in the same strain of Hamlet speaking of the moral decline and corruption in the State of Denmark. Marcellus had remarked that there is something rotten in the State of Denmark. Perhaps the analogy is clear enough to be understood. While we are still on the continuing strain of the Shakespeare, one cannot but recall what in Julius Caesar, Shakespeare had said, "Men are at some time masters of their own fate. The fault dear Brutus is not in our stars, but in ourselves that we are so helpless." The helplessness of the Finance Minister to craft a strategy which is credible enough to address the deteriorating micro economic environment is a telling story of a line which I have just quoted from Julius Caesar of Shakespeare. In fact, if you look at the last 60 days, look at the broad facts and perspective, look at the key micro economic parameters, first and foremost, long-term saving rates have declined, from 36.8 per cent to just 31 per cent, according to the annual statistics of the Central Statistical Office which has just been released. This is indeed lower, therefore, the investment gearing ratio, which will make a climb back with a high growth trajectory, if not impossible, but, certainly

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

very, very difficult. The fiscal deficit remains uncorrected with little twilight in the sky because given the deceleration in growth, given the lower rate of expected realisation from declining tax buoyancy, given the likelihood of lower disinvestments and given the fact of hesitation, Mr. Finance Minister, your colleagues prompt you not to bite the bullet, the chances of the fiscal deficit being corrected remain very grim.

(Contd by 2Z/PK)

-KLS/PK/2Z/3.50

SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD.): To compound this problem, Sir, the borrowing programme of the Government this year, which is entailing a borrowing of Rs.5.6 lakh crores for this fiscal year, which is 1.52 lakh crores higher than the borrowing target for the last year, completely cramps the room for financing of credible private investment. The other deficit, Sir, remains equally problematic, namely, the Current Account Deficit, which has now crossed four per cent of the GDP. Given the fact that exports, year on year, fell from a credible 11.5 per cent to -5 per cent in the figures of March released last year and given the fact that imports continue to remain very robust and the import

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

penetration continues to be very high and given the fact, Sir, that, as opposed to last year, the decline in the reserves has been 7.1 billion during April-December, 2011, financing, Sir, of this Current Account Deficit remains problematic. In fact, the Finance Minister, your very good friend, and also a good friend of mine, only last week in Mexico, while attending a Think Tank, Larry Summers and Pascal Lamy told me that India's problem is not the high Current Account Deficit; India's problem would be the mode of financing this Current Account Deficit and the either of the two options, of lowering its reserves which could become vulnerable or financing this Current Account Deficit through volatile FII flows, is, something, which can further compound the problem. To add to the worries, Sir, inflation has begun to show its ugly heads, which circumscribes the flexibility of the Central Bank to further moderate its monetary policy.

The manufacturing sector, Sir, as you know, remains in doldrums, the services sector remains subdued and hopes on agriculture are tenuously pinned on the fact that the El Nino is not replaced by La Nina in the last year's Monsoon phase, which will, then, make, therefore, agricultural growth some more problematic.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

To make matters worse, Sir, the successive lowering of the investment rating by Standard & Poor increased the cost of borrowing and increased access to external funds even more difficult. This will further deepen investors' skepticism and continue to give negative signals to investors' community, both in India and abroad. These, Sir, are the configurations, broadly, of the macro-economic scenario.

I am not a prophet of doom; I have continued to be an optimist. I continue to have immense faith on your ability to craft the magic, pull out a rabbit from your hat, since Finance Ministers are known to pull out rabbits from their hats. Let me, at this point, therefore, make eight suggestions for your consideration. First and foremost, Sir, yes, the postponing of GAAR was positive, but the world is yet to reconcile itself with the fact that not necessarily legal, but moral, retrospective taxes to rectify judgements of the Supreme Court have queered the pitch and lent uncertainty in the minds of the investors' community. Sir, I do not know your experience in Washington with Tim Geithner and others, but my experience with Larry Summers, Pascal Lamy and a host of other investors suggests that their

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

sentiments remain frail and they remain anxious. I would suggest for your consideration, Sir, the constitution of an Investment Commission with domain experts to actively engage in a dialogue with the investor community to allay their fears and to encourage their tangible investments. Whenever I travel abroad, Sir, I am also asked the question: what will happen if the Government were to change? Is there likely to be a continuity of Economic Policy? I would, therefore, suggest this for your consideration. Just like many other countries have done, you could also consider setting up a Bipartisan Committee of Parliamentarians to allay investors' concerns, since the India's growth story is too important and the India's growth story must go beyond partisan politics. So, an Investment Commission and a Bipartisan Growth Commission to hold dialogue with investors could be a credible step forward.

Secondly, Sir, no words can substitute action.

(Contd. by 3A/PB)

PB/3A/3.55

SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD.): You must begin to bite the bullet. I leave the timing to you, I leave the choice to you, I leave the sequencing to

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

you, but not biting the bullet is not an option or a luxury, Mr. Finance Minister, which you have at this moment.

My third suggestion, Sir, is this. You promised in Washington, in April, 2012, of the impending legislations on banking, insurance and pension reforms. In fact, just to remind you, Mr. Finance Minister, the Prime Minister had made this promise exactly seven years ago, again in April, 2005. The fact that the Cabinet postponed the decision and did not bring these legislations forward during the current Session of Parliament in spite of a strong bipartisan support, which you have on these legislations, is a matter which cannot fill any of the investor community with comfort.

My fourth suggestion is this. You must not delay the constitution of a Debt Management Office and you must not further delay the implementation of the Rangarajan Committee Report on the classification of Government accounts.

Then, Sir, I come to my fifth suggestion. Just to remind you, you had very kindly agreed to a suggestion made in this House by some hon. Members, including myself, when I ventured to make this suggestion. I am grateful that you accepted the constitution of a Chief

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Ministers' Committee for Eastern India on Agriculture. This Committee, Sir, is yet to be constituted, and, perhaps, it would be a fulfilment of an assurance given by you during the Budget speech. I will be grateful if this could be done.

Also, Sir, since the Central Government has happily crossed the FRBM limits prescribed, this degree of flexibility, during difficult transition period, could be given to some States, including poor disadvantaged States like Bihar.

Coming to my sixth point, Sir, you know very well that at the end of it, all expenditure must result in credible implementation. The time and cost overruns and the efficacy in Government expenditure, when in over 300 projects, costing over Rs. 100 crores, is facing huge time and cost overruns; they are not easy problems to solve. There are problems of coordination. There are problems of inter-departmental coordination. There are problems of coordination with federal Governments. Consider, Sir, the constitution of a Chief Ministers' Economic Council -- since the Centre-State Council remains a dead letter -- to be headed by you, which could look into some of these

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

problems of difficult project implementation, and also of a coordinated framework in a federal polity.

Now, I go on to my seventh suggestion. With regret, I have to say that this has been an era of jobless growth, an era in which high rates of economic growth have not been matched by a growth in employment coefficients to take care of the backlog in employment, much less, the accretion of people to the new labour force. Consider, Sir, the constitution of a Cabinet Committee on Employment to really take care of employment trends, to monitor employment creation, to monitor job creation and to periodically report to Parliament.

Eighth, and my final suggestion, Sir, is that policy paradigms of a Central Banker are always riddled with a difficulty in fulfilling the impossible trinity, the impossible trinity of a free monetary policy, a free exchange rate regime and a moderating inflation. You, Mr. Finance Minister, face a different kind of an impossible trinity, the impossible trinity of reconciling austerity with growth, fiscal rectitude with populist expenditure and moderating subsidies while

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

benchmarking with best global practices. Sir, you need to reconcile these in a manner that the 'India Growth Story' can be reinvigorated.

Finally, Sir, if I may say so, media is flooded, with stories -- and you must be undergoing this yourself -- of your impending elevation. I see, Sir, that you are caught up in the miasma of yet another Shakespearean saying "to be or not to be". If you are to be, Sir, leave behind a legacy, even over the next two months, which addresses the serious macro economic concerns and puts India back on the high growth trajectory by taking actions which are credible and decisive. If you are not to be, then the task is even more rigorous of consolidation and true reckoning of what are immediate economic measures necessary to restore the investor confidence and revive the magic of India. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

(Followed by 3b/SKC)

3b/4.00/skc

SHRI D. BANDYOPADHYAY (WEST BENGAL): Sir, it is always very difficult to follow Nandu Singh. I can call him by his name as he has been a friend for the last, perhaps, 40-45 years.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Sir, my point is slightly different. I rise to support the Appropriation Bill and the Finance Bill. I do so, not because I happen to be an ally of the UPA, but because I think it is ethically necessary to do so.

Sir, I must congratulate the hon. Finance Minister, at the outset, for having shown the human face in the Ministry of Finance. A Minister of Finance, as he said, is basically cruel; he hardly ever has a kind face. But the Minister has shown that in withdrawing the duties on gold ornaments, by ensuring one-and-a-half crore employment for them, and today, you have given some waivers, which is likely, or not likely, give impetus to the investment climate.

**(THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN)
in the Chair)**

Sir, I do congratulate him for believing in a focus on domestic demand-driven growth, and not on foreign exports growth. We have such a huge market and such a huge population. If we could only activate that and make their latent demands effective, we could do

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

miracles. I am very happy that the Finance Minister has chosen that route.

Sir, it is well-known that the growth does not immediately trickle down if positive and affirmative actions are not taken to cure the ills that the growth process in a free market economy itself creates. We have, therefore, today, huge and unacceptable levels of inequality and very low levels of employment. As my friend, hon. Shri N.K. Singh, has said, we expected that the average growth rate of eight per cent would result in, at least, some increase in employment. On the other hand, employment in the organized sector has decelerated to even below one per cent. It is, if my memory is correct, 0.8 per cent. This is not the way we could have an inclusive growth. We have growth, certainly, but is it inclusive or is it exclusive? That is where we have to put our minds.

Sir, one unsavoury feature is the continuing poverty ratio. I am not going into figures. There is the Tendulkar Committee figure of 37 per cent; there is the Arjun Sengupta Committee-figure of 77 per cent; there is a new figure, which I saw in the *Times of India*, of 68 per cent. I couldn't care less, but the broad figure is, roughly between 300 and

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

330 million men, women and children are below the Poverty Line and, at least, 200-220 million men, women and children go to bed hungry every night. This is not an acceptable situation in the growth trajectory that he has brought in. Things may be beyond his control. I never suspected his honesty or his desire to do something, but things are happening in a way which may be beyond his control.

Sir, I would just illustrate what poverty means. I do not have many questions, I have just got some figures. I got them from the very senior hon. Member, Dr. Pilania, who, in fact, made a short notice mention here that according to the International Food Policy Research Institute, we are 67th in a list of 80 hunger-ridden countries with 21 per cent of the population being under-nourished, nearly 44 per cent below-5 years children underweight and seven per cent of them dying before reaching the age of five years.

(contd. at 3c/hk)

Hk/3C/4.05

SHRI D. BANDYOPADHYAY (CONTD.): This is a situation which no civilized country can accept. I do admit that neither the UPA Government, nor our friends in the opposition will accept that

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

situation. But I must say one thing that we have been able to withstand a lot of vicissitudes in the international affairs because we still have, however badly we criticize it, the Nehruvian structure. We still have the residue of socialist pattern with not-so-dominant our public sector undertakings with some controls, particularly in the capital account. Otherwise, we might have gone the Indonesian or Philippines' way. That is where I salute the vision of Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru, Mrs. Indira Gandhi and, to some extent, Shri Rajiv Gandhi. Though he started the liberalization in a different way, yet foundations are so strong that in spite of the tsunami of marketism, we can survive, and we have survived it. I request the hon. Finance Minister that be in the same tradition of the socialist Congress, and please do not dismantle everything which is protecting us from international marketism. Sir, while we are discussing about this poverty scenario, there is something else which is highly disturbing. At the same time, vulgar, ostentatious and conspicuous consumption goes on unabated and unashamedly. Gross competitive demonstration of wealth and opulence among the rich, verging on obscenity, is causing discomfort. It loudly proclaims the existence of a parallel economy

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

about which all of us know, but hardly anyone does anything. I very earnestly request our hon. Finance Minister, he knows all about it; he has the White Paper on this subject, to initiate such an action so that some excesses of this parallel economy could be curbed. Sir, here, I would just quote, with your permission Prof. Amartya Sen. ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):

Time is over. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI D. BANDYOPADHYAY: He says, "There is probably no other example in the history of world development of an economy growing so fast for so long with such limited results in terms of broad-based social progress." Naturally, it raises an important question, 'Whose growth is it anyway?' Sir, I congratulate the hon. Finance Minister for increasing the allotment for agriculture by 18 per cent. But, Sir, our agriculture is in such a bad state because of continuous deceleration of public investment that 18 per cent increase may not be sufficient unless you have a long-term plan to sustain public investment in agriculture. I know that he knows everything as to what is to be done. Sir, crisis in agriculture -- in spite of the fact that we have the best

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

output this year, but for the past 7 or 8 years we have been in the crisis -- has led to secular decline in per capita availability of cereals. Five year average per capita availability between 1991 to 1995 was 440 grams.

(Contd. by 3d/KSK)

KSK/ASC/4.10/3D

SHRI D. BANDYOPADHYAY (CONTD.): Between 2001 and 2005, it came down to 413. And, between 2006 and 2010, it came down to 4.03. Sir, the 37-point programme...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):
The time allotted to you is over.

SHRI D. BANDYOPADHYAY: I will conclude by saying that I have a small agenda for West Bengal, and that is very simple...(Interruptions). It is for the hon. Minister to accept it or not to accept it. My point is very simple and it is known to him. West Bengal Government has inherited a huge burden of debt, and our tax revenue is almost equal to our debt service amount. Therefore, we

require moratorium and restructuring of debt. That is what we want.

Sir, through you, I implore him to bail us out from this predicament.

(Ends)

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, UPA के संकट मोचक, मैं कहूंगा कि सबसे योग्य और मंत्री परिषद् में सबसे वरिष्ठ मंत्री, हो सकता है कि दो महीने बाद महामहिम राष्ट्रपति हो जाएं, के विभाग पर मुझे बोलने का मौका मिला है। दादा, मुझे आलोचना करने में थोड़ी हिचक हो रही है, लेकिन मैं देश के हित में जो कहने जा रहा हूं कि आप आलोचना को आलोचना के रूप में मत लीजिए, बल्कि सुझाव के रूप में लीजिए। मैंने अपने राजनीति सफर में जो थोड़ा बहुत सीखा है, उसको आपके सामने रख रहा हूं।

श्रीमन्, सन् 2000 से पहले देश में जो बजट प्रस्तुत होता था, वह करीब 28 फरवरी को पेश होता था और आज भी होता है। एक प्रक्रिया थी, एक नियम था कि एक साल के लिए वह बजट फिक्स होगा। बजट में जो भी टैक्स लगता या छूट दी जाती थी, तो उस बजट को पूरा देश सुनता था और टी.वी. पर देखता था कि हमारे घर का एक साल का बजट क्या होगा? देश एक साल के लिए किस रास्ते पर चला जाएगा, देश की सोच क्या होगी? मैं यह नहीं समझ पाया कि 2000 के बाद कौन सी फ्री इकॉनमी की बात आई कि आज बजट पेश करने का कोई महत्व रह ही नहीं गया। अब लोग बजट पर विश्वास नहीं करते हैं, क्योंकि हर महीने आप टैक्स बढ़ा रहे हैं, हर महीने नई पॉलिसी ला रहे हैं,

पेट्रोलियम की मार्केट फ्री कर रहे हैं। WTO में जाने के बाद आप इकॉनमी को फ्री कर रहे हैं। हमें पता ही नहीं लग रहा है कि हमारा हर महीने का क्या बजट होगा? लोगों का बजट से धीरे-धीरे विश्वास उठता जा रहा है। हम घाटे का बजट पेश करते हैं। हमने घाटे का बजट पेश किया था, जब एक तरीके से यह कम्युनिस्ट इकॉनमी थी, लेकिन आज फ्री इकॉनमी में हम घाटे का बजट क्यों पेश कर रहे हैं? आखिर हमें इसका कारण भी सोचना चाहिए। अगर हम इसका कारण नहीं सोचेंगे, तो ठीक नहीं होगा। आज इन्टरनेशनल क्रेडिट रेटिंग एजेंसी ने हमारी रेटिंग नकारात्मक की है, तो उसके क्या तात्कालिक परिणाम होंगे। श्रीमन, हिन्दुस्तान की रेटिंग नकारात्मक होने के बाद आज हमारा फॉरेन इन्वेस्टमेंट कट गया, शेयर बाजार में गिरावट आ गई, विदेशी निवेशकों की बिकवाली हो गई, फॉरेन एक्सचेंज कम आने लगा और हमारी कंट्री की स्थिति, पूरे विश्व में मखौल के रूप में खड़ी हुई। हम हर रोज कहते हैं कि हमारी GDP बढ़ रही है, कंट्री ग्रो कर रही है। लेकिन अगर आंकड़ों पर जाएं, अधिकारियों की आंकड़ों की जो बाजीगरी है, वह देश को तरक्की की ओर नहीं ले जा सकती। हमें रियल्टी पर आना पड़ेगा। अखबारों ने लिखा कि देश की स्थिति, हमारी आर्थिक स्थिति के कारण औद्योगिक उत्पादन में महा गिरावट आई। मार्च में वृद्धि दर शून्य से तीन परसेंट नीचे चली गई, जो पिछले वर्ष 9.4 परसेंट थी। अगर इंडस्ट्रियल डिवेलपमेंट रुकता चला गया, वैसे भी कंट्री की ग्रोथ गिर रही है, आपका नॉन प्लान का खर्चा बढ़ रहा है, प्लान का खर्चा घट रहा है। आप

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

बोरोइंग इतनी कर रहे हैं कि टोटल रिवेन्यु का करीब 22-23 परसेंट उसके बोरोइंग में, उसके ब्याज में जा रहा है। एक समीक्षक ने जो समीक्षा लिखी है, मैं उसको पढ़ कर सुना हूँ, “Between 2007-08 and 2011-12, the Union Government revenue receipts galloped by 41.5 per cent. Total expenditure galloped by a whopping 85 per cent from 2007-08 to 2011-12. Non-Plan expenditure rose by nearly 76 per cent largely due to subsidies which increased by 298 per cent, and interest payment and debt servicing up to 73 per cent.”

(continued by 3e — gsp)

GSP-LP-3E-4.15

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल (क्रमागत) : हमने इन तीन सालों में 270 परसेंट borrowing की है। अगर हमारी यह स्थिति बन गई है, तो यह हमें देखना पड़ेगा कि आगे आने वाले दिनों में हमारी फाइनेंशियल स्थिति क्या होगी। आपने कह दिया कि हम एफ.डी.आई. को लाएंगे। चलिए, यह तो हम सभी विपक्ष के लोगों के कारण यह एफ.डी.आई. विरोध में रही, लेकिन आप एफ.डी.आई. में देख लीजिए, आप जिस वॉलमार्ट के लिए एफ.डी.आई. लाना चाहते थे, उस वॉलमार्ट का सालाना टर्न ओवर 421 अरब डॉलर है। 421 अरब डॉलर वॉलमार्ट का सिर्फ सालाना टर्न ओवर है, जबकि हमारी कंट्री का 314 अरब डॉलर सिर्फ विदेशी मुद्रा भंडार है। आप भी बैठे हैं, राज्य मंत्री जी यहाँ बैठे हैं, अगर मैं गलत फिगर दे

रहा हूं, मेरी फिगर गलत हों, तो आप कह दीजिए कि मैंने गलत फिगर दी हैं, लेकिन जो सत्यता आई है, वह यह है कि हमारे हिन्दुस्तान की जो खुदरा मार्केट है, वह आज, इस समय करीब 500 अरब डॉलर सालाना टर्न ओवर की है। यह आंकड़ा 2020 तक 1250 अरब डॉलर पर पहुंच जाएगा। आप उन लोगों को हमारे हिन्दुस्तान में आने के लिए आमंत्रित कर रहे हैं, जिनकी टर्न ओवर बहुत ज्यादा है। मैंने तो W.T.O. को हरदम, इसी मारे ओपोज किया था, लेकिन आप लोगों ने कहा कि W.T.O. अच्छा है। हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जी अर्थशास्त्री हैं, मैं नहीं शब्द नहीं कह सकता, क्योंकि वे अर्थशास्त्री रहे हैं। आज आप, वे और मोंटेक सिंह अहलुवालिया जी, ये तीन लोग देश के सबसे बड़े अर्थशास्त्री हैं, लेकिन अर्थशास्त्री होने के बाद यदि अर्थ ही नहीं रह जाएगा, तो हम शास्त्री का क्या करेंगे? अर्थ निकलता चला जा रहा है और शास्त्री रहते चले जा रहे हैं। आखिर हमें यह सोचना पड़ेगा कि अगर अर्थ नहीं रहा और शास्त्र लेकर घूमोगे, तो क्या फायदा? सेना में Head न रहे और सेना को औजार पकड़ा दो, तो सेना क्या करेगी, आप इसको खुद समझ सकते हो। आज वही स्थिति हमारी इकॉनॉमी की हो रही है। अगर हमने इस अर्थव्यवस्था को नहीं सुधारा, इस पर जोर नहीं दिया तो स्थिति बहुत विस्फोटक होगी। आज डॉलर 44 से 54 रुपये पर पहुंच गया है। आज भी आपकी इकॉनमी कहीं भी stability पर नहीं है। डॉलर की बढ़ती दर में आपका एक्सपोर्ट खत्म हो जाएगा, क्योंकि एक्सपोर्ट करने वाले जिस तरह से बढ़ी डॉलर दर पर गए हैं, उससे इम्पोर्ट बढ़ता चला जाएगा। हमारे

पास जो विदेशी मुद्रा है, यदि वह घटती चली गई, अगर हमारा खजाना खाली होता चला गया तो फिर हमारी economic स्थिति क्या होगी, आप समझिए। मैं तो कहता हूँ कि इस पर विचार कीजिए। अगर आप इस पर विचार नहीं करेंगे तो उचित नहीं होगा, क्योंकि स्थिति भयंकर होती चली जा रही है और इस भयंकर स्थिति को बचाने के लिए आपको कोई न कोई एक निर्णय लेना ही पड़ेगा। अगर निर्णय नहीं लिया तो देश में कहीं न कहीं विद्रोह होगा।

श्रीमन्, जितनी इन्कम कोई कमाता है, पूरे वर्ल्ड में उसका 30 परसेंट स्लैब टैक्स है। टैक्स का एक रेट है कि 30 परसेंट टैक्स दे दो। पूरे यूरोप में पेपर मनी नहीं है, वहाँ प्लास्टिक मनी है। उन पर 30 परसेंट टैक्स लगा हुआ है। आदमी 30 परसेंट डायरेक्ट टैक्स देने से मना नहीं करता है, क्योंकि उसके बाद उसकी इनकम 70 परसेंट है। दादा, आप तो रोज ही इतने टैक्स लगाते जा रहे हैं कि हम समझ नहीं पा रहे हैं। मैं कहता था कि देश में इतने कानून हैं। श्रीमन्, जब मैं वकालत पास करके, अपने सीनियर के पास वकालत करने गया तो उन्होंने हर बात पर इतने कानून दिखाने शुरू किए कि मैं थोड़ा घबरा गया कि पढ़कर क्या आया था और देख क्या रहा हूँ। वही हाल यहाँ पर हो गया है। 100 रुपये पर आपका करीब 130 रुपये टैक्स हो गया है। आपने जितना टैक्सेशन किया है, आप उसको निकाल लीजिए। आप जो उनको दिखा रहे हैं, उस संदर्भ में मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि मार्च में इन्कम टैक्स डिपार्टमेंट वाले, कस्टम एक्साइज वाले तमाम व्यापारियों से एडवांस टैक्स ले लेते हैं। आप एडवांस टैक्स दिखाकर

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

आमदनी दिखा रहे हैं। आपने एडवांस टैक्स जमाकर के यह दिखा दिया कि हमारा इतना रेवेन्यू बढ़ गया। उसके बाद, हम उसमें से करीब 25 परसेंट रिफंड करते हैं। मीणा जी, आप बता दीजिए कि हम जो रुपया जमा करते हैं, उसका हर साल इन्कम टैक्स और कस्टम एक्साइज में कितना रिफंड होता है। आपने तो उसको दिखा दिया और वह हमारी रेवेन्यू में आ गया, लेकिन जब आपने उसका 25 परसेंट रिफंड कर दिया, तब टोटल बजट में आपने जो इन्कम दिखाई है, उस इन्कम में जब 25 परसेंट चला गया, तब घाटा तो बढ़ता चला गया। आपने कहा हम वोडाफोन से 40,000 करोड़ रुपये लेंगे। कैसे लेंगे, आप यह बता दीजिए। हम लोग आखिर वह मैकेनिज्म भी तो समझ जाएं। इस सदन में जवाब देते वक्त आप कम से कम उस मैकेनिज्म को भी हमें बता दीजिए। ..(व्यवधान)..श्रीमन्, अभी तो शुरू किया है।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):

Agrawal ji, your allotted time is over. Please conclude.

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, आप तो बड़े कृपालु हैं।

(3f/akg पर जारी)

AKG-SK/3F/4.20

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल (क्रमागत) : दादा, मैं आपसे कह रहा हूँ कि आपने दिखाया है कि इस वर्ष वोडाफोन की वसूली से हमारी अनुमानित आय 40 हजार करोड़ रुपए होगी। वोडाफोन की वसूली से कैसे होगी?

मैं आपसे कहना चाहता हूँ कि आपकी नेता, यूपीए की लीडर, आदरणीया सोनिया जी ने घोषणा कर रखी है कि “फूड फॉर ऑल” और “एजुकेशन टू ऑल”, दो बिल हम इसी वर्ष लाएँगे। ... (व्यवधान) ... उन्होंने दो बिल के लिए कहा था। हेल्थ फॉर ऑल, वे तो चाहते हैं कि हेल्थ जितनी खराब हो जाए, उतना अच्छा है। हम तो कह रहे हैं कि “फूड फॉर ऑल” और “एजुकेशन टू ऑल”, आपने ये दो बिल लाने की बात की, लेकिन जब वे बिल आएँगे, तो उनके लिए पैसा कहाँ से आएगा, आपने बजट में उनके लिए कितना प्रावधान किया? क्या आपने कोई कॉलम छोड़ा, एक रुपया डाला, दो रुपए डाले, बजट में कहीं पर शुरुआत की? अगर आपने शुरुआत नहीं की, तो इसका मतलब यह है कि आप इन्हें लाना नहीं चाहते हैं। अगर आप लाना चाहते हैं और आपने शुरुआत नहीं की है, तो फिर आप अगले सेशन में सप्लीमेंटरी लाएँगे। आप हम लोगों को, देश को रोज-रोज क्यों गुमराह कर रहे हैं? एक बार गुमराह कीजिए, जो कहना हो, देश के सामने एक बार कह दीजिए, हम लोग एक बार में समझ लेंगे, लेकिन अगर रोज-रोज पॉलिसी को कहीं इधर बदल कर, कहीं उधर बदल कर लाएँगे, तो इससे देश का हित नहीं होने जा रहा। इससे इकॉनमिक बैलेंस नहीं होगा। अगर अर्थव्यवस्था बैलेंस नहीं हुई, तो आप चाहे जितना कहिए कि हम बहुत अच्छी गवर्नमेंट चला रहे हैं, लेकिन जब तक इम्पैक्ट नीचे नहीं जाएगा, आपको इसका रिटर्न नहीं आएगा।

मैं बहुत बार कहता रहा, लेकिन आपने बैंकों को फ्रीडम दे दी।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (डा. ई.एम. सुदर्शन नाच्चीयप्पन) : आप समाप्त कीजिए।

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : मैं खत्म कर रहा हूँ।

माननीय मीणा जी, बैंकों के लिए यह कम्पलसरी था कि वे स्टेट के डेवलपमेंट के लिए सीडी रेशियो बनाएँ, 60:40 का रेशियो। यहाँ तमाम लोग बैठे हैं, बंगाल के, यूपी के, बिहार के। हमारे स्टेट में बैंक जितना रुपया जमा कर रहा है, मुश्किल से उसका 20 परसेंट हमारे स्टेट में खर्च कर रहा है। वह 80 परसेंट बॉरोइंग कर रहा है, उन पूँजीपतियों को, जो उनको पैसा दे रहे हैं। हमारे स्टेट पर कहाँ खर्च हो रहा है? माननीय दादा, माननीय मीणा जी, मैं आपसे सिर्फ इतना पूछना चाहता हूँ कि आप बता दीजिए कि पूरी कंट्री में हर स्टेट में बैंकों में कितने रुपए प्रति वर्ष जमा होते हैं और उनमें से कितना पैसा उस स्टेट के डेवलपमेंट के लिए खर्च होता है? आप बैंकों के लिए यह कम्पलसरी कीजिए कि वे जो रुपए जमा करेंगे, उनका 60 परसेंट उस स्टेट के डेवलपमेंट पर लगाएँगे, तब वह स्टेट डेवलप करेगी।

अंत में मैं सिर्फ इतना कहूँगा, वैसे तो बहुत कुछ कहना था, दादा, मैं सिर्फ इतना ही कहूँगा कि जब तक आप इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर पर रुपए खर्च नहीं करेंगे, तब तक कंट्री डेवलप नहीं होगी। पूरे विश्व में टोटल इन्कम का 35 परसेंट इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर के डेवलपमेंट पर खर्च किया जाता है, आप तो 10 परसेंट भी खर्च नहीं कर रहे हैं। अगर कंट्री ही नहीं डेवलप करेगी, आप वोटों के लिए सब्सिडी के माध्यम से चलते रहेंगे, बीपीएल-एपीएल का झगड़ा चलता रहेगा, और चीजों

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

का झगड़ा चलता रहेगा, तो कंट्री कहाँ रहेगी? दादा, मैं तो नहीं चाहता हूँ कि आप अंत में यही कहें कि “हम छोड़ चले हैं महफिल को, याद आएँ कभी तो मत रोना”। बस इतना ही कहना चाहता हूँ। दादा, मुझे विश्वास है कि आपके जैसा योग्य व्यक्ति मेरे जैसे एक छोटे व्यक्ति के मुँह से निकली हुई बातों को गम्भीरता से लेते हुए, उनको कहीं समायोजित करते हुए, इस देश की अर्थव्यवस्था में सुधार लाते हुए हमारे देश को विश्व में जो स्थान बनाना है, विश्व में वह स्थान दिलाएगा। इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ मैं आपका आभार व्यक्त करता हूँ। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

SHRI T.M. SELVAGANAPATHI (TAMIL NADU): Thank you, Sir, for giving me this opportunity. Sir, while I rise to support these two Bills, The Appropriation (No.3) Bill, 2012 and the Finance Bill, 2012, I would like to raise two important issues concerning the State of Tamil Nadu before my time gets exhausted. Tamil Nadu is the hub of textile business. It accounts for one-third of the textile business of this country, employing nearly fifty lakh workers directly under this industry. It is in a serious trouble, Sir. This industry is earning foreign exchange of almost rupees fifty thousand crore, which have invested over rupees one lakh crore during the last ten years. But, the unfortunate, unprecedented and huge price fluctuation of all the fibres

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

and the demand recession for all textile products globally rendered these units incur a huge loss because of the serious draw back in the domestic market.

(Contd. by 3G-ysr)

-SK/YSR/4.25/3G

SHRI T.M. SELVAGANAPATHI (CONTD.): Sir, out of 308 textile units in the country, almost all the textile units are incurring a heavy loss; only a few are making a marginal profit. Because of acute power shortage in the southern region, the textile industry in Tamil Nadu is the worst affected. It is not that the problem is company specific. All these losses have resulted from external factors. Today, industrialists are suffering for no fault of theirs. The present outstanding loans of this sector are estimated to be around Rs.50,000 crore. The industrialists' forum, namely the South India Millowners' Association has already made their representation before the hon. Finance Minister and the Textile Ministry. The Textile Ministry has also made a favourable recommendation for a deferred payment of this loan. Neither do they demand interest waiver, nor do they demand any

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

other concession. They only want a deferred payment of two years which will save this industry. The only concern is that the rules of the Reserve Bank of India do not permit the second moratorium. The first moratorium was announced by the Government in 2008-09 on the eve of global recession and the restructuring facility was given to these industries *suo motu*, not on the demand of industrialists. Now, this cannot be considered as a second restructuring. It is not even a restructuring. They want only a deferred payment. I think the Finance Minister, who always stands for reason and prudence, would sympathetically consider this. Otherwise, the industry will go to dogs and we would not be in a position to reshape it in future.

The other issue is related to tapioca sago industry. It is known as 'sabudana' in Hindi. It is consumed as a food item in the northern India. During the festival season, sabudana is consumed mostly after the fasting. It is a food item, which is widely consumed in almost seven-eight States like Rajasthan, Gujarat, and Maharashtra during the festival season. In the recent Budget of 2012-13, the excise duty levied on sabudana has been increased from one per cent to two per cent. Last year, it was one per cent. Prior to that, there was no

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

excise duty on this particular product. Now it is being increased to two per cent without CENVAT credit facility under the tariff heading No.1903.

Sir, the problem is that tapioca is grown especially in the State of Tamil Nadu in an area of 3.1 lakh hectares. Almost 20 lakh agricultural families mostly belonging to tribal sections of society are working in it. It is a rainfed crop. It is not a waterfed crop. It is cultivated on dry land. There is no intermediate product emerging in producing sabudana. Even the Department of Industries has recommended to waive this two per cent duty in order to help the manufacturers and farmers. There are nearly 250 SSI units in the State of Tamil Nadu which has an investment of less than Rs. five crore. If this is not removed, both the farmers and the industrialists will have a serious problem in the forthcoming year because of rising input cost and the level of prices they will get which they already take into consideration. Being an ally of the UPA II, not an ally but a trusted ally of the UPA II, the people of our district and the State expect this demand to be considered sympathetically in order to save these two industries. (Contd. by VKK/3H)

SHRI T.M. SELVAGANAPATHI (CONTD.): Sir, coming to the core issues, we are happy to note that the proposed amendments to the General Anti Avoidance Rules in the Finance Bill would target the tax avoidance of those who are not genuine investors and normally try to take advantage of the low or zero tax countries which give them the shelter. Sir, I compliment the Minister for initiating an amendment against those who really do not pay the taxes. Though the amendment is laudable, we would only like to know: Why is it that the hon. Minister is planning to defer the implementation of the General Anti Avoidance Rules for one year?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):

Thank you. Please conclude quickly.

SHRI T.M. SELVAGANAPATHI: Sir, you are my custodian and I would like you to grant me two more minutes to express my points on the main issues of the Budget. Therefore, this one year could be utilised by the hon. Minister to see that the FIs are not hampered which will have a bearing on the growth of the economy. Therefore, this one year could have been utilised to find out the reasons how this money

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

could be garnered in order to benefit the economy. We also compliment the amendment to the Income Tax Act which has been proposed after the Supreme Court verdict on the Vodafone issue in order to bring overseas mergers and acquisitions in tax net. Sir, my apprehension is: Will it stand the test or the scrutiny of law, especially when the courts have declared that the Income Tax Department cannot tax such companies and there is no provision? The retrospective effect that is given in the amendment would certainly lead to protracted litigation in the courts. The Minister is anticipating Rs.35000 crore to Rs.40000 crore but, what would happen in that situation? Therefore, the anticipated protracted litigation must be taken into consideration and see that how it could be compensated on a different occasion.

Sir, the other important issue is relating to the increase in indirect taxes, that is, excise duty and service tax from ten per cent to twelve per cent. It is another area of concern. Our apprehension is: Will it not indirectly result in raising prices of essential commodities, especially when we have been already facing serious inflationary pressure for the past two years?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):

Kindly conclude. We have to complete it.

SHRI T.M. SELVAGANAPATHI: Yes, Sir. I am coming to the end. Sir, the increase in the service tax and the hike in excise duty would adversely affect the growth prospects of the industry and result in higher cost to the consumers which, in turn, will lead to inflation. Sir, this is one point which we must take into account because with the increase in service tax, we see a phase that we are turning to GST. Sir, while introducing the GST, the hon. Minister must take the States and the allied parties into confidence, otherwise, they would be the sufferers because the States are already reeling under serious financial crisis. Sir, in that situation, the oil subsidy and the fertiliser subsidy, the non-food subsidy, will hit the agricultural sector.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):

Okay. Thank you.

SHRI T.M. SELVAGANAPATHI: Sir, now, I am making the last point.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN): I

have to call the last next speaker.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

SHRI T.M. SELVAGANAPATHI: Sir, I would make a humble submission. The petroleum subsidy is projected to fall from Rs.68000 crore to Rs.43000 crore. What is the cascading effect? Will it not affect the inflationary pressure already felt?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):

Thank you very much. Please conclude.

SHRI T.M. SELVAGANAPATHI: Sir, now, I come to the last point. In respect of the Fertiliser Subsidy Bill, I am constrained to add that the Minister for Chemicals and Fertilisers was opposed to the reduction or removal of the subsidy for fertilisers.

(Contd. by TMV/3j)

-VKK-TMV-MCM/3J/4.35

SHRI T. M. SELVAGANAPATHI (CONTD.): But still the Government of India had gone ahead with the complete abolition of the subsidy on the fertilizer front. In 2011-12, it was Rs.60,000 crores and now it is estimated to be Rs.74,000 crores which would earn an additional revenue of Rs.7,199 crores.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E. M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):

Okay, thank you. Dr. Yogendra P. Trivedi.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

SHRI T. M. SELVAGANAPATHI: This would definitely be passed on to the farmers who are supposed to pay the fertilizer price.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E. M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):
Please conclude.

SHRI T. M. SELVAGANAPATHI: Already the agricultural farmers whose input cost is more and do not get the price, then, again, the farmers are going to be affected because of this move.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E. M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):
Okay. Thank you. Dr. Yogendra P. Trivedi.

SHRI T. M. SELVAGANAPATHI: Therefore, I urge upon the Government to have a relook at this issue. These are cases in which the farmers are affected, the common man is affected. So, it should be relooked. Thank you.

(Ends)

DR. YOGENDRA P. TRIVEDI (MAHARASHTRA): Thank you, Sir. I rise here to support the Appropriation Bill as well as the Finance Bill, not merely because we are allies of the UPA-II, but I also believe sincerely that the Finance Minister was working under tremendous constraints. Under these circumstances, he has to bring out the

finance proposals which would have satisfied some and dissatisfied some.

At the opening of the Budget Session we were expecting four important Finance Bills which should have tremendous effect on the financial horizon of the country. One was the Direct Tax Code; the second was Goods and Services Act; the third was the Companies Act; and the fourth was the Insurance Bill and the FDI in retails. Out of these, the Direct Tax Code, which should have changed the Income-Tax Act, 1961, after 50 years, which was overdue, was most eagerly awaited and was to come into effect from 1st April, 2012. The Finance Minister promised that he would bring the Direct Tax Code into operation from 1st April, 2012, but he could not succeed. But he brought some of the provisions of the Direct Tax Code in the Finance Bill like General Anti-Avoidance Rules (GAAR). The GAAR is prevalent in many countries in different forms. In some countries, they have the Strategic Anti-Avoidance Rules (SAAR). In some countries, they have the Targeted Anti-Avoidance Rules (TAAR). But most of the countries have accepted that avoidance of tax by unfair means can't be tolerated. Now, the Finance Committee, when the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

proposals of Direct Tax Code came, gave certain suggestions. If these suggestions had been incorporated in the Finance Act, probably, there would have been a little opposition. One of our suggestions was that there should not be unbridled power in the hands of the officers and the Commissioners of Income-Tax. The second thing that we have suggested was that the burden of proof should not be put on the income-taxpayer. It should be considered to be the primary duty of the officer to find out whether there is a desire to avoid tax. Both these suggestions were not taken into consideration and under the provisions with which they came up in the Finance Bill, the burden of proof was on the assessee, but, at the same time, unbridled powers were given to the officers. There was a lot of opposition. As a result of that, the Finance Minister has postponed the implementation of these provisions till 2014. I am afraid, this is a retrograde step. This is like throwing the baby with the bath water. These were good provisions, which are necessary provisions, but they were to be abandoned because of the hasty way in which they were brought.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Then, I must admire the Finance Minister's courage for taking a firm stand on Vodafone. It is true that there was a Supreme Court judgement. But most of the people forget that before the matter came before the Supreme Court, on two occasions, the Bombay High Court had to study the very same case.

(Contd. by 3K/VK)

VK/3K/4.40

DR. YOGENDRA P. TRIVEDI (CONTD): Justice Radhakrishnan, in an interim application, came to the conclusion that this transaction was taxable in India. That is why the notice which was issued by the TDS authorities was correct. Thereafter, when the matter came for final hearing before Justice Chandrachud and others, Justice Chandrachud also took the view that it was taxable in India. You can't have provisions by which you do not pay tax anywhere in the world. The matter then came to the Supreme Court. The Supreme Court took a divergent view. There was considerable pressure on the Finance Minister that the Supreme Court judgement should now be followed and he should not go in for any amendment. But he had the courage. He said, "The country can't afford to lose such a large

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

amount of money.” This is a transaction in which we must look at the commercial substance. The assets were here; sixty-seven per cent of the assets were in India. If you go outside and make a transaction and say that there is no liability of capital gains tax, it is not permissible. The Finance Minister stuck to his guns. I must say one thing that this was a transaction which was also blessed by the World Bank Chief, Robert Zoellick. He also said that this was not correct. In any event, a company which is entering into a transaction of this nature has to ultimately pay tax somewhere. They cannot say that we are not liable to pay tax anywhere. He has taken the right step. This has to be taxed. The country cannot afford to lose such a large amount of money. At the same time, I must also admit that he has been gracious enough. He has said that all these retrospective amendments, which he has made, by virtue of which Vodafone becomes liable to pay tax here, will not be operative beyond six years, which is the period for reopening the assessment. Probably, he is also thinking that Vodafone should not be penalized. Otherwise also, I think, if it is a view which is taken by the Supreme Court, there will be no penalty for concealment. But he has said that he will go to the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

extent that there is no concealment on this transaction. I am not against that. But at the same time I must also mention some of the aspects which are very important. I was reading a lead article in a very influential daily yesterday. I found therein that some of the things stated about our economy require consideration. There was a mention about Adidas, which has suffered a loss of Rs. 1,350 crores. They have closed down their shops, 300 shops of Adidas and 200 shops of Reebok shoes, because there was a fraud by some of the employees. This happens in this country because our legislative machinery is so slow and our procedure so prolonged that as a result thereof the criminals are not brought to justice. In this country, unfortunately, what has happened is....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):

Please conclude.

DR. YOGENDRA P. TRIVEDI: Earlier it used to be said, “Crime does not pay”, but in our country, sometimes, we feel that crime pays. This is something which has to be looked into.

(THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair)

Then there was this case of pharmaceutical products. There was lack of quality audit, as a result of which a Japanese company, Daiichi Sankyo suffered a loss of 3.8 billion dollars. They said that there was absence of quality audit in the country. As a result of which we find that the Standard and Poor's has downgraded us considerably. Institutions like LIC, ICICI, Axis Bank have been downgraded. Now, the thing is, people forget. People are now becoming despondent. They are saying that in this country there is no future.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please conclude.

DR. YOGENDRA P. TRIVEDI: I am concluding. I am only giving suggestions. When they are crying foul, they forget one thing which is very important. Our country is first in the production of cotton in the world. We are second in the production of sugar in the world. We are first in the production of milk in the world. We forget one thing which is very important. I found in an article that one-fifths of Europe's car-making capacity is idle, while sales in India are growing

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

double-digit. I think people have to come to us. There is no hope; there is no scope anywhere else.

(Contd. By 3L)

RG & SSS/4.45 & 4.50/3L & 3M

DR. YOGENDRA P. TRIVEDI (contd.): People will come; there will be inflow of foreign capital. But we have to bear in mind two things which are very important here. The Finance Minister has increased the duty on gold to four per cent, as a result of which, I am afraid, there will be a large amount of gold smuggling. I am making a suggestion here. In this country, a large amount of gold is lying in private hands, in temples and trusts. Why don't you have Gold Bank so that people can go and deposit their gold? The Gold Bank will be in possession of gold worth trillions of dollars, and that will give some sort of support to our economy.

Finally, Sir, the Government must consider about the large amounts of money which have been stashed abroad. This is the question of black money, and much has been said about it. And what we have seen is that the Finance Minister had to bite the bullet. This

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

money will not come in the automatic channel. By all these tax treaties or these tax avoidance treaties, the money will not come. There is a necessity for a voluntary scheme for payment of taxes by those who have parked their money abroad. This can be done if the Finance Minister takes courage in both hands and brings about this legislation, before his elevation, by way of an ordinance. Then, I am sure, trillions of dollars will come in as a result of this.

(Ends)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Hon. Members, we have to have the reply today itself. So, I have to conclude the discussion by 6 o' clock. Therefore, every hon. Member is requested to stick to their allotted time. Whatever time is due to them, they will get, but not more. So, accordingly, you plan your speech. Now, Shri Shashi Bhusan Behera. You have six minutes.

SHRI SHASHI BHUSAN BEHERA (ODISHA): Sir, I thank you for giving me this opportunity to express my views on the Finance Bill. I

would like to speak in Oriya. The Members may face some constraint because they have to listen to the interpretation. But, I think, this will not be a constraint for the Finance Minister, Pranabda, who hails from West Bengal. It is well-known to Members that Odisha and West Bengal are neighbouring States, and the Oriya and Bengali languages are quite similar. So, I want to speak in Oriya. I can all the more touch the heart of Pranabda this way, and also, because this may be his last stint as the Finance Minister, I want to get closer to him through my language. **

** Pp 760-763 (English version of the original speech made in Odia will be issued as a supplement.

THE APPROPRIATION (NO.3) BILL, 2012**AND****THE FINANCE BILL, 2012 (contd.)**

SHRI SHASHI BHUSAN BEHERA (ODISHA): **At the outset I would like to congratulate to Hon'ble Finance Minister for trying his best in tackling the recession so bold and efficiently. But our economy is still not fully free from the bad effects of recession. During my speech I will certainly respond to the points raised by my colleague Dr. Bhalchandra Mangekar who has tried to defend to government. It is but natural that the budget of the Government shall face criticism on the demerits found in the budget. But I would like to welcome the step taken by Dada for rolling back the 1% duty on jewellery. This will go a long way in providing relief to the craftman and small traders dealing in gold jewellery. The craftman and small traders of Odisha and West Bengal are deeply grateful to the Hon'ble Finance Minister.

** Pp 760-763 (English version of the original speech in Odia.)

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Sir, India has a population of 120 crores. I do not wish to discuss again the problem of poverty of our country. It has been discussed many times in this august House. But I wish to caution the Hon'ble Finance Minister about the difficulties he will be facing in tackling the acute problem of recession. A deficit budget will contribute to create further inflation in the country.

Sir, this government has miserably failed in controlling inflation. The steps taken by this Government have proved fruitless with regard to the production of food grains. The government has failed to put a check on the rising price of petrol and diesel, which has an adverse impact on inflation in general as well as the price rise of essential commodities. Government is a miserable failure in controlling price-rise and this has badly affected the poor and down-trodden of the country. It has become a habit with this Government for pre-budget increase of the prices of petrol and diesel. The common man has been facing problem in service sector due to an increase of a 2% increase in excise duty. The interest of the common man has been badly affected. States like Orissa and West are taking steps to

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

provide infrastructure. But the 2% increase of duty on cement will certainly affect the interest of these States.

Sir, the Government has failed to achieve the target of 7.9% of growth rate of the GDP. You could just manage to achieve 6.9%. In the field of agriculture also the target of 4% growth has not been achieved. These are not adequate provision for providing irrigation facilities to the farmers and also providing greater infrastructure in the country. The worst sufferers are the small and medium farmers due to rising prices of chemical fertilizers and seeds. I just hope the Hon'ble Finance Minister will take steps for safeguarding the interest of small and medium farmers.

Sir, there is an urgent need to take steps scientifically in order to take care of the lakhs of tons of food grains which are rotting in the godown, while people are starving in our country.

Sir, unless genuine efforts are made in providing health care, education facilities by the government the economic condition of the people will never improve.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Sir, there are tremendous potential for tourism in Orissa. But unfortunately there has been not even 1% financial allocation for tourism. This fact has been raised by my colleague Shri Piyush Goyal. There is no provision in the budget for encouraging tourism in States like West Bengal and Odisha, where there is tremendous potential for tourism. We need to take steps for utilizing coal and other mineral resources for the development of our economy. There is also a need for opening more ports in India. About 14 Ports are in the pipeline in Odisha. So there is a need to give financial support for creating this infrastructure. Sit, It is unfortunate that States are getting only Rs. 27 out of Rs. 250 of royalty in iron-ore. We feel that our State has incurred a loss of one lakh crores of royalty. Hence there is a need to review the royalty policy with regard to minerals. I also make the demand for declaring Odisha as a special category State.

Thanking you.

(Ends)

(Followed by 3N)

SHRI A.W. RABI BERNARD (TAMIL NADU): Hon. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I congratulate the hon. Finance Minister for the bold decision he has taken in the case of amending the tax laws retrospectively. He has categorically said that India cannot be a tax avoiding or tax evading country for a few shrewd foreign companies. Sir, a question on paying taxes to the Roman conquerors was asked to Jesus Christ. Jesus, whom I consider as one of the greatest revolutionary of all times, said, "Render therefore unto Caesar the things which be Caesar's, and unto God the things which be God's." Sir, who is Caesar in a democracy like ours? Is it not the people? Peraringar Anna, in whose fond memory my party is named, said,

(Hon. Member may please fill Tamil portion)

It means, let us see God in the joy of the poor. Let us see God in the smiles of the marginalised. When the hon. Finance Minister spoke so patriotically in the other House and I quote, "We were not eating lizards or cockroaches before the foreign investors came." I was reminded of my own leader, another revolutionary whom I admire, Puratchi Thalaivar M.G.R. He sang,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012
(Hon. Member may please fill the Tamil portion).

It means, what is that this sacred country is lacking that you will stretch a begging arm to foreign countries? Toil with all our strength in the fields of the motherland and you will be respected in other countries. This is what Dr. MGR was said in 1968. What FDI does Cuba get? But, look at the medical miracles of Cuba. Sir, not only Hugo Chavez and Fidel Castro but every single citizen of Cuba gets cured and gets an excellent medical treatment. Hence, we, once again, reiterate our support to all actions of patriotism and pro-poor legislation.

Sir, I also suggest that retrospective amendments to clarify the position of law should be done at the earliest point of time when the issue stems up i.e., at the beginning of the controversy, rather than allowing controversy to reach the highest court of the land.

We, in Tamil Nadu, are celebrating the first anniversary of Madam Jayalalitha's Government. One of the marvelous achievements of Madam Jayalalitha, which will have far-reaching consequence for the young men and women of the country and the economy in general, is the cost-free laptops given to the millions of

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

students in my State. Only a visionary leader like Madam Jayalalitha, who rules the State like a missionary, totally dedicated to the cause, can think of such fantastic scheme.

Sir, in the Finance Bill, the hon. Finance Minister talks and I quote, "Additional surcharge, for the purposes of the Union, to be called the 'Secondary and Higher Secondary Cess on income tax,' calculated at the rate of one per cent of such income tax and surcharge so as to fulfill the commitment of the Government to provide and finance secondary and higher secondary education." Sir, the Government of India might have collected huge sums through Higher Education Cess w.e.f. 2008-09. We are asking for our dues. We demand what is legitimately ours. The hon. Finance Minister promised higher education subsidies and collected cess for it. Now, let him keep his promise and give us our share. How much of educational cess, both elementary and higher education, have the Government of India collected so far? Please share this with the States generously. In Tamil Nadu, we give everything free of cost to all students. We give geometry boxes, colour pencils, atlas, dictionaries, bicycles, school bags, text books, note books, hostel fee, enhanced food allowances,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

etc., to millions of students. So, please share the educational cess with the States generously.

With these words, I support the Finance and Appropriation Bills. Thank you.

(Ends)

(FOLLOWED BY KS "30")

30/5:00/ks

SHRI Y. S. CHOWDARY (ANDHRA PRADESH): Thank you very much, Sir, for having given me this opportunity. To begin with, I may be permitted to quote a few headlines -- from one of the financial newspapers -- which show our country's economic situation today. These headlines are, and I quote, 'Gloom to Deepen: India Inc', 'Moody's Adds Insult to Injury, Scissors Rating of 3 Banks', and 'Rupee Stays in a Hole, Sinks to 53.97 vs Dollar'.

Sir, today, every sector in India, whether it is steel, cement, telecom, power or infrastructure, is facing huge financial imbalance, mainly due to indecisions at various levels of the Government. Unfortunately, for the past couple of years, the Government has been reeling under scam after scam like 2G scam, Commonwealth scam,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

iron ore scam and so on. Because of indecision at the highest levels of the Government, the country has been losing its direction which is reflecting very clearly in every economic activity and which is also directly resulting in weakening of our rupee. Sir, corporates, because of this indecision, are forced to refer their cases to CDR for financial restructuring, which does not augur well for an economy that has seen an unprecedented growth in the last couple of decades. If this trend continues, I am afraid, ultimately, all our banks and financial institutions, which are the backbone not only of our industry but the whole of our economy, may land in big trouble losing their credibility in the international market. Ultimately, the country will lose its credit rating. Sir, as we are all aware, yesterday, LIC's rating was downgraded. A few months ago SBI's rating was also downgraded. These are great institutions of trust and faith. They are the leaders in their respective sectors. Downgrading of the leader in a sector is a clear reflection as to what is happening in that sector. Sir, post-Independence, all our Indian entrepreneurs have worked very hard and created industrial growth which has helped all the banks in developing their own networks.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Sir, today, our farmers want support for sustainable farming but not doles. But Government after Government has preferred to give doles, for obvious reasons! Subsidies on fertilizers, oil, power, etc. are nothing but doles. Instead of giving these doles, Government should formulate good and balanced policies, have a level-playing field in business, so that different sectors of our economy can improve their financial health and, indirectly, will help the country's economy. The Government has to come out with aggressive plans, particularly in reducing imports which can go a long way in helping the farming community in improving their technology, agricultural implements and in yield-improvement technologies. The Government has been continuously silent about any aggressive policy in regard to production of renewable energy which can produce a lot of power, whether hydel or solar.

Sir, today many banks and Government departments are not taking any decision due to the 'fear of the unknown' which is a well-known fact. Unfortunately, we all agree that there is a complete breakdown and a paralysis of our decision-making process. It looks as if the Government is surviving with the support of ventilator. The

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

country have had many scams and many problems like various by-elections, demands for smaller States, etc. I strongly request that the Government should deal with all these scams, etc. by appointing a task force exclusively for this purpose, without affecting the growth of the country.

(cd. by 3p/kgg)

Kgg/3p/5.05

SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY (contd.): Sir, in every developing economy, some systemic failures are bound to happen. But, we have to deal with such kind of failures in a matured manner and not in haste.

Sir, in any case, the time has also come for all the political parties to work with cooperation and coordination rather than confrontation and competition in the interest of the country. In any case, this Bill is a *fait accompli* approval. Thank you.

(Ends)

DR. ASHOK S. GANGULY (NOMINATED): Sir, I support both the Bills that have been put forward by the hon. Finance Minister. I would not repeat many of the points that have been made, but I compliment the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

hon. Finance Minister for having accepted some key recommendations and for having acknowledged that, possibly, the time-frame, it was supposed to have, needs to be moderated. Thank you, hon. Finance Minister for the consideration. However, I wish to share with the House and the Finance Minister a rather gloomy prognosis. We can be critical, we can do anything. But, the point of the fact is that the world is going through a very difficult phase. I am not paranoid. I have worked internationally around; but, I sometimes wondered whether the rating agencies are playing a role that they are not supposed to play. I think, we need to question and challenge the rating agencies rather than converting them into headlines in our newspapers.

The second thing I want to warn is that the banking institutions around the world are in very serious trouble. A major funding institution has just lost 2-3 billion dollars due to trading mistakes. Therefore, the crisis of the global financial system is far deeper and we have to be very alert about the games the international financial institutions also play. I think, it is the legitimate right of every country to have a taxation system and bilateral taxation treaties. But, there

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

cannot be any system which can be discovered where you do not pay any tax anywhere in the world. Therefore, it is our legitimate right; every country is doing it, to explore ways and means, to charge people taxes that legitimately belong to the nation. I will never get on to the defensive regarding some of the measures that the hon. Finance Minister is proposing. However, let us not forget that we are yet to come to the Monsoon Session of the House. The Finance Minister is always there praying to the Rain God rather than depending on the meteorologists because on that depends the bulk of our economy.

I think, the allocation for the Green Revolution, particularly in the five eastern States, is going to be critical, Mr. Finance Minister, and I hope for the adequate funds as well. My worry is, there is going to be a slowdown in investment, there is going to be a slowdown in growth. But, the bigger worry is the slowdown in employment. I do not want our demographic dividend to become a demographic burden. Very little you can do about it, because you are yourself facing the challenge of fiscal deficit which is a significant issue. I did not hear, across the room, any suggestion that would be helpful for you to

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

tackle the fiscal deficit. However, I think, you are a great asset to the nation because when you speak in this country, or in conferences at international forum, you can change the mood of the world about the Indian opportunities. However, I do not under-estimate the latest threat that the world is facing and that is the slowdown of the Chinese economy, the Chinese foreign trade. Just imagine, if China were to quite selectively devalue the Yuan, the competitive threat to India would not be insignificant.

(Contd. by tdb/3q)

TDB/3Q/5.10

DR. ASHOK S. GANGULY (CONTD.): And, therefore, Mr. Finance Minister, while we talk, we can do everything we want; you have an enviable task with your hon. Ministers of State as well. In order to manage, possibly, one of the most difficult periods in the last 20 years that is going to face this country, between now and the next Budget in 2013-14, I can only wish you well. I know that you rise above criticism; you rise above the analysis, paralysis that travels through this House. You have a long experience. And while I do not want to wish you which way you will choose your own future, I can only selfishly hope

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

that the nation can have some say in the decision about your continuing to guide the future of this country, as you have done for so many years. I wish you all the best. I thank you, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, for giving me the opportunity to speak on this subject. Sir, you know that I never take extra time.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.K. KURIEN): I must specially thank you for that.

DR. ASHOK S. GANGULY: Thank you, Sir. I wish the Finance Minister all the best.

(Ends)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.K. KURIEN): Dr. Bhartkumar Raut, you should emulate the example of Gangulyji with regard to timing.

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT (MAHARASHTRA): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, it so happens that whenever a discussion takes place, we forget that we are Council of States; we are Rajya Sabha. All these parties which are represented here are regional parties. We may be small in number here, but we are giants in our States. And, this House is meant for raising the voice of States.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.K. KURIEN): Therefore, you take five minutes.

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT: Okay, Sir.

Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, while talking on the Appropriation and the Finance Bill, I would not be touching the macro issues, which my other colleagues have already touched and deliberated. But I am going into micro issues, which touch my State. I come from Mumbai, which is called *urbs prima*. We want to make it the financial hub of the world. So, I just want to highlight the plight of my city, the city of Mumbai, in this House. Sir, I am only touching those points which have financial implications, and in which, the Centre is supposed to provide finance to the city for its benefit.

Sir, I am going into bullet points, and I will not speak more. Sir, my first point is about Brihan Mumbai Storm Water Drainage Project, which is popularly known as BRIMSTOWAD. Sir, on 26th July, 2005, the big floods affected Mumbai. Then, we decided to improve our drainage and sewage system, for which we kept an amount of Rs.1,200 crores. For that, the State was supposed to pay Rs.200 crores, and the Centre was supposed to provide Rs.1,000 crores. Sir,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

I want to remind the hon. Finance Minister as to how much has come. Now, after seven years, the project cost has gone up to Rs.3,535 crores. So, it has gone up from Rs.1,200 crores to Rs.3,535 crores. It is only because the finance did not come on time. Sir, the State has already paid some amount. And, now, what is required is Rs.2,335 crores. That amount is required from the Centre. Sir, I would suggest that this amount should come as fast as possible.

Sir, another thing is about the development of the Mithi River. The world has heard about the Mithi River only after the worst floods that hit the city. After that, MMRDA, the State Government body, and the Mumbai Municipal Corporation, together, created a project. Because six years have passed, the revised Budget for the Project is Rs.1,657 crores; for which, the Centre is supposed to pay Rs.1,100 crores immediately. Sir, I am saying immediately because every day's delay is costing us something like Rs. 1 crore per day, apart from the hazards to the city.

(Contd. by 3r-cls)

KLS/3R-5.15

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT (CONTD): Sir, the third project that I would like to bring to your notice is the heliport project that was also developed with the help of the Central Government. Mumbai has only length, we do not have breadth. Therefore, to decongest the traffic, particularly, during the busy time, the proposal was that we have a heliport one at Marine Drive or at Kolaba which is the centre tip of the city and the other in northern tip and here it can be in Navi Mumbai. Sir, the Environment Ministry has given clearance to the Navi Mumbai heliport but it has not given clearance to the south tip. So, how does it work? From where do the helicopters take off? Sir, here also we need financial help from the Centre. This is because unless we get finance from the Centre, this will not work. Sir, I am saying this because Mumbai has population from all over the country. We have more Hindi-speaking people than any city of Uttar Pradesh. We have more Gujarati-speaking people than any city except Ahmedabad. I am not going into the regionalism. I am saying that people from all over the country come here and they do their business. In order to help them to commute, at least, you should have heliports, otherwise,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

we cannot do anything. (Time-bell) Sir, I am coming to the last point. There is another project of floating jetties. In order to decongest the city, the project is to have floating jetties near Gateway of India and near Andheri or near Chambur. Sir, that project is also waiting for financial assistance for the last ten years. In ten years you can imagine how much traffic has gone up. So, my suggestion to the Centre is that, please look into these issues very urgently. There are many issues of Maharashtra. I am not touching them because this time I thought I should concentrate on the *urbs prima*. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU): Thank you, Sir. The Finance Bill, 2012 is clearly biased towards the corporates and the rich. This is evident from the fact that while the Direct Taxes being levied on the rich will result in a loss of Rs.4500 crores, more after the concessions announced by our hon. Finance Minister on 7th May, 2012. Increase in Indirect Taxes and Service Tax and Excise Duties will yield additional revenue of more than Rs. 45,940 crores. This is in line with Government's policy of last several years where poor and common people have been overburdened to subsidize the rich and the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

corporates. There is huge amount of Rs.5.3 lakh crores revenue forgone in 2011-12, out of which over Rs.55,000 crore were tax concessions to the corporates. This is the irony when the Government claims it rules for *aam adami*, finally, this is what happens in our country. At the same time, the Budget gives slew of concessions to investment in the stock markets at a time when developed countries are trying to control the volatility in stock markets by tax regime against speculations. The Budget cuts security transaction tax by 25 per cent and new tax exemption has been announced to encourage retail stock market investors. Sir, India is among the few countries with the lowest tax GDP ratio which has been declining over the years.

(Contd by 3S/PK)

-KLS/PK/3S/5.20

SHRI D. RAJA (CONTD.): The tax GDP ratio is the lowest not only among the G-20 countries but also among the middle income countries. On the other hand, the global community has been taking all measures to tax the rich. The newly elected French President, Francois Hollande, has proposed a 75 per cent tax rate for the rich.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

However, in our country, due to the sustained campaign by the rich and corporates, the Government swiftly acted to reduce the tax burden and tax compliance provisions even more to boost the stock market. The announcements made by our hon. Finance Minister deferring the implementation of the General Anti-Avoidance Rules (GAAR) by one year and diluting many of its provisions is a meek surrender to finance capital, multi-national corporations and the US Administration.

Sir, the GAAR are meant to strengthen India's tax laws to prevent foreign investors from avoiding paying taxes on capital gains in India. This was also needed to plug the loopholes in the Double Taxation Avoidance Agreements (DTAAs) with tax havens like Mauritius. I don't need to explain what Mauritius means to India. It is noteworthy that over 40 per cent of FDI inflows into India are routed through Mauritius, in order to facilitate crores of rupees of tax savings by foreign companies at the cost of the Indian exchequer. GAAR have been implemented in countries across the world to crack down on such tax avoidance which leads to a loss of revenue to the sovereign governments. India is a sovereign Government. Even

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

South Africa and China have GAAR in place. Dilution of GAAR in India has, apparently, been done to please the corporate houses and the rich who have been using the provisions of DTAA for siphoning money out of the country. That is the source of black money, Sir.

Sir, the fact that the Government, the Finance Ministry, has been acting in favour of corporate houses is evident from their announcements such as cut in capital gains tax on private equity, cut in withholding tax on foreign borrowings and withdrawal of tax on property transactions. These are all meant to favour big financiers and real estate players. A recent report by the Ministry of Finance's Intelligence Wing — if I am wrong, I stand to be corrected, Sir, -- has confirmed that the real estate sector is the biggest culprit as far as tax and black money is concerned. The Government has also absolved the corporates from proving their tax liabilities with the proposed change, putting the onus on the Government. This is what is happening. Here, many people referred to Vodafone. This is to give benefits to companies such as Vodafone by proposing to exclude from the proposed amendments those companies whose cases have already been settled.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please conclude.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I am coming to the end. This is a big concession with huge losses to the Government.

While the Government has gone overboard in pleasing the corporates, lack of resources has been used as an excuse to reduce fertilizer subsidy, expenditure on MGNREGA and other social welfare expenditures. It is obvious that the political economy of the Finance Bill is clearly a reflection of the politics of the Congress-led UPA-II Government of exploiting the common man to benefit the corporate houses. (Time-bell)

Finally, Sir, Pranabda, at this age, with his rich experience, need not be in a dilemma, to be or not to be. I want him to be decisive. I want him to take a decisive step in correcting the neo-liberal policies which have proved to be disastrous. I hope he leaves an imprint in taking such a bold step. The macro-level economic and financial policies need a thorough review, and cross-correction is necessary at this point of time. With this request, I conclude my intervention. Thank you.(Ends)

(Followed by 3T)

श्री रघुनन्दन शर्मा (मध्य प्रदेश): माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, आदरणीय वित्त मंत्री जी को मैं दो साल, तीन साल पूर्व के काल खंड में वापस ले जाना चाहूंगा, जब वे नई ऊर्जा, नया जनादेश, नई नीति, नई दिशा लेकर इस सदन में आए थे, तब उन्होंने 6 जुलाई, 2009 को इस संसद के माध्यम से देश की जनता को कई अभिवचन दिए थे। उन्होंने अपने शब्दों में कहा था, “हम इस राष्ट्र की भलाई के लिए अपनी सम्पूर्ण सामर्थ्य से प्रयत्नशील रहेंगे,” लेकिन हम यह देख रहे हैं कि प्रत्येक वस्तु के मूल्य निरंतर बढ़ रहे हैं। महंगाई राक्षस की तरह से मुंह फाड़ कर दौड़ी चली आ रही है और हर व्यक्ति को वह तेजी से निगलने की चेष्टा कर रही है। इतना ही नहीं, एक के बाद एक ऐसे घोटाले सामने आ रहे हैं, जिनसे यह प्रश्न हमारे मन में उठता है कि देश विकास की ओर जा रहा है या भ्रष्टाचार की ओर जा रहा है? इस कारण से मैं उनको उनकी कुछ वचनबद्धताएं स्मरण दिलाना चाहूंगा कि हम किस दिशा में जाना चाहते हैं।

महोदय, 6 जुलाई, 2009 को उन्होंने अपने अभिवचन में कहा था कि कम से कम 9 प्रतिशत विकास दर प्रति वर्ष बनाए रखेंगे, क्या यह रख पाए? 12 मिलियन नए कार्य अवसर सृजन करेंगे, क्या यह कर पाए? गरीबी रेखा के नीचे जीवनयापन करने वाले अनुपात को 2014 तक आधे से कम कर देंगे, अभी तक कितना कर पाए?

महोदय, हां, हम यह कह कर सारे राष्ट्र में हास्यास्पद अवश्य हो गए हैं, क्योंकि हमने जीवनयापन के लिए जो मापदंड तय किया है, वह 28 रुपए तय किया है। क्या एक व्यक्ति अपना जीवन निर्वाह 28 रुपए के आधार पर कर सकता है? यह आकलन करके हमने अपने आपको हास्यास्पद बना लिया है। अगर ग्रामीण व्यक्ति की बात करें, तो वहां की हालत और खराब है, उसको तो आपने 22 रुपए में ही रोक दिया है, वहीं खड़ा कर दिया है। यह एक व्यक्ति के जीवनयापन के लिए पर्याप्त नहीं है।

महोदय, मैं वित्त मंत्री जी को ध्यान दिलाना चाहूंगा कि उन्होंने 2009 में ही अपने भाषण में कौटिल्य को याद किया था और उन्होंने कहा था, “मैं कौटिल्य की सलाह मान कर राजकोषीय घाटे के एफ.आर.बी.एम. लक्ष्य को पुनः प्राप्त करने का इरादा रखता हूँ।” वर्ष 2004-05 में राजकोषीय घाटा 1,25,794 करोड़ रुपए था, जो आज 5,25,000 करोड़ रुपए तक जा पहुंचा है और यह चार गुना से अधिक है। इसी प्रकार से सकल बाजार ऋण 46,031 करोड़ था, वह 4,80,000 करोड़ हो गया है, जो दस गुना से अधिक है। आज तो केवल ब्याज का भुगतान ही 3,20,000 करोड़ रुपए हो गया है।

यदि राजकोषीय घाटा तथा ब्याज भुगतान को मिला दिया जाए, तो 8,33,349 करोड़ रुपए होते हैं। इस प्रकार आपके पास 14,90,000 करोड़ में से केवल 6,57,576 करोड़ रुपए ही बचते हैं, जब कि आपका गैर आयोजना व्यय ही 9,69,000 करोड़ का है। इसकी पूर्ति के लिए 3 लाख करोड़ रुपए से अधिक

की आवश्यकता होगी। उसका कोई उपाय हमारे सामने दिखाई नहीं देता है। अगर योजनाओं पर व्यय की बात करेंगे, तो वह कहां जाएगी? इसका अर्थ यह है कि हम विकास को गौण मान कर अन्य कार्य को प्राथमिकताएं दे रहे हैं। इस स्थिति में आपके तीन वर्ष पूर्व के अभिवचन का क्या होगा? मैं यह माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी को स्मरण दिलाना चाहूंगा।

महोदय, कभी ये कहते हैं कि विश्वव्यापी मंदी का हम पर कोई प्रभाव नहीं पड़ा और कभी कहते हैं कि यदि हम सब क्षेत्रों में पिछड़ रहे हैं, तो विश्व में जो विश्वव्यापी मंदी आई है, उसका हम पर प्रभाव पड़ा है। अब सच क्या है? कभी एक बात बोलते हैं, तो कभी दूसरी बात बोलते हैं।

(3u/DS पर जारी)

-VNK/DS-SKC/5.30/3u

श्री रघुनन्दन शर्मा (क्रमागत): मैं यह कहना चाहूंगा कि भारत में जब से काले धन को लाने की आवाज़ उठी है, तब से वह काला धन रिस-रिस कर, धीरे-धीरे एक स्रोत की तरह, एक झरने की तरह इस देश में गुप्त मार्ग से, प्रछन्न मार्ग से आ रहा है और उस काले धन ने ही महँगाई का पहाड़ खड़ा किया है। वह इस महँगाई के शक्तिशाली राक्षस पर हावी हो गया है और हमारे कदमों ने, हमारी नीतियों ने इस महँगाई को नियंत्रित करने की बजाय आग में घी डालने का काम किया है।

माननीय महोदय, ग्रामीण अंचल में आज गरीबों और निर्धनों की जो हालत है, उसे देख कर मुझे फिल्म “पीपली लाइव” की याद आती है, जिसमें एक गरीब आदमी आत्महत्या करने के लिए लालायित रहता है और उसके घर के लोग, उसके घर की महिलाएँ गाती हैं, “सखि सड़ियां तो खूब ही कमात है, महँगाई डायन खाय जात है।” यह महँगाई गरीबों को खा रही है और आप उसको रोकने के उपाय नहीं कर पा रहे हैं। मुझे नहीं मालूम कि आपकी यह विवशता किस कारण से है और आप जैसे सशक्त वित्त मंत्री उसको रोकने में असमर्थ क्यों दिखायी दे रहे हैं।

आपने किसान को सात प्रतिशत ब्याज पर ऋण देने की बात कही है और समय पर भुगतान करने वाले को तीन प्रतिशत की छूट दी है, लेकिन मध्य प्रदेश के मुख्य मंत्री ने वहाँ पर एक प्रतिशत पर किसानों को ऋण देना प्रारम्भ किया है। आखिर एक प्रदेश का मुख्य मंत्री एक प्रतिशत पर ऋण दे रहा है और हम केन्द्र में बैठ कर सात प्रतिशत की बात कर रहे हैं! आप विचार करें, किसानों को क्या हम उसी प्रकार से सस्ता ऋण उपलब्ध नहीं करा सकते?

इसी प्रकार, आयात और निर्यात का मामला भी हमारे सामने है। आपके इस वर्ष के बजट के संदर्भ में मैं यह बात कहना चाहूँगा कि आपने निर्यात में 23 प्रतिशत की वृद्धि और आयात में 29 प्रतिशत की वृद्धि दर्ज करवायी है, ये अच्छे लक्षण नहीं हैं। कुशलता तो इसमें थी कि निर्यात 29 प्रतिशत होता और आयात में 23 प्रतिशत की वृद्धि होती। आयात के ऊपर निर्यात का दबाव हमेशा बना

रहना चाहिए, यही कुशल नीति है। मैं सोचता हूँ, देश के हित में इस चिन्तन की आवश्यकता है, लेकिन हम देसी चिन्तन की बजाय विदेशी चिन्तकों की ओर जाने लगे हैं, उनको प्रेरणा का केन्द्र मानने लगे हैं। कौटिल्य को आपने छोड़ दिया, शुक्र को आपने छोड़ दिया, आपने उपनिषद की *तेन त्यक्तेन भुञ्जिथा* की बात को छोड़ दिया, हम मिल-बाँट कर खाएँगे और स्वर्ग में जाएँगे, इस विचार का भी आपने परित्याग कर दिया और आप शेक्सपीयर के पीछे दौड़ पड़े, जो निर्दयी होने की बात कहता है। वह कहता है कि निर्दयी हो जाओ। निर्दयी होने की दृष्टि से आज देश की क्या हालत हो गयी है? हम दयाविहीन हो गये और हमारी करुणा समाप्त हो गयी। यह करुणा समाप्त होने के कारण और हमारी दया की भावना समाप्त होने के कारण हम गरीबों को जो सहूलियतें देना चाहते थे, वे नहीं दे पाए और हम देश को विकास की जो दिशा देना चाहते थे, वह भी नहीं दे पाए।

महोदय, देश में रेलों की हालत खराब है, सड़कों की हालत खराब है, किसानों की हालत खराब है, मजदूरों की भी यही स्थिति है और आपने भविष्य निधि पर कम ब्याज देकर भी लोगों का पेट काट लिया। आज सारे देश में हाहाकार मची हुई है। यह तो आपने सब लोगों की दुआ से सदबुद्धि प्राप्त करके स्वर्णकारों और देसी कारीगरों को फिर से आजीविका चलाने का अवसर प्रदान कर दिया है, उसके लिए मैं आपको धन्यवाद देना चाहूँगा कि आपने देश की जनता की भावना को समझा है। शेक्सपीयर ने आपको निर्दयी होने के लिए

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

जरूर कहा, लेकिन मैं चाहूँगा कि आप टैगोर को अपने सामने रखें, तुलसी को आप अपने सामने रखें और किसी देसी नीति निर्देशक को, प्रेरणास्रोत को सामने रखें। अगर आप किसी को नहीं, तो कबीर को ही अपने सामने रख लेते, तो आपके मन में करुणा जाग्रत होती और कबीर के शब्दों में आप कह उठते:

*कबीरा हाय गरीब की कबहूँ न निष्फल जाए,
मरी खाल की हाय से लौह भस्म हो जाए।*

मैं चाहूँगा कि आप कम से कम गरीबों की हाय मत लीजिए, गरीबों का साथ दीजिए, देश के विकास के लिए कदम उठाइए और ऐसी नीतियाँ बनाइए, जिनसे यह देश विश्व में आर्थिक महाशक्ति बन कर उभर सके। बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

(3w/HK पर आगे)

HK/3w/5.35

SHRI RAMA CHANDRA KHUNTIA (ODISHA): Sir, I rise to support the Appropriation (No.3) Bill, 2012 and the Finance Bill, 2012. Our hon. Finance Minister has already accepted the suggestions given by the Standing Committee. About the DTC, he has clearly mentioned, while moving the Bill, that all partners will be consulted and their suggestions will be taken and accommodated, and only then the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

decision will be taken. Sir, I do not want to go into the details of the Bill, but I want to give some suggestions for the consideration of the hon. Finance Minister. Sir, some days ago here in the Parliament, we raised the issue of old-age pension, for which thousands of farmers and people are agitating on the streets. This old-age pension was implemented as per the recommendations of the Agriculture Commission. It is Rs.200 only. But for people of 80 years of age, it is Rs.500. In course of life, the life span has increased. But son, daughters and family members are not taking proper care of old and aging people, so these people are demanding Rs.2,000 per month. However, Government can consider enhancing this amount so that aging people can get the assurance and confidence of getting some support of the Government. Secondly, I want to raise an issue about agriculture insurance. Many farmers are committing suicide. Everybody is concerned about the problems of farmers with respect to crop and agriculture. But the irony of the fact is that, till today, we have not been able to cover all the agriculture products and fields by way of insurance. If full insurance coverage is there and if farmers get compensation, I think, that will be one way to support the farmers.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

For that purpose, all the villages, not the blocks, should be taken as one unit. Sir, I am very much grateful that this UPA Government has taken a decision for skill-upgradation and skill-training. Hon. Finance Minister has also made the Budget provision for it. The target is to get 500 million skill-upgraded people in our country by 2023. But we have only Rs.1000 crore per annum for the Skill Upgradation Fund. Is it possible, by giving Rs.1000 crore per year, to get 500 million skilled people by 2023? I do suggest that these multi-nationals and industrial houses, who are using the skill of this country, should also contribute to the Skill Upgradation Fund so that this Fund can be increased. Sir, my another suggestion is regarding contract labourers working in Customs, Excise and Income Tax Departments, especially in the Eastern Zone -- West Bengal, Odisha, Bihar, Assam and in the North-East area. Almost in all areas, contract labourers have been regularized. But these people are working as contract labourers. We all know that Excise, Customs and Income Tax Departments are very sensitive Departments. If these people will work there as contract workers, how can they be able to dictate those people who are not paying the tax, or, those who are involving themselves in all sorts of

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

work? So, these workers, who are working as contract labourers in Excise, Customs and Income Tax Departments in the Eastern Zone, should be regularized. Sir, I am very much thankful to this UPA Government for the State Bank Pension Scheme. The UPA Government has taken a decision for giving pension to all nationalized banks' workers and officers. The only bank which is left out is Gramin Bank and its 65,000 officers and employees. I would like to remind the hon. Finance Minister that it was only his creation when Mrs. Indira Gandhi was the Prime Minister. At that time, on the suggestion of hon. Finance Minister, Gramin Bank was created to provide cheap credit. All these bank people are covered by the secured pension scheme, but these Gramin Bank people are dependent only on Provident Fund Scheme. When an officer retires, he gets Rs.1000 or Rs.1200 as pension, whereas peons and Class-IV employees working in Central Government and State Governments offices get pension higher than those. I think, that is under the consideration of the Government.

(Contd. by 3x/KSK)

KSK/5.40/3X

SHRI RAMA CHANDRA KHUNTIA (CONTD.): And, that estimation is there. The requirement for this purpose is Rs.7,000 crore. They have around Rs.2,000 crore in Provident Fund and, I think, the Government should also consider and find out a way. They are also prepared to give their contribution so that the pension scheme could be developed and finalised for the Grameen Bank officers and employees.

Sir, about education loans, we are thankful that the Government has taken a decision to give interest-free loan to the students belonging to income group of less than Rs.4.5 lakhs. But, above Rs.4.5 lakh income group, the students have to pay interest rate of 11 to 14 per cent. When there are some commercial loans on cars and other items with interest rates of 10 or 11 per cent, why should students, even though they belong to income group of above Rs.4.5 lakh, have to pay more interest? I think, this is also not correct and I appeal to the hon. Finance Minister to consider this point. They may be asked to pay the interest, but it must be a minimum interest of 5 to

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

6 per cent, so that it is reasonable. So, that should also be taken into consideration by the Government.

Sir, I want to mention one thing regarding the expenditure on the State Plan. When the Plan is being finalised for various States, the Plan size is very big. We are very happy to know that in a Plan, so many thousands of crores of rupees are sanctioned for a State Government. But, is this Plan money being utilised properly? I want to know the position in this regard from the hon. Finance Minister. Some States are telling that the Central Government is not giving adequate funds to them. But, has the total Plan allocation, given to the States, been utilised? Are they able to raise internal sources to utilise the Plan allocation? If that is not the case, then I think there is no justification in saying that the Central Government is not giving money. We are with the States. Our State, Odisha, should also get more money. But, we must also try to spend the money which has been given by the Central Government. Now, the other day, the hon. Minister of Drinking Water and Sanitation, Shri Jairam Ramesh, was telling here that in case of Bihar, Jharkhand and Odisha, the money released for the drinking water and sanitation has not been properly

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

utilised. If this is the fact, then the State Government would not be in a position to ask for more money. The States must have the capacity to utilise the funds.

Sir, I want to mention about MPLAD fund. There are allegations that MPLAD fund is not utilised by the Members of Parliament and the percentage of amount utilised is given in the media reports. But, I want to mention in this House the case of Odisha. We are getting Rs.5 crore per annum per Member. We have 31 Members from Odisha — 21 in Lok Sabha and 10 in Rajya Sabha. We get about Rs.155 crore per annum. It is not a small amount. But, the fact remains that the State Government and the district authorities are not taking interest to utilise the MPLAD fund. It is irrespective of any party politics. They are not taking any interest. For example, in the case of Odisha, if the State Government will not take interest to utilise Rs.155 crore, which will be given by our hon. Members of Parliament, then the developmental work will not happen. And, it is the case of all the States all over the country. I want to draw the kind attention of this House towards this fact. I am sorry to say that in 2008, when I was elected to this House, I had given Rs.3,00,000 to Tarini Mahavidayala

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

in Panikoili. This has not been utilised till date. In 2008-09, I gave Rs.86,00,000 to Kodai Block for 36 projects. It has also not been utilised till now. I have given a project for 84 tube wells in Kodai Block, for which, around Rs.45,00,000 have been given. It was given two years back and it has not been utilised till today. And, sometimes, it is being said that Members are not giving the projects. Sir, I have given the project for 2012. Even if full money is paid, my project is pending in the district level court. If we have given the project, then we have not committed any mistake.

(continued by 3y — gsp)

GSP-KLG-3Y-5.45

SHRI RAMA CHANDRA KHUNTIA (CONTD.): We are also not changing our project. In that case, I think, it is high time that the Central Government, the hon. Finance Minister talk to all the State Governments, State Finance Ministers and the concerned departments to take appropriate action for proper utilization of MPLAD fund, instead of blaming the Members of Parliament for non-utilization of these funds. We are trying to utilize the funds for the development

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

of the State. We are also not recommending to do this and that.

(Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please conclude.

SHRI RAMA CHANDRA KHUNTIA: So, I urge upon the Government to talk to the State Governments for proper utilization of the MPLAD fund. Sir, as a disciplined Member, I obey your order to conclude my speech. Once again, I support this Appropriation Bill and the Finance Bill introduced by the hon. Finance Minister, and, I also expect that the Finance Minister will consider my proposals. Thank you.

(Ends)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Thank you, Mr. Khuntia, for being disciplined. Now, Shri Ram Kripal Yadav. आपने भी पांच मिनट में खत्म करना है। ...(व्यवधान)... हमेशा मेरे से झगड़ा करते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)..

श्री राम कृपाल यादव (बिहार): सर, मैं आपके निर्देशों को भी सुन रहा हूँ और घड़ी को भी देख रहा हूँ। ..(व्यवधान).. सर, आपने कहा कि मिनिमम पांच मिनट और मैक्सिमम दस मिनट। आपने यही कहा है, न?

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० पी.जे.कुरियन): नहीं, पांच मिनट।

श्री राम कृपाल यादव: सर, मुझे ऐसा पता चला है कि आज मंत्री जी जवाब नहीं दे रहे हैं। इसलिए आप मुझे बोलने दीजिए।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं सबसे पहले माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी, जो हमारे अभिभावक हैं, नेता हैं, जो एक अनुभवी वित्त मंत्री हैं, विशेष तौर पर उनके प्रति मैं आभार व्यक्त करना चाहता हूँ। आपने इस देश के स्वर्णकार भाइयों के लिए कदम उठाकर एक्साइज ड्यूटी को वापस लिया है। पूरे देश में जिस तरह से स्वर्णकार भाई परेशान थे और पूरा सदन एजीटेटेड था, सदन के अंदर और सदन के बाहर भी इसको लेकर प्रदर्शन हो रहा था, उन भावनाओं को समझते हुए उनके अनुरूप, उन स्वर्णकार भाइयों के लिए आपने यह एक बड़ा कदम उठाया है। इसके लिए मैं अपनी तरफ से और पूरे सदन की तरफ से आपके प्रति आभार व्यक्त करना चाहता हूँ।

महोदय, इस देश को आजादी मिले साठ वर्ष से अधिक हो गए हैं और अभी हमने संसद का साठवां वर्ष भी मनाया है। देखकर आश्चर्य होता है कि देश के हालात आज ठीक नहीं हैं। देश की 78 प्रतिशत आबादी आज मात्र 20 रुपए पर निर्भर करती है। इस बात को समझा जाए कि 20 रुपए पर जो निर्भर करने वाला व्यक्ति होगा, वह अपना जीवनयापन किस तरह से गुजर कर रहा होगा? माननीय मंत्री जी इसको जरूर समझ रहे होंगे और इस तरफ ध्यान देने का काम करेंगे कि किस तरह से ऐसे लोगों को ऊपर उठाने का काम किया जाए। यह 78 परसेंट आबादी एक बहुत बड़ी आबादी होती है। आप देखें, इस देश में

गरीबी बहुत ज्यादा है। मैं यहां आंकड़ा प्रस्तुत करना चाहता हूँ कि पूरे देश में जो गरीबी की हालत है, सबसे अधिक बिहार जैसे प्रदेश में है, जहां बहुत पहले से ही पिछड़ापन है, गरीबी है। जब प्रथम पंचवर्षीय योजना में राशि का आवंटन हुआ, उस समय से ही बिहार को नेगलेक्ट किया गया और आज तक वह नेगलेक्टेड है। मैं आपको बताऊ कि 53.3 परसेंट बिहार में, उसके बाद छत्तीसगढ़ में 48.7 परसेंट, मणिपुर में 47.1 परसेंट, झारखंड में 39.1 परसेंट, असम में 37.9 परसेंट और उत्तर प्रदेश में 37.7 परसेंट लोग गरीबी रेखा से नीचे गुजर-बसर करने वालों की संख्या में आते हैं। खासकर के जो गरीब खेतिहर मजदूर हैं, उनकी हालत तो बहुत खराब है। यह 50 परसेंट गरीब खेतिहर मजदूर हैं, जो खेत में काम करते हैं। अपने खून-पसीने से अन्न पैदा करने का काम करते हैं और उसे देश में हम सब लोगों को खिलाने का काम करते हैं, वे गरीबी रेखा से नीचे गुजर-बसर करने वालों की संख्या में आते हैं। वैसे श्रमिक वर्ग ही, मैं समझता हूँ कि गरीब तबके के लोग हैं, जैसा मैंने कहा खेतिहर मजदूर 50 परसेंट, 40 परसेंट वह श्रमिक हैं, जो शहरी इलाकों में बसते हैं और 47.1 परसेंट अस्थाई श्रमिक गरीब हैं। खास तौर पर जो सम्पन्न हरियाणा और पंजाब है, वहां के खेतिहर मजदूरों की स्थिति भी ठीक नहीं है। हरियाणा में 55.9 परसेंट और पंजाब में 35.6 परसेंट खेतिहर मजदूर गरीब हैं।

(3जेड/एनबी पर जारी)

NB/3Z/5.50

श्री राम कृपाल यादव (क्रमागत) : ये हालात हैं। मैं समझता हूँ कि इस देश में गरीबी रेखा के नीचे गुजर-बसर करने वालों की संख्या लगातार बढ़ रही है। गरीबी रेखा के नीचे रहने वाले लोगों को यदि मौत आ जाए तो ज्यादा अच्छा है, क्योंकि वे दो वक्त की रोटी नहीं कमा पा रहे हैं, अपने बच्चों को पढ़ा-लिखा नहीं पा रहे हैं, उनके पास रहने के लिए घर नहीं हैं, वे खुले आकाश के नीचे रह रहे हैं। यह अजब विडंबना है। माननीय मंत्री जी, मैं आपसे निवेदन करूंगा कि आप इनकी तरफ निगाह रखने का काम करें। महंगाई लगातार बढ़ रही है और इसने सुरसा की तरह मुंह बना लिया है। लगातार महंगाई बढ़ रही है। प्रधान मंत्री जी ने और स्वयं वित्त मंत्री जी ने बार-बार कहा है कि हम इसको नियंत्रित करने का काम करेंगे, लेकिन नियंत्रण नहीं हो पा रहा है। मैं समझता हूँ कि इसमें जो वृद्धि हो रही है, आप इस पर कुछ कंट्रोल करने का काम कीजिए, इसके लिए कुछ उपाय कीजिए। आप कोशिश कर रहे हैं, लेकिन आपकी कोशिश सफल नहीं हो रही है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, पेट्रोलियम पदार्थों के दाम लगातार बढ़ रहे हैं। हमें जानकारी मिली है कि अब आप डीजल और केरोसिन ऑयल के दामों को ओपन मार्केट पर छोड़ने के बारे में सोच रहे हैं। यदि ऐसा हो गया तो इन पर आपका नियंत्रण नहीं रहेगा। यह चिंता का विषय है। यदि पेट्रोलियम पदार्थों की कीमतें बढ़ जाती हैं, तो वे हर चीज पर प्रेशर डालने का काम करती हैं और हर वर्ग, हर

तबका इससे प्रभावित होता है। सबसे बड़ी चीज यह है कि हमारे यहां बेरोजगारी की समस्या बढ़ रही है। अभी गवर्नमेंट का एक आंकड़ा आया है, मेरे प्रश्न के जवाब में माननीय मंत्री जी ने बताया था कि 21 दिसंबर, 2009 के आंकड़ों के हिसाब से 15 से 35 वर्ष की आयु के 3.53 करोड़ लोग रोजगार कार्यालयों में रजिस्टर्ड हैं। इसके अलावा जो बिना पढ़े-लिखे लोग हैं, जो अनरजिस्टर्ड हैं, उनकी संख्या इससे भी अधिक है। आज देश के सामने यह समस्या है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, एक समस्या यह भी है कि जो हमारे छोटे-छोटे घरेलू उद्योग थे, उन पर कुठाराघात हो रहा है। जब से नयी इकनॉमिक पॉलिसी आई है, उसके कारण बाहर की जो सामग्री है, वह हमारे देश में आ रही है और इससे छोटे उद्योगों पर काफी असर हो रहा है और हमारे उद्योग-धंधे चौपट हो रहे हैं। अब चीन से इतना ज्यादा माल आ रहा है - छोटे-छोटे खिलौने, घरेलू उपयोग की छोटी-छोटी चीजें, खाने का सामान, इसका हमारे व्यापार पर असर पड़ रहा है और इसके कारण बेरोजगारी बढ़ रही है। हमारी economy भी इससे प्रभावित हो रही है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन) : अब आप समाप्त कीजिए।

श्री राम कृपाल यादव : क्या मैं बैठ जाऊं?

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन) : अच्छा, आप एक मिनट में समाप्त कीजिए।

श्री राम कृपाल यादव : नहीं सर, मैं तीन मिनट और लूंगा। सर, यह सदन की राय है और आपकी राय भी इसमें शामिल है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मैंने निवेदन किया कि एक तरफ तो गरीब, फटेहाल मज़दूरों के लिए आप subsidy हटाने की बात कर रहे हैं और वहीं एक ऐसी पॉलिसी के तहत इस देश के जो बड़े घराने हैं, कॉर्पोरेट हाउसेज़ हैं, बड़े-बड़े उद्योगपति हैं, उनको एक्साइज़ में छूट दे रहे हैं, उनको सीमा शुल्क में छूट दे रहे हैं, जिसकी वजह से एक साल में आपने लगभग 88.26 करोड़ रुपए की छूट दी है। पिछले छः वर्षों में 21 लाख करोड़ रुपए की छूट आपने दी है। यह छूट न देकर, अगर आप इस पैसे को गरीबों पर खर्च करते, तो मैं समझता हूँ कि देश में जो गरीब तबके के लोग हैं, उनके साथ बड़ा न्याय हुआ होता। जो कमा रहे हैं, खिला रहे हैं, उन किसानों की हालत क्या है? ...(समय की घंटी)... सर, मैं एक मिनट और लूंगा। जो खुद भूखे रह कर हम सब लोगों को खिला रहे हैं, आप उनके लिए कुछ ठोस उपाय कीजिए। आप किसानों के लिए अलग बजट बनाइए, क्यों नहीं बनाते हैं? किसान आयोग ने आपको अनुशंसा करने का काम किया। अगर किसान खुशहाल रहेगा, तो देश खुशहाल रहेगा।

अंत में मैं बिहार की बात करना चाहता हूँ। जैसा कि हमारे माननीय साथियों ने कहा, हमारा बिहार बहुत पिछड़ा प्रदेश है। वहां गरीबी, फटेहाली, बेरोज़गारी सब कुछ है। आप पर्याप्त पैसा भी दे रहे हैं, मगर मैं समझता हूँ कि जब तक बिहार में आप दिए गए पैसे पर नियंत्रण नहीं रखेंगे ...(समय की घंटी) ... बिहार में भारी पैमाने पर लूट हो रही है। बिहार भ्रष्टाचार के आकंठ में डूबा हुआ है। मनरेगा का पैसा, शिक्षा का पैसा, रोड का पैसा, इनकी बड़े पैमाने पर

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

लूट वहां की जा रही है, इसलिए मैं यह कहता हूं कि आप पैसा ज़रूर दीजिए, लेकिन उस पर नियंत्रण रखिए। निश्चित तौर पर आज बिहार फटेहाली और गरीबी के हालात से गुज़र रहा है। हम वहां की सरकार को ज़रूर कहेंगे कि हम विकसित होकर पूरे देश में आगे बढ़ेंगे, मगर बिहार की जो जायज़ मांग है, उसकी तरफ आप ज़रूर ध्यान दीजिए। अगर बिहार पिछड़ा रहेगा, तो देश आगे नहीं बढ़ेगा। वहां 10 करोड़ 38 लाख की आबादी भूखी है, प्यासी है, अशिक्षित है। वहां उद्योग नहीं हैं, वहां बेरोज़गारी है, गरीबी है। बाढ़ और सुखाड़ की वजह से लोग परेशान हैं, तो निश्चित तौर पर ...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन) : आप बोर्ड पर नहीं देखते हैं, यही प्रॉब्लम है।

श्री राम कृपाल यादव : मैं खत्म कर रहा हूं। I am going to conclude. इसलिए माननीय मंत्री जी, मैंने निवेदन किया कि आप उदार दिल से बिहार को अतिरिक्त सहायता देकर उसे मुख्य धारा में लाएं। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

(4A/YSR-MP पर आगे)

-SK/YSR/5.55/4A

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL (PUNJAB): Sir, I would like to compliment the hon. Finance Minister for showing flexibility with regard to certain provisions of the Budget proposals. GAAR have been widely criticised

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

by the investing community, both in India and abroad, and it was sending wrong signals in a difficult year when we require more FDI. Sir, I am glad that he has decided to postpone it for the time being. At the same time, I appreciate the hon. Finance Minister's very clear signal to the world investing community that they should not consider India as a tax haven. All companies and individuals that do business in India must pay taxes either in India or in their own country. Also, Sir, irrespective of the size of the company, nobody can twist India's arm. That is another message which the hon. Finance Minister has sent very loud and clear. The Finance Minister would also listen to the voice of reason as far as the small jewellery business is concerned. A large section of our small traders and artisans would now benefit from it. Sir, I understand the adverse economic situation that the country is passing through and the hon. Minister's difficult position to balance the Budget and, at the same time, keep the fiscal deficit under control. However, Sir, the rural sector on which 70 per cent of India depends urgently requires some succour. I have a suggestion for the hon. Finance Minister. Even though it may be morally incorrect for me to suggest it and I would probably be criticised by the media for saying

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

so, I would still venture to do so. It requires some out-of-the-box thinking in these difficult times for our economy. The figures of black money, both in the country and stashed abroad, which have been coming in the public domain, are truly mind-boggling. Since the hon. Finance Minister has made a lot of efforts to unearth black money, it has certainly created a lot of scare amongst a lot of people who are willing to come clean and declare their illegal hoardings both in India and abroad. Sir, I would suggest that the hon. Finance Minister should announce an amnesty scheme on the lines of 1997 Scheme which mopped up more than Rs.20,000 crore. I am sure, today, he would come up with such a scheme that the country will get over a lakh crore of rupees for sure. I would only add one rider to it. The entire amount that he collects should be earmarked for rural development and especially for two schemes: clean drinking water and sanitation. It is a matter of shame that after 65 years of Independence, a large section of our rural population has no access to safe drinking water. Similarly, a large section of our rural women have no access to toilets. We must protect their honour and dignity. Sir, I know it is not right to suggest that one should encourage tax

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

evasion. But if you can collect over a lakh crore of rupees this way, you must do so and inject it into the rural economy in one go. This would certainly give a fillip to our economy. Sir, also it is high time that the Government got rid of all the loss-making PSUs, especially the ones like the Air India and the Hotel Corporation which have been bleeding the Government for a long time. The Government has no business to be in service industry. It is best left to the private sector. Air India is expected to lose Rs.10,000 crore this year and the MTNL is fast catching up. (Contd. by VKK/4B)

-YSR/VKK-SC/4b/6.00

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL (CONTD.): Besides, there are so many other PSUs which are bleeding the economy very heavily. Kindly privatise them as soon as possible and use this money for productive purposes. (Interruptions) चलिए, अब उनको आपकी जरूरत नहीं है, इसलिए शायद कर लें।

Finally, Sir, there is a lot of speculation that you are about to declare a fiscal package for your home State, as was recommended

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

by the Finance Commission. I welcome it. You must do so. But, kindly do not forget Punjab and Kerala in the bargain.

Now, I am concluding. Sir, the hon. Finance Minister has been a Member of this House or the other House now for almost 43 years and is likely to move to a bigger house very soon. I only hope that the best wishes of the entire House are with him. I do hope that before he demits office, he will take care of his State and my State. Thank you.

(Ends)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, Shri Ram Vilas Paswan. He is not here. So, the discussion is over. The hon. Finance Minister will reply tomorrow. Now, we will take up Special Mentions.

SPECIAL MENTIONS — contd.

*** DEMAND TO RESOLVE THE PROBLEM OF PROLIFERATION OF SLUMS ALONG MUMBAI COAST POSING SECURITY THREATS TO THE CITY**

DR. ASHOK S. GANGULY (NOMINATED): I have been requesting the Bombay Municipal Corporation and the Maharashtra State

* Laid on the Table.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Government regarding proliferation of new slums on the Haji Ali sea coast of Mumbai City. In response, the BMC has reported that whenever these slums are removed, they are immediately rebuilt and cannot be prevented from doing so because of lack of help from Mumbai Police. This is a serious matter related to coastal security, as was experienced on 26th November, 2008, during the terrorist attacks in Mumbai. In addition, these slums promoted by local slumlords are in gross violation of the coastal zone regulations. Due to absence of any response from the State Government, the BMC and Mumbai Police Commissioner, I am forced to bring this major security risk to the attention of the hon. Home Minister and the hon. Minister for Environment and Forests. I have also made two successive requests to raise this extremely important issue during the Zero Hour and have not been permitted to do so. I now request protection to raise and record this issue concerning National Security in the Rajya Sabha and request that immediate measures are taken to clean and protect the coastal areas off Mumbai coast from slums.

(Ends)

CONCERN OVER THE RIVERS IN GOA GETTING POLLUTED

DUE TO MINING ACTIVITIES IN MAHARASHTRA

SHRI SHANTARAM NAIK (GOA): Sir, environmental experts in Goa have expressed fears that increasing mining activities in Maharashtra, a State bordering Goa, specially in its areas of Dodamarg and Sawantwadi areas, is causing pollution of waters of two rivers in Goa. Therefore, I would like to urge upon appropriate authorities in Maharashtra to take steps under the Environment Protection Act, Water Pollution Act and laws dealing with mining activities to curb the menace.

Sindhudurg district of Maharashtra, according to these experts, has the highest forest cover of 49 per cent in Maharashtra, but it has 49 mining leases, out of which, 32 mining permits have been given in the Sawantwadi and Dodamarg zone, which has the highest forest cover within Sindhudurg.

Out of eleven rivers, two important rivers of Goa, Tiracol and Colvale, originate in Maharashtra. Tiracol originates in Manohargad area of Sawantwadi whereas Colvale originates in Tudiye of Changad in Kolhapur district.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

Experts also contend that Tiracol and Colvale rivers are the lifeline of Pernem, Bicholim and Bardez talukas, which are getting polluted and permanent damage is caused to wildlife habitat.

Presently, mining activities have already begun in Kalane, Sateli-Satarda, Redi areas of Maharashtra. Mining in Sateli has polluted the River Tiracol whereas Kalane's mine has posed a serious threat to the River Kalane, the main feeder of the River Colvale. Rivers in Goa are also getting polluted on account of mining in Goa itself. These issues require joint attention of both the Governments.

(Ends)

*** DEMAND TO TAKE MEASURES TO CONTAIN UNSUSTAINABLE
LEVELS OF CURRENT ACCOUNT DEFICIT**

SHRI N.K. SINGH (BIHAR): India's Current Account Deficit crossed four per cent of the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) in the previous quarter when three per cent is considered to be the proverbial

*Laid on the Table.

'Lakshman Rekha'. The RBI has warned that this inflated level of Current Account Deficit (CAD) is unsustainable and may widen further

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

given the global economic sentiment and lack of meaningful Government action. During April to December 2011, the CAD widened to US \$ 53.7 billion from US \$ 39.6 billion in April to December 2010, largely reflecting a higher trade deficit. Even though net FDI inflows were higher in the April-December quarter than in the comparable period of the previous year, portfolio flows were lower resulting in a decline in overall capital inflows. Consequently, there was a drawdown of reserves to the extent of US \$7.1 billion during the aforementioned period. This is interpreted as a sign of structural weakness in the economy. Higher CAD has been on the back of a widening trade deficit. Indeed, India's merchandise trade deficit came in at a record high of US \$160.4 billion in financial year 2011-12, equivalent to 8.6 per cent of nominal GDP. Crucially, despite major rupee weakness, no impact is being witnessed on exports. Export growth has collapsed from 36.4 per cent year-on-year in September to -5.7 per cent in March 2012. On the flip side, import penetration has remained robust, expanding by a four-month high of 24.3 per cent year-on-year in March. Additionally, the downside risks — ranging from deep Eurozone recession to weaker capital inflows as a

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

result of harsher taxes on foreign investors — are significant. These times are eerily similar to the worst the country faced in more than two decades economically. I, therefore, urge the Government to immediately address this problem by increasing exports and avoid implementing policies that are likely to hurt investor sentiment and reduce capital inflows into the country.

(Ends)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, Shri Mansukh Mandaviya, not here. Now, Shri Nandi Yellaiah.

**DEMAND TO EXPEDITE THE PROCESS OF SETTING UP A
THERMAL POWER PLANT OF NTPC AT SHANKARPALLI IN
ANDHRA PRADESH**

श्री नंदी येल्लैया (आन्ध्र प्रदेश) : महोदय, वर्ष 1999 में नेशनल थर्मल पाँवर कारपोरेशन (एनटीपीसी) ने आन्ध्र प्रदेश के मेदक जिले में शंकरपल्ली गांव में 650 मेगावाट का एक पाँवर प्लांट लगाने की पेशकश की थी, जिससे हैदराबाद सिटी को बिजली की मांग पूरी की जा सके। मगर तमाम क्लियरेंस मिल चुकने के बाद भी कई कारणों से इस प्रोजेक्ट पर अब तक काम शुरू नहीं हो पाया।

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 15.05.2012

अब ग्रेटर हैदराबाद की लगातार बढ़ती जा रही बिजली की मांग को पूरा करने के लिए इस प्रोजेक्ट को तैयार करना बेहद जरूरी हो गया है। इसके लिए कृष्णा नदी से बहुत पानी मिल सकता है। इसके अलावा गुजरात-मुम्बई से गुजरने वाली कृष्णा-गोदावरी गैस पाइप लाइन भी शंकरपल्ली से गुजरती है, जो इस प्रोजेक्ट से सिर्फ एक किलोमीटर की दूरी पर है। ये सब हालात इस प्रोजेक्ट को लगाने के लिए बहुत अच्छे हैं।

इसलिए आपकी मार्फत मेरा केन्द्र सरकार से अनुरोध है कि वह एनटीपीसी के इस पॉवर प्लांट को लगाने का काम शीघ्र शुरू करे क्योंकि अन्य मेट्रो सिटीज़ के पास अपनी बिजली की जरूरत पूरी करने के लिए अपने पॉवर प्लांट हैं। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

श्री आनंद भास्कर रापोलू (आन्ध्र प्रदेश) : महोदय, मैं माननीय सदस्य के वक्तव्य से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

(4सी-जीएस पर आगे)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): Shrimati Renubala Pradhan. She is not there. Shri Prabhat Jha. He is not there.

The House is adjourned to meet tomorrow at 11.00 a.m.

* * * * *

The House then adjourned at six minutes past six of the clock till eleven of the clock on Wednesday, the 16th May, 2012.